RESEARCH ARTICLE

Shutong WANG, Tongle HU, Yanling JIAO, Jianjian WEI, Keqiang CAO

Isolation and characterization of *Bacillus subtilis* EB-28, an endophytic bacterium strain displaying biocontrol activity against *Botrytis cinerea* Pers.

© Higher Education Press and Springer-Verlag 2009

Abstract The fungal pathogen Botrytis cinerea Pers. causes severe rotting on tomato fruits during storage and shelf life. As a biological control agent, endophytic bacterium was regarded as an effective alternative to chemical control. Out of 238 endophytic bacterial isolates, three strains (EB-15, EB-28, and EB-122) isolated from Lycopersicum esculentum Mill., Speranskia tuberculata (Bge.) Baill, and Dictamnus dasycarpus Turcz. respectively were found to be strongly antagonistic to the pathogen in vitro and were selected for further in vivo tests. One endophytic bacterium strain, encoded EB-28, was selected from the three in vivo tested isolates. The inhibitive rate of EB-28 reached 71.1% in vitro and 52.4% in vivo. EB-28 was identified as Bacillus subtilis according to its morphological, physiological, and biochemical characteristics and 16S rDNA sequence analysis.

Keywords endophytic bacterium, *Bacillus subtilis*, *Botrytis cinerea* Pers., biological control

1 Introduction

The pathogen *Botrytis cinerea* Pers. causes serious losses in more than 200 crop species worldwide (Williamson et al., 2007). Currently, the use of synthetic fungicides is the primary method to control post-harvest fungal decay (Chen et al., 2008). However, there is a continuing need for more

Received July 24, 2008; accepted October 6, 2008

Jianjian WEI Beijing TEPEC Sunshine Science and Technology Cooperat

Beijing TEPEC Sunshine Science and Technology Cooperation, Beijing 100086, China

effective and safer fungicides, especially those with novel modes of action and resistance-breaking properties, and natural products have a key role to play in the search for such compounds. Scientists have focused on biological methods to protect crops from invasion and infection by the pathogen (Liu et al., 2007). The management of pathogens by the use of antagonistic microorganisms or their secondary metabolites is now considered to be a feasible disease control technology (Han et al., 2005).

B. cinerea is the most destructive on mature or senescent tissues of dicotyledonous hosts, but it usually penetrates into plant tissue at an earlier stage in crop development and remains quiescent for a considerable period before rapidly rotting tissues under a conducive environment, and the host physiology changes. Therefore, serious damage is caused following the harvest of apparently healthy crops and the subsequent transport to distant markets where the losses become evident (Williamson et al., 2007). Endophytes, living for most of their life cycles inside healthy plant tissues, are mutualistic to their hosts. In particular, endophytic bacteria are thought to interact closely with their host plants and can therefore potentially be used as biological control agents in sustainable crop production (Sturz et al., 2000). A variety of endophytes have been reported to have antagonistic activities toward bacterial and fungal pathogens (Lodewyckx et al., 2002; Sessitsch et al., 2004). At least seven products have been approved for use on food and non-food plants in greenhouses, under plastic tunnels, or in the fields in different countries. They have achieved niche markets in situations where heavy use of conventional fungicides is restricted because of accumulating residues or because of the restriction imposed by importing countries (Elad and Stewart, 2004).

The aim of the present study was to isolate endophytic bacteria from *Lycopersicum esculentum* Mill. (tomato), *Speranskiae tuberculatae* (tuberculation speranskia herb), and *Dictamnus dasycarpus* Turcz. Densefruit Pittany Koot-bark, which showed a strong inhibition on the

Shutong WANG, Tongle HU, Yanling JIAO, Keqiang CAO (⊠) Bio-control Center of Plant Disease and Plant Pests of Hebei Province, College of Plant Protection, Agricultural University of Hebei, Baoding 071001, China E-mail: ckq@hebau.edu.cn

growth of *B. cinerea*. A potential endophytic antagonist, *Bacillus subtilis*, denoted as EB-28, effective against the growth of *B. cinerea*, was identified in healthy stems of *L. esculentum* by *in vitro* and *in vivo* screening techniques and was characterized by morphology, physiological tests, and 16S rDNA sequence analysis.

