### **SHORT RESEARCH COMMUNICATION**



# **Metallic iron for environmental remediation: the still overlooked iron chemistry**

Minhui Xiao<sup>1,2</sup> · Rui Hu<sup>1</sup> · Ran Tao<sup>2</sup> · Xuesong Cui<sup>2</sup> · B. Konadu-Amoah<sup>1</sup> · Huichen Yang<sup>2</sup> · Arnaud Igor Ndé-Tchoupé<sup>1</sup> · **WillisGwenzi**<sup>3,4</sup> · Chicgoua Noubactep<sup>1,2,5,6,7,8</sup> • Hans Ruppert<sup>8</sup>

Received: 5 May 2023 / Accepted: 11 October 2023 / Published online: 2 November 2023 © The Author(s) 2023

### **Abstract**

Permeable reactive barriers (PRBs) containing metallic iron  $(Fe<sup>0</sup>)$  as reactive materials are currently considered as an established technology for groundwater remediation. Fe<sup>0</sup> PRBs have been introduced by a field demonstration based on the fortuitous observation that aqueous trichloroethylenes are eliminated in  $Fe^0$ -based sampling vessels. Since then,  $Fe^0$  has been tested and used for treating various biological (e.g. bacteria, viruses) and chemical (organic and inorganic) contaminants from polluted waters. There is a broad consensus on the view that "reactivity loss" and "permeability loss" are the two main problems hampering the design of sustainable  $Fe^0$  systems. However, the view that  $Fe^0$  is a reducing agent (electron donor) under environmental conditions should be regarded as a distortion of Corrosion Science. This is because it has been long established that aqueous iron corrosion is a spontaneous process and results in the  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  surface being shielded by an oxide scale. The multi-layered oxide scale acts as a conduction barrier for electrons from  $Fe^0$ . Accordingly, "reactivity loss", defined as reduced electron transfer to contaminants, must be revisited. On the other hand, because "stoichiometric" ratios were considered while designing the first generation of  $Fe^0$  PRBs ( $Fe^0$  as reductant), "permeability loss" should also be revisited. The aim of this communication is to clarify this issue and reconcile a proven efficient technology with its scientific roots (i.e. corrosion science).

**Keywords** Adsorptive removal · Reactivity loss · Removal mechanisms · Size-exclusion · Zero-valent iron

 $\boxtimes$  Chicgoua Noubactep cnoubac@gwdg.de Minhui Xiao xiaominhui@hhu.edu.cn Rui Hu

rhu@hhu.edu.cn

Arnaud Igor Ndé-Tchoupé ndetchoupe@gmail.com

Willis Gwenzi wgwenzi@gast.uni-kassel.de; wgwenzi@yahoo.co.uk

Hans Ruppert hrupper@gwdg.de

<sup>1</sup> School of Earth Science and Engineering, Hohai University, Fo Cheng Xi Road 8, Nanjing 211100, China

<sup>2</sup> Applied Geology, University of Göttingen, Goldschmidtstraße 3, D-37077 Göttingen, Germany

- <sup>3</sup> Grassland Science and Renewable Plant Resources, Faculty of Organic Agricultural Science, University of Kassel, Steinstrasse 19, 37213 Witzenhausen, Germany
- Leibniz Institute for Agricultural Engineering and Bioeconomy (ATB), Potsdam, Germany
- <sup>5</sup> Department of Water and Environmental Science and Engineering, Nelson Mandela African Institution of Science and Technology, P.O. Box 447, Arusha, Tanzania
- Faculty of Science and Technology, Campus of Banekane, Université Des Montagnes, P.O. Box 208, Bangangté, Cameroon
- <sup>7</sup> Centre for Modern Indian Studies (CeMIS), Universität Göttingen, Waldweg 26, 37073 Göttingen, Germany
- <sup>8</sup> Department of Sedimentology & Environmental Geology, University of Göttingen, Goldschmidtstraße 3, 37077 Göttingen, Germany

#### <span id="page-1-1"></span>**Introduction**

Dissolved species and pathogens are mostly quantitatively removed from aqueous solutions in the presence of metallic iron  $(Fe<sup>0</sup>)$  (Devonshire [1890;](#page-8-0) Baker [1934\)](#page-7-0). This century-old knowledge has been intensively applied during the past three decades in solving the challenges for a clean environment and safe drinking water (Wakatsuki et al. [1993;](#page-10-0) Henderson and Demond [2007;](#page-8-1) Chen et al. [2014;](#page-7-1) Ghauch [2015](#page-8-2); Guan et al. [2015;](#page-8-3) Singh et al. [2023](#page-9-0); Lawrinenko et al. [2023a](#page-8-4)). Despite such a broad application, an understanding of the science of the  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  remediation technology has not yet been achieved (Cao et al. [2022](#page-7-2); Lawrinenko et al. [2023b](#page-8-5); Noubactep [2023](#page-9-1)). In particular, an understanding of the mechanisms of water decontamination in Fe ${}^{0}/\text{H}_2\text{O}$  systems is useful for designing sustainable systems in practice (Comba et al. [2011](#page-7-3); Fu et al [2014](#page-8-6); Obiri-Nyarko et al [2014](#page-9-2)).

Mechanistic information regarding the operating mode of  $Fe^{0}/H_{2}O$  systems is conflicting. For example, Matheson and Tratnyek ([1994](#page-8-7)) used slowly stirred batch experiments  $(\leq 15$  rpm) to suggest that chlorinated carbons (RCl) are removed from aqueous solution mostly via reductive degradation mediated by electrons from  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$ . Weber ([1996\)](#page-10-1) reported to have confrmed that reductive transformation by Fe<sup>0</sup> is a surface-mediated process while using 4-aminoazobenzene as a probe contaminant and a completely diferent experimental design. Weber [\(1996\)](#page-10-1) also reported that the requirement that the contaminant contacts the  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  surface for electron transfer can be circumvented by the addition of soluble electron mediators. Roberts et al. ([1996](#page-9-3)) and several other authors made similar conclusion which fnally led to the "broad concensus" (O'Hannesin and Gillham  $1998$ ) that  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  oxidative dissolution is the anodic reaction occurring simultaneously to the cathodic reduction in the contaminant of interest (e.g. an electrochemical reaction). It should be pointed out that this reasoning is limited to reducible contaminants, while several other non-reducible species, including pathogens, have been quantitatively eliminated from the aqueous phase in the presence of  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  (You et al. [2005;](#page-10-2) Henderson and Demond [2007;](#page-8-1) Noubactep [2007\)](#page-9-5). Thus, the removal of non-reducible contaminants and microbes cannot be explained by the concept of reductive transformation or degradation.

In contrast, Lipczynska-Kochany et al. ([1994](#page-8-8)) questioned the validity of the reductive transformation concept in a context where iron corrosion increases the pH value of the system and the universal oxide scale on  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$ impedes any (quantitative) electron transfer from the metal body. Similarly, Schreier and Reinhard ([1994](#page-9-6)) found a lag time between the initiation of the reaction and the start of

the degradation of chlorinated organic compounds in  $Fe<sup>0</sup>/$  $H<sub>2</sub>O$  systems. Further results questioning the validity of the reductive transformation concept were presented by several authors including Cantrell et al. ([1995\)](#page-7-4), Warren et al. ([1995](#page-10-3)), Fiedor et al. ([1998\)](#page-8-9), Qiu et al. ([2000](#page-9-7)), Farrell et al. ([2001](#page-8-10)), Lavine et al ([2001\)](#page-8-11), and Jiao et al. ([2009\)](#page-8-12).

