6

The Role of Lay Women Teachers in Catholic Education Before the Education (Scotland) Act, 1918

Jane McDermid

In his history of the intellectual life of the British working classes, Jonathan Rose presented two examples of Catholic education in early twentieth-century Scotland, both female, which he portrayed as typical of the elementary school experience of Scotland's largest minority. His impression from these early twentieth-century recollections was that compared to non-Catholics, at least before the 1918 Education Act, working-class Catholic adults

> gave their schools and teachers a much lower positive rating, were more likely to complain about corporal punishment in education, were less likely to see any benefit in their education, were far more prone to regret the quality of their schooling, and were much happier to leave school.[1]

Historians tend to explain the lower standards of Catholic schooling before the 1918 Act by pointing to the impact of large-scale migration from Ireland, especially from the 1840s, and linked to that the

J. McDermid (✉)
Southampton University, Southampton, UK
e-mail: J.McDermid@soton.ac.uk

S. J. McKinney, R. McCluskey (eds.), *A History of Catholic Education and Schooling in Scotland*, https://doi.org/10.1057/978-1-137-51370-0_6

generalized poverty of the mainly working-class Catholic population. More specifically, the Church's decision to remain outside of the national system of education set up by the 1872 Education Act accounts for the substantial under-funding reflected in inadequate accommodation, limited resources and heavy reliance on largely unqualified, poorly paid schoolmistresses.[2] The Catholic School Committee recorded that even at the end of the century, demand for qualified teachers and assistants was still far in excess of supply.[3]

Although he does not comment on the gender of the teachers, one of Rose's witnesses was taught by a woman, though it is unclear whether she was lay or religious. Nor is it clear whether she was certificated, but as the following discussion will show, in such a small rural school, it is likely that she was not, especially since teacher training remained under the control of the churches and there was no Catholic college in Scotland until the mid-1890s. Founded by the sisters of Notre Dame, it was to train schoolmistresses. A common complaint has been that women religious are often hidden from history or marginalized in contrast to the attention paid to lay mistresses.[4] However, since the 1990s considerable recovery work has been done on the religious teaching orders, whereas in the history of the schooling of Catholic working-class children in Scotland before the 1918 Education Act, less has been written on lay women despite the fact that they made up the majority of schoolmistresses.[5]

One of Rose's two witnesses grew up in a crofting family in the Grampians. Born in 1913, Anne Kynoch's first school was non-Catholic, and she regretted losing her 'intellectual freedom' when she moved to a Catholic school. Anne's recollection of the latter was as a 'prison and hell for me'. She felt

> insulted by the low academic standards, the history lessons grossly slanted in favour of Mary Stuart ('the blackmail of hate'), the time wasted on saints' lives and catechism, her teacher's sadistic bouts of caning ('which gave her great sensual pleasure'), and above all the restrictions on library privileges.[6]

For Rose, this bleak reflection is a telling indictment of Catholic elementary schooling, though he points out that 'memories can grow sour with age' and that the majority of people who recalled their school experience

did not share the dissatisfaction of these two women. Moreover, the pedagogy of rote learning and corporal punishment was prevalent in nineteenth-century Scotland and not confined to Catholic schools.[7]

Problems and Pressures

Although Catholics remained outside of the national system until the 1918 Act, the aim of the Church was to win acceptance from the host community while forming a distinct identity in what was a hostile environment.[8] Catholic education in the nineteenth century faced the twin problems of rapid population growth and mass migration. Until the late eighteenth century, the majority of the 30,000 Scottish Catholics had lived in the Highlands and Islands, with only three score or so in Glasgow, then migration from the former but especially from Ireland reversed this profile.[9] The census of 1851 showed that of the 207,367 Irish-Scots, 135,975 (66.6 per cent) had settled in the west-central region (Ayrshire, Lanarkshire and Renfrewshire) where they made up 15.4 per cent of the population.[10] By the late 1870s around a fifth of the Scottish population lived in Glasgow, while two-thirds of those born in Ireland lived in the city and surrounding areas.[11] By 1910, when Catholics made up 10 per cent of Scotland's population, they were 17.6 per cent of Glasgow's.[12] Mary Hickman has argued that anxiety over the potentially disruptive influence of so many migrants of a generally reviled religion led the Church to adopt the strategy of separate education in order to strengthen Catholic but eliminate, or at least dilute, Irish identity.[13] As Karly Kehoe's chapter in this volume shows, the clergy relied particularly on female religious to spearhead the efforts to socialize and civilize the children of the migrant poor and to mould the daughters who would go on to make up the rank and file of elementary school teachers.[14]

In addition to overcrowding and large classes, Catholic schools suffered from irregular attendance and poor punctuality, and after the 1872 Act the standard of teaching remained lower and there was an even heavier reliance on pupil teachers, the majority of whom were female, than in the Board schools. Moreover, the failure rate of Catholic pupil teachers at scholarship examinations was high and those who passed did

not achieve high places. These problems were acknowledged by the Catholic School Committee which admitted that the Church could neither match the support for the professional development of teachers and pupil teachers extended by school boards nor afford the wages paid by even the smallest boards.[15]

The tradition in Scotland was of a male-dominated profession with the revered figure of the 'dominie' at its centre.[16] The Church made efforts to attract men to its schools by, for example, offering special grants to male pupil teachers and to students and teachers at male training colleges, but these had little impact.[17] By 1880 there were three to four times as many females as males at all levels of the teaching profession in the Glasgow Archdiocese.[18] A proposal to establish a training college for men foundered in 1907 because the bishops recognized that it would prove considerably more expensive than the female college.[19] Moreover, it was difficult to retain male teachers given the low salaries and alternative job opportunities.[20] With many fewer employment options, women, both lay and religious, constituted a cheap labour source.