2 Materials and methods

2.1 Isolation of endophytic bacteria

Healthy stems from *L. esculentum* and *S. tuberculata*, and stem bark from *D. dasycarpus* were collected from Baoding, Hebei, in April 2007. The endophytic bacteria were isolated according to the method described by Liu et al. (2001). Three segments were randomly cut from each stem or bark. They were first washed in running water and then had their surface sterilized. The segments were washed again using sterile distilled water in autoclaved Petri dishes and then sectioned to 0.5 cm length using a small knife and placed on potato dextrose agar (PDA: potato, 200 g; dextrose, 20 g; agar, 15 g; distilled water, 1 L). After incubation for 1–2 days at 30°C in the dark, bacteria appeared on the plates and were individually isolated as single colonies on PDA.

2.2 Pathogen inoculum

A strain of *B. cinerea* (MYB01) used for laboratory trials had been isolated from infected tomato fruits with the typical symptom of gray mold in Baoding, China, and identified by its morphological characteristics. The fungal pathogen was cultivated on PDA plates for 10 days at 25°C until sporulation. A monospore isolate was maintained on PDA at 4°C and was subcultured onto fresh PDA plates at one-month intervals. Fresh, 5-mm-diameter mycelia plugs that were cut from the edge of a *B. cinerea* colony that was incubated for 5 days at 25°C were used as inoculum. 2.3 Tomato leaves and cucumber seedling cotyledons

Detached tomato leaves and cucumber seedling cotyledons were used for bioassay. The fourth leaves of the tomato plants (*Lycopersicum esculentum* cv. Hezuo908) and the eight-day-old cucumber seedling cotyledons (*Cucumis sativus* L. cv. Chuangchunmici) were uniform in size and free from wounds and lesions. Thereafter, the leaves were surface-sterilized by soaking in 2% aqueous sodium hypochlorite for 3 min. They were then thoroughly rinsed with sterile distilled water, dried by using sterile filter papers, and finally put into Petri dishes that contained 0.5% water agar medium (Jiao et al., 2009).

2.4 In vitro antagonism experiments

The inhibitory effects of endophytic strains on the growth of B. cinerea were tested in Petri dishes containing the PDA medium. A 5-mm mycelium disc cut from a 5-dayold culture of B. cinerea was deposited in the center of the plates, and bacteria from 2-day-old cultures were streaked across both sides of the mycelium disc approximately 2.5 cm away from the disc center. The plates were then incubated at 25°C for 4 days. The inhibition on fungal growth was evaluated by the reduction percentage of mycelium expansion compared to control plates without bacteria following the formula of Whipps (1987): (R1-R2)/ $R1 \times 100$, where R1 is the farthest radial distance (measured in millimeters) grown by B. cinerea after 4 days of incubation in the direction of the antagonist (a control value), and R2 is the distance of fungal growth from the point of inoculation to the colony margin in the direction of the antagonist. All in vitro antagonism assays were made in triplicate (Fig. 1).

2.5 In vivo antagonism experiments

For each experiment, fresh cultures of the pathogen and the bacterial antagonists were used. To evaluate their



Fig. 1 Description of the in vitro antagonism assay

Note: (a) One mycelial plug of *B. cinerea* was placed at the center of the plate, and the bacterial isolates were streaked across each side of the mycelial plug. The distance between the two microorganisms was 2.5 cm. Plates were then incubated at 25° C for 4 days. (b) The percentage growth inhibition of the fungus was calculated by the formula of Whipps (1987): (R1-R2)/ $R1 \times 100$, where R1 is the farthest radial distance (measured in millimeters) grown by *B. cinerea* after 4 days of incubation in the direction of the antagonist (a control value), and R2 is the distance of fungal growth from the point of inoculation to the colony margin in the direction of the antagonist.

antagonistic activities against B. cinerea on the detached tomato leaves, all bacterial strains selected from in vitro tests were grown for 48 h on Luria-Bertani (LB) medium at 30° C, shaken at $150 \text{ r} \cdot \text{min}^{-1}$. The cells were collected by centrifugation at 4000 r · min⁻¹ and re-suspended with sterilized saline solution (1% NaCl). Bacterial suspension was adjusted to 1×10^8 colony-forming units (CFU) \cdot mL⁻¹. The bacterial concentration was determined by dilution plating on LB plate. After the bacterial suspension was sprayed on the surface of the detached tomato leaves, the leaves were allowed to air dry in a sterile cabinet for up to 60 min, followed by inoculation with a mycelium plug at the center of each leaf. The control treatments included bacterial candidate alone (non-Botrytis inoculated leaves, positive control) and distilled water (Botrytis-inoculated leaves, untreated control). The leaves were then stored in a growth chamber with 16 h of light and 8 h of darkness at 24°C for 48 h. The percentage of disease reduction of the gray mold on the tomato leaves was calculated using the following formula:

