CO₂-Driven Ocean Acidification Disrupts the Filter Feeding Behavior in Chilean Gastropod and Bivalve Species from Different Geographic Localities

Cristian A. Vargas • Victor M. Aguilera • Valeska San Martín • Patricio H. Manríquez • Jorge M. Navarro • Cristian Duarte • Rodrigo Torres • Marco A. Lardies • Nelson A. Lagos

Received: 10 July 2013 / Revised: 6 August 2014 / Accepted: 15 August 2014 / Published online: 5 September 2014 © Coastal and Estuarine Research Federation 2014

Abstract We present experimental data obtained with newly hatched veliger larvae of the gastropod *Concholepas* concholepas and juveniles of the mussel *Perumytilus* purpuratus exposed to three pCO_2 levels. Egg capsules of *C. concholepas* were collected from three geographic locations in northern (Antofagasta), central (Las Cruces), and southern Chile (Calfuco), and then incubated throughout their entire intra-capsular life cycle at three nominal pCO_2 levels, ~400, 700, and 1,000 ppm. Similarly, *P. purpuratus* were collected from both Las Cruces and Calfuco and exposed to the same pCO_2 levels during 6 weeks. Hatched gastropod larvae and mussel juvenile were fed with the haptophyte *Isochrysis galbana*. Clearance and ingestion rates were

Communicated by Wayne S. Gardner

C. A. Vargas · V. S. Martín Aquatic Ecosystem Functioning Lab (LAFE), Department of Aquatic System, Faculty of Environmental Sciences & Environmental Sciences Center EULA Chile, Universidad de Concepción, Concepción, Chile

C. A. Vargas · V. S. Martín · C. Duarte · M. A. Lardies · N. A. Lagos Center for the Study of Multiple-Drivers on Marine Socio-Ecological System (MUSELS), Universidad de Concepción, Concepción, Chile

C. A. Vargas (⊠) · V. M. Aguilera Millennium Institute of Oceanography (IMO), Universidad de Concepción, Concepción, Chile e-mail: crvargas@udec.cl

V. M. Aguilera Instituto de Ciencias Naturales Alexander von Humboldt,

Universidad de Antofagasta, Av. Jaime Guzman 02800, P.O. Box 170, Antofagasta, Chile

P. H. Manríquez · J. M. Navarro

Instituto de Ciencias Marinas y Limnológicas, Universidad Austral de Chile, Laboratorio Costero de Recursos Acuáticos de Calfuco, Valdivia, Chile estimated for newly hatched larvae, and for juvenile mussel these rates were measured at two observation times (3 and 6 weeks). Our results clearly showed a significant negative effect of elevated pCO_2 on the clearance and ingestion for both *C. concholepas* larvae and *P. purpuratus* juveniles, which dropped between 15 up to 70 % under high pCO_2 conditions. The present study has also shown large variations in the sensitivities of *C. concholepas* larvae from different local populations (i.e. Antofagasta, Las Cruces, and Calfuco). The influence of both corrosive upwelling waters and the influence of freshwater discharges from Maipo River may explain the minor negative effect of high pCO_2 conditions in hatched larvae from Las Cruces' egg capsules, which would

C. Duarte

Departamento de Ecología y Biodiversidad, Facultad de Ecología y Recursos Naturales, Universidad Andres Bello, Santiago, Chile

R. Torres Centro de Investigación en Ecosistemas de la Patagonia (CIEP), Coyhaique, Chile

M. A. Lardies Facultad de Artes Liberales, Universidad Adolfo Ibáñez, Santiago, Chile

M. A. Lardies Center for Aquaculture Research (INCAR), Santiago, Chile

Present Address:

P. H. Manríquez · N. A. Lagos Laboratorio de Ecología y Conducta de la Ontogenia Temprana (LECOT), Centro de Estudios Avanzados en Zonas Áridas (CEAZA), Avenida Ossandón 877, Coquimbo, Chile suggest that they are inherently more tolerant to ocean acidification (OA) than organisms that live on regions with a lower pCO_2 variability. The present study suggests the need for sitespecific studies and reveals the important effect of low pH conditions on feeding activity. Furthermore, this study supports the notion that feeding is a key physiological process susceptible to the effects of OA in marine invertebrates.

Keywords Acidification · Newly hatched larvae · Gastropod · Mussel juveniles · Feeding

Introduction

Over the last two centuries, human activity has become an additional force in the global climate system, as exemplified by greenhouse gas emissions such as CO₂ derived from the burning of fossil fuels (e.g. Caldeira and Wicket 2003; Orr et al. 2005). Although the ocean has partially absorbed the anthropogenic atmospheric CO₂, this has come at the expense of a significant reduction in pH and the concentration of carbonate ion ($[CO_3^{-2}]$), a process known as ocean acidification (OA). OA may promote changes in the carbonate chemistry of seawater (e.g. Sabine et al. 2004), resulting in a wide range of effects in marine organisms such as alteration in physiological processes (Kurihara et al. 2004; Fabry et al. 2008), changes in algal photosynthesis (Feng et al. 2009; Egge et al. 2009), plankton community structure (Engel et al. 2008; Huang et al. 2011), among others. Within the various marine organisms particularly vulnerable to OA, calcifying organisms, such as marine mollusks, are exceptionally vulnerable (Byrne 2011; Gazeau et al. 2013). They have been recognized for their great ecological and economic value, as a food source for humans. In consequence, any impacts of OA on sensitive life history traits of these organisms will potentially lead to adverse ecological and economic impacts.

New scientific evidences suggest that pH drop might affect significantly the physiology of marine mollusks (Chan et al. 2011; Navarro et al. 2013; Vargas et al. 2013) and, therefore, their ecological functions and interactions with lower and/or higher trophic levels (Widdicombe and Spicer 2008). The general reported effects of OA have been associated to changing growth and calcification patterns likely to be related to an altered energy budget allocation (Thomsen and Melzner 2010). Calcification process seems to be strongly controlled by a biological control. Previous studies conducted with mussel species (e.g. Melzner et al. 2011; Thomsen et al. 2013) suggest that shell growth upon ocean acidification scenarios can be less negatively affected when food availability is abundant and feeding is enhanced, considering the significant energetic effort need to keep inner shell integrity. Therefore, feeding could be one of the key physiological processes affected by OA. However, there have been scarce reports about the effect of OA on feeding behavior in both adult and/or juvenile/larval stages of marine invertebrates (Stumpp et al. 2011; Barton et al. 2012; Vargas et al. 2013; Navarro et al. 2013).

The eastern boundary Humboldt Current System (HCS) off Chile is characterized by spatial-environmental heterogeneity in oceanographic conditions and ecological patterns (Thiel et al. 2007). Coastal upwelling areas, such as found in northern-central HCS, are predicted to be strongly affected by OA and deoxygenation. Coastal upwelling waters have low dissolved O₂ and are CO₂ supersaturated resulting in lower coastal pH (Feely et al. 2008). In addition, nonseasonal freshwater discharges flow into some areas in Central Chile. Riverine waters are also acidic in comparison with oceanic waters, due to its low alkalinity and high dissolved inorganic carbon and pCO_2 (Salisbury et al. 2008; Duarte et al. 2013). In consequence, marine mollusks inhabiting intertidal coastal environments are exposed to wide range of natural fluctuations of pH in their environment, which may determine a level of tolerance based on their natural range of exposure. Previous studies with mussels from different geographic locations have evidenced a wide range of negative effects, depending of the past environmental history (Range et al. 2013). Nonetheless, the extreme range of pH variability does not necessarily translate to extreme resistance to future OA (Hofmann et al. 2011).

Here, we present a laboratory study focused on two ecological important species of the rocky intertidal and subtidal communities distributed along the Chilean coast, the smallsized intertidal bivalve Perumytilus purpuratus and the economically important carnivorous gastropod Concholepas concholepas, known as "loco" (Chilean abalone). Both species have been selected for this study based in their wide latitudinal range along the Pacific coast (from 0° to 52°S for P. purpuratus and from 12°S to 55°S for C. concholepas) (Osorio and Bahamonde 1968; Stuardo 1979; Prado and Castilla 2006). P. purpuratus also play a highly relevant ecological role, forming conglomerated beds over intertidal rocks and therefore affecting habitat conditions and the local diversity of invertebrate species (Prado and Castilla 2006). Furthermore, both species constitute important components of the rocky intertidal food web (Prado and Castilla 2006). In nature, females of C. concholepas laid clumps of egg capsules to rocky substratum where they remain cemented for about 3 months (Manríquez and Castilla 2001). Here, an intracapsular development period of 1 to 2 months is required for hatching (Gallardo 1973).