Clergy and teachers felt they were up against not only the prejudice of the Protestant majority but also the ignorance of Catholic parents who tended to keep children from school as soon as they could contribute to the family income. In particular, heads often complained of mothers' attitudes to education and to teachers.[21] Still, before 1872 it appears that Catholic girls in Glasgow enjoyed a better (relatively speaking) education than boys, because of the earlier arrival of female religious orders, the Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception in 1847 and the Sisters of Mercy in 1849.[22] The arrival in Glasgow in 1858 of the Marist Brothers who took charge of boys' education and a year later the Jesuits who concentrated on middle-class boys might seem to have changed that, but this reversal of fortunes may have been more apparent than real due to the pupil-teacher system (introduced in 1846) which gave opportunities for those Catholic girls whose parents could afford to do without either their daughters' wages or their help at home.[23] Only a minority became pupil teachers, however, and even fewer went on to training college, for whereas the Church considered teaching a respectable occupation for a woman in contrast to factory work, the latter was better paid and the needs of the family came first.[24] Thus, the headmistress at St John's in Port Glasgow recorded in 1887 that 'one by one

girls who thought to work on in school in prospect of a [pupil teacher] vacancy, have left for employment which would presently add a little to the family income'.[25] Some pupils, notably in the textile regions of Renfrewshire and Dundee, were under the half-time system which both clergy and teachers found frustrating: the mistress of St James's school in Renfrew recorded that the reverend manager tried to persuade factory owners not to take on girls, insisting he would not admit half-timers but, she added, his threat did not improve attendance.[26]

In the mixed as in the single-sex schools, complaints of the impact of truancy on both academic progress and discipline persisted.[27] Headmistresses in Lowland schools frequently complained that mothers kept daughters in particular at home to help with domestic duties.[28] In the Highlands, boys and girls were recorded as absent helping on the croft and whereas girls were more likely to be kept from school to help in the home, teachers also regretted that boys' education was severely circumscribed by family circumstances.[29] Log books reveal that very few, girls or boys, stayed on into the senior standards: at St Mary's Girls' school in Glasgow in 1889, the mistress lamented that a number of pupils had been granted labour exemptions to leave early.[30] Mistresses also had to deal with children who only began to attend from the age of nine or ten: one complained they were 'almost unteachable' and a 'drag' on the other pupils.[31]

The Church favoured mixed-sex infant schools followed by either single-sex schools or separate departments within the same school, but generally this arrangement was possible only in larger urban centres.[32] Even there, a few schools were mixed-sex and had a lay female head teacher.[33] The Church considered women to be naturally best suited to teach infants and girls, but even in the Catholic boys' schools, female assistants were increasingly employed in the later Victorian period, and Francis O'Hagan gives the example of St Mary's Boys' school, Glasgow, which employed female teachers in the early 1900s.[34] Outside of Glasgow, sizeable towns such as Airdrie had separate schools for girls and boys, though the example from Geraldine Vaughan's study suggests parents were more willing to send sons than daughters: she found that in 1856 there were 120 pupils in boys' school, but only 80 pupils in the girls' school.[35] In small towns and rural areas, Catholic schools were mainly mixed-sex with a predominantly lay female staff: from my sample of 35

Catholic schools, of which 15 were in Glasgow, 24 were run by lay women, and of the 20 schools outside of Glasgow, 14 had lay headmistresses, 5 lay headmasters and 1 a female religious.[36]

Catholic school logs show a higher teacher-pupil ratio than in Board schools. In the smaller schools, a teacher was often supported only by monitors and pupil teachers, and in one case, in 1893, a pupil teacher substituted for a headmistress who was absent due to illness.[37] Class sizes in Catholic schools were generally large: at the end of the century, when the number of pupil teachers was decreasing, some classes accommodated up to 100 pupils with teachers experiencing unrelenting pressure from the 'constantly increasing' numbers of children.[38] Depending on numbers in the higher standards, teachers in mixed-sex schools found it more efficient to have the girls and boys in the same classroom, but as the mistress at Holy Cross, Glasgow, found early in 1900, it was not always possible to do so.[39]

Not surprisingly, the curriculum in the majority of schools was limited to meeting minimum government requirements for both sexes, with the focus on the '3 Rs' and, additionally for girls, domestic subjects. Whereas this emphasis on a specifically female curriculum reflected government policy, it was also central to the Catholic Church's strategy of surviving in a hostile environment by endorsing the values they shared with the wider society including the domestic ideal for women.[40] However, although female teachers predominated in schools, the range of domestic subjects on offer was limited, and there was some parental resistance to their prominence in the girls' curriculum.[41] Mistresses sometimes expressed resentment at the heavy burden of domestic subjects, especially in mixed-sex schools, but more often they complained that parents persistently declined to provide the necessary materials for their daughters, especially the younger ones.[42] In practice, Catholic schools found it difficult to support the range of domestic subjects offered in Board schools because of the additional expense and lack of suitable accommodation, as well as the burden on the mistresses who were often expected to teach these in addition to the basic curriculum, without having the opportunity to gain the necessary expertise. When subjects such as cookery and laundry were taught, conditions were often inadequate: in an unexceptional example from Glasgow in 1888, cooking was taught from a stove installed in a cupboard.[43]

