ORIGINAL PAPER

Natural forests exhibit higher organic carbon concentrations and recalcitrant carbon proportions in soil than plantations: a global data synthesis

Xiuqing Nie1 · Hui Wang¹ · Jian Wang1 · Shirong Liu1

Received: 22 November 2023 / Accepted: 25 January 2024 © Northeast Forestry University 2024

Abstract Diferent chemical compositions of soil organic carbon (SOC) affect its persistence and whether it significantly difers between natural forests and plantations remains unclear. By synthesizing 234 observations of SOC chemical compositions, we evaluated global patterns of concentration, individual chemical composition (alkyl C, O-alkyl C, aromatic C, and carbonyl C), and their distribution evenness. Our results indicate a notably higher SOC, a markedly larger proportion of recalcitrant alkyl C, and lower easily decomposed carbonyl C proportion in natural forests. However, SOC chemical compositions were appreciably more evenly distributed in plantations. Based on the assumed conceptual index of SOC chemical composition evenness, we deduced that, compared to natural forests, plantations may have higher possible resistance to SOC decomposition under

Project funding: This work was supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (Grants 31971463, 31930078), the National Key R&D Program of China (Grant 2021YFD2200402), and the Chinese Academy of Forestry (Grant CAFYBB2020ZA001).

The online version is available at [https://link.springer.com/.](https://springerlink.bibliotecabuap.elogim.com/)

Corresponding editor: Yanbo Hu.

Supplementary Information The online version contains supplementary material available at [https://doi.org/10.1007/](https://doi.org/10.1007/s11676-024-01739-1) [s11676-024-01739-1](https://doi.org/10.1007/s11676-024-01739-1).

 \boxtimes Hui Wang wanghui@caf.ac.cn

 1 Ecology and Nature Conservation Institute, Chinese Academy of Forestry, Key Laboratory of Forest Ecology and Environment of National Forestry and Grassland Administration, No. 2 Dongxiaofu, Haidian District, Beijing 100091, People's Republic of China

disturbances. In tropical regions, SOC levels, recalcitrant SOC chemical composition, and their distributed evenness were signifcantly higher in natural forests, indicating that SOC has higher chemical stability and possible resistance to decomposition. Climate factors had minor efects on alkyl C in forests globally, while they notably afected SOC chemical composition in tropical forests. This could contribute to the diferences in chemical compositions and their distributed evenness between plantations and natural stands.

Keywords Global data synthesis · Natural forest · Plantations · Soil organic carbon · Soil organic carbon chemical composition

Introduction

Natural forests can provide benefts of carbon (C) storage, water provisioning, erosion control, and biodiversity; however, plantations have an advantage in uniform wood production (Hua et al [2022](#page-8-0)). A meta-analysis showed that soil organic carbon (SOC) levels decreased by 36.5% through conversion from natural forests to plantations (Liao et al [2012\)](#page-9-0). Most studies have demonstrated that more SOC is stored in natural forests, while several results have shown that plantations sequester more C in soils (Lemma et al [2006;](#page-9-1) Pibumrung et al [2008;](#page-9-2) Zarafshar et al [2020](#page-10-0)). However, the patterns of SOC stocks between plantations and natural stands could be context-independent. The diferences in SOC storage vary in diferent climate regions and environmental conditions (Liao et al [2012;](#page-9-0) Hong et al [2020](#page-8-1)). Therefore, a global synthesis of forest SOC patterns needs to be comprehensively assessed.

Various organic C chemicals constitute SOC (Crow et al [2009](#page-8-2)), including O-alkyl C, alkyl C, carbonyl C, and

aromatic C, and show diferent levels of resistance to decompose in diverse ecosystems (Lorenz et al [2007](#page-9-3)). Ligninrooted litter aromatics are signifcantly refractory in the process of decomposition (Berg and Meentemeyer [2002](#page-8-3)). Carbohydrates, such as cellulose, are characterized by abundant O-alkyl C (Baldock et al [1992](#page-8-4)). Carbonyl C represents the oxidized products of various molecules (Hall et al [2020\)](#page-8-5) and is a labile C functional group rapidly degraded by the microbial community (Kang et al [2021](#page-9-4)). Generally, the alkyl C signal can be assigned to compositions as the framework of long-chain polymethylene $[(CH_2)_n]$ such as lipids, waxes and resins, showing relative stability resistance to microorganism decomposition (Kögel-Knabner et al [1992](#page-9-5)). Alkyl C often accumulates in the soil to the beneft of increasing the SOC pool stability (Mikutta et al [2006](#page-9-6)). The "ecosystem property theory" indicates that abiotic and biological controlling factors, instead of chemical structure, afect the stability of soil organic matter (Schmidt et al [2011\)](#page-9-7). The "soil continuum model" proposes that organic debris is in a continuous state and goes into smaller polymers via the decomposer community (Lehmann and Kleber [2015](#page-9-8)). These perspectives suggest that any organic C compositions would ultimately decay in the presence of appropriate decomposer groups and abiotic environment. Based on these theories, we developed a concept of SOC chemical composition evenness (Wang et al [2019b,](#page-10-1) [2022a](#page-10-2), [b,](#page-10-3) [2023a](#page-9-9), [b\)](#page-10-4). Specifcally, when SOC chemical composition evenness reduces, the risk of C emissions increases because of any one soil chemical composition sufering substantial impacts, since climate changes and other disturbances would rise. The evenness of distribution of chemical compositions of SOC can be used to indicate the potential resistance to decompose (Wang et al [2023a,](#page-9-9) [b\)](#page-10-4). In addition, an analogous view indicated that the signifcant factor controlling decomposition is the molecular diversity of organic compounds instead of the material properties of individual compounds due to the increasing cost of metabolism along a greater diversity of molecules (Lehmann et al [2020](#page-9-10)). Low diversity, coupled with a high concentration of individual chemical compositions, potentially contributes to both more efective 'investment strategies' and specialization for soil biota (Kögel-Knabner [2017](#page-9-11); Wang et al [2023a](#page-9-9)). The duration of organic residues tends to increase with the enhanced diversity of chemical particles (Kallenbach et al [2016](#page-9-12); Wang et al [2023a](#page-9-9)).

