BACTERIOLOGY (N BOREL, SECTION EDITOR)



# *Mycobacterium avium* subsp. *paratuberculosis* – An Overview of the Publications from 2011 to 2016

Radka Dziedzinska<sup>1</sup> · Iva Slana<sup>1</sup>

Published online: 17 January 2017 © Springer International Publishing AG 2017

#### Abstract

*Purpose of review* The goal was to evaluate the trend in publications related to *Mycobacterium avium* subsp. *paratuberculosis* (MAP) published between 2011 and mid-2016.

*Recent findings* The publication search was performed using the Web of Science® (WOS) database. Papers were split into categories dealing with i) methods for MAP detection, ii) immune responses to MAP, iii) MAP hosts, iv) prevalence and control, v) food and vi) zoonosis. In 2013, the highest number of papers was published in almost all categories. In all years, papers focused on methods, immunity or hosts predominated. Reports on zoonotic aspects of MAP were mostly published in 2011. Possible connection of MAP with other autoimmune, but non-intestinal diseases was suggested after 2011. MAP was also discovered in new animal species.

*Summary* It is evident that MAP still plays an important role in many animal species. Its connection with Crohn's disease and other autoimmune diseases is still under discussion.

**Keywords** *Mycobacterium avium* subsp. *paratuberculosis* · Paper · Search · Epidemiology · Food · Zoonosis

This article is part of the Topical Collection on *Bacteriology* 

⊠ Iva Slana slana@vri.cz

> Radka Dziedzinska dziedzinska@vri.cz

## Introduction

Paratuberculosis or Johne's disease is a disease with a long history. "Wasting or consumptive" disease was first reported in 1807 in cattle by Edward Skellet. The changes in the intestine of infected cattle were described by Johne and Frothingham in 1895. They proposed the name "pseudotuberculous enteritis" for the disease. Awareness of paratuberculosis increased during the following decades. In 1923, *Mycobacterium paratuberculosis* was officially named as the causative agent of paratuberculosis. In the early 1900s, paratuberculosis was described in cattle in the USA. From the 1970s onwards paratuberculosis has been distributed worldwide. In the beginning of the 1900s, Dr. Dalziel published his hypothesis that *Mycobacterium avium* subsp. *paratuberculosis* (MAP) may have zoonotic potential. This interest was re-stimulated by a review by Chiodini [1].

Paratuberculosis was first reported in cattle, but all ruminant and non-ruminant species can be infected. The typical symptoms include diarrhoea, weight loss, emaciation, and decreased milk production. These symptoms, however, occur in animals in the late stage of infection. The late stage of the disease is preceded by a significantly longer period of "silent" and inapparent infection [2]. Animals without clinical signs shed MAP through faeces into the environment and are a source of infection for healthy animals. Apart from this, vertical transmission and feeding of contaminated milk and colostrum represent other important routes of infection [2]. In wildlife ruminants and mammals the clinical phase is mostly featureless or entirely absent [3].

Paratuberculosis causes significant financial losses for cattle farmers [4•]. These losses are mainly connected with lower milk yield, decreased meat production and associated costs (veterinarians, laboratory, slaughterhouse, herd restoration) [4•]. Treatment of paratuberculosis is not possible. With the aim of limiting the spread of infection, paratuberculosis control programmes (PCP)

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Department of Food and Feed Safety, Veterinary Research Institute, Hudcova 70, 621 00 Brno, Czech Republic

have been implemented. In most countries, the implementation of PCP is voluntary. The success of a PCP depends both on its effectiveness and on the consistency of the herd owner in implementing the programme [5]. Vaccination against paratuberculosis can be effective, but must be accompanied by management changes in the herd [6].

Apart from economic losses, the presence of paratuberculosis in farms for food production is a major concern due to the possible association of MAP with Crohn's disease. Crohn's disease is a chronic, systemic disease of the intestinal tract. Due to the similarity of symptoms with those in ruminants, MAP has been implicated in the pathogenesis of Crohn's disease in humans. This theory has many supporters, but also opponents, which mean that the situation is still unclear. Similarly as in animals, humans can be infected through food derived from infected animals (milk, meat) or water contaminated with faeces from MAP-positive animals. Apart from Crohn's disease, the possible connection of MAP and Blau syndrome, or type 1 diabetes mellitus was suggested.

In the past, the Web of Science<sup>®</sup> (WOS) portal was utilised to analyse publications regarding mycobacteria in food and feed [7] or in water, soil and plants [8]. The aim of this paper was to assess the trend in scientific publications regarding paratuberculosis. In our analysis we attempted to cover the most important issues of paratuberculosis research, such as methods of detection, immune response of hosts to the agent, epidemiology and paratuberculosis as a zoonosis. The search was limited to papers published after 2011 as a similar analysis was not carried out after this year.

## Web of Science Database

The Web of Science® (WOS) Core Collection database (Thomson Reuters) was used to retrieve the publications relating to MAP. The WOS provides access to the following indexes: Science Citation Index (SCI), Social Sciences Citation Index (SSCI), Arts & Humanities Citation Index (A&HCI), Conference Proceedings Citation Index, Emerging Sources Citation Index, Current Chemical Reactions and Index Chemicus. The search encompassed papers published during the period of 2011-2016 (August the 5<sup>th</sup>). The search within WOS was split into certain categories: i) methods of detection, ii) immune response, iii) MAP hosts, iv) prevalence and control, v) food and vi) zoonosis. A specific search profile was used for each category as a "Topic" word (menu in WOS database). The results were then refined (utility "Refine") using specific sub-keywords (Table 1). The "Analyse results" utility was applied when comparing the number of papers published in individual years in each category.

The "topic" keywords were selected to retrieve the maximum number of papers published in each category from 2011 to mid- 2016. However, for this reason, many papers were duplicated among certain categories. As the keywords for search profiles were rather general, we are aware that some non-relevant publications could be retrieved.

From each category, the most important papers or papers reporting novel information were selected and are discussed in the text.

### Paratuberculosis and Johne's Disese

In general, 1464 results were retrieved when "paratuberculosis or johne\*" keywords were submitted to the WOS database. To find papers defined by these keywords together with other themes, specific search profiles were created (Table 1).

