ORIGINAL ARTICLE

Visualization of gaseous and dissolved CO2 migration in porous media

Jin‑Seok Kim1 · Ho Young Jo1 · Seong‑Taek Yun1

Received: 19 September 2017 / Accepted: 7 April 2018 / Published online: 16 April 2018 © Springer-Verlag GmbH Germany, part of Springer Nature 2018

Abstract

Visualization experiments using a rectangular transparent acrylic cell, which contained glass beads saturated with alkaline solution, with a universal pH indicator, were conducted to investigate the migration behaviors of gas and dissolved $CO₂$ in water-saturated porous media, assuming that $CO₂$ exsolution occurs from the $CO₂$ -saturated groundwater. Immediately after the CO₂ gas injection ($t < 1$ s), which is comparable to the period immediately following CO₂ exsolution, CO₂ gas moved upward, percolating into the pores through various pathways. During CO_2 gas injection ($t > 1$ s), CO_2 gas bubbles continued to move upward to the interface between the saturated porous medium and air, while dissolving in the pore water. When the CO₂ gas reached the interface, a thin, dense yellow layer was formed, followed by the gradual coalescing of the small fngers, forming a thick dense yellow layer, indicating density-driven convection. The fngers formed by the density-driven convective fow were clearer in the coarser glass beads. The migration of carbonated water was faster, as the glass bead size and the $CO₂$ gas injection rate increased, causing earlier $CO₂$ saturation in pore water. The temporal changes in the effluent $CO₂$ gas concentration, emitted from the saturated glass beads to air, varied with the grain size of the porous medium and the $CO₂$ gas injection rate.

Keywords $CO_2 \cdot$ Porous media \cdot Convection \cdot Visualization \cdot pH indicator

Introduction

Over the past 100 years the average temperature has risen from 0.3 to 0.6 \degree C, with the sea level rising by 10–25 cm. If the energy use for industrial activity remains in the present condition, $CO₂$ emissions will gradually increase every year. One of the main causes of global warming is the greenhouse gases produced by anthropogenic activities. If the greenhouse gases continue to increase at the current level, the average temperature of earth will increase by 1.1–6.4 °C by the year 2100, with sea levels rising by 18–59 cm (IPCC [2007](#page-12-0); IEA [2008\)](#page-12-1).

Geological storage of $CO₂$ is a technology to sequester $CO₂$ in the long term by injecting captured $CO₂$ into large porous rock layers underground $(>800 \text{ m})$, with an impermeable caprock. For the geological storage of $CO₂$, the target porous rock layers should have a suitable depth, sufficient

 \boxtimes Ho Young Jo hyjo@korea.ac.kr porosity, and an impermeable caprock. The function of the caprock is to prevent the upward migration of the injected $CO₂$ by buoyancy. The injected $CO₂$ should be stored for long periods of time without leakage (Holoway [2005;](#page-12-2) IPCC [2007](#page-12-0)).

Even if $CO₂$ is sequestered in the porous rock layers with an impermeable caprock, potential risks of $CO₂$ leakage continue to exist. The injected $CO₂$ can leak through various pathways in the form of supercritical $CO₂$ or dissolved $CO₂$. $CO₂$ can move upward through the direct pathway around an injection well or to subsurface through the discontinuities (e.g., cracks, joints, and faults) in the caprock (Oldenburg and Lewicki [2006](#page-12-3); Kreft et al. [2007](#page-12-4); Gaus [2010](#page-12-5); Plampin et al. [2014](#page-12-6)).

When $CO₂$ leaks through the caprocks, it dissolves into the groundwater, migrating by advection and diffusion. When the groundwater, supersaturated with $CO₂$, reaches the shallow subsurface, a $CO₂$ gas phase may be formed from the supersaturated groundwater due to a decrease in pressure, which is known as exsolution. The exsolved $CO₂$ gas may migrate upward through pores, fractures, and faults or re-dissolve in surrounding groundwater that is undersaturated with CO_2 . The dissolution of CO_2 in groundwater can

¹ Department of Earth and Environmental Sciences, Korea University, 145 Anam-ro, Seongbuk-gu, Seoul 02841, Republic of Korea

significantly affect the quality of groundwater (Enouy et al. [2011](#page-12-7); Sakaki et al. [2013](#page-12-8); Plampin et al. [2014;](#page-12-6) Porter et al. [2015](#page-12-9)).

Previous studies have suggested two diferent mechanisms for gas migration in the saturated porous medium. The frst was migration of gas bubbles by rising through the connected pore space induced by buoyant. The velocity of the gas migration was signifcantly afected by compressibility of gas (Roosevelt and Corapcioglu [1998](#page-12-10); Corapcioglu et al. [2004;](#page-12-11) Oldenburg and Lewicki [2006;](#page-12-3) Cihan and Corapcioglu [2008](#page-12-12)). The second was migration of gas bubble trapped in the pore structure induced by the high capillary pressure of small pore throats. When the gas flled the entire pore, the pore was pressurized. The gas bubble then percolated the adjacent pore and became a gas (Li and Yortos [1995](#page-12-13); Dominguez et al. [2000\)](#page-12-14).