Previous studies have indicated that vegetation changes associated with long-term land use shifts can result in differences in SOC chemical composition (Quideau et al [2001](#page-9-13)). When natural forests were converted to hoop pine plantations, O-alkyl C decreased while alkyl C increased in soils (Chen et al [2004\)](#page-8-6). Conversely, in afforested pine forests, O-alkyl C was higher in soils than in natural woodlands in the Mediterranean environment (De Marco et al [2022](#page-8-7)). Mixed plantations of *Erythrophleum fordii* Oliv. and *Pinus* *massoniana* Lamb. have a higher proportion of recalcitrant alkyl C and a larger evenness of SOC chemical compositions than the monospecifc plantation of *P. massoniana* (Wang et al [2019b\)](#page-10-1). However, the various shifts in SOC chemical compositions between natural forests and planted ones have been primarily based on small-scale experiments. Whether the chemical composition of soil organic carbon and their distributed evenness difer among forest types at a global scale is unclear.

SOC dynamics have been ultimately related to climate; for instance, higher temperatures increase the decomposition of organic matter (Davidson and Janssens [2006;](#page-8-8) Hall et al [2020\)](#page-8-5). Warming completely alters the organic C chemical compositions and accelerates the degradation of lignin, e.g., aromatic C and carbohydrates, e.g., O-alkyl C (Feng et al [2008](#page-8-9); Pisani et al [2015;](#page-9-14) Guan et al [2018;](#page-8-10) Wang et al [2019a](#page-10-5)). Precipitation significantly controls net primary productivity (NPP), shaping plant-rooted C sources (Wynn et al [2006](#page-10-6); Nie et al [2021\)](#page-9-15), thus afecting SOC components (Chiti et al [2019\)](#page-8-11). Soil pH has an important role in determining SOC storage (Ramesh et al [2019\)](#page-9-16) and drives the spatial distribution of arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi and soil fauna and the relative abundance of bacterial communities (Liu et al [2007](#page-9-17); Cheng et al [2012](#page-8-12); Shen et al [2013](#page-9-18)). Research has shown that pH has a positive relationship with protein and a negative one with lipids in soils at a continental scale (Hall et al [2020](#page-8-5)). However, the efects of climatic and soil factors on SOC chemicals and their distribution globally are unclear.

In this study, we explore the patterns and drivers of SOC concentration, the individual chemical components of SOC, and their distribution evenness between natural forests and plantations in diferent climate regions by conducting a global data synthesis. We hypothesized that: (1) natural forests would have more recalcitrant SOC chemical compositions and higher SOC levels concentrations than plantations; and that (2) distributed evenness of SOC chemical compositions would be larger in natural forests because of the more complex plant community structure and the diverse litter carbon inputs.

Materials and methods

Meta‑analysis

An extensive literature search was carried out in Google Scholar and the ISI Web of Science on May 13, 2021 using the search terms: nuclear magnetic resonance (NMR); soil organic carbon or soil carbon; chemical composition or composition or fraction or component; and forest or plantation or planted forest. The search initially produced 459 publications (159 from ISI Web of Science and 300 in Google Scholar), of which we focused on SOC chemical compositions in forest topsoil and topsoil sample depth was as $<$ 30 cm (Georgiou et al 2022). To avoid bias in literature selection, studies were chosen according to the following six criteria: (1) studies that estimated soil C chemical composition in mangrove forest ecosystems were excluded; (2) soil C chemical composition was derived only from surface soils, excluding samples from deep soils; (3) the studies explored the efects of various treatments (i.e., nutrient and litter addition, altered temperature or precipitation) on soil chemical composition, and only observations of the control were used; (4) only the method for estimating soil C chemical composition using NMR was employed; (5) studies examining the chemical composition of SOC or SOM were used, and other materials, such as humic substances, particulate organic matter, or light fraction, were excluded; and (6) only studies of the proportion of soil chemical compositions of carbonyl C, aromatic C, O-alkyl C, and alkyl C were used with a sum of 100%. When an original study reported results graphically, SigmaScanPro version 5 (Systat Software Inc., Point Pichmond, CA, USA) was used to extract the data digitally. The subset included 234 sites in 69 publications, covering tropical, subtropical, temperate and boreal forests across Asia, Europe, Africa, America, and Oceania (Fig. S1 and Table S1).

NMR spectra were divided into four shift regions for C chemical composition (Mathers and Xu [2003\)](#page-9-19): alkyl, O-alkyl, aromatic, and carbonyl; the specific chemical shift areas for the four compositions are shown in Table S1 (Condron and Newman [1998](#page-8-14); Shrestha et al [2008](#page-9-20); Dymov et al [2015](#page-8-15); Angst et al [2016;](#page-8-16) Jiménez-González et al [2016](#page-9-21); Fang et al [2017;](#page-8-17) Cusack et al [2018](#page-8-18); Hasegawa et al [2021](#page-8-19)). Alkyl C/O-alkyl C (A/OA) indicates the substrate quality for microorganisms and the decomposition extent of SOC due to easily decomposed O-alkyl C and recalcitrant alkyl C (Huang et al [2008](#page-8-20)).

Species evenness refers to how close in numbers each species in an environment is. Pielou evenness index represents the evenness of a community (*J*[']): $J' = H'/H_{\text{max}}$; $H' = \sum p_i \log_2 p_i$; and $p_i = n_i/N$, where n_i and *N* are the mean abundance of *i*th species and the total abundance, respec-tively (Shannon and Weaver [1949\)](#page-9-22); $H_{\text{max}} = \text{Ln}(S)$, where *S* is the number of all species. Pielou evenness indicated the evenness of the chemical composition (Wang et al [2019b](#page-10-1)). *S*=4 (four chemical compositions of organic C-carbonyl C, aromatic C, O-alkyl C, and alkyl C), *N* is the total proportion of SOC chemical composition and n_i is the specific percentage of the *i*th C chemical fraction accounting for the total SOC estimated using relative intensity of every C composition ¹³C NMR spectra (Wang et al 2019_b). A low evenness indicates one or more functional C compositions were relatively low or high, while a high index indicates a more even distribution of diferent functional C compositions.