Yet whatever the constraints and the additional load these put on the mistresses, notably in mixed-sex schools, the city's Archbishop was an enthusiastic supporter of efforts to extend the teaching of domestic economy in Catholic schools. He considered these essential for both the harmony and comfort of the family home and the health and prosperity of the community. This was reflected in his membership on the board of directors of the School of Cookery in Glasgow from its establishment in 1876.[44] Such an emphasis on the domestic also reflects the willingness of school managers to sacrifice academic, or 'specific', subjects for vocational, especially in the girls' curriculum, which in turn limited the range of what mistresses could teach.[45] Often, domestic economy was the only specific subject open to girls in Catholic schools. At least to the 1880s when other specific subjects were introduced, they appear to have been mainly reserved for boys.[46] Specific subjects were even less likely to be offered in Catholic schools in the Highlands and Islands, and when they were it was in urban centres: for example, in Inverness, St Joseph's school offered Latin, French, domestic economy and, by the 1890s, cookery.[47]

Indeed, the irregular attendance of pupils and the inadequacy of equipment made it very difficult to teach specific subjects, domestic economy included, effectively. Still, there was some educational progress: by the end of the century, girls as well as boys were encouraged to try for the Merit Certificate and to enter university examinations.[48] These, however, were exceptions to the general pattern of frequent truanting and leaving school as soon as possible. The numbers receiving a secondary education remained tiny into the twentieth century. As late as 1918, only 8.5 per cent of Catholic children benefited from some form of secondary education: even in Glasgow, as little as 3 per cent did.[49]

The Teachers

Moreover, only a minority of teachers in Catholic schools were qualified above the level of pupil teacher, relatively few of whom were able to go on to college, which before 1894 was Mount Pleasant in Liverpool.[50] That year the first Scottish Catholic teacher training institution, Dowanhill

College, also run by the sisters of Notre Dame de Namur, was established in Glasgow, confirming the even greater dependence on female staff in Catholic than in Board schools.[51] Moreover, whereas by the early 1890s only a tiny minority of teachers (8 of a total of 216) in Board schools did not have certificates, two-thirds of female Catholic teachers and a half of the males were without them.[52]

Bernard Aspinwall noted that the sisters of Notre Dame assured the young women they trained that not only did they stand between the priests and the parents but they derived authority from Almighty God.[53] Both parties were to be treated firmly and professionally, while tact was particularly commended in their dealings with the clergy. The schoolmistresses should 'respect the priest in "his little whims and plans about his school", conciliate but retain a respectful distance, yet never compromise on professional educational issues'.[54] The sisters of Notre Dame widened the college curriculum beyond government requirements to include, for example, foreign languages, classical as well as modern. They encouraged students in self-education and once qualified to continue professional development.[55] Again, only a minority of schoolmistresses would have the time, energy or resources to do so, but a few who did gained impressive qualifications. Miss Mary Ginlay, headmistress of Holy Cross mixed-sex school in Glasgow, received the LLA (Licentiate in Arts) from St Andrews University in 1898. Two years later the HMI (Her Majesty's Inspector) applauded her teaching of the senior class, though his report implicitly criticized the shortcomings of the majority of her counterparts:

> Nothing can have a more beneficial effect upon the older pupils and tend more to induce them to prolong their stay at school than the feeling that they are being directly taught and trained by the most highly qualified teacher.[56]

She was exceptional but not unique: in 1903 nine Dowanhill students registered at Glasgow University, while in 1906 the Notre Dame Sisters themselves were given permission to attend the University and take higher degrees.[57]

HMI reports acknowledged the progress made against great odds but, more explicitly than in the report on Miss Ginlay, they highlighted the more typical lack of a serious training in method and of an intel-

lectual education among the majority of Catholic teachers.[58] The opening of Dowanhill College in 1895 was in response to such concerns. Yet while the Church and religious orders strained to raise the level of teaching and learning, it still lacked the resources to pay the same salaries as School Boards. Female teachers were paid less than male in both Board and Catholic schools which meant that women in the latter were paid the least: in 1911, the average annual salary of male teachers in Catholic schools was £4 lower than their equivalents in Board schools, whereas that of Catholic women teachers was on average £7 lower than Board schoolmistresses.[59]

The injustice of such low pay for women teachers was acknowledged by Father Joseph Holder who was a member of the Dundee School Board in the mid-1890s. He criticized the 'enormously disproportionate rates at which we are accustomed to pay our male and female teachers' in the Board schools: the annual salary of male assistant teachers was almost £98, that of their female equivalent just under £55. He was not calling for equal pay but rather to reduce the differential for those performing the same duties. Moreover, he recognized that since women in Board schools were concentrated in teaching infants and the lower standards, they had bigger classes than men in the higher standards and, since the mistresses also taught needlework which was compulsory for girls, they earned more in grants for the school than the men who taught the more prestigious subjects such as Latin and mathematics to a minority of mainly boys. While he was not challenging the domestic ideal, he pointed out that men in Dundee, which had an exceptionally high rate of female employment, were not the only breadwinners, observing that 'female teachers who have to support claims beside their own are far more numerous than those who have not'.[60] Such differentials were replicated in Catholic schools where mistresses received on average around half the salary of masters. His argument, therefore, had as much if not more relevance for Catholic schools, but it gained support neither from most Board members nor from reverend school managers who were particularly reliant on those low salaries.