## **Methods for MAP Detection**

Culture remains the gold standard for MAP detection; accordingly, papers dealing with culture represented the major group of retrieved publications (Table 1). Between 2011 and 2016, the papers were mostly oriented towards the i) development, innovation and validation of cultivation methods [9, 10], ii) comparison of culture with other methods [11] and iii) ability to culture MAP from different matrices [12, 13]. Despite this, MAP detection using culture is increasingly being replaced by other, more modern methods, especially PCR.

Nowadays, the PCR method is involved in practically all areas of MAP research and has found indispensable application in epidemiology, development of new methods of DNA isolation [14], or development, standardization and improvement of new or already existing PCRs [15, 16]. Newly developed PCR-based methods (e.g. high-resolution melting for analysis of short sequence repeats) can be introduced for paratuberculosis detection [17, 18]. Diagnosis based on PCR can be used on a wide variety of matrices such as milk [19], dairy products [20], meat [21], water [22] or environmental samples [23]. Further refining of papers containing PCR showed, that most PCR articles dealt with faeces (167 results), milk (145), tissue (99), environment (76) and water (35).

Using the keyword "ELISA" 290 articles were found (Table 1). For diagnosis of paratuberculosis, ELISA is most commonly utilized due to its ability to analyse many samples in a short time for a low price. It was also applied to determine the in-herd prevalence based on samples of bulk tank milk [24], or individual milk [25]. In most retrieved publications, ELISA was, however; only mentioned as one of several methods used for diagnosis of MAP in the infected sample/animal [26].

Due to the number of papers found, it seems that there is an increasing focus on the study of gene expression in MAP (Table 1; 216 articles). The gene expression finds its application mainly in the study of differences between examined (treated)

Category	Search profile <sup>a,b</sup>	No. of publications	Refining keywords	No. of publications
Methods	((paratuberculosis or johne*) and (cultiv* or	1064	cult*	496
	*PCR* or sequenc* or cultur* or assay* or		*PCR*	412
	elisa or immuno* or chemic* or express*		ELISA	290
	or transcript* or magnet*))		express*	216
			VNTR*	33
			magnet*	29
Immunity	((paratuberculosis or johne*) and (immun*	johne*) and (immun* 1090 antibod*	292	
	or vaccin* or receptor* or antigen* or elisa* or antibod* or interferon* or macrophag* or lymphocyt* or response* or react* or serolog* or blood* or host* or assay*))		antigen*	205
			vaccin*	169
Host	((paratuberculosis or johne*) and (ruminant* or animal* or cow* or cattle* or goat* or sheep*	1050	(cattle or cow* or calv* or bull*)	782
	or mammal* or wildlife or deer*))		(sheep* or goat*)	242
			(mammal* or wild* or deer*)	186
Prevalence and	((paratuberculosis or johne*) and (distribut* or	858	58 (control* and program*)	148
control	control* or prevalenc* or spread* or program*		(herd* and level*)	118
	or measur* or cost* or finan*))		<pre>*PCR* ELISA express* VNTR* magnet* antibod* antigen* vaccin* (cattle or cow* or calv* or bull*) (sheep* or goat*) (mammal* or wild* or deer*) (control* and program*) (herd* and level*) cost* or financ* milk* water* meat* cheese* yoghurt* diabet* scleros* autism* Parkins*</pre>	94
Food	((paratuberculosis or johne*) and (food* or meat*	426	milk*	338
	or water* or milk* or cheese* or yoghurt*))		water*	74
	meat*	meat*	27	
			cheese*	19
			yoghurt*	1
Zoonosis	((paratuberculosis and crohn*) and (zoonos* or patient* or hospital* or medic* or gut* or colit*))	165	diabet*	20
			scleros*	9
			autism*	3
			Parkins*	2

Table 1 Search categories, search profiles and numbers of papers found in the Web of Science® (WOS) database for the period 2011–2016 (August the 5<sup>th</sup>)

\*asterisk can be replaced by any letter during the search

<sup>a</sup> searched as a "Topic" word (menu in WOS)

<sup>b</sup> paratuberculosis (as disease) as well as *Mycobacterium avium* subsp. *paratuberculosis* are retrieved when "paratuberculosis" as a search word is entered into WOS

and control group of animals/samples [27] finding of biomarkers [28], or in the study of the immune response [29].

The VNTR method was used to gain a better understanding of the biodiversity of MAP in infected animals/herds [30], characterisation of MAP isolates from infected animals [31] or in the search for new polymorphisms [32]. Although the method can provide deep insights into the epidemiology of paratuberculosis, limitations still exist due to the inability to identify closely and distantly related isolates [33].

Isolation methods based on magnetic separation improve the process of DNA extraction through the inclusion of multiple/repeated washing steps which enable DNA isolation from matrices containing large amounts of inhibitory compounds. Milk and faeces, the most typical biological samples for MAP DNA isolation, belong to such problematic matrices [34, 35]. The method of magnetic separation was further used when distinguishing between live and dead cells using propidium monoazide [36]. An interesting connection between magnetic separation and serodiagnosis of paratuberculosis was described by Wadhwa *et al.* [37].

## **Immune Response to MAP**

Based on the search results, the category of "immunity" was the widest (1090 results; Table 1, Fig 1). Within this category three sub-searches were applied (Table 1). The findings using the "vaccin\*" keyword (169 results) were further separated based on the animal of interest. In small ruminants, vaccination has still been solved [38]. Apart from paratuberculosis, vaccination programs and trends in the development of new vaccines against other significant diseases in small ruminants is well reviewed in Lacasta *et al.* [39]. Vaccination in dairy herds mostly takes place as part of paratuberculosis control programs [40] or as part of research regarding the efficacy of vaccination [41]. From the diagnostic point of view, the Fig. 1 Papers on *Mycobacterium avium* subsp. *paratuberculosis* (MAP) published between 2011 and 2016 (August 5<sup>th</sup>). The papers were categorised according to their subject: *i*) methods of MAP detection, *ii*) immune responses to MAP, *iii*) MAP hosts, *iv*) prevalence and control, *v*) food and *vi*) zoonosis



interference of paratuberculosis and bovine tuberculosis in serological tests after vaccination is significant and therefore research on this field should not be neglected [42].

Diagnostics using immunological methods in ruminants requires the discovery of MAP-specific antigens which have been proven to induce the immune response. The significance of this problem is apparent as almost one fifth of articles were refined when using the "antigen" keyword (Table 1). Most of the refined articles referred to the testing of MAP-specific antigens on animals in different infection conditions. Efforts directed towards finding novel MAP antigens (based on secreted proteins, lipopeptids, protoplasmatic antigens, etc.) are ongoing according to papers published between 2011 and 2016 [43]. A slightly larger proportion of papers dealt with antibodies against MAP and antibody response profiles in animals which were naturally or artificially infected by MAP [44].

