

Labour Market Discrimination: the Lived Experiences of English-Speaking Caribbean Immigrants in Toronto

Ron Robert Branker¹ 

Published online: 23 January 2016

© Springer Science+Business Media Dordrecht 2016

Abstract The study examined the lived experiences of immigrants in Toronto from Jamaica, Guyana and Trinidad and Tobago, with emphasis on their perceptions and experiences of labour market discrimination. The study employs a qualitative methodology and adopts a critical policy research framework which included a series of in-depth interviews. Based on the central argument that there is a disjuncture between the human capital model used at the policy level and the understanding of immigrant human capital on the ground, the study has found structural and institutional practices inherent in the Canadian labour market that are principal reasons for many immigrants' poor labour market outcomes. Evidence from the study strongly suggests that there is an issue of racism and sexism at play in the Canadian labour market that negatively affects outcomes for Caribbean immigrants in Toronto.

Keywords Race discrimination · Gender discrimination · Immigration policy · Human capital · Labour market

Introduction

This paper is part of a wider study that critically examined Canada's human capital approach to immigration policy through an analysis of factors beyond human capital that influenced labour market outcomes for English-speaking Caribbean immigrants in Toronto. These immigrants are primarily racialized individuals who, despite being native English speakers and possessing high levels of education and work experience, have experienced higher unemployment rates and lower incomes than the Canadian-born.

✉ Ron Robert Branker
rbranker@ryerson.ca

¹ Policy Studies, Ryerson University, 350 Victoria Street, Toronto, ON M5B 2K3, Canada

A number of academics have identified barriers faced by Canada's immigrants, related to race- and gender-based discrimination (Galabuzi 2006; Preston and Giles 2004; James 1994; Teelucksingh and Galabuzi 2007; Anisef et al. 2003; Christofides and Swidinsky 1994). In Canada, racism is largely viewed as a historical and cultural process that has shaped society's norms and values and as a phenomenon that has become embedded in institutions, leading to an inequitable access to opportunities and resources (James 2007; Basran 1983; Allahar 2010; Henry and Ginzberg 1985). Previous to 1962, Canada's immigration policies were openly discriminatory, restricting entry for immigrants from developing countries, with a view on ensuring that no alteration was made to the character of the population through migration (Green 2004; Knowles 2007; James 2010; Satzewich 1991). It was not until 1967 that government formally introduced immigration regulations that abolished discrimination based on race and nationality and introduced new selection criteria for permanent residence in Canada (D'Costa 1987; Kelley and Trebilcock 2010; Agnew 2009). Policy emphasis shifted from country of birth to individual human capital attributes including education, training, and skills (Green 2004; Kelley and Trebilcock 2010). However, while immigration laws and policies were amended to allow minority persons to immigrate to Canada, discrimination still exists in many forms and discrimination negatively affects labour market outcomes for racialized immigrants. The value placed on immigrant human capital at the policy level differs significantly from the understanding of human capital on the ground (i.e., how employers actually recognize and utilize newcomer skills within the labour market) which results in poor employment outcomes for many immigrants.

Failure to explain or address significant race-based differences in income returns from education has been a central criticism of the human capital growth theory (Bowles and Gintis 1975; Welch 1975; Darity 1982; Steinberg 1985). Canada's approach to immigration at the policy level fails to take into account the systemic (structural and conditional) racism and discrimination at the ground level. A number of studies have clearly demonstrated that Canada's visible minority immigrants earn lower incomes and experience higher unemployment rates than their European counterparts or the native-born (Cardozo and Pendakur 2008; Pendakur and Pendakur 2011; Block and Galabuzi 2011; Gilmore 2008; Reitz 2001, 2007; Somerville and Walsworth 2010). The worsening labour market performance of immigrants as a whole has coincided with shifts in source country for Canada's immigrants (Richmond and Shields 2005; Green and Worswick 2009; Lo et al. 2000). For each Census period 1996, 2001 and 2006, immigrants from the Caribbean experienced higher unemployment rates and lower incomes than the Canadian-born population (Statistics Canada 2010; Colin 2007). Further to this, Caribbean immigrant women experienced higher levels of unemployment and lower average incomes than Caribbean men and the Canadian born (Statistics Canada 2010). A number of quantitative studies have also established that lower labour market performance for racialized immigrants is caused in part by racial and gender discrimination (Christofides and Swidinsky 1994; de Silva 1997; Pendakur and Pendakur 1998, 2011). However, researchers have also queried the magnitude of the impact of discrimination, and as a result, the significance of discrimination as a cause for poor labour market outcomes is difficult to quantify and is not as yet well established empirically (Hiebert 2006; Yoshida and Smith 2008). As a result, there have been calls for continued innovative research to unpack the negative impact of race on

labour market outcomes in Canada (Tattsoglou and Preston 2006; Reitz 2007; Fearon and Wald 2011; Lo et al. 2000).

Critical Policy Analysis

Contemporary critical theory takes several forms but is generally concerned with post-Marxist notions of power, domination and transformation (Kushner and Morrow 2003; Rexhepi and Torres 2011). Supporters of the critical theory approach advocate for social action to produce changes in culture, overturn unjust practices or, at the extreme, transform society. Critical theory embraces an inter-disciplinary approach to research and has many dimensions; however, my research primarily focused on two areas: critical race and critical feminist theory.

Critical race theorists argue that socially constructed definitions of race is a major factor in determining access to employment opportunities in Canada as a result of inherent biases built into labour market institutions (James et al. 1999; Allahar 2010; Teelucksingh and Galabuzi 2007). At its very core, critical race theorists seek to address the inequitable distribution of power by advocating for justice for persons who exist on the margins of society, many of whom hold minority racial status (Treviño et al. 2008). Through an examination of the intersection of class, gender and other forms of oppression, critical race theory offers useful insights in how discrimination comes to be structured into the labour market and elsewhere (Galabuzi 2006). Several researchers have argued that despite the image that Canada portrays to the world of racial and cultural tolerance, anti-black racism exists in Canada (Aylward 1999; Galabuzi 2006). Researchers have argued that economic inequality and the class system which leads to the exploitation of labour utilize racism as justification for this exploitation (Basran 1983). Other researchers have argued that racism as a concept is best understood in terms of the manner in which certain racial groups are disadvantaged by structural and cultural factors in society (James 2009). Exploited groups are viewed as different and less deserving with the result that they find themselves in low-wage jobs and are largely excluded from access to the benefits of membership in society (Simmons 1998).