The Church's educational efforts to meet the growth in numbers of Irish-born children were concentrated on the Lowlands and, it has been claimed, this led to the neglect of the Highlands and Islands as a 'distinct,

organic, cultural and linguistic entity'.[61] When Notre Dame training college was opened in 1895, Gaelic was not on the curriculum and education at all levels was in English.[62] In addition, Catholic as well as Board schools had difficulties attracting teachers, especially men who had more chances than women of employment outside of education, to poorly remunerated jobs in isolated regions. Hence Catholic schools in the Highlands and Islands tended to rely on a single mistress and pupil teachers. There were few separate Catholic schools in the region: even after the arrival of the Ursuline Sisters in 1865, there were not enough Catholic children in Perthshire to merit separate schools.[63] Two years later only 13 per cent of Catholic children (of whom there were around 300 in the county) attended the two schools in Perth. After 1872, the Church sometimes complained about the appointment of teachers to Board schools which Catholics attended in the region not just because of fears of proselytism but also because of prejudice among Board members about the 'low' social origins of Catholic teachers, reflected in the negative image of Catholics in some sections of the press.[64]

In order to strengthen the community and safeguard its own position, the Church sought to inculcate a desire for education among its parishioners.[65] The religious orders, moreover, aimed to stimulate the development of a skilled working class and a middle class by instilling a desire to keep children longer in school.[66] However, by the turn of the century, Dowanhill had contributed only 143 qualified teachers, and while it was making headway—the *Report of the Committee of Council on Education in Scotland* for 1902–1903 shows that there were 101 Catholic students in training, all of whom were female and 2 of whom were attending Glasgow University—the numbers remained small compared to the needs of the schools.[67] It was clear that as long as Catholic schools remained outside of the state system, only a few teachers could follow this route of professional qualifications and social advancement. With the continuing reliance on female uncertificated and pupil teachers, the efforts of their schools to reach the standards of the rate-aided Boards had little chance of success before the 1918 Act. Nevertheless, Mary McHugh has found that despite Irish-born females remaining concentrated in unskilled and low-skilled occupations, the training of Irish-born schoolmistresses had improved significantly by the turn of the century; and while most certificated teachers

were employed in the Lowlands, this trend was also seen in the Highlands and Islands.[68] For example, F.G. Rea, the (English) headmaster of a Catholic school in South Uist between 1889 and 1894, recalled in his memoir that some of the girls he had taught became head teachers and qualified nurses. Some of the boys also became head teachers and doctors, and he highlighted without comment their success in a wider range of better paid employment opportunities.[69]

Religious Leaders, Lay Followers

David Limond has argued that the dominant distinctive component of being a Catholic girl in Scotland between the 1872 Education Act and the end of the Second World War was the possibility of being taught by nuns.[70] Karly Kehoe has shown how crucial female religious were for the development of Catholic education, including the training of teachers, especially in the larger urban centres.[71] Certainly, whereas lay teachers were subject to the reverend manager, the religious orders regarded his authority over them as limited: he could engage their services but they reserved the right to withdraw and the manager was 'helpless to contest their decision'.[72] Lay mistresses could not act so independently, but as Bernard Aspinwall noted those trained by the sisters were advised on how to 'manage' the manager. As one lay headmistress recorded in 1888 when dealing with an 'insolent' female assistant: 'Hitherto in my schools, I have been considered as the *first*, and under certain necessary and fitting restrictions so far as the Reverend Managers were concerned, the *supreme* authority'.[73]

Francis O'Hagan agreed with Bernard Aspinwall that the sisters provided some 'outstanding examples of leadership'.[74] Karly Kehoe in particular insists that female religious orders were not only integral to establishing the Catholic school system in Glasgow, but that the sisters often remained the principal teachers in most of the city's Catholic schools and that they influenced the lay women who worked under them and whom they trained, thereby maintaining their key role.[75] Influence, however, is easier to assume than to measure, especially when neither religious nor lay women left much in the way of personal papers.

It is indisputable that the Church gave the teaching orders the leadership role in elementary education and that the statements made by the religious orders for their influence were accepted by the authorities. Thus the Argyll Commission into the condition of education in Scotland in the mid-1860s accepted the claim made by the sisters who taught evening classes in Glasgow that the girls who attended were much better behaved than those who did not and 'made much better wives', commending their efforts to remedy such 'ignorance'.[76] The main source for this chapter has been such official reports and especially school log books written by head teachers. Logs are of variable use with some merely noting that the work of the school continued as usual and others giving substantial detail on what went on, with sometimes idiosyncratic commentaries. Holdings of Catholic school logs are scattered, making it difficult to assess the influence of the female religious orders or, indeed, the clergy, on Catholic elementary teachers in Scotland as a whole. Few of the logs kept by lay women which I have consulted make any reference to female religious, and though they note visits of the reverend manager, they rarely comment on them.

The annual reports of the religious examinations of Catholic schools in the Western Province, which included Glasgow, confirm the numerical predominance of lay women. For example, in the Greenock mission area from 1880 to 1881, there were 30 schools of which 3 were for boys and 3 for girls, 7 for infants and 17 mixed-sex. The principal teachers included 2 lay men, 6 from religious orders and 22 lay mistresses, of whom 1 was married.[77] This example also confirms the enormous expansion in Catholic elementary schooling after 1872 which overwhelmed the religious orders: by 1894, there were 180 Catholic schools in Scotland, with accommodation for 60,000 children.[78]

Certainly, influence cannot be measured just by numbers. At the same time, the religious orders were concentrated in Glasgow, with fewer in significant urban centres such as Edinburgh, Paisley, Dundee and Greenock. Indeed, Glasgow was the exception in what was a small-town society, and elementary schools in both small towns and rural areas relied on lay women.[79] The *Report of the Religious Examination of Schools* for July 1909–July 1910 recorded that there were 81 mostly mixed-sex schools in the mission area within Glasgow's orbit: 22 had male lay principals, 17 were from religious orders, and the majority were lay women. In contrast, in