In addition, we also collected data on soil properties and climate factors to evaluate their effects on the chemical composition of SOM and its distribution. Both mean annual precipitation (MAP) and mean annual temperature (MAT) were obtained from the global database ([http://www.world](http://www.worldclim.org/) [clim.org/](http://www.worldclim.org/)). Soil organic carbon and pH were derived from corresponding literature or the SoilGrids data of the website [\(https://soilgrids.org/#!/?layer=TAXNWRB_250m&](https://soilgrids.org/#!/?layer=TAXNWRB_250m&vector=1) [vector=1](https://soilgrids.org/#!/?layer=TAXNWRB_250m&vector=1)). Net primary productivity was extracted from Numerical Terradynamic Simulation Group Data [\(http://](http://www.ntsg.umt.edu/data) [www.ntsg.umt.edu/data\)](http://www.ntsg.umt.edu/data).

Statistical analysis

The Wilcoxon rank-sum test was carried out to determine the diferences in chemical composition and evenness of the SOC between natural forests and plantations. Diferences were also tested by Wilcoxon rank-sum for various types of tropical, subtropical, temperature, and boreal forests at $P < 0.05$.

Linear mixed-efects models were used to examine the relationships of O-alkyl C and alkyl C on SOC, where O-alkyl C and alkyl C were treated as fxed factors, while studies were treated as random factors.

Structural equation modeling examined the indirect and direct efects of MAT, MAP, pH and NPP on SOC compositions and their distribution evenness, and scaled to mean $=0$ and $SD = 1$. The package "PIECEWISE" performed the structural equation model analysis. All statistical analyses were performed in R 3.2.4 (R Development Core Team [2016](#page-9-23)).

Results

Concentrations and chemical compositions of soil organic carbon

Higher SOC, a larger proportion of recalcitrant alkyl C, a larger A/OA ratio, and a lower easily decomposed carbonyl C were found in global natural forests than in plantations $(P<0.05)$ (Fig. [1](#page-3-0)), which supports the first hypothesis. Other chemical compositions, including O-alkyl C and aromatic C, were not signifcantly diferent between plantations and natural forests (Fig. [1\)](#page-3-0). Moreover, in tropical forests, SOC levels, recalcitrant SOC composition, A/OA ratio, and evenness of SOC chemical compositions were higher in natural forests (Fig. [2\)](#page-3-1). For subtropical forests, alkyl C of natural forests was signifcantly larger than that for plantations (Fig. [3](#page-4-0)). Soil organic carbon in temperate natural forests was signifcantly larger than in temperate plantations (Fig. [4](#page-4-1)).

Chemical compositions of SOC were distributed more evenly in global plantations than in natural forests (Fig. [1](#page-3-0)).

Fig. 1 Percentages of **a** alkyl C, **b** O-alkyl C, **c** aromatic, and **d** carbonyl C, **e** alkyl C/O-alkyl C (A/OA), **f** evenness of SOC chemical compositions and **g** SOC in global forests. Signifcance levels: *P*<0.001 (***) and *P*<0.05 (*)

Fig. 2 Sizes of **a** alkyl C, **b** O-alkyl C, **c** aromatic C and **d** carbonyl C, **e** alkyl C/O-alkyl C (A/OA), **f** evenness of SOC chemical compositions, and **g** SOC in global tropical forests. Signifcant levels: *P*<0.001 (***), *P*<0.01 (**), and *P*<0.05 (*)

Conversely, in tropical forests, SOC was distributed more evenly in natural forests (Fig. [2](#page-3-1)). This supports our second hypothesis for tropical forests.

Various chemical compositions had diferent notable relationships with SOC between natural forests and plantations (Figs. 5 and 6). Specifically, with alkyl C, it showed an increasing trend in global plantations, while it was relatively stable in natural forests (Fig. [5](#page-5-0)). In tropical forests, SOC had decreased O-alkyl C in natural forests and increased in plantations (Fig. [6\)](#page-5-1).

Controls on chemical composition of soil organic carbon and their distribution evenness

Climate factors had various efects on SOC chemicals in diferent forest types. Generally, they had less consequences on alkyl C and aromatic C, but MAT had negative efects on O-alkyl C but positive efects on carbonyl C and evenness of chemical compositions in global forests (Fig. [7](#page-6-0)). However, the results showed a diferent picture in tropical forests. Mean annual precipitation signifcantly afected

Fig. 3 Sizes of **a** alkyl C, **b** O-alkyl C, **c** aromatic C and **d** carbonyl C, **e** alkyl C/O-alkyl C (A/OA), **f** evenness of SOC chemical compositions, and **g** SOC in global subtropical forests. Signifcance levels: *P*<0.05 (*)

Fig. 4 Sizes of **a** alkyl C, **b** O-alkyl C, **c** aromatic C, and **d** carbonyl C, **e** alkyl C/O-alkyl C (A/OA), **f** evenness of SOC chemical compositions, and **g** SOC in global temperate forests. Signifcance levels: *P*<0.001 (***)

the chemical make-up of SOC and evenness of their distributions, and MAT affected alkyl C and aromatic C levels (Fig. [8\)](#page-7-0).

pH and NPP markedly afected the chemical compositions of SOC and their evenness at a global scale (Fig. [7](#page-6-0)), and in tropical forests (Fig. [8](#page-7-0)). pH was negatively related with alkyl C and positively with the evenness of chemical compositions across global forests and in tropical forests (Fig. [7\)](#page-6-0). Net primary productivity was positively related with carbonyl C levels and chemical compositions evenness (Fig. [8\)](#page-7-0).

