#### **ORIGINAL PAPER**



# Levels, Sources, Markers and Health Risks of Heavy Metals in PM<sub>2.5</sub> **Over a Typical Mining and Metallurgical City of Central China**

Jingru Zheng<sup>1,2</sup> · Changlin Zhan<sup>1,2</sup> · Ruizhen Yao<sup>1,2</sup> · Jiaquan Zhang<sup>1,2</sup> · Hongxia Liu<sup>1,2</sup> · Ting Liu<sup>1,2</sup> · Wensheng Xiao<sup>1,2</sup> · Xianli Liu<sup>1,2</sup> · Junji Cao<sup>3</sup>

Received: 24 September 2017 / Revised: 20 November 2017 / Accepted: 29 November 2017 / Published online: 5 December 2017 © Institute of Earth Environment, Chinese Academy Sciences 2017

#### **Abstract**

To investigate the pollution characteristics, sources and health risk assessment of various elements in  $PM_{2.5}$  of Huangshi city, 54 samples were collected from March 2012 to February 2013. The composition and characteristic of sixteen elements (Mg, Al, Ca, Ti, Cr, Mn, Cu, Zn, V, Fe, As, Pb, Cd, Co, Ni and W) were analyzed by high-sensitivity X-ray fuorescence (XRF). The result showed that the annual mean concentration of  $PM_{2.5}$  was 104.4  $\mu$ g/m<sup>3</sup>, far exceeding the secondary level of Ambient Air Quality Standard of China (annual average limit  $35 \mu g/m^3$ ). Element W has the highest annual concentration, followed by Zn, Pb and As. Compared with the concentration limit of National Ambient Air Quality Standard of China, Cd and As in Huangshi were 4.3 times and 32.8 times higher, respectively, than national standard. The concentration of most elements has distinct seasonal characteristic which is higher in winter and lower in summer. Enrichment factor (EF) analysis indicates that W, Fe, Cd, As, Pb, Zn, Cu, Cr, Co and Ni are extremely enriched in  $PM<sub>2</sub>$ , Ca, Mg and Mn are highly enriched, and V is signifcant enriched. EF of Ti is less than 2, suggesting minimal pollution. Positive matrix factorization (PMF) analysis indicates that Ca, Ti and Al are associated with fugitive dust, and As is associated with coal-fred industrial activity. W, Cr, Cd, V and Ni are originated from chemical and metallurgical industry activities. Pb, Zn, Cu and Mg are derived from vehicle emissions. The results of the human health risk assessment model show that As may pose great non-carcinogenic risk to children and adults. Cr and As have a higher carcinogenic risk for adults, and Cr has a higher carcinogenic risk for children, and other toxic metals are in relatively safe range.

**Keywords** Huangshi city  $\cdot PM_{2.5} \cdot Elements$   $\cdot Enrichment factor \cdot Source \cdot Health risk$ 

# **1 Introduction**

Atmospheric particulates, especially fine particles ( $PM<sub>2.5</sub>$ ), can difuse and absorb solar radiation and directly afect visibility and climate change (Booth et al. [2012;](#page-7-0) Cao et al. [2012b;](#page-7-1) Pöschl [2005](#page-8-0); Ramanathan et al. [2001\)](#page-8-1). Epidemiological studies have confrmed that cardiovascular morbidity and mortality are closely related to atmospheric particulate

 $\boxtimes$  Changlin Zhan chl\_zhan@126.com concentrations (Brook et al. [2010;](#page-7-2) Pope et al. [2002,](#page-8-2) [2009](#page-8-3); Thurston et al. [2016\)](#page-8-4). Atmospheric particulate matter (PM) is important carrier of toxic and harmful metal elements (such as Cr, As, Cd, Ni, Cu, Pb, Zn, etc.) and other organic pollutants (such as PAHs, VOCs). Studies show that smaller particle, due to its relative larger surface area, carries pollutants that are higher in quantity and complexity and obtains easier access to body's respiratory system and blood circulation, thus impacting human health (Meng et al. [2013](#page-8-5)); consequently,  $PM<sub>2.5</sub>$  has become a heated topic for current international atmospheric environment.

Many previous studies have analyzed the pollution characteristics, specifc sources and toxicity of heavy metals in ambient PM, due to their adverse health effects (Chen et al. [2015;](#page-8-6) Satsangi et al. [2014;](#page-8-7) Schleicher et al. [2011](#page-8-8); Tecer et al. [2012](#page-8-9); Wild et al. [2009\)](#page-9-0). Heavy metals, mostly from traffic and industrial emissions, are differed widely from the sites of ambient environment. Industrial activities such as

School of Environmental Science and Engineering, Hubei Polytechnic University, Huangshi 435003, China

<sup>2</sup> Hubei Key Laboratory of Mine Environmental Pollution Control and Remediation, Huangshi 435003, China

Key Laboratory of Aerosol Chemistry and Physics (KLACP), Institute of Earth Environment, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Xi'an 710061, China

metallurgical (steel, copper, stainless steel and other forms of nonferrous metals), concrete, ceramic and petrochemical industries have diferent characteristics of marker elements. For example, metallurgy production emissions are linked to high levels of Cr, Ni, Cu, Zn, Mn, Cd, As, Pb and Sn, while high levels of Ni and V are always regarded as the tracers of petrochemical industries or fuel–oil combustion (Querol et al. [2007\)](#page-8-10). Marker elements may provide certain insights in the interpretation of PM emission sources in receptormodeling studies.