Reduction rate $(\%)=(A-B)/A\times 100$,

where A is the lesion diameter recorded in untreated control, and B is the lesion diameter in the infected tomato fruit treated with the antagonists (Sadfi et al., 2008). For each treatment, twelve tomato leaves were assayed (three leaves as one replicate), and the experiment was repeated at least three times.

2.6 Identification of antagonistic bacteria strain EB-28

The antagonistic bacteria strain EB-28 was phenotypically characterized on the basis of morphology, physiological tests, and chemical analysis, and identified according to the methods of Bergey's Manual of Determinative Bacteriology (1994) and Hacene et al. (2004), which were based on the following phenotypic features: colony and cell morphology, motility, spore production, Gram staining, pigmentation, and growth at different NaCl concentrations of 2%, 5%, 7%, and 10% (w/v). Catalase was determined by adding 10 volumes of H₂O₂ to cell culture (18 h) on solid LB medium. H₂S production was performed according to Clarke (1953). Nitrate reduction was assayed by adding 0.2% (w/v) KNO₃ to the liquid LB medium. Voges-Proskauer tests were performed by standard procedures (Barritt, 1936).

16S rRNA gene sequence determination was conducted by extracting chromosomal DNA from a single colony for PCR procedure according to Xiao et al. (2000). 16S rDNA from EB-28 genomic DNA was amplified with the primers 63F 5'-CAGGCCTAACACATGCAAGTC-3' and 1494R 5'-GGTTACCTTGTTACGACTT-3'. The PCR amplification condition was as follows: denaturation at 94°C for 5 min followed by 35 cycles at 94°C for 40 s each, at 56°C for 40 s, and at 72°C for 1.5 min, with another extension at 72°C for 10 min (Guo et al., 2007). The PCR products were purified using a UNIQ-10 gel extraction kit (Shanghai Sangon Biological Engineering Technology & Services Co., Ltd.) and identified by horizontal electrophoresis on 1.2% agarose gel, and then sequenced with an ABI 3100-Avant Genetic Analyzer (Applied Biosystems). The DNA sequence homology searches were performed using the online BLAST search engine in GenBank (available at: http://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov).

2.7 Statistical analyses

The results of the experiments were analyzed with DPS (Data Processing System 3.01) software. The data presented were the mean values of the three replications. The data were subjected to variance analysis, and one-way ANOVA or *t*-test was used to estimate the significance of differences between mean values (P < 0.05).

3 Results

3.1 Screening of effective antagonists in vitro

The results of the *in vitro* screening revealed that seven out of 238 endophytic bacterial isolates (EB-7, EB-11, EB-15, EB-19, EB-28, EB-112, and EB-122) significantly reduced the mycelial growth of *B. cinerea* by forming an inhibition zone (Table 1, Fig. 2(c)). Isolates EB-15, EB-28, and EB-122, which are the representative isolates from *S. tuberculata*, *L. esculentum*, and *D. dasycarpus*, were selected from the *in vivo* test.

 Table 1
 Antagonistic effect of endophytic bacteria strains against

 B cinerea
 Contract of the strain str

endophytic bac- teria strain	original plant	inhibition zone /mm	inhibitory rate/%
EB-7	S. tuberculata	10	60.00
EB-11	S. tuberculata	10	62.50
EB-15	S. tuberculata	11	70.27
EB-19	S. tuberculata	9	58.06
EB-28	L. esculentum	12	71.05
EB-112	D. dasycarpus	9	60.61
EB-122	D. dasycarpus	10	69.44

3.2 Effective antagonist tests in vivo

Isolates EB-15, EB-28, and EB-122, which are the representative isolates from *S. tuberculata, L. esculentum*, and *D. dasycarpus* were tested on cucumber seedling cotyledons and detached tomato leaves. The most effective was the EB-28 that was isolated from the tomato stem, with a percentage of gray mold reduction of 44.8% (cucumber cotyledon) and 52.4% (tomato leaves) (Fig. 2 and Fig. 3).