While it is certain that the reductive transformation concept has never been univocally accepted/established, a cursory survey of the  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  literature reveals that it is favoured by the large majority of active researchers investigating  $Fe<sup>0</sup>/$ H2O systems (Chen et al. [2014](#page-7-1); Guan et al. [2015](#page-8-3); Hu et al. [2021](#page-8-13); Lawrinenko et al. [2023a](#page-8-4)). In particular, Lawrinenko et al. [\(2023a\)](#page-8-4) recently attempted to reiterate the validity of the named concept while characterizing divergent views as "isolated misconceptions". The views reported by Lawrinenko et al. ([2023a](#page-8-4)) contrast with recent developments that the observation that organic substances are reductively degraded in  $\text{Fe}^0/\text{H}_2\text{O}$  systems was not entirely new, rather, it has been known around 1990 as reported by Reynolds et al. [\(1990](#page-9-8)) (Hu et al. [2021;](#page-8-13) Konadu-Amoah et al. [2021](#page-8-14)). Moreover, the view that any dissolved species can exchange electrons with Fe<sup>0</sup> disproves a century-old knowledge that protons  $(H<sup>+</sup>)$  and protons alone oxidize  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  under environmental conditions ( $pH > 4.5$ ) (Whitney [1903\)](#page-10-4). Actually, the pioneers of the Fe<sup>0</sup> remediation technology have not considered Whitney ([1903\)](#page-10-4) and other ancient works like Gould ([1982\)](#page-8-15), Murphy ([1988](#page-9-9)), Khudenko ([1991](#page-8-16)), and Murphy [\(1991\)](#page-9-10), while

<span id="page-1-0"></span>**Table 1** Bibliometric analysis of six important references pertinent to the understanding of the operating mode of  $\text{Fe}^0/\text{H}_2\text{O}$  systems using Google Scholar [\(https://scholar.google.de](https://scholar.google.de), Accessed 01.12.2022)

Reference	Total		$Fe0$ lit First cited RGN $P$		
	$(-)$	$(-)$	$(-)$	$(-)$	$(\%)$
Devonshire (1890)	64	62	2017	50	80.6
Whitney $(1903)$	139	21	2018	19	90.5
Baker (1934)	43	27	2017	24	88.9
Cutler (1987)	6	2	2017	$\Omega$	0.0
Khudenko (1991)	39	24	2000	14	58.3
Reynolds et al. (1990)	260	212	1994	29	13.7
Gillham and O'Hannesin (1994)	1817	702	1994	43	6.1
Lipczynska-Kochany et al. (1994)	171	13	1995	34	26.2
Matheson and Tratnyek (1994)	1938	592	1995	63	10.6
Schreier and Reinhard (1994)	158	92	1995	31	33.7

For comparison, a bibliometric analysis of the frst published peerreviewed articles is added. It is seen that pioneering works were only discovered around 2017, 27 years after Reynolds et al. [\(1990](#page-9-8)). These works are predominantly (*P*>58%) referenced by our research group led by Dr. Noubactep (RGN). *P* in % represents the extent to which RGN has cited each reference relative to the total citation within the  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  literature (Fe<sup>0</sup> lit.)

introducing their concept. Table [1](#page-1-0) gives an overview of the extent to which six selected relevant pioneering scientifc articles have been considered in the  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  remediation litera-ture. Khudenko [\(1991\)](#page-8-16) utilized  $Cu^{2+}$  cementation by Fe<sup>0</sup> to generate  $\text{Fe}^{\text{II}}$  species (and H/H<sub>2</sub> species) for the reductive destruction of organics. This approach was rooted in the knowledge that direct electron transfer from  $\mathrm{Fe}^0$  is impossible (Whitney [1903;](#page-10-4) Khudenko [1985](#page-8-19), [1987](#page-8-20)). In other words, it was established before 1994 that  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  is corroded by an electrochemical mechanism while contaminants are reduced by a chemical mechanism.

Table [1](#page-1-0) clearly shows that our research group (RGN) has largely considered the pioneering works with a citation rate varying from 6.1% for Gillham and O'Hannesin ([1994\)](#page-8-18) to 33.7% for Schreier and Reinhard [\(1994](#page-9-6)). Table [1](#page-1-0) also refects the fact that the reductive transformation concept was favoured ([Sect. 1\)](#page-1-1) as Gillham and O'Hannesin [\(1994\)](#page-8-18) and Matheson and Tratnyek [\(1994](#page-8-7)) were roundly referenced 10 times more than Lipczynska-Kochany et al. [\(1994](#page-8-8)) and Schreier and Reinhard ([1994](#page-9-6)). This selective citation is particularly evident considering that these papers were published in the same year (i.e., 1994). Another important feature refected in Table [1](#page-1-0) is that only a tiny fraction of published articles have referenced the original mechanistic works. In fact, recent bibliometric studies suggest that more than 10,000 scientific articles on "Fe $<sup>0</sup>$  for water remediation"</sup> have been published since 1994 (Chen et al. [2019](#page-7-5); Antia [2020](#page-7-6); Li et al. [2021\)](#page-8-21). Actually, Google Scholar covers also graduation thesis and technical documents.

Given the crucial importance of the actual reaction mechanisms for the design of sustainable  $\text{Fe}^0$  remediation systems, the present work critically analyses the contaminant-free  $\text{Fe}^0/\text{H}_2\text{O}$  system to improve the mechanistic understanding of its operating mode. The presentation starts with a discussion of the chemistry of aqueous iron corrosion.

# <span id="page-2-5"></span>**Aqueous iron corrosion: the Fe0 /H2O system**

Iron primarily exists in the environment in two oxidation states: (i) highly soluble  $Fe^{2+}$  (ferrous iron) and (ii) lowly soluble  $Fe<sup>3+</sup>$  (ferric iron) (Langmuir [1997\)](#page-8-22). Once immersed in water, reactive Fe<sup>0</sup> undergoes oxidative dissolution (corrosion) owing to its instability. It was demonstrated 120 years ago that aqueous iron corrosion under environmental conditions is an electrochemical process, whereby  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  dissolves at an anode (Eq. [1](#page-2-0)) and proton  $(H<sup>+</sup>$  from water dissociation) reduction takes place at a cathode (Eq. [2](#page-2-1)) (Whitney [1903](#page-10-4)). Clearly, the knowledge that water  $(H^+)$  and only water  $(H^+)$ accepts electrons from  $\text{Fe}^0$  (Eq. [3](#page-2-2)) is a century-old scientific fact.

<span id="page-2-0"></span>
$$
\text{Fe}^0 \Leftrightarrow \text{Fe}^{2+} + 2 \text{e}^- \tag{1}
$$

<span id="page-2-1"></span>
$$
2 H^{+} + 2 e^{-} \Leftrightarrow H_{2}
$$
 (2)

<span id="page-2-2"></span>
$$
\Leftrightarrow \text{Fe}^0 + 2 \text{ H}^+ \text{@Fe}^{2+} + \text{H}_2 \tag{3}
$$

It should be highlighted that Whitney ([1903\)](#page-10-4) explicitly excluded the possibility that dissolved oxygen accepts electrons from  $\text{Fe}^0$  (Eq. [1](#page-2-0)). This makes the following reaction (Eq. [4\)](#page-2-3) impossible:

<span id="page-2-3"></span>
$$
2Fe^{0} + 4H^{+} + O_{2} @ 2Fe^{2+} + 2H_{2}O
$$
 (4)

As shown in Table [1](#page-1-0), Whitney ([1903\)](#page-10-4) has been overlooked in the  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  remediation literature until 2018. This means that the pioneers of the technology have performed incomplete literature research. This is unfortunate as the paper has been published twice: (i) in 1903 at the Journal of the American Chemical Society (original version) and (ii) in 1947 at CORROSION, The Journal of Science and Engineering. The textual reproduction was enriched with the mention: "Dr. W.R. Whitney's classical paper on the electrochemical principles of corrosion is reproduced here by courtesy of the American Chemical Society from that Society's 1903 journal. In recognition of Dr. Whitney's work in establishing this theory of corrosion, the National Association of Corrosion Engineers this year founded the Willis Rodney Whitney Award in the Science of Corrosion, and designated Dr. Whitney the frst recipient of the award, presentation of which was made during the NACE award meeting in Chicago, III, April 7–10, 1947."

Dr. Whitney's theory negates the popular view that  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$ is corroded by water (Eq. [3\)](#page-2-2) only under anoxic conditions (absence of  $O_2$ ) (Matheson and Tratnyek [1994;](#page-8-7) Zhang et al. [2022](#page-10-5)). It also reiterates that under oxic conditions (presence of  $O_2$ ), Fe<sup>0</sup> corrosion is accelerated because  $O_2$  consumes  $Fe<sup>2+</sup>$  for its reductive transformation (Eq. [5\)](#page-2-4) (Le Chatelier Principle).

$$
4Fe^{2+} + 4H^{+} + O_2@4Fe^{3+} + 2H_2O
$$
 (5)

<span id="page-2-4"></span>In other words, the often-written reaction of  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  oxidation by  $O<sub>2</sub>$  (under oxic conditions) (Eq. [4\)](#page-2-3) should be regarded as impossible, even though it is still regarded as textbook knowledge. Once this misconception is fxed, scope exists for an agreement on the further transformations of ferrous and ferric ions to generate an oxide scale shielding the  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$ surface and slowing the kinetics of  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  corrosion (Nesic [2007](#page-9-11); Noubactep [2010](#page-9-12)). As evident from Eqs. [3](#page-2-2) and  $5$ , Fe<sup>0</sup> corrosion consumes  $H<sup>+</sup>$  and induces a significant increase in the pH value of the solution. A concomitant decline in solution redox potential (Eh) has been documented (Matheson and Tratnyek [1994](#page-8-7); Singh et al. [2023\)](#page-9-0). In other words,

irrespective of the presence of any contaminant, the immersion of  $\text{Fe}^0$  in a system may lead to the development of highly reducing conditions.

