ORIGINAL PAPER



# Aquatic resources in human diet in the Late Mesolithic in Northern France and Luxembourg: insights from carbon, nitrogen and sulphur isotope ratios

Dorothée G. Drucker<sup>1</sup> · Frédérique Valentin<sup>2</sup> · Corinne Thevenet<sup>3</sup> · Daniel Mordant<sup>4</sup> · Richard Cottiaux<sup>5</sup> · Dominique Delsate<sup>6</sup> · Wim Van Neer<sup>7,8</sup>

Received: 16 March 2016 / Accepted: 20 June 2016 / Published online: 9 July 2016 © Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg 2016

Abstract We investigated the contribution of freshwater resources to the diet of seven Late Mesolithic hunter-gatherers (ca. 5300–7000 BC) from Northern France and Luxembourg using stable isotope ratios. In addition to the carbon and nitrogen stable isotope ratios ( $\delta^{13}$ C,  $\delta^{15}$ N), we explored the potential of the sulphur isotopic ratios ( $\delta^{34}$ S) to detect and quantify the proportion of protein derived from aquatic foodstuff. In only two sites, animal remains from an associated settlement were available and subsequently examined to decipher the isotopic differential between terrestrial and freshwater resources. The quantification of their relative contribution was simulated using a Bayesian mixing model. The measurements revealed a significant overlap in  $\delta^{13}$ C values between freshwater and terrestrial resources and a large range of  $\delta^{15}$ N values for each food category. The  $\delta^{34}$ S values of the aquatic and

Dorothée G. Drucker dorothee.drucker@ifu.uni-tuebingen.de

- <sup>1</sup> Department of Geosciences, Biogeology, Eberhardt Karls Universität Tübingen, Hölderlinstrasse 12, 72074 Tübingen, Germany
- <sup>2</sup> CNRS, UMR 7041, Maison de l'Archéologie et de l'Ethnologie, 21 allée de l'Université, 92023 Nanterre cedex, France
- <sup>3</sup> UMR 8215, Maison de l'Archéologie et de l'Ethnologie, 21 allée de l'Université, 92023 Nanterre cedex, France
- <sup>4</sup> 11 rue des noisetiers, 77590 Bois-le-Roi, France
- <sup>5</sup> INRAP, UMR 8215, Maison de l'Archéologie et de l'Ethnologie, 21 allée de l'Université, 92023 Nanterre cedex, France
- <sup>6</sup> Luxembourg Natural History Museum, Paleontology, 25, rue Münster, 2160 Luxembourg, Luxembourg
- <sup>7</sup> Royal Belgian Institute of Natural Sciences, Vautierstraat 29, 1000 Brussels, Belgium
- <sup>8</sup> Laboratory of Biodiversity and Evolutionary Genomics, University of Leuven, Ch. Debériotstraat 32, 3000 Leuven, Belgium

terrestrial animals were clearly distinct at the settlement in the Seine valley, while the results on fish from Belgium demonstrated a possible overlap in  $\delta^{34}$ S values between freshwater and terrestrial resources. Local freshwater ecosystem likely contributed to ca. 30–40 % of the protein in the diet of the individuals found in the Seine settlement. Out of this context, the isotopic signature and thus contribution of the available aquatic foods was difficult to assess. Another potential source of dietary protein is wild boar. Depending on the local context, collagen  $\delta^{34}$ S values may contribute to better assessment of the relative contribution of freshwater and terrestrial resources.

**Keywords** Mesolithic · Stable isotopes · Freshwater · Northern France · Luxembourg

# Introduction

For the last few decades, the application of stable isotope ratio analyses on Late Mesolithic hunter-gatherers in Europe has mainly been considered in the context of the transition to the first farming communities of the Neolithic and their relative use of aquatic resources in this important transitional period (e.g. Lubell et al. 1994; Richards and Mellars 1998; Lillie and Richards 2000; Richards et al. 2003a, c; Bonsall et al. 2004; Bocherens et al. 2007; Fischer et al. 2007; Smits and van der Plicht 2009; Lightfoot et al. 2011; Schulting and Richards 2001; Guiry et al. 2015). Most of the studies quoted above were conducted on sites from coastal environments where the consumption of marine resources was investigated. To date, research on the use of freshwater resources by Mesolithic groups in a continental context has been restricted to relatively few specific geographical areas such as the Danube Gorges (e.g. Bonsall et al. 2004; Borić et al. 2004; Nehlich et al. 2010), the Dnieper Basin (Lillie et al. 2011), the Meuse Basin (Bocherens et al. 2007) and western Germany (Bollongino et al. 2013).

An increasing number of Late Mesolithic burials have recently been added to the archaeological record of continental Northwestern Europe, notably in Northern France (e.g. Valentin et al. 2008; Meiklejohn et al. 2010; Bosset and Valentin 2013). It contrasts with the poorly represented Late Mesolithic archaeological contexts of Belgium and the yet sole example of Loschbour in Luxembourg (review in Meiklejohn et al. 2014). A large number of the Northern France burials are associated with very few, if any, artefacts and are not associated to settlement context. Based on faunal remains found in Northern France and Luxembourg, animal food resources appear to include the wild boar (Sus scrofa), red deer (Cervus elaphus), roe deer (Capreolus capreolus) and aurochs (Bos primigenius) (e.g. Cordy 1982; Bridault 1997; Ducrocq et al. 2008; Leduc et al. 2013; Marinval-Vigne et al. 1989). Evidence for fishing is limited until 8200 <sup>14</sup>C BP and confidently attested at only two sites: Noven-sur-Seine and La Chaussée-Tirancourt in Northern France (Marinval-Vigne et al. 1989; Ducrocq and Ketterer 1995).

### Stable isotope ratios and paleodiet

Carbon and nitrogen isotope abundances in bone collagen have proved to be useful tracers of the source of protein, namely terrestrial versus aquatic, in the diet of ancient hunter-gatherers in continental context (e.g. Richards et al. 2001; Bocherens et al. 2007; Drucker et al. 2016). For predators, the collagen  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{15}$ N values depend on those of their food with a factor of enrichment, which is limited in <sup>13</sup>C but significant in  $^{15}$ N (0.8 to 1.3 % compared with 3 to 5 % in the latter; e.g. Bocherens and Drucker 2003). For a comparable trophic position, specimens from aquatic ecosystems deliver higher <sup>15</sup>N abundances than specimens from terrestrial context (e.g. Schoeninger and DeNiro 1984; Dufour et al. 1999), a difference that is reflected in their consumers. However, the respective ranges of  $\delta^{15}$ N values of terrestrial and freshwater resources also depend on environmental factors such as temperature and aridity that may differ significantly geographically and temporally (e.g. Drucker et al. 2003; Bocherens et al. 2014). This can result in a large range of isotopic variation and thus overlapping isotopic values between potential prey species (e.g. Dufour et al. 1999; Katzenberg et al. 2010).

The <sup>34</sup>S abundances in collagen have increasingly been investigated on archaeological remains to track aquatic resources consumption (review in Nehlich 2015). Primary producers are characterized by  $\delta^{34}$ S values around +20 % in oceanic contexts, whereas, in continental ecosystems, they exhibit lower  $\delta^{34}$ S values except in areas close to coastlines due to the sea spray effect (e.g. Peterson and Fry 1987). The  $\delta^{34}$ S values of plants are passed on along the food chain with minor fractionation from ca. -1 to +1.5 % (Richards et al. 2003b; Barnes and Jennings 2007; Tanz and Schmidt 2010) if not negligible (McCutchan et al. 2003; Arneson and MacAvoy 2005). Depleted  $\delta^{34}$ S values are observed as the result of the reduction of sulphate  $(SO_4^{2^-})$  to hydrogen sulphide  $(H_2S)$  and subsequent reoxidation by bacteria, which are notably present in rivers and aquatic sediments (Fry et al. 1986; Holmer and Storkholm 2001). Hence, a distinction in the abundance of <sup>34</sup>S is expected between terrestrial and freshwater ecosystems and has indeed already been explored in ancient contexts (Privat et al. 2007; Nehlich et al. 2010, 2011; Bocherens et al. 2011). Although a clear distinction in the collagen  $\delta^{34}$ S values was found in most cases between terrestrial and freshwater faunal remains, the observed ranges of values were variable from one case study to the other due to local differences in geology, atmospheric deposition and conditions of sulphur cycling. The pattern of distinction in <sup>34</sup>S abundances between terrestrial and freshwater resources is thus unpredictable, and systematic analyses of the local faunal remains are required to establish it.

In this paper, we aim to reconstruct the contribution of freshwater resources to the diet of Late Mesolithic humans from Northern France and Luxembourg (ca. 6300-8000  $^{14}C$  BP, ca. 5300-7000 BC) using  $^{13}C$  and  $^{15}N$  abundances of their bone collagen. For this purpose, we established the isotopic baseline using as many animal remains as possible from the same region and time span to decipher the specific stable isotope pattern of the associated ecosystems. We considered, in addition, the abundances in  $^{34}S$  in order to explore further quantitative estimation of the different sources of protein, in particular between freshwater and terrestrial and possibly fine-tune the reconstruction of subsistence at an individual level.

### Materials and methods

#### Materials

The studied human remains come from different sites in Northern France and Luxembourg (Fig. 1) and witnessed diverse funerary treatments. The site of Loschbour at Heffingen in the Grand-Duchy of Luxembourg, discovered in 1935, provided a primary inhumation (LSB1) with a cremation (LSB2) (Toussaint et al. 2009). The excavation also revealed evidence of a settlement area with a lithic industry of Montbanian culture and some faunal remains predominantly of not only wild boar but also aurochs, red deer, roe deer and beaver (Gob 1982). The buried individual was a male adult whose skull was partially ochered (Delsate et al. 2009, 2011). Two aurochs ribs in apparent association with the human individual were dated to  $7115 \pm 45$  <sup>14</sup>C BP (Gob 1982).