Fig. 2 In vivo and in vitro test of endophytic antagonistic bacteria to Botrytis cinerea

Note: (a) Antagonistic effect of endophytic bacterium isolates EB-122, EB-15, and EB-28 (a1, a2, and a3) on cucumber seedling cotyledons against tomato gray mold (a4 was the untreated control). (b) Antagonistic effect of endophytic bacterial isolates EB-28 (b2) on detached tomato leaves against gray mold (b1 was the untreated control). (c) Dual cultures of pathogen-antagonists showing (c1) a strong inhibition of radial growth of *B. cinerea* (c2 was the untreated control).



Fig. 3 Inhibitive effect of three effective endophytic bacterium isolates against *B. cinerea* on cucumber cotyledons and tomato leaves

3.3 Characterization and identification of EB-28

The optimum growth occurred in medium containing 2% salt (w/v; Table 2). The EB-28 isolates were Grampositive, motile endospore-forming rods. The spores were spherical or sometimes ellipsoidal and were located at subterminal positions. The spores survived heating at 80°C for at least 10 min. Colonies of EB-28 were 1–2 mm in diameter after being cultivated for 48 h on LB medium, and circular, smooth, and cream-pigmented (Fig. 4). EB-28 was identified as the member of the genera *Bacillus* from its morphological, biochemical, and physiological characteristics (Table 2).

By the 16S rDNA sequence analysis, EB-28 showed 99.1% similarity to *B. subtilis* EF488979. Therefore, it was identified as *B. subtilis* (Fig. 4).

	ED 20		ED 20
characteristic	EB-28	characteristic	EB-28
colonial morphol-	circular	catalase	+
ogy			
cell shape	rod	H ₂ S production	+
spore production	+	nitrate reduction	+
motility	+	vogues-Proskauer	+
		test	
anerobic growth	-	growth tempera-	
		ture	
gram stain	+	4°C	-
growth in presence		10°C	_
of:			
2% NaCl	+	20°C	+
5% NaCl	-	30°C	++
7% NaCl	-	40°C	+
10% NaCl	—	55°C	-

4 Discussion

The aim of this research was to isolate endophytic bacteria with an ability to control or at least reduce the pernicious effects of the pathogen *Botrytis cinerea* Pers. The *in vitro* pre-screening test of dual culture allowed us to select three endophytic bacterium strains. Among the three tested trains, *B. subtilis* EB-28 showed potential as a biocontrol agent for gray mold *in vivo* and may be used in biologically controlling the phytopathogenic fungus *B. cinerea*. Further investigation is needed to verify the effectiveness of EB-28 in field and long-term storage conditions.

It is shown previously that *Bacillus* species was the predominant bacterium of all the isolated endophytic bacteria. When Moundt and Hinckle (1976) isolated the endophytic bacteria from the surface-sterilized ovules and

 Table 2
 Phenotypic characterization of EB-28





Note: (a) and (b) Morphology and endospores of EB-28. (c) Electrophoresis of 16S rDNA of EB-28. (d) Neighbor-joining tree based on 16S rDNA (1468 bases) sequences showing the phylogenetic relationship between EB-28 and other related species of the *Bacillus* sp. Bootstrap values (expressed as percentages of 100 replications) > 70% are given at the nodes.

seeds of 27 plant species, the Bacillus species occurred more frequently than any other species of single bacterial genus, accounting for almost one-third of all bacteria isolated. In the work of Walker et al. (1998), 72 of the 92 isolates obtained from the spermospheres of peas and dwarf French beans were found to be Bacillus species. Recent studies undertaken by Sadifi et al. (2001, 2002), showed the successful biocontrol of the Bacillus species in the inhibition of the post-harvest disease of potatoes induced by Fusarium sambucinum under storage conditions. In our research, more than half of the isolated endophytic bacterium strains were identified as Bacillus species according to their morphological characteristics (data not shown). This special microbial flora should be exploited more extensively in the biological control of phytopathogenic fungi.