Most studies on the impact of OA on invertebrates have been relatively short term and mostly focused on one life history stage. However, a majority of marine invertebrates develop by means of benthic egg capsules and then on different larval stages and/or juvenile stages. In the present study, we have exposed juvenile stages of *P. purpuratus* and egg capsules of *C. concholepas* collected from different geographic locations along a latitudinal range and environmental histories to three different and constant pCO_2 environments for many weeks (i.e. entire intra-capsular life cycle for the gastropod larvae and for 3 to 6 weeks for the mussel juveniles) (Fig. 1a). Then, we evaluated the ingestion and clearance rates of *P. purpuratus* juveniles and newly hatched *C. concholepas* veliger larvae originating from the treated egg capsules in order to evaluate effects of OA on feeding behavior of these species. We hypothesize in this study that physiological responses of both species under high pCO_2 conditions are different depending on the geographic origin and therefore environmental histories of exposition to low pH/ high pCO_2 natural conditions.

Methods

Collection of Individuals

Newly hatched larvae of *C. concholepas* were obtained from egg capsules collected in rocky intertidal habitats



Fig. 1 Study area showing the different geographic locations from which gastropods and mussels were collected for pCO_2 expositions and feeding estimates

(Antofagasta, 23°45'S, 70°26'W, exp I and II), and from egg capsules recently laid by females maintained in captivity in aquariums in Central Chile (Las Cruces, 33°30'S, 71°38'W, exp III and IV), and from southern Chile (Coastal Laboratory at Calfuco, 39°78'S, 73°39'W, exp V and VI). At Calfuco, as soon as they were laid, the egg capsules were identified, and a few days later, when the female had moved away from the oviposition site, they were transferred to rearing conditions. A similar procedure was carried out at Las Cruces, but once egg capsules were accessible, they were transported under wet conditions to Calfuco.

Juvenile individuals of *P. purpuratus* were randomly sampled in the rocky shore of two of the three locations previously mentioned: Las Cruces and Calfuco, accordingly to Osorio (2002). After collection, all animals were maintained in filtered seawater and translated to the lab in a thermobox within 2 h after sampling. Ninety individuals were cleaned, sized (12 ± 1.4 mm lengths), and then separated in three groups of 30 individuals each one and transferred to rearing conditions under different pCO_2 .

Seawater CO₂ Manipulation

In our study, three plastic 280-L tanks that were used as acidification units to generate seawater to three nominal levels of pCO_2 were set: 400, 700, and 1,000 ppm, hereafter referred to as "low," "medium," and "high" levels of pCO₂. The pCO₂ conditions chosen for the medium and high levels were selected taking into account the rate of change projected by the years 2070-2110 (i.e. based on rate of change in pH predicted by the most extreme scenario [RCP8.5 scenario] of atmospheric CO_2 (Meinshausen et al. 2011). For the medium and high CO₂ treatments, CO₂ concentrations were modified by equilibrating the seawater with air containing different CO₂ concentrations, as Findlay et al. (2008). Air/CO₂ mixtures were produced using a bulk flow technique, where known flows of dry air (i.e. by compressing atmospheric air, 117 psi, and passing through a 1 µm particle) and ultra-pure (i.e. research grade) CO₂ gas were supplied, via mass flow controller (MFC), and mixed before equilibration with sea water. Airflow in MFC was set manually to 5 L min⁻¹ for both treatments, and CO₂ flow was set manually to 1.33 and 4.25 mL min⁻¹, to produce CO₂ treatments of approximately 700 and 1,000 ppm, respectively. The CO₂ of blended gas was monitored to allow fine regulation of CO₂ through MFCs to reach each target pCO_2 in seawater. During the experiments, seawater pH (total scale, pH_T) were monitored in each tank every 3 days in a 25 mL cell thermostatted at 25.0±0.1 °C for standardization, with a pH meter Metrohm® using a glasscombined double junction Ag/AgCl electrode following DOE potenciometric method (DOE, 1994). Temperature and salinity were monitored during incubations by using a small CTDO (Ocean Seven 305 Plus). Temperature averaged 13 °C in

spring and from 15.4 to 16 °C during summer experiments (Table 1). Total alkalinity (TA) was also measured using the automated potentiometric titration method (Haraldsson et al. 1997). The pH_T, AT, phosphate (Strickland and Parsons 1968), dissolved silicate (Strickland and Parsons 1968), temperature, and salinity data were used to calculate the rest of carbonate system parameters (e.g. pCO_2 , CO_3^{2-}) and the saturation stage of Omega aragonite (Ω_{arag}) using CO₂SYS software (Lewis and Wallace 1998) set with Mehrbach solubility constants (Mehrbach et al.1973) refitted by Dickson and Millero (1987).

Experimental Rearing

Egg capsule rearing was achieved through two methodologies developed to maintain them during the entire intra-capsular developing period under contrasting pCO_2 levels (i.e. 400, 700, and 1,000). The first methodology included a recirculation system in which the seawater equilibration took place in three large (250 L) plastic tanks, and electric pumps were used to move the equilibrated seawater into the rearing containers. A small opening (1 cm in diameter) was made within the upper part of each rearing beaker and sealed with 100 µm mesh size to allow seawater overflow and to prevent larval loss if hatching took place during the rearing. Seawater overflow was accumulated within a plastic container in which the rearing beakers were placed and then conducted by gravity through a silicone pipe into the large equilibration tanks. This rearing methodology was used with egg capsules collected in Antofagasta. The second methodology included 5-L Plexiglas containers filled once a day with equilibrated seawater generated in the large tanks (above). However, to maintain the required pCO_2 levels between seawater changes, a continuous injection of a mix of air and CO₂ was provided. This rearing methodology was used with egg capsules collected in Las Cruces and Calfuco. In both methodologies, the egg capsules were cleaned regularly, and developing took place within the described timing (ca. 2 months). Once maturity was achieved and hatching egg capsules were recorded, they were removed from the rearing containers to obtain the hatching larvae. Since differences in egg capsule developing were not detected and the contrasting pCO_2 and pH_T levels were achieved similarly through both methodologies (Table 1), the consequence or the type of egg capsule rearing was not analyzed in the present study.

Individuals of *P. purpuratus* from both Las Cruces (n=90) and Calfuco (n=90) were reared during a mean period of 3 to 6 weeks at the different pCO_2 levels (low, medium, and high; 30 mussels per CO₂ treatment) in three plastic 22-L containers filled with 15 L of corresponding equilibrated seawater. The continuous injection of air and the required CO₂ was used to maintain the experimental levels between water changes. After water changes, the individuals were fed ad libitum

(>10 µg Chl aL^{-1}) with *I. galbana* and seawater in each bakers was renewed every day (from Monday to Friday) during mean incubation time of 10 weeks (Table 2).

Feeding Experiments with Veliger Larvae

Once a week, the rearing containers were washed and the egg capsules were carefully cleaned with the aid of a soft paintbrush. Mature egg capsules of C. concholepas bearing nearhatch larvae were easily recognizable by their brownish coloration (Manríquez and Castilla 2001), which under our rearing conditions were obtained after about 2 months. The detection of newly hatched larvae in the rearing containers marked the end of the intra-capsular period (from ~6.5 to \sim 8 weeks). Mature egg capsules in process of hatching were then removed from the rearing containers and placed in a small petri dish with 0.5 µm filtered seawater. Under a stereomicroscope, hatched larvae were carefully removed and transferred to experimental acclimation conditions. Experiments with newly hatched larvae of C. concholepas hatched from egg capsules from different locations were conducted on six separate occasions (Table 1): 20-21 June 2011 (exp I, Antofagasta), 02-03 August 2011 (exp II, Antofagasta), 18-19 October 2011 (exp III, Las Cruces), 25-26 January 2012 (exp IV, Las Cruces), 13-14 April 2012 (exp V, Calfuco), and 15-16 April 2012 (exp VI; Calfuco). Naturally induced hatched larvae of C. concholepas selected for the experiments were transferred to 1,000-mL acid-washed polycarbonate bottles filled with the filtered and equilibrated seawater from the three different pCO_2 treatments and fed with ~4,000 to 5,000 cell mL⁻¹ (2.2±0.2 and 3.0±0.3 µg Chl aL^{-1}) of the haptophyte I. galbana sp. Care was taken to avoid air bubbles in the bottles. Three control bottles without larvae and three bottles with 30 newly hatched larvae (0.06 ind mL^{-1}) for each treatment (low, medium, and high pCO₂ levels) were incubated for approximately 24 h and periodically rotated by hand to avoid particle sedimentation. Bottles were immersed in a container with flow-through seawater system used for maintaining temperature fluctuation during a given experiment within 1°. In all experiments, 300-mL subsamples for determination of chlorophyll a (Chl a) were 0.7 µm filtered and dark extracted in acetone 95 % before measurement on a TD 700 Turner fluorometer (Strickland and Parsons 1968). The remaining volume was gently poured through a 20-µm sieve in order to check that incubated larvae were healthy and actively filtering after the incubation period. Clearance (CR) and ingestion rates (IR), measured as Chl a removal, were calculated according to Frost (1975) modified by Marin et al. (1986). Clearance and ingestion rates were calculated only when the differences in prey concentration between control and experimental bottles proved to be significant (t test: p < 0.05). Food availability (i.e. biomass) of *I. galbana* in each CO₂ treatment was estimated from the T0 subsample. For all