Fig. 1 Geographical location of the sites investigated in this study



Regarding Northern France, Maisons-Alfort at Zac d'Alfort (Val de Marne, France) corresponds to a primary single burial. The individual is a mature adult of unknown sex due to the poor preservation of the remains (Valentin et al. 2008). Similarly, the sites of Cuiry-lès-Chaudardes 'Les Fontinettes' and Berry-au-Bac 'Le Vieux Tordoir' have both provided a single human burial with a necklace made of pike vertebrae in the first case (Ilett 1998) and with ochre and a bone artefact in the latter. In contrast, the human remains at Noyen-sur-Seine 'Hauts des Nachères' were found in a nonfunerary context. The site is a riverbank formation located between Nogent-sur-Seine and Montereau. Archaeological remains from the four excavated loci reveal a Mesolithic occupation in palaeochannels of the Seine River in a peat context. Surface erosion led to the exposure of the peat deposit 9sup in locus 3, while the lower peat deposit 9 is visible in the excavated locus 2 (reviewed in Mordant et al. 2013). One radiocarbon date was obtained on the wood fibres of a fish trap  $(8000 \pm 100^{-14} \text{C BP})$  recovered at the basis of layer 9. Two more recent dates were retrieved on wood fragments from level 9sup:  $7040 \pm 80^{-14}$ C BP and  $6240 \pm 70^{-14}$ C BP. A preliminary study of a sub-sample of the human remains, found in both level 9sup and level 9, described cranial and postcranial remains of varying degrees of completeness and, in some cases, showing superficial modifications such as traces of burning and cutmarks (Auboire 1991). In this paper, we investigate one adult and one juvenile individual from level 9 and one adult from level 9sup on which further study is currently conducted for age and sex determination. With the exception of the non-adult individual from layer 9 of Noyensur-Seine (NO7300), the individuals under consideration were directly radiocarbon dated (Table 1).

The interpretation of the isotopic signature of the human individuals requires the establishment of isotopic baseline provided by local faunal remains. The terrestrial animals we included are red deer (C. elaphus) and wild boar (S. scrofa) from both Noyen-sur-Seine and Loschbour. In addition, roe deer (Capreolus capreolus), aurochs (B. primigenius), wild boar (S. scrofa), wolf (Canis lupus), red fox (Vulpes vulpes), lynx (Lynx lynx), and wild cat (Felis silvestris) were sampled from the faunal assemblage of Noven-sur-Seine. With the exception of one unfused long bone of aurochs (NO5200), only mature individuals were sampled from the animal remains and, as far as possible, the same anatomical part was selected. Aquatic animals chosen for sampling encompass European pond turtle (Emys orbicularis), northern pike (Esox lucius) and European eel (Anguilla anguilla) as well as one of their predator, the otter (Lutra lutra), all specimens coming from Noven-sur-Seine. One pike and several cyprinids from the Mesolithic occupation of Abri du Pape located along the Meuse river in Belgium, with radiocarbon dates ranging from 8800 to 7850 <sup>14</sup>C BP (in Léotard et al. 1999) supplemented the dataset.

Table 1 List of the	radiocarbon dates obtained on the	he sites from Northern France and	Luxembourg investigated i	n this study			
Site	Location	Excavation reference	Description	Lab no.	<sup>14</sup> C dating BP	<sup>14</sup> C age BC 95.4 % prob.	<sup>14</sup> C source
Loschbour 1	Heffingen	Burial LSB1	Human, adult male	LSB-1	$7205 \pm 50 \text{ OXA-}7338$	62155995	2
Loschbour 1	Heffingen	Burial LSB1	Aurochs, ribs		$7115 \pm 45 \text{ GrN-}7177$	60655900	2
Zac d'Alfort	Maisons-Alfort	Burial 7	Human, adult	ZMA-1	$8030 \pm 50 \text{ Ly}-9817$	7085-6705	С
Les Fontinettes	Cuiry-lès-Chaudardes		Human, adult	CRC-1	$7400 \pm 60 \text{ GrA}-28268$	6415-6095	4
Le Vieux Tordoir	Berry-au-Bac	Burial 353	Human, adult	BRB-1	$6325 \pm 35$ SacA-5455	5375-5215	4
Haut-des-Nachères	Noyen-sur-Seine	Locus 3, layer 9sup	Wood		$6240 \pm 70 \text{ Gif-}6991$	5360-5010	1
Haut-des-Nachères	Noyen-sur-Seine	Locus 3, layer 9sup basis	Wood		$7040 \pm 80 \text{ Gif-}7125$	6050-5745	1
Haut-des-Nachères	Noyen-sur-Seine	Locus 3, layer 9sup	Human, adult	NO7200	$7490 \pm 45 \text{ GrA-}50237$	6440-6250	This work
Haut-des-Nachères	Noyen-sur-Seine	Locus 1, layer 9	Human, adult	NO6800	$7915 \pm 45 \text{ GrA}-50239$	7030-6650	This work
Haut-des-Nachères	Noyen-sur-Seine	Locus 1, layer 9	Red deer, bone	NO5000	$7810 \pm 45 \text{ GrA} - 45303$	6770-6505	This work
Haut-des-Nachères	Noyen-sur-Seine	Locus 1, layer 9	Otter, bone	NO6500	$8070 \pm 45 \text{ GrA} - 45301$	7175-6825	This work

Magdalenian fish freshwater species (ca. 12,800 <sup>14</sup>C BP) including burbot (*Lota lota*), brown trout (*Salmo trutta fario*), and nase (*Chondrostoma nasus*) from earlier Magdalenian sites of the Meuse valley (Drucker et al. 2016) were also added in the present analysis.

### Sample preparation and analysis

7245-6635

 $8000 \pm 100$  Gif-6633

Fish trap

Locus 1, layer 9 basis

Noyen-sur-Seine

Haut-des-Nachères

3: Valentin et al. 2008, 4: Posth et al. 2016

1: Mordant and Mordant 1992, 2: Higham et al. 2007,

Collagen was extracted following a protocol based on Longin (1971) and modified by Bocherens et al. (1997). The extraction process includes a step of soaking in 0.125 M NaOH between the demineralization and solubilization steps to achieve the elimination of lipids. Elemental analysis (C, N, S) and isotopic analysis ( $\delta^{13}$ C,  $\delta 15N$ ,  $\delta^{-34}S$ ) were conducted at the Department of Geosciences of Tübingen University using a NC2500 CHN-elemental analyser coupled to a Thermo Quest Delta + XL mass spectrometer. Sample  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{15}$ N values are reported relative to the international reference scales V-PDB for carbon and AIR for nitrogen isotopes. Analytical error, based on within-run replicate measurement of laboratory standards (albumen, modern collagen, USGS 24, IAEA 305A), was  $\pm 0.1$  % for  $\delta^{13}$ C values and  $\pm 0.2 \%$  for  $\delta^{15}$ N values. Samples were calibrated to  $\delta^{34}$ S values relative to V-CDT of NBS 123 ( $\delta^{34}$ S = 17.1 % $_o$ ), NBS 127 ( $\delta^{34}$ S = 20.3 %), IAEA-S-1 ( $\delta^{34}$ S = -0.3 %) and IAEA-S-3 ( $\delta^{34}$ S = 21.7 %). The reproducibility is  $\pm 0.4\,\%$  for  $\delta^{34}S$  measurements, and the error on S measurement is 5 %. Reliability of the  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{15}$ N values can be established by measuring collagen chemical composition, with atomic C:N ranging from 2.9 to 3.6 (DeNiro 1985) and the percentage of C and N above 8 and 3 %, respectively (Ambrose 1990). We retained  $\delta^{34}$ S values of samples whose atomic C:S and N:S fit into the range of 300-900 and 100-300, respectively (Nehlich and Richards 2009) and whose percentage of S ranged between 0.14 and 0.26 %, determined through the results of modern mammalian collagen (Aldrich collagen, modern elk and modern camel) measured in the same sets. The  $^{34}$ S amounts and the  $\delta^{34}$ S values in animal species from level 9 of Noyen-sur-Seine published in Bocherens et al. (2011) were normalised based on Sigma collagen (0.22  $\pm$ 0.003 % and  $4.2 \pm 0.2$  %) and Aldrich collagen (0.18 ± 0.01 % and  $1.8 \pm 0.6$  %) measurements used in Drucker et al. (2011).

Direct AMS radiocarbon dates have been performed on most of the considered human remains and some faunal specimens (Table 1). The results were then calibrated with a 95.4 % confidence level and rounded to the nearest 5 based on the OxCal 4.2 programme (Bronk Ramsey and Lee 2013) using the IntCal13 calibration curve (Reimer et al. 2013).

### Calculation of the proportions of consumed preys

The relative contribution of the different preys to the average diet of the human individuals was simulated using a Bayesian mixing model approach performed in the Stable Isotope Analysis in R (SIAR) package (Parnell et al. 2010), using the R software, version 3.0.2 (Team R Core 2013). SIAR offers the possibility to incorporate uncertainty in input data and yields not only a range of possible dietary proportions but also provides also their relative probability distribution (Parnell et al. 2010). We considered a trophic enrichment factor (TEF) of +1.1  $\pm$  0.2 and +3.8  $\pm$  1.1 % for  $\delta^{13}C$  and  $\delta^{15}N$  values, respectively, based on a review comparing the  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{15}$ N values of the bone collagen of predators and that of their prev in modern and ancient terrestrial ecosystems (reviewed in Bocherens et al. 2015). There are however few controlled feeding experiments on mammals to enlighten TEF between consumer body tissues and their diet for  $\delta^{34}$ S (Richards et al. 2003b; Tanz and Schmidt 2010). In this study, we used a TEF of  $0.5 \pm 2.4 \%$  for  $\delta^{34}$ S corresponding to an average of published TEF data for modern fauna (reviewed in Nehlich 2015).

### **Results and discussion**

# $\delta^{13}C$ and $\delta^{15}N$ values of the preys

The  $\delta^{13}$ C values of the collagen of the terrestrial fauna of the Mesolithic occupation of Noven-sur-Seine and Loschbour revealed some inter-species differences (Table 2, Fig. 2). Among the terrestrial ungulates, the wild boar showed  $\delta^{13}C$ values varying from -21.5 to -18.8 %, while a range of lower values were observed for aurochs, red deer and roe deer (-23.8 to -22.3 %). The latter are similar to collagen values reported for herbivores consuming plants that developed under a dense canopy (see review in Drucker et al. 2008). Several studies in boreal and temperate forest confirmed the occurrence of a 'canopy effect' on understory plants (Broadmeadow et al. 1992; Brooks et al. 1997; Bonafini et al. 2013) due to the accumulation of  ${}^{13}C$ -depleted CO<sub>2</sub> produced by leaf litter recycling and the change in photosynthetic activity and stomatal conductance linked to the specific conditions of light and humidity (e.g. Francey et al. 1985; van der Merwe and Medina 1991; Broadmeadow et al. 1992). Thus, a closed forest habitat can be deduced for the aurochs and roe deer of Noven-sur-Seine and the red deer at both Noven-sur-Seine and Loschbour as both show very similar  $\delta^{13}$ C values range (-23.1 to -22.3 and -23.1 to -22.5 %), respectively). In contrast, the relatively high  $\delta^{13}$ C values of the wild boar of Noyen-sur-Seine and Loschbour could be due to their specific consumption of fruits, acorns and underground tubers (e.g. Ballari and Barrios García 2014). No canopy effect is expected for these food items since they come from the top of the canopy or develop underground. It would be thus premature to conclude that the habitat of the wild boar was not overlapping that of the deer and large bovine. Hence, the temperate forest can be considered as the permanent habitat of a large variety of the terrestrial preys hunted by the Mesolithic groups around Noyen-sur-Seine and Loschbour.