# **MAP Hosts**

Refining articles using the above search profile resulted in 1050 publications. Most reported the detection of MAP in animals, farms or farm environments, improved methods for agent detection, or the immune response of hosts to paratuberculosis. As all these topics were included in the above categories, only selected papers referring to novel, but also specific and remarkable findings are mentioned in this paragraph. Mortier *et al.* [45] found that not only calves up to six months of age, but also those up to one year old are highly susceptible to MAP infection. Tissue colonisation by MAP in experimentally infected calves can be decreased when gallium is chemoprophylactically applied before and during the period of high susceptibility [46]. On the basis of age and shedding of MAP in faeces, Mitchell *et al.* [47••]

suggested three categories of immune control. The phenomenon of passive shedding was studied [48] and different bacterial species were described in the faeces of paratuberculosis infected and non-infected animals [49]. Control programmes are implemented mainly in dairy herds, but are important for beef herds as well [50]. Apart from standard methods, examination of milk filters was suggested as a useful tool for MAP detection before any control strategies [51].

About one quarter of articles (242) were refined when subsearching for "goat\* or sheep\*" keywords. More papers dealt with sheep (123 papers) compared to goats (49 papers). The most cited "sheep" papers dealt with the immune response in early stages of infection [52], progression of the disease in naturally exposed animals [53] and culture differentiation of MAP isolates obtained from different regions and hosts [54]. The most cited "goat" papers focused on preparation and evaluation of MAP mutants for vaccine purposes [55•, 56]. The method based on the measurement of volatile organic compounds in the exhaled breath of infected animals appears to be a potentially very interesting tool for paratuberculosis diagnostics [57].

As for the period preceding 2011, a range of current papers (2011–2016) dealt with MAP detection and paratuberculosis infection in wild deer, such as red deer [58, 59], roe deer [58] or elks [60, 61]. Many different animal species–ruminant and non-ruminant–were found to be infected by MAP; most were described in papers published before 2011. However, after 2011, some new hosts of MAP were also revealed (Table 2).

# **Prevalence and Control**

Refining using (herd\* and level\*) keywords resulted in 118 papers (from 858) between 2011 and 2016. During this period,

Table 2 Detection of Mycobacterium avium subsp.

Mycobacterium avium subsp.	Species	Country	Citation
<i>paratuberculosis</i> in animals other than domestic ruminants	Guanaco (Lama Guanicoe)	Chile	[62]
determined by microscopy,	Alpaca (Lama Pacos)	Germany	[63]
culture and/or PCR in the period	Eurasian otter ( <i>Lutra lutra</i> )	Portugal	[64, 65]
2011–2016	Badger (Meles meles)	Portugal	[64]
	Beech marten (Martens foina)	Portugal	[64]
	Egyptian mongoose (Herpestes ichneumon)	Portugal	[64]
	Elk ( <i>Cervus elaphus</i> )	Canada	[60, 66]
	Key deer (Odocoileus virginianus clavium)	Florida, USA	[67]
	Rusa Deer (Cervus timorensis rusa)	Mauritius	[68]
	Alpaca (Vicugna pacos)	USA	[69]
	Chamois ( <i>Rupicapra rupicapra</i> )	Switzerland	[58]
	Tundra Reindeer (Rangifer tarandus tarandus)	Scotland	[70]
	Wild boar ( <i>Sus scrofa</i> )	Korea	[71]
	Sitatunga antelope ( <i>Tragelaphus spekii</i> ) West African dwarf goat ( <i>Capra aegagrus f. hircus</i> )	Germany	[72]
	Bactrian camel (Camelus bactrianus)		
	Chapman's zebra (Equus quagga chapmani)		
	Black-and-white ruffed lemur (Varecia variegata)		
	Cottontop tamarin (Saguinus oedipus)		
	Gelada baboon (Theropithecus gelada)		
	Desmarest's hutia (Capromys pilorides)		
	Patagonian cavy (Dolichotis patagonum)		
	Emu (Dromaius novaehollandiae)		
	Ara parrot		
	Snowy owl (Bubo scandiacus)		
	Vulturine guineafowl (Acryllium vulturinum)		
	Wallaby (Macropodidae)		
	Water buffalo (Bubalus bubalis)	Brazil	[73]
	Camel (Camelus dromedarius)	Saudi Arabia	[74, 75]
	Fox (Vulpes vulpes)	Portugal	[76]
	Southern Black Rhinoceros (Diceros bicornis minor)	Australia	[77]
	Arctic Caribou (Rangifer Tarandus Ssp.)	Canada	[78]
	Indian monkey (Rhesus macaques)	India	[79]
	Hare (Leupus)	Chile	[80]
		New Zealand	[81]
	Brushtail possum ( <i>Trichosurus vulpecula</i> ) Hedgehog ( <i>Erinaceus</i> )	New Zealand	[81]
	Cat (Fellis)		
	Paradise sheldok (Tadorna variegata)		
	Rabbit (Oryctolagus cuniculus)	New Zealand	[81]
		Spain	[82]

prevalence studies were conducted in different countries using different methods (culture, PCR, ELISA) and matrices (faeces, milk, environmental samples). High between-herd prevalence (HTP) was found, e.g. in cattle in the US (91.1%) [25], Canada (68-76%) [83], Denmark (87-96%) [84] and Northern Italy (around 70%) [85]. In sheep, the HTP was assessed to be 66.8% in Canada [86] and 76% in New Zealand [87]. A HTP of 62.6% was calculated in dairy goats in Canada [86], 74.1% in water buffaloes in Italy [88] and 46% and 42% in New Zealand deer and beef herds, respectively [87].

With the aim of decreasing prevalence levels, PCP have been implemented by individual countries. In most countries, their realisation is voluntary, but in a few countries the implementation of PCP is obligatory. The participation of farmers in voluntary PCP can be supported by governments through incentive measures, e.g. higher milk prices [89]. A survey from selected US farms published in 2015 [90] showed that participation in voluntary PCP was characteristic for farms with larger herds, with high self-assessed knowledge of paratuberculosis and a better understanding of the details of PCP. Control programmes are mainly directed towards cattle [50, 84, 90, 91], but a few were prepared for sheep and goat as well [92, 93].