With the rapid development of China's economy and technology, the problem of urban air pollution has become more complicated and poses a great threat to human health. In 2013, *The 2010 Global Disease Burden Assessment* noted that in 2010, China's outdoor  $PM_{2.5}$  pollution resulted in 1.234 million deaths and 25 million years of health life loss in China (Yang et al. [2013\)](#page-9-1). At present, domestic research on atmospheric  $PM<sub>2.5</sub>$  pollution is mainly focused on large cities such as Beijing, Shanghai, Guangzhou, Chengdu, Xi'an, Nanjing, Tianjin, etc., discussing the  $PM<sub>2.5</sub>$  pollution characteristics, element composition, source apportionment and health risk (Cao et al. [2012a](#page-7-3); Hu et al. [2012](#page-8-11); Huang et al. [2014](#page-8-12); Tao et al. [2013;](#page-8-13) Wang et al. [2006](#page-9-2), [2013;](#page-9-3) Zhang and Cao [2015](#page-9-4); Zheng et al. [2005\)](#page-9-5). In recent years, haze events frequently occur over the Wuhan city cluster and its surrounding areas during autumn and winter, and have aroused widespread concern of the public. Unfortunately, study of urban atmospheric  $PM<sub>2.5</sub>$  in central China is rarely reported at present (Guo et al. [2015](#page-8-14); Lyu et al. [2016](#page-8-15); Wei et al. [1999](#page-9-6)).

Huangshi City is located in the southeastern part of Hubei Province, at the south bank of the middle reaches of the Yangtze River. It is the suburban center of Wuhan city cluster and is also an important industrial base of raw materials in central China. Huangshi holds rich mineral resources, with more than 190 deposits of iron, copper and gold, providing favorable conditions for the metallurgical, chemical, building materials industries. However, long periods of mineral resource exploitation and smelting have seriously afected the ecological environment of Huangshi area, and heavy metal pollution is particularly serious (Cai et al. [2015;](#page-7-4) Du et al. [2015;](#page-8-16) Gao et al. [2003;](#page-8-17) Yan et al. [2007](#page-9-7); Yu et al. [2005](#page-9-8)). Additionally in recent years, the number of motor vehicles in Huangshi increased yearly, motor vehicle emissions added serious burden to local air pollution. The study of atmospheric  $PM_{2.5}$  in Huangshi area is of great signifcance to understand the composition, content and source of heavy metals in urban atmosphere, so to protect public health and formulate practical control measures.

In this study, the  $PM<sub>2.5</sub>$  samples were collected at a building rooftop of Hubei Polytechnic University, located in Huangshi, from March 2012 to February 2013. The mass concentrations of  $PM_{2.5}$  and 16 elements were analyzed. The element composition and sources were assessed, and the health risks of heavy metal elements were evaluated. We hope this study could provide basic data and reference for Huangshi atmospheric environmental management, pollution prevention and health protection.

# **2 Materials and Methods**

#### **2.1 Sampling and Analysis**

The sampling site (30°12′35.47″N,115°01′30.38″E) of this study was located on the rooftop of the Environmental Science and Engineering Institute building (about 16 m above ground and 48 m above sea level) in Hubei Polytechnic University of Huangshi city, close to central China (Fig. [1](#page-2-0)). No single specifc pollution sources were identifed near the sampling site.

Fifty-four  $PM_{2.5}$  samples were collected from March 31, 2012 to February 24, 2013 with battery-powered minivolume samplers (Airmetrics, Oregon, USA) operating at a flow rate of 5 L/min. One 24-h PM<sub>2.5</sub> sample was collected on 47-mm tefon flter (Whatman, England) every 6 day. The sampling was started at 9:00 am to next day at 9:00 am. Before and after sampling, the flters were conditioned at  $20 \pm 1$  °C in relative humidity of  $50 \pm 2\%$  for 24 h. The filters were then weighed by an electronic microbalance with a detection sensitivity of 1 μg (Mettle M3, Switzerland). The filter samples were stored at  $-4$  °C until pretreatment.

The mass concentration of  $PM<sub>2.5</sub>$  was determined by gravimetric method. The element compositions were analyzed after being exposed to high-sensitivity X-ray fuorescence (Epsilon 5, Netherlands) under certain conditions (30 °C) for 22 min. Sixteen elements (Ca, Mg, Ti, Al, Cr, Mn, Cu, Zn, V, Fe, As, Pb, Cd, Co, Ni and W) were measured for each  $PM_{2.5}$  sample.

# **2.2 Enrichment Factors (EFs)**

EFs are often used to assess the degree of element enrichment in atmospheric particulate matter and determine the geological or anthropogenic origin of a certain pollutant element. The equation for the EFs is:

$$
EF = \frac{(C_i/C_n)_{\text{sample}}}{(C_i/C_n)_{\text{background}}},\tag{1}
$$

where  $i$  is the element of interest,  $C_i$  is the concentration of  $i$ , and  $C_n$  is the concentration of a reference element.  $(C_i/C_n)_{\text{sample}}$  represents the concentration ratio of studied element collected in  $PM_{2.5}$  sample to the reference element, and  $(C_i/C_n)_{\text{background}}$  is the concentration ratio of studied element to reference element of background soil. In this study,



<span id="page-2-0"></span>**Fig. 1** Location of Huangshi City. The green color in the map means protected areas (color fgure online)

aluminum (Al) was chosen as the reference element, and the concentration of Al (7.19%) was taken from soil background values in China (China National Environmental Monitoring Center [1990\)](#page-8-18). If the EFs value is between 0 and 1, it generally indicates that the element is not enriched in the atmosphere, but primarily originated from geological weathering. If the EFs value is between 1 and 10, it means that the element was infuenced by both natural and anthropogenic sources. If the EFs is higher than 10, it indicates that the element was dominated by anthropogenic contributions. According to the study of Sutherland [\(2000\)](#page-8-19), the pollution enrichment levels can be divided into a five-category system: when EFs is less than 2, it suggests nearly no enrichment or minimal pollution; when EFs is between 2 and 5, it suggests moderate enrichment; when EFs is between 5 and 20, it suggests signifcant enrichment; when EFs is between 20 and 40, it suggests highly enrichment; when EFs is greater than 40, it suggests extremely enrichment.

### **2.3 Source Apportionment**

Positive matrix factorization (PMF) is a multivariate receptor model that estimates the source profles and their contributions based on a weighted least square approach (Paatero and Tapper [1993\)](#page-8-20). It is also a tool for analyzing atmospheric particulate source recommended by the US Environmental Protection Agency (US EPA) and the Ministry of Environmental Protection of China. In the present study, PMF

5.0 was employed with the inclusion of 16 elements in the model computation.