Most of the  $\delta^{15}$ N values of the ungulates clustered between 3.7 and 7.4 % with comparable range from one species to another (Table 2, Fig. 2). However, two specimens from Noyen-sur-Seine, roe deer NO5500 and wild boar NO1100, showed a higher  $\delta^{15}$ N value of 10.0 and 9.2 %, respectively, and so did a wild boar sample from Loschbour as well. The high <sup>15</sup>N abundance of the Loschbour specimen can be explained by the nursing effect since the collagen was extracted from a canine root. The enriched <sup>15</sup>N collagen from the two samples of Noven-sur-Seine could be explained by the consumption of a specific enriched <sup>15</sup>N plant, such as mushrooms (e.g. Drucker et al. 2012), locally specific conditions of temperature and/or aridity (e.g. Amundson et al. 2003; Craine et al. 2009) or a forage quality significantly under the animal's requirement (e.g. Robbins et al. 2010; Poupin et al. 2011). An alternative reason for the case of the wild boar could be the access to animal protein since this species can be omnivorous (e.g. Ballari and Barrios García 2014). Such a hypothesis was confirmed through the <sup>15</sup>N analysis of single amino acids (Naito et al. 2013). Even though the number of these high <sup>15</sup>N ungulates was limited, they might have introduced variability in the  $\delta^{15}$ N values of the terrestrial predators.

# $\delta^{13}C$ and $\delta^{15}N$ values of the animal predators

Within the terrestrial carnivores, among which considerable variation in isotopic composition was observed, two groups can be considered on the basis of their  $\delta^{15}N$  values. The first group corresponded to a  $\delta^{15}$ N value of 9.3 % and included the wild cat and the wolf ( $\delta^{13}$ C value of -19.8 and -21.3 %, respectively). The red fox and the lynx both yielded  $\delta^{15}$ N values around 12 %, but  $\delta^{13}$ C in the same range as the wild cat and the wolf. These last predators presented the expected enrichment of 3 to 5 % in  $\delta^{15}$ N and about 1 % in the  $\delta^{13}$ C (Bocherens and Drucker 2003) in relation to the averaged values of most of the terrestrial ungulates. The more enriched <sup>15</sup>N predators can be explained by a consumption of ungulates with high  $\delta^{15}$ N values such as the wild boar NO1100 and the roe deer NO5500 or young animals since they constitute a source of <sup>15</sup>N-enriched meat due to the nursing effect. An opportunistic behaviour can be hypothesised for the red fox, suggesting the scavenging of dietary remains of human groups, including larger preys than those normally hunted by it (Drucker 2001) or some aquatic resources in this context. Indeed, the consumption of large ungulates and aquatic animals through scavenging has been documented for red fox in modern temperate ecosystems (e.g. Jędrzejewski and Jędrzejewska 1992; Lanszki 2005). In

Table 2Resultcollagen is givenDetails about the	ts of stable isoto through element selection of the	pe analyses of α al composition (t samples for thest	ollagen ( $\delta^{13}$ C, $\delta^{15}$ N, $\delta^{3}$ C, N, S) and atomic ratic e calculations are giver	<sup>4</sup> S) from animal remain: (o (C:N, C:S, N:S). The v in the main text	s from F /alues co	rench, I onsidere	d for the	ourgian and calculation	d Belgiar n of the S	l sites. T IAR ave	he carbon rages and	, nitroge standard	n and su I deviatic	llphur compo ons (in italics)	sition of the are framed.
Site	Lab n°	Species	Sample	Reference	ပ	z	C:N	δ <sup>13</sup> C	δ <sup>15</sup> Ν	s	δ <sup>34</sup> <b>S</b>	C:S	N:S	<sup>13</sup> C, <sup>15</sup> N	34 <b>S</b>
					(%)	(%)	L	(00)	(%)	(%)	(%)	(%)	(%)	source	source
Loschbour 1	LSB2	Red deer	antler		37.4	13.4	3.3	-22.5	6.3	0.15	3.8	677	208	this work	this work
Loschbour 1	LSB5	Red deer	mandible	1886-1943	41.0	13.8	3.5	-23.1	7.1	0.17	6.8	628	181	this work	this work
Noyen/Seine	NO100	Red deer	radius R	84 XVI C150-8 9	41 <u>.</u> 6	15.1	3 <u>.</u> 2	-22.8	6.8	0.19	1.9	581	180	-	1, this work
Noyen/Seine	NO400	Red deer	humerus L	84 XVI H140-6 9	42.0	15.8	3 <u>.</u> 0	-22.3	6.8	0.19	2.0	604	195	-	1, this work
Noyen/Seine	NO600	Red deer	radius L	84 XVI D144-6 9	41.6	14.8	3.3	-23.1	3.7					~	
Noyen/Seine	NO4800	Red deer	metacarpal L	84 XVI E137-12 9	41.8	15.1	3.2	-22.5	4.1						
Noyen/Seine	NO5000	Red deer	metacarpal L	84 XVI D143-15 9	42.5	15.6	3.2	-22.5	6.8	0.14	1.8	812	256	~	1, this work
Noyen/Seine	NO2100	Roe deer	phalanx 1	83 XVI E140 9	42.0	15.5	3.2	-22.7	5.1	0.17	4.1	658	208	~	1, this work
Noyen/Seine	NO2200	Roe deer	phalanx 1	83 XVI E140 9	42.3	15.5	3.2	-22.4	5.5	0.19	4.7	593	186	<del>.</del>	1, this work
Noyen/Seine	NO2400	Roe deer	phalanx 1	84 XVI Y151-36 9	41.9	15.2	3.3	-23.1	3.8					<del>.</del>	
Noyen/Seine	NO5300	Roe deer	femur L	84 XV Z151-36 9	41.6	15.1	3.2	-22.9	3.7					~	
Noyen/Seine	NO5400	Roe deer	tibia L	84 XVI G142-6 9	42.2	15.5	3.2	-22.8	6.3	0.19	0 <u>.</u> 2	579	182	~	1, this work
Noyen/Seine	NO5500	Roe deer	tibia L	84 XVI E141-2 9	42.7	15.7	3.2	-23.8	10.0					2	
Noyen/Seine	NO5600	Roe deer	phalanx 1	84 XVI H132-38 9	42.8	15.8	3.2	-23.2	6.3					~	
Noyen/Seine	NO1600	Aurochs	phalanx 3	84 XVI C150-8 9	41.4	14.8	3.3	-23.5	5.2					~	
Noyen/Seine	NO1900	Aurochs	metapodial L	84 XVI C149-6 9	41.7	15.2	3.2	-23.4	6.0	0.19	2.7	601	188	-	1, this work
Noyen/Seine	NO2000	Aurochs	metatarsus	84 XV TZ153-9 9	41.5	15.1	3.2	-22.8	5.2					~	
Noyen/Seine	NO5100	Aurochs	metatarsal L	84 XVI G144-4 9	42.5	15.4	3.2	-22.9	4.9	0.15	2.1	757	235	~	1, this work
Noyen/Seine	NO5200	Aurochs	tibia L	84 XVI B148-14 9	41.7	15.2	3.2	-22.6	5.8					-	
						Av	SIAR erage	-22.9	5.8		3.0				

	· I ·		(	.,-		-																						
	this work	this work		1, this work						1, this work	1, this work	1, this work	1, this work			this work							this work	this work	this work			
	this work	this work	~	~	~	~	-			~	-	~	~	this work	this work	this work	this work	S	S	с	S	с	с	с	с	с	с	S
	211	162		189						178	211	140	162			48							64	49	52			
	692	586		609						563	670	444	522			156							209	161	169			
1 0	-1.0	<u>6.</u> 6		2.1				2.6	3.8	-1.9	4.4	-1.1	5.1			4.0							4.6	-0.5	-0.5			
_	0.16	0.18		0.18						0.20	0.17	0.24	0.20			0.59							0.47	0.64	0.56			
15	8.5	7.4	6.5	9.2	5.4	6.3	5.7	6.7	1.4	9.3	12.4	11.9	9 <u>.</u> 3	8.3	10.9	8.0	9.5	<u>6.</u> 6	10.5	9.8	7.7	8.7	9.2	9.4	8.9	8.7	10.6	8.1
70	-20.4	-18.8	-21.5	-19.7	-20.6	-20.1	-20.9	-20.3	1.0	-21.3	-21.2	-19.1	-19.8	-23.8	-22.5	-21.2	-22.3	-23.2	-21.8	-24.1	-23.8	-18.7	-20.5	-19.8	-20.5	-19.8	-20.5	-23.7
US.	3.3	3.6	3.2	3.2	3.2	3.3	3.2 214 P	rage	SD	3.2	3.2	3.2	3.2	3.3	3.3	3.2	3.2	3.2	3.1	3.1	3.1	3.5	3.3	3.3	3.2	3.2	3.4	3.3
	14.8	12.9	15.2	14.9	15.2	14.5	15.5	Ave		15.3	15.6	14.9	14.5	14.5	14.3	12.5	11.1	9.5	12.4	12.1	5.6	12.2	13.1	13.6	12.8	<u>9.</u> 9	13.5	14.2
	41.5	40.1	41.9	41.1	41.6	40.8	42.7			41.5	42.4	40.3	40.0	40.7	40.3	34.8	30.5	26.2	33.3	32.5	14.8	37.0	36.9	38.6	35.6	27.0	39.5	40.3
		2880-1943	84 XVI G148-8 9	84 XVI D148-2 9	84 XVI A151-21 9	83 XVI C148-5 9	84 XVI E147 9			84 XVI A153-7 9	84 XVI G178 9	84 XVI D142-5 9	85 XVI H206-1 9	84 XVI D141														
	canine root	mandible	ulna L	radius L	humerus L	humerus R	phalanx 3			ulna	metacarpal	tibia	femur R	vertebrae	vertebra	vertebra	epihyal	vertebra	vertebra	bones	vertebra	vertebra	vertebra	vertebra	vertebra	vertebra	bone piece	bone pieces
	Wild boar	Wild boar	Wild boar	Wild boar	Wild boar	Wild boar	Wild boar			Wolf	Red fox	Lynx	Wild cat	Eel	Pike	Cyprinidae	Cyprinidae	Burbot	Burbot	Burbot	Burbot	Brown trout	Brown trout	Brown trout	Brown trout	Brown trout	Pike	Pike
	LSB3	LSB6	006ON	NO1100	NO1300	NO1500	NO5900			NO4000	NO6700	NO3700	NO3500	NO7600	BP-16	BP-20	BP-21	Vert-72/74	Vert-91/-94	BP 3/11	BP 8	Vert-84/85	BP-5	BP6/7/15	BP-13	BP-14	Vert-110	Vert-111
	Loschbour 1	Loschbour 1	Noyen/Seine	Noyen/Seine	Noyen/Seine	Noyen/Seine	Noyen/Seine			Noyen/Seine	Noyen/Seine	Noyen/Seine	Noyen/Seine Noyen/Seine	Noyen/Seine	Abri du Pape	Abri du Pape	Abri du Pape	Trou du Sureau	Trou du Frontal	Bois Laiterie	Bois Laiterie	Trou de Chaleux	Bois Laiterie	Bois Laiterie	Bois Laiterie	Bois Laiterie	Trou du Frontal	Trou du Frontal