The significance of labour market discrimination based on racial origins is a complex issue in determining labour market access (Reitz 2007). Some researchers have argued that socially constructed definitions of race are a major factor in determining access to employment opportunities in Canada (Teelucksingh and Galabuzi 2007; James 2009; Galabuzi 2006). Other researchers have highlighted the significance of “everyday racism” experienced by racialized persons (Essed 1991), the cumulative effect of which may serve as impediments to job performance (Gosein and Pon 2011; Solorzano 1998; Wing Sue et al. 2007; Essed 1991). It is also difficult to ignore a growing number of studies that show visible minority immigrants having lower earnings and higher unemployment rates than the rest of the Canadian population (Cardozo and Pendakur 2008; Block and Galabuzi 2011; Henry 1999; Henry and Ginzberg 1985; Somerville and Walsworth 2010; Gilmore 2008; Reitz 2007).

The literature on women’s labour market participation suggests that in addition to the obstacles faced by immigrants as a whole, immigrant women are confronted by gender-based barriers to labour market entry (Tattsoglou and Preston 2006; Hawkesworth 2010). The main argument from an equity and feminist perspective is

that traditional gender ideologies and divisions of labour which define women as homemakers reduce prospects to find employment and relegate them to low-paying jobs (Tattsoglou and Preston 2006). From the perspective of critical policy research, emphasis is on the evaluation of government policy and its impact on gender equality, in an effort to ensure gender equity within the policy process itself (Orsini and Smith 2007).

In Canada, the perceived value of women's labour is predicated on existing inequities based on gender, class and race/ethnicity with the result that women's employment rates and income levels have lagged behind men's (Boyd and Yiu 2009; Liu 2007). Although labour force participation rates of women have been increasing and have approached parity with men in recent years, employment segregation continues to be a major concern, and women have found themselves to a considerable degree relegated to the feminized occupations in administration and the services sector (Creese and Wiebe 2012; Lee 2008; Galabuzi 2006; Preston and Giles 2004; Tattsoglou and Preston 2006). In this regard, there is a great deal of concern over the nature and characteristics of recent employment trends, which have been found to be disproportionately part-time and other forms of temporary work, and women are too often found to be employed in fields not commensurate with their level of training (Wilson et al. 2011; Preston and Giles 2004; Tattsoglou and Preston 2006).

In addition, minority women in Canada may earn lower wages because they are victims of double discrimination, based on gender and race (Christofides and Swidinsky 1994). In Canada, racialized immigrant women from Africa and the Caribbean in particular have been concentrated in low-paying, part-time employment as a result of classism and sexism (Elabor-Idemudia 2000; Creese and Wiebe 2012; Das Gupta 1996). In Toronto, women from non-English-speaking countries are found to be amongst the most socio-economically disadvantaged (Lo et al. 2000). Caribbean immigrant women are believed to experience a double disadvantage in the labour market caused by the negative cumulative effect of gender and race-based discrimination, or they are considered 'triple disadvantaged' where the negative effects are also associated with being foreign-born (Boyd and Yiu 2009).

Unfortunately, Canadian governments have not sufficiently adopted a gender-based approach in the implementation of labour market programs, and government's labour market integration policies and programs for immigrants have failed to directly address the issue of gender-based labour market discrimination. This is the context in which this study has sought to examine the lived labour market experience of English-speaking Caribbean immigrants with emphasis on their perceptions and experiences of race- and gender-based discrimination.

The Study

The snowball sampling method was used to recruit participants with assistance from Caribbean immigrant organizations in Toronto. Data were collected from interviews with 39 Caribbean immigrants in Toronto: 20 were men, 6 each from Trinidad and Tobago and Jamaica, and 8 from Guyana; and 19 were women, 6 each from Trinidad and Tobago and Jamaica and 7 from Guyana. The majority of Canada's English-speaking Caribbean immigrants came from these three countries, and more than three

quarters of them reside in Toronto (Canada 2009). The flow of immigrants from other English-speaking Caribbean islands is comparatively small.

Participation was restricted to immigrants who possessed at least a post-secondary level of education. The majority of participants studied at Canadian universities: 1 held a PhD from the USA, 12 master's degrees (8 from Canada), 15 undergraduate degrees (10 from Canada), 10 college diplomas (8 from Canada), and 1 had some university education.

Participants were also required to have resided in Canada for at least 5 years, to negate the effects of settlement and other constraints that also affect labour participation for more recent immigrants. Most participants (17) entered Canada before 1986 (10 men and 7 women): 7 between 1986 and 2002 (3 men and 4 women), and 15 between 2002 and 2007 (7 men and 8 women).

In terms of occupation, 11 participants had worked in senior management (directors, managers or senior administrators) and 10 employed as analysts (information technology, public policy or financial services). There were also two college professors, three engineers, three teachers, four in administrative or customer service work, two security guards, one graduate student/teaching assistant, and three were unemployed (all women). Nine participants were retired at the time of the interviews, indicative of the range and richness of the labour market experience that participants were able to contribute to the study.

Selection of English-speaking immigrants with high levels of human capital provided a good test case regarding the perception of labour market discrimination. All participants self-identified as racial minority persons and reported fluency in English. The language factor can therefore be eliminated as a barrier to labour market participation, highlighting the relevance of other barriers that the study seeks to unpack.

Interviews

Participants were asked whether or not they believed that employers in Toronto discriminated against immigrants in their hiring practices, if they believed that labour market discrimination was based on race and/or gender, and whether they had experienced discrimination themselves. Responses revealed that Caribbean immigrants felt discrimination in the Toronto labour market. Participants reported discrimination based on age, disability, religion and language skills, but the majority felt that discrimination was based on either race or gender or both.

Race Discrimination

Studies have found that visible minorities perceived or experienced a higher level of group and personal discrimination than most other ethnic groups (Dion and Kawakami 1996; Henry and Ginzberg 1985). A number of studies have documented the experiences of seasonal agricultural workers, live-in caregivers and other temporary foreign workers in Canada who are vulnerable to abuse, and many have experienced wage discrimination and were subjected to abusive recruitment practices (Faraday 2014; Tilson 2009; Satzewich 1991). In order to pursue their dreams of becoming permanent residents in Canada, many temporary workers endured experiences of exploitation that

is reflective of institutionalized race- and gender-based discrimination that also impacts permanent immigrants (Tilson 2009). Inadequate protection by provincial labour legislation and a lack of awareness of their rights are factors that contributed to their exploitation. Experiences of live-in caregivers are symptomatic of and perpetuate existing gender inequality (Satzewich 1991), with an added class and race dimension in that housework and childrearing have become the responsibility of women with subordinate class, racial and citizenship status (Arat-Koc 2009).

It is no surprise therefore that the majority, 29 (74 percent) of the 39 interview participants, had witnessed or experienced race discrimination in Toronto's labour market. While some participants narrated personal accounts of their lived experiences of discrimination, others were able to speak about instances of racism witnessed in their workplace or through the experiences of family members. A number of participants also belonged to Caribbean organizations that provided assistance to immigrants and were able to narrate second-hand accounts of discrimination.