Another key feature from Whitney [\(1903,](#page-10-4) [1947\)](#page-10-6) is that depending on the salinity of natural waters, for  $pH > 4.5$ , Fe<sup>0</sup> corrosion produces low-solubility hydroxides/oxides and more soluble salts (Antia [2020,](#page-7-6) [2022;](#page-7-7) Tao et al. [2023](#page-9-13)). The generation of iron hydroxides/oxides is certain as far as  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$ is reactive. However, the amount generated is unknown and cannot be estimated because the corrosion rate is unknown (non-constant and nonlinear) (Angst [2019](#page-7-8); Yang et al. [2021,](#page-10-7)  $2022$ ). In a porous system, the extent of  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  corrosion (spatially and temporally) depends on three key factors: (i) the relative solubility of hydroxides and salts, (ii) the concentration of dissolved  $O_2$ , and (iii) the residual porosity and the pore size distribution. For the proper discussion of the mechanisms of water decontamination using  $Fe^{0}/H_{2}O$  systems, it is essential to consider the relative abundance of  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$ ,  $O_2$  and salts. Assuming that  $Fe^0$  is available in stoichiometric abundance, for highly soluble salts (e.g.  $FeCl<sub>2</sub>$ ,  $FeCl<sub>3</sub>$ ), the extent of hydroxide precipitation depends on the time scale of Cl<sup>-</sup> exhaustion (Antia [2020;](#page-7-6) Tao et al. [2023\)](#page-9-13).

This section has reiterated the complexity of the contaminant-free  $\text{Fe}^0/\text{H}_2\text{O}$  system. The challenge for scientists is to properly investigate its changes with the numerous infuencing factors, including: (i)  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  intrinsic reactivity, (ii) water chemistry (electrolyte), (iii) water fow velocity (stagnant vs. convection), (iv) the presence of microorganisms, and (v) the presence of reactive phases (e.g. FeS<sub>2</sub>, MnO<sub>2</sub>) (Cao et al. [2022](#page-7-2)). In dynamic systems, the time-dependent properties of the porous medium (pore size and pore size distribution) must be considered as well (Wielinski et al. [2022](#page-10-9)). Clearly, it is about a holistic consideration of various interdependent dynamic processes such as  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  corrosion, contaminant transport, chemical reactions, and particle transport (Bedrikovetsky [2008;](#page-7-9) Yang et al. [2021\)](#page-10-7).

## Investigating the remediation Fe<sup>0</sup>/H<sub>2</sub>O **system**

[Section 2](#page-2-5) recalls the major characteristics of the contaminant-free  $\text{Fe}^0/\text{H}_2\text{O}$  system which can be summarized in two points: (i) Fe<sup>0</sup> corrodes, and an oxide scale is generated in its vicinity (not really at its surface), and (ii) the extent of  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$ corrosion depends on various inter-related factors, including water chemistry (electrolyte's nature) and the available volume of pores (e.g. pore size and pore size distribution). In other words, polluted water (to be remediated) is just an electrolyte containing elevated concentrations of selected contaminants, typically in trace amounts ( $\mu$ g/L or mg/L). However, the electrolyte is just one component of an electrochemical cell. The three other components are: (i) the anode

where  $\text{Fe}^0$  is dissolved (to  $\text{Fe}^{2+}$ ) and electrons are released, (ii) the uncorroded  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  conducting the released electrons to the cathode, and (iii) the cathode where electrons from  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$ are exchanged (with protons) and molecular  $H_2$  is generated (Groysman [2010](#page-8-23); Noubactep [2014\)](#page-9-14). At this stage of reasoning, four points need to be highlighted: (i) immersed  $\text{Fe}^0$  corrodes also in the absence of  $\text{O}_2$  and any contaminant (Fact 1), (ii) the oxide scale on  $\text{Fe}^0$  acts as a diffusion barrier for  $O_2$  and contaminants (Fact 2), (iii) the oxide scale on Fe<sup>0</sup> is non-conductive and acts as conduction barriers for electrons from Fe<sup>0</sup> (Fact 3), and (iv) Fe<sup>2+</sup> and H<sub>2</sub> are standalone reducing agents (Fact 4). Facts 1–4 have been presented by Noubactep ([2007,](#page-9-5) [2008](#page-9-15)) to refute the validity of the theory that Fe<sup>0</sup> donates electrons to any dissolved species. Attempts to falsify Noubactep's view to date were collectively limited to supporting the view introduced in the 1990s. For example, Lawrinenko et al. ([2023a,](#page-8-4) [2023b\)](#page-8-5) supported their views while citing Cutler ([1987](#page-8-17)), Gillham and O'Hannesin ([1994](#page-8-18)), and Matheson and Tratnyek ([1994\)](#page-8-7). These three articles are claimed to have provided "evidence for direct electron transfer and the corrosion of  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  in contact with chlorinated hydrocarbons". However, as shown in Table [1,](#page-1-0) the two papers from 1994 have not considered Whitney ([1903\)](#page-10-4), while Cutler ([1987](#page-8-17)) is rather a review article on the interactions of  $Al^0$  with halogenated hydrocarbons. Clearly, since the rejection of the reductive transformation concept about 15 years ago, some colleagues have approved the alternative concept (Ghauch et al. [2011;](#page-8-24) Gheju [2011;](#page-8-25) Giles et al. [2011](#page-8-26); Ghauch [2015](#page-8-2); Sista et al. [2021;](#page-9-16) Gheju and Balcu [2019,](#page-8-27) [2023](#page-8-28); Lan et al. [2023](#page-8-29)), while the large majority has overlooked it. Lawrinenko et al. ([2023a](#page-8-4)) is the very frst attempt to falsify the new concept.

Coming back to the contaminant-free  $\text{Fe}^0/\text{H}_2\text{O}$  system, and considering dissolved  $O<sub>2</sub>$  as a non-polluting contaminant, its reduction by  $\text{Fe}^{2+}$  (Eq. [4](#page-2-3)) induces concentration changes in the vicinity of  $\text{Fe}^0$  and in the adjacent porous system. However, the dynamic relationships between these concentration changes and the extent of  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  corrosion are complex and depend on many factors, including: (i) chemical reactions (e.g.  $O_2$  reduction, oxide precipitation), (ii) local pore structure (e.g. size of  $\text{Fe}^0$  and sand particles), and (iii) ionic transport, difusion within the oxide scale, and advection in moving water. The presence of contaminants and site-specifc microorganisms are two other complicating parameters (Angst [2019](#page-7-8); Yang et al. [2021;](#page-10-7) Tao et al. [2023](#page-9-13)). Thus, it is impossible to root the understanding of the  $Fe^{0}/H_{2}O$  system on simple engineering approaches, merely based on the nature of the contaminant and its redox reactivity relative to the redox couple  $Fe^{0}/Fe^{II} (E^{0} = -0.44 V)$ (Gillham and O'Hannesin [1994](#page-8-18); Matheson and Tratnyek [1994](#page-8-7); Sarr [2001](#page-9-17); Fu et al. [2014;](#page-8-6) Obiri-Nyarko et al. [2014](#page-9-2); Lawrinenko et al. [2023a\)](#page-8-4).