The evolution and migration of $CO₂$ gas in porous media were investigated by conducting experiments and modeling studies in the shallow subsurface (Ji et al. [1993;](#page-12-15) Brooks et al. [1999](#page-12-16); Enouy et al. [2011;](#page-12-7) Amonette et al. [2013;](#page-12-17) Zhou et al. [2013](#page-13-0); Sakaki et al. [2013](#page-12-8); Plampin et al. [2014;](#page-12-6) Porter et al. [2015](#page-12-9)). For example, Ji et al. [\(1993](#page-12-15)) conducted the frst visualization experiments using glass beads. They described gas flow pattern as a function of grain size. Brooks et al. ([1999\)](#page-12-16) also investigated gas fow pattern using glass beads ranged between 0.42 and 3 mm. They showed coherent gas flow occurred for small grain size, whereas incoherent gas fow occurred for large grain size. Sakaki et al. [\(2013](#page-12-8)) conducted experiments using 4.5-m-long columns flled with diferent sizes of sands. CO_2 -saturated water was injected into the bottom of the columns, while monitoring the water saturation, electrical conductivity (EC), and temperature. They indirectly showed the formation of gas phase in the columns, regardless of the size of sands, by providing water saturation data. The gas formation was affected by the $CO₂$ saturation pressure in the injected water and the hydrostatic pressure. The gas formation was enhanced when the $CO₂$ saturation pressure was higher than the hydrostatic pressure.

Most studies regarding $CO₂$ migration in the reservoir focused on the characterization and visualization of densitydriven, subsurface $CO₂$ migration due to buoyancy (Kneafsey and Pruess [2009;](#page-12-18) Polak et al. [2011;](#page-12-19) Bang et al. [2012](#page-12-20); Faisal et al. [2013;](#page-12-21) Mojtaba et al. [2014;](#page-12-22) Thomas et al. [2015](#page-12-23)). The main purpose of the studies was to characterize convective $CO₂$ migration in subsurface areas, where supercritical or gaseous $CO₂$ was dissolved in saline water. However, few studies have showed visually, the behaviors of the leaked $CO₂$ gas (i.e., $CO₂$ gas migration and re-dissolution) in shallow aquifers, consisting of porous media (Bang et al. [2012](#page-12-20)). Bang et al. ([2012](#page-12-20)) investigated the visually leaked $CO₂$ migration in porous media using a thin, transparent tank, flled with water-saturated glass beads, containing a universal pH indicator, which changed color with the change in pH of water. The $CO₂$ gas was injected through a needle in the bottom of the tank. The gas and the dissolved $CO₂$ migration patterns were monitored using digital cameras during testing. They visually showed the patterns of $CO₂$ gas migration and the convection of carbonated water in the glass beads, which were affected by the size of the glass beads.

The objectives of this study were to observe directly the patterns of $CO₂$ gas migration, re-dissolution, and dissolved $CO₂$ migration in the water-saturated porous medium, while investigating the efects of the size of the porous medium and $CO₂$ injection rate on the migration patterns and effluent $CO₂$ gas concentration from the porous medium. This study assumed that the $CO₂$ leaked from the reservoir reaches the shallow aquifer, causing $CO₂$ gas formation due to a decrease in pressure.

Materials and methods

Materials

Two sizes of fner and coarser glass beads (DAIHAN Scientifc) were used to investigate the efect of pore size on the gaseous and dissolved $CO₂$ migration in the porous medium. Sieve analyses, conducted on the glass beads using ASTM D 422-63 ([2007\)](#page-12-24), show that the sizes of finer and coarser glass beads ranged from 0.25 to 0.5 mm and from 0.75 to 1.0 mm, as shown in Fig. [1](#page-2-0)a. The soil–water characteristic curves (SWCC) for the glass beads were determined using a hanging column test, followed by ASTM D 6836-16 ([2016\)](#page-12-25) as shown in Fig. [1b](#page-2-0). The SWCC describes the relationship between volumetric water content and suction. The fner glass beads had a higher air entry suction than the coarser glass beads due to their smaller pore size, indicating that the fner glass beads (1.4 kPa) had a higher capillary pressure than coarser glass beads (0.6 kPa).

The physical properties of glass beads are shown in Table [1](#page-2-1). The porosities of fner and coarser glass beads were 0.40 and 0.38, respectively, with packing densities of 1.50 and 1.59 $g/cm³$, respectively. The hydraulic conductivities of finer and coarser glass beads were 1.7×10^{-2} and 5.8×10^{-2} cm/s, respectively, which were measured by the constant head method.

De-ionized (DI) water ($pH = 5.6$) was used to saturate the glass beads. Concentrated NaOH solution was added to the DI water for adjusting the pH to approximately 10. A universal pH indicator was used to visualize the change in pH due to $CO₂$ dissolution and the migration of carbonated water in porous media. The universal pH indicator is a mixture of several chemical compounds that cause smooth color changes to occur as the pH of the solution changes from 1 to 14. A universal pH indicator is typically composed of water, propan-1-ol, phenolphthalein sodium salt, sodium

Fig. 1 Grain size distribution curves (**a**) and soil–water characteristics curves (SWCC), (**b**) for fner and coarser glass beads

Table 1 Physical properties of glass beads used in this study

Glass bead size (mm)	Physical properties		
	Porosity	Packing den- sity (g/cm^3)	Hydraulic conductivity (cm/s)
$0.25 - 0.5$ (finer)	0.40	1.50	1.7×10^{-2}
$0.75 - 1.0$ (coarser)	0.38	1.59	5.8×10^{-2}

hydroxide, methyl red, bromothymol blue monosodium salt, and thymol blue monosodium salt. Yellow to red, red to green, and green to blue or purple indicate that the solution is acidic, neutral, and alkaline, respectively (Foster and Gruntfest [1937\)](#page-12-26).