Table 1 Average (±SE) conditions of carbonate system parameters during incubation of egg capsules and feeding experiments conducted with newly hatched veliger larvae of C. concholepas during the

Exp	Species	Location	Date	Nominal CO ₂ levels	Temperature (°C)	Salinity	pH_T	TA (µmol kg ⁻¹)	pCO ₂ (μatm)	$[CO_3^2]$ in situ (µmol kg ⁻¹)	Ω_{calc}	Ω_{arag}
I	C. concholepas	Antofagasta	20 June	400	10.9 ± 0.3	$33.0 {\pm} 0.1$	8.015±.031	2158.4 ± 24.3	410.1 ± 22.0	117.7±7.3	$2.8 {\pm} 0.2$	1.8 ± 0.1
	Veliger larvae			700	11.0 ± 0.4	$33.0 {\pm} 0.1$	$7.763 \pm .030$	2170.6 ± 18.1	785.1 ± 61.1	$70.6 \pm .5.8$	$1.7 {\pm} 0.1$	1.1 ± 0.1
				1,000	11.1 ± 0.4	$33.0 {\pm} 0.1$	$7.630 \pm .061$	2174.1 ± 20.2	1098.1 ± 13.3	53.7±7.4	1.3 ± 0.2	$0.8{\pm}0.1$
Π	C. concholepas	Antofagasta	02 Aug	400	11.1 ± 1.0	31.5 ± 1.9	$8.015 \pm .020$	2132.5±112.1	410.1 ± 22.1	113.4 ± 11.0	$2.8 {\pm} 0.3$	1.7 ± 0.2
	Veliger larvae			700	11.1 ± 0.9	31.7 ± 1.9	$7.779 \pm .031$	2135.1 ± 112.2	767.0±62.2	68.9±7.7	$1.7 {\pm} 0.2$	1.1 ± 0.1
				1,000	11.2 ± 0.9	$31.9{\pm}1.8$	$7.624 \pm .022$	2148.3 ± 106.4	1102.0 ± 64.1	$51.0{\pm}5.1$	1.2 ± 0.1	$0.8 {\pm} 0.1$
III	C. concholepas	Las Cruces	18 Oct	400	$13.5 {\pm} 0.8$	30.3 ± 1.2	$8.041 \pm .021$	2092.1 ± 45.1	381.2 ± 14.1	123.7±8.3	$3.0 {\pm} 0.2$	2.0 ± 0.1
	Veliger larvae			700	$13.4 {\pm} 0.7$	30.3 ± 1.2	$7.797 \pm .033$	2085.1 ± 54.2	712.6±48.2	74.6±5.3	$1.8 {\pm} 0.1$	1.2 ± 0.1
				1,000	13.4 ± 0.3	$30.4{\pm}1.3$	$7.631 \pm .020$	2076.7±47.0	1067.7 ± 68.1	52.5 ± 3.8	1.3 ± 0.1	0.9 ± 0.1
N	C. concholepas	Las Cruces	25 Jan	400	16.5 ± 1.0	34.6 ± 0.8	$8.063 \pm .021$	2265.0 ± 25.1	$376.8 {\pm} 20.0$	167.5 ± 6.1	$4.0 {\pm} 0.2$	2.6 ± 0.1
	Veliger larvae			700	16.4 ± 1.0	34.1 ± 0.7	$7.822 \pm .030$	2269.4 ± 20.3	716.8 ± 56.0	103.5 ± 6.0	$2.5 {\pm} 0.2$	1.6 ± 0.1
				1,000	16.5 ± 1.0	$34.0 {\pm} 0.6$	$7.689 \pm .041$	2266.3 ± 21.2	1006.0 ± 99.1	78.6 ± 7.1	$1.9 {\pm} 0.2$	1.2 ± 0.1
>	C. concholepas	Calfuco	13 Apr	400	15.6 ± 1.7	$33.5 {\pm} 0.9$	$8.061 \pm .021$	2264.7 ± 46.1	382.3 ± 21.2	159.0 ± 9.1	$3.8 {\pm} 0.2$	2.5 ± 0.1
	Veliger larvae			700	15.6 ± 1.7	$33.5 {\pm} 0.9$	$7.823 \pm .020$	2268.5 ± 40.2	718.2±74.1	99.3 ± 8.2	$2.4 {\pm} 0.2$	$1.5 {\pm} 0.1$
				1,000	15.7±1.7	33.3 ± 1.0	$7.699 \pm .041$	2264.3 ± 41.1	980.6 ± 97.0	77.0±7.3	$1.9 {\pm} 0.2$	1.2 ± 0.1
ΓΛ	C. concholepas	Calfuco	15 Apr	400	15.6 ± 1.7	$33.5 {\pm} 0.9$	$8.062 \pm .020$	2264.7 ± 46.0	382.3 ± 21.0	159.0 ± 9.0	$3.8 {\pm} 0.2$	2.5 ± 0.1
	Veliger larvae			700	15.6 ± 1.7	$33.5 {\pm} 0.9$	$7.821 \pm .021$	2268.5 ± 40.0	718.2 ± 74.0	99.3 ± 8.1	$2.4 {\pm} 0.2$	1.5 ± 0.1
				1,000	15.8 ± 1.7	33.3 ± 1.0	$7.710 \pm .041$	2264.3 ± 41.1	980.6±97.0	77.0±7.1	$1.9 {\pm} 0.2$	1.2 ± 0.1
The di	fferent experiments	ul CO ₂ levels in	the mesocos	ims and in reari	ing containers were ac	chieved and n	naintained durin	g the entire experime	ental neriod by ac	tive injection of m	ixed CO, an	d air. The

The universe experimental O_2 reversing unconversed on the interval and interval and interval and interval in the entry experimental period by acuve injection of mixed O_2 and all. The experimental nominal treatments considered three different O_2 levels: 400 ppm (present), 700 (year 2100*), and 1,000 (year 2200*), pH_T values are presented with three decimals according with the *Guide to best practices for ocean acidification research and data reporting*

juvenile P. purpuratus during the rearing period (January to April 2012):	concentration (CO_3^{2-} in µmol kg ⁻¹), saturation states of the water with		
22 Average (±SE) conditions of carbonate system parameters during pre-incubation and feeding experiments conducted with	(total scale), total alkalinity (TA in μ mol kg ⁻¹), partial pressure of CO ₂ (levels of p CO ₂ in seawater in μ atm), carbonate ior	α to aragonite minerals (Ω_{arag})	

Exp	Species	Location	Date		Nominal	Temperature	Salinity	pH_T	TA (μ mol kg ⁻¹)	pCO_2 (µatm)	$[CO_3^2]$ in situ	$\Omega_{ m calc}$	Ω_{arag}
			Initial	Final	CU ₂ levels						(by iomul)		
	Juvenile	Las Cruces	10 Jan	30 Jan	400	16.9 ± 0.9	34.5±0.6	8.085 ± 0.041	2257.2±14.0	355.0±34.0	176.0±8.4	4.2 ±0.2	2.7±0.1
	P. purpuratus				700	$16.8 {\pm} 0.9$	34.0 ± 0.1	$7.867 {\pm} 0.070$	2267.5±17.3	661.6 ± 116.0	112.4 ± 13.4	2.7 ± 0.3	1.7 ± 0.2
					1,000	17.0 ± 0.9	$33.8{\pm}0.5$	7.730±0.091	2258.9 ± 13.1	916.6 ± 188.0	86.6 ± 12.5	2.1 ± 0.3	1.3 ± 0.2
П	Juvenile	Las Cruces	30 Jan	12 Apr	400	15.9 ± 1.4	34.3 ± 0.8	8.071 ± 0.030	2258.7±42.0	372.1 ± 29.0	163.0 ± 11.4	$3.9 {\pm} 0.3$	2.5 ± 0.2
	P. purpuratus				700	15.9 ± 1.4	$33.9 {\pm} 0.8$	7.835 ± 0.054	2260.6 ± 40.0	695.5 ± 85.1	102.5 ± 10.81	2.5 ± 0.3	$1.6 {\pm} 0.2$
					1,000	16.0 ± 1.4	$33.7 {\pm} 0.8$	7.713 ± 0.051	2259.2 ± 41.0	949.6 ± 121.0	79.8±8.7	$1.9 {\pm} 0.2$	1.2 ± 0.1
Ш	Juvenile	Calfuco	10 Jan	02 Feb	400	16.9 ± 0.9	$33.5 {\pm} 0.7$	8.095 ± 0.040	2254.4 ± 14.0	347.5±34.2	$177.6 {\pm} 8.1$	4.3 ± 0.2	2.7 ± 0.2
	P. purpuratus				700	$16.8 {\pm} 0.8$	$33.4 {\pm} 0.1$	7.867±0.061	2263.1 ± 18.1	655.6 ± 101.0	112.4 ± 11.6	2.7 ± 0.3	2.7 ± 0.3
					1,000	16.9 ± 0.8	33.3 ± 0.4	7.730±0.071	2259.1 ± 11.0	911.9 ± 163.1	$86.6{\pm}10.8$	2.1 ± 0.3	1.3 ± 0.2
Π	Juvenile	Calfuco	03 Feb	17 Apr	400	15.7 ± 1.5	$33.4 {\pm} 0.8$	8.066 ± 0.030	2258.7±43.2	377.4±25.0	160.4 ± 9.9	$3.9 {\pm} 0.2$	$2.5 {\pm} 0.2$
	P. purpuratus				700	15.7±1.4	$33.2 {\pm} 0.9$	7.828 ± 0.042	2261.1 ± 40.0	707.4 ± 69.0	100.2 ± 7.7	$2.4 {\pm} 0.2$	$1.6 {\pm} 0.1$
					1,000	15.9 ± 1.5	33.2 ± 0.8	7.708 ± 0.041	2260.4 ± 41.1	959.6 ± 103.0	78.5 ± 6.3	$1.9 {\pm} 0.2$	1.2 ± 0.1