Glasgow's 55 departments, there were 14 male principal teachers, 12 lay women and 24 from religious orders. Some schools had a mixture: St Joseph's in Glasgow had a male principal teacher in the boys' department, the Sisters of Mercy were in charge of the girls, and a lay woman managed the infants.[80] The report for July 1912–July 1913 revealed that in the mission schools of the Glasgow Archdiocese, there were 43 headmasters, 96 headmistresses, 58 trained male assistants, 521 trained female assistants, 16 untrained male assistants and 584 untrained female assistants.[81] On the eve of the passage of the Education Act in 1918, only 4 per cent of Scotland's Catholic schoolteachers were members of religious orders, and they were concentrated in Lowland secondary schools, orphanages and reformatories.[82]

Female religious were certainly important for teacher training, devoted themselves to provision for the very poor and for delinquent children, and played a key role in providing middle-class schooling.[83] However, by 1918 the orders did not have sufficient numbers even to provide opportunities for the minority of Catholic girls and boys who were able to go on to secondary education.[84] Teaching orders hoped to recruit from their students but the numbers were not large, and the motivation of some may have been the lack of opportunities outside of the religious life.[85] Most employment for working-class women was insecure, unskilled manual labour. Lay women, especially without qualifications, were cheap to employ in a system which had large numbers of children but received limited grants from the state. School logs show that the reverend manager visited often, but that the day-to-day running of the school was the responsibility of the mistress.[86] Logs rarely give access to the private thoughts of the teacher and, at least until the early twentieth century, few working- or lower middle-class women left personal reminiscences. In view of the pressures on poorly educated and often unqualified schoolmistresses outlined above, it is perhaps unsurprising that so many relied on rote learning and the tawse. However understandable that is, Jonathan Rose has provided us with the memories of two women who experienced such methods which, even if unrepresentative, are very uncomfortable to read.

There was a lack of professional alternatives to teaching for women of all faiths in late 19th- and early twentieth-century Scotland and little scope for promotion within schools.[87] Nevertheless, in view of the numbers of girls and women who taught at all levels in Catholic schools, it seems to have

been a position to which many aspired. Although salaries in Catholic schools were indeed considerably lower than under the boards, Catholic mistresses had more chances of a principal teacher's post than women employed by the latter. Given that many teachers had neither been taught nor trained by female religious, the impression is that the latter's role in elementary education was not as significant as was the case in Ireland with its much larger pool of teaching sisters. Even for those who were educated by the teaching orders, we cannot assume that the lay women simply did as the sisters told them given the lack of evidence on the relationship between them: as Martin Mitchell has said of the clergy, the fact that the female religious were important and influential figures did not mean that they could exercise authority without question.[88] The religious orders brought into Scotland were expected by the Church hierarchy to provide leadership in female education. However, in Catholic elementary schooling, lay mistresses were not only in the majority but also more representative of their community. Of course, they were on the bottom rung of the educational ladder, but since more parents sent their children to Catholic schools than attended church, these women were vital to the success of that strategy.[89]

Conclusion

The Church's mission was not just to protect its community but to raise expectations of what could be achieved through education in a hostile host society which believed that schooling should foster a common citizenship.[90] Whatever their limitations, lay women were the foot soldiers of the Catholic school system and (for good or ill) played a significant role in the schooling of the working class. Before the 1918 Act, they were severely limited by their own education, circumscribed opportunities and all the pressures described above. Recognizing their contribution to Catholic education does not detract from the significance of female religious. Rather, since teacher training remained under the control of the sisters of Notre Dame after the 1918 Act, they may have increased their influence on their growing numbers of students. Whatever the case, it is clear that when the 1918 Act incorporated Catholic schools into the national system, it gave their lay mistresses more opportunities for both intellectual and professional development.[91]

Notes

1. Jonathan Rose, *The Intellectual Life of the British Working Classes* (London: Yale University Press, 2001), 184–85.
2. See Sister Mary Bonaventure Dealy, *Catholic Schools in Scotland* (Washington: The Catholic University of America Press, 1945); Sister Martha Skinnider, "Catholic Elementary Education in Glasgow 1818–1918", in T. R. Bone (ed.), *Studies in the History of Scottish Education, 1872–1939* (London: London University Press, 1967).
3. The *46th Annual Report of the Catholic School Committee*, 1893, Glasgow Archdiocese Archive (GAA), ED9.
4. Bart Hellinckx, Frank Simon and Marc Depaepe, *The Forgotten Contribution of the Teaching Sisters: A Historiographical Essay on the Educational Work of Catholic Women Religious in the 19th and 20th Centuries*, Studia Paedagogica 44 (Leuven: Leuven University Press, 2009), 13. Some recent works examining the role of active women religious in the UK in the nineteenth century include Barbara Walsh, *Roman Catholic Nuns in England and Wales, 1800–1937* (Dublin: Irish Academic Press, 2002); Carmen M. Mangion, "'Good Teacher' or 'Good Religious'? The Professional Identity of Catholic Women Religious in Nineteenth-Century England and Wales", *Women's History Review*, 14(2), 2005, 223–242; S. Karly Kehoe, "Nursing the Mission. The Franciscan Sisters of the Immaculate Conception and the Sisters of Mercy in Glasgow, 1847–1866", *The Innes Review*, 56(1), 2005, 46–50; Deirdre Raftery, "The "mission" of nuns in female education in Ireland, c.1850–1950", *Paedagogica Historica*, 48(2), 2012, 299–313.
5. See Bernard Aspinwall, "Catholic Teachers for Scotland: the Liverpool Connection", *The Innes Review*, 45(1), 1994, 85–108.
6. Rose, *Intellectual Life*, 184.
7. Ibid., 186. See, for example, David Northcroft, *Scots at School* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2003).
8. For anti-Catholicism in Scotland, see, for example, Tom Gallagher, *Glasgow: The Uneasy Peace* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 1987); Graham Walker and Tom Gallagher (eds.), *Sermons and Battle Hymns: Protestant Popular Culture in Modern Scotland* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 1990); Raymond Boyle and Peter Lynch (eds.), *Out of the ghetto? The Catholic community in modern Scotland* (Edinburgh: John Donald, 1998); T. M. Devine (ed.), *Scotland's shame?*

Bigotry and sectarianism in modern Scotland (Edinburgh: Mainstream, 2000).