Visualization experiments for CO₂ gas and dissolved **CO₂** migration

A series of visualization experiments were conducted to investigate the efect of the grain size of porous medium and the $CO₂$ gas leakage rate on the gaseous and dissolved $CO₂$ migration in the water-saturated porous medium. A schematic diagram of the experiment is shown in Fig. [2.](#page-3-0) A rectangular transparent acrylic cell (width \times height \times thick $ness = 25$ cm \times 25 cm \times 5 cm) was filled with glass beads, up to a height of 20 cm in the cell to allow constant head space. The head space (25 cm \times 5 cm \times 5 cm) was filled with air. The glass beads in the cell were subsequently saturated with a mixture of an alkaline solution ($pH=10$) and a universal pH indicator. After adding the universal pH indicator to the alkaline solution, the color of the solution turned purple, indicating a pH of 10. The alkaline solution for saturating the glass beads was used to clearly observe the migration of dissolved CO_2 because the dissolution of CO_2 in the solution caused changes to the pH.

Approximately 99.99% purity of $CO₂$ gas was injected at 3 cm from the bottom of the cell to simulate $CO₂$ gas exsolution in shallow aquifer, using Teflon tubing, which has low $CO₂$ sorption capacity. $CO₂$ was injected at various injection rates $(20, 40, 100, \text{ and } 200 \text{ cm}^3/\text{min})$ to evaluate the effect of gas leakage rate on the $CO₂$ gas and dissolved $CO₂$ migration in the porous medium. When supercritical $CO₂$ or CO_2 -saturated groundwater leaks through discontinuities in the confined layer, the $CO₂$ gas leakage rate can vary, depending on the pressure decrease rate (Sakaki et al. [2013](#page-12-8)). The $CO₂$ injection rate was controlled by a gas mass controller (Alicat Scientific, Inc.). The $CO₂$ gas and dissolved $CO₂$ migration were flmed using a digital camera (Cam Shots) during the experiment. The empty headspace of the captured images was removed to show more closely the phenomena occurred in the porous media.

The reactor had a sealing cap at the top to prevent $CO₂$ gas leakage. However, the sealing cap had a small hole, which was connected to an infrared (IR)-based $CO₂$ analyzer (LI-820 IR CO₂ analyzer), to measure effluent $CO₂$ gas concentration emitted from the saturated glass beads. The effluent $CO₂$ gas concentration was logged automatically by a computer at every second. The effluent $CO₂$ gas was diluted 10 times using 99.9% purity of N_2 gas for lowering the effluent $CO₂$ gas concentration, to satisfy the maximum $CO₂$ detection limit of the analyzer. The effluent $CO₂$ gas

Fig. 2 Schematic diagram of a visualization experiment setup

was dehydrated by using a column containing silica gel to minimize errors in the measurement (Fig. [2](#page-3-0)).

Results and discussion

Visualization of CO₂ gas and dissolved CO₂ migration

At the beginning of the CO₂ gas injection: CO₂ gas **movement**

At the beginning of the $CO₂$ gas injection ($t < 1$ s), the movement of gas bubbles through the glass beads was observed, regardless of the grain size and $CO₂$ injection rate $(20-200 \text{ cm}^3/\text{min})$. However, no color change was observed in the pore water, indicating that the $CO₂$ dissolution did not occur immediately after $CO₂$ gas injection (Fig. [3\)](#page-4-0). For the coarse glass beads (0.75–1 mm), as the $CO₂$ injection rate increased, the plume of $CO₂$ gas bubbles was more clearly observed, with the lateral extent of the plume becoming larger (Fig. [3\)](#page-4-0). On the other hand, the movement of gas bubbles could not be observed clearly for the fner glass beads, when the CO_2 gas injection rate was low (20–40 cm³/min). The movement of gas bubbles can be initiated when the injection pressure is higher than the air entry pressure (i.e.,

hydrostatic and capillary pressures) induced by the saturated porous beads (Geistlinger et al. [2006](#page-12-27)).

When $CO₂$ gas was injected into the glass beads at a higher injection pressure than the air entry pressure, $CO₂$ gas moved upward due to buoyancy and pressure gradient, percolating into various pathways. $CO₂$ gas displaced the water in the pores of the glass beads, producing irregular continuous gas pathways, like trees. The tree-like pattern induced by air injection to saturated medium is called "channelized fow," in which the air displaces water along continuous pathways of least resistance. Various factors, such as grain size, packing density, and injection rate, can afect the channelized fow pattern (Ji et al. [1993;](#page-12-15) Brooks et al. [1999](#page-12-16)). Brooks et al ([1999](#page-12-16)) suggested that the channelized fow occurred when the grain size and injection rate were less than 1.5 mm and higher than $10 \text{ cm}^3/\text{min}$, respectively. In this study, the channelized fow pattern was more clearly observed in the glass beads with larger grain size $(0.75-1.0$ mm).

During the CO₂ gas injection: CO₂ gas and dissolved CO₂ **migration**

The representative images of temporal changes in the $CO₂$ gas and dissolved $CO₂$ (i.e., carbonated water) migration for the finer glass beads (0.25–0.5 mm) at various $CO₂$ gas injection rates from 20 to 200 cm³ /min are shown in Fig. [4.](#page-5-0) Immediately after CO_2 gas injection ($t > 1$ s), CO_2 gas

Fig. 3 Captured images of CO₂ gas migration in finer (0.25–0.5 mm, **a**, **b**) and coarser (0.75–1 mm, **c–f**) glass beads, from the visualization experiments at various CO_2 injection rates at the beginning of CO_2 injection ($t < 1$ s)

bubbles continued to move upward to the top surface, with the color of pore water near the pathways of $CO₂$ gas bubbles changing from blue to yellow, regardless of the injection rate, suggesting that $CO₂$ dissolution began in pore water near the $CO₂$ gas migration pathways.