Fig. 6 Relationships between O-alkyl C and SOC in global tropical forests; **a** total, **b** natural forests, and **c** plantations

Discussion

Concentration/chemical compositions of soil organic carbon in natural forests and plantations

Compared with many natural forests, plantations are subject to more anthropogenic disturbances. The simpler stand structure and higher soil temperatures in plantations stimulate SOM decomposition (Li et al [2014\)](#page-9-24). The intense cultivation in plantations leads to a signifcant loss of SOC (Wu et al [2014](#page-10-7)). Consequently, it was higher in the natural forests.

In this study, natural forests exhibited more recalcitrant SOC, higher A/OA, and lower evenness of SOC chemical compositions at a global scale. Compared with plantations, natural forests had more soil alkyl C, indicating the greater persistence of SOC under current conditions. However, the concept of the molecular diversity of chemical components, instead of material properties of individual organic components controlling the process of decomposition (Lehmann et al [2020\)](#page-9-10) and evenness of SOC chemical compositions, has been suggested to indicate the potential C resistance to decomposition in climate change scenarios and other disturbances (Wang et al [2019b](#page-10-1)). Therefore, compared with natural forests, plantations had a higher evenness of organic carbon compositions. This suggests that natural forests could be at greater risk of carbon decomposition, while plantations may have higher possible resistance to SOC decomposition in projected climate change scenarios. These results suggest that SOC storage and potential resistance to disturbance exist as a tradeoff between natural forests and plantations at a global scale. The lower alkyl C and the higher carbonyl C in soils in plantations resulted in the greater evenness of chemical compositions. The conception of SOC chemical evenness is based on ecosystem property theory and soil continuum model (Wang et al [2019b](#page-10-1)). One of the uncertainties was the difficulty of proving the effects of SOC chemical composition evenness on C decomposition in controlled experiments. The experiments could be designed to prove the relationships between SOC chemical evenness and potential C decomposition in the future.

In contrast to the global scale, in tropical regions, natural forests had a higher evenness of SOC chemical compositions due to soil O-alkyl C in plantations. This indicates that tropical natural forests could be at less risk of SOC decomposition to possible disturbances than plantations in the tropics. Combining higher SOC concentrations, the more recalcitrant soil alkyl C and larger soil A/OA in the natural forests in the tropical regions, it is concluded that SOC storage, chemical stability, and potential resistance showed a synergetic relationship between the tropical natural forests and plantations.

Fig. 7 Structural equation models determining direct and indirect drivers of **a** alkyl C, **b** O-alkyl C, **c** aromatic C, **d** carbonyl C, **e** evenness of chemical composition distribution, and **f** alkyl C/O-alkyl C (A/OA) in global forests; number values are proportional to their

relative size of efect. Dashed arrows represent nonsignifcant efects, red arrows are positive effects, blue arrows negative effects. Symbols indicate: *P*<0.001 (***), *P*<0.01 (**), and *P*<0.05 (*)

Natural forests play a signifcant role in SOC storage and sequestration of their higher carbon and alkyl C. Therefore, although plantations can replenish soil carbon loss, protecting natural forests is also signifcant for improving the storage and sequestration of carbon.

Soil organic carbon levels increased signifcantly with alkyl C in global plantations and decreased with O-alkyl C in tropical forests. Similarly, O-alkyl C was notably negatively connected with SOC stock in subtropical plantations (Wang et al [2022b](#page-10-3)). In contrast, in harvested and old-growth forests, the proportion of O-alkyl C in SOC was positively correlated with SOC stock in tropical rainforests (Wang et al [2023b](#page-10-4)). This inconsistency implies that the relationships between SOC storage and chemical composition are largely dependent on biome and spatial scales.

Controlling factors on chemical compositions of soil organic carbon

In our study, MAT, rather than MAP, signifcantly afected the chemical compositions of SOC and their even distribution in forests at a global scale. It has been demonstrated that increasing temperature decreases the easily decomposed O-alkyl C in grasslands (Guan et al [2018](#page-8-10)). Similarly, increasing soil temperature has also been found to decrease O-alkyl C in a soil warming experiment in a subtropical plantation (Wang et al [2019a](#page-10-5)). Soil warming stimulates microbial decomposition of SOM, and the subsequent release of C into the atmosphere due to warming-induced thawing has been reported (Schuur et al [2015](#page-9-25)). In this study, soil O-alkyl C was negatively correlated with increasing MAT, while carbonyl C was positively correlated in forests at a global scale. Investments in the use of molecular methods that are rare in the soil solution are energetically less rewarding because of the rapid adsorption or low production rates (Lehmann et al [2020](#page-9-10)). The larger proportion of the SOC chemical composition, e.g., O-alkyl C, potentially stimulates decomposition for a greater reward (Lane and Martin [2010\)](#page-9-26) than the lower proportion of soil carbonyl C. Therefore, soil O-alkyl C preferentially decomposed with increasing MAT. Increasing temperature can also stimulate decomposition of SOC by increasing C input from plants (Nie et al [2021](#page-9-15)), which partly shapes the positive relationship between MAT and soil carbonyl C.

In tropical forests, MAP had marked infuence on the chemical composition of SOC and its evenness. Precipitation will affect SOC based on indirectly affecting the degree of soil acid (Slessarev et al [2016\)](#page-9-27). Increasing precipitation can

Fig. 8 Structural equation models determining direct and indirect drivers of **a** alkyl C, **b** O-alkyl C, **c** aromatic C, **d** carbonyl C, **e** evenness of chemical composition distribution, and **f** alkyl C/O-alkyl C (A/OA) in global tropical forests; number values are proportional to

their relative size of effect. Dashed arrows represent nonsignificant efects, red arrows are positive efects, blue arrows negative efects. Symbols indicate: *P*<0.001 (***), *P*<0.01 (**), and *P*<0.05 (*)

also weather Ca minerals, resulting in greater Ca^{2+} leaching and immobile Al^{3+} accumulation, consequently decreasing pH (Slessarev et al 2016). Ca²⁺ is involved in SOC stabiliza-tion (Rowley et al [2018\)](#page-9-28) and decreasing Ca^{2+} partly reduces alkyl C and O-alkyl C and could lead to the increased evenness of SOC chemical compositions.