#### **2.4 Health Risk Assessment**

According to the human health risk assessment model based on those developed by the US EPA ([2011a](#page-9-9)), exposure parameters suitable for Chinese were selected, exposure concentration (EC) was estimated to assess the health risks of ten inhalable heavy elements (Cr, Mn, Cu, Zn, V, As, Pb, Cd, Co and Ni) in  $PM_{2.5}$ . The reference dose of W and Fe was not available, so the assessment of health risks in this study did not include W and Fe. The assessment subjects were divided into two groups: adults  $(> 15$  years) and children (0–15 years), owning to the diferences in their behavior and respiratory system (Li et al. [2016](#page-8-21)). In this study, Mn, Cu, Zn and V are non-carcinogenic, and Cr, As, Cd, Co, Pb and Ni are carcinogenic.

The average daily dose of heavy metals exposure through inhalation of particulate matter is calculated by following the Eq.  $(2)$  $(2)$ :

<span id="page-2-1"></span>
$$
EC_{inh} = \frac{C \times ET \times EF \times ED}{AT},
$$
 (2)

where *C* represents heavy metal concentration in  $PM_{2.5}$ ( $\mu$ g/m<sup>3</sup>); ET is exposure time (h/day); EF is exposure frequency (day/year); ED is duration of exposure (a); and AT is the average exposure time through inhalation (h). For non-carcinogens,  $AT = ED \times 365$  days  $\times 24$  h/day; for carcinogens,  $AT = 70 \times 365$  days  $\times$  24 h/day. The parameters involved in the model are shown in Table [1](#page-3-0).

The risk of exposure to heavy metals through inhalation is calculated by Eqs. ([3\)](#page-3-1) and ([4](#page-3-2)) (Li et al. [2016;](#page-8-21) You et al. [2017](#page-9-10)):

$$
HQ = \frac{EC_{inh}}{RfC_i \times 1000},
$$
\n(3)

 $ELCR = IUR \times EC<sub>inh</sub>$ , (4)

where HQ is non-carcinogenic quotient; ELCR is excess lifetime carcinogenic risk;  $RfC<sub>i</sub>$  is the inhalation reference concentration, mg/m<sup>3</sup>; IUR is the inhalation unit risk, per  $\mu$ g/m<sup>3</sup>.

## **3 Results and Discussion**

# **3.1 Mass Concentrations and Characteristics of PM2.5 and Elements**

<span id="page-3-2"></span><span id="page-3-1"></span>Table [2](#page-3-3) shows the mass concentrations of atmospheric  $PM<sub>2.5</sub>$  and 16 elements in Huangshi. The results indicate that during the sampling period, the average annual  $PM_{2.5}$ concentration in Huangshi is 104.4  $\mu$ g/m<sup>3</sup>, and the mean values of  $PM<sub>2.5</sub>$  in spring, summer, autumn and winter are  $(96.9 \pm 27.0) \,\mu\text{g/m}^3$ ,  $(60.7 \pm 24.7) \,\mu\text{g/m}^3$ ,  $(111.1 \pm 45.8)$ μg/m<sup>3</sup> and (114.0  $\pm$  43.8) μg/m<sup>3</sup>, respectively. Compared with the average 24-h (75  $\mu$ g/m<sup>3</sup>) PM<sub>2.5</sub> mass concentration standard set from China's "Environmental Quality Standards" (GB 3095-2012 [2012\)](#page-8-22), except for summer, Huangshi PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration in spring, autumn and winter is 1.29 times, 1.48 times and 1.52 times higher than national average, respectively. The concentration of  $PM_{2.5}$  in autumn and winter is evidently higher than that in summer, which is similar to many other studies. The main reason is that

#### <span id="page-3-0"></span>**Table 1** Exposure parameters via respiration

Adults	Children	References
350	350	$(HJ 25.3-2014 2014)$
24	<sub>(</sub>	$(HJ 25.3-2014 2014)$
$70 \times 365 \times 24$	$70 \times 365 \times 24$	(US EPA 2013)
$ED \times 365 \times 24$	$ED \times 365 \times 24$	(US EPA 2013)

<span id="page-3-3"></span>**Table 2**  $PM_{2.5}$  ( $\mu$ g/m<sup>3</sup>) and 16 metal elements ( $\text{ng/m}^3$ ) mass concentrations in Huangshi city



*SD* standard deviation

solar radiation is relatively weak during autumn and winter in Huangshi when the atmospheric boundary layer is low, the pollutants are difficult to disperse, and less rainfall also contributes to the accumulation of pollutants. While during summer, solar radiation is stronger and boundary layer is higher, assisted by frequent rainfall removing pollutants, PM<sub>2.5</sub> concentration could remain at a lower level. Comparing with other cities, annual average of  $PM<sub>2.5</sub>$  mass concentration in Huangshi is similar to that of Beijing (101  $\mu$ g/m<sup>3</sup>, Zheng et al.  $2005$ ), Shanghai (103.07  $\mu$ g/m<sup>3</sup>, Wang et al. [2013\)](#page-9-3) and Shijiazhuang (101.4 μg/m<sup>3</sup>, Wang et al. [2013](#page-9-3)), however, signifcantly higher than that of Xiamen (34.1 μg/  $m<sup>3</sup>$ , Zhang and Cao [2015](#page-9-4)), Shenzhen (32.0 μg/m<sup>3</sup>, Zhang and Cao  $2015$ ), Chongqing (59.1  $\mu$ g/m<sup>3</sup>, Zhang and Cao [2015\)](#page-9-4), and other cities in Europe or North America (Cheng et al. [2016](#page-8-24); Salameh et al. [2015\)](#page-8-25).