Figure [5](#page-6-0) shows the enlarged images of areas near the surface of the cell during $CO₂$ injection for the finer glass beads $(0.25-0.5 \text{ mm})$. CO₂ bubble movement in the glass beads was continuously observed during the $CO₂$ gas injection. $CO₂$ bubbles coalesced to form clusters, moving through the glass beads as clusters. Once the clusters reached the

top surface of the glass beads (i.e., the interface between water-saturated glass beads and air), the glass beads on the top surface explode due to the expulsion of $CO₂$ gas by displacing water. At the lowest $CO₂$ gas injection rate of 20 cm³/min, weak explosion was observed, probably because the amount of injected $CO₂$ was not sufficient to form gas clusters, causing the continuous channelized $CO₂$ gas fow or/and the injection pressure to be lower than the overburden pressure (Fig. [5\)](#page-6-0). On the other hand, at a high injection rate, ranging between 40 and 200 cm³/min, larger $CO₂$ clusters were formed, causing the glass beads on the

Fig. 4 Captured images from the visualization experiments using finer glass beads $(0.25-0.5 \text{ mm})$ at various CO_2 injection rates during CO_2 injection $(t>1 s)$

surface to swell, subsequently explosion. The expansion and explosion of clusters occurred rapidly as the $CO₂$ gas injection rate increased (Fig. [4\)](#page-5-0). The top surface of the glass beads explodes because the upward pressure of $CO₂$ bubbles exceeded the overburden pressure due to buoyancy and advection.

The color of the pore water changed from blue to yellow, indicating CO_2 dissolution during CO_2 injection (Fig. [5](#page-6-0)), regardless of the $CO₂$ injection rate. The color of pore water in the glass beads changed with the pH of the pore water because the pore water contained the universal pH indicator (Fig. [5](#page-6-0)). The initial pH of the pore water in the glass beads was 10, causing the color of the pore water to be blue. When $CO₂$ was injected into the glass beads, the color of the pore water turned from blue to yellow, as the pore water changed from alkaline to acidic. The color change suggests that $CO₂$ dissolution occurred in the pore water, causing a decrease in the pH of the pore water, while producing carbonated water. The darker yellow of the pore water indicates that more $CO₂$ dissolved in the pore water.

For the CO₂ injection rate of 20 cm³/min, at time = 1 h, carbonated water (yellow) was produced on the top surface by $CO₂$ dissolution, laterally extending by advection and difusion, forming a thin, dense layer on the interface between the saturated glass beads and air. The yellow layer was darker near the injection tube, indicating more $CO₂$ dissolution. After the formation of the thin, dense yellow layer, small fngers were formed, suggesting the initiation of density-driven convection. The small fngers then gradually coalesced, forming a thick, dense yellow layer (Fig. [4](#page-5-0)).

As the CO₂ injection rate increased from 40 to 200 cm³/ min, the color change occurred more clearly near the

Fig. 5 Enlarged images showing CO_2 gas clusters obtained from the visualization experiments using finer glass beads (0.25–0.5 mm) at various CO₂ injection rates during CO₂ injection ($t \ge 1$ h)

injection tube, suggesting that $CO₂$ dissolution occurred near the channelized $CO₂$ gas flow pathways (i.e., plume of $CO₂$ gas and dissolved $CO₂$; Fig. [4\)](#page-5-0). The plume extent of the dissolved $CO₂$, which had an inverted triangle shape, increased with the increase in $CO₂$ gas injection rate. The dense layer formed near the interface thickened with time due to the density-driven convection of carbonated water. The downward migration of carbonated water was faster with the increase in $CO₂$ gas injection rate. The downward migration along the side wall was probably faster because the pore size along the side wall was larger than that inside the glass beads.

For coarse glass beads (0.75–1.0 mm), no large bubble clusters were observed. However, more continuous channelized $CO₂$ gas flow pathways were observed during $CO₂$ gas injection (Fig. [6](#page-7-0)), potentially because the air entry pressure of the coarser glass beads was smaller than that of the fner glass beads as shown in Fig. [1](#page-2-0)b. Similar to the finer glass beads (0.25–0.5 mm), the $CO₂$ gas moved upward to the top surface by buoyancy and advection, while $CO₂$ dissolution began near the $CO₂$ gas bubble migration pathways. The carbonated water produced by $CO₂$ dissolution on the interface between the glass beads and air was laterally extended due to advection and difusion, forming a single dense layer on the top surface.

The downward migration of the carbonated water due to the density-driven convective fow was divided into three patterns during $CO₂$ injection for the coarser glass beads, probably due to their higher hydraulic conductivity: (1) downward migration along the side wall, (2) downward migration of the dense layer, and (3) direct downward migration from the $CO₂$ injection point to the bottom of the cell, causing a triangular-shaped accumulation. The triangular-shaped accumulation was not clearly observed in the experiment with the high CO_2 injection rate of 200 cm³/min. The boundary layer at the interface between carbonated water and pre-existing water became unstable, producing small fngers, which were induced by density-driven convective flow. The denser fingers produced a plume by coalescing small fngers, with the plume moving downward. During the downward movement of the plume, lateral concentration diference occurred with the plumes descending into the surrounding water. Therefore, the density of the descending plumes was reduced, along with the concentration fux, relative to the initial level (Neufeld et al. [2010](#page-12-28)). The formation of fngers by the density-driven convective flow was more clearly observed in the coarser glass

Fig. 6 Captured images from the visualization experiments using coarser glass beads $(0.75-1.0 \text{ mm})$ at various CO₂ injection rates during CO₂ injection $(t>1 s)$

beads, suggesting that the density-driven convective fow was more dominant in them. Finally, the glass beads were fully saturated with carbonated water. The migration of carbonated water was faster as both, the glass bead size and the $CO₂$ gas injection rate, increased, causing earlier $CO₂$ saturation in the pore water.