Paratuberculosis, mainly in dairy cattle, causes significant financial loses for farmers. Financial losses stem from decreased milk production, weight loss and lower meat production, loss of animals and subsequent replacement costs, veterinary treatment and laboratory testing [4]. After 2011, the financial losses of farmers connected with partuberculosis were estimated in a few publications. The extent of financial losses depended on herd size, level of prevalence, participation of farm in PCP or methods used for testing [26, 94, 95]. The economic benefit of vaccination against paratuberculosis in cattle herds was also calculated [96, 97].

#### **MAP and Food**

Out of 426 initially retrieved papers, 338 were found when refined by "milk\*", 74 when refined by "water\*", 27 by "meat\*", 19 by "cheese\*" and one by "yoghurt\*".

In these papers, detection of MAP in food matrices continued as before. However, a few previously untested foods were also examined, e.g. yogurt, acidophilus milk and kefir [20], goat and sheep cheeses [12] or powdered infant formula [98]. Other authors aimed at procedures directed at the reduction of MAP in food. The presence of probiotic cultures led to a reduction in MAP numbers in fermented milk products [20]. Longer ripening time of cheese [99] and extended cooking time of hamburger patties together with higher temperature [100] led to a decrease in MAP counts. Direct steam injection was successfully applied to MAP-contaminated milk [101].

## Zoonosis

Between 2011 and mid-2016, 165 publications related to paratuberculosis and Crohn's disease have been published.

As in the past, testing for the presence of MAP in Crohn's patients continues in recently published studies with more [102, 103], or less successful results [104, 105]. Today, it is recognised that MAP is only one of the possible triggers and that other bacteria can be involved as well [106]. Apart from this, other factors such as genetic susceptibility, commensal microflora, viral infection and environmental factors play a significant role in the development of inflammatory bowel diseases, including Crohn's disease [106–108]. Since 2011,

a role for MAP in the development of Crohn's disease was discussed and evaluated in a number of reviews [109–112]. Other groups of reviews focused on the assessment of antibiotic treatment [113], effect of probiotics [114] or nutrition [115] in Crohn's disease therapy and etiopathogenesis. Except for Crohn's disease, potential relationships between MAP and type 1 diabetes [116, 117]; and MAP and multiple sclerosis [118, 119] have also been discussed. Dow [120] hypothesized that MAP may be a trigger of autism. In 2016, MAP DNA was found in some patients with Parkinson's disease; however, the mechanism by which MAP might be involved in the disease is unclear [121•].

## Conclusion

In total, 1464 papers were retrieved when searching for papers published between 2011 and 2016 using "paratuberculosis and johne". Most papers (1090, 74.5%) were concerned with "immunity". Almost the same number of publications was obtained for "methods". In both categories, the number of publications increased from 2011 to 2013 and decreased slightly from 2014 onwards. From the diagnostic point of view cultivation is the most commonly used method. Although PCR is still not regarded as an equivalent diagnostic method, the number of publications was very close to those concerned with culture. Within the "host" category, MAP presence was described in new animal species. In spite of this, publications regarding cattle are naturally the most numerous. In spite of the application of paratuberculosis control programmes, the incidence of paratuberculosis around the word remains high. The number of "food" publications was stable during the examined period. Milk was the most commonly studied matrix. The possible connection of MAP with Crohn's disease is still under discussion; further, its connection with other, non-intestinal diseases has also been suggested.

As the number of publications was stable (or slightly increasing) during the examined years, it is evident that mycobacteria are still the subject of intense focus in the spheres of animal and human research.

Acknowledgements This work was supported by the Ministry of Agriculture of the Czech Republic (grant no. RO0516).

#### **Compliance with Ethical Standards**

**Conflict of Interest** Radka Dziedzinska and Iva Slana declare they have no competing interests.

Human and Animal Rights and Informed Consent This article contains no studies with human or animal subjects performed by the authors.

#### References

Recently published papers of particular interest have been highlighted as:

- Of importance
- •• Of major importance
  - Chiodini RJ. Crohn's disease and the mycobacterioses: a review and comparison of two disease entities. Clin Microbiol Rev. 1989;2(1):90–117.
  - Sweeney RW. Transmission of paratuberculosis. Vet Clin North Am Food Anim Pract. 1996;12(2):305–12.
  - Mackintosh CG, de Lisle GW, Collins DM, et al. Mycobacterial diseases of deer. N Z Vet J. 2004;52(4):163–74.
  - 4.• Garcia AB, Shalloo L. Invited review: the economic impact and control of paratuberculosis in cattle. J Dairy Sci. 2015;98(8): 5019–39. The authors describe in detail the economic impact related to paratuberculosis and its control.
  - Kudahl AB, Nielsen SS, Ostergaard S. Economy, efficacy, and feasibility of a risk-based control program against paratuberculosis. J Dairy Sci. 2008;91(12):4599–609.
  - Groenendaal H, Nielen M, Jalvingh AW, et al. A simulation of Johne's disease control. Prev Vet Med. 2002;54(3):225–45.
  - Kaevska M, Hruska K. Analysis of publications on paratuberculosis from 1995 to 2009 with emphasis on the period from 2005 to 2009. Vet Med. 2010;55(2):43–54.
  - Hruska K, Kaevska M. Mycobacteria in water, soil, plants and air: a review. Vet Med. 2012;57(12):623–79.
  - Whittington RJ, Whittington AM, Waldron A, et al. Development and validation of a liquid medium (M7H9C) for routine culture of *Mycobacterium avium* subsp *paratuberculosis* to replace modified Bactec 12B medium. J Clin Microbiol. 2013;51(12):3993–4000.
- Akineden O, Fernandez-Silva JA, Weirich S, et al. Comparison of two decontamination procedures, three culture media, and real time-PCR assay for the detection of *Mycobacterium avium* subsp *paratuberculosis* (MAP) from artificially contaminated raw sausage. Arch Lebensmittelhyg. 2011;62(5):150–6.
- Rasanen NHJ, Rintala H, Miettinen IT, et al. Comparison of culture and qPCR methods in detection of mycobacteria from drinking waters. Can J Microbiol. 2013;59(4):280–6.
- Galiero A, Fratini F, Mataragka A, et al. Detection of *Mycobacterium avium* subsp *paratuberculosis* in cheeses from small ruminants in Tuscany. Int J Food Microbiol. 2016;217: 195–9.
- Pribylova R, Slana I, Kralik P, et al. Correlation of *Mycobacterium avium* subsp. *paratuberculosis* counts in gastrointestinal tract, muscles of the diaphragm and the masseter of dairy cattle and potential risk for consumers. Int J Food Microbiol. 2011;151(3): 314–8.
- Park KT, Allen AJ, Davis WC. Development of a novel DNA extraction method for identification and quantification of *Mycobacterium avium* subsp *paratuberculosis* from tissue samples by real-time PCR. J Microbiol Meth. 2014;99:58–65.
- Sidoti F, Banche G, Astegiano S, et al. Validation and standardization of IS900 and F57 real-time quantitative PCR assays for the specific detection and quantification of *Mycobacterium avium* subsp. *paratuberculosis*. Can J Microbiol. 2011;57(5):347–54.
- Sevilla IA, Garrido JM, Molina E, et al. Development and evaluation of a novel multicopy-element-targeting triplex PCR for detection of *Mycobacterium avium* subsp *paratuberculosis* in feces. Appl Environ Microb. 2014;80(12):3757–68.
- Trangoni MD, Gioffre AK, Cucchi MEC, et al. LAMP technology: rapid identification of Brucella and *Mycobacterium avium* subsp. *paratuberculosis*. Braz J Microbiol. 2015;46(2):619–26.