Compared with global patterns, one of the most signifcant diferences in tropical regions was high temperature and precipitation, and MAT and MAP were 21.6 ± 3.8 versus 12.9 ± 7.2 °C and 1752.2 ± 713.1 versus 1249.6 ± 615.5 mm (tropical values vs. global values) in the study regions, respectively. Furthermore, results from structural equation modeling showed that climate factors had minor efects on soil alkyl C in global forests and signifcantly afected SOC chemical composition in tropical forests. This could potentially contribute to the diferences in chemical compositions of SOC and their distributed evenness between plantations and natural forests globally and in the tropics.

Soil pH has been shown to have a close link with biological processes (Hong et al [2018\)](#page-8-21) and responds to soil properties (Rasmussen et al [2018\)](#page-9-29). It had a negative efect on alkyl C and a positive one on the distribution evenness of SOC chemical compositions in this study (Figs. [7](#page-6-0) and [8](#page-7-0)). Similar results also indicated that soil pH had a positive efect on SOC chemical compositions in Chinese forests (Wang et al [2023a,](#page-9-9) [2023b](#page-10-4)). Soil acidity has an important role in regulating microbial activity, biomass, and composition (Tashi et al [2016\)](#page-9-30). The conditions of more acidic soils lead to less diversity of soil bacteria (Shen et al [2013\)](#page-9-18), having signifcant efects on SOC stabilization and solubility (Özkan and Gökbulak [2017;](#page-9-31) Nie et al [2021](#page-9-15)). Soil pH can also afect arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi (e.g., *Acaulospora* and *Glomus*) abundance, substantially regulating SOC decomposition in the scenario of increased $CO₂$ (Cheng et al [2012\)](#page-8-12). This may partially contribute to the decrease in alkyl C, contributing to increasing SOC chemical composition along with soil pH.

In global nitrogen deposition, an increase will reduce pH in forest ecosystems (Yang et al [2015\)](#page-10-8). Our results indicate that alkyl C increases with decreasing pH in forests globally. These results indicated that in global nitrogen deposition, decreasing pH could change individual SOC chemical composition and enhance its evenness, possibly increasing the potential for carbon loss in forest ecosystems.

Conclusions

Based on a global data synthesis, including 234 field studies across major forest ecosystems, lower SOC levels, less recalcitrant alkyl C, and more evenly distributed SOC chemical compositions were found in plantations than in natural forests. These results suggest that the storage and potential resistance to disturbance of SOC is a tradeof between natural forests and plantations. The latter could be less at risk of losing SOC and substantially complement the SOC decrease in natural forests in projected disturbances. Specifcally, in tropical regions, natural forests had a larger SOC concentration and a higher potential resistance to decomposition in terms of a higher evenness of its chemical compositions. This result highlights that organic carbon storage and chemical stability showed a synergetic correlation between tropical natural forests and plantations. Although plantations can replenish soil carbon loss, protecting natural forests is still important for improving the storage and sequestration of soil organic carbon.

Author contributions Hui Wang conceived the study and designed the methodology; Xiuqing Nie collected the data; Xiuqing Nie and Jian Wang analyzed the data; Xiuqing Nie and Hui Wang led the writing of the manuscript; Shirong Liu provided academic advice. All authors contributed critically to the drafts and gave their fnal approval for publication.

Data availability The data that support the findings of this study are available from the corresponding author upon reasonable request.