experimental nominal treatments considered three different CO₂ levels: 400 ppm (present), 700 (year 2100^{*}), and 1,000 (year 2200^{*}). pH_T values are presented with three decimals according with the Guide to best practices for ocean acidification research and data reporting

experiments, there were no significant differences in food availability (Chl *a*) among *p*CO₂ treatments; ANOVA tests, exp I–II ($F_{2,12}$ =<1, *p*>0.05), exp III–IV ($F_{2,12}$ =<1, *p*>0.05), exp V–VI ($F_{2,12}$ =<1, *p*>0.05). However, variations on food availability (Chl *a*) were evident between experiments (exp I> exp II, exp III

Feeding Experiments with P. purpuratus

Feeding experiments were conducted with individuals from both locations after ca. three ("time I") and 6 weeks ("time II") of CO₂ exposition (Table 2). Experiments with juveniles of P. purpuratus were conducted on four separate occasions (Table 2): 29-30 January 2012 (exp I), 02-03 February 2012 (exp II), 12-13 April 2012 (exp III), and 17-18 April 2012 (exp IV). Individuals belonging to each experimental group were individually sorted into 140-mL acid-washed DBO amber bottles filled with filtered seawater (1 µm) and equilibrated with the respective CO₂ treatment. Three control bottles without P. purpuratus and ten bottles with one individual for each treatment (low, medium, and high pCO_2) levels) were incubated for approximately 4 h and periodically rotated by hand to avoid particle sedimentation. Previous to the experiment juvenile body mass (mb) was determined with an analytical balance (±0.01 mg). Food availability varied between 11.7 and 11.8 μ g Chl aL^{-1} , which correspond to a mean cell concentration of ~20,000 cell mL⁻¹ of *I. galbana*. Bottles were immersed in a container with flow-through seawater system used for maintaining temperature fluctuation during a given experiment within 1° (Table 2). After to sieving through 80 mm (fecal material), 8 mL of all bottles were measured directly on TD 700 Turner fluorometer (Strickland and Parsons 1968). The length and maximal width of each valve from each individual were estimated, and with these measurements, wet and buoyant weight was then estimated accordingly with Palmer (1982). Clearance (CR) and ingestion rates (IR) were measured as Chl a removal and were calculated according to Coughlan (1969). For all experiments, there were no significant differences in food availability among CO₂ treatments (Table 4). However, variations on food availability were significant between consecutive observation times performed in Calfuco: time I>time II (Table 4).

Statistical Analyses

Since experimental conditions (salinity, temperature, and food availability) were statistically similar on each couple of experiments performed with *C. concholepas* larvae at the three locations, results will be pooled in one single observation per location: Antofagasta, Las Cruces, and Calfuco. Such that salinity, temperature, food availability, and clearance and ingestion rates of *C. concholepas* larvae were compared among geographic locations and pCO_2 treatments through a two-way

ANOVA tests. When significant differences were found, either among locations or pCO_2 concentrations, a least significant difference (LSD) post hoc test identified the source of such variability. A similar approach but to evaluate the role of incubation time (i.e. time I and time II) and pCO_2 treatments was adopted to evaluate variability on clearance and ingestion rates of *P. purpuratus*.

Results

Experimental Conditions

The experimental setup and average environmental and carbonate chemistry parameters recorded during experiments with C. concholepas larvae are shown in Table 1. Saturation states for Aragonite varied significantly among all the different treatments and experiments (ANOVA, $F_{2,12}=107.3$, p < 0.0001) and during the winter and spring incubations (exp I to III) ranged from supersaturation ($\Omega_{arag}=2.0$) to slightly undersaturated ($\Omega_{arag}=0.8$) (Table 1). Meantime, experimental setup, environmental and carbonate chemistry parameters recorded during experiments with P. purpuratus are shown in Table 2. For incubations with organisms from Las Cruces, pH_T 25 °C was maintained at 8.08, 7.86, and 7.73 and 8.07, 7.84, and 7.71 for exp I and II, respectively, which correspond to pCO_2 levels of approximate 355, 661, and 916 and 372, 695, and 949 µatm, respectively. Saturation states for Aragonite varied less in relation to larvae experiments as well as undersaturation was never reached ($\Omega_{arag} > 1$) (Table 2).

Clearance and Ingestion Rate of Veliger Larvae upon High pCO_2

Statistic comparison of experimental conditions ("temperature," "salinity," and "food availability") and clearance and ingestion rates of newly hatched larvae of C. concholepas in relation to "location" and "pCO2" levels are showed in Table 3. Highest temperature (16.5±1 °C), salinity (34.6 PSU), and food availability (2.84±.2 µg Chl aL^{-1}) were recorded during experiments in summer with egg capsules from Las Cruces (Fig. 2a, Table 1). These environmental conditions varied significantly among experiments with organisms from different locations (one-way ANOVA, p < 0.05); however, all these variables remain similar upon the different pCO₂ treatments (two-way ANOVA, with non-significant location $\times p$ CO₂ interaction, $F_{1,45} = <1, p>0.05$). These results are highlighted in Table 3 since they support further evaluations of CO₂ effects on larval feeding traits. Maximum clearance and ingestion rates were observed in newly hatched larvae from egg capsules from Las Cruces, then, followed by those from Antofagasta, and finally those from Calfuco

Table 3 Two-way ANOVA for each experimental conditions (temperature, salinity, pH_T , and food availability) and clearance and ingestion rates of newly hatched larvae of *C. concholepas* in relation to the locations and pCO_2 levels (low [400 ppm], medium [700 ppm], high [1,000 ppm])

Variable	Factor	F value	d.f.	p value
Temperature	Location	27	2, 45	.0001
	CO ₂	11	2, 45	>0.05
	Interaction	<1	1, 45	>0.05
Salinity	Location	18	2, 45	.001
	CO_2	<1	2, 45	>0.05
	Interaction	<1	1, 45	>0.05
Food	Location	15	2, 45	.0001
	CO ₂	<1	2, 45	>0.05
	Interaction	<1	1, 45	>0.05
Clearance	Location	41	2, 45	.0001
	CO ₂	35	2, 45	.0001
	Interaction	3	2, 45	.04
Ingestion	Location	65	2, 45	.0001
-	CO_2	38	2, 45	.0001
	Interaction	4	1, 45	.01

(Fig. 2b, c). Although, larval size of newly hatched larvae were slightly larger in Las Cruces and Valdivia than those

Fig. 2 a Comparison of the initial food availability (μ g Chl aL^{-1}) before CO₂ equilibration for feeding of newly hatched larvae of *C. concholepas; vertical bars* belong to total plankton biomass, **b** individual clearance (mL ind⁻¹ day⁻¹), and **c** ingestion rates (μ gC Chl a ind⁻¹ day⁻¹) in six experiments including three CO₂ treatments. *Error bars* denote standard error

from capsules from Antofagasta, differences were not significant. Moreover, mean size of newly hatched larvae from egg capsules from these different geographic locations reared under contrasting pCO₂ levels did not show differences in larval size (i.e. 250 ± 6 , 245 ± 9 , and 252 ± 7 µm at low, medium, and high pCO_2 levels, respectively. Clearance rates varied between 2.6 ± 0.3 (Las Cruces) and 1.9 ± 0.4 (Calfuco) mL ind⁻¹ day⁻¹ (Fig. 2b). A similar pattern was observed on ingestion rates, which varied between 6.8 ± 0.8 (Las Cruces) and 4.1 ± 0.9 (Calfuco) µg Chl aind⁻¹ day⁻¹ (Fig. 2c). Estimates from the different feeding experiments with Isochrysis diet clearly showed a significant reduction in clearance rate, between ~15 up to 60 % from the control condition at low pCO_2 upon increasing pCO_2 levels in seawater. This negative effect of high pCO2 on larval clearance and ingestion was more intense in veliger larvae from Calfuco (mean 14 % of ingestion reduction at nominal 700 µatm) and Las Cruces (mean 18 % of ingestion reduction at nominal 1,000 µatm) (Fig. 2b, c). Indeed, both clearance and ingestion rates varied significantly in relation to both variability factors, since the interaction between geographic location and different pCO_2 levels resulted significant on both clearance and ingestion rates (two-way ANOVA, with significant location $\times pCO_2$ interaction, $F_{2,45}=3$, p=0.04 and $F_{1,45}=4$, p=0.01, respectively) (Table 3).