- Ricchi M, Barbieri G, Cammi G, et al. High-resolution melting for analysis of short sequence repeats in *Mycobacterium avium* subsp. *paratuberculosis*. FEMS Microbiol Lett. 2011;323(2):151–4.
- Anzabi Y, Hanifian S. Detection of *Mycobacterium avium* subspecies *paratuberculosis* in pasteurized milk by IS900 PCR and culture method. Afr J Microbiol Res. 2012;6(7):1453–6.
- Klanicova B, Slana I, Roubal P, et al. *Mycobacterium avium* subsp. *paratuberculosis* survival during fermentation of soured milk products detected by culture and quantitative real time PCR methods. Int J Food Microbiol. 2012;157(2):150–5.
- Klanicova B, Slana I, Vondruskova H, et al. Real-time quantitative PCR detection of *Mycobacterium avium* subspecies in meat products. J Food Prot. 2011;74(4):636–40.
- Aboagye G, Rowe MT. Occurrence of *Mycobacterium avium* subsp *paratuberculosis* in raw water and water treatment operations for the production of potable water. Water Res. 2011;45(11): 3271–8.
- Moravkova M, Babak V, Kralova A, et al. Culture- and quantitative IS900 real-time PCR-based analysis of the persistence of *Mycobacterium avium* subsp. *paratuberculosis* in a controlled dairy cow farm environment. Appl Environ Microbiol. 2012;78(18):6608–14.
- Nielsen SS, Toft N. Bulk tank milk ELISA for detection of antibodies to *Mycobacterium avium* subsp *paratuberculosis*: Correlation between repeated tests and within-herd antibody-prevalence. Prev Vet Med. 2014;113(1):96–102.
- Lombard JE, Gardner IA, Jafarzadeh SR, et al. Herd-level prevalence of *Mycobacterium avium* subsp *paratuberculosis* infection in United States dairy herds in 2007. Prev Vet Med. 2013;108(2-3):234–8.
- Aly SS, Anderson RJ, Whitlock RH, et al. Cost-effectiveness of diagnostic strategies to identify *Mycobacterium avium* subspecies *paratuberculosis* super-shedder cows in a large dairy herd using antibody enzyme-linked immunosorbent assays, quantitative realtime polymerase chain reaction, and bacterial culture. J Vet Diagn Invest. 2012;24(5):821–32.
- Narnaware SD, Periasamy S, Tripathi BN. Studies on pathology, cytokine gene expression and molecular typing of *Mycobacterium avium* subsp *paratuberculosis* of naturally occurring Johne's disease in bullocks. Res Vet Sci. 2016;106:74–80.
- Park HE, Shin MK, Park HT et al. Gene expression profiles of putative biomarker candidates in *Mycobacterium avium* subsp. *paratuberculosis*-infected cattle. Pathog Dis. 2016; 74(4).
- Subharat S, Shu DR, Wedlock DN, et al. Immune responses associated with progression and control of infection in calves experimentally challenged with *Mycobacterium avium* subsp. *paratuberculosis*. Vet Immunol Immunop. 2012;149(3-4):225–36.
- van Hulzen KJE, Heuven HCM, Nielen M, et al. Different Mycobacterium avium subsp. paratuberculosis MIRU-VNTR patterns coexist within cattle herds. Vet Microbiol. 2011;148(2-4):419–24.
- Biet F, Sevilla IA, Cochard T et al. Inter- and Intra-subtype genotypic differences that differentiate *Mycobacterium avium* subspecies *paratuberculosis* strains. BMC Microbiol. 2012; 12.
- Fawzy A, Zschock M, Ewers C, et al. New polymorphisms within the variable number tandem repeat (VNTR) 7 locus of *Mycobacterium avium* subsp *paratuberculosis*. Mol Cell Probes. 2016;30(3):132–7.
- 33. Ahlstrom C, Barkema HW, Stevenson K et al. Limitations of variable number of tandem repeat typing identified through whole genome sequencing of *Mycobacterium avium* subsp *paratuberculosis* on a national and herd level. BMC Genomics. 2015;16.
- 34. Gilardoni LR, Fernandez B, Morsella C, et al. *Mycobacterium paratuberculosis* detection in cow's milk in Argentina by

immunomagnetic separation-PCR. Braz J Microbiol. 2016;47(2): 506–12.