References

- Angst G, Kögel-Knabner I, Kirfel K, Hertel D, Mueller CW (2016) Spatial distribution and chemical composition of soil organic matter fractions in rhizosphere and non-rhizosphere soil under European beech (*Fagus sylvatica* L.). Geoderma 264:179–187. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoderma.2015.10.016>
- Baldock J, Oades J, Waters A, Peng X, Vassallo A, Wilson M (1992) Aspects of the chemical structure of soil organic materials as revealed by solid-state ¹³C NMR spectroscopy. Biogeochemistry 16:1–42.<https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00024251>
- Berg B, Meentemeyer V (2002) Litter quality in a north European transect versus carbon storage potential. Plant Soil 242:83–92. <https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1019637807021>
- Chen CR, Xu ZH, Mathers NJ (2004) Soil carbon pools in adjacent natural and plantation forests of subtropical Australia. Soil Sci Soc Am J 68:282–291.<https://doi.org/10.2136/sssaj2004.2820>
- Cheng L, Booker FL, Tu C, Burkey KO, Zhou LS, Shew HD, Rufty TW, Hu SJ (2012) Arbuscular mycorrhizal fungi increase organic carbon decomposition under elevated $CO₂$. Science 337:1084– 1087.<https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1224304>
- Chiti T, Certini G, Marzaioli F, D'Acqui LP, Forte C, Castaldi S, Valentini R (2019) Composition and turnover time of organic matter in soil fractions with diferent magnetic susceptibility. Geoderma 349:88–96.<https://doi.org/10.1016/J.GEODERMA.2019.04.042>
- Condron LM, Newman RH (1998) Chemical nature of soil organic matter under grassland and recently established forest. Eur J Soil Sci 49:597–603.<https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-2389.1998.4940597.x>
- Crow SE, Lajtha K, Filley TR, Swanston CW, Bowden RD, Caldwell BA (2009) Sources of plant-derived carbon and stability of organic matter in soil: implications for global change. Glob Change Biol 15:2003–2019. [https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2486.](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2486.2009.01850.x) [2009.01850.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2486.2009.01850.x)
- Cusack DF, Halterman SM, Tanner EVJ, Wright SJ, Hockaday W, Dietterich LH, Turner BL (2018) Decadal-scale litter manipulation alters the biochemical and physical character of tropical forest soil carbon. Soil Biol Biochem 124:199–209. [https://doi.org/10.](https://doi.org/10.1016/J.SOILBIO.2018.06.005) [1016/J.SOILBIO.2018.06.005](https://doi.org/10.1016/J.SOILBIO.2018.06.005)
- Davidson EA, Janssens IA (2006) Temperature sensitivity of soil carbon decomposition and feedbacks to climate change. Nature 440:165–173. <https://doi.org/10.1038/nature04514>
- De Marco A, Panico SC, Memoli V, Santorufo L, Zarrelli A, Barile R, Maisto G (2022) Diferences in soil carbon and nitrogen pools between aforested pine forests and natural shrublands in a Mediterranean area. Appl Soil Ecol 170:104262. [https://doi.org/10.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apsoil.2021.104262) [1016/j.apsoil.2021.104262](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apsoil.2021.104262)
- Dymov AA, Zhangurov EV, Hagedorn F (2015) Soil organic matter composition along altitudinal gradients in permafrost afected soils of the Subpolar Ural Mountains. CATENA 131:140–148. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.catena.2015.03.020>
- Fang XH, Zhang JC, Meng MJ, Guo XP, Wu YW, Liu X, Zhao KL, Ding LZ, Shao YF, Fu WJ (2017) Forest-type shift and subsequent intensive management afected soil organic carbon and microbial community in southeastern China. Eur J For Res 136:689–697. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10342-017-1065-0>
- Feng X, Simpson AJ, Wilson KP, Dudley Williams D, Simpson MJ (2008) Increased cuticular carbon sequestration and lignin oxidation in response to soil warming. Nat Geosci 1:836–839. [https://](https://doi.org/10.1038/ngeo361) doi.org/10.1038/ngeo361
- Georgiou K, Jackson RB, Vindušková O, Abramof RZ, Ahlström A, Feng W, Harden JW, Pellegrini AFA, Polley HW, Soong JL, Riley WJ, Torn MS (2022) Global stocks and capacity of mineral-associated soil organic carbon. Nat Commun 13:3797. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-022-31540-9) [10.1038/s41467-022-31540-9](https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-022-31540-9)
- Guan S, An N, Zong N, He YT, Shi PL, Zhang JJ, He NP (2018) Climate warming impacts on soil organic carbon fractions and aggregate stability in a Tibetan alpine meadow. Soil Biol Biochem 116:224–236. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2017.10.011>
- Hall SJ, Ye C, Weintraub SR, Hockaday WC (2020) Molecular tradeofs in soil organic carbon composition at continental scale. Nat Geosci 13:687–692.<https://doi.org/10.1038/s41561-020-0634-x>
- Hasegawa S, Marshall J, Sparrman T, Nasholm T (2021) Decadal nitrogen addition alters chemical composition of soil organic matter in a boreal forest. Geoderma 386:114906. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoderma.2020.114906) [geoderma.2020.114906](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoderma.2020.114906)
- Hong SB, Piao SL, Chen AP, Liu YW, Liu LL, Peng SS, Sardans J, Sun Y, Peñuelas J, Zeng H (2018) Aforestation neutralizes soil pH. Nat Commun 9:520.<https://doi.org/10.1038/s41467-018-02970-1>
- Hong SB, Yin GD, Piao SL, Dybzinski R, Cong N, Li XY, Wang K, Peñuelas J, Zeng H, Chen AP (2020) Divergent responses of soil organic carbon to aforestation. Nat Sustain 3:694–700. [https://](https://doi.org/10.1038/s41893-020-0557-y) doi.org/10.1038/s41893-020-0557-y
- Hua FY, Bruijnzeel LA, Meli P, Martin PA, Zhang J, Nakagawa S, Miao XR, Wang WY, McEvoy C, Peña-Arancibia JL, Brancalion PHS, Smith P, Edwards DP, Balmford A (2022) The biodiversity and ecosystem service contributions and trade-ofs of forest restoration approaches. Science 375:839–844. [https://doi.org/10.](https://doi.org/10.1126/science.abl4649) [1126/science.abl4649](https://doi.org/10.1126/science.abl4649)
- Huang ZQ, Xu ZH, Chen CR, Boyd S (2008) Changes in soil carbon during the establishment of a hardwood plantation in subtropical

Australia. For Ecol Manag 254:46–55. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foreco.2007.07.021) [foreco.2007.07.021](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foreco.2007.07.021)