Element W has the highest concentration in  $PM_{2.5}$  of Huangshi (2348.1 ng/m<sup>3</sup>). W is a rare metal element, commonly used for special alloy steel, which are massively produced for cutting tools and mining tools. Tungsten ore reserves are abundant in Huangshi, together with enterprises of special steel production and processing, resulted in the high enrichment of W in  $PM_{2.5}$  of this region. While no similar report is found in studies of other cities. The order of mass concentration of studied element is  $W > Fe > Zn$  $Ca > Al > Pb > As > Cu > Mn > Cr > Ti > Cd > Ni > Co$ > V. Among them, the average concentration of Pb, Cd and As is 293.3, 21.4 and 196.9 ng/m<sup>3</sup>, respectively, which is  $0.6$ times, 4.3 times and 32.8 times of the reference concentration limit in the Ambient Air Quality Standard of China (GB 3095-2012 [2012](#page-8-22)). Element As exceeds the limit drastically. V has the lowest annual average concentration  $(2.1 \text{ ng/m}^3)$ , well below the reference concentration of WHO (1000 ng/  $m<sup>3</sup>$ ). The average annual concentrations of Zn, Cu, Mn, Cr, Ni and Co are 582.1, 51.9, 51.8, 31.1, 6.1 and 2.9 ng/m<sup>3</sup>, respectively; however, the current Ambient Air Quality Standard of China (GB 3095-2012 [2012\)](#page-8-22) has no concentration limits requirement for these elements.

Regard to seasonal variation, the mass concentrations of Ca, Mg, Ti, Al, Cr, Mn, As and Ni all show the highest concentration in winter and the lowest concentration in summer, which is consistent with the variation of  $PM<sub>2.5</sub>$  mass concentration. The seasonal variations of Fe, Cu, Zn and Pb are similar, which is high in spring, autumn and winter, while lower in summer. Mass concentration of V is highest in summer and lowest in winter, while Cd concentration is highest in autumn and lowest in spring. W mass concentration shows a trend of spring > summer > autumn > winter. The possible reasons for most of the metal element concentrations being lowest in summer are: (1) high frequent precipitation in summer enhances wet deposition effect; (2) the surface runoff formed by the summer rainfall to certain extent suppress fugitive dust caused by city traffic,

and reduce their contribution to atmospheric particulate; (3) fourishing vegetation in summer absorbs and removes some heavy metals from the atmosphere. The seasonal variation of particular elements may be related to specifc pollution sources in the region, which remains to be further studied.

As shown in Table [3](#page-5-0),  $PM<sub>2.5</sub>$  metal element concentrations in China's large- and medium-sized cities are signifcantly higher than those of overseas, indicating that domestic urban air pollution of metal elements is more severe and lead to greater damage to human health. Because of the diferences in sampling time, sampling season, type of sampling site, analysis method and emission source in diferent cities, there are big diferences in the concentration of metal elements in  $PM<sub>2.5</sub>$  in different cities at home and abroad.

## **3.2 EF Characteristics and Source of Elements**

### **3.2.1 EF**

The annual EF for 16 elements is shown in Fig. [2](#page-6-0). It is clear that the EF value of W is the highest, nearly reaching 277853.2; followed by Fe and Cd, which exceed 10,000; Zn, As, Pb and Cu also show high  $EF$  ( $> 100$ ); Ca, Cr, Co, Mn and Ni appear to be greater than 10. It suggests that these extremely enriched elements were probably largely afected by anthropogenic emissions, in consistent with the highly industrialized environment studied. W is possibly related to the prosperous special steel industry, while Fe and Cd are more likely impacted by the industrial processes of iron and steel smelting. The enrichment of Ca may be related to cement production and construction fugitive dust. The EF values of Mg and V are 7.4 and 4.3, respectively, which suggests that they were infuenced both by natural and anthropogenic sources. Ti has an EF of 0.9, mainly originating from natural sources such as crust or rock weathering.

The order of the mean annual EF value of element in Huangshi city is:  $W > Fe > Cd > As > Pb > Zn > Cu > C$  $r > Co > Ni > Ca > Mn > Mg > V > Ti$ , which also shows their accumulation degree. According to the Sutherland clas-sification of enrichment factor (Sutherland [2000](#page-8-19)), the mean value EF of W, Fe, Cd, As, Pb, Zn, Cu, Cr, Co and Ni is greater than 40, indicating that these elements are superenriched and critically harmful. The EF of Ca, Mg and Mn is between 5 and 20, indicating signifcant enrichment, and the EF value of V is between 2 and 5, which is moderate enrichment. The EF value of Ti is less than 2, generally no enrichment.

#### **3.2.2 PMF Fingerprints**

The source apportionment of 16 elements in  $PM_{2,5}$  is determined by PMF source analysis method. After several times of operation, analysis and comparison, four factors were



<span id="page-5-0"></span>Ė

extracted by the PMF model, and the result of factor pro fles is shown in Fig. [3](#page-6-1). The extracted factors are interpreted as follows.

Factor 1 has high loadings of Ca, Ti and Al, and explains 66.3, 63.2 and 47.4% of variance, respectively. Ca is a rep resentative indicator of cement dust, mainly from cement and gypsum plants or construction sites (Kim et al. [2004](#page-8-26)). Ti and Al are important markers of crustal source or soil dust (Lough et al. [2005;](#page-8-27) Viana et al. [2008\)](#page-9-12). Thus, factor 1 is related to crust dust or soil dust.

Factor 2 explains approximately 89.6% of the variance in As, which has the highest loading. Many previous studies have shown that emissions from coal combustion contains higher concentration of As (Duan and Tan [2013](#page-8-28); Kang et al. [2011](#page-8-29); Tian et al. [2010\)](#page-8-30). This factor is attributed to emissions from coal combustion.

Factor 3 explains 81.7% of the variance for W. Further more, the factor profle is dominated by Ni, V, Cr and Cd, which explains 72.5, 64.2, 54.5 and 53.4% of the variance, respectively. W is mainly used in alloy manufacturing and metal processing (Yih and Wang [1979](#page-9-13)). In addition to fuel combustion (Vallius et al. [2005](#page-9-14)), Ni and V could also derive from the mineral extraction process (Brown et al. [2007](#page-7-5)). Cr and Cd are the symbolic elements (Alleman et al. [2010\)](#page-7-6) in particulate matter which emitted from the petrochemical industry; they also come from the high temperature combus tion of coal, oil and garbage (Uberoi and Shadman [1991](#page-9-15)). Huangshi is an important base for iron ore and nonferrous mineral production in China, many metal manufacturing and processing, metal smelting enterprises. All these industrial activities may have an important contribution to the heavy metal elements, such as W, Ni, V, Cr and Cd in  $PM_{2.5}$ . Therefore, factor 3 is possibly from anthropogenic source, which is related to the activities of the chemical and metallurgical industries.