9. John F. McCaffrey, "Roman Catholics in Scotland in the 19th and 20th centuries", *Records of the Scottish Church History Society*, 21, 1991, 275–300: 275. See also Skinnider. 'Catholic Elementary Education in Glasgow', 13; James Cleland, *Enumeration of the Inhabitants of the City of Glasgow and the County of Lanark for the Government Census of 1831* (Glasgow: J. Smith, 1832), 260.
10. Martin J. Mitchell, *The Irish in the West of Scotland 1797–1848: Trade Unions, Strikes and Political Movements* (Edinburgh: John Donald, 1998), 2.
11. McCaffrey, 'Roman Catholics in Scotland', 276.
12. J. J. Smyth, *Labour in Glasgow 1896–1936: socialism, suffrage, sectarianism* (East Linton: Tuckwell Press, 2000), 127.
13. Mary Hickman, *Religion, Class and Identity: The State, the Catholic Church and the Education of the Irish in Britain* (Aldershot: Avebury, 1995), 12. In her study of Greenock, Airdrie and Coatbridge, Geraldine Vaughan argues instead that the Church's aim was not to 'de-nationalise' its Irish parishioners, but rather to keep them away from radical nationalism: Geraldine Vaughan, *The 'Local' Irish in the West of Scotland 1851–1921* (Basingstoke: Palgrave Macmillan, 2013), 133. See also her chapter in this volume.
14. For an example, see John Quinn, "The Mission of the Churches in Dundee 1846–1886", unpublished MLitt thesis, University of Stirling, 1993, 106–107.
15. See *The 47th Annual Report of the Catholic School Committee*, 1894, GAA, ED9; *The 42nd Annual Report of the Catholic School Committee*, 1889, 15, GAA, ED9/2.
16. William F. Hendrie, *The Dominie: A Profile of the Scottish Headmaster* (Edinburgh: John Donald, 1997), 1.
17. *The 39th Annual Report of the Catholic Poor School Committee*, 1886, v–vi, 7, GAA, ED9/2.
18. *Report of the Religious Examinations of Schools for 1880–81*, GAA, ED7.
19. Scottish Catholic Archives (SCA), DE99/1, Catholic Education Committee, 1906–1907: November 1906 and February 1907.
20. See *The 51st Annual Report of the Catholic School Committee*, 1898, GAA, ED9/2.
21. See, for example, the log book entries for 17 June and 1 August 1865, 2 October 1867, St Lawrence's School, Greenock, Glasgow City Archives (GCA), CO2/5/6/36/1.

22. Mary McHugh, "The Development of the Catholic Community in the Western Province (Roman Catholic Dioceses of Glasgow, Motherwell, and Paisley) 1878–1962", unpublished PhD thesis, University of Strathclyde, 1990, 116–17.
23. Skinnider, 'Catholic Elementary Education in Glasgow', 17–18.
24. Girls, including pupil teachers, tended to be kept at home to help mothers while they were engaged in heavy domestic duties such as laundry, or substitute for them when they were in paid employment, or ill, or to allow older sisters to earn money outside the home. See, for example, the log book for St John's R.C. mixed-sex school, Port Glasgow, entry for 3 February 1888, GCA, CO2/5/6/78/2.
25. Ibid., log book entry for 17 October 1887.
26. St James's School, Renfrew, GCA, CO2/5/6/77/1, log book entry for 18 September 1895.
27. See, for example, St John's Girls' School, Glasgow, GCA, D-ED7/222/2/1, log book entry for 30 April 1899. For (largely unsuccessful) incentives offered to children to improve attendance, see, for example, St Margaret's Girls' School, Glasgow, GCA, D-Ed7/161/2/1, log book entry for 11 February 1898; St John's Girls' School, Glasgow, GCA, D-ED7/222/2/1, log book entry for 25 June 1896.
28. See, for example, St John's School, Port Glasgow, GCA, CO2/5/6/36/1, log book entry for 14 September 1885.
29. For example, see Eskadale R.C. School, Highland County Archives (HCA), CI5/3/39b, log book entry for 17 May 1895; Duisdale School, HCA, CI5/3/34a, log book entry for 17 May 1895; Strontian School log book, HCA, CA5/3/16a, entry for 26 September 1879. Keeping boys at home for domestic reasons, especially if there were no older daughters, also happened in the industrial lowland regions: see, for example, St Mungo's Academy, GCA, D-Ed7/247/1/1, log book entries for 24 August 1867, 12 and 24 November 1868, 12 October 1883.
30. St Mary's Girls' School, GCA, SR10/3/894/2/1, log book entry for 20 August 1889.
31. St Margaret's Girls' School, GCA, D-ED7/161/2/2, log book entry for 11 April 1902.
32. See, for example, St Aloysius' School for Girls, GCA, D-ED7/188/1, log book entries for 1876.
33. Ibid., girls' and infants' school. See also Holy Cross School log books from 1882, GCA, D-ED7/103/1/1 for boys and girls; St Michael's School log books from 1877, GCA, SR10/896/1/1.