- Jiménez-González MA, De la Rosa JM, Jiménez-Morillo NT, Almendros G, González-Pérez JA, Knicker H (2016) Post-fre recovery of soil organic matter in a Cambisol from typical Mediterranean forest in Southwestern Spain. Sci Total Environ 572:1414–1421. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2016.02.134>
- Kallenbach C, Frey S, Grandy A (2016) Direct evidence for microbial-derived soil organic matter formation and it ecophsiological controls. Nat Commun 7:13630. [https://doi.org/10.1038/ncomm](https://doi.org/10.1038/ncomms13630) [s13630](https://doi.org/10.1038/ncomms13630)
- Kang HZ, Yu WJ, Dutta S, Gao HH (2021) Soil microbial community composition and function are closely associated with soil organic matter chemistry along a latitudinal gradient. Geoderma 383:114744.<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.geoderma.2020.114744>
- Kögel-Knabner I (2017) The macromolecular organic composition of plant and microbial residues as inputs to soil organic matter: fourteen years on. Soil Biol Biochem 34:139–162. [https://doi.org/10.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2016.08011) [1016/j.soilbio.2016.08011](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2016.08011)
- Kögel-Knabner I, Hatcher PG, Tegelaar EW, de Leeuw JW (1992) Aliphatic components of forest soil organic matter as determined by solid-state ¹³C NMR and analytical pyrolysis. Sci Total Environ 113:89–106. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0048-9697\(92\)90018-N](https://doi.org/10.1016/0048-9697(92)90018-N)
- Lane N, Martin W (2010) The energetics of genome complexity. Nature 467:929–934. <https://doi.org/10.1038/nature09486>
- Lehmann J, Kleber M (2015) The contentious nature of soil organic matter. Nature 528:60–68.<https://doi.org/10.1038/nature16069>
- Lehmann J, Hansel CM, Kaiser C, Kleber M, Maher K, Manzoni S, Nunan N, Reichstein M, Schimel JP, Torn MS, Wieder WR, Kögel-Knabner I (2020) Persistence of soil organic carbon caused by functional complexity. Nat Geosci 13:529–534. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1038/s41561-020-0612-3) [10.1038/s41561-020-0612-3](https://doi.org/10.1038/s41561-020-0612-3)
- Lemma B, Kleja DB, Nilsson I, Olsson M (2006) Soil carbon sequestration under diferent exotic tree species in the southwestern highlands of Ethiopia. Geoderma 136:886–898. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1016/J.GEODERMA.2006.06.008) [10.1016/J.GEODERMA.2006.06.008](https://doi.org/10.1016/J.GEODERMA.2006.06.008)
- Li YF, Zhang JJ, Chang SX, Jiang PK, Zhou GM, Shen ZM, Wu JS, Lin L, Wang ZS, Shen MC (2014) Converting native shrub forests to Chinese chestnut plantations and subsequent intensive management afected soil C and N pools. For Ecol Manag 312:161–169. <https://doi.org/10.1016/J.FORECO.2013.10.008>
- Liao CZ, Luo YQ, Fang CM, Chen JK, Li B (2012) The effects of plantation practice on soil properties based on the comparison between natural and planted forests: a meta-analysis. Glob Ecol Biogeogr 21:318–327.<https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1466-8238.2011.00690.x>
- Liu CH, Luo YQ, Chen ZL, Lian ZM (2007) The relationship between soil animal community ecology and soil micro-ecological-environment. Ecol Environ 16:1564–1569. [https://doi.org/10.16258/j.](https://doi.org/10.16258/j.cnki.1674-5906.2007.05.011) [cnki.1674-5906.2007.05.011](https://doi.org/10.16258/j.cnki.1674-5906.2007.05.011)
- Lorenz K, Lal R, Preston CM, Nierop KGJ (2007) Strengthening the soil organic carbon pool by increasing contributions from recalcitrant aliphatic bio(macro)molecules. Geoderma 142:1–10. [https://](https://doi.org/10.1016/J.GEODERMA.2007.07.013) doi.org/10.1016/J.GEODERMA.2007.07.013
- Mathers NJ, Xu ZH (2003) Solid-state ¹³C NMR spectroscopy: characterization of soil organic matter under two contrasting residue management regimes in a 2-year-old pine plantation of subtropical Australia. Geoderma 114:19–31. [https://doi.org/10.](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0016-7061(02)00339-7) [1016/S0016-7061\(02\)00339-7](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0016-7061(02)00339-7)
- Mikutta R, Kleber M, Torn MS, Jahn R (2006) Stabilization of soil organic matter: Association with minerals or chemical recalcitrance? Biogeochemistry 77:25–56. [https://doi.org/10.1007/](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10533-005-0712-6) [s10533-005-0712-6](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10533-005-0712-6)
- Nie XQ, Wang D, Yang LC, Zhou GY (2021) Controls on variation of soil organic carbon concentration in the shrublands of the north-eastern Tibetan Plateau. Eur J Soil Sci 72:1817–1830. <https://doi.org/10.1111/ejss.13084>
- Özkan U, Gökbulak F (2017) Efect of vegetation change from forest to herbaceous vegetation cover on soil moisture and temperature regimes and soil water chemistry. CATENA 149:158–166. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.catena.2016.09.017>
- Pibumrung P, Gajaseni N, Popan A (2008) Profles of carbon stocks in forest, reforestation and agricultural land, Northern Thailand. J For Res 19:11–18.<https://doi.org/10.1111/ejss.13084>
- Pisani O, Frey SD, Simpson AJ, Simpson MJ (2015) Soil warming and nitrogen deposition alter soil organic matter composition at the molecular-level. Biogeochemistry 123:391–409. [https://](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10533-015-0073-8) doi.org/10.1007/s10533-015-0073-8
- Quideau SA, Chadwick OA, Benesi A, Graham RC, Anderson MA (2001) A direct link between forest vegetation type and soil organic matter composition. Geoderma 104:41–60. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0016-7061(01)00055-6) [org/10.1016/S0016-7061\(01\)00055-6](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0016-7061(01)00055-6)
- R Development Core Team (2016) R: a language and environment for statistical computing. R Foundation for Statistial Computing, Vienna
- Ramesh T, Bolan NS, Kirkham MB, Wijesekara H, Kanchikerimath M, Rao CS, Sandeep S, Rinklebe J, Ok YS, Choudhury BU (2019) Soil organic carbon dynamics: impact of land use changes and management practices: a review. Adv Agron 156:1–107.<https://doi.org/10.1016/bs.agron.2019.02.001>
- Rasmussen C, Heckman K, Wieder WR, Keiluweit M, Lawrence CR, Berhe AA, Blankinship JC, Crow SE, Druhan JL, Hicks Pries CE, Marin-Spiotta E, Plante AF, Schäde C, Schimel JP, Sierra CA, Thompson A, Wagai R (2018) Beyond clay: towards an improved set of variables for predicting soil organic matter content. Biogeochemistry 137:297–306. [https://doi.org/10.1007/](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10533-018-0424-3) [s10533-018-0424-3](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10533-018-0424-3)
- Rowley MC, Grand S, Verrecchia ÉP (2018) Calcium-mediated stabilisation of soil organic carbon. Biogeochemistry 137:27–49. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s10533-017-0410-1>
- Schmidt M, Torn W, Abiven S, Dittmar T, Guggenberger G, Janssens IA, Kleber M, Kogel-Knabner I, Lehmann J, Manning DA, Nannipieri P, Rasse DP, Weiner S, Trumbore SE (2011) Persistence of soil organic matter as an ecosystem property. Nature 478:49–56.<https://doi.org/10.1038/nature10386>
- Schuur EA, McGuire AD, Schädel C, Grosse G, Harden J, Hayes DJ, Hugelius G, Koven CD, Kuhry P, Lawrence DM (2015) Climate change and the permafrost carbon feedback. Nature 520:171–179.<https://doi.org/10.1038/nature14338>
- Shannon C, Weaver W (1949) The mathematical theory of communication. University of Illinois Press, Urbana, pp 3–94
- Shen CC, Xiong JB, Zhang HY, Feng YZ, Lin XG, Li XY, Liang WJ, Chu HY (2013) Soil pH drives the spatial distribution of bacterial communities along elevation on Changbai Mountain. Soil Biol Biochem 57:204–211. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilb](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2012.07.013) [io.2012.07.013](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2012.07.013)
- Shrestha BM, Certini G, Forte C, Singh BR (2008) Soil organic matter quality under diferent land uses in a mountain watershed of Nepal. Soil Sci Soc Am J 72:1563–1569. [https://doi.org/10.](https://doi.org/10.2136/SSSAJ2007.0375) [2136/SSSAJ2007.0375](https://doi.org/10.2136/SSSAJ2007.0375)
- Slessarev E, Lin Y, Bingham N, Johnson J, Dai Y, Schimel J, Chadwick O (2016) Water balance creates a threshold in soil pH at the global scale. Nature 540:567–569.<https://doi.org/10.1038/nature20139>
- Tashi S, Singh B, Keitel C, Adams M (2016) Soil carbon and nitrogen stocks in forests along an altitudinal gradient in the eastern Himalayas and a meta-analysis of global data. Glob Change Biol 22:2255–2268.<https://doi.org/10.1111/gcb.13234>
- Wang H, Ding Y, Zhang YG, Wang JX, Freedman Z, Liu PC, Cong W, Wang J, Zang RG, Liu SR (2023a) Evenness of soil organic carbon chemical components changes with tree species richness, composition and functional diversity across forests in China. Glob Change Biol 29:2852–2864.<https://doi.org/10.1111/gcb.16653>
- Wang H, Liu SR, Schindler A, Wang JX, Yang YJ, Song ZC, You YM, Shi ZM, Li ZY, Chen L, Ming AG, Lu LH, Cai DX (2019a) Experimental warming reduced topsoil carbon content and increased soil bacterial diversity in a subtropical planted forest. Soil Biol Biochem 133:155–164. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilb](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2019.03.004) [io.2019.03.004](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.soilbio.2019.03.004)
- Wang H, Liu SR, Song ZC, Yang YJ, Wang JX, You YM, Zhang X, Shi ZM, Nong Y, Ming AG, Lu LH, Cai DX (2019b) Introducing nitrogen-fxing tree species and mixing with *Pinus massoniana* alters and evenly distributes various chemical compositions of soil organic carbon in a planted forest in southern China. For Ecol Manag 449:117477. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foreco.2019.117477>
- Wang H, Song ZC, Wang JJ, Yang YJ, Wang J, Liu SR (2022a) The quadratic relationship between tree species richness and topsoil organic carbon stock in a subtropical mixed-species planted forest. Eur J For Res 141(6):1151–1161. [https://doi.org/10.1007/](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10342-022-01498-w) [s10342-022-01498-w](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10342-022-01498-w)
- Wang J, Wang H, Ding Y, Zhang YG, Cong W, Zang RG, Liu SR (2023b) Shifting cultivation and logging change soil organic carbon functional groups in tropical lowland rainforests on Hainan Island in China. For Ecol Manag 549:121447. [https://doi.org/10.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foreco.2023.121447) [1016/j.foreco.2023.121447](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foreco.2023.121447)
- Wang J, Wang H, Li X, Nie XQ, Liu SR (2022b) Effects of environmental factors and tree species mixtures on the functional groups of soil organic carbon across subtropical plantations in southern China. Plant Soil 480:265–281. [https://doi.org/10.1007/](https://doi.org/10.1007/s11104-022-05580-5) [s11104-022-05580-5](https://doi.org/10.1007/s11104-022-05580-5)
- Wu JS, Lin HP, Meng CF, Jiang PK, Fu WJ (2014) Effects of intercropping grasses on soil organic carbon and microbial community