Clearance and Ingestion Rate of Juvenile Mussels upon High pCO_2

Statistic comparison of experimental conditions (temperature, salinity, and food availability) and clearance and ingestion rates of *P. purpuratus* in relation to "time of exposition" (i.e. 3 or 6 weeks) and " pCO_2 levels" is showed in Tables 4 and 5. Temperature in observations conducted in early January to April 2012 decreased from ca. 16.9 to 15.7 °C (Table 1). Temperature and salinity did not vary significantly neither between observation times and pCO_2 levels (one-way ANOVA, p > 0.05). However, food availability decreased between both observations (times I and II) only for experiments with *P. purpuratus* collected in Calfuco (one-way ANOVA, p=0.0001) (Fig. 3a, Table 5).

Our results clearly evidenced that mussels significantly decreased their clearance and ingestion rates, when they were exposed to a high pCO_2 level, with a reduction from 15 up to more than 70 %. Significant changes were observed in clearance rates in relation to pCO_2 levels for individuals from both geographic locations ("Las Cruces" and "Calfuco"), decreasing from ~7,997 to 4,916 mL g⁻¹ day⁻¹ from low to high pCO_2 levels, respectively (Fig. 3). The effect of high pCO_2 was even more intense with the time of exposition for individuals collected in Las Cruces (two-way ANOVA, with significant time × pCO_2 interaction, $F_{1,54}$ =6.2, p=0.004) (Table 4). The effect of high pCO_2 on ingestion rates was only evident for individuals collected in Calfuco, since for those collected in Las Cruces, we only found

Table 4 Two-way ANOVA for each experimental conditions (size, temperature, salinity, pH_T , and food availability) and clearance and ingestion rates of juvenile *P. purpuratus* (Las Cruces), in relation to exposure time ("time") and three pCO_2 levels (low [380 ppm], medium [700 ppm], high [1,000 ppm])

Location	Variable	Factor	F value	<i>d.f.</i>	p value
Las Cruces	Temperature	Time	<1	1, 54	>0.05
		CO_2	<1	2,57	>0.05
		Interaction	<1	1, 54	>0.05
	Salinity	Time	<1	1, 54	>0.05
		CO_2	<1	2, 54	>0.05
		Interaction	<1	1, 54	>0.05
	Food	Time	<1	1, 54	>0.05
		CO_2	<1	2, 54	>0.05
		Interaction	>1	1, 54	>0.05
	Clearance	Time	3.4	1,54	>0.05
		CO_2	5	2, 54	0.01
		Interaction	6.2	1, 54	0.004
	Ingestion	Time	4	1, 54	0.05
		CO_2	1.4	2, 54	>0.05
		Interaction	1.3	1, 54	>0.05

Table 5 Two-way ANOVA for experimental conditions (size, temperature, salinity, pH_T , and food availability) and clearance and ingestion rates of juvenile *P. purpuratus* (Calfuco), in relation to exposure time (time) and three pCO_2 levels (low [380 ppm], medium [700 ppm], high [1,000 ppm])

Location	Variable	Factor	F value	d.f.	p value
Calfuco	Temperature	Time	<1	1, 54	>0.05
		CO_2	<1	2, 57	>0.05
		Interaction	<1	1, 54	>0.05
	Salinity	Time	<1	1,54	>0.05
		CO_2	<1	2, 54	>0.05
		Interaction	<1	1,54	>0.05
	Food	Time	54	1,54	.0001
		CO_2	<1	2, 54	>0.05
		Interaction	<1	1,54	>0.05
	Clearance	Time	<1	1,54	>0.05
		CO_2	18	2, 54	0.0001
		Interaction	1.4	1,54	>0.05
	Ingestion	Time	2.7	1,54	>0.05
		CO_2	8	2, 54	0.001
_		Interaction	1.3	1, 54	>0.05

significant differences at different exposition time, with a decrease between observation times of ca. 19 % (one-way ANOVA time, $F_{1.54}$ =4, p=0.05).

A frequency analysis performed on clearance rates of *P. purpuratus* collected from both Las Cruces and Calfuco evidenced that as time of exposition and pCO_2 level increase, most individuals reduce their feeding activity, since the highest frequency is observed for lower ranges of clearance rates, but even more, new ranges of low clearance rates appears between observation time (Fig. 4).

Discussion

The periods of exposure used in our study for both gastropod egg capsules and juvenile mussels (42 to 56 days) allowed a better appraisal of the long-term effects on feeding performance of these species, which may contribute to reconcile the context of a permanent exposure under pCO_2 -driven OA scenarios. During our study, our clearance rates estimates in "control" treatment were in the mean range of published values for other veliger larvae (~1.5 to 3.5 mL ind⁻¹ day⁻¹). For instance, Baldwin and Newell (1991) found that veligers of the eastern oyster *Crassostrea virginica* cleared autotrophic ¹⁴C-labeled cells at 2 mL ind⁻¹ day⁻¹. Vargas et al. (2013) had previously reported clearance estimates for newly hatched larvae of *C. concholepas* larvae of 0.4 up to 7 mL ind⁻¹ day⁻¹, based on cell counts of natural food assemblages. Nevertheless, differences in clearance may be

Fig. 3 a Comparison of the initial food availability (μ g Chl aL^{-1}) before CO₂ equilibration for feeding of juvenile *P. purpuratus*; *vertical bars* belong to total plankton biomass, **b** weight-specific clearance (mL g⁻¹ h⁻¹), and **c** ingestion rates (μ gC Chl $ag^{-1} h^{-1}$) in two obseervations (I and II) including three CO₂ treatments. *Error bars* denote standard error



associated with several factors, including field food concentration, incubation temperature and, more importantly, differences in larval body size. Indeed, all feeding structures, such as length of the prototrochal ciliary band, prototrochal cilia, and the angular velocity of the cilia, scale with larval body size (Strathmann and Leise 1979). Indeed, although larval size in those individuals hatched from egg capsules from all locations were not significantly different, individuals from Antofagasta were slightly smaller than those from other locations. Furthermore, similar than our finding, a recent study have detected that levels of pCO_2 do not affect morphological traits of newly hatched larvae of C. concholepas such as larval size during the egg capsule rearing. However, the same study detected that larval size is significantly affected by the interaction between pCO_2 levels with female nested within source locality (Manríquez, personal communication).

Our clearance estimates for juveniles of *P. purpuratus* also are in the relatively same magnitude with clearance rates reported for juveniles and/or adults of other mussel species (~0.15 to 0.46 L g⁻¹ h⁻¹). For instance, for *Mytilus edulis*, Petersen et al. (2004) reported a clearance from 5.3 to 10 L g⁻¹ h⁻¹, and Denis et al. (1999) have reported for the Mediterranean mussel *Mytilus galloprovincialis* a similar clearance rate from ~0.2 to 0.4 L g⁻¹ h⁻¹. For another mussel species in Chilean waters, *Choromytilus chorus*, Toro et al. (2003) reported a clearance rate of ~0.7 to 2.2 L g⁻¹ h⁻¹.

During the last few years, several studies have reported the impacts of OA on the growth and development of larval and adult stages of shellfish (Miller et al. 2009). However, to date, there are few reports regarding the effect of OA on feeding behavior of marine invertebrates, especially on early life stages (Vargas et al. 2013). It is evident from our experiments that an important effect of CO₂-driven OA is the radical decrease in larval and juvenile feeding of both gastropod and mussel species selected. Newly hatched larvae of the gastropod *C. concholepas* and juvenile stages of the mussel *P. purpuratus* decreased their clearance rate between 15 up to 70 % under high pCO_2 in comparison to control conditions at low pCO_2 levels. However, the underlying mechanism by which OA impacts the feeding process remains unclear for us.

Despite that feeding processes during early life stages of marine invertebrates are likely to be more sensitive to OA than Fig. 4 Clearance rate frequencies (no. of individuals) observed in two consecutive feeding observation times (time I and time II) conducted with juvenile *P. purpuratus* collected in Las Cruces (*left*) and Calfuco (*right*) including three pCO_2 treatments: low (upper), medium (middle) and high (lower)



in adults (Findlay et al. 2008), there are few reports regarding the effect of OA on feeding behavior of larval invertebrates (Stumpp et al. 2011; Barton et al. 2012). Recently, Vargas et al. (2013) reported a significant effect of elevated pCO_2 (~1,000 ppm pCO_2) on the intensity of *C. concholepas* larval feeding on natural food assemblages, which dropped by 60 %. Furthermore, these authors also reported that high pCO_2 induced changes in the food selectivity of *C. concholepas* larvae, switching from large diatom cells to small nanoflagellate and cyanobacteria. In the present study, we have used as a single food source, the nanoflagellate *I. galbana*, a small algal cell, which should be selected under high pCO_2 conditions, but clearance on this small algal cell also decreased significantly under this condition.