Trou de Chaleux	Vert-90	Pike	vertebra		31.1	11.1	3.3	-21.7	10.3					с	
Trou de Chaleux	Vert-82	Nase	bones		40.5	15.4	3.1	-20.1	8.7	0.49	-0.6	222	72	с	this work
Trou du Frontal	Vert-112	Cyprinidae	bone piece		43.3	15.8	3.2	-21.9	11.7					с	
Trou du Frontal	Vert-113	Cyprinidae	vertebra		42.1	15.2	3.2	-21.7	10.6					с	
Trou du Frontal	Vert-114	Cyprinidae	vertebra		41.5	14.2	3.4	-21.8	10.5					с	
							SIAR								
						Av	erage	-21.6	9.4		-0.4				
							SD	1.5	1.3		3.0				
Noyen/Seine	NO4600	Pond turtle	shell	84 XVI G141-8	37.6	13.7	3.2	-25.7	7.6					~	
Noyen/Seine	NO4700	Pond turtle	shell	84 XVI G145-8	39 <u>.</u> 9	14.4	3.2	-25.3	7.7					~	
Noyen/Seine	NO6100	Pond turtle	L hypoplastron	84 XVI Z151-23	39.7	14.3	3.2	-26.7	7.8					-	
Noyen/Seine	NO6200	Pond turtle	L hypoplastron	84 XVI D141-48	41.4	15.1	3.2	-25.0	7.3	L				۲	
Noyen/Seine	NO6300	Pond turtle	L hypoplastron	84 XVI D146-8	40.5	14.7	3.2	-25.7	8.2	0.24	-19.0	453	141	-	1, this work
Noyen/Seine	NO6400	Pond turtle	R hypoplastron	84 XVI E147	40.1	14.4	3.2	-25.9	8 <u>.</u> 0					-	
							SIAR								
						Av	erage	-25.7	7.8						
							SD	0.6	0.3						
Noyen/Seine	NO3200	Otter	femur	84 XV Z151 <del>-</del> 49	42.6	15.2	3.3	-19.3	12.3					~	
Noyen/Seine	NO6500	Otter	scapula	84 XVI D142-12	41.2	15.1	3.2	-24.2	10.7	0.21	-14.5	513	161	<del></del>	1, this work
Noyen/Seine	NO6600	Otter	fibula	84 XV B147	41.9	15.4	3.2	-23.9	11.1	0.16	-12.7	680	214	-	1, this work
							SIAR								
						Av	erage				-15.4				
							SD				3.2				

1: Bocherens et al. 2011; 2: Naito et al. 2013; 3: Drucker et al. 2016

Table 2 (continued)

**Fig. 2**  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{15}$ N values of bone collagen of the red deer (n = 7), roe deer (n = 7), wild boar (n = 7), aurochs (n = 5), fish (n = 20), pond turtle (n = 6), wolf (n = 1), red fox (n = 1), lynx (n = 1), wild cat (n = 1) and otter (n = 3)



conclusion, the contrasted isotopic signatures of the terrestrial carnivores reflect the isotopic diversity of the accessible preys.

The Mesolithic fish from Noyen-sur-Seine and the Abri du Pape clustered between -23.7 and -21.2% for the  $\delta^{13}$ C values and between 8.0 and 10.9% for the  $\delta^{15}$ N values (Table 2, Fig. 2). These values fall within the wide range found for fish of the Belgian Magdalenian (-24.1 to -18.7% in  $\delta^{13}$ C, 6.6 to 11.7% in  $\delta^{15}$ N; Drucker et al. 2016). While the  $\delta^{13}$ C values of the fish largely overlapped those of the terrestrial fauna, the  $\delta^{15}$ N values were generally higher as it could be expected based on studies on past and modern ecosystems (e.g. Dufour et al. 1999; Drucker et al. 2016). The pond turtle at Noyen-sur-Seine represents another potential source of aquatic food. Although its  $\delta^{15}$ N values were comparable to the low values found in freshwater fish (7.3 to 8.2%), its  $\delta^{13}$ C values were drastically lower, ranging from -26.7 to -25.0%. Recent studies have shown that the pond turtle is neither strictly carnivorous nor a pure aquatic animal (Ottonello et al. 2005) and that it favours a woodland environment for its terrestrial movements during nesting (Ficetola et al. 2014).

The otter specimens show a high variability in their  $\delta^{13}$ C and to a smaller extent in their  $\delta^{15}$ N values (Table 2, Fig. 2) than was previously observed in Late Mesolithic contexts from the Netherlands (Smits and van der Plicht 2009). This is probably

**Table 3** Results of stable isotope analyses of collagen ( $\delta^{13}$ C,  $\delta^{15}$ N,  $\delta^{34}$ S) from human remains from French and Luxembourgian sites. The carbon, nitrogen and sulphur composition of the collagen is given through elemental composition (C, N, S) and atomic ratio (C:N, C:S, N:S<sub>c</sub>)

Site	Lab no.	Sample	Reference	C (%)	N (%)	C:N	δ <sup>13</sup> C (‰)	δ <sup>15</sup> N (‰)	S (%)	δ <sup>34</sup> S (‰)	C:S (%)	N:S (%)	<sup>13</sup> C/ <sup>15</sup> N Source	<sup>34</sup> S Source
Heffingen	LSB-1	Femur L	LSB1, 20.5.1943	38.5	13.7	3.3	-20.3	11.9	0.14	4.6	735	224	This work	This work
Maisons-Alfort	ZMA-1	Tibia R	ALFIII St7	35.4	12.9	3.2	-21.1	12.6	0.15	6.6	632	197	This work	This work
Cuiry-lès-Chaudardes	CRC-1	Tibia L		40.9	14.6	3.3	-20.1	11.2	0.17	4.9	634	194	This work	This work
Berry-au-Bac	BRB-1	Fibula R	BVT89 353	39.2	14.4	3.2	-20.3	11.6	0.13	2.5	785	242	This work	This work
Noyen-sur-Seine	NO7200	Femur R	85 XVI B212-20	42.8	15.4	3.2	-21.5	12.1	0.23	-8.3	496	153	2	This work
Noyen-sur-Seine	NO6800	Humerus	84 XVI C145-28	42.5	14.6	3.4	-20.1	11.2	0.26	-9.9	436	128	This work	This work
Noyen-sur-Seine	NO7300	Skull	83 XVI E142-8	40.7	14.5	3.3	-21.3	12.3	0.23	-5.0	464	142	2	This work

1: Bocherens et al. 2011; 2: Naito et al. 2013

**Fig. 3**  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{15}$ N values of bone collagen of the human individuals compared with the terrestrial herbivores represented in mean and standard deviations (red deer, roe deer, wild boar, aurochs), fish and waterdependent animals (turtle, otter), carnivores (wolf, red fox, lynx, wild cat, otter)



due to a difference in proportion of freshwater and terrestrial resources in their diet. Otters feed not only mainly on fish but consume also amphibians, reptiles (including pond turtles), birds, mammals, and aquatic invertebrates (e.g. Clavero et al. 2003; Lanszki et al. 2006). The species appears thus as a flexible predator that exploited both the terrestrial and freshwater ecosystems as has also been observed in modern ecological studies. Analysis of otter droppings conducted in riverine ecosystems show that fish contributes between ca. 55 and 80 % of the diet (e.g. Lanszki and Molnár 2003; Reid et al. 2013).

# $\delta^{13}C$ and $\delta^{15}N$ values of the human individuals

The human individuals showed  $\delta^{13}C$  and  $\delta^{15}N$  values ranging from -21.5 to -20.1 and 11.2 to 12.6 ‰, respectively (Table 3, Fig. 3). The  $\delta^{13}C$  values collected in two clusters: one around -21.4 ‰ including the individual of Maisons-Alfort, the Noyen-sur-Seine juvenile of layer 9 and the adult of layer 9sup, and another group around -20.2 ‰ including Berry-au-Bac, Cuiry-lès-Chaudardes, Loschbour 1 and the adult of layer 9 of Noyen-sur-Seine. The relatively low <sup>13</sup>C cluster showed higher  $\delta^{15}N$  values (12.1 to 12.6 ‰) than the second one (11.2 to 11.9 ‰), the within-group variability of the  $\delta^{15}N$  values being less than 0.8 ‰. The two groups can be interpreted as reflecting two different dietary profiles, the lower <sup>13</sup>C group having access to aquatic resources since its  $\delta^{15}N$  values is 6 to 7 % higher in average than the terrestrial animal species. The second cluster possibly incorporated more terrestrial resources leading to lower  $\delta^{15}$ N values. The large difference in <sup>13</sup>C abundances (>3%) between the human individuals and the pond turtle indicates that this specific animal species was probably not a significant source of food in all of the cases. It is tempting to see a high diet similarity between the individuals of each cluster due to the homogeneity in their isotopic signature. However, the high variability in <sup>13</sup>C and <sup>15</sup>N abundances displayed by each of the main food groups, namely terrestrial and aquatic, could lead to similar isotopic results despite different diet compositions.