34. Francis J. O'Hagan, *The Contribution of the Religious Orders to Education in Glasgow During the Period 1847–1918* (Lampeter: The Edwin Mellen Press, 2006), 181. For the late nineteenth century, see, for example, St John's Boys' School, GCA, D-Ed7/221/1/1, log book entry for 18 May 1888; St Margaret's Boys' School, Kinning Park, GCA, D-ED7/161/1/1, log book entry for 18 February 1884.
35. Vaughan, *'Local' Irish in the West of Scotland*, 77.
36. For examples from my sample of Catholic schools, see the log books of the following schools: GCA, CO2/5/6/45/1, St Margaret's, Johnstone; CO2/5/6/77/1, St James', Renfrew; CO2/5/6/65/1-2, St Mary's, Paisley; CO3/10/7/52/1, St Mary's, Largs. See also Dumfries Ewart Library, KD5/151/1, St Peter's, Dalbeattie, Kirkcudbright; and HCA, CI5/3/39/a, Eskadale R.C. School, Inverness.
37. St Ninian's School, Gourock, May 1893, GCA, CO2/5/6/18/1.
38. *The 20th Annual Report of the Religious Examination of Schools (1896–97)*, CAGA, ED7. See also the *Forty-Second* (1889) and *Fiftieth* (1897) Annual Reports of the Catholic School Committee, GAA, ED9/2.
39. Holy Cross School, GCA, D-ED7/103/1/1, log book entry for January 1900.
40. See Bernard Aspinwall, "Children of the Dead End: The Formation of the Modern Archdiocese of Glasgow, 1815–1914", *The Innes Review*, 43(2), 1992, 119–144.
41. See, for example, St Lawrence's School Greenock, GCA, CO2/5/6/36/1, log book entry for 31 July 1866; Albert Public School, Airdrie, GCA, CO1/5/5/2/2, log book entry for 31 August 1893.
42. See, for example, Achnarrow Public School, HCA, CI5/3/4a, log book entry for 16 May 1882; Braes School, HCA, CI5/3/14a, log book entry for 21 May 1896.
43. St Aloysius' School, GCA, D-ED7/188/1, log book entry for 30 November 1888.
44. For the School of Cookery, see the Hill and Hogan Bequest Correspondence (1889–1903), GCA, T-HH4/3/1-3, and the Sederunt Book of Directors of the Glasgow School of Cookery, GCA, T-HH4/1//1.
45. For example, see Jane McDermid, *The Schooling of Working-Class Girls in Victorian Scotland: Gender, Education and Identity* (London: Routledge, 2005), chapters 3 and 4.
46. See, for example, St Andrew's Boys' School, GCA, D-ED7/192/1/1, log book entry for April 1877; St Margaret's Boys' School, GCA, D-ED7/161/1/2, log book entry for January 1897.

47. St Joseph's School, HCA, CI5/3/53a, log book entries for February 1873, May 1876, and the HMI Report for 1898. See also Jane McDermid, "Gender and geography: the schooling of poor girls in the highlands and islands of nineteenth-century Scotland", *History of Education Review*, 32(2), 2003, 30–45.
48. See, for example, St Aloysius' School, GCA, D-Ed7/189/1/1, log book report for 1899; St Mary's Girls' School, GCA, SR10/3/894/2/1, log book entry for 6 August 1897.
49. McCaffrey, 'Roman Catholics in Scotland', 298; Skinnider, 'Catholic Elementary Education in Glasgow', 31. For before the 1872 Education Act, see T. A. FitzPatrick, *Catholic Secondary Education in South-West Scotland Before 1872: its contribution to the change in status of the Catholic community* (Aberdeen: Aberdeen University Press, 1986).
50. Alexander Wall, "The Supply of Certificated Teachers to the Roman Catholic Elementary Schools of Britain 1848–1870", unpublished MPhil thesis, University of Lancaster, 1983, 289. Bernard Aspinwall compiled a list of 195 women associated with Scotland who trained at Mount Pleasant College in Liverpool between the mid-1850s and early 1900s, which shows that 57 entered religious life, 67 married, 71 remained single and lay teachers: 'Catholic Teachers for Scotland', 89–101.
51. See Helen Corr, "The sexual division of labour in the Scottish teaching profession", in W. M. Humes and H. M. Paterson (eds.), *Scottish Culture and Scottish Education* (Edinburgh: John Donald, 1983). See also T. A. FitzPatrick, "Scottish Catholic Teacher Education: the wider context", *The Innes Review*, 45(2), 1994, 147–70.
52. *The Report of the Committee of Council on Education in Scotland, 1891–92*. See also FitzPatrick, 'Scottish Catholic Teacher Education: the wider context', 60.
53. Aspinwall, 'Catholic Teachers for Scotland', 87. See also *The 51st Annual Report of the Catholic School Committee*, 1898, and *The 53rd Annual Report of the Catholic School Committee*, 1900, 2–3, GAA, ED9/2.
54. Aspinwall, 'Catholic Teachers for Scotland', 87. See also O'Hagan, *Contribution of the Religious Orders*, 243.
55. See Kim Lowden, "Spirited Sisters: Anglican and Catholic Contributions to Women's Teacher Training in the Nineteenth Century", unpublished PhD thesis, University of Liverpool, 2000, 316.
56. Holy Cross School, Crosshill, GCA, D-ED7/103/1/1, log book entries for 15 August 1898 and summary of HMI Report. For the LLA (sometimes referred to as Lady Literate in Arts), see Robert Bell and Malcolm

Tight, *Open Universities: A British Tradition* (Buckingham: Open University Press, 1993), 78; Lindy Moore, "Women in Education", in Heather Holmes (ed.) *Scottish Life and Society Volume 11: Institutions of Scotland: Education* (East Linton: Tuckwell Press, 2000), 316–343, especially 320.