In recent years, numerous studies have demonstrated the negative effects of OA on marine bivalves. During a long-term exposure at high pCO_2 (35 days), Navarro et al. (2013) showed that *Mytilus chilensis* showed a significant reduction in its clearance rate. Fernández-Reiriz et al. (2011) also found a reduction in the feeding rate by the clam *Ruditapes decussatus*. Recently, Range et al. (2013) reported a

significant decrease in the clearance rate of R. decussatus during a long-term experiment under high pCO_2 (i.e. 1,000 to 4,000 µatm). These authors used the same food item, I. galbana, at similar food concentration (0.8 to14.8 µg Chl $a^{-1}L^{-1}$). Food concentration is another important issue as food availability has explicitly showed a potential counteractive effect on marine organisms under elevated pCO_2 conditions (e.g. Holcomb et al. 2010, 2012; Melzner et al. 2011; Thomsen et al. 2013). Nevertheless, Chl a concentration in experiments with C. concholepas ranged from 2 to 3 µg Chl $a^{-1}L^{-1}$, which is within the main range of Chl *a* concentration observed for Chilean coastal waters (Yuras et al. 2005), and in those conducted with P. purpuratus, mean Chl a concentration was similar than used by Range et al. (2013), resembling a bloom condition (i.e. 11 to 12 µg Chl $a^{-1}L^{-1}$). In consequence, the decrease in larval filtration rate observed in our study could be associated to other physiological constraints, such as hypercapnia, which can also lead to additional metabolic costs for many marine organisms (Cummings et al. 2011; Stumpp et al. 2011), as well as the effect of uncompensated extracellular pH (Stumpp et al. 2012), affecting the filtration rate in these organisms. In any case, our results also

support the notion that feeding is one of the key physiological processes affected by OA in marine invertebrates.

Substantial reductions of larvae ingestion occurred at midhigh CO₂ levels among larvae from different locations. This was especially clear in the case of larvae from Las Cruces where ingestion reached a significant reduction of 18 ± 3 % (Kruskall-Wallis test H=4, p<0.05) at nominal CO₂ level of 1,000 µatm in relation to the control situation. Thus, the present study has also shown large variations in the sensitivities of newly hatched larvae from different local populations (i.e. Antofagasta, Las Cruces, and Calfuco). Consequently, information about geographic variation is critical because many morphological, life history, and metabolic traits show variation across space (Beniash et al. 2010; Ramajo et al. 2013), which is often attributed to organism adaptation over environmental gradients (Levins 1968). For example, (Pascal et al. 2010) recorded that copepods associated with sediments with higher CO₂ concentrations were better adapted to hypercapnic environments than copepods inhabiting sediments with lower CO₂ levels. A similar hypothesis was proposed by (Widdicombe et al. 2009) to explain the different tolerances of two macrofauna communities to sea acidification. Cummings et al. (2011) showed that the expression of the chitin synthase (CHS) enzyme, which is a key in the synthesis of bivalve shells, was upregulated in individuals of the Antarctic bivalve Laternula elliptica exposed to hypercapnic conditions, indicating some degree of adaptation to sea acidification in this species. The coastal ecosystems of the Chilean Southeastern Pacific coast is characterized by an almost linear coastline (north of 40°S) and by strong pCO_2 gradients between the atmosphere and the surface water, with high spatial and temporal variability in the northern-southern direction (Torres et al. 2011). Large upwelling areas are located northward of 37°S and determine the monthly fluctuation in sea surface temperature (SST) and pCO_2 levels (Torres et al. 2011). Typically, quasi-permanent upwelling events, occurring in northern Chile, such as in our study site, Antofagasta, injecting low dissolved O₂ and CO₂ supersaturated waters in surface waters along the coast, resulting in lower ocean pH, resulting in a strong across-shore pH and pCO₂ gradients, similar than occurring in other coastal upwelling areas (e.g. California Current System, Feely et al. 2008). However, in the present study, C. concholepas from the Antofagasta region were collected from Antofagasta Bay, an area already reported as an "upwelling shadow"; therefore, marine invertebrates in this region commonly are not affected by low oxygen/high pCO_2 waters (Lagos et al. 2008). Nevertheless, other coastal areas such as our site in Las Cruces in Central Chile are affected by both upwelling and the influence of freshwater discharges from Maipo River, where typically pCO_2 levels may increase as a response to organic matter remineralization (i.e. terrestrial and anthropogenic) and its low buffer capacity (Pérez personal communication). This local condition could greatly influence the adaption potential for organisms under a high pCO_2 conditions. Indeed, the medium and high levels of pCO_2 (i.e. 712 to 1,067 µatm, respectively) represent a natural condition which can be observed in Las Cruces (Lagos et al. 2013; Ramajo et al. 2013), especially in the site where egg capsules were collected and where typically the Maipo River plume arrive daily at the rocky shore (Vargas et al. 2006). In consequence, this natural variability may explain the minor negative effect of high pCO_2 conditions in newly hatched larvae from this local population, which indeed may suggest they are inherently more tolerant to OA than organisms that live on regions with a lower pCO_2 variability (e.g. Antofagasta). Finally, Calfuco is an area that is not directly affected by both upwelling and/or river discharge (Aguilera et al. 2013). The environmental history of pH exposure at the different selected sites in our study (i.e. Antofagasta, Las Cruces, and Calfuco) could induce differential physiological resilience of both C. concholepas and P. purpuratus and may explain the differential responses upon high pCO_2 observed in this study. Similarly, Range et al. (2013) showed large variations in the sensitivities of the mussel M. galloprovincialis, the clams Chamelea gallina and R. decussatus upon high pCO₂, among different local populations of the same species. Consequently, more attention should be given to understanding geographic differences in variability rather than differences in mean values in response to OA. These results clearly suggest the need for site-specific studies and local adaptive measures for supporting the ecological and economic roles of these species under future scenarios of climate change in South America.

Summarizing, our results highlight the negative effects of OA on the feeding process of economically and ecologically important marine species under projected rising atmospheric pCO_2 scenarios. In spite of the fact that this incubation period encompasses a biologically relevant timescale, our approach also must confront the inherent decoupling between experimental periods and the timescale at which the OA process is projected to occur in nature. In addition, OA in nature will act simultaneously with other climate-related variables, including ocean warming, and the extent of low oxygen minimum zone in coastal areas (Doney et al. 2012). In consequence, these coastal areas should be further studied to assess the mechanisms determining the sensitivity of marine invertebrates under those multiple stressors. This condition may imply even worse scenarios, and it might have a larger effect on the metabolic process of marine invertebrates in Chilean waters. Finally, under high pCO_2 scenarios, food quality can be deteriorated as increased CO2 can stimulate carbon fixation through photosynthesis and therefore reducing the nutrient content relative to carbon (Engel et al. 2008). This condition may have significant consequences for the consumer, as nutrient demand for somatic growth can be impaired (Urabe et al. 2003)

Considering that the gastropod *C. concholepas* supports small-scale fisheries that rely on natural stocks (Leiva and Castilla 2001) and *P. purpuratus* form dense beds that play an important role as bioengineers on intertidal rocky shores along Chilean coast (Prado and Castilla 2006), any negative impacts associated with OA that affect this species may produce significant socio-economic and ecological disruptions to the ecosystem and to the essential ecosystem services that it provides for humans.

Acknowledgments We acknowledge the skillful help of all assistants involved in this research, especially to Haydee Müller, Karin Acuña, Loreto Mardones, and María Elisa Jara for their logistic support. This work was supported by the Proyecto Anillos ACT-132 by CONICYT (Comisión Nacional de Investigación Científica y Tecnológica) (http://www.eula.cl/anillos_acidificacion); Fondecyt Grant 1090624 (TOA-SPACE Project), and Millennium Nucleus *Center for the Study of Multiple-Drivers on Marine Socio-Ecological Systems (MUSELS)* funded by MINECON NC120086. Finally, the *Millennium Institute of Oceanography (IMO)* funded by MINECON IC120019 also supported this work during the final stage. CAV is supported by Red Doctoral REDOC.CTA, MINEDUC project UCO1202 at U. de Concepción.