### $\delta^{34}$ S values of preys and the animal predators

The <sup>34</sup>S can provide higher resolution of the relative contribution of terrestrial versus freshwater food resources (e.g. Bocherens et al. 2011). However, the number of samples is then reduced since such a measurement requires the combustion of additional collagen material, of which there are not always remainder due to combustion for prior analyses, as well as an excellent preservation of the amino acid containing the element sulphur, namely methionine (Nielsen et al. 1991).

The  $\delta^{34}$ S values of the terrestrial ungulates plotted between -1.0 and 6.8 %, without clear correlation with species (Table 2, Fig. 4). The range of values exhibited by the large

**Fig. 4**  $\delta^{34}$ S and  $\delta^{15}$ N values of bone collagen of the red deer (n = 5), roe deer (n = 3), wild boar (n = 3), aurochs (n = 2), fish (n = 5), pond turtle (n = 1), wolf (n = 1), red fox (n = 1), lynx (n = 1), wild cat (n = 1) and otter (n = 2)



 $\delta^{34}$ Scoll (‰)

**Fig. 5**  $\delta^{34}$ S and  $\delta^{15}$ N values of bone collagen of the human individuals (*n* = 7) compared with the terrestrial herbivores including red deer (*n* = 5), roe deer (*n* = 3), wild boar (*n* = 3), aurochs (*n* = 2) to the terrestrial carnivores including wolf (*n* = 1), red fox (*n* = 1), lynx (*n* = 1), wild cat (*n* = 1), and the aquaticdependent animals including Belgian fish (*n* = 5) and pond turtle (*n* = 1) and otter (*n* = 2) from Noyen-sur-Seine

ungulates was comparable between the site of Loschbour and Noyen-sur-Seine, which suggests these values are representative of the terrestrial resources for the considered geographical region. This is confirmed by the results obtained on the carnivores, averaging the contribution of prey species, with  $\delta^{34}$ S values clustering in a similar range as the ungulates of both Noyen-sur-Seine and Loschbour (-1.9 to 9.3 ‰).

In contrast, the species of the aquatic ecosystem displayed quite different  $\delta^{34}$ S values according to their location. At Noven-sur-Seine, the pond turtle and the two waterdependent otters provide values ranging from -19.0 to -12.7%, while the Belgian fish clustered between -4.6 and 4.0 % (Table 2, Fig. 4). The  $\delta^{34}$ S values of the latter were thus overlapping with the terrestrial values provided by the sites of Loschbour 1 and Noven-sur-Seine. Interestingly, the waterdependent animals of Noven-sur-Seine were significantly distinct from the terrestrial species of the same site in their lower abundances in  $^{34}S.$  The relatively low  $\delta^{34}S$  of the otters and pond turtle from Noven-sur-Seine could reflect the anaeorobic bottom water conditions (reduced sulphur) of the local aquatic ecosystem where they mainly fed, while the higher  $\delta^{34}$ S values of the Belgian fish may correspond to more oxygenated water conditions (sulphate) (see review in Nehlich 2015). Despite a possible terrestrial contribution to their diet, turtle and otter depend significantly on the riverine environment for

food and habitat, and the riparian ecosystem they reflect is very distinct in <sup>34</sup>S from the terrestrial forested ecosystem represented by the large hunted ungulates. The Belgian fish shows relatively high <sup>34</sup>S abundances, which makes them difficult to distinguish from the terrestrial resources. Two distinct groups of aquatic food are identifiable here and should thus be considered separately as far as the <sup>34</sup>S tracking is concerned.

# $\delta^{34}$ S values of preys and the human individuals

The human  $\delta^{34}$ S values ranged between -9.9 and 6.6% (Table 3, Fig. 5). All the humans from Noyen-sur-Seine linked to negative values, ranging from -9.9 to -5.0%, while the other individuals displayed a different range varying from 2.5 to 6.6%. The latter aligned with the terrestrial animal range and partly overlapped with the range of the Belgian fish. The relatively lower  $\delta^{34}$ S values of the humans from Noyen-sur-Seine placed them in an intermediate position between the terrestrial animals and Belgian fish on the one hand and the riparian animals of the same site on the other. In this last case, the consumption of the local aquatic resources is clearly reflected in the <sup>34</sup>S abundances of the human individuals. Outside of Noyen-sur-Seine, the interpretation of the human  $\delta^{34}$ S values may be hindered by potential insufficient discrimination between the local aquatic and terrestrial resources.



Fig. 6 Proportional contribution of freshwater fish, riparian resources and terrestrial animals consumed by animal predators as estimated by SIAR using the following assumptions: terrestrial foods were estimated from wild boar and other large herbivores separately, freshwater foods were estimated from Magdalenian and Mesolithic Belgian fish, riparian resources were estimated from pond turtle and otter of Noyen-sur-Seine.

*Black boxes* and *whiskers* show the median with first and third quartiles and ranges with 1.5 times length of the interquartile range above the third quartile or below the first quartile, respectively. The *shaded area* indicates the Kernel density plot of the probability density of prey proportions. The *brackets* link the resources with a significant negative correlation in their posterior distribution

#### Proportions of consumed prey calculated using SIAR

For each human individual, the possible contribution of each food source was evaluated using SIAR and considered the combined  $\delta^{13}$ C,  $\delta^{15}$ N and  $\delta^{34}$ S values. The food categories were separated between the wild boar, the ruminant ungulates (red deer, roe deer and aurochs), the aquatic-dependent species of the site of Noven-sur-Seine and the fish from Belgium, since these four groups differ from each other based on at least one of the isotopic systems. The averaged isotopic values of the wild boars and of the ruminant herbivores were calculated from all the available data from Noven-sur-Seine and Loschbour. The wild boar canine root was excluded from the calculation for  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{15}$ N values since they may have been affected by a nursing effect, but it was included in the averaged  $\delta^{34}$ S value due to the lack of trophic effect (e.g. Tanz and Schmidt 2010; Nehlich et al. 2011). Pond turtles were used to calculate the mean  $\delta^{13}C$  and  $\delta^{15}N$  values of the riparian resources of the Seine River, and values of the water-dependent otter (NO6500 and NO6600) were also included to estimate the averaged  $\delta^{34}$ S values, again because of the lack of significant fractionation effect.

The application of the SIAR model allows for the testing of possible combinations of food groups providing dietary protein to animal and human predators over several years. Some difficulties can be foreseen in the overlapping range of  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{34}$ S values between the Belgian fish and the terrestrial ungulates. It results in a lack of good discrimination between some food groups, namely wild boar and Belgian fish, testified by a significant negative correlation in their posterior distribution for all the tested predators, except for the fox and the otters (Fig. 6). Such a negative correlation was also found between the ruminant herbivores and the wild boar when testing the diet of the wolf and the wild cat. Among the animal predators, the water-dependent otters with relatively low  $\delta^{13}$ C values displayed a significant consumption of



Fig. 7 Proportional contribution of freshwater fish, riparian resources and terrestrial animals consumed by humans as estimated by SIAR using the following assumptions: terrestrial foods were estimated from wild boar and other large herbivores separately, freshwater foods were estimated from Magdalenian and Mesolithic Belgian fish, riparian resources were estimated from pond turtle and otter of Noyen-sur-

Seine. *Black boxes* and *whiskers* show the median with first and third quartiles and ranges with 1.5 times length of the interquartile range above the third quartile or below the first quartile, respectively. The *shaded area* indicates the Kernel density plot of the probability density of prey proportions. The *brackets* link the resources with a significant negative correlation in their posterior distribution

Fig. 8 Percentage of prey contribution with the highest probability for the different human individuals. In every case, the wild boar and the Belgian fish are negatively correlated, meaning that a higher proportion of one involves a lower proportion of the other



local aquatic resources of Noyen-sur-Seine with ca. 80 % of aquatic-derived protein as the highest likely scenario, while the contribution of the Belgian fish type of resources was very limited in probability. It is consistent with the contextdependent isotopic signature of the freshwater resources and fits the expected maximum contribution of aquatic food observed in ecological studies (e.g. Lanszki and Molnár 2003; Reid et al. 2013). Testing the respective probable contributions of the food resources to the diet of the fox did not provide clear results, especially because none of them were expected to be natural preys of this small predator that is more reliant on small rodents and lagomorphs, unless it has access to the carcasses of larger preys (e.g. Jędrzejewski et al. 1989, 2002; Delibes-Mateos et al. 2007; Helldin and Danielsson 2007). Small preys can be expected to yield lower  $\delta^{15}$ N values than large ungulates based on the results of previous studies (e.g. Bocherens et al. 2011), and their consumption can thus explain the relatively low  $\delta^{15}$ N values of the wild cat, which is even more specialized on rodents than the red fox (e.g. Carvalho and Gomez 2001). Interestingly, the wolf is the other animal predator with a low  $\delta^{15}$ N value, which may also reflect the consumption of ungulates with depleted <sup>15</sup>N abundances that can be found among the deer specimens. In the temperate Białowieża forest in Poland, red deer is indeed the most hunted prey of the wolf (e.g. Jędrzejewski et al. 2002). In the same ecosystem, the lynx is specialized on mediumsized preys, such as roe deer (e.g. Okarma et al. 1997). The result of the SIAR simulation for the lynx of Noyen-sur-Seine indicated a diet more oriented towards wild boar, perhaps as a consequence of the high availability of this prey and the interspecific competition with wolf on deer (e.g. Jędrzejewski et al. 1989). In all cases, the contribution of the local riparian resources to the diet of canids and cats of Noyen-sur-Seine was negligible.

The human individuals of Noyen-sur-Seine were the only ones displaying an unambiguous consumption of local aquatic resources. The local riparian resources were potentially contributing to ca. 30 to 40 % of their dietary protein based on their combined  $\delta^{13}$ C,  $\delta^{15}$ N and  $\delta^{34}$ S values (Figs. 7 and 8). These proportions are in accordance with other estimations based on the amino acid <sup>15</sup>N composition (Naito et al. 2013). This implies a significant contribution over a large time span that could fit the hypothesis of Marinval-Vigne et al. (1989) of possible food preservation for a delayed consumption along with fishing activities conducted mainly in summer. On another hand, the contribution of the aquatic resources as based on the Belgian fish appears possible, but with a strong negative correlation with the contribution of wild boar. It means that a higher proportion of one involves a lower proportion of the other. The  $\delta^{34}$ S values supports the dominant input of the local riparian resources as aquatic-based food, leading to the low probability of the Belgian fish-like resource contribution and then a significant consumption of the wild boar as terrestrial resource.