- Salgado M, Steuer P, Troncoso E, et al. Evaluation of PMS-PCR technology for detection of *Mycobacterium avium* subsp. *paratuberculosis* directly fromty bovine fecal specimens. Vet Microbiol. 2013;167(3-4):725–8.
- Ricchi M, De Cicco C, Kralik P, et al. Evaluation of viable Mycobacterium avium subsp. paratuberculosis in milk using peptide-mediated separation and propidium monoazide qPCR. EMS Microbiol Lett. 2014;356(1):127–33.
- Wadhwa A, Foote RS, Shaw RW, et al. Bead-based microfluidic immunoassay for diagnosis of Johne's disease. J Immunol Methods. 2012;382(1-2):196–202.
- Chartier C, Mercier P, Pellet MP, et al. Effect of an inactivated paratuberculosis vaccine on the intradermal testing of goats for tuberculosis. Vet J. 2012;191(3):360–3.
- Lacasta D, Ferrer LM, Ramos JJ, et al. Vaccination schedules in small ruminant farms. Vet Microbiol. 2015;181(1-2):34–46.
- Lu Z, Schukken YH, Smith RL, et al. Using vaccination to prevent the invasion of *Mycobacterium avium* subsp *paratuberculosis* in dairy herds: a stochastic simulation study. Prev Vet Med. 2013;110(3-4):335–45.
- Alonso-Hearn M, Molina E, Geijo M, et al. Immunization of adult dairy cattle with a new heat-killed vaccine is associated with longer productive life prior to cows being sent to slaughter with suspected paratuberculosis. J Dairy Sci. 2012;95(2):618–29.
- 42. Stabel JR, Waters WR, Bannantine JP, et al. Mediation of host immune responses after immunization of neonatal calves with a heat-killed *Mycobacterium avium* subsp. *paratuberculosis* vaccine. Clin Vaccine Immunol. 2011;18(12):2079–89.
- Facciuolo A, Kelton DF, Mutharia LM. Novel secreted antigens of Mycobacterium paratuberculosis as serodiagnostic biomarkers for Johne's disease in cattle. Clin Vaccine Immunol. 2013;20(12): 1783–91.
- Mackintosh CG, Clark RG, Tolentino B, et al. Immunological and pathological responses of red deer resistant or susceptible genotypes, to experimental challenge with *Mycobacterium avium* subsp. *paratuberculosis*. Vet Immunol Immunop. 2011;143(1-2): 131–42.
- 45. Mortier RAR, Barkema HW, Bystrom JM et al. Evaluation of agedependent susceptibility in calves infected with two doses of *Mycobacterium avium* subspecies *paratuberculosis* using pathology and tissue culture. Vet Res. 2013;44.
- Fecteau ME, Whitlock RH. Treatment and chemoprophylaxis for paratuberculosis. Vet Clin N Am-Food A. 2011;27(3):547-+.
- 47.•• Mitchell RM, Schukken Y, Koets A, et al. Differences in intermittent and continuous fecal shedding patterns between natural and experimental *Mycobacterium avium* subspecies *paratuberculosis* infections in cattle. Vet Res. 2015; 46. The authors defined the presence of three categories of immune control on the basis of MAP shedding in faces and the control of infection.
- Kralik P, Pribylova-Dziedzinska R, Kralova A, et al. Evidence of passive faecal shedding of *Mycobacterium avium* subsp. *paratuberculosis* in a Limousin cattle herd. Vet J. 2014;201(1): 91–4.
- Kaevska M, Videnska P, Sedlar K, et al. Faecal bacterial composition in dairy cows shedding *Mycobacterium avium* subsp. *paratuberculosis* in faeces in comparison with nonshedding cows. Can J Microbiol. 2016;62(6):538–41.
- Roussel AJ. Control of *Paratuberculosis* in beef cattle. Vet Clin N Am-Food A. 2011;27(3):593-+.
- Slana I, Kralik P, Kralova A, et al. Short communication: examination of milk filters by real-time PCR as a herd-level indicator of the presence of *Mycobacterium avium* subspecies *paratuberculosis* in dairy herds. J Dairy Sci. 2012;95(3):1162–5.

- Dennis MM, Reddacliff LA, Whittington RJ. Longitudinal study of clinicopathological features of Johne's disease in sheep naturally exposed to *Mycobacterium avium* subspecies *paratuberculosis*. Vet Pathol. 2011;48(3):565–75.
- Whittington RJ, Marsh IB, Saunders V, et al. Culture phenotypes of genomically and geographically diverse *Mycobacterium avium* subsp. *paratuberculosis* isolates from different hosts. J Clin Microbiol. 2011;49(5):1822–30.
- 55.• Hines ME, Turnquist SE, Ilha MRS et al. Evaluation of novel oral vaccine candidates and validation of a caprine model of Johne's disease. Front Cell Infect Mi. 2014; 4. Oral application of the attenuated MAP strain (as a vaccine) to goat kids reduced presence of paratuberculosis lesions, slow progression of disease, reduced fecal shedding and tissue colonization.
- Park KT, Allen AJ, Bannantine JP, et al. Evaluation of two mutants of *Mycobacterium avium* subsp. *paratuberculosis* as candidates for a live attenuated vaccine for Johne's disease. Vaccine. 2011;29(29-30):4709–19.
- Purkhart R, Kohler H, Liebler-Tenorio E et al. Chronic intestinal mycobacteria infection: discrimination via VOC analysis in exhaled breath and headspace of feces using differential ion mobility spectrometry. J Breath Res. 2011; 5(2).
- Sarno E, Keller S, Wittenbrink MM, et al. Occurrence of Mycobacterium avium subsp. paratuberculosis in fecal samples of hunted deer, chamois and ibex in Switzerland. Schweiz. Arch Tierh. 2013;155(9):523–5.
- Stringer LA, Wilson PR, Heuer C. Prevalence of *Mycobacterium* avium subsp. paratuberculosis in farmed red deer (*Cervus* elaphus) with grossly normal mesenteric lymph nodes. N Z Vet J. 2013;61(3):147–52.
- Forde T, Pruvot M, De Buck J, et al. A high-morbidity outbreak of Johne's disease in game-ranched elk. Can Vet J. 2015;56(5):479– 83.
- Pruvot M, Kutz S, van der Meer F et al. Pathogens at the livestockwildlife interface in Western Alberta: does transmission route matter? Vet Res. 2014; 45.
- Salgado M, Sevilla I, Rios C, et al. Presence of *Mycobacterium* avium subsp paratuberculosis in alpacas (*Lama pacos*) inhabiting the Chilean Altiplano. J ZOO Wildlife Med. 2016;47:12–6.
- Munster P, Volkel I, von Buchholz A, et al. Detection of Mycobacterium avium subspecies paratuberculosis by IS900based PCR assays from an alpaca (Vicugna pacos) kept in a German zoological garden. J ZOO Wildlife Med. 2013;44:176– 80.
- 64. Matos AC, Figueira L, Matos M, et al. Seroprevalence of *Mycobacterium avium* complex in wild mammals in the Iberian Peninsula. J Hell Vet Med Soc. 2015;66:177–84.
- Matos AC, Figueira L, Martins MH, et al. Disseminated *Mycobacterium avium* subsp *paratuberculosis* infection in two wild eurasian otters (*Lutra lutra L.*) from Portugal. J. ZOO Wildlife Med. 2013;44:193–5.
- 66. Pruvot M, Kutz S, van der Meer F et al. Pathogens at the livestockwildlife interface in Western Alberta: does transmission route matter? Vet. Res. 2014; 45: Artn 18
- Murray HL, Yabsley MJ, Keel MK, et al. Persistence of *Mycobacterium avium* subspecies *paratuberculosis* in endangered Florida key deer and key deer habitat. J Wildlife Dis. 2014;50:349–53.
- Jori F, Godfroid J, Michel AL, et al. An assessment of zoonotic and production limiting pathogens in rusa deer (*Cervus timorensis rusa*) from Mauritius. Transbound Emerg Dis. 2014;61:31–42.