Packing stability

The growth of the plume of $CO₂$ gas and dissolved $CO₂$ near the injection tube (i.e., fuidized zone or inverted triangularshaped zone) and the explosion on the top surface of the glass beads can be quantitatively evaluated using the packing stability of the unconsolidated porous medium, which can be calculated using the packing stability ratio of V_d to V_c , determined by the following equations (Zhao [2010](#page-13-1)).

$$
V_{\rm d} = \frac{Q}{\pi a \left(H_{\rm b} - H_{\rm or} \right)}\tag{1}
$$

$$
V_{\rm c} = \frac{(\rho_{\rm gb} - \rho_{\rm w})(1 - \Phi)}{\rho_{\rm w}} k_{\rm w}
$$
 (2)

where *Q* is the air injection rate, *a* is the thickness of the saturated glass beads, $H_b - H_{or}$ is the effective height of the saturated porous glass beads. ϕ is the porosity of the saturated porous medium, ρ_{gb} is the packing density of the glass beads, ρ_w , is the density of water, and k_w is the initial rates

hydraulic conductivity of the glass beads. V_d is the dipole velocity related to air flow, and V_c is the critical velocity related to uplift of a patch of grains. If V_c is less than V_d , the grain patch can be uplifted. Because the air fow can cause instability of the matrix, the grain patch can be uplifted and pushed by the air fow. The calculated packing stability ratio, V_d/V_c , is shown in Table [2.](#page-8-0) An increase in the packing stability ratio suggests that the stability of the saturated glass beads for a given test condition (i.e., glass bead size and $CO₂$ gas injection rate) decreases during $CO₂$ gas injection.

The packing stability ratio increased, suggesting that the stability of the saturated glass beads decreased due to the $CO₂$ gas injection, as both, the glass bead size and the $CO₂$ gas injection rate, increased (Table [2\)](#page-8-0). As the packing stability increased, the inverted triangular-shaped zone (i.e., plume of $CO₂$ gas and dissolved $CO₂$) at the top of glass beads appeared more clearly (Figs. [4](#page-5-0) and [6\)](#page-7-0). For the fner glass beads (0.25–0.5 mm), the inverted triangular-shaped zone appeared clearly when the packing stability ratio was higher than approximately 0.5, at a $CO₂$ gas injection rate higher than 40 cm³/min. Above the injection point, an unstable packing zone was formed with the increase in packing instability, leading to an inverted triangular-shaped zone at the top surface of the glass beads.

For example, for the fner glass beads (0.75–1 mm) at CO_2 gas injection rates of 100 and 200 cm³/min, the packing stability ratio was higher than 1, suggesting that the packing instability was too large to hold the grains in the initial position. As a result, a fuidized zone was formed in the glass beads near the injection tube, above the $CO₂$ injection point, with dissolution occurring more actively in the fuidized zone (Fig. [4](#page-5-0)). The formation of the fuidized zone during $CO₂$ gas injection could be clearly observed by the change in color induced by $CO₂$ dissolution. In addition, the explosion at the top surface of the glass beads clearly occurred when the packing ratio was higher than 0.5. For the finer glass beads, this occurred at a $CO₂$ gas injection rate higher than 40 cm^3/min , while for the coarser glass beads, it occurred at a CO_2 injection rate of 200 cm³/min (Figs. [4](#page-5-0)) and [6](#page-7-0)), suggesting that the packing instability caused the explosion.

Effluent CO₂ concentrations

The temporal changes in the normalized effluent $CO₂$ gas concentration, obtained from the experiments using the fner and coarser glass beads, are shown in Figs. [7](#page-9-0) and [8.](#page-10-0) The normalized effluent $CO₂$ gas concentration was the ratio of the effluent CO_2 gas concentration ([CO_2]_e) to the initially injected CO_2 gas concentration ([CO_2]_i).

The gas flow patterns, through a saturated porous medium, are classified as transient and steady drainage phases. When $CO₂$ is injected into a saturated porous medium, $CO₂$ displaces water, becoming trapped in the pore spaces. When the $CO₂$ gas pressure exceeds the overburden pressure, $CO₂$ moves upward along the preferential pathways of least resistance. When the $CO₂$ gas is emitted from the saturated porous medium, with the effluent $CO₂$ gas concentration exceeding the influent $CO₂$ gas concentration, it is called the transient drainage phase. After the transient drainage phase, the $CO₂$ gas flow enters a steady-state phase (Geistlinger et al. [2006\)](#page-12-27).