When aquatic resource consumption is attested, its possible impact on the conventional age has to be considered since the freshwater ecosystem can be a reservoir of older <sup>14</sup>C that differs from the <sup>14</sup>C of the contemporary atmosphere (e.g. Lanting and van der Plicht 1998). The <sup>14</sup>C depletion in freshwater-dissolved inorganic carbon is caused by a restricted exchange in CO<sub>2</sub> between water and atmosphere and the input of <sup>14</sup>C-depleted sources such as fossil carbonates (Geyh et al. 1998; Lanting and van der Plicht 1998), fossil organic carbon (Boaretto et al. 1998) and ancient glacial melted water (Hall and Henderson 2001). As a result, the offset introduced by the freshwater reservoir effect (FRE) is highly variable and depends on the local causes of the reservoir effect, but does not exceed several hundred years (Keaveney and Reimer 2012; but see exception in Iceland in Ascough et al. 2007). At Noven-sur-Seine, a difference of  $260 \pm 63$  years was found between the conventional date of one of the aquatic influenced otters ( $8070 \pm 45$ , NO6500) and a red deer of the same layer  $(7810 \pm 45, \text{ NO5000})$  (Table 1). If the diet accounts for this offset, we can speculate that the consumption of freshwater resources shifted the radiocarbon date of the human remains of no more than ca. 130 years. Indeed, the proportion of the freshwater resources in the human diet was about half of the one estimated in the otter diet. This can thus not explain differences in conventional age as the one observed between the human from layer 9 and the one from layer 9sup at Noven-sur-Seine.

The consumption of freshwater resources appeared difficult to decipher for the individuals of Berry-au-Bac, Cuirylès-Chaudardes, Maison-Alfort and Loschbour 1 using the SIAR model (Fig. 7 and 8). The dietary use of the riparian environment, such as along the Seine bank at Noyen-sur-Seine, can be excluded. However, the non-discriminant results between the Belgian fish and the wild boar as protein providers are a source of uncertainty. In the case of Loschbour 1, the hypothesis of a high consumption of wild boar would fit the archaeological evidences, albeit resulting from old excavations (Cordy 1982) where fish remains may not have been adequately recovered. On the other hand, a necklace made of pike vertebrae found in association with the burial of Cuirylès-Chaudardes (Ilett 1998) illustrates the access to aquatic resources, but is certainly not sufficient to provide a clear evidence for fish consumption. If a limited intake of freshwater food could be demonstrated, it would in turn highlight the importance of wild boar in the subsistence pattern of the Loschbour, Cuiry-lès-Chaudardes and Berry-au-Bac individuals, perhaps to a lesser extent for the individual of Maison-Alfort. In this last case, the isotopic discrimination between the different ungulate groups was low, not allowing the determination of the main terrestrial contributor to the human diet. If the dependence on aquatic resources could be established, it would demonstrate that the aquatic environment exploited by humans out of Noyen-sur-Seine was isotopically different from the anoxic riparian context found along the Seine river at that time.

# Conclusions

The examined human individuals of the Late Mesolithic from northern France and Luxembourg are all characterized by relatively high  $\delta^{15}$ N values of their collagen. Due to the complexity of the  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{15}$ N pattern revealed by the terrestrial as well as the freshwater ecosystem, the interpretation of such values appears difficult at this point. The analysis of the  $\delta^{34}$ S values in the same collagen allows for a clear distinction between the local riparian and terrestrial resources at Noven-sur-Seine, and a SIAR model points to a most likely aquatic contribution around 30 to 40 % of the dietary protein. In contrast, the aquatic  $\delta^{34}$ S values determined on fish specimens of the Mesolithic and older periods of the Magdalenian in Belgium point to a possible isotopic overlap between aquatic and terrestrial ecosystems. As a result, the SIAR model fails to discriminate between this potential aquatic resource and the wild boar contribution for the other studied human individuals. However, the delivered probability reconstruction underlines a difference in protein sources compared with the individuals of Noyen-sur-Seine, despite very comparable results in  $\delta^{13}$ C and  $\delta^{15}$ N values that could have been thought to reflect very similar subsistence strategies. This difference could be linked either to the type of aquatic ecosystem exploited for food or to the higher consumption of terrestrial resources, mainly based on wild boar. In contrast, the diet of the human of Maisons-Alfort may have comprised more comparable proportions of the different large ungulates preys.

The analysis of more collagen from local animals could help to constrain the ambiguity introduced by the overlapping  $\delta^{34}$ S values between aquatic and terrestrial resources. However, the Late Mesolithic burials from Northern France and Luxembourg are generally characterized by a lack of association with animal remains and settlement structures with the notable exception of the extra-funerary remains of the site of Noyen-sur-Seine. The potential of the <sup>34</sup>S in bulk collagen as a tracer of aquatic consumption in continental environments should not be neglected, though, but needs a thorough caseby-case preliminary evaluation.

Acknowledgements We acknowledge the financial support provided by the PCR 'Paléolithique final et Mésolithique dans le Bassin Parisien et ses marges' (dir. B. Valentin). The European Social Fund and the Ministry of Science, Research and Arts of Baden-Württemberg funded the current position of D.G. Drucker. The contribution of Wim Van Neer to this paper presents research results of the Interuniversity Attraction Poles Programme—Belgian Science Policy. Thanks are due to A. Bridault, M.-C. Marinval-Vigne, H. Bocherens and D. Billiou for the initial sampling of the animal remains of Noyen-sur-Seine. We are grateful to Michaël Ilett, Lamys Hachem and Bruno Robert (Trajectoires, CNRS-UMR8215) for allowing the study of Cuiry-les-Chaudardes and Berry-au-Bac. We thank Foni Le Brun-Ricalens, Laurent Brou, François Valotteau (Centre National de Recherche Archéologique, Luxembourg), Jean-Michel Guinet, Edmée Engel and Alain Faber (Musée National d'Histoire Naturelle, Luxembourg) for allowing sampling of faunal remains from the Loschbour 1 excavation. The isotopic analysis benefited from the technical support of Bernd Steinhilber, Catherine Bauer, Christoph Wißing and the team of Biogeologie (Department of Geoscience, University of Tübingen). We are grateful to Thomas Tütken and an anonymous reviewer for their valuable comments. Furthermore, we wish to thank Sophia Haller for English proofreading.

### References

- Ambrose SH (1990) Preparation and characterization of bone and tooth collagen for isotopic analysis. J Archeol Sci 17(4):431–451
- Amundson R, Austin AT, Scuur EAG, Yoo K, Matzek V, Kendall C, Uerbersax A, Brenner D, Baisden WT (2003) Global patterns of the isotopic composition of soil and plant nitrogen. Glob Biogeochem Cycles 17:1031
- Arneson LS, MacAvoy SE (2005) Carbon, nitrogen, and sulfur diet-tissue discrimination in mouse tissues. Can J Zool 83(7):989–995
- Ascough PL, Cook GT, Church MJ, Dugmore AJ, McGovern TH, Dunbar E, Einarsson Á, Friðriksson A, Gestsdóttir H (2007) Reservoirs and radiocarbon: <sup>14</sup>C dating problems in Mývatnssveit, Northern Iceland. Radiocarbon 49:947–961
- Auboire G (1991) Les restes humains mésolithiques de Noyen-sur-Seine (Seine-et-Marne, France). l'Anthropologie 95(1):229–236
- Ballari SA, Barrios García MN (2014) A review of wild boar Sus scrofa diet and factors affecting food selection in native and introduced ranges. Mammal Rev 44:124–134
- Barnes C, Jennings S (2007) Effect of temperature, ration, body size and age on sulphur isotope fractionation in fish. Rapid Commun Mass Spectrom 21:1461–1467
- Boaretto E, Thorling L, Sveinbjornsdottir AE, Yechielis Y, Heinemeieri J (1998) Study of the effect of fossil organic carbon on <sup>14</sup>C in groundwater from Hvinningdal, Denmark. Radiocarbon 40:915–920
- Bocherens H, Drucker D (2003) Trophic level isotopic enrichments for carbon and nitrogen in collagen: case studies from recent and ancient terrestrial ecosystems. Int J Osteoarchaeol 13:46–53
- Bocherens H, Billiou D, Patou-Mathis P, Bonjean D, Otte M, Mariotti A (1997) Paleobiological implications of the isotopic signature (<sup>13</sup>C, <sup>15</sup>N) of fossil mammal collagen in Scladina cave (Sclayn, Belgium). Quat Res 48:370–380
- Bocherens H, Polet C, Toussaint M (2007) Palaeodiet of Mesolithic and Neolithic populations of Meuse Basin (Belgium): evidence from stable isotopes. J Archaeol Sci 34:10–27
- Bocherens H, Drucker DG, Taubald H (2011) Preservation of bone collagen sulphur isotopic compositions in an early Holocene river-bank archaeological site. Palaeogeogr Palaeoclimatol Palaeoecol 310:32–38
- Bocherens H, Drucker DG, Madelaine S (2014) Evidence for a <sup>15</sup>N positive excursion in terrestrial foodwebs at the Middle to Upper Palaeolithic transition in south-western France: implications for early modern human palaeodiet and palaeoenvironment. J Hum Evol 69:31–43
- Bocherens H, Drucker DG, Germonpré M, Lázničková-Galetová M, Naito YI, Wissing C, Brůžek J, Oliva M (2015) Reconstruction of the Gravettian food-web at Předmostí I using multi-isotopic tracking (<sup>13</sup>C, <sup>15</sup>N, <sup>34</sup>S) of bone collagen. Quat Int 359:211–228
- Bollongino R, Nehlich O, Richards MP, Orschiedt J, Thomas MG, Sell C, Fajkošová Z, Powell A, Burger J (2013) 2000 Years of parallel societies in Stone Age Central Europe. Science 342:479–481
- Bonafini M, Pellegrini M, Ditchfield P, Pollard AM (2013) Investigation of the 'canopy effect' in the isotope ecology of temperate woodlands. J Archaeol Sci 40:3926–3935