At this stage of reasoning, it should be highlighted that  $E^0$  = –0.44 V, the electrode potential of the Fe<sup>II</sup>/Fe<sup>0</sup> redox couple, is not the decisive factor to justify the use of  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  in water treatment. The frst reason for this is that the oxide scale is positively charged and will selectively attract negatively charged pollutants (Sato [2001](#page-9-18); Miyajima [2012;](#page-8-30) Phu-kan et al. [2015](#page-9-19)). On the other hand,  $Al^0$  (E<sup>0</sup>=–1.66 V), Mg<sup>0</sup>  $(E^{0}=-2.38 \text{ V})$ , and  $Zn^{0}$  ( $E^{0}=-0.76 \text{ V}$ ) are more powerful reducing agents than Fe<sup>0</sup> (Cutler [1987;](#page-8-17) Shreier and Reinhardt [1994;](#page-9-6) Warren et al. [1995](#page-10-3)). Proponents of the reductive transformation concept have not really considered this key aspect to explain why these metals are not used for the removal of contaminants in a similar way as  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$ . Rather, their reasoning was limited to toxicity and cost issues. However, particularly,  $Al^0$  and  $Zn^0$  are not suitable for long-term operations because they just form one hydroxide each  $(AI(OH))$ <sub>3</sub> and  $Zn(OH)<sub>2</sub>$ ) and one oxide (Al<sub>2</sub>O<sub>3</sub> and ZnO). The unit cells in Al and  $Al_2O_3$  on the one side and that of Zn and ZnO on the other side are very similar to one another. Thus,  $Al_2O_3$ adheres tightly to  $Al^0$  beneath it, just as ZnO adheres tightly to  $\text{Zn}^0$ . In both cases, the oxidized surface provides a protective layer that prevents  $O_2$  from getting to the underlying metal surface (Dickerson et al. [1979](#page-8-31); Noubactep [2010\)](#page-9-12). In contrast, the packing dimensions of  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  and Fe oxides are not particularly close; thus, there is no tendency for an iron oxide layer to adhere to  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$ . Accordingly, the oxide scale on  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  constantly flakes off and exposes fresh  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  surfaces for attack or corrosion (Dickerson et al. [1979](#page-8-31)). This is the reason why  $\text{Fe}^0$  is a long-term source of iron oxides for water remediation (James et al. [1992](#page-8-32); Wakatsuki et al. [1993](#page-10-0); Jia et al. [2007;](#page-8-33) Bradley et al. [2011\)](#page-7-10), and not a long-term source of electrons for the reductive transformation of selected species (Lawrinenko et al. [2023a](#page-8-4)) (Fig. [1\)](#page-4-0).

Figure [1](#page-4-0) recalls that both concepts recognized the formation of the oxide scale on  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$ . On the one hand, the reductive transformation concept strives to explain why electron transfer from  $\text{Fe}^0$  occurs despite the presence of the oxide scale (Scherer et al. [2000;](#page-9-20) Lawrinenko et al. [2023a](#page-8-4)). On the other hand, the alternative concept supported by the seminal work of Whitney ([1903](#page-10-4)) argues that such an electrochemical

reaction is impossible (Cao et al. [2022](#page-7-2); Noubactep [2023\)](#page-9-1). It is very important to recall that for the concentration ranges of natural water, chemical reduction is not even a relevant remediation mechanism for many substances, particularly when it comes to safe drinking water (Noubactep [2011;](#page-9-21) Hei-mann et al. [2018\)](#page-8-34). The reason is that even reaction products have to be removed from the aqueous phase. However, the maximum contamination limit (MCL) is generally lower than the solubility limit (Kalin et al. [2005;](#page-8-35) Ndé-Tchoupé et al. [2015](#page-9-22)). For this reason, adsorption, co-precipitation, and size-exclusion as occurring in all  $\text{Fe}^0/\text{H}_2\text{O}$  systems are fundamental (Noubactep [2007,](#page-9-5) [2008](#page-9-15); Ghauch et al. [2011](#page-8-24); Gheju [2011;](#page-8-25) Giles et al. [2011](#page-8-26); Noubactep [2011](#page-9-21); Gheju and Balcu [2019](#page-8-27); Sista et al. [2021\)](#page-9-16).

## **Designing sustainable Fe0 PRBs**

The view that  $\text{Fe}^0$  is an electron donor under environmental conditions has led to an empirical design of the frst generation of  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  PRBs. In fact, the stoichiometry of the reaction between  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  and the contaminants of concern were considered (Sarr [2001\)](#page-9-17), and a "safety factor" was used to "increase assurance of successful remediation" (Lawrinenko et al.  $2023a$ ). In this approach, mixing  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  with non-expansive materials like pumice or sand was regarded as a " $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  dilution" with cost benefts, but possible negative impacts on the efficiency of the resulting systems (Kenneke and McCutch-eon [2003](#page-8-36); Westerhoff and James  $2003$ ; Bi et al.  $2009$ ). Fe<sup>0</sup>/ sand mixtures were also used as pre-treatment systems to free inflowing water from dissolved  $O_2$  such that the pure Fe<sup>0</sup> main treatment system could be fully anoxic  $(O_2$  free) (Westerhoff and James [2003](#page-10-10)). Ironically, these efforts coexisted in the literature with the demonstration of the efficiency of Fe<sup>0</sup> PRBs using a Fe<sup>0</sup>/sand mixture comprising 22% Fe<sup>0</sup> (w/w) (O'Hannesin and Gillham [1998](#page-9-4)).

Although differences in density between Fe<sup>0</sup>  $(d=7.6 \text{ g})$ cm<sup>3</sup>) and its corrosion products  $(d < 5.2$  g/cm<sup>3</sup>) have been previously considered in justifying permeability loss in Fe<sup>0</sup> PRBs (Liang et al. [2003](#page-8-37), [2005](#page-8-38)), our research group led Dr.

<span id="page-4-0"></span>**Fig. 1** Illustration of proposed hypotheses for contaminant (RCl) reduction in  $\text{Fe}^0/\text{H}_2\text{O}$ systems: (left)  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  is oxidized by RCl and water  $(H^+)$  (Path 1), and (right)  $\text{Fe}^0$  is oxidized by water  $(H<sup>+</sup>)$  and RCl is reduced by Fe<sup>II</sup> species and H<sub>2</sub> (Path 2). Path 1 is not feasible because the oxide scale is a conduction barrier for electrons from Fe<sup>0</sup>. Path 2 is feasible and rooted in aqueous iron corrosion



<span id="page-5-0"></span>**Fig. 2** Illustration of changes in the residual porosity in a bed filled with spherical Fe<sup>0</sup> particles: (left) at the start of the operation  $(t_0=0)$ , and (right) sometimes later  $(t > t_0)$ , but  $t < t_{\infty}$ ) before Fe<sup>0</sup> complete exhaustion at *t*∞. The time required for complete exhaustion  $(t_{\infty})$  depends on a diversity of factors, including Fe<sup>0</sup> intrinsic reactivity, initial porosity, water chemistry, and Fe<sup>0</sup> ratio



Noubactep was the frst to properly consider the volumetric expansive nature of iron corrosion in designing  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  filters (Noubactep and Caré [2010\)](#page-9-23). Accordingly, replacing a fraction of  $\text{Fe}^0$  in a filtration system with a non-expansive material (e.g.  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$ , pumice, sand) is a tool to enable complete exhaustion of  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  in the long-term (Moraci and Calabrò [2010](#page-9-24); Noubactep et al. [2012;](#page-9-25) Caré et al. [2013;](#page-7-12) Bilardi et al.  $2023$ ). In 100% Fe<sup>0</sup> filters (Fig. [2\)](#page-5-0), clogging occurs before Fe<sup>0</sup> exhaustion because of a lack of space for further dis-solution. Figure [3](#page-5-1) shows two systems, one with  $100\% \text{ Fe}^0$ 

and the other with  $50\% \text{Fe}^0$  (vol/vol). Here, it is seen that the pure Fe<sup>0</sup> system clogs when the 50% Fe<sup>0</sup> has just lost 50% of its porosity. This reasoning implies that mixing  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  and a non-expansive material is a tool to enable better material efficiency (avoid  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  wastage), and a prerequisite for sustainability in terms of long-term permeability (Noubactep et al. [2012](#page-9-25); Caré et al. [2013;](#page-7-12) Domga et al. [2015](#page-8-39); Bilardi et al. [2023;](#page-7-13) Tao et al. [2023\)](#page-9-13). Proponents of the reductive transformation concept have considered a decrease in the source of electrons ( $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  ratio) as a cause of declined system

<span id="page-5-1"></span>**Fig. 3** Illustration of changes in the residual porosity in a bed flled with spherical particles: **a**  $100\% \text{ Fe}^0$ , and **b** Fe<sup>0</sup>/sand with  $50\%$  Fe<sup>0</sup> (vol/vol). The representation corresponds to a time (*t*) when the  $100\%$  Fe<sup>0</sup> is completely clogged. It is considered that the Fe<sup>0</sup>/sand system has lost 50% of its initial porosity



performance for  $\text{Fe}^0$  filters (Kenneke and McCutcheon [2003](#page-8-36); Bi et al. [2009](#page-7-11)). Yet data from both batch and column studies show that admixing Fe<sup>0</sup> with non-expansive aggregates improves the performance of  $\text{Fe}^0/\text{H}_2\text{O}$  systems (Westerhoff and James [2003;](#page-10-10) Song et al. [2005](#page-9-26); Moraci and Calabrò [2010;](#page-9-24) Miyajima [2012](#page-8-30); Tepong-Tsindé et al. [2019](#page-9-27); Gheju and Balcu [2023](#page-8-28); Lan et al. [2023](#page-8-29)). Surprisingly, proponents of the reductive transformation concept have not yet revisited their theory in the light of this evidence (Wielinski et al. [2022](#page-10-9); Lawrinenko et al. [2023a\)](#page-8-4).