The low rate of polymorphism in the rDNA transcription unit allowed the characterization of the rDNA of each species using only a few specimens and made this DNA useful for interspecific comparisons. In addition, the different coding regions of the rDNA repeats usually showed distinct evolution rates. As a result, this DNA could provide information about almost any systematic level (Hillis and Dixon, 1991). The comparison of 16S rDNA sequences was one of the most powerful tools for the classification of microorganisms (Wu et al., 2006). In our study, seven endophytic bacterium isolates from *L. esculentum* Mill., *S. tuberculatae*, and *D. dasycarpus* effectively inhibited the mycelial growth of *B. cinerea*, and one strain encoded EB-28 significantly inhibited the lesion extension of gray mold on the cucumber seedling cotyledons and detached tomato leaves. The characterization of EB-28 was performed by conventional methods using morphology, physiological tests, and 16S rDNA sequence analysis. It was identified as *B. subtilis*. Further efforts are needed to exploit *B. subtilis* EB-28 and other endophytic bacterium isolates for commercial production and application under storage and greenhouse conditions.

The Lycopersicum esculentum Mill., Speranskiae tuberculatae (Bge.) Baill, and Dictamnus dasycarpus Turcz. used to isolate endophytic bacteria in the present work were selected from dozens of plant species during pre-screening experiments (unpublished data). The tomato (*L. esculentum*) is an important host plant of *B. cinerea*. Endophytic bacterium strains isolated from tomatoes are considered to have the potential to be used as a biocontrol agent against tomato gray mold in field and post-harvest conditions. *S. tuberculatae* and *D. dasycarpus* are two Chinese traditional medicinal herbs. S. tuberculatae is useful in treating all types of acne when used in conjunction with Herba Menthae, Radix Gentiana, and other herbs of the same family (Li et al., 2000). Dictamnus (Dictamnus dasycarpus; baixianpi) is one of the most commonly used Chinese herb for the treatment of eczema (Du et al., 2005). S. tuberculatae and D. dasycarpus have been found to have antifungal activity against some plant pathogens, such as Rhizoctonia solani, Alternaria longipes, and Curvulavia lunata (Du et al., 2005; Huang et al., 2007) and are regarded as potential biocontrol agents to plant diseases. In this study, four endophytic bacterium isolates from S. tuberculatae and two isolates from D. dasycarpus showed significant antagonistic effects against B. cinerea in vitro, while the inhibitive effects of these two plants against B. cinerea were still unclear. An interesting question is whether combined biological control agents made up of endophytic bacteria and plant extracts would have a stronger biocontrol effect against tomato gray mold or other plant diseases.

Acknowledgements This work was supported by the International Corporation Grant from the Ministry of Science and Technology of the People's Republic of China (No. 2006DFB72260), and by the Doctoral Grant from Agricultural University of Hebei, China.

References

- Barritt M M (1936). The intensification of the Voges-Proskauer reaction by the addition of α-naphtol. J Pathol Bacteriol, 42: 441–445
- Bergey's Manual of Determinative Bacteriology (1994). Bergey's Manual of Determinative Bacteriology, 9th ed. Baltimore: The Williams and Wilkins Company
- Chen H, Xiao X, Wang J, Wu L J, Zheng Z M, Yu Z L (2008). Antagonistic effects of volatiles generated by *Bacillus subtilis* on spore germination and hyphal growth of the plant pathogen, *Botrytis cinerea*. Biotechnological Letters, 30: 919–923
- Clarke P H (1953). Hydrogen sulphide production by bacteria. J Gen Microbiol, 8: 397–407
- Du C F, Yang X X, Tu P F (2005). Studies on chemical constituents in bark of *Dictamnus dasycarpus*. China Journal of Chinese Materia Medica, 30(21): 1663–1666 (in Chinese)
- Elad Y, Stewart A (2004). Microbial control of *Botrytis* spp. In: Elad Y, Williamson B, Tudzynski P, Delen N, eds. *Botrytis*: Biology, Pathology and Control. The Netherlands: Kluwer Academic Press, 223–241
- Guo Y B, Zheng H, Yang Y L (2007). Characterization of Pseudomonas corrugate strain P94 isolated from soil in Beijing as a potential biocontrol agent. Curr Microbiol, (55): 247–253
- Hacene H, Rafa F, Chebhouni N, Boutaiba S, Bhatnagar T, Baratti J C, Ollivier B (2004). Biodiversity of prokaryotic micro-flora in El Golea Salt lake Algerian Sahara. J Arid Environ, 58: 273–284
- Hillis D M, Dixon M T (1991). Ribosomal DNA: molecular evolution and phylogenetic inference. Quart Rev Biol, 66: 411–453
- Huang G R, Du X Y, Xu D G, Zhang H, Pan R Q, Xu H H (2007). Antifungal activities in methanol extracts from twenty species of

plants in three gorges region Hubei province. Journal of South China Agricultural University, 28(3): 37–41 (in Chinese)