References

- Aguilera, V.M., C.A. Vargas, P.H. Manríquez, J.M. Navarro, and C. Duarte. 2013. Low-pH freshwater discharges drive spatial and temporal variations in life history traits of neritic copepod *Acartia tonsa*. *Estuaries and Coasts* 1–9.
- Baldwin, B.S., and R.I.E. Newell. 1991. Omnivorous feeding by planktotrophic larvae of the eastern oyster *Crassostrea virginica*. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 78: 285–301.
- Barton, A., B. Hales, G.G. Waldbusser, C. Langdon, and R.A. Feely. 2012. The Pacific oyster, *Crassostrea gigas*, shows negative correlation to naturally elevated carbon dioxide levels: implications for near-term ocean acidification effects. *Limnology and Oceanography* 57: 698–710.
- Beniash, E., A. Ivanina, N.S. Lieb, I. Kurochkin, and I.A. Sokolova. 2010. Elevated level of carbon dioxide affects metabolism and shell formation in oysters *Crassostrea virginica*. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 419: 95–108.
- Byrne, M. 2011. Impact of ocean warming and ocean acidification on marine invertebrate life history stages: vulnerabilities and potential for persistence in a changing ocean. *Oceanography and Marine Biology: An Annual Review* 49: 1–42.
- Caldeira, K., and M.E. Wickett. 2003. Anthropogenic carbon and ocean pH. *Nature* 425: 365.
- Chan, K.Y.K., D. Grünbaum, and M.J. O'Donnell. 2011. Effects of ocean-acidification-induced morphological changes on larval swimming and feeding. *The Journal of Experimental Biology* 214: 3857– 3867.
- Coughlan, J. 1969. The estimation of filtering rate from the clearance of suspensions. *Marine Biology* 2: 356–358.
- Cummings, V., J. Hewitt, A. Van Rooyen, K. Currie, S. Beard, S. Thrush, and V. Metcalf. 2011. Ocean acidification at high latitudes: potential effects on functioning of the antarctic bivalve *Laternula elliptica*. *PLoS One* 6: e16069.
- Denis, L., E. Alliot, and D. Grzebyk. 1999. Clearance rate responses of Mediterranean mussels, *Mytilus galloprovincialis*, to variations in the flow, water temperature, food quality and quantity. *Aquatic Living Resources* 12: 279–288.

- Dickson, A.G., and F.J. Millero. 1987. A comparison of the equilibrium constants for the dissociation of carbonic acid in seawater media. *Deep Sea Research Part A: Oceanographic Research Papers* 34: 1733–1743.
- DOE. 1994. Handbook of methods for the analysis of the various parameters of the carbon dioxide system in sea water, version 2. In *Report* ORNL/CDIAC-74, ed. Dickson, A.G. and C. Goyet. Oak Ridge: Oak Ridge National Laboratory.
- Doney, S.C., M. Ruckelshaus, J.E. Duffy, J.P. Barry, F. Chan, C.A. English, and L.D. Talley. 2012. Climate change impacts on marine ecosystems. *Annual Review of Marine Science* 4: 11–37.
- Duarte, C.A., I.E. Hendriks, T.S. Moore, Y.S. Olsen, A. Steckbauer, L. Ramajo, J. Carstensen, J.A. Trotter, and M. McCulloch. 2013. Is ocean acidification an open-ocean syndrome? Understanding anthropogenic impacts on seawater pH. *Estuaries and Coasts* 36(2): 221–236.
- Egge, J.K., J.F. Thingstad, A. Larsen, A. Engel, J. Wohlers, R. Bellerby, and U. Riebesell. 2009. Primary production during nutrient-induced blooms at elevated CO₂ concentrations. *Biogeosciences* 6: 877–885.
- Engel, A., K.G. Schulz, U. Riebesell, R. Bellerby, B. Delille, and M. Schartau. 2008. Effects of CO₂ on particle size distribution and phytoplankton abundance during a mesocosm bloom experiment (PeECE II). *Biogeosciences* 5: 509–521.
- Fabry, V.J., B.A. Seibel, R.A. Feely, and J.C. Orr. 2008. Impacts of ocean acidification on marine fauna and ecosystem processes. *ICES Journal of Marine Science: Journal du Conseil* 65: 414–432.
- Feely, R.A., C.L. Sabine, J.M. Hernandez-Ayon, D. Ianson, and B. Hales. 2008. Evidence for upwelling of corrosive "acidified" water onto the continental shelf. *Science* 320: 1490–1492.
- Feng, Y., C.E. Hare, K. Leblanc, J.M. Rose, Y. Zhang, G.R. DiTullio, and D.A. Hutchins. 2009. The effects of increased pCO₂ and temperature on the North Atlantic spring bloom: I. The phytoplankton community and biogeochemical response. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 388: 13–25.
- Fernández-Reiriz, M.J., P. Range, X.A. Álvarez-Salgado, and U. Labarta. 2011. Physiological energetics of juvenile clams *Ruditapes decussatus* in a high CO₂ coastal ocean. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 433: 97–105.
- Findlay, H.S., M.A. Kendall, J.I. Spicer, C. Turley, and S. Widdicombe. 2008. Novel microcosm system for investigating the effects of elevated carbon dioxide and temperature on intertidal organisms. *Aquatic Biology* 3: 51–62.
- Frost, B.W. 1975. A threshold feeding behavior in *Calanus pacificus*. *Limnology and Oceanography* 1: 263–266.
- Gallardo, C.S. 1973. Desarrollo intracapsular de Concholepas concholepas (Brugière) (Gastropoda, Muricidae). Publicación ocasional. Museo nacional de Historia Natural (Chile) 16.
- Gazeau, F., L.M. Parker, S. Comeau, J.P. Gattuso, W.A. O'Connor, S. Martin, H.O. Pörtner, and P.M. Ross. 2013. Impacts of ocean acidification on marine shelled molluscs. *Marine Biology* 160: 2207– 2245.
- Haraldsson, C., L.G. Anderson, M. Hassellöv, S. Hulth, K. Olsson. 1997. Rapid, high precision potentiometric titration of alkalinity in ocean and sediment pore waters. *Deep-Sea Research Part I: Oceanographic Research Papers* 44: 2031–2044.
- Hofmann, G.E., J.E. Smith, K.S. Johnson, U. Send, L.A. Levin, F. Micheli, and T.R. Martz. 2011. High-frequency dynamics of ocean pH: a multi-ecosystem comparison. *PLoS One* 6: e28983.
- Holcomb, M., D.C. McCorkle, and A.L. Cohen. 2010. Long-term effects of nutrient and CO₂ enrichment on the temperate coral *Astrangia poculata* (Ellis and Solander, 1786). *Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology* 386: 27–33.
- Holcomb, M., A.L. Cohen, and D.C. McCorkle. 2012. An investigation of the calcification response of the scleractinian coral *Astrangia poculata* to elevated pCO_2 and the effects of nutrients, zooxanthellae and gender. *Biogeosciences* 9: 29–39.

- Huang, B., W. Xiang, X. Zeng, K.P. Chiang, H. Tian, J. Hu, and H. Hong. 2011. Phytoplankton growth and microzooplankton grazing in a subtropical coastal upwelling system in the Taiwan Strait. *Continental Shelf Research* 31: 48–56.
- Kurihara, H., S. Shimode, and Y. Shirayama. 2004. Sub-lethal effects of elevated concentration of CO₂ on planktonic copepods and sea urchins. *Journal of Oceanography* 60: 743–750.
- Lagos, N.A., J.C. Castilla, and B.R. Broitman. 2008. Spatial environmental correlates of intertidal recruitment: a test using barnacles in Northern Chile. *Ecological Monographs* 78: 245–261.
- Lagos, N.A., L. Prado, L. Ramajo, C.A. Vargas, R. Torres, P.H. Manríquez, J.M. Navarro, M.A. Lardies, C. Duarte, and G. Saldías. 2013. Divergent population and community patterns on faunal assemblages associated to intertidal mussel beds: influence of corrosive freshwater input on benthic ecosystems. In this issue.
- Leiva, G.E., and J.C. Castilla. 2001. A review of the world marine gastropod fishery: evolution of catches, management and the Chilean experience. *Reviews in Fish Biology and Fisheries* 11: 283–300.
- Levins, R. 1968. *Evolution in changing environments*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.
- Lewis, E. and D. Wallace. 1998. Program developed for CO₂ system calculations. Carbon Dioxide Information Analysis Center, Oak Ridge, Tennessee, USA.
- Manríquez, P.H., and J.C. Castilla. 2001. Significance of marine protected areas in central Chile as seeding grounds for the gastropod *Concholepas concholepas. Marine Ecology Progress Series* 215: 201–211.
- Marin, V., M.E. Huntley, and B. Frost. 1986. Measuring feeding rates of pelagic herbivores: analysis of experimental design and methods. *Marine Biology* 93: 49–58.
- Mehrbach, C., C.H. Culberson, J.E. Hawley, and R.N. Pytkowicz. 1973. Measurement of the apparent dissociation constants of carbonic acid in seawater at atmospheric pressure. *Limnology and Oceanography* 18: 897–907.
- Meinshausen, M., S.J. Smith, K. Calvin, J.S. Daniel, M.L.T. Kainuma, J.-F. Lamarque, K. Matsumoto, S.A. Montzka, S. Raper, K. Riahi, A. Thomson, G.J.M. Velders, and D.P.P. van Vuuren. 2011. The RCP greenhouse gas concentrations and their extensions from 1765 to 2300. *Climatic Change* 109: 213–241.
- Melzner, F., P. Stange, K. Trübenbach, J. Thomsen, I. Casties, U. Panknin, and M.A. Gutowska. 2011. Food supply and seawater pCO₂ impact calcification and internal shell dissolution in the blue mussel *Mytilus edulis*. *PLoS One* 6: e24223.
- Miller, A.W., A.C. Reynolds, C. Sobrino, and G.F. Riedel. 2009. Shellfish face uncertain future in high CO₂ world: influence of acidification on oyster larvae calcification and growth in estuaries. *PLoS One* 4: e5661.
- Navarro, J.M., R. Torres, K. Acuña, C. Duarte, P.H. Manriquez, M. Lardies, and V. Aguilera. 2013. Impact of medium-term exposure to elevated pCO₂ levels on the physiological energetics of the mussel *Mytilus chilensis. Chemosphere* 90: 1242–1248.
- Orr, J.C., V.J. Fabry, O. Aumont, L. Bopp, S.C. Doney, R.A. Feely, and A. Yool. 2005. Anthropogenic ocean acidification over the twentyfirst century and its impact on calcifying organisms. *Nature* 437: 681–686.
- Osorio, C. 2002. Moluscos marinos en Chile, especies de importancia económica. Facultad de Ciencias Universidad de Chile. 211 pp.
- Osorio, C., and N. Bahamonde. 1968. Moluscos bivalvos en pesquerías chilenas. *Biología Pesquera* 3: 69–128.
- Palmer, A.R. 1982. Growth in marine gastropods: a non-destructive technique for independently measuring shell and body weight. *Malacologia* 23: 63–73.
- Pascal, P.Y., J.W. Fleeger, F. Galvez, and K.R. Carman. 2010. The toxicological interaction between ocean acidity and metals in coastal meiobenthic copepods. *Marine Pollution Bulletin* 60: 2201–2208.