For the finer glass beads (0.25–0.5 mm), at a CO_2 gas injection rate of 20 cm³/min, the breakthrough of CO_2 gas concentration occurred at an early stage of the experiment $(2-6 h)$, with a significant drop in the effluent $CO₂$ concentration subsequently (Fig. [7](#page-9-0)a). The early initial breakthrough could probably be attributed to the continuous channelized $CO₂$ gas flow, resulting in the $CO₂$ gas reaching the top surface early. CO_2 gas bubbles on the top surface of the glass beads at 20 cm³/min are shown in Fig. [4](#page-5-0)a–d. Subsequently, a significant drop in the effluent $CO₂$ concentration occurred due to gradual $CO₂$ dissolution in the pore water of the glass beads, retarding the $CO₂$ gas emission. At the $CO₂$ gas injection rates of 40 and 100 cm^3/min , lower normalized effluent CO₂ gas concentration occurred at an early stage, compared to that at 20 cm³/min, eventually stabilizing (Fig. [7a](#page-9-0)–c), probably because the $CO₂$ gas bubbles coalesced, forming clusters and retarding the gas bubble migration, causing the $CO₂$ gas to dissolve in the pore water. $CO₂$ gas clusters were observed in the experiments at 40 and 100 cm^3/min . However, they were not observed at $20 \text{ cm}^3/\text{min}$, as shown in Fig. [5.](#page-6-0) On the other hand, at a $CO₂$ gas injection rate of 200 cm³/min, early breakthrough occurred within 1 h, with no subsequent change in the effluent $CO₂$ gas concentra-tion (Fig. [7d](#page-9-0)), which suggests that $CO₂$ gas continuously migrated upward, emitting from the glass beads due to the higher $CO₂$ gas injection rate. While $CO₂$ gas bubbles were observed, no cluster was observed in the $CO₂$ gas pathways in the experiment at $200 \text{ cm}^3/\text{min}$, as shown in Fig. [5](#page-6-0).

For the coarser glass beads (0.75–1.0 mm), earlier and more $CO₂$ gas emission occurred from the saturated glass

Fig. 7 Ratio of the effluent CO_2 concentration ($[CO_2]_e$) to influent CO_2 concentration ($[CO_2]_i$) as a function of the time elapsed, obtained from the visualization experiments using finer glass beads $(0.25-0.5 \text{ mm})$ at various $CO₂$ injection rates

beads than the fner glass beads (0.25–0.5 mm) at a given CO_2 gas injection rate, except for 20 cm³/min (Fig. [8\)](#page-10-0). At a CO_2 injection rate of 20 cm³/min, almost no CO_2 gas was emitted from the saturated glass beads during the $CO₂$ gas injection (Fig. [8a](#page-10-0)), suggesting that the injected $CO₂$ gas was trapped in the pore space, dissolving in the pore water. After approximately 9 h, when the pore water was almost saturated with CO_2 , a very small amount of CO_2 was emitted (Figs. [6](#page-7-0)) and [8](#page-10-0)). In the larger glass beads, the fuidized zone (plume of CO_2 gas and dissolved CO_2) was further extended due to the larger pore space, leading to lower $CO₂$ gas emission. At 40 cm³/min, a fluctuation was observed in the effluent CO_2 gas concentration during $CO₂$ injection, indicating transient $CO₂$ gas flow (Fig. [8](#page-10-0)b). $CO₂$ gas was trapped in the pore, subsequently dissolving in the pore water near $CO₂$ gas migration pathways. When the buoyant pressure exceeded the air entry and overburden pressures, $CO₂$ gas was emitted

from the saturated glass beads, leading to an increase in the effluent CO_2 concentration. These transient CO_2 flow processes were repeated, causing a fluctuation in the effluent CO_2 gas concentration. At the CO_2 injection rate of 200 cm³/ min, almost no transient $CO₂$ flow was observed. However, a steady-state $CO₂$ flow was achieved rapidly (Fig. [8](#page-10-0)d).

The cumulative mass of dissolved $CO₂$ with time at different $CO₂$ injection rates was calculated using the effluent $CO₂$ gas concentration ($[CO_2]_e$) and the initially injected CO_2 gas concentration ($[CO_2]_i$). The cumulative mass of dissolved $CO₂$ with time is shown in Fig. [9](#page-11-0). The highest and lowest cumulative masses of dissolved $CO₂$ were obtained at the $CO₂$ injection rates of 100 and 20 cm³/min, respectively, regardless of the glass bead size. The cumulative mass of dissolved CO_2 increased with increasing the CO_2 injection rate. However, the cumulative mass of dissolved $CO₂$ at 200 cm³/min was lower than those at 40 and 100 cm³/

Fig. 8 Ratio of the effluent CO_2 concentration ($[CO_2]_e$) to influent CO_2 concentration ($[CO_2]_i$) as a function of the elapsed time, obtained from the visualization experiments using coarser glass beads $(0.5-1.0 \text{ mm})$ at various CO₂ injection rates

min. The results of the cumulative mass of dissolved $CO₂$ were comparable to those of the normalized effluent $CO₂$ gas concentration (Figs. [7](#page-9-0), [8,](#page-10-0) [9](#page-11-0)). At the low CO_2 injection rate, the incoherent flow occurs due to buoyance, causing lower $CO₂$ dissolution. As the $CO₂$ injection rate increases, the incoherent fow becomes gradually the coherent fow, causing an increase in the $CO₂$ dissolution. However, when the CO_2 injection rate exceeds the critical CO_2 injection rate, the multiple channels coalesce into single channel (Geistlinger et al. [2006](#page-12-27)), probably causing a decrease in the $CO₂$ dissolution.

Implication

The injected $CO₂$ can leak through caprock, subsequently dissolving in the surrounding groundwater, producing

 CO_2 -saturated groundwater. The CO_2 -saturated groundwater can move upward through discontinuities such as fractures and faults, which can produce signifcant changes in pressure. A signifcant pressure drop causes the exsolution of $CO₂$ gas from the $CO₂$ -saturated groundwater. The $CO₂$ exsolution rate from the leaking point can vary with the pressure drop in the CO_2 -saturated groundwater. Higher pressure drop can lead to a higher $CO₂$ exsolution rate. In this study, the $CO₂$ exsolution rate was simulated with the $CO₂$ injection rate.