In factor 4, the loadings of Pb, Zn, Cu and Mg are higher, which explains 74.2, 69.6, 39.9 and 35.9% of the variance, respectively. Pb and Zn are often used to indicate motor vehicle exhaust (Grieshop et al. [2006](#page-8-31); Tecer et al. [2012\)](#page-8-9). The high loading of Cu is a clear marker of vehicles exhaust, tires and brakes abrasion (Kuang et al. [2004\)](#page-8-32), while the presence of Mg could be derived from traffic fugitive dust. Therefore, the origin of this factor is mainly related to traffic exhaust emissions.

# **3.3 Health Risk Analysis**

Carcinogenic risk and non-carcinogenic analysis of 10 toxic heavy metal elements contained in Huangshi  $PM<sub>2.5</sub>$ are shown in Table [4](#page-7-7). Element As has the highest noncarcinogenic risk (4.32), significantly higher than the limit of US EPA, indicating that As may lead to non-car cinogenic health risks for both adults and children. The

<span id="page-6-0"></span>

 $PM<sub>2.5</sub>$ 





<span id="page-6-1"></span>**Fig. 3** PMF fngerprints of 16 elements in Huangshi  $PM_{2.5}$ 



both adults and children, which is similar to the order of non-cardiogenic risk value in this study.

As seen from Table [4,](#page-7-7) the risks of carcinogenic heavy metals for adults and children are similar, both following

<span id="page-7-7"></span>**Table 4** Cardiogenic risk of inhalable toxic heavy metals in Huangshi  $PM<sub>2.5</sub>$ 

Element $RfC_i^a$		$IUP^a$	Carcinogenic Non-carci-		
			nogenic	Adult	Children
Ph		$8.00E - 05$			7.71E-06 1.93E-06
V	$1.00E - 04$		$2.01E - 02$		
Mn	$5.00E - 0.5$		$9.94E - 01$		
Cu					
Zn					
Cr		1.00E-04 8.40E-02 1.02E-01			$8.60E - 04$ 2.15E $-04$
As		$1.50E - 05$ $4.30E - 03$ $4.32E + 00$			$2.78E - 04$ 6.96E - 05
Cd		1.00E-05 1.80E-03 7.04E-01			$1.27E - 05$ 3.17E-06
Co		$6.00E - 06$ 9.00E $-03$ 1.60E $-01$			$8.65E - 06$ 2.16E - 06
Ni		$1.40E - 0.5$ $2.40E - 0.4$ $1.43E - 0.1$		$4.81E - 07$ 1.20E-07	

a US EPA ([2011b\)](#page-9-18)

the descending order of  $Cr > As > Cd > Co > Pb > Ni$ . For adults, the carcinogenic risk values for Cr and As were  $8.60 \times 10^{-4}$  and  $2.78 \times 10^{-4}$ , respectively, which exceeded the carcinogenic risk threshold  $(10^{-6}-10^{-4})$ ; the carcinogenic risk of Cd exceeded  $1 \times 10^{-4}$ , but within the range of cancer risk thresholds. For children, the carcinogenic risk value of Cr is  $2.15 \times 10^{-4}$ , which exceeds the threshold of carcinogenic risk. The carcinogenic risk of As is 6.96  $\times$  10<sup>-5</sup>, slightly lower than 1  $\times$  10<sup>-4</sup>, which means potential carcinogenic risk for children. The carcinogenic risk of adults with six carcinogenic elements was higher than that of children. The carcinogenic risk found in this study was signifcantly higher than that in Nanjing (Hu et al. [2012\)](#page-8-11), Chengdu (Li et al. [2016](#page-8-21)) and Tianjin (Chen et al. [2015](#page-8-6)), implying greater impact on the public health, the local environmental protection departments should take appropriate measures to reduce its harm.

# **4 Conclusion**

During the period from March 2012 to February 2013,  $PM_{2.5}$ samples were collected in Huangshi city, and the concentrations of 16 metal elements were analyzed. The main conclusions were as follows:

1. The annual  $PM<sub>2.5</sub>$  average concentration in Huangshi city is 104.4  $\mu$ g/m<sup>3</sup>, which is significantly higher than that of the national environmental air quality standard, indicating a critical pollution condition. Element W content is highest in  $PM<sub>2.5</sub>$ , V concentration the lowest; As and Cd content exceeded the standard by 32.8 times and 4.3 times. Most elements showing seasonal trend of high in winter and low in summer, similar with seasonal variation of  $PM_{2.5}$  mass.

- 2. EF analysis shows that, except Ti, the other 15 elements were all enriched in diferent degrees. W, Fe, Cd, As, Pb, Zn, Cu, Cr, Co and Ni are extremely enriched, Ca, Mg and Mn are signifcantly enriched, and V is moderately enriched.
- 3. PMF source analysis results show that there are four main sources of metal elements in  $PM<sub>2.5</sub>$  of Huangshi area: soil dust or fugitive dust (Ca, Ti, Al), coal combustion (As), chemical industry and metallurgical industry (W, Ti, Ni, V, Cr, Cd), motor vehicle emissions (Pb, Cu,  $Zn$ , Mg).
- 4. The results of health risk assessment showed that the non-carcinogenic risk of element As is higher than 1, indicating a high risk of non-carcinogenesis for adults and children. The carcinogenic risk of Cr and As is higher than the tolerate limit (1  $\times$  10<sup>-4</sup>) and may therefore poses a greater risk of cancer in adults. For children, the carcinogenic risk of Cr is higher than the threshold range  $(10^{-6}$ – $10^{-4}$ ), indicating that there may be a greater risk of cancer.