- Fecteau ME, Bedenice D, Cebra CK, et al. Prevalence of Mycobacterium avium subsp. paratuberculosis fecal shedding in alpacas presented to veterinary hospitals in the United States. J. Vet. Intern Med. 2013;27:1228–33.
- Del-Pozo J, Girling S, McLuckie J, et al. An unusual presentation of *Mycobacterium avium* spp. *paratuberculosis* infection in a captive tundra reindeer (*Rangifer tarandus tarandus*). J Comp Pathol. 2013;149:126–31.
- Kim JM, Ku BK, Lee HN, et al. *Mycobacterium avium* paratuberculosis in wild boars in Korea. J Wildlife Dis. 2013;49:413-7.
- Munster P, Fechner K, Volkel I, et al. Distribution of *Mycobacterium avium* ssp *paratuberculosis* in a German zoological garden determined by IS900 semi-nested and quantitative real-time PCR. Vet Microbiol. 2013;163:116–23.
- Dalto AC, Bandarra PM, Pavarini SP, et al. Clinical and pathological insights into Johne's disease in buffaloes. Trop Anim Health Pro. 2012;44:1899–904.
- Alhebabi AM, Badi FA, Alluwaimi AM. The relation of *Mycobacterium avium* subspecies *paratuberculosis* shedding to the seroconversion in the camels. J Camel Pract Res. 2012;19: 255–8.
- 75. Ghosh P, Hsu CY, Alyamani EJ, et al. Genome-wide analysis of the emerging infection with *Mycobacterium avium* subspecies *paratuberculosis in the Arabian camels (Camelus dromedarius)*. Plos One. 2012;7:e31947.
- Matos AC, Figueira L, Martins MH, et al. Survey of Mycobacterium avium subspecies paratuberculosis in road- killed wild carnivores in Portugal. J ZOO Wildlife Med. 2014;45:775–81.
- Bryant B, Blyde D, Eamens G, et al. *Mycobacterium avium* subspecies *paratuberculosis* cultured from the feces of a southern black rhinoceros (*Diceros bicornis minor*) with diarrhea and weight loss. J ZOO Wildlife Med. 2012;43:391–3.
- Forde T, Orsel K, De Buck J, et al. Detection of *Mycobacterium avium* subspecies *paratuberculosis* in several herds of Arctic Caribou (*Rangifer tarandus* ssp.). J Wildlife Dis. 2012;48:918–24.
- 79. Singh AV, Singh SV, Singh PK, et al. High prevalence of *Mycobacterium avium* subspecies *paratuberculosis* ('Indian bison type') in animal attendants suffering from gastrointestinal complaints who work with goat herds endemic for Johne's disease in India. Int J Infect Dis. 2011;15:E677–83.
- Salgado M, Manning EJB, Monti G, et al. European hares in Chile: A different lagomorph reservoir for *Mycobacterium avium* subsp. *paratuberculosis*? J Wildlife Dis. 2011;47:734–8.
- Nugent G, Whitford EJ, Hunnam JC, et al. *Mycobacterium avium* subsp *paratuberculosis* infection in wildlife on three deer farms with a history of Johne's disease. N Z Vet J. 2011;59:293–8.
- Maio E, Carta T, Balseiro A, et al. Paratuberculosis in European wild rabbits from the Iberian Peninsula. Res Vet Sci. 2011;91:212–8.
- Wolf R, Barkema HW, De Buck J, et al. High herd-level prevalence of *Mycobacterium avium* subspecies *paratuberculosis* in Western Canadian dairy farms, based on environmental sampling. J Dairy Sci. 2014;97(10):6250–9.
- Verdugo C, Toft N, Nielsen SS. Within- and between-herd prevalence variation of *Mycobacterium avium* subsp. *paratuberculosis* infection among control programme herds in Denmark (2011-2013). Prev Vet Med. 2015;121(3-4):282–7.
- Pozzato N, Capello K, Comin A, et al. Prevalence of paratuberculosis infection in dairy cattle in Northern Italy. Prev Vet Med. 2011;102(1):83–6.
- Bauman CA, Jones-Bitton A, Menzies P, et al. Prevalence of paratuberculosis in the dairy goat and dairy sheep industries in Ontario. Canada Can Vet J. 2016;57(2):169–75.