Another point of discrepancy between the two views is how to investigate spatio-temporal changes in  $\text{Fe}^0/\text{H}_2\text{O}$  systems. Proponents of the reductive transformation concept are still combining analytical tools to monitor changes in mineral phases in short-term experiments (some few weeks) (Wielinski et al. [2022\)](#page-10-9), while our research group insists on the scarcity of long-term column studies (e.g.  $> 52$  weeks, 1 year) (Tepong-Tsindé et al. [2019](#page-9-27); Yang et al. [2022](#page-10-8)). In fact, using a pure thermodynamic approach (mass balance), the optimum  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  ratio to avoid material wastage was determined as 25% (vol/vol) in hybrid Fe<sup>0</sup>/sand systems (Miyajima [2012;](#page-8-30) Miyajima and Noubactep [2013](#page-8-40)). There is material wastage whenever  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  is not completely exhausted as the system is clogged (Caré et al. [2013;](#page-7-12) Domga et al [2015](#page-8-39)). This is when the time to material exhaustion  $(t<sub>∞</sub>)$  is lower than the time to clogging  $(t_{clog})$ . A Fe<sup>0</sup> volumetric ratio of  $25\%$  in a Fe<sup>0</sup>/sand system roughly corresponds to (i)  $50\%$  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  (w/w) which has been used at several field installations (Henderson and Demond [2007;](#page-8-1) Guan et al. [2015\)](#page-8-3) and (ii) the solution to the special case ( $t_{\infty} = t_{\text{clog}}$ , where clogging occurs promptly at Fe<sup>0</sup> complete exhaustion). The temporal issue that is the extent of porosity loss at any time (or time to clogging) is difficult or even impossible to address because the corrosion kinetics is not known and has even not been really investigated in the Fe<sup>0</sup> remediation context (Moraci et al. [2016](#page-9-28); Noubactep [2016;](#page-9-29) Yang et al. [2022](#page-10-8)). Ironically, while  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  oxidation by water is mostly considered as a side reaction, modelling efforts, since Mayer et al. [\(2001\)](#page-8-41), are mainly rooted in its corrosion rate as determined by Dr. Eric J. Reardon 33 years ago (Reardon [1995](#page-9-30)).

A last fundamental design aspect to consider is how the expected decrease of the permeability will infuence the long-term efficiency of  $\text{Fe}^0$  PRBs. In fact,  $\text{Fe}^0$  PRBs are designed to be more permeable than the surrounding aquifer material (O'Hannesin and Gillham [1998](#page-9-4); Zhang et al. [2022](#page-10-5); Plessl et al.  $2023$ ). However, despite mixing  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  with nonexpansive materials, the permeability of the reactive zone  $(Fe<sup>0</sup> PRB)$  will still decrease. Therefore, it makes sense to forecast specifc cases, for example, when the initial PRB's permeability will decrease by one-quarter, one-third, or onehalf. Considering such scenarios in the design phase would be useful for better monitoring of the system's performance (Yang et al. [2021](#page-10-7), [2022](#page-10-8)).

### **Practical signifcance**

The analysis in this study shows that under given operational conditions,  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  can generate various amounts of FeCPs which are highly effective in removing many classes of contaminants from aqueous solutions (Bigg and Judd [2000](#page-7-14); Henderson and Demond [2007](#page-8-1); Cundy et al. [2008;](#page-8-42) Noubactep et al. [2009\)](#page-9-32). Adsorption, co-precipitation, and size-exclusion (chromatographic effects) are the common underlying removal mechanisms, including for redox-active species. The robust design of sustainable  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  PRBs depends on the profound understanding of how site-specifc characteristics (e.g.  $O_2$  availability, pH value, salinity) affect the long-term availability of FeCPs within the system (Naseri et al. [2017](#page-9-33); Noubactep [2018](#page-9-34); Tao et al. [2023](#page-9-13)). In other words, the analysis presented herein provides a new starting point for the conceptualization of future laboratory, pilot, and feld-scale studies for the design of efficient and sustainable  $Fe<sup>0</sup> PRBs$ for groundwater remediation as well as systems to treat wastewater and  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  filters for safe drinking water provision.

To the best of the authors' knowledge, only the research group of Dr. Vollprecht (starting later) has designed their whole experiments correctly and interpreted the results according to the state-of-the-art knowledge (Vollprecht et al. [2018,](#page-9-35) [2020](#page-9-36); Sedlazeck et al. [2019](#page-9-37), [2020](#page-9-38)). In retrospect, Vollprecht's articles on the "Ferrodecont Process" are built on Müller et al. ([2014](#page-9-39)) entitled "Implementation of fuidized granulated iron reactors in a chromate remediation process". Müller et al. [\(2014\)](#page-9-39) is nothing new, but an independent rediscovery of the Anderson Process as implemented in the 1880s in the waterworks of Antwerpten (Belgium) (Devonshire [1890;](#page-8-0) van Craenenbroeck [1998](#page-9-40); Mwakabona et al. [2017](#page-9-41); Antia [2020\)](#page-7-6). Both processes (Anderson and Ferrodecont) are rooted in the evidence that in fltration systems, clogging is a special (or geometrical) effect occurring because space lacks to store the in-situ generated corrosion products (contaminant scavengers) (Caré et al. [2013](#page-7-12); Domga et al. [2015](#page-8-39); Bilardi et al. [2023](#page-7-13)).

### **Conclusions and a look ahead**

This article presents a critical assessment of the state-ofthe-art knowledge on the operating mode of engineered  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$ -based systems for water remediation as used for safe drinking water supply, wastewater treatment, and environmental remediation. The following major conclusions are drawn:

Immersing a reactive  $Fe^0$  specimen in (polluted) water at a pH value higher than 4.5 results in its oxidative dissolution by H+ ions and the generation of solid iron corrosion products which act as contaminant scavengers.  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  dissolution also generates standalone reducing agents (e.g.  $Fe^{II}$  oxides,  $Fe^{II}/Fe^{III}$  oxides, H<sub>2</sub>) which may reduce selected contaminants by a chemical reaction. In other words, although  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$ corrosion in PRBs is an electrochemical process, oxidizing electrons are not supplied by any dissolved contaminant. This century-old knowledge has been overlooked for 28 years while discussing the mechanisms of contaminant removal in  $\text{Fe}^0/\text{H}_2\text{O}$  systems (Table [1](#page-1-0)).

Despite the discrepancy in the actual operating mode of engineered Fe<sup>0</sup>-based systems, a well-documented advantage of these systems is that their decontamination efficiency can be maintained for decades (Phillips et al. [2010;](#page-9-42) Wilkin et al. [2014,](#page-10-11) [2019\)](#page-10-12). This is an additional motivation to root this technology in its scientifc background (i.e. iron corrosion).

The relationship between Fe<sup>0</sup> dissolution, porosity loss, and water decontamination is very complex. This is because of the numerous inter-related and partly dynamic infuencing factors involved in the processes. Relevant infuencing factors include: (i) the porous structure (e.g. size, distribution), (ii) the water chemistry (e.g.  $O_2$  availability, pH value, salinity), (iii) water flow velocity, and (iv) the action of microorganisms. Thus, engineering or pragmatic approaches for understanding the mechanisms of water treatment using  $Fe<sup>0</sup>/$ H<sub>2</sub>O systems have proven unreliable. The scientific challenge for the coming years is to properly consider advances in numerical modelling (e.g. reactive transport modelling in porous media) to devise models capable of considering: (i) the spatio-temporal changes within the  $Fe^{0}/H_{2}O$  system at the pore-scale level, and (ii) the interdependence between the involved processes (e.g. chemical reactions,  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  reactivity, Fe<sup>0</sup> ratio, and transport processes).

A concerted effort is needed to pave the way out of the current "valley of confusion" characterized by a high level of empiricism. It is hoped that based on the clarifcations presented herein, new engineering tools will be developed to increase the efectiveness and reliability of the next generation of  $\text{Fe}^0$  PRBs as an efficient and sustainable technology for groundwater remediation.

**Author contributions** Conception (MX, RH and CN), developing the original idea (MX, RH, CN, AINT, and WG), literature review (all), supervision (RH, CN and WG), redaction and revisions (all).

**Funding** Open Access funding enabled and organized by Projekt DEAL. This work is supported by the Ministry of Science and Technology of China through the Programme "Driving process and mechanism of three dimensional spatial distribution of high risk organic pollutants in multi-feld coupled sites" (Project Code: 2019YFC1804303).