The exsolved $CO₂$ gas moves upward due to buoyancy and pressure gradient in the shallow aquifer containing the porous media. After the early stage of $CO₂$ gas leak from the exsolution point, the $CO₂$ gas bubbles initially percolate into the porous media through various pathways, subsequently leading to $CO₂$ dissolution near the $CO₂$ gas pathways. The

Fig. 9 Cumulative mass of dissolved $CO₂$ as a function of the elapsed time, obtained from the visualization experiments using fner (0.25– 0.5 mm) and coarser $(0.5-1.0 \text{ mm})$ glass beads at various $CO₂$ injection rates

lateral extent of the plume (i.e., $CO₂$ gas bubbles and dissolved $CO₂$) increases due to advection and diffusion, with the increase in the porous medium size and $CO₂$ exsolution rate. For the finer porous medium at a high $CO₂$ exsolution rate, $CO₂$ gas bubbles can coalesce to form gas clusters, while continuous channelized flow, without cluster formation, occurs in the coarser porous medium, regardless of the $CO₂$ exsolution rate (Fig. [3\)](#page-4-0).

Once the plume (i.e., $CO₂$ gas bubbles and dissolved $CO₂$) reaches the interface between the saturated porous medium and air or the unsaturated porous medium, the plume extends laterally on the surface, producing a thin, dense CO_2 -saturated layer. Simultaneously, CO_2 gas is emitted from the saturated porous medium, leading to an increase in $CO₂$ gas concentration in the atmosphere. The grain size of the porous medium present in the shallow aquifer and the $CO₂$ exsolution rate affects the degree and pattern of the $CO₂$ gas emission. For example, for the coarser porous medium at a higher $CO₂$ exsolution rate, earlier and greater $CO₂$ gas emission can occur. In addition, continuous and periodic $CO₂$ gas emission can occur, depending on the grain size of the porous medium and the $CO₂$ exsolution rate (Figs. [7](#page-9-0) and [8\)](#page-10-0).

Conclusions

Visualization experiments using a rectangular transparent acrylic cell, which contained glass beads saturated with an alkaline solution having a universal pH indicator, were conducted to investigate the migration behavior of $CO₂$ gas and dissolved $CO₂$ in water-saturated porous media. The experiments indicated that the injected $CO₂$ leaked through the caprock, with the $CO₂$ -saturated groundwater moving upward through the discontinuities, causing the exsolution of $CO₂$ gas from the $CO₂$ -saturated groundwater. The $CO₂$ gas and the dissolved $CO₂$, after exsolution from the $CO₂$ -saturated groundwater, can migrate through the porous media in shallow aquifers.

Immediately after the $CO₂$ gas injection ($t < 1$ s), which is comparable to the period immediately following the $CO₂$ exsolution, $CO₂$ gas moved upward due to buoyancy and pressure gradient, percolating into pores through various pathways. The $CO₂$ gas displaced the water in the pores of the glass beads, producing irregular continuous gas pathways, known as channelized flow. The continuous channelized flow was more dominant in coarser glass beads $(0.75-1.0 \text{ mm})$, while transient channelized flow (i.e., gas clusters migration) occurred in the fner glass beads (0.25–0.50 mm).

During CO_2 gas injection ($t > 1$ s), CO_2 gas bubbles continued to move upward to the interface between the saturated porous medium and air, with the color of pore water near the pathways of $CO₂$ gas bubbles changing from blue (i.e., alkaline) to yellow (i.e., acidic), regardless of the grain size and the $CO₂$ gas injection rate, suggesting $CO₂$ dissolution in pore water near the $CO₂$ gas migration pathways. Once the $CO₂$ gas reached the interface, a thin, dense yellow layer $(i.e., CO₂$ dissolved water) was formed, laterally extending by advection and difusion. After the formation of the thin, dense yellow layer, small fngers occurred, which subsequently gradually coalesced, thickening the dense yellow layer, indicating density-driven convection. The fngers due to density-driven convective fow occurred more clearly in the coarser glass beads. The migration of carbonated water was faster as both, the glass bead size and the $CO₂$ gas injection rate, increased, causing earlier $CO₂$ saturation in pore water.

The temporal changes in the effluent $CO₂$ gas concentration emitted from the saturated glass beads to air varied with the grain size of the porous medium and the $CO₂$ gas injection rate. For the coarser glass beads, earlier and higher $CO₂$ gas emission generally occurred at a given $CO₂$ gas injection rate. As the $CO₂$ injection rate increased, the effluent $CO₂$ gas concentration was more stable.

The results of this study suggest that the extent and pattern of $CO₂$ gas emission from the ground surface can be implicitly predicted using information such as porous media properties and $CO₂$ exsolution rate and vice versa. However, the fndings in this study are probably only applicable to specifc conditions, without representing real feld conditions, because the experiments in this study were conducted under specifc and limited conditions, which might not represent real feld conditions. Further study under various conditions (e.g., various grain sizes and $CO₂$ injection rates, heterogeneity of porous media) needs to be conducted to understand the patterns of $CO₂$ gas and dissolved $CO₂$ migration in porous media and $CO₂$ gas concentration in the boundary between the ground and atmosphere.

Acknowledgements This research was supported by the Korea Ministry of Environment (MOE) under the "K-COSEM Research Program" and the National Research Foundation (NRF-2017R1A2B4008238) of the Ministry of Science, ICT and Future Panning, Korea.