**Acknowledgements** This research was supported by the Ministry of Science of Technology (2013FY112700), the College Science Technology Research Project of Hubei Province (Q20134404), the National Natural Science Foundation of China (41603117), the Talent Introduction Projects of Hubei Polytechnic University (16xjz02R) and the Outstanding Youth Science and Technology Innovation Team Projects of Hubei Province (T201729).

## **References**

- <span id="page-7-6"></span>Alleman LY, Lamaison L, Perdrix E, Robache A, Galloo JC (2010)  $PM_{10}$  metal concentrations and source identification using positive matrix factorization and wind sectoring in a French industrial zone. Atmos Res 96(4):612–625
- <span id="page-7-0"></span>Booth BB, Dunstone NJ, Halloran PR, Andrews T, Bellouin N (2012) Aerosols implicated as a prime driver of twentieth-century North Atlantic climate variability. Nature 484(7393):228–232
- <span id="page-7-2"></span>Brook RD, Rajagopalan S, Pope CA, Brook JR, Bhatnagar A, Diez-Roux AV, Holguin F, Hong Y, Luepker RV, Mittleman MA, Peters A, Siscovick D, Smith SC, Whitsel L, Kaufman JD (2010) Particulate matter air pollution and cardiovascular disease. Circulation 121(21):2331–2378
- <span id="page-7-5"></span>Brown SG, Frankel A, Rafuse SM, Roberts PT, Hafner HR, Anderson DJ (2007) Source apportionment of fne particulate matter in Phoenix, AZ, using positive matrix factorization. J Air Waste Manag 57(6):741–752
- <span id="page-7-4"></span>Cai LM, Xu ZC, Qi JY, Feng ZZ, Xiang TS (2015) Assessment of exposure to heavy metals and health risks among residents near Tonglushan mine in Hubei, China. Chemosphere 127:127–135
- <span id="page-7-3"></span>Cao JJ, Shen ZX, Chow JC, Watson JG, Lee SC, Tie XX, Ho KF, Wang GH, Han YM (2012a) Winter and summer  $PM_{2.5}$  chemical compositions in fourteen Chinese cities. J Air Waste Manag 62(10):1214–1226
- <span id="page-7-1"></span>Cao JJ, Wang QY, Chow JC, Watson JG, Tie XX, Shen ZX, Wang P, An ZS (2012b) Impacts of aerosol compositions on visibility impairment in Xi'an, China. Atmos Environ 59:559–566
- <span id="page-8-6"></span>Chen P, Bi X, Zhang J, Wu J, Feng Y (2015) Assessment of heavy metal pollution characteristics and human health risk of exposure to ambient  $PM_{2.5}$  in Tianjin, China. Particuology 20:104–109
- <span id="page-8-24"></span>Cheng Z, Luo L, Wang S, Wang Y, Sharma S, Shimadera H, Wang X, Bressi M, de Miranda RM, Jiang J, Zhou W, Fajardo O, Yan N, Hao J (2016) Status and characteristics of ambient  $PM<sub>2.5</sub>$  pollution in global megacities. Environ Int 89:212–221
- <span id="page-8-18"></span>China National Environmental Monitoring Center (1990) Soil element background value in China. China Environmental Science Press, Beijing, p 406
- <span id="page-8-36"></span>Cohen DD, Crawford J, Stelcer E, Atanacio AJ (2012) Application of positive matrix factorization, multi-linear engine and back trajectory techniques to the quantifcation of coal-fred power station pollution in metropolitan Sydney. Atmos Environ 61:204–211
- <span id="page-8-16"></span>Du P, Xie Y, Wang S, Zhao H, Zhang Z, Wu B, Li F (2015) Potential sources of and ecological risks from heavy metals in agricultural soils, Daye city, China. Environ Sci Pollut Res 22(5):3498–3507
- <span id="page-8-28"></span>Duan J, Tan J (2013) Atmospheric heavy metals and arsenic in China: situation, sources and control policies. Atmos Environ 74:93–101
- <span id="page-8-35"></span>Feng J, Yu H, Liu S, Su X, Li Y, Pan Y, Sun J (2016) PM2.5 levels, chemical composition and health risk assessment in Xinxiang, a seriously air-polluted city in North China. Environ Geochem Health.<https://doi.org/10.1007/s10653-10016-19874-10655>
- <span id="page-8-17"></span>Gao Y, He J, Ling W, Hu H, Liu F (2003) Efects of organic acids on copper and cadmium desorption from contaminated soils. Environ Int 29(5):613–618
- <span id="page-8-22"></span>GB 3095-2012 (2012) Ambient air quality standards (in Chinese). Ministry of Environmental Protection of the People's Republic of China
- <span id="page-8-31"></span>Grieshop AP, Lipsky EM, Pekney NJ, Takahama S, Robinson AL (2006) Fine particle emission factors from vehicles in a highway tunnel: effects of fleet composition and season. Atmos Environ 40:287–298
- <span id="page-8-14"></span>Guo H, Zhou J, Wang L, Zhou Y, Yuan J, Zhao R (2015) Seasonal variations and sources of carboxylic acids in  $PM<sub>2.5</sub>$  in Wuhan, China. Aerosol Air Qual Res 15:517–528
- <span id="page-8-23"></span>HJ 25.3-2014 (2014) Technical guidelines for risk assessment of contaminated sites (in Chinese). Ministry of Environmental Protection of the People's Republic of China
- <span id="page-8-11"></span>Hu X, Zhang Y, Ding Z, Wang T, Lian H, Sun Y, Wu J (2012) Bioaccessibility and health risk of arsenic and heavy metals (Cd Co, Cr, Cu, Ni, Pb, Zn and Mn) in TSP and PM2.5 in Nanjing. China Atmos Environ 57:146–152
- <span id="page-8-12"></span>Huang RJ, Zhang Y, Bozzetti C, Ho KF, Cao JJ, Han YM, Daellenbach KR, Slowik JG, Platt SM, Canonaco F (2014) High secondary aerosol contribution to particulate pollution during haze events in China. Nature 514(7521):218–222
- <span id="page-8-29"></span>Kang Y, Liu G, Chou C-L, Wong MH, Zheng L, Ding R (2011) Arsenic in Chinese coals: distribution, modes of occurrence, and environmental efects. Sci Total Environ 412–413:1–13
- <span id="page-8-26"></span>Kim E, Hopke PK, Edgerton ES (2004) Improving source identifcation of Atlanta aerosol using temperature resolved carbon fractions in positive matrix factorization. Atmos Environ 38(20):3349–3362
- <span id="page-8-32"></span>Kuang C, Neumann T, Norra S, Stüben D (2004) Land use-related chemical composition of street sediments in Beijing. Environ Sci Pollut Res Int 11(2):73–83
- <span id="page-8-21"></span>Li Y, Zhang Z, Liu H, Zhou H, Fan Z, Lin M, Wu D, Xia B (2016) Characteristics, sources and health risk assessment of toxic heavy metals in  $PM<sub>2.5</sub>$  at a megacity of southwest China. Environ Geochem Health 38(2):353–362
- <span id="page-8-27"></span>Lough GC, Schauer JJ, Park JS, Shafer MM, DeMinter JT, Weinstein JP (2005) Emissions of metals associated with motor vehicle roadways. Environ Sci Technol 39(3):826–836
- <span id="page-8-15"></span>Lyu X, Chen N, Guo H, Zeng L, Zhang W, Shen F, Quan J, Wang N (2016) Chemical characteristics and causes of airborne particulate