### **Declarations**

**Conflict of interest** The authors declare no confict of interest.

**Ethical approval statement** Not applicable.

**Informed consent** Not applicable.

**Open Access** This article is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License, which permits use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons licence, and indicate if changes were made. The images or other third party material in this article are included in the article's Creative Commons licence, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the article's Creative Commons licence and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder. To view a copy of this licence, visit<http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>.

### **References**

- <span id="page-7-8"></span>Angst UM (2019) A critical review of the science and engineering of cathodic protection of steel in soil and concrete. Corrosion 75:1420–1433
- <span id="page-7-7"></span>Antia DDJ (2022) Catalytic partial desalination of saline water. Water 14:2893
- <span id="page-7-6"></span>Antia DDJ (2020) Water treatment and desalination using the ecomaterials n-Fe<sup>0</sup> (ZVI), n-Fe<sub>3</sub>O<sub>4</sub>, n-Fe<sub>x</sub>O<sub>y</sub>H<sub>z</sub>[mH<sub>2</sub>O], and n-Fe<sub>x</sub>[Cation]<sub>n</sub>O<sub>v</sub>H<sub>z</sub>[Anion]<sub>m</sub> [rH<sub>2</sub>O]. In: Kharissova OV et al (eds) Handbook of nanomaterials and nanocomposites for energy and environmental applications. Springer, Switzerland. [https://](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-11155-7_66-1) [doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-11155-7\\_66-1](https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-030-11155-7_66-1)
- <span id="page-7-0"></span>Baker MN (1934) Sketch of the history of water treatment. J Am Water Works Assoc 26:902–938
- <span id="page-7-9"></span>Bedrikovetsky P (2008) Upscaling of stochastic micro model for suspension transport in porous media. Transp Porous Med 75:335–369
- <span id="page-7-11"></span>Bi E, Devlin JF, Huang B (2009) Efects of mixing granular iron with sand on the kinetics of trichloroethylene reduction. Ground Water Monit Remediat 29:56–62
- <span id="page-7-14"></span>Bigg T, Judd SJ (2000) Zero-valent iron for water treatment. Environ Technol 21:661–670
- <span id="page-7-13"></span>Bilardi S, Calabrò PS, Moraci N (2023) A review of the hydraulic performance of permeable reactive barriers based on granular zero valent iron. Water 15:200
- <span id="page-7-10"></span>Bradley I, Straub A, Maraccini P, Markazi S, Nguyen TH (2011) Iron oxide amended biosand flters for virus removal. Water Res 45:4501–4510
- <span id="page-7-4"></span>Cantrell KJ, Kaplan DI, Wietsma TW (1995) Zero-valent iron for the in situ remediation of selected metals in groundwater. J Hazard Mater 42:201–212
- <span id="page-7-2"></span>Cao V, Bakari O, Kenmogne-Tchidjo JF, Gatcha-Bandjun N, Ndé-Tchoupé AI, Gwenzi W, Njau KN, Noubactep C (2022) Conceptualizing the  $\text{Fe}^0/\text{H}_2\text{O}$  system: a call for collaboration to mark the 30th anniversary of the Fe<sup>0</sup>-based permeable reactive barrier technology. Water 14:3120
- <span id="page-7-12"></span>Caré S, Crane R, Calabrò PS, Ghauch A, Temgoua E, Noubactep C (2013) Modeling the permeability loss of metallic iron water fltration systems. CLEAN—Soil Air Water 41:275–282
- <span id="page-7-1"></span>Chen S, Fan D, Tratnyek PG (2014) Novel contaminant transformation pathways by abiotic reductants. Environ Sci Technol Lett 1:432–436
- <span id="page-7-5"></span>Chen Q, Fan G, Na W, Liu J, Cui J, Li H (2019) Past, present, and future of groundwater remediation research: a scientometric analysis. Int J Environ Res Public Health 16:3975
- <span id="page-7-3"></span>Comba S, Di Molfetta A, Sethi R (2011) A Comparison between feld applications of nano-, micro-, and millimetric zero-valent iron for