- Bonsall C, Cook GT, Hedges REM, Higham TFG, Pickard C, Radovanović I (2004) Radiocarbon and stable isotope evidence of the dietary change from the Mesolithic to the Middle Ages in the Iron Gates: new results from Lepenski Vir. Radiocarbon 46:293–300
- Borić D, Grupe G, Peters J, Mikić Ž (2004) Is the Mesolithic-Neolithic subsistence dichotomy real? New stable isotope evidence from the Danube Gorges. Eur J Archaeol 7:221–248
- Bosset G, Valentin F (2013) Mesolithic burial practices in the northern half of France: isolated burials and their spatial organization. In: Valentin B, Souffi B, Ducrocq T, Fagnart J-P, Séara F, Verjux C (eds) Palethnographie du Mésolithique : recherches sur les habitats de plein-air entre Loire et Neckar / Mesolithic palethnography : Research on open-air campsites from the river Loire to the Neckar (Actes bilingues de la table-ronde internationale de Paris, 26-27 novembre 2010). Société préhistorique française, Paris, pp 207-216
- Bridault A (1997) Broadening and diversification of hunted resources, from the Late Palaeolithic to the late Mesolithic, in the North and East of France and the bordering areas: Old world hunters and gatherers. Anthropozoologica 25–26:295–308
- Broadmeadow MSJ, Griffiths H, Maxwell C, Borland AM (1992) The carbon isotope ratio of plant organic material reflects temporal and spatial variations in CO<sub>2</sub> within tropical forest formations in Trinidad. Oecologia 89:435–441
- Bronk Ramsey C, Lee S (2013) Recent and planned developments of the program OxCal. Radiocarbon 55:720–730
- Brooks JR, Flanagan LB, Buchmann N, Ehleringer JR (1997) Carbon isotope composition of boreal plants: functional grouping of life forms. Oecologia 110:301–311
- Carvalho JC, Gomez P (2001) Food habits and trophic niche overlap of the red fox, European wild cat and common genet in the Peneda-Gerês National Park. Galemys 13:39–48
- Clavero M, Prenda J, Delibes M (2003) Trophic diversity of the otter (*Lutra lutra* L.) in temperate and Mediterranean freshwater habitats. J Biogeogr 30:761–769
- Cordy J-M (1982) La faune mésolithique du gisement de Loschbour près de Reuland (G. D. de Luxembourg). In: Gob A, Spier F (eds) Le Mésolithique entre Rhin et Meuse. Actes du Colloque sur le Paléolithique supérieur final et le Mésolithique dans le Grand-Duché de Luxembourg et dans les régions voisines (Ardenne, Eifel, Lorraine) tenu à Luxembourg le 18 et 19 mai 1981. Publication de la Soc. Préhist. Luxembourgeoise, Luxembourg, pp 119–128
- Craine JM, Elmore AJ, Aidar MPM, Bustamante M, Dawson TE, Hobbie EA, Kahmen A, Mack MC, McLauchlan KK, Michelsen A, Nardoto GB, Pardo LH, Peñuelas J, Reich PB, Schuur EAG, Stock WD, Templer PH, Virginia RA, Welker JM, Wright IJ (2009) Global patterns of foliar nitrogen isotopes and their relationships with climate, mycorrhizal fungi, foliar nutrient concentrations, and nitrogen availability. New Phytol 183:980–992
- Delibes-Mateos M, Redpath SM, Angulo E, Ferreras P, Villafuerte R (2007) Rabbits as a keystone species in southern Europe. Biol Conserv 137(1):149–156
- Delsate D, Guinet JM, Saverwyns S (2009) De l'ocre sur le crâne mésolithique (haplogroupe U5a) de Reuland-Loschbour (Grand-Duché de Luxembourg). Bull Soc Préhist Luxembourgeoise 31:7–30
- Delsate D, Brou L, Spier F (2011) L'inhumation mésolithique de Loschbour (Loschbour 1) - résultats des analyses récentes. In: Sous nos pieds/Unter unseren Füßen: Archäologie in Luxemburg -Archéologie au Luxembourg - 1995-2010. Musée National d'Histoire et d'Art, Luxembourg, pp 138-142
- DeNiro MJ (1985) Postmortem preservation and alteration of in vivo bone collagen isotope ratios in relation to palaeodietary reconstruction. Nature 317:806–809
- Drucker D (2001) Validation méthodologique de l'analyse isotopique d'ossements fossiles et apports aux reconstitutions paléoécologiques du Paléolithique supérieur du sud-ouest de la France. Dissertation, University of Paris 6 Pierre et Marie Curie

- Drucker DG, Bocherens H, Billiou D (2003) Evidence for shifting environmental conditions in Southwestern France from 33,000 to 15,000 years ago derived from carbon-13 and nitrogen-15 natural abundances in collagen of large herbivores. Earth Planet Sci Lett 216:163–173
- Drucker DG, Bridault A, Hobson KA, Szuma E, Bocherens H (2008) Can collagen carbon-13 abundance of large herbivores reflect the canopy effect in temperate and boreal ecosystems? Evidence from modern and ancient ungulates. Palaeogeogr Palaeoclimatol Palaeoecol 266:69–82
- Drucker DG, Bridault A, Cupillard C, Hujic A, Bocherens H (2011) Evolution of habitat and environment of red deer (*Cervus elaphus*) during the Late-glacial and early Holocene in eastern France (French Jura and the western Alps) using multi-isotope analysis ( $\delta^{13}$ C,  $\delta^{15}$ N,  $\delta^{18}$ O,  $\delta^{34}$ S) of archaeological remains. Quat Int 245:268–278
- Drucker DG, Hobson KA, Münzel SC, Pike-Tay A (2012) Intraindividual variation in stable carbon ( $\delta^{13}$ C) and nitrogen ( $\delta^{15}$ N) isotopes in mandibles of modern caribou of Qamanirjuaq (*Rangifer tarandus groenlandicus*) and Banks Island (*Rangifer tarandus pearyi*): implications for tracing seasonal and temporal changes in diet. Int J Osteoarchaeol 22:494–504
- Drucker DG, Rosendahl W, Van Neer W, Weber M-J, Görner I, Bocherens H (2016) Environment and subsistence in northwestern Europe during the Younger Dryas: an isotopic study of the human of Rhünda (Germany). J Archaeol Sci Rep 6:690–699
- Ducrocq T, Ketterer I (1995) Le gisement mésolithique du "Petit Marais", La Chaussée-Tirancourt (Somme). Bull Soc préhist fr 92:249–259
- Ducrocq T, Bridault A, Coutard S (2008) Le gisement mésolithique de Warluis: approche préliminaire. Mém Soc préhist fr 45:85–106
- Dufour E, Bocherens H, Mariotti A (1999) Palaeodietary implications of isotopic variability in Eurasian lacustrine fish. J Archaeol Sci 26:627–637
- Ficetola GF, Padoa-Schioppa E, Monti A, Massa R, De Bernardi F, Bottoni L (2014) The importance of aquatic and terrestrial habitat for the European pond turtle (*Emys orbicularis*): implications for conservation planning and management. Can J Zool 82:1704–1712
- Fischer A, Olsen J, Richards M, Heinemeier J, Sveinbjörnsdóttir ÁE, Bennike P (2007) Coast-inland mobility and diet in the Danish Mesolithic and Neolithic: evidence from stable isotope values of humans and dogs. J Archaeol Sci 34:2125–2150
- Francey RJ, Gifford RM, Sharkey TD, Weir B (1985) Physiological influences on carbon isotope discrimination in huon pine (*Lagarostrobos franklinii*). Oecologia 66:211–218
- Fry B, Gest H, Hayes JM (1986) Sulfur isotope effects associated with protonation of HS- and volatilization of H<sub>2</sub>S. Chem Geol (Isot Geosci Sect) 58(3):253–258
- Geyh MA, Schotterer U, Grosjean M (1998) Temporal changes of the <sup>14</sup>C reservoir effect in lakes. Radiocarbon 40:921–931
- Gob A (1982) L'occupation mésolithique de l'abri du Loschbour près de Reuland (G.-D. de Luxembourg). In: Gob A, Spier F (eds) Le Mésolithique entre Rhin et Meuse, Actes du colloque sur le Paléolithique final et le Mésolithique dans le Grand-Duché de Luxembourg et dans les régions voisines (Ardenne, Eifel, Lorraine), Luxembourg, 18 et 19 mai 1981. Société préhistorique luxembourgeoise, Luxembourg, pp 91–117
- Guiry EJ, Hillier M, Richards MP (2015) Mesolithic Dietary Heterogeneity on the European Atlantic Coastline. Curr Anthropol 56(3):460–70
- Hall BL, Henderson GM (2001) Use of uranium-thorium dating to determine past <sup>14</sup>C reservoir effects in lakes: examples from Antarctica. Earth Planet Sci Lett 193:565–577
- Helldin JO, Danielsson AV (2007) Changes in red fox Vulpes vulpes diet due to colonisation by lynx Lynx lynx. Wildl Biol 13(4):475–480
- Higham TFG, Bronk Ramsey C, Brock F, Baker D, Ditchfield P (2007) Radiocarbon dates from the Oxford AMS system archaeometry datelist 32. Archaeometry 49:1–60
- Holmer M, Storkholm P (2001) Sulphate reduction and sulphur cycling in lake sediments: a review. Freshw Biol 46(4):431–451
- Ilett M (1998) Cuiry-lès-Chaudardes, les Fontinettes. Bilan scientifique de la région Picardie. Service régional de l'Archéologie, Amiens, pp 26–27