pollution in warm seasons in Wuhan, central China. Atmos Chem Phys 16(16):10671–10687

- <span id="page-8-5"></span>Meng X, Ma Y, Chen R, Zhou Z, Chen B, Kan H (2013) Size-fractionated particle number concentrations and daily mortality in a Chinese city. Environ Health Perspect 121(10):1174–1178
- <span id="page-8-20"></span>Paatero P, Tapper U (1993) Analysis of diferent modes of factor analysis as least squares ft problems. Chemometr Intell Lab 18(2):183–194
- <span id="page-8-2"></span>Pope CA III, Burnett RT, Thun MJ, Calle EE, Krewski D, Ito K, Thurston GD (2002) Lung cancer, cardiopulmonary mortality, and long-term exposure to fne particulate air pollution. JAMA 287(9):1132–1141
- <span id="page-8-3"></span>Pope CA III, Burnett RT, Krewski D, Jerrett M, Shi Y, Calle EE, Thun MJ (2009) Cardiovascular mortality and exposure to airborne fne particulate matter and cigarette smoke. Circulation 120(11):941–948
- <span id="page-8-0"></span>Pöschl U (2005) Atmospheric aerosols: composition, transformation, climate and health efects. Angew Chem Int Ed 44(46):7520–7540
- <span id="page-8-10"></span>Querol X, Viana M, Alastuey A, Amato F, Moreno T, Castillo S, Pey J, Rosa J, Campa AS, Artíñano B, Salvador P, Santos SGD, Fernández-Patier R, Moreno-Grau S, Negral L, Minguillón MC, Monfort E, Gil JI, Inza A, Ortega LA, Santamaría JM, Zabalza J (2007) Source origin of trace elements in PM from regional background, urban and industrial sites of Spain. Atmos Environ 41:7219–7231
- <span id="page-8-1"></span>Ramanathan V, Crutzen P, Kiehl J, Rosenfeld D (2001) Aerosols, climate, and the hydrological cycle. Science 294(5549):2119–2124
- <span id="page-8-25"></span>Salameh D, Detournay A, Pey J, Pérez N, Liguori F, Saraga D, Bove MC, Brotto P, Cassola F, Massabò D, Latella A, Pillon S, Formenton G, Patti S, Armengaud A, Piga D, Jafrezo JL, Bartzis J, Tolis E, Prati P, Querol X, Wortham H, Marchand N (2015) PM<sub>2.5</sub> chemical composition in fve European Mediterranean cities: a 1-year study. Atmos Res 155:102–117
- <span id="page-8-7"></span>Satsangi PG, Yadav S, Pipal AS, Kumbhar N (2014) Characteristics of trace metals infine ( $PM_{2.5}$ ) and inhalable ( $PM_{10}$ ) particles and its health risk assessment along with in silico approach in indoor environment of India. Atmos Environ 92:384–393
- <span id="page-8-8"></span>Schleicher NJ, Norra S, Chai F, Chen Y, Wang S, Cen K, Yu Y, Stuben D (2011) Temporal variability of trace metal mobility of urban particulate matter from Beijing—a contribution to health impact assessments of aerosols. Atmos Environ 45:7248–7265
- <span id="page-8-19"></span>Sutherland RA (2000) A comparison of geochemical information obtained from two fuvial bed sediment fractions. Environ Geol 39(3–4):330–341
- <span id="page-8-34"></span>Tan JH, Duan JC, Ma YL, Yang FM, Cheng Y, He KB, Yu YC, Wang JW (2014) Source of atmospheric heavy metals in winter in Foshan, China. Sci Total Environ 493:262–270
- <span id="page-8-13"></span>Tao J, Zhang L, Engling G, Zhang R, Yang Y, Cao J, Zhu C, Wang Q, Luo L (2013) Chemical composition of  $PM_{2.5}$  in an urban environment in Chengdu, China: importance of springtime dust storms and biomass burning. Atmos Res 122:270–283
- <span id="page-8-33"></span>Tao J, Gao J, Zhang L, Zhang R, Che H, Zhang Z, Lin Z, Jing J, Cao J, Hsu SC (2014)  $PM_{2.5}$  pollution in a megacity of southwest China: source apportionment and implication. Atmos Chem Phys 14(16):8679–8699
- <span id="page-8-9"></span>Tecer LH, Tuncel G, Karaca F, Alagha O, Süren P, Zararsız A, Kırmaz R (2012) Metallic composition and source apportionment of fne and coarse particles using positive matrix factorization in the southern Black Sea atmosphere. Atmos Res 118:153–169
- <span id="page-8-4"></span>Thurston GD, Ahn J, Cromar KR, Shao Y, Reynolds HR, Jerrett M, Lim CC, Shanley R, Park Y, Hayes RB (2016) Ambient particulate matter air pollution exposure and mortality in the NIH-AARP diet and health cohort. Environ Health Perspect 124(4):484–490
- <span id="page-8-30"></span>Tian HZ, Wang Y, Xue ZG, Cheng K, Qu YP, Chai FH, Hao JM (2010) Trend and characteristics of atmospheric emissions of Hg, As, and Se from coal combustion in China, 1980–2007. Atmos Chem Phys 10(23):11905–11919
- <span id="page-9-15"></span>Uberoi M, Shadman F (1991) High-temperature removal of cadmium compounds using solid sorbents. Environ Sci Technol 25(7):1285–1289