- Jiao Y L, Wang S T, Cao K Q (2009). Establishment and application of bioassay method for screening fungicides against *Botrytis cinerea* Pers. Journal of Agricultural University of Hebei, 31: (in press) (in Chinese)
- Li C, Zhang C Z, Hu F D, Shi J G (2000). Chemical constituents from Speranskia tuberculata (Bge.) Baill. China Journal of Chinese Materia Medica, 25(5): 291–292 (in Chinese)
- Liu C H, Zou W X, Lu H, Tan R X (2001). Antifungal activity of *Artimisia annua* endophyte cultures against some phytopathogenic fungi. Journal of Biotechnology, 88: 277–282
- Liu C H, Chen X, Liu T T, Lian B, Gu Y C, Caer V, Xue Y R, Wang B T (2007). Study of the antifungal activity of *Acinetobacter baumannii* LCH001 *in vitro* and identification of its antifungal components. Applied Microbiology and Biotechnology, 76: 459–466
- Lodewyckx C, Vangronsfeld J, Porteous F, Moore E R B, Taghavi S, Mergeay M, van der Lelie D (2002). Endophytic bacteria and their potential applications. Critical Review of Plant Science, 21: 583–606
- Moundt J O, Hinckle N F (1976). Bacteria within ovules and seeds. Applied and Environmental Microbiology, 32: 694–698
- Sadfi N, Cherif M, Fliss I, Boudabous A, Antoun H (2001). Evaluation of *Bacillus* isolates from salty soils and *Bacillus thuringiensis* strains for the biocontrol of *Fusarium* dry rot of potato tubers. Journal of Plant Pathology, 83: 101–108
- Sadfi N, Cherif M, Hajlaoui M R, Boudabous A (2002). Biological control of the potato tubers dry rot caused by *Fusarium roseum* var. sambucinum under greenhouse, field and storage conditions using *Bacillus* sp. isolates. Journal of Phytopathology, 150: 640–648
- Sadfi N, Essghaier B, Hajlaoui M R, Fardeau M L, Cayaol J L, Ollivier B, Boudabous A (2008). Ability of moderately halophilic bacteria to control grey mould disease on tomato fruits. Journal of Phytopathology, 156(1): 42–52
- Sessitsch A, Reiter B, Berg G (2004). Endophytic bacterial communities of field-grown potato plants and their plant-growth promoting and antagonistic abilities. Canadian Journal of Microbiology, 50: 239–249
- Sturz AV, Christie B R, Nowak J (2000). Bacterial endophytes: potential role in developing sustainable system of crop production. Critical Review of Plant Science, 19(1): 1–30
- Walker R, Powell A A, Seddon B (1998). *Bacillus* isolates from the spermosphere of peas and dwarf French beans with antifungal activity against *Botrytis cinerea* and *Pythium* species. Journal of Applied Microbiology, 84: 791–801
- Whipps J M (1987). Effect of media on growth and interactions between a range of soil-borne glasshouse pathogens and antagonistic fungi. New Phytologist, 107(1): 127–142
- Williamson B, Tudzynski B, Tudzynski P, van Kan J A L (2007). *Botrytis cinerea*: the cause of grey mould disease. Molecular Plant Pathology, 8(5): 561–580
- Wu X Y, Walker M J, Hornitzky M, Chin J (2006) Development of a group-specific PCR combined with ARDRA for the identification of *Bacillus* species of environmental significance. J Microbiol Methods, 64: 107–119
- Xiao T L, Liu W W, Fang D C (2000). Construction of phage antibody library and screening of human anti-ATP monoclonal antibody. Acta Academiae Medicinae Militaris Tertiae, 22(7): 682–684 (in Chinese)