INVITED REVIEW



# The selection and uses of plant tissue cultures resistant to toxic compounds

Jack M. Widholm<sup>1</sup>

Received: 9 November 2016 / Accepted: 21 March 2017 / Published online: 13 April 2017 / Editor: John Finer © The Society for In Vitro Biology 2017

Abstract Beginning in 1970, *in vitro* selection for resistance to various toxic compounds has produced many plant cell lines useful for studying biochemical pathways, altering overall cell metabolism and growth, and regenerating plants with desirable traits. Some toxin-resistant lines have been used to elucidate the genetic and biochemical mechanisms plant cells use to adapt, including gene amplification. Other resistance traits have been used for the selection of protoplast fusion hybrids or to develop selectable markers for nuclear or plastid transformation through cloning the corresponding genes and promoters.

**Keywords** Allyl alcohol resistance · Amino acid analog resistance · Chlorate resistance · Herbicide resistance · Streptomycin resistance

# Introduction

Plant cell and tissue cultures have many uses, including selection for cell lines resistant to various inhibitory substances. The system can be efficient and effective since millions of cells can be subjected to a toxic substance, which enables the selection of resistant cells that arise at very low frequencies, as one would expect for mutations. Such selected lines can then be used for many purposes, including biochemical genetic studies to unravel pathways and controls, regeneration into whole plants that are resistant to herbicides or contain increased levels of amino acids, and cloning of genes that cause resistance, which can then be used as selectable markers for selecting transformants and protoplast fusion hybrids.

These studies have documented a number of resistance mechanisms, including the following: (1) generation of an insensitive target site, (2) degradation of the toxic compound, (3) increase in the target site due to gene amplification or higher transcript levels through higher transcription or messenger RNA (mRNA) stability, or (4) decreased uptake of the toxic compound. In this review article, each of these mechanisms will be examined by highlighting one or more useful examples.

#### **Threonine and Streptomycin Resistance**

The first