- Petersen, K.J., S. Bougrier, A.C. Smaal, P. Garen, S. Robert, J.E.N. Larsen, and E. Brummelhuis. 2004. Intercalibration of mussel *Mytilus edulis* clearance rate measurements. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 267: 187–194.
- Prado, L., and J.C. Castilla. 2006. The bioengineer *Perumytilus purpuratus* (Mollusca: Bivalvia) in central Chile: biodiversity, habitat structural complexity and environmental heterogeneity. *Journal of the Marine Biological Association of the United Kingdom* 86: 417–421.
- Ramajo, L., A. Baltanás, R. Torres, P.H. Manríquez, A. Rodriguez-Navarro, and N. Lagos. 2013. Geographic variation in shell morphology of juvenile snails (*Concholepas concholepas*) along the physical-chemical gradient of the Chilean coast. *Journal* of Marine Biological Association of the United Kingdom. doi:10.1017/S0025315413000891.
- Range, P., M.A. Chícharo, R. Ben-Hamadou, D. Piló, M.J. Fernandez-Reiriz, U. Labarta, and L. Chícharo. 2013. Impacts of CO₂-induced seawater acidification on coastal Mediterranean bivalves and interactions with other climatic stressors. *Regional Environmental Change* 1–12.
- Sabine, C.L., R.A. Feely, N. Gruber, R.M. Key, K. Lee, J.L. Bullister, and A.F. Rios. 2004. The oceanic sink for anthropogenic CO₂. *Science* 305: 367–371.
- Salisbury, J.E., D. Vandemark, C.W. Hunt, J.W. Campbell, W.R. McGillis, and W.H. McDowell. 2008. Seasonal observations of surface waters in two Gulf of Maine estuary-plume systems: relationships between watershed attributes, optical measurements and surface pCO₂. *Estuarine, Coastal and Shelf Science* 77: 245–252.
- Strathmann, R.R., and E. Leise. 1979. On feeding mechanisms and clearance rates of molluscan veligers. *The Biological Bulletin* 157: 524–535.
- Strickland, J.D.H., and T.R. Parsons. 1968. Determination of reactive phosphorus. A practical handbook of seawater analysis. *Fisheries Research Board of Canada, Bulletin* 167: 49–56.
- Stuardo, J. 1979. Sobre la clasificación, distribución y variación de Concholepas concholepas (Bruguiere, 1789): Un estudio de taxonomía Beta. Biología Pesquera Chile 12: 5–38.
- Stumpp, M., S. Dupont, M.C. Thorndyke, and F. Melzner. 2011. CO₂ induced seawater acidification impacts sea urchin larval development II: gene expression patterns in pluteus larvae. *Comparative Biochemistry and Physiology-Part A: Molecular & Integrative Physiology* 160: 320–330.
- Stumpp, M., K. Trübenbach, D. Brennecke, M.Y. Hu, and F. Melzner. 2012. Resource allocation and extracellular acidbase status in the sea urchin *Strongylocentrotus droebachiensis* in response to CO₂ induced seawater acidification. *Aquatic Toxicology* 110: 194–207.
- Thiel, M., E.C. Macaya, E. Acuña, W.E. Arntz, H. Bastías, K. Brokordt, P. Camus, J.C. Castilla, L.R. Castro, M. Cortés, C.P. Dumont, R. Escribano, M. Fernández, J.A. Gajardo, C.F. Gaymer, I. Gomez, A.E. González, H.E. González, P.A. Haye, J.E. Illanes, J.L. Iriarte, D.L. Lancellotti, G. Luna-Jorquera, C. Luxoro, P.H. Manriquez, V. Marín, P. Muñoz, S.A. Navarrete, E. Pérez, E. Poulin, J. Sellanes, H.H. Sepúlveda, W. Stotz, F. Tala, A. Thomas, C.A. Vargas, J.A. Vásquez, and J.M.A. Vega. 2007. The Humboldt Current system of northern and central Chile oceanographic processes, ecological interactions and socioeconomic feedback. *Oceanography and Marine Biology: An Annual Review* 45: 195–344.
- Thomsen, J., and F. Melzner. 2010. Seawater acidification does not elicit metabolic depression in the blue mussel *Mytilus edulis*. *Marine Biology* 157: 2667–2676. doi:10.1007/s00227-010-1527-0.
- Thomsen, J., I. Castles, C. Pansch, A. Körtzinger, and F. Melzner. 2013. Food availability outweighs ocean acidification effects in juvenile *Mytilus edulis*: laboratory and field experiments. *Global Change Biology* 19: 1017–1027.

1177

- Toro, B., J.M. Navarro, and H. Palma-Fleming. 2003. Relationship between bioenergetics responses and organic pollutants in the giant mussel, *Choromytilus chorus* (Mollusca: Mytilidae). *Aquatic Toxicology* 63: 257–269.
- Torres, R., S. Pantoja, N. Harada, H.E. González, G. Daneri, M. Frangopulos, and M. Fukasawa. 2011. Air-sea CO_2 fluxes along the coast of Chile: from CO_2 outgassing in central northern upwelling waters to CO_2 uptake in southern Patagonian fjords. *Journal of Geophysical Research* 116, C09006.
- Urabe, J., J. Togari, and J.J. Elser. 2003. Stoichiometric impacts of increased carbon dioxide on a planktonic herbivore. *Global Change Biology* 9: 818–825.
- Vargas, C.A., D.A. Narváez, A. Piñones, S.A. Navarrete, N.A. Lagos. 2006. River plume dynamic infuences transport of barnacle larvae in the inner shelf o_i central Chile. *Journal of Marine Biological* Association of United Kingdom 86: 1057–1065.

- Vargas, C.A., M. de la Hoz, V. Aguilera, V. San Martín, P.H. Manríquez, J.M. Navarro, and N.A. Lagos. 2013. CO₂-driven ocean acidification reduces larval feeding efficiency and change food selectivity in the mollusk *Concholepas concholepas*. *Journal of Plankton Research* 35(5): 1059–1068
- Widdicombe, S. and J.L. Spicer. 2008. Predicting the impact of ocean acidification on benthic biodiversity: what can animal physiology tell us? *Journal of Experimental Marine Biology and Ecology* 366: 187–197.
- Widdicombe, S., S.L. Dashfield, C.L. McNeill, H.R. Needham, A. Beesley, A. McEvoy, and J.A. Berge. 2009. Effects of CO₂ induced seawater acidification on infaunal diversity and sediment nutrient fluxes. *Marine Ecology Progress Series* 379: 59–75.
- Yuras, G., O. Ulloa, and S. Hormazabal. 2005. On the annual cycle of coastal and open ocean satellite chlorophyll off Chile (18–40°S). *Geophysical Research Letters* 32, L23604. doi:10.1029/2005GL023946.