the remediation of contaminated aquifers. Water Air Soil Pollut 215:595–607

- <span id="page-8-42"></span>Cundy AB, Hopkinson L, Whitby RLD (2008) Use of iron-based technologies in contaminated land and groundwater remediation: a review. Sci Tot Environ 400:42–51
- <span id="page-8-17"></span>Cutler DP (1987) Reactions between halogenated hydrocarbons and metals: a literature review. J Hazard Mater 17:99–108
- <span id="page-8-0"></span>Devonshire E (1890) The purifcation of water by means of metallic iron. J Frankl Inst 129:449–461
- <span id="page-8-31"></span>Dickerson RE, Gray HB, Haight GP Jr (1979) Chemical principles, 3rd edn. Benjamin/cummings inc, London, Amsterdam, p 944
- <span id="page-8-39"></span>Domga R, Togue-Kamga F, Noubactep C, Tchatchueng JB (2015) Discussing porosity loss of Fe<sup>0</sup> packed water filters at ground level. Chem Eng J 263:127–134
- <span id="page-8-10"></span>Farrell J, Wang J, O'Day P, Conklin M (2001) Electrochemical and spectroscopic study of arsenate removal from water using zerovalent iron media. Environ Sci Technol 35:2026–2032
- <span id="page-8-9"></span>Fiedor JN, Bostick WD, Jarabek RJ, Farrel J (1998) Understanding the mechanism, of uranium removal from groundwater by zerovalent iron using X-ray photoelectron spectroscopy. Environ Sci Technol 32:1466–1473
- <span id="page-8-6"></span>Fu F, Dionysiou DD, Liu H (2014) The use of zero-valent iron for groundwater remediation and wastewater treatment: a review. J Hazard Mater 267:194–205
- <span id="page-8-2"></span>Ghauch A (2015) Iron-based metallic systems: an excellent choice for sustainable water treatment. Freib Online Geosci 32:1–80
- <span id="page-8-24"></span>Ghauch A, Abou AH, Baydoun H, Tuqan AM, Bejjani A (2011) Fe<sup>0</sup>-based trimetallic systems for the removal of aqueous diclofenac: mechanism and kinetics. Chem Eng J 172:1033–1044
- <span id="page-8-25"></span>Gheju M (2011) Hexavalent chromium reduction with zero-valent iron (ZVI) in aquatic systems. Water Air Soil Pollut 222:103–148
- <span id="page-8-27"></span>Gheju M, Balcu I (2019) Sustaining the efficiency of the  $Fe(0)/H<sub>2</sub>O$ system for Cr(VI) removal by  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$  amendment. Chemosphere 214:389–398
- <span id="page-8-28"></span>Gheju M, Balcu I (2023) Effect of sand co-presence on  $Cr<sup>VI</sup>$  removal in  $\text{Fe}^0\text{-}\text{H}_2\text{O}$  system. Water 15:777
- <span id="page-8-26"></span>Giles DE, Mohapatra M, Issa TB, Anand S, Singh P (2011) Iron and aluminium based adsorption strategies for removing arsenic from water. J Environ Manag 92:3011–3022
- <span id="page-8-18"></span>Gillham RW, O'Hannesin SF (1994) Enhanced degradation of halogenated aliphatics by zero-valent iron. Ground Water 32:958–967
- <span id="page-8-15"></span>Gould JP (1982) The kinetics of hexavalent chromium reduction by metallic iron. Water Res 16:871–877
- <span id="page-8-23"></span>Groysman A (2010) Corrosion for Everybody. Springer, Dordrecht, Heidelberg, London, New York, p 368
- <span id="page-8-3"></span>Guan X, Sun Y, Qin H, Li J, Lo IMC, He D, Dong H (2015) The limitations of applying zero-valent iron technology in contaminants sequestration and the corresponding countermeasures: the development in zero-valent iron technology in the last two decades (1994–2014). Water Res 75:224–248
- <span id="page-8-34"></span>Heimann S, Ndé-Tchoupé AI, Hu R, Licha T, Noubactep C (2018) Investigating the suitability of  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  packed-beds for water defluoridation. Chemosphere 209:578–587
- <span id="page-8-1"></span>Henderson AD, Demond AH (2007) Long-term performance of zerovalent iron permeable reactive barriers: a critical review. Environ Eng Sci 24:401–423
- <span id="page-8-13"></span>Hu R, Gwenzi W, Sipowo HuR, Ndé-Tchoupé AI, Cao V, Gwenzi W, Noubactep C (2021) Metallic iron for environmental remediation: The fallacy of the electron efficiency concept. Frontiers Environ Chem 2:677813
- <span id="page-8-32"></span>James BR, Rabenhorst MC, Frigon GA (1992) Phosphorus sorption by peat and sand amended with iron oxides or steel wool. Water Environ Res 64:699–705
- <span id="page-8-33"></span>Jia Y, Breedveld GD, Aagaard P (2007) Column studies on transport of deicing additive benzotriazole in a sandy aquifer and a zerovalent iron barrier. Chemosphere 69:1409–1418
- <span id="page-8-12"></span>Jiao Y, Qiu C, Huang L, Wu K, Ma H, Chen S, Ma L, Wu L (2009) Reductive dechlorination of carbon tetrachloride by zerovalent iron and related iron corrosion. Appl Catal B: Environ 91:434–440
- <span id="page-8-35"></span>Kalin M, Wheeler WN, Meinrath G (2005) The removal of uranium from mining waste water using algal/microbial biomass. J Environ Radioact 78:151–177
- <span id="page-8-36"></span>Kenneke JF, McCutcheon SC (2003) Use of pretreatment zones and zero-valent iron for the remediation of chloroalkenes in an oxic aquifer. Environ Sci Technol 37(12):2829–2835
- <span id="page-8-19"></span>Khudenko BM (1985) Mechanism and kinetics of cementation processes. Water Sci Technol 17:719–731
- <span id="page-8-20"></span>Khudenko BM (1987) Mathematical models of cementaion process. J Environ Eng 113:681–702
- <span id="page-8-16"></span>Khudenko BM (1991) Feasibility evaluation of a novel method for destruction of organics. Water Sci Technol 23:1873–1881
- <span id="page-8-14"></span>Konadu-Amoah B, Ndé-Tchoupé AI, Hu R, Gwenzi W, Noubactep C (2021) Investigating the  $Fe^{0}/H_{2}O$  systems using the methylene blue method: Validity, applications and future directions. Chemosphere 291:132913
- <span id="page-8-29"></span>Lan LE, Reina FD, De Seta GE, Meichtry JM, Litter MI (2023) Comparison between diferent technologies (zerovalent iron, coagulation-focculation, adsorption) for arsenic treatment at high concentrations. Water 15:1481
- <span id="page-8-22"></span>Langmuir D (1997) Aqueous environmental geochemistry. Prentice hall, 600
- <span id="page-8-11"></span>Lavine BK, Auslander G, Ritter J (2001) Polarographic studies of zero valent iron as a reductant for remediation of nitroaromatics in the environment. Microchem J 70:69–83
- <span id="page-8-4"></span>Lawrinenko M, Kurwadkar S, Wilkin RT (2023a) Long–term performance evaluation of zero-valent iron amended permeable reactive barriers for groundwater remediation—a mechanistic approach. Geosci Front 14:101494
- <span id="page-8-5"></span>Lawrinenko M, Kurwadkar S, Wilkin RT (2023b) Reply to comment by C. Noubactep on "Long-term performance evaluation of zerovalent iron amended permeable reactive barriers for groundwater remediation: a mechanistic approach." Geosci Front 14:101583
- <span id="page-8-21"></span>Li X, Li Z, Du C, Tian Z, Zhu Q, Li G, Shen Q, Li C, Li J, Li W, Zhao C, Zhang L (2021) Bibliometric analysis of zerovalent iron particles research for environmental remediation from 2000 to 2019. Environ Sci Pollut Res 28:4200–34210
- <span id="page-8-37"></span>Liang L, Sullivan AB, West OR, Moline GR, Kamolpornwijit W (2003) Predicting the precipitation of mineral phases in permeable reactive barriers. Environ Eng Sci 20:635–653
- <span id="page-8-38"></span>Liang L, Moline GR, Kamolpornwijit W, West OR (2005) Infuence of hydrogeochemical processes on zero-valent iron reactive barrier performance: a feld investigation. J Contam Hydrol 78:291–312
- <span id="page-8-8"></span>Lipczynska-Kochany E, Harms S, Milburn R, Sprah G, Nadarajah N (1994) Degradation of carbon tetrachloride in the presence of iron and sulphur containing compounds. Chemosphere 29:1477–1489
- <span id="page-8-7"></span>Matheson LJ, Tratnyek PG (1994) Reductive dehalogenation of chlorinated methanes by iron metal. Environ Sci Technol 28:2045–2053
- <span id="page-8-41"></span>Mayer KU, Blowes DW, Frind EO (2001) Reactive transport modeling of an in situ reactive barrier for the treatment of hexavalent chromium and trichloroethylene in groundwater. Water Resour Res 37:3091–3103
- <span id="page-8-30"></span>Miyajima K (2012) Optimizing the design of metallic iron flters for water treatment. Freib Online Geosci 32:1–60
- <span id="page-8-40"></span>Miyajima K, Noubactep C (2013) Impact of  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$  amendment on methylene blue discoloration by sand columns. Chem Eng J 217:310–319
- <span id="page-9-24"></span>Moraci N, Calabrò PS (2010) Heavy metals removal and hydraulic performance in zero-valent iron/pumice permeable reactive barriers. J Environ Manag 91:2336–2341
- <span id="page-9-28"></span>Moraci N, Lelo D, Bilardi S, Calabrò PS (2016) Modelling long-term hydraulic conductivity behaviour of zero valent iron column tests for permeable reactive barrier design. Can Geotech J 53:946–961
- <span id="page-9-39"></span>Müller P, Lorber KE, Mischitz R, Weiß C (2014) Implementation of fuidized granulated iron reactors in a chromate remediation process. Sci Tot Environ 485–486:748–754
- <span id="page-9-9"></span>Murphy AP (1988) Removal of selenate from water by chemical reduction. Ind Eng Chem Res 27:181–191
- <span id="page-9-10"></span>Murphy AP (1991) Chemical removal of nitrate from water. Nature 350:223–225
- <span id="page-9-41"></span>Mwakabona HT, Ndé-Tchoupé AI, Njau KN, Noubactep C, Wydra KD (2017) Metallic iron for safe drinking water provision: considering a lost knowledge. Water Res 117:127–142
- <span id="page-9-33"></span>Naseri E, Ndé-Tchoupé AI, Mwakabona HT, Nanseu-Njiki CP, Noubactep C, Njau KN, Wydra KD (2017) Making Fe<sup>0</sup>-based filters a universal solution for safe drinking water provision. Sustainability 9:1224
- <span id="page-9-22"></span>Ndé-Tchoupé AI, Crane RA, Hezron T, Mwakabona NC, Njau KN (2015) Technologies for decentralized fuoride removal: testing metallic iron based flters. Water 7:6750–6774
- <span id="page-9-11"></span>Nesic S (2007) Key issues related to modelling of internal corrosion of oil and gas pipelines—a review. Corros Sci 49:4308–4338
- <span id="page-9-5"></span>Noubactep C (2007) Processes of contaminant removal in " $Fe^{0} - H_{2}O$ " systems revisited. The importance of co-precipitation. Open Environ Sci 1:9–13
- <span id="page-9-15"></span>Noubactep C (2008) A critical review on the mechanism of contaminant removal in  $\text{Fe}^0$ –H<sub>2</sub>O systems. Environ Technol 29:909–920
- <span id="page-9-12"></span>Noubactep C (2010) The suitability of metallic iron for environmental remediation. Environ Prog Sustain Energy 29:286–291
- <span id="page-9-21"></span>Noubactep C (2011) Aqueous contaminant removal by metallic iron: Is the paradigm shifting? Water SA 37:419–426
- <span id="page-9-14"></span>Noubactep C (2014) Flaws in the design of Fe(0)-based fltration systems? Chemosphere 117:104–107
- <span id="page-9-29"></span>Noubactep C (2016) Predicting the hydraulic conductivity of metallic iron flters: modeling gone astray. Water 8:162
- <span id="page-9-34"></span>Noubactep C (2018) Metallic iron ( $Fe<sup>0</sup>$ ) provide possible solution to universal safe drinking water provision. J Water Technol Treat Methods 1(1):102
- <span id="page-9-1"></span>Noubactep C (2023) Comments on "long-term performance evaluation of zero-valent iron amended permeable reactive barriers for groundwater remediation: a mechanistic approach" by Lawrinenko et al., Geoscience Frontiers 14, 2023 101494. Geosci Front 14:101582
- <span id="page-9-23"></span>Noubactep C, Caré S (2010) Dimensioning metallic iron beds for efficient contaminant removal. Chem Eng J 163:454–460
- <span id="page-9-32"></span>Noubactep C, Schöner A, Woafo P (2009) Metallic iron flters for universal access to safe drinking water. Clean: Soil, Air, Water 37:930–937
- <span id="page-9-25"></span>Noubactep C, Caré S, Btatkeu KBD, Nanseu-Njiki CP (2012) Enhancing the sustainability of household Fe<sup>0</sup>/sand filters by using bimetallics and  $MnO<sub>2</sub>$ . Clean—Soil Air Water 40:100–109
- <span id="page-9-4"></span>O'Hannesin SF, Gillham RW (1998) Long-term performance of an in situ "iron wall" for remediation of VOCs. Ground Water 36:164–170
- <span id="page-9-2"></span>Obiri-Nyarko F, Grajales-Mesa SJ, Malina G (2014) An overview of permeable reactive barriers for in situ sustainable groundwater remediation. Chemosphere 111:243–259
- <span id="page-9-42"></span>Phillips DH, Van Nooten T, Bastiaens L, Russell MI, Dickson K, Plant S, Ahad JME, Newton T, Elliot T, Kalin RM (2010) Ten year performance evaluation of a feld-scale zero-valent iron permeable reactive barrier installed to remediate trichloroethene contaminated groundwater. Environ Sci Technol 44:3861–3869
- <span id="page-9-19"></span>Phukan M, Noubactep C, Licha T (2015) Characterizing the ionselective nature of Fe<sup>0</sup>-based filters using azo dyes. Chem Eng J 259:481–491
- <span id="page-9-31"></span>Plessl K, Russ A, Vollprecht D (2023) Application and development of zero-valent iron (ZVI) for groundwater and wastewater treatment. Int J Environ Sci Technol 20:6913–6928
- <span id="page-9-7"></span>Qiu SR, Lai H-F, Roberson MJ, Hunt ML, Amrhein C, Giancarlo LC, Flynn GW, Yarmoff, (2000) Removal of contaminants from aqueous solution by reaction with iron surfaces. Langmuir 16:2230–2236
- <span id="page-9-30"></span>Reardon JE (1995) Anaerobic corrosion of granular iron: Measurement and interpretation of hydrogen evolution rates. Environ Sci Technol 29:2936–2945
- <span id="page-9-8"></span>Reynolds GW, Hoff JT, Gillham RW (1990) Sampling bias caused by materials used to monitor halocarbons in groundwater. Environ Sci Technol 24:135–142
- <span id="page-9-3"></span>Roberts AL, Totten LA, Arnold WA, Burris DR, Campbell TJ (1996) Reductive elimination of chlorinated ethylenes by zero-valent metals. Environ Sci Technol 30:2654–2659
- <span id="page-9-17"></span>Sarr D (2001) Zero-valent-iron permeable reactive barriers - how long will they last? Remediation 11:1–18
- <span id="page-9-18"></span>Sato N (2001) Surface oxides affecting metallic corrosion. Corros Rev 19:253–272
- <span id="page-9-20"></span>Scherer MM, Richter S, Valentine RL, Alvarez PJJ (2000) Chemistry and microbiology of permeable reactive barriers for in situ groundwater clean up. Rev Environ Sci Technol 30:363–411
- <span id="page-9-6"></span>Schreier CG, Reinhard M (1994) Transformation of chlorinated organic compounds by iron and manganese powders in bufered water and in landfll leachate. Chemosphere 29:1743–1753
- <span id="page-9-37"></span>Sedlazeck KP, Vollprecht D, Müller P, Mischitz R, Gill J, Trois W, Maunz I, Frate R, Mann O, Wruss K (2019) Decomposition of dissolved organic contaminants by combining a boron-doped diamond electrode, zero-valent iron and ultraviolet radiation. Chemosphere 217:897–904
- <span id="page-9-38"></span>Sedlazeck KP, Vollprecht D, Müller P, Mischitz R, Gieré R (2020) Impact of an in-situ Cr(VI)-contaminated site remediation on the groundwater. Environ Sci Pollut Res 27:14465–14475
- <span id="page-9-0"></span>Singh R, Chakma S, Birke V (2023) Performance of feld-scale permeable reactive barriers: an overview on potentials and possible implications for in-situ groundwater remediation applications. Sci Tot Environ 858:158838
- <span id="page-9-16"></span>Sista KS, Kumar D, Sinha GR, Moon AP, Dwarapudi S (2021) Iron powders as a potential material for arsenic removal in aqueous systems. ISIJ Int 61:2687–2702
- <span id="page-9-26"></span>Song D-I, Kim YH, Shin WS (2005) A simple mathematical analysis on the efect of sand in Cr(VI) reduction using zero valent iron. Korean J Chem Eng 22:67–69
- <span id="page-9-13"></span>Tao R, Cui X, Xiao M, Hu R, Gwenzi W, Ruppert H, Noubactep C  $(2023)$  Influence of water salinity on the efficiency on  $Fe<sup>0</sup>$ -based systems for water treatment. Water 15:2466
- <span id="page-9-27"></span>Tepong-Tsindé R, Ndé-Tchoupé AI, Noubactep C, Nassi A, Ruppert H (2019) Characterizing a newly designed steel-wool-based household flter for safe drinking water provision: Hydraulic conductivity and efficiency for pathogen removal. Processes 7:966
- <span id="page-9-40"></span>van Craenenbroeck W (1998) Easton & Anderson and the water supply of Antwerp (Belgium). Ind Archaeol Rev 20:105–116
- <span id="page-9-35"></span>Vollprecht D, Krois L-M, Sedlazeck KP, Müller P, Mischitz R, Olbrich T, Pomberger R (2018) Removal of critical metals from waste water by zero-valent iron. J Clean Prod 208:1409–1420
- <span id="page-9-36"></span>Vollprecht D, Plessl K, Neuhold S, Kittinger F, Öfner W, Müller P, Mischitz R, Sedlazeck KP (2020) Recovery of molybdenum, chromium, tungsten, copper, silver, and zinc from industrial waste waters using zero-valent iron and tailored benefciation processes. Processes 8:279
- <span id="page-10-0"></span>Wakatsuki T, Esumi H, Omura S (1993) High performance and N, P removable on-site domestic wastewater treatment system by multi-soil-layering method. Water Sci Technol 27:31–40
- <span id="page-10-3"></span>Warren KD, Arnold RG, Bishop TL, Lindholm LC, Betterton EA (1995) Kinetics and mechanism of reductive dehalogenation of carbon tetrachloride using zero-valence metals. J Hazard Mater 41:217–227
- <span id="page-10-1"></span>Weber EJ (1996) Iron-mediated reductive transformations: investigation of reaction mechanism. Environ Sci Technol 30:716–719
- <span id="page-10-10"></span>Westerhoff P, James J (2003) Nitrate removal in zero-valent iron packed columns. Water Res 37:1818–1830
- <span id="page-10-4"></span>Whitney WR (1903) The corrosion of iron. J Am Chem Soc 25(4):394–406