- Verdugo C, Jones G, Johnson W, et al. Estimation of flock/herdlevel true *Mycobacterium avium* subspecies *paratuberculosis* prevalence on sheep, beef cattle and deer farms in New Zealand using a novel Bayesian model. Prev Vet Med. 2014;117(3-4):447–55.
- Desio G, Nizza S, Montagnaro S et al. Estimated prevalence of Johne's disease in herds of water buffaloes (*Bubalus bubalis*) in the province of Caserta. Ital J. Anim Sci. 2013; 12(1).
- Nagel-Alne GE, Asheim LJ, Hardaker JB, et al. The Norwegian Healthier Goats programme - a financial cost-benefit analysis. Prev Vet Med. 2014;114(2):96–105.
- Ritter C, Kwong GPS, Wolf R, et al. Factors associated with participation of Alberta dairy farmers in a voluntary, managementbased Johne's disease control program. J Dairy Sci. 2015;98(11): 7831–45.
- Khol JL, Baumgartner W. Examples and suggestions for the control of paratuberculosis in European cattle. Jpn J Vet Res. 2012;60:S1–7.
- Windsor PA. Understanding the efficacy of vaccination in controlling ovine paratuberculosis. Small Ruminant Res. 2013;110(2-3): 161–4.
- Robbe-Austerman S. Control of paratuberculosis in small ruminants. Vet Clin N Am-Food A. 2011;27(3):609-+.
- Tamba M, Paternoster G, Formigoni A, et al. Estimation of economic losses associated with Johne's Disease in dairy herds of Northern Italy. Large Anim Rev. 2014;20(4):147–51.
- 95. Wolf R, Clement F, Barkema HW, et al. Economic evaluation of participation in a voluntary Johne's disease prevention and control program from a farmer's perspective-the Alberta Johne's Disease Initiative. J Dairy Sci. 2014;97(5):2822–34.
- Groenendaal H, Zagmutt FJ, Patton EA, et al. Cost-benefit analysis of vaccination against *Mycobacterium avium* ssp *paratuberculosis* in dairy cattle, given its cross-reactivity with tuberculosis tests. J Dairy Sci. 2015;98(9):6070–84.
- Cho J, Tauer LW, Schukken YH, et al. Economic analysis of *Mycobacterium avium* subspecies *paratuberculosis* vaccines in dairy herds. J Dairy Sci. 2012;95(4):1855–72.
- Botsaris G, Swift BMC, Slana I, et al. Detection of viable Mycobacterium avium subspecies paratuberculosis in powdered infant formula by phage-PCR and confirmed by culture. Int J Food Microbiol. 2016;216:91–4.
- Yoon Y, Lee S, Choi KH. Microbial benefits and risks of raw milk cheese. Food Control. 2016;63:201–15.
- Hammer P, Walte HGC, Matzen S, et al. Inactivation of Mycobacterium avium subsp. paratuberculosis during cooking of hamburger patties. J Food Prot. 2013;76(7):1194–201.
- Peterz M, Butot S, Jagadeesan B, et al. Thermal inactivation of Mycobacterium avium subsp. paratuberculosis in artificially contaminated milk by direct steam injection. Appl Environ Microb. 2016;82(9):2800–8.
- 102. Di Sabatino A, Paccagnini D, Vidali F, et al. Detection of Mycobacterium avium subsp. paratuberculosis (MAP)-specific IS900 DNA and antibodies against MAP peptides and lysate in the blood of Crohn's disease patients. Inflamm Bowel Dis. 2011;17(5):1254–5.
- 103. Lee A, Griffiths TA, Parab RS, et al. Association of *Mycobacterium avium* subspecies *paratuberculosis* with Crohn disease in pediatric patients. J Pediatr Gastr Nutr. 2011;52(2): 170–4.
- 104. O'Brien CL, Pavli P, Gordon DM, et al. Detection of bacterial DNA in lymph nodes of Crohn's disease patients using high throughput sequencing. Gut. 2014;63(10):1596-+.
- 105. Tuci A, Tonon F, Castellani L, et al. Fecal detection of *Mycobacterium avium paratuberculosis* using the IS900 DNA sequence in Crohn's disease and ulcerative colitis patients and healthy subjects. Digest Dis Sci. 2011;56(10):2957–62.
- Mann EA, Saeed SA. Gastrointestinal infection as a trigger for inflammatory bowel disease. Curr Opin Gastroen. 2012;28(1):24–9.

- Frolkis A, Dieleman LA, Barkema HW, et al. Environment and the inflammatory bowel diseases. Can J Gastroenterol. 2013;27(3): E18–24.
- Ng SC, Bernstein CN, Vatn MH, et al. Geographical variability and environmental risk factors in inflammatory bowel disease. Gut. 2013;62(4):630–49.
- Davis WC. On deaf ears, *Mycobacterium avium paratuberculosis* in pathogenesis Crohn's and other diseases. World J Gastroentero. 2015;21(48):13411–7.
- 110. Atreya R, Bulte M, Gerlach GF et al. Facts, myths and hypotheses on the zoonotic nature of *Mycobacterium avium* subspecies *paratuberculosis*. Int J Med Microbiol. 2014.
- 111. Chiodini RJ, Chamberlin WM, Sarosiek J, et al. Crohn's disease and the mycobacterioses: a quarter century later. Causation or simple association? Crit Rev Microbiol. 2012;38(1):52–93.
- Davis WC, Madsen-Bouterse SA. Crohn's disease and *Mycobacterium avium* subsp paratuberculosis: the need for a study is long overdue. Vet Immunol Immunop. 2012;145(1-2):1–6.
- Chamberlin W, Borody TJ, Campbell J. Primary treatment of Crohn's disease: combined antibiotics taking center stage. Expert Rev Clin Immu. 2011;7(6):751–60.
- Korada SK, Yarla NS, Bishayee A, et al. Can probiotics cure inflammatory bowel diseases? Curr Pharm Design. 2016;22(7): 904–17.

- Wedrychowicz A, Zajac A, Tomasik P. Advances in nutritional therapy in inflammatory bowel diseases: review. World J Gastroentero. 2016;22(3):1045–66.
- 116. Naser SA, Thanigachalam S, Dow CT et al. Exploring the role of *Mycobacterium avium* subspecies *paratuberculosis* in the pathogenesis of type 1 diabetes mellitus: a pilot study. Gut Pathogens. 2013; 5.
- 117. Bitti MLM, Masala S, Capasso F et al. *Mycobacterium avium* subsp. *paratuberculosis* in an Italian cohort of type 1 diabetes pediatric patients. Clin. Dev. Immunol. 2012; article No. 785262.
- Cossu D, Cocco E, Paccagnini D et al. Association of Mycobacterium avium subsp. paratuberculosis with multiple sclerosis in Sardinian patients. Plos One. 2011; 6(4).
- Frau J, Cossu D, Coghe G, et al. *Mycobacterium avium* subsp. *paratuberculosis* and multiple sclerosis in Sardinian patients: epidemiology and clinical features. Mult Scler J. 2013;19(11):1437– 42.
- 120. Dow CT. Mycobacterium *paratuberculosis* and autism: is this a trigger? Med Hypotheses. 2011;77(6):977–81.
- 121.• Arru G, Caggiu E, Paulus K, et al. Is there a role for *Mycobacterium avium* subspecies *paratuberculosis* in Parkinson's disease? J Neuroimmunol. 2016;293:86–90. In some patients with Parkinson's disease MAP DNA (IS900) was found.