functional diversity under Chinese hickory (*Carya cathayensis* Sarg.) stands. Soil Res 52:575–583. [https://doi.org/10.1071/](https://doi.org/10.1071/SR14021) [SR14021](https://doi.org/10.1071/SR14021)

- Wynn JG, Bird MI, Vellen L, Grand-Clement E, Carter J, Berry SL (2006) Continental-scale measurement of the soil organic carbon pool with climatic, edaphic, and biotic controls. Glob Biogeochem Cycles 20:1–12. <https://doi.org/10.1029/2005GB002576>
- Yang YH, Li P, He HL, Zhao X, Datta A, Ma WH, Zhang Y, Liu XJ, Han WX, Wilson MC, Fang JY (2015) Long-term changes in soil pH across major forest ecosystems in China. Geophys Res Lett 42:933–940.<https://doi.org/10.1002/2014GL062575>
- Zarafshar M, Bazot S, Matinizadeh M, Bordbar SK, Rousta MJ, Kooch Y, Enayati K, Abbasi A, Negahdarsaber M (2020) Do tree plantations or cultivated felds have the same ability to maintain soil quality as natural forests? Appl Soil Ecol 151:103536. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apsoil.2020.103536) [org/10.1016/j.apsoil.2020.103536](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.apsoil.2020.103536)

Publisher's Note Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Springer Nature or its licensor (e.g. a society or other partner) holds exclusive rights to this article under a publishing agreement with the author(s) or other rightsholder(s); author self-archiving of the accepted manuscript version of this article is solely governed by the terms of such publishing agreement and applicable law.