- Jędrzejewski W, Jędrzejewska B (1992) Foraging and diet of the red fox Vulpes vulpes in relation to variable food resources in Biatowieza National Park, Poland. Ecography 15(2):212–220
- Jędrzejewski W, Jędrzejewska B, Szymura A (1989) Food niche overlaps in a winter community of predators in Białowieża primeval forest, Poland. Acta Theriol 34:487–496
- Jędrzejewski W, Schmidt K, Theuerkauf J, Jędrzejewska B, Selva N, Zub K, Szymura L (2002) Kill rates and predation by wolves on ungulate populations in Białowieża primeval forest (Poland). Ecology 83: 1341–1356
- Katzenberg MA, Bazaliiskii VI, Goriunova OI, Savel'ev NA, Weber AW (2010) Diet reconstruction of prehistoric hunter-gatherers in the Lake Baikal Region. Prehistoric hunter-gatherers of the Baikal Region, Siberia. University of Pennsylvania Museum of Archaeology and Anthropology, Philadelphia, pp 175–191
- Keaveney EM, Reimer PJ (2012) Understanding the variability in freshwater radiocarbon reservoir offsets: a cautionary tale. J Archaeol Sci 39:1306–1316
- Lanszki J (2005) Diet composition of red fox during rearing in a moor: a case study. Folia Zool 54(1/2):213–216
- Lanszki J, Molnár T (2003) Diet of otters living in three different habitats in Hungary. Folia Zool 52:378–388
- Lanszki J, Molnár M, Molnár T (2006) Factors affecting the predation of otter (*Lutra lutra*) on European pond turtle (*Emys orbicularis*). J Zool 270:219–226
- Lanting JN, van der Plicht J (1998) Reservoir effects and apparent <sup>14</sup>Cages. J Irish Archaeol 9:151–165
- Leduc C, Bridault A, Souffi B, David E, Drucker DG (2013) Apports et limites de l'étude des vestiges fauniques à la caractérisation d'un site mésolithique de plein air à Paris : « 62 rue Henry-Farman » (15<sup>e</sup> arrondissement). Bull Soc préhist fr 110:257–280
- Léotard JM, Straus LG, Otte M (1999) L'Abri du Pape. Bivouacs, enterrements et cachettes sur la Haute Meuse belge: du Mésolithique au Bas Empire Romain. Etudes et Recherches Archéologiques de l'Université de Liège, ERAUL
- Lightfoot E, Boneva B, Miracle PT, Šlaus M, O'Connell TC (2011) Exploring the Mesolithic and Neolithic transition in Croatia through isotopic investigations. Antiquity 85:73–86
- Lillie MC, Richards M (2000) Stable isotope analysis and dental evidence of diet at the Mesolithic-Neolithic transition in Ukraine. J Archaeol Sci 27:965–972
- Lillie M, Budd C, Potekhina I (2011) Stable isotope analysis of prehistoric populations from the cemeteries of the Middle and Lower Dnieper Basin, Ukraine. J Archaeol Sci 38(1):57–68
- Longin R (1971) New method of collagen extraction for radiocarbon dating. Nature 230:241–242
- Lubell D, Jackes M, Schwarcz H, Knyf M, Meiklejohn C (1994) The Mesolithic–Neolithic transition in Portugal: isotopic and dental evidence of diet. J Archaeol Sci 21:201–216
- Marinval-Vigne M-C, Mordant D, Auboire G, Augereau A, Bailon S, Dauphin C, Delibrias G, Krier V, Leclerc A-S, Leroyer C, Marinval P, Mordant C, Rodriguez P, Vilette P, Vigne J-D (1989) Noyen-sur-Seine, site stratifié en milieu fluviatile: une étude multidisciplinaire intégrée. Bull Soc Préhi Fr 86:370–379
- McCutchan JH, Lewis WM, Kendall C, McGrath CC (2003) Variation in trophic shift for stable isotope ratios of carbon, nitrogen, and sulfur. Oikos 102(2):378–90
- Meiklejohn C, Bosset G, Valentin F (2010) Radiocarbon dating of Mesolithic human remains in France. Mesolithic Miscellany 21:10–56
- Meiklejohn C, Miller R, Toussaint M (2014) Radiocarbon dating of Mesolithic human remains in Belgium and Luxembourg. Mesolithic Miscellany 22:10–39
- Mordant D, Mordant C (1992) Noyen-sur-Seine: a Mesolithic waterside settlement. In: Coles B (ed) The Wetland Revolution in Prehistory. The Prehistoric Society, Exeter, pp 55–64

- Mordant D, Valentin B, Vigne J-D (2013) Noyen-sur-Seine, twenty-five years on. In: Valentin B, Souffi B, Ducrocq T, Fagnart J-P, Séara F, Verjux C (eds) Palethnographie du Mésolithique : recherches sur les habitats de plein-air entre Loire et Neckar / Mesolithic palethnography : Research on open-air campsites from the river Loire to the Neckar (Actes bilingues de la table-ronde internationale de Paris, 26-27 novembre 2010). Société préhistorique française, Paris, pp 37-49
- Naito YI, Chikaraishi Y, Ohkouchi N, Drucker DG, Bocherens H (2013) Nitrogen isotopic composition of collagen amino acids as an indicator of aquatic resource consumption: insights from Mesolithic and Epipalaeolithic archaeological sites in France. World Archaeol 45: 338–359
- Nehlich O (2015) The application of sulphur isotope analyses in archaeological research: a review. Earth-Sci Rev 142:1–17
- Nehlich O, Richards MP (2009) Establishing collagen quality criteria for sulphur isotope analysis of archaeological bone collagen. Archaeol Anthropol Sci 1:59–75
- Nehlich O, Borić D, Stefanović S, Richards MP (2010) Sulphur isotope evidence for freshwater fish consumption: a case study from the Danube Gorges, SE Europe. J Archaeol Sci 37:1131–1139
- Nehlich O, Fuller BT, Jay M, Mora A, Nicholson RA, Smith CI, Richards MP (2011) Application of sulphur isotope ratios to examine weaning patterns and freshwater fish consumption in Roman Oxfordshire, UK. Geochim Cosmochim Acta 75(17):4963–4977
- Nielsen H, Pilot J, Grinenko LN, Grinenko VA, Lein AY, Smith JW, Pankina RG (1991) Lithospheric sources of sulfur. In: Krouse HR, Grinenko VA (eds) Stable Isotopes in the Assessment of Natural and Anthropogenic Sulfur in the Environment. John Wiley & Sons, Chichester, pp 65–132
- Okarma H, Jędrzejewski W, Schmidt K, Kowalczyk R, Jędrzejewska B (1997) Predation of Eurasian lynx on roe deer in Białowieża primeval forest, Poland. Acta Theriol 42:203–224
- Ottonello D, Salvidio S, Rosecchi E (2005) Feeding habits of the European pond terrapin *Emys orbicularis* in Camargue (Rhône delta, Southern France). Amphibia-Reptilia 26:562–565
- Parnell AC, Inger R, Bearhop S, Jackson AL (2010) Source partitioning using stable isotopes: coping with too much variation. PLoS ONE 5, e9672
- Peterson BJ, Fry B (1987) Stable isotopes in ecosystem studies. A Rev Ecol Syst 18:293–320
- Posth C, Renaud G, Mittnik A, Drucker DG, Rougier H, Cupillard C, Valentin F, Thevenet C, Furtwängler A, Wißing C, Francken M, Malina M, Bolus M, Lari M, Gigli E, Capecchi G, Crevecoeur I, Beauval C, Flas D, Germonpré M, van der Plicht J, Cottiaux R, Gély B, Ronchitelli A, Wehrberger K, Grigorescu D, Svoboda J, Semal P, Caramelli D, Bocherens H, Harvati K, Conard NJ, Haak W, Powell A, Krause J (2016) Pleistocene mitochondrial genomes suggest a single major dispersal of non-Africans and a late glacial population turnover in Europe. Curr Biol 26:1–7
- Poupin N, Bos C, Mariotti F, Huneau J-F, Tomé D, Fouillet H (2011) The nature of the dietary protein impacts the tissue-to-diet <sup>15</sup>N discrimination factors in laboratory rats. PLoS ONE 6, e28046
- Privat KL, O'Connell TC, Hedges RE (2007) The distinction between freshwater-and terrestrial-based diets: methodological concerns and archaeological applications of sulphur stable isotope analysis. J Archaeol Sci 34(8):1197–1204

- Reid N, Thompson D, Hayden B, Marnell F, Montgomery WI (2013) Review and quantitative meta-analysis of diet suggests the Eurasian otter (*Lutra lutra*) is likely to be a poor bioindicator. Ecoll Indicators 26:5–13
- Reimer PJ, Bard E, Bayliss A, Beck JW, Blackwell PG, Bronk Ramsey C, Grootes PM, Guilderson TP, Haflidason H, Hajdas I, Hatte C, Heaton TJ, Hoffmann DL, Hogg AG, Hughen KA, Kaiser KF, Kromer B, Manning SW, Niu M, Reimer RW, Richards DA, Scott EM, Southon JR, Staff RA, Turney CSM, Van der Plicht J (2013) IntCal13 and Marine13 radiocarbon age calibration curves 0-50,000 years cal BP. Radiocarbon 55:1869–1887
- Richards MP, Mellars PA (1998) Stable isotopes and the seasonality of the Oronsay middens. Antiquity 72(275):178–184
- Richards MP, Fuller BT, Hedges REM (2001) Sulphur isotopic variation in ancient bone collagen from Europe: implications for human palaeodiet, residence mobility, and modern pollutant studies. Earth Planet Sci Lett 191:185–190
- Richards MP, Douglas TD, Koch E (2003a) Mesolithic and Neolithic subsistence in Denmark: new stable isotope data. Curr Anthropol 44:288–295
- Richards MP, Fuller BT, Sponheimer M, Robinson T, Ayliffe L (2003b) Sulphur isotopes in palaeodietary studies: a review and results from a controlled feeding experiment. Int J Osteoarchaeol 13(1-2):37–45
- Richards MP, Schulting RJ, Hedges RE (2003c) Archaeology: sharp shift in diet at onset of Neolithic. Nature 425(6956):366–366
- Robbins CT, Felicetti LA, Florin ST (2010) The impact of protein quality on stable nitrogen isotope ratio discrimination and assimilated diet estimation. Oecologia 162:571–579
- Schoeninger MJ, DeNiro MJ (1984) Nitrogen and carbon isotopic composition of bone collagen from marine and terrestrial animals. Geochim Cosmochim Acta 48:625–639
- Schulting RJ, Richards MP (2001) Dating women and becoming farmers: new palaeodietary and AMS dating evidence from the Breton Mesolithic cemeteries of Téviec and Hoëdic. J Anthropol Archaeol 20(3):314–344
- Smits L, van der Plicht H (2009) Mesolithic and Neolithic human remains in the Netherlands: physical anthropological and stable isotope investigations. J Archaeol Low Countries 1:55–85
- Tanz N, Schmidt H (2010) δ<sup>34</sup>S value measurements in food origin assignments and sulfur isotope fractionations in plants and animals. J Agric Food Chem 58:3139–3146
- Team R Core (2013) R: a language and environment for statistical computing. 409
- Toussaint M, Brou L, Le Brun-Ricalens F, Spier F (2009) The Mesolithic site of Heffingen-Loschbour (Grand Duchy of Luxembourg). A yet undescribed human cremation possibly from the Rhine-Meuse-Schelde culture: anthropological, radiometric and archaeological implications. In: Crombé P, Van Strydonck M, Sergant J, Boudin M, Bats M (eds) Chronology and evolution within the Mesolithic of North-West Europe. Cambridge Scholars Publishing, Cambridge, pp 239–260
- Valentin F, Cottiaux R, Buquet-Marcon C, Confalonieri J, Delattre V, Lang L, Le Goff I, Lawrence-Dubovac P, Verjux C (2008) Découvertes récentes d'inhumations et d'incinération datées du Mésolithique en Ile de France. Revue Archéologique d'Ile-de-France 1:21–42
- van der Merwe NJ, Medina E (1991) The canopy effect, carbon isotope ratios and foodwebs in Amazonia. J Archaeol Sci 18:249–259