<span id="page-10-6"></span>Whitney WR (1947) The corrosion of iron. Corrosion 3:331–340

- <span id="page-10-9"></span>Wielinski J, Jimenez-Martinez J, Göttlicher J, Steininger R, Mangold S, Hug SJ, Berg M, Voegelin A (2022) Spatiotemporal mineral phase evolution and arsenic retention in microfuidic models of zerovalent iron-based water treatment. Environ Sci Technol 56:13696–13708
- <span id="page-10-11"></span>Wilkin RT, Acree SD, Ross RR, Puls RW, Lee TR, Woods LL (2014) Fifteen-year assessment of a permeable reactive barrier for treatment of chromate and trichloroethylene in groundwater. Sci Tot Environ 468–469:186–194
- <span id="page-10-12"></span>Wilkin RT, Lee TR, Sexton MR, Acree SD, Puls RW, Blowes DW, Kalinowski C, Tilton JM, Woods LL (2019) Geochemical and

isotope study of trichloroethene degradation in a zero-valent iron permeable reactive barrier: a twenty-two-year performance evaluation. Environ Sci Technol 53:296–306

- <span id="page-10-7"></span>Yang H, Hu R, Ruppert H, Noubactep C (2021) Modeling porosity loss in Fe<sup>0</sup>-based permeable reactive barriers with Faraday's law. Sci Rep 11:16998
- <span id="page-10-8"></span>Yang H, Liu Q, Hu R, Ptak T, Taherdangkoo R, Liu Y, Noubactep C (2022) Numerical case studies on long-term efectiveness of metallic iron based permeable reactive barriers: importance of porosity heterogeneity of the barrier. J Hydrol 612:128148
- <span id="page-10-2"></span>You Y, Han J, Chiu PC, Jin Y (2005) Removal and inactivation of waterborne viruses using zerovalent iron. Environ Sci Technol 39:9263–9269
- <span id="page-10-5"></span>Zhang Y-F, Zhang C-H, Xu J-H, Li L, Li D, Wu Q, Ma L-M (2022) Strategies to enhance the reactivity of zero-valent iron for environmental remediation: a review. J Environ Manag 317:115381

**Publisher's Note** Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional afliations.