References

- Amonette JE, Barr JL, Erikson RL, Dobeck LM, Barr JL, Shaw JA (2013) Measurement of advective soil gas fux: results of feld and laboratory experiments with CO₂. Environ Ear Sci 70(4):1717-1726
- ASTM D 422–63 (2007) Standard test method for particle-size analysis of soils. ASTM International, West Conshohocken, PA
- ASTM D 6836–16 (2016) Standard test method for determination of the soil water characteristic curve for desorption using hanging column, pressure extractor, chilled mirror hygrometer, or centrifuge. ASTM International, West Conshohocken, PA
- Bang ES, Son JS, Santamarina JC (2012) Subsurface $CO₂$ leakage: labscale study of salient characteristics and assessment of boreholebased detection using resistivity tomography. In: 4th International Conference on Geotechnical and Geophysical Site Characterization $(ISC'4)$
- Brooks MC, Wise WR, Annable MD (1999) Fundamental changes in in situ air sparging fow patterns. Ground Water Monit Remediat 19(2):105–113
- Cihan A, Corapcioglu MY (2008) The efect of compressibility on the rise velocity of an air bubble in porous media. Water Resour Res 44(W04409):1–8
- Corapcioglu MY, Cihan A, Drazenovic M (2004) Rise velocity of an air bubble in porous media: theoretical studies. Water Resour Res 40(W04214):1–9
- Dominguez A, Bories S, Prat M (2000) Gas cluster growth by solute difusion in porous media. Experiments and automaton simulation on pore network. Int J Multiph Flow 26:1951–1979
- Enouy R, Li M, Ioannidis MA, Unger AJA (2011) Gas exsolution and fow supersaturated water injection in porous media: II. Column experiments and continuum modeling. Adv Water Resour 34:15–25
- Faisal TF, Chevalier S, Sassi M (2013) Experimental and numerical studies of density driven natural convection in saturated porous media with application to CO₂ geological storage. Energy Proced 37:5323–5330
- Foster LS, Gruntfest IJ (1937) Demonstration experiments using universal indicators. J Chem Educ 14(6):274
- Gaus I (2010) Role and impact of CO_2 -rock interactions during CO_2 storage in sedimentary rocks. Int J Greenh Gas Con 4:73–89
- Geistilinger H, Krauss G, Lazik D, Luckner L (2006) Direct gas injection into saturated glass beads: transition from incoherent to coherent gas flow pattern. Water Resour Res 42:W07403
- Holloway S (2005) Underground sequestration of carbon dioxide—a viable green-house gas mitigation option. Energy 30:2318–2333
- IEA/OECD (2008) CO₂ capture and storage—a key carbon abatement option. Organisation for Economic Co-operation and Development & International Energy Agency, Paris, p 266
- IPCC (2007) Climate change 2007: Synthesis report. In: Pachauri RK, Reisinger A (eds) IPCC, Geneva, p 104
- Ji W, Dahmani A, Ahlfeld DP, Lin JD, Hill IE (1993) Laboratory study of air sparging: air fow visualization. Ground Water Monit Remediat 13(4):115–116
- Kneafsey TJ, Pruess K (2009) Laboratory flow experiments for visualizing carbon dioxide-induced, density-driven brine convection. Transp Porous Media 82(1):123–139
- Kreft E, Bernstone C, Meyer R, May F, Arts R, Obdam A, Svensson R, Eriksson S, Durst P, Gaus I, Meer B, Geel C (2007) ''The Schweinrich structure'', a potential site for industrial scale $CO₂$ storage and a test case for safety assessment in Germany. Int J Greenh Gas Con 1:69–74
- Li X, Yortsos YC (1995) Theory of multiple bubble growth in porous media by solute difusion. Chem Eng Sci 50(8):1247–1271
- Mojtaba S, Behzad R, Rasoul NM, Mohammad R (2014) Experimental study of density-driven convection effects on $CO₂$ dissolution rate in formation water for geological storage. J Nat Gas Sci Eng 21:600–607
- Neufeld JA, Hesse MA, Riaz A, Hallworth MA, Tchelepi HA, Huppert HE (2010) Convective dissolution of carbon dioxide in saline aquifers. Geophys Res Lett 37:L22404
- Oldenburg CM, Lewicki JL (2006) On leakage and seepage of $CO₂$ from geologic storage sites into surface water. Environ Geol 50(5):691–705
- Plampin M, Illangasekare T, Sakaki T, Pawar R (2014) Experimental study of gas evolution in heterogeneous shallow subsurface formations during leakage of stored CO₂. Int J Greenh Gas Control 22:47–62
- Polak S, Cinar Y, Holt T, Torsæter O (2011) An experimental investigation of the balance between capillary, viscous, and gravitational forces during $CO₂$ injection into saline aquifers. Energy Proced 4:4395–4402
- Porter ML, Plampin M, Pawar R, Illangasekare T (2015) CO₂ leakage in shallow aquifers: a benchmark modeling study of $CO₂$ gas evolution in heterogeneous porous media. Int J Greenh Gas Control 39:51–61
- Roosevelt SE, Corapcioglu MY (1998) Air bubble migration in a granular porous medium: experimental studies. Water Resour Res 34(5):1131–1142
- Sakaki T, Plampin M, Rawar R, Komatsu M, Illangasekare T (2013) What controls carbon dioxide gas phase evolution in the subsurface? Experimental observations in a 4.5 m-long column under diferent heterogeneity conditions. Int J Greenh Gas Control 17:66-77
- Thomas C, Lemaigre L, Zalts A, D'Onofrio A, Wit AD (2015) Experimental study of $CO₂$ convective dissolution: the effect of color indicators. Int J Greenh Gas Control 42:525–533
- Zhao K (2010) Experimental investigation of air injection in saturated unconsolidated porous media. University of Science and Technology of China, Guangdong
- Zhou X, Apple ME, Dobeck LM, Cunningham AB, Spangler LH (2013) Observed response of soil O_2 concentration to leaked CO_2 from an engineered CO2 leakage experiment. Int J Greenh Gas Control 16:116–128