- <span id="page-9-9"></span>US EPA (2011a) Risk Assessment Guidance for Superfund. In: Part A: human health evaluation manual; part E, supplemental guidance for dermal risk assessment; part F, supplemental guidance for inhalation risk assessment, vol. I. [http://www.epa.gov/oswer/](http://www.epa.gov/oswer/riskassessment/human_health_exposure.htm) [riskassessment/human\\_health\\_exposure.htm](http://www.epa.gov/oswer/riskassessment/human_health_exposure.htm)
- <span id="page-9-18"></span>US EPA (2011b) The Screening Level (RSL) Tables (Last updated June 2011).<http://www.epa.gov/region9/superfund/prg/index.html>
- <span id="page-9-11"></span>US EPA (2013) User's guide/technical background document for US EPA Region 9's RSL tables. Washington, D C, US Environmental Protection Agency. [http://www.epa.gov/region9/superfund/](http://www.epa.gov/region9/superfund/prg.htm) [prg.htm](http://www.epa.gov/region9/superfund/prg.htm)
- <span id="page-9-14"></span>Vallius M, Janssen NAH, Heinrich J, Hoek G, Ruuskanen J, Cyrys J, Van Grieken R, de Hartog JJ, Kreyling WG, Pekkanen J (2005) Sources and elemental composition of ambient  $PM<sub>2.5</sub>$  in three European cities. Sci Total Environ 337(1):147–162
- <span id="page-9-12"></span>Viana M, Kuhlbusch TAJ, Querol X, Alastuey A, Harrison RM, Hopke PK, Winiwarter W, Vallius M, Szidat S, Prévôt ASH, Hueglin C, Bloemen H, Wåhlin P, Vecchi R, Miranda AI, Kasper-Giebl A, Maenhaut W, Hitzenberger R (2008) Source apportionment of particulate matter in Europe: a review of methods and results. J Aerosol Sci 39(10):827–849
- <span id="page-9-2"></span>Wang X, Bi X, Sheng G, Fu J (2006) Chemical composition and sources of  $PM_{10}$  and  $PM_{2.5}$  aerosols in Guangzhou, China. Environ Monit Assess 119(1):425–439
- <span id="page-9-3"></span>Wang J, Hu Z, Chen Y, Chen Z, Xu S (2013) Contamination characteristics and possible sources of  $PM_{10}$  and  $PM_{2.5}$  in different functional areas of Shanghai. China Atmos Environ 68:221–229
- <span id="page-9-6"></span>Wei F, Teng E, Wu G, Hu W, Wilson W, Chapman R, Pau J, Zhang J (1999) Ambient concentrations and elemental compositions of  $PM_{10}$  and  $PM_{2.5}$  in four Chinese cities. Environ Sci Technol 33(23):4188–4193
- <span id="page-9-0"></span>Wild P, Bourgkard E, Paris C (2009) Lung cancer and exposure to metals: the epidemiological evidence. Methods Mol Biol 472:139–167
- <span id="page-9-7"></span>Yan S, Ling Q, Bao Z (2007) Metals contamination in soils and vegetables in metal smelter contaminated sites in Huangshi, China. Bull Environ Contam Toxicol 79(4):361–366
- <span id="page-9-16"></span>Yang F, Tan J, Zhao Q, Du Z, He K, Ma Y, Duan F, Chen G, Zhao Q (2011) Characteristics of  $PM<sub>2.5</sub>$  speciation in representative megacities and across China. Atmos Chem Phys 11(11):5207–5219
- <span id="page-9-1"></span>Yang G, Wang Y, Zeng Y, Gao GF, Liang X, Zhou M, Wan X, Yu S, Jiang Y, Naghavi M, Vos T, Wang H, Lopez AD, Murray CJL (2013) Rapid health transition in China, 1990–2010: fndings from the Global Burden of Disease Study 2010. Lancet 381(9882):1987–2015
- <span id="page-9-17"></span>Yatkin S, Bayram A (2008) Source apportionment of  $PM_{10}$  and  $PM_{2.5}$ using positive matrix factorization and chemical mass balance in Izmir, Turkey. Sci Total Environ 390(1):109–123
- <span id="page-9-13"></span>Yih SW, Wang CT (1979) Tungsten: sources, metallurgy, properties, and applications. Plenum Publishing Corporation, New York
- <span id="page-9-10"></span>You S, Yao Z, Dai Y, Wang CH (2017) A comparison of PM exposure related to emission hotspots in a hot and humid urban environment: concentrations, compositions, respiratory deposition, and potential health risks. Sci Total Environ 59–60:464–473
- <span id="page-9-8"></span>Yu J, Yao S, Chen R, Zhu K, Yu L (2005) A quantitative integrated evaluation of sustainable development of mineral resources of a mining city: a case study of Huangshi, Eastern China. Resour Policy 30(1):7–19
- <span id="page-9-4"></span>Zhang YL, Cao F (2015) Fine particulate matter (PM<sub>2.5</sub>) in China at a city level. Sci Rep UK 5:14884. <https://doi.org/10.1038/srep14884>
- <span id="page-9-5"></span>Zheng M, Salmon LG, Schauer JJ, Zeng L, Kiang C, Zhang Y, Cass GR (2005) Seasonal trends in  $PM<sub>2.5</sub>$  source contributions in Beijing, China. Atmos Environ 39(22):3967–3976