57. *The 46th Annual Report of the Catholic School Committee*, 1893, GAA, ED9/2, 13, where 'several' was not quantified. See also O'Hagan, *Contribution of the Religious Orders*, 246–47.
58. *Report of the Committee of Council on Education in Scotland*, 1891–1892, 257 and 1902–1903, 18.
59. Skinnider, 'Catholic Elementary Education in Glasgow', 39.
60. Rev. Joseph Holder, *Basis for An Argument in Favour of the Better Payment of Female Assistant Teachers in the Employ of the Dundee School Board* (Dundee: John Leng & Co., 1894): SCA, SM/13/43/2.
61. Ray Burnett, "'The Long Nineteenth Century': Scotland's Catholic Gaidhealtachd" in Boyle and Lynch (eds.), *Out of the Ghetto?*, 166–68.
62. See, for example, Eskadale R.C. School, HCA, CI5/3/39a, log book entry for 29 April 1874 where the reverend manager catechized the pupils in Gaelic.
63. See Drummore Public School, Perth and Kinross Record Office, CC1/5/7/27, log book entry for October 1876.
64. See the *53rd Annual Report of the Catholic School Committee*, 1900, GAA, ED9/2, 2, for the social origins of the teachers. See the *Report of the Committee of Council on Education in Scotland*, 1895–1896, 16–17, and 1902–03, 759–70, for the preference for university educated teachers. See also Marjorie Cruikshank, *A History of the Training of Teachers in Scotland* (London: University of London Press, 1970). Steve Bruce et al., *Sectarianism in Scotland* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2004), 22–23, show that some parts of the press were sympathetic to the situation of the Catholic community.
65. See Gallagher, *The Uneasy Peace*, 23.
66. See O'Hagan, *Contribution of the Religious Orders*, chapters 3 and 5.
67. *Report of the Committee of Council on Education in Scotland*, 1902–03, 18.
68. McHugh, "Development of the Catholic Community in the Western Province", 76.
69. F. G. Rea, *A School in South Uist: Reminiscences of a Hebridean Schoolmaster, 1890–1913* (Edinburgh: Birlinn, 1997), 81.

70. David Limond, "The Female Experience of Schooling in Scotland, 1872–1945: Lassies o' Pairts or Lassies Apart?", unpublished PhD thesis, University of Glasgow, 1996, iii.
71. S. Karly Kehoe, *Creating a Scottish Catholic Church: Catholicism, gender and ethnicity in nineteenth-century Scotland* (Manchester: Manchester University Press, 2010), 134.
72. Memo of 23 November 1917 from the Ecclesiastical Managers, St Patrick's School, to Lord Skerrington, SCA, DE105/1.
73. St John's School, Port Glasgow, GCA, CO2/5/6/73/1, 205, emphasis (underlining) in the log book.
74. O'Hagan, *Contribution of the Religious Orders*, 22.
75. Kehoe, *Creating a Scottish Church*, especially chapter 4.
76. James Greig and Thomas Harvey, *Education Commission (Scotland). Report on the State of Education in Glasgow* (Edinburgh: Thomas Constable for H.M.S.O., 1866), 84.
77. *Report of the Religious Examination of Schools*, July 1880–July 1881, 14, GAA, ED7. Bernard Aspinwall has pointed out that it was common for Catholic schoolmistresses to continue teaching after marriage: 'Catholic Teachers for Scotland: the Liverpool Connection', 89.
78. Ibid., 85.
79. John F. McCaffrey, *Scotland in the 19th Century* (Basingstoke: Macmillan, 1998), 3.
80. *Report of the Religious Examination of Schools*, July 1909–July 1910, 9, GAA, ED7. The remaining principals were recorded with initials only. Whereas lay mistresses were identified by surname and usually first name, this was generally not the case for the sisters who taught. See York Lane R.C. School Accounts book 1889–1903, SCA, SM13/15: the maximum number of un-named sisters who taught there in the 1890s was three, compared to between 10 and 13 named lay mistresses.
81. *Report of the Religious Examination of Schools*, July 1912–July 1913, 6, GAA, ED7. 'Untrained' denoted former pupil teachers who did not go on to teacher training college.
82. Dealy, *Catholic Schools in Scotland*, 162.
83. O'Hagan, *Contribution of the Religious Orders*, 12.
84. Dealy, *Catholic Schools in Scotland*, 162.
85. Kehoe, *Creating a Scottish Catholic Church*, 135.
86. Rev. Brother Kenneth, *Catholic Schools in Scotland 1872–1972* (Glasgow: Catholic Education Commission, 1972), 11.

87. See Helen Corr, "Teachers and Gender: debating the myths of equal opportunities in Scottish education 1800–1914", *Cambridge Journal of Education*, 27(3), 1997, 355–63.
88. Martin J. Mitchell (ed.), *New Perspectives on The Irish in Scotland* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2008), 2. For Ireland see, for example, Deirdre Raftery and Catherine Nowlan-Roebuck, "Convent Schools and National Education in Nineteenth-Century Ireland: Negotiating a Place within a Non-denominational System", *History of Education*, 36(3), 2007, 353–65.
89. For a discussion of the importance of schools to the Church's strategy, see Hickman, *Religion, Class and Identity*, 252.
90. See R. D. Anderson, *Education and the Scottish People* (Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1995); Lindsay Paterson, *Scottish Education in the 20th Century* (Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2003).
91. See Anthony Ross, "The Development of the Scottish Catholic community 1878-1978", *The Innes Review*, 29(1), 1978, 30–55, on the significance of the 1918 Act for the Catholic community in Scotland in guaranteeing religious freedom, relieving financial burdens and contributing to the growth of a Catholic middle class.