Generally speaking, participants were of the view that race discrimination was subtle and difficult to prove. These responses are consistent with the argument made by many researchers that, in Canada, racism can be pervasive but often can be expressed in subtle forms that makes it more difficult to identify (Allahar 2010; Galabuzi 2006; Warner 2006). Some participants were hesitant to describe their experiences of workplace conflict as race-based, while others preferred to define workplace conflict in terms of personality or attitudinal clashes. Examples of these responses included the following:

JF3¹: "Yes and no; I think it is more based on familiarity versus specific race because I do not think that blacks get more discriminated against as compared to South Asians or East Asians. I think it is more like "I am not familiar with an accent, or you do not sound like or look like me so I would not hire you."

GF2: "You know there has been work place discrimination but I do not think that it was because of gender and I do not think it was race either. It is very difficult to tell so it is very hard for me to say, only because I know that other doors have opened for me, so...."

JM5: "I do not think that just because you may have a dispute with someone of a different race that you should think that it is racism. Sometimes people of all different races simply do not like each other for personal reasons, not necessarily racial reasons."

These interview responses are examples of everyday racism, the notion that racism can be manifested not only through intentional acts of racial bigotry but also in the small, routine practices of day-to-day interaction and an overall denial of racism (Essed 1991). According to Essed, everyday racism can be manifested in many forms including marginalization, containment, assimilation, patronage, cultural oppression and an

¹ Note that in an effort to preserve the anonymity of interview participants, each participant was assigned a coded name on the basis of country of birth, gender and the order in which the interviews took place. For example, JF3 refers to the third immigrant woman from Jamaica that was interviewed.

overall denial of racism (Essed 1991). Participant's everyday racial experiences may also be examples of micro-aggression, experiences of racism that may appear to be rather innocuous at first but have been found to have a cumulative effect (Gosein and Pon 2011). Micro-aggression can be demonstrated in many ways including verbal insults, non-verbal exchanges such as avoidant behavior, dismissive glances, body language, having one's work more directly scrutinized than a non-racialized person's, and conveying stereotypical assumptions about a racialized group (Gosein and Pon 2011; Wing Sue et al. 2007; Solorzano 1998). The perpetrators of these acts are often unaware, and these exchanges are so pervasive and automatic in everyday conversations and interactions that they are often dismissed or are glossed over as being innocent (Wing Sue et al. 2007). However, micro-aggression can make the workplace more inhospitable to some workers than others, render them invisible, lower expectations and impact a person's self-confidence, the cumulative effect of which can serve as impediments to job performance (Gosein and Pon 2011; Solorzano 1998; Wing Sue et al. 2007).

Management Opportunities

After finding employment, discrimination can still affect opportunities to advance and levels of earnings (Henry 1999). Studies have shown that racialized immigrants in Toronto have experienced upward mobility barriers in the labour market that they perceived as racially based (Warner 2006; James 2009; Dion and Kawakami 1996). Similarly, a general sentiment among our participants was a feeling that race was a major factor in determining access to opportunities for promotion. Examples of these responses included the following:

TM3: "Management, particularly higher management were all of one gender and one nationality. They might give you a little supervisory role which is lower level management, but you will not go any further than that."

GM5: "For my promotions, they did not expect me to be as aggressive as I was and my aggression was what moved me up. I do not think that I actually got any promotions in the beginning without me going and saying that here is what I have done, whereas other people got it automatically once they had done well."

Many of our respondents felt that Toronto's employers often see immigrants as incapable of performing well at the management level. The majority of our participants held degrees from Canadian universities; however, visible minority immigrants educated in Canada can also face labour market disadvantages (Pendakur and Pendakur 1998; de Silva 1997). Researchers have found that within Canadian society, immigrants are often viewed as unlikely to possess the educational credentials required for employment in certain occupations (James 1994). Other researchers have highlighted the importance of social capital, as high-ranking management and professional positions and internal promotions are often filled through informal social networks which can serve to exclude immigrants (Liu 2007). Some participants were concerned Caribbean immigrants are not sufficiently represented in decision-making positions and that this

limited their access to the informal networks or hiring processes that are a feature of Canadian job recruitment.

Discrimination from Junior Staff

Some participants reported that they had experienced race-based abuse from their white junior staff, largely because of resentment of the fact that they, as a white Canadian, had to report to a minority immigrant person. Examples of these responses included the following:

GM5: “I could remember having a young white gentleman working for me who told me that ‘in Canada we are supposed to get increases.’ I did not think that he had performed well enough, he reported to me and I said, ‘Well where I come from you have to earn it.’ So there was this feeling that this immigrant who had come into this position should not be telling me what to do, from some of my juniors.”

JF4: “Yes. I had just started working at my new job but there were other people working there before me and I found that I was moving up faster than some people. I remember this young lady came to me one night and said ‘I am white and the manager is white and you are black, how come you are getting to do this kind of work?’ I told her it was because I always do good work.”

These everyday supervisor–subordinate relations are also examples of everyday racism that can contribute to toxicity of the workplace and affect productivity. The academic discourse suggests that racial prejudices can be acquired, shared and reproduced within the white dominant group through everyday conversations, while the implications of these exchanges continue to be unacknowledged or denied (van Dijk 1992; Gosein and Pon 2011). These everyday experiences can undermine the performance of racialized managers and reinforce the negative perceptions that racialized persons are not suitable for management positions.

Several participants also reported that their employers have adopted diversity policies aimed at promoting inclusiveness and racial sensitivity in the workplace, for example,

TM2: “In my company, it is very diverse; we have diversity surveys every year where we answer questions on what we feel and what we think about diversity in the workplace.”

Researchers examining measures to combat racial discrimination in the workplace have proposed development of inclusion frameworks, to dismantle barriers to participation faced by Canada’s immigrants (Omidvar and Richmond 2005; Liu 2007; Fearon and Wald 2011). The key argument is that Canada’s employers need to be encouraged to implement diversity policies aimed at fostering inclusiveness and erasing false stereotypes about immigrants.

Stereotypes

Studies have shown that many of Canada's black immigrants believed that their failure to obtain employment opportunities is linked to race-based stereotyping and that they had to work harder than other employees to retain their jobs (James 2009; Henry and Ginzberg 1985). A number of our participants also felt that Toronto's employers harboured negative perceptions about Caribbean workers, for example,

JF5: "Yes with a recent interview I had, the interviewer (a white Canadian woman) jokingly, she disguised it at the end as a joke, but she said to me 'I know you are Jamaican, but you guys have to be on time for this job'."

GF1: "I think that people have stereotypes about West Indian people; that we are lazy and stuff like that because I think that, for the most part, they believe that West Indians have a fairly laid back attitude towards work."

GM1: "When I first applied for a job here, the man who interviewed me said to me that this job requires intelligence, skills and knowledge, he went through a whole litany of things; and then he said to me 'I do not think that you possess any of these qualities.' And this position was one of the lower level positions in the organization. I think that that decision he made was based on my race. By the way, later in life that interviewer, well he ended up reporting to me."

One Caribbean immigrant woman of South Asian descent felt that her family name was relatively non-English sounding and wondered whether this was a labour market obstacle:

TF3: "I have applied for many jobs, but I have not received acknowledgement for most of them. I might have received an automated response for about three of them and I would say that I have applied for more than one hundred. So I have believed that it is my name, the way it looks. Obviously my experience is not taken into consideration because I have a lot of experience; I have a lot of years of teaching experience. And I still have not been called. I do not know if my name is an obstacle because my name is relatively non-English sounding."

Experimental studies have also found that resumes from applicants with non-English-sounding last names were less likely to move forward in the job application process (Oreopoulos 2011; Henry and Ginzberg 1985). A number of our participants also felt that Toronto's employers were hesitant to hire immigrants and that when they identified themselves as an immigrant, it sometimes resulted in them being screened out of the hiring process. Examples of these responses included the following:

JM2: "I sense that there is a hesitance to hire immigrants and that hesitance may come from the fact that they were not introduced to them by their network."

GM6: "No, I do not think that my race has been a factor, just the fact that I came from somewhere else other than Canada."

One Jamaican immigrant woman felt that it was necessary to hide the fact that she was a newcomer to Canada as a result of past experiences of conflict with her co-workers:

JF2: "I do not know if it is related to race or to the fact that I am a newcomer, but what I have found myself doing is that; I am cautious in telling persons that I am a newcomer, because of my experiences with co-workers. You know it is a system that thrives on what you call seniority, so if that person was there before then it is likely that that person would get promotion before somebody who has just come in like myself. Now in my case I felt some sort of hostility, for example, when I got a promotion. There was definitely some hostility coming from other team members."

Other participants felt that being an immigrant meant that they had to work harder than non-immigrant persons to prove themselves, for example,

GM1: "Well, it is always an uphill battle, in the sense that, well my sense about it is that from looking not just at myself but at others, you have to be like four times better to be even considered. Yes, and can I add that I think, no it is not that I think, I am pretty sure that people like us we are the least to be considered; the last to be considered."

However, while participants believed and that this bias was an obstacle to them finding jobs, a number of participants also felt that employers were generally pleased when they hired Caribbean immigrants who performed well. An example of these responses was as follows:

GF7: "I think that there might be preconceived notions about your abilities and so on, so that they are taken aback when they see the level of skills you have."

Some participants indicated that they made efforts to conform, by adjusting their appearance so as to minimize the negative perceptions associated with persons of their race:

GF3: "In one job, what was very interesting is that in one job I kept my hair very much in its natural state which was very curly or kinky as some would say. Then at some point my hair dresser took it upon herself to straighten my hair and immediately so many people in my workplace started smiling and talking with me. I found that to be very remarkable; sad to say because I really believe in being myself."

GM5: "I think that the image of being black is something that did affect me from the perspective that; I had a beard, but I refused to cut mine, I cut it low but I refused to shave it. So in being yourself there was some conformity there. But you had white Canadians who had beards, but they did not go through the same scenarios that we went through. So you have to associate that with race."

Many Canadian employers place a low value on immigrant human capital, and this has resulted in poor employment outcomes for many immigrants. A number of studies have linked labour market disadvantage to immigrant status (Christofides and Swidinsky 1994; Fearon and Wald 2011). James (2009) found that the social construction of Caribbean immigrants as ‘outsiders’ on the basis of their race informs the way that they are treated, their participation in society and levels of economic and social attainment. A 1996 study similarly concluded that visible minorities perceived greater discrimination towards their group than did white minorities, and black respondents perceived higher levels of discrimination than other groups (Dion and Kawakami 1996). Other researchers have found that employers view immigrants as persons who need help, because of their inability to integrate into the mainstream labour market (Liu 2007), or that Canadian employers are often concerned that immigrants may lack critical language skills for performing well on the job (Oreopoulos 2011). To combat these perceptions requires expansion of initiatives aimed at educating Canada’s employers about the actual benefits and advantages of immigrant recruitment. Researchers have also highlighted the need for more transparency in hiring practices, better evaluation of the human capital of racialized persons and better regulation of working conditions (Teelucksingh and Galabuzi 2007; Creese and Wiebe 2012).

Accents

Participants also felt that their Caribbean accent was a labour market obstacle. Examples of these responses include the following:

GF3: “One of the jobs that I applied for; the interviewer asked me the set of usual questions; there was no Human rights Code in those days so they could ask you any question including your racial origin; and, she said that “you know given your accent, I do not think that you would be a good person to do this job.”

TF2: “Yes I would say yes I faced obstacles; and well I am interpreting this to have to do with my accent and with my skin colour. I would say yes, because my English and my knowledge of English are actually better than a lot of people who were born here who are not racial minorities.”

Some participants from Jamaica believed that Canadian employers associated Caribbean immigrants with heavy accents, with lower levels of skill and ability than other groups of accented immigrants.

JF5: “The moment employers see Caribbean immigrants, especially those of us who are accented, the idea is that we are not as well educated as someone who is non-accented. That is the general notion and I think that is projected onto every accented person in every situation, whether it be a job interview or in performing a service.”

GM2: “Accents, this is a discussion I have had with other people and well this is something that is definitely seen as a problem, although you have many people

who have come to Canada as immigrants from Europe and had accents, Irish accents etc., at the time this was seen as a cool thing, until recently.”

GM5: “Well in Canada, people who come from the Caribbean, particularly with what they would call an accent are sometimes excluded from some jobs at the lower levels. At the higher levels not as much, but what is very interesting is that a Chinese guy would come to Canada and have a worse accent from my perspective and a lack of command of English, but would not suffer the same setbacks as someone who came from the Caribbean and had a better command of English.”

Jamaican participants were also concerned that their accent was an obstacle, and a number of them reported that they took steps to get rid of their accents soon after arrival. Examples of responses included the following:

JF3: “I got rid of my accent because people said that that could potentially be a barrier. Plus, growing up I don’t think that I have a thick Jamaican accent to begin with and my schools always focused on speaking the “Queen’s English” so I believe that impacted ability to adapt.”

JF5: “I had a part-time job while I was in school, but initially the employer had said that I would not be able to do it because I was heavily accented. I found that to be a little bit ridiculous because most of the supervisors were also accented. Everyone had an accent as well so the fact that they were recruiting non-accented persons and discriminating against me because of that is a bit of irony, right. I made a conscious effort to lose the accent.”

These responses are similar to other studies that identified discrimination experienced by minority persons, based on first language and accent, as well as cultural affiliation linked to an individual’s name (Wilson et al. 2011; Creese and Wiebe 2012; Henry and Ginzberg 1985). This negative stereotyping is linked to the racialization process through which society constructs racial categories on the basis of factors like accents, names, beliefs, practices and place of origin (Agnew 2009; Galabuzi 2006; Creese and Wiebe 2012). This has resulted in some groups experiencing disadvantage and discrimination which in turn leads to differential labour market outcomes.

Discrimination from other Minority Groups

A number of participants also reported experiences of race-based discrimination from other immigrant groups. Examples of these responses included the following:

GM2: “There is this feeling though, and this is an important thing for you to look at. Usually when we talk about racism we talk about a Canadian white versus a non-white experience. But a lot of people, and I am sure there must be studies on this, a large chunk of our employers are immigrants themselves and they are brown or they are non-white. They employ people of colour who complain of racism or what I call ‘shadism’.”

TF2: “I have seen a lot of people face discrimination in the workplace. I have seen people bullied because they were racial minorities, and this was not necessarily by the larger white community. I have seen racial minorities bully other racial minorities. So my point is that as far as discrimination goes no one race has monopoly over racism, although some groups are in positions of power and in positions where they can exercise it more.”

Researchers have also argued that not enough attention is paid to intra-racial colour hierarchies and discrimination, in that it does not adequately explore the prejudicial treatment faced by multiracial persons or other individuals within a racial or ethnic group (Treviño et al. 2008; Griffith 2013). Among my interview participants, not many of their Canadian employers were minority persons, but some found that minority employers are sometimes hesitant to employ immigrants. However, the significance of intra-racial colour hierarchies among sub-groups of Canadian immigrants remains an under-studied area.

Gender-Based Discrimination

More than half of our interview participants also felt that Toronto’s employers discriminated against Caribbean immigrants on the basis of gender. There was a general sense that although women have made some significant strides toward parity, there was still labour market discrimination against immigrant women. A number of researchers have argued that although labour force participation rates of women have been advancing towards those of men’s in recent years, employment segregation continues to be a major concern (Lee 2008; Galabuzi 2006; Preston and Giles 2004; Tatsoglou and Preston 2006; Creese and Wiebe 2012). Examples of responses from informants who reported that they had witnessed gender-based discrimination in their workplaces included the following:

TF1: “Yes. Not me directly, but I have seen it around me where men have applied for positions and women have also applied for it, and the women is more experienced but the man gets the job.”

TF4: “For me no, but I know of other people who have experienced it, actually not just based on gender but based on maternity, they were treated differently because they were pregnant.”

Many of our interview participants also felt that women were still clustered in employment in female-dominated occupations including administration, banking and customer service. One participant from Guyana was particularly concerned that, as a woman, she was expected to know how to type:

GF3: “I hated the fact that as a woman, I was expected to know how to type. I always wondered if that there was some equally stupid question that they asked men. When we first came and my husband got a job in Toronto, I went to the

employment agencies but none of them would register me because I did not type forty words a minute or whatever it is that they wanted.”

These findings are consistent with findings from other studies that immigrant women’s employment has been found to be primarily part-time, contract work, and women are seldom found to be employed in a field commensurate with their training (Wilson et al. 2011; Preston and Giles 2004; Tattsoglou and Preston 2006). Unfortunately, in the context of this study, a number of research participants also felt that Caribbean immigrant women still did not have easy access even to employment opportunities in the female-dominated occupations, for example,

TF3: “Within teaching I am not sure. I think it is more of a race issue. I know people who were doing the MEd (Master of Education) with me and did not have even the kind of experience that I have, but they were able to get substitute teaching positions; and I have never been even put on a list. These are women and that is why I cannot say that there is a gender bias here.”

Some male participants also reported that they worked in sectors that largely excluded women from employment. The following responses demonstrate this:

GM1: Yes, I believe so and I can give you an example. I recall when we got a new President for this company, and he said that he did not understand how come there were so many women in senior positions, at the time there was about a fifty/fifty split between men and women VPs, but within six months there was only one woman left.”

TM6: “My profession is more male dominated because it requires hours of work and work schedules that may not be as appropriate for women.”

These responses reinforce the argument from a number of other studies that have found that traditional gender ideologies and divisions of labour have reduced immigrant women’s prospects of finding employment and relegated them to low-paying jobs (Tattsoglou and Preston 2006; Boyd and Yiu 2009; McCoy and Masuch 2007; Creese and Wiebe 2012). Employment segregation continues to be a major concern, and immigrant women have increasingly found themselves relegated to the female-dominated occupations in administration and the services sector (Lee 2008; Galabuzi 2006; Preston and Giles 2004; Tattsoglou and Preston 2006; McCoy and Masuch 2007). Other studies have found that employment segregation has been a phenomenon of the health care sectors in Canada that has resulted in racialized women mostly concentrated within lower-level nursing work (e.g., cooking, cleaning and laundering), thus creating a racially segmented workforce (Das Gupta 1996; Lo et al. 2000; Hagey et al. 2001). As such, researchers have called for the development of government policies to address these gender inequities in the labour market and ensure that immigrant women do not remain at the bottom of the gendered labour market (Creese and Wiebe 2012; Tattsoglou and Preston 2006). An important note is that all three interview participants who reported that they were unemployed at the time of the interviews were women and recent university graduates. This is indicative of the level

of difficulty that Caribbean immigrant women have experienced to find suitable employment in Canada.

A number of participants from Jamaica believed that immigrant Caribbean women were finding it easier to transition into the Ontario labour market than Caribbean immigrant men. Examples of these responses included the following:

JM1: “Well the funny thing about it, at least from the Caribbean right, what I found that was consistent was that the women, like if a couple came up, the woman would get a job right away but it was harder for the guys.”

JM6: “There is an ego thing happening here too, where you know the men used to be the breadwinners and now the women are becoming the breadwinners in the family and are in the positions to get a job and bring home an income. It is a situation where it is hard to pin down the exact reasons for it, but it seems to me that that girls seem to have a bit of an edge in getting ahead.”

However, the tendency for immigrant Caribbean women to integrate into the labour market more quickly than their male counterparts may relate in part to their willingness to accept low-skilled jobs, particularly in the early period after entry into Canada. The following interview response is reflective of this:

JF3: “Interestingly I think that women transition into the labour market easier than men. I do not know what factors influence that because I am not a man, but I think that with certain professions it is skewed towards certain genders. I have done some studies looking at the diaspora and people immigrating into Canada and their experiences; a lot of the time the women tend to land on their feet easier because they can take a factory job or you know, or do something that may be low paying.”

These responses are similar to a number of other studies that have shown that many highly educated Caribbean and African immigrant women in Canada have only been able to obtain employment in low-status jobs doing what is traditionally considered to be ‘women’s work’ (Elabor-Idemudia 2000; Creese and Wiebe 2012; Das Gupta 1996). Other studies have found that immigrant women are confronted by structural and conditional barriers to labour market entry and, as a result, fewer women held managerial or professional positions than men (James et al. 1999; Tatsoglou and Preston 2006). These women have limited power and therefore restricted access to well-paid jobs in the professions for which they have been trained.

Combination of Gender and Race Discrimination

A number of participants felt that Caribbean immigrant women faced the double disadvantage of being discriminated against on the basis of both race and gender. Examples of these responses included the following:

TF2: “I had several managers during the last ten years and one manager and one director in particular targeted me because of my gender as well as because of my skin colour. I honestly believe it is that, because as I was saying they treated my male co-workers differently.”

TF5: “Yes, not only gender but also based on the fact that I am a visible minority. There were job opportunities that I knew I was qualified for but that was given to another person because of their background; because they were not a visible minority.”

These responses are consistent with studies that have concluded that immigrant women in Canada have experienced discrimination based on both gender and birthplace (Shamsuddin 1998; Boyd and Yiu 2009; Creese and Wiebe 2012). Studies of the experiences of nurses in Ontario also found similar patterns of racism faced by African-Canadian nurses, concluding that participant nurses were subjected to racism, sexism and classism (Das Gupta 1996; Hagey et al. 2001). Other studies have shown that race is the most significant factor when combined with social processes that devalue women and women’s work (Lightman and Gingrich 2012). Similarly, our respondents felt that they had experienced discrimination based on both their race and gender that negatively impacted their labour market outcomes.

Summary and Policy Implications

This study has found qualitative evidence that discrimination exists in Toronto’s labour market and that this discrimination is negatively influencing labour market outcomes for Caribbean immigrants. Our participants have felt discrimination to the extent that they believe Canadian employers harbour negative opinions about the skill and work ethic of Caribbean workers. The mere sound of a Caribbean accent in particular is believed to send a negative signal to employers, and there is the concern that some of Canada’s employers believe that accented persons are less capable than other workers. A significant number of participants in this study also believed that their race was a barrier to their access to opportunities for promotion into management positions, and of those that held management positions, many of them had experienced race-based conflict from junior staff, who resented having a reporting relationship with a minority person. Participants have also encountered everyday experiences of racial micro-aggression in their private conversations and interactions in the workplace, the cumulative effect of which may have served as impediments to their job performance (Gosein and Pon 2011; Solorzano 1998; Wing Sue et al. 2007; Essed 1991). There is also qualitative evidence that Caribbean immigrant women experience gender-based labour market discrimination, and participants were also particularly concerned about the double disadvantage of being discriminated against on the basis of both race and gender. A key conclusion of this study is that additional research and policy focus is required to address dual impacts of race- and gender-based discrimination in Toronto’s labour market.

This study has contributed to a growing body of evidence of discrimination in the Canadian labour market. The exact impact of race and gender on labour market

outcomes may be difficult to quantify, but many immigrants believe that there is an impact and it is hard to ignore the growing body of research that suggests that Canada's employers do not treat minority workers fairly. In Canada, an immigrant's race or gender may actually be more significant factors in determining access to the labour market than educational qualifications or work experience.

This study maintains that there is a disjuncture between the valuation of immigrant human capital at the policy level and the understanding of human capital on the ground. There is an element of discrimination at play in Canada's employers' valuation of immigrant's education and work experience, which are the core human capital criterion on which Canada's immigration selection policies are based. Canada's immigration policy continues to place too much emphasis on refinements to measures aimed at recruiting a continuous supply of high-skilled labour. The federal skilled worker program is already very successful in this regard. Canada's recent immigrants are more highly educated and skilled compared to earlier cohorts (Omidvar and Richmond 2005; Alboim and McIssac 2007). In addition, improved selection criteria do not address the concerns of the large number of high-skilled immigrants already in Canada, who are experiencing great difficulty in realizing their labour market objectives. What is required is an increased policy focus on issues that affect labour market demand to ensure that high-skilled immigrants can successfully integrate into the Canadian labour market and economy.

To eliminate race-based discrimination in the Canadian labour market requires a fundamental shift in attitudes and practices that relate to employing minority persons and immigrant women in particular. To facilitate change requires that Canada's employers be made more aware of the skills and competences of foreign skilled workers. Less policy focus should be placed on promoting the narrow idea that employers need to hire more newcomers and more emphasis should be centred on educating employers about the actual benefits and advantages of immigrant recruitment (Liu 2007). Government, employers, trade unions and bodies that regulate professions and trades must work together, to develop policies to eliminate barriers to equal access to employment faced by minority persons in Canada. There is also need for more transparency in hiring practices, better evaluation of the human capital of racialized persons, and increased policy focus on the creation of well-paid employment and for better regulation of working conditions for immigrants in Canada (Teelucksingh and Galabuzi 2007).

From the perspective of gender-based discrimination, Canada's immigrant policies do not adequately address the needs of immigrant women. Far too much emphasis is placed on education and work experience, and policies largely ignore the fact that the value of women's work is viewed differently in the Canadian market, than that of men's work. A number of academics have called for women-specific public policies and programs aimed at directly addressing the persistent inequities faced by women (Hankivsky 2007; Orsini and Smith 2007; Tattsoglou and Preston 2006). A gender-based approach is not very evident in terms of the actual implementation of labour market programs, and government's immigration policy is noticeably silent on the issue of gender-based labour market discrimination.

References

- Agnew, V. (2009). Introduction. In V. Agnew (Ed.), *Racialized migrant women in Canada—essays on health, violence and equity* (pp. 3–36). Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Alboim, N., & McIssac, E. (2007). Making the connections—Ottawa's role in immigrant employment. *Immigration and Refugee Policy, 13*(3), 1–24.
- Allahar, A. (2010). The political economy of 'race' and class in Canada's Caribbean diaspora. *American Review of Political Economy, 8*(2), 54–86.
- Anisef, P., Sweet, R., & Frempong, G. (2003). *Labour Market Outcomes of Immigrant and Racial Minority University Graduates in Canada*. Toronto: Joint Centre of Excellence for Research on Immigration and Settlement (CERIS).
- Arat-Koc, S. (2009). The politics of family and immigration in the subordination of domestic workers in Canada. In B. Fox (Ed.), *Family Patterns Gender Relations* (pp. 496–506). Oxford: Oxford University Press.
- Aylward, C. (1999). *Canadian critical race theory: racism and the law*. Winnipeg: Fernwood Publishing.
- Basran, G. S. (1983). Canadian immigration policy and theories of racism. In P. Li & B. Singh Bolaria (Eds.), *Racial minorities in multicultural Canada* (pp. 3–14). Toronto: Garamond Press.
- Block, S., & Galabuzi, G.-E. (2011). *Canada's colour coded labour market*. Toronto: Wellesley Institute.
- Bowles, S., & Gintis, H. (1975). The problem with human capital theory—a Marxian critique. *American Economic Review, 65*(2), 74–82.
- Boyd, M., & Yiu, J. (2009). Immigrant women and earnings inequality in Canada. In V. Agnew (Ed.), *Racialized migrant women in Canada—essays on health, violence and equity* (pp. 208–232). Toronto: Toronto University Press.
- Canada. (2009). *Facts and Figures 2008*. Ottawa: Citizenship and Immigration Canada.
- Cardozo, A., & Pendakur, R. (2008). *Canada's visible minority population: 1967-2017*. Vancouver: Metropolis British Columbia.
- Christofides, L. N., & Swidinsky, R. (1994). Wage determination by gender and visible minority status: evidence from the 1989 LMAS. *Canadian Public Policy, 20*(1), 34–51.
- Colin, L. (2007). *Profiles of ethnic communities in Canada—the Caribbean community in Canada 2001*. Ottawa: Statistics Canada.
- Creese, G., & Wiebe, B. (2012). Survival employment: gender and deskilling among African immigrants in Canada. *International Migration, 50*(5), 56–76.
- Darity, W. A. (1982). The human capital approach to Black-White earnings inequality: some unsettled questions. *The Journal of Human Resources, 17*(1), 72–93.
- Das Gupta, T. (1996). Anti-Black racism in nursing in Ontario. *Studies in Political Economy, 51*, 97–116.
- D'Costa, R. (1987). *Canadian immigration policy: a chronological review with particular reference to discrimination. Conference on Canada 2000: Race Relations and Public Policy* (pp. 1–19). Ottawa: Carleton University.
- de Silva, A. (1997). Wage discrimination against visible minority men in Canada. *Canadian Business Economics, 5*(4), 25–42.
- Dion, K., & Kawakami, K. (1996). Ethnicity and perceived discrimination in Toronto: another look at the personal/group discrimination discrepancy. *Canadian Journal of Behavioural Science, 28*(3), 203–221.
- Elabor-Idemudia, P. (2000). Challenges confronting African immigrant women in the Canadian Workforce. In A. Calliste & G. J. Dei (Eds.), *Anti-racist feminism—critical race and gender studies* (pp. 91–110). Halifax: Fernwood Publishing.
- Essed, P. (1991). *Understanding everyday racism: an interdisciplinary theory*. Newbury Park: Sage Publications.
- Faraday, F. (2014). *Profiting from the Precarious: how recruitment practices exploit migrant workers*. Toronto: Metcalfe Foundation.
- Fearon, G., & Wald, S. (2011). The earnings gap between Black and White workers in Canada: evidence from the 2006 Census. *Industrial Relations, 66*(3), 324–348.
- Galabuzi, G.-E. (2006). *Canada's economic apartheid—the social exclusion of racialized groups in the new century*. Toronto: Canadian Scholars' Press.
- Gilmore, J. (2008). *The immigrant labour force analysis series: the Canadian immigrant labour market in 2006: analysis by region or country of birth*. Ottawa: Statistics Canada.
- Gosein, K., & Pon, G. (2011). On the front lines: the voices and experiences of racialized child welfare workers in Toronto, Canada. *Journal of Progressive Human Services, 22*, 135–159.

- Green, A. (2004). The goals of Canada's immigration policy: a historical perspective. *Canadian Journal of Urban Research*, 13, 102–139.
- Green, A. D., & Worswick, C. (2009). *Entry earnings of immigrant men in Canada: the roles of labour market entry effects and returns to foreign experience*. Ottawa: Citizenship and Immigration Canada.
- Griffith, A. (2013). *Policy arrogance of innocent bias—resetting citizenship and multiculturalism*. Ottawa: Anar Press.
- Hagey, R., Choudhry, U., Guruge, S., Turriffin, J., Collins, E., & Lee, R. (2001). Immigrant nurses' experience of racism. *Journal of Nursing Scholarship*, 33(4), 389–394.
- Hankivsky, O. (2007). Gender mainstreaming in the Canadian context. In M. Orsini & M. Smith (Eds.), *Critical policy studies* (pp. 111–135). Vancouver: UBC Press.
- Hawkesworth, M. (2010). From constitutive outside to the politics of extinction: critical race theory, feminist theory, and political theory. *Political Research Quarterly*, 63(3), 686–696.
- Henry, F. (1999). Two studies of racial discrimination in employment. In J. Curtis, E. Grabb, & N. Guppy (Eds.), *Social Inequality in Canada—patterns, problems, and priorities* (pp. 226–235). Toronto: Prentice-Hall.
- Henry, F., & Ginzberg, E. (1985). *Who gets the job: a test of racial discrimination in employment*. Toronto: Urban Alliance on Race Relations and Social Planning Council of Metropolitan Toronto.
- Hiebert, D. (2006). *Beyond the polemics: the economic outcomes of Canadian immigration*. Vancouver: Metropolis Vancouver Centre of Excellence.
- James, C. (1994). The paradox of power and privilege—race, gender and occupational position. *Canadian Woman Studies*, 14, 47–51.
- James, C. (2007). Reverse racism? Students' responses to equity programs. In T. D. Gupta, C. E. James, R. C. Maaka, G. E. Galabuzi, & C. Andersen (Eds.), *Race and racialization essential readings* (pp. 356–362). Toronto: Canadian Scholars' Press.
- James, C. (2009). African-Caribbean Canadians working “harder” to attain their immigrant dreams: context, strategies, and consequences. *A Journal of the Caribbean and its Diasporas*, 12, 92–108.
- James, C. (2010). *Seeing ourselves—exploring race, ethnicity and culture*. Toronto: Thompson Educational Publishing, Inc.
- James, C., Plaza, D., & Jansen, C. (1999). Issues of race in employment: experiences of Caribbean Women in Toronto. *Canadian Woman Studies*, 19, 129–133.
- Kelley, N., & Trebilcock, M. (2010). *The making of the mosaic—a history of Canadian immigration policy*. Toronto: University of Toronto Press.
- Knowles, V. (2007). *Strangers at our gates. Canadian Immigration and Immigration Policy, 1540-2006*. Toronto: Dundurn Press.
- Kushner, K. E., & Morrow, R. (2003). Grounded theory, feminist theory. *Critical Theory. Towards Theoretical Triangulation. Advances in Nursing Science*, 26(1), 30–43.
- Lee, J.-A. (2008). Immigrant women workers in the immigrant settlement sector. In M. Wallis & S. Kwok (Eds.), *The deepening racialization and feminization of poverty in Canada* (pp. 103–112). Toronto: Canadian Scholars Press.
- Lightman, N., & Gingrich, L. G. (2012). The intersecting dynamics of social exclusion: age, gender, race and immigration status in Canada's labour market. *Canadian Ethnic Studies*, 44(3), 121–145.
- Liu, E. (2007). *A descriptive study of employers' attitudes and practices in hiring newcomer job seekers*. Toronto: CERIS - The Ontario Metropolis Centre.
- Lo, L., Preston, V., Wang, S., Reil, K., Harvey, E., & Siu, B. (2000). *Immigrants' Economic Status in Toronto: Rethinking Settlement and Integration Strategies*. Toronto: Joint Centre of Excellence for Research on Immigration and Settlement (CERIS).
- McCoy, L., & Masuch, C. (2007). Beyond “entry-level” jobs: immigrant women and non-regulated professional occupations. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*, 8(2), 185–206.
- Omidvar, R., & Richmond, T. (2005). Immigrant settlement and social inclusion in Canada. *CERIS Policy Matters*, 16, 1–5.
- Oreopoulos, P. (2011). Why do skilled immigrants struggle in the labor market? field experiment with thirteen thousand resumes. *American Economic Journal: Economic Policy*, 3(4), 148–171.
- Orsini, M., & Smith, M. (2007). Critical Policy Studies. In M. Orsini & M. Smith (Eds.), *Critical Policy Studies* (pp. 1–16). Vancouver: UBC Press.
- Pendakur, K., & Pendakur, R. (1998). The colour of money: earnings differentials among ethnic groups in Canada. *The Canadian Journal of Economics*, 31(3), 518–548.
- Pendakur, R., & Pendakur, K. (2011). *Colour by numbers: minority earnings in Canada 1996-2006*. Vancouver: Metropolis British Columbia.

- Preston, V., & Giles, W. (2004). *Employment experiences of highly skilled immigrant women: where are they in the labour market. gender & work: knowledge production in practice* (pp. 1–32). Toronto: York University.
- Reitz, J. G. (2001). Immigrant skill utilization in the Canadian labour market: implications of human capital research. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*, 2(3), 347–378.
- Reitz, J. G. (2007). Immigrant employment success in Canada, Part I: individual and contextual causes. *International Journal of Migration and Integration*, 8(1), 11–36.
- Rexhepi, J., & Torres, C. A. (2011). Reimagining critical theory. *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, 32, 679–698.
- Richmond, T., & Shields, J. (2005). NGO-government relations and immigrant services: contradictions and challenges. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*, 6(3–4), 513–526.
- Satzewich, V. (1991). *Racism and the incorporation of foreign labour—farm labour migration to Canada since 1945*. London and New York: Routledge.
- Shamsuddin, A. (1998). The double-negative effect on the earnings of foreign-born females in Canada. *Applied Economics*, 30, 1187–1201.
- Simmons, A. (1998). Racism and immigration policy. In V. Satzewich (Ed.), *Racism and Social Inequality in Canada* (pp. 87–130). Toronto: Thompson Educational Publishing, Inc.
- Solorzano, D. (1998). Critical race theory, race and gender microaggressions, and the experience of Chicana and Chicano scholars. *Qualitative Studies in Education*, 11(1), 121–136.
- Somerville, K., & Walsworth, S. (2010). Admission and employment criteria discrepancies: experiences of skilled immigrants in Toronto. *Journal of International Migration and Integration*, 11(3), 341–352.
- Statistics Canada. (2010). *Statistics Canada, 2006 Census of Population, Statistics Canada (Catalogue no. 97-564-XCB2006008)*. Retrieved 06 26, 2013, from [www12.statcan.ca/ezproxy.lib.ryerson.ca/census-recensement/2006/dp-pd/prof/sip/Rp-eng.cfm?TABID=1&LANG=E&A=R&APATH=3&DETAIL=1&DIM=0&FL=A&FREE=0&GC=535&GID=838003&GK=10&GRP=1&O=D&PID=97613&PRID=0&PTYPE=97154&S=0&SHOWALL=0&SUB=0&Temporal=2006&THEME=7](http://www12.statcan.ca/ezproxy/lib.ryerson.ca/census-recensement/2006/dp-pd/prof/sip/Rp-eng.cfm?TABID=1&LANG=E&A=R&APATH=3&DETAIL=1&DIM=0&FL=A&FREE=0&GC=535&GID=838003&GK=10&GRP=1&O=D&PID=97613&PRID=0&PTYPE=97154&S=0&SHOWALL=0&SUB=0&Temporal=2006&THEME=7)
- Steinberg, S. (1985). Human capital: a critique. *The Review of Black Political Economy*, 14, 67–74.
- Tattsoglou, E., & Preston, V. (2006). *Gender, immigration and labour market integration: what we are and what we still need to know*. Toronto: CERIS- The Ontario Metropolis Centre.
- Teelucksingh, C., & Galabuzi, G. E. (2007). Working precariously: the impact of race and immigrants status on employment opportunities and outcomes in Canada. In T. D. Gupta, C. E. James, R. C. Maaka, G. E. Galabuzi, & C. Andersen (Eds.), *Race and racialization—essential readings* (pp. 202–208). Toronto: Canadian Scholars' Press.
- Tilson, D. (2009). *Temporary foreign workers and non-status workers—report of the standing committee on citizenship and immigration*. Ottawa: Parliament of Canada.
- Treviño, J., Harris, M. A., & Wallace, D. (2008). *What's so critical about critical race theory?* (pp. 7–10). Contemporary Justice Review: Issues in Criminal, Social, and Restorative Justice.
- van Dijk, T. (1992). Discourse and the denial of racism. *Discourse and Society*, 3, 87–118.
- Warner, O. (2006). Encountering Canadian racism: Afro-Trini immigrants in the Greater Toronto area. *Canada. A Journal of the Caribbean and its Diasporas*, 9, 4–37.
- Welch, F. (1975). The human capital approach: an appraisal—human capital theory: education, discrimination and life cycles. *American Economic Association*, 65(2), 63–73.
- Wilson, R., Landolt, P., Shakya, Y., Galabuzi, G. E., Zahoorunissa, I. Z., Pham, D., & Joly, M. (2011). *Working rough, living poor: employment and income insecurities faced by racialized groups in the Black Creek Area and their impacts on health*. Toronto: Access Alliance Multicultural Health and Community Services.
- Wing Sue, D., Capodilupo, C., Torino, G., Bucceri, J., Holder, A., Nadal, K., & Esquilin, M. (2007). Racial microaggressions in everyday life—implications for clinical practice. *American Psychologist*, 62(4), 271–286.
- Yoshida, Y., & Smith, M. R. (2008). Measuring and mismeasuring discrimination against visible minority immigrants: the role of work experience. *Canadian Studies in Population*, 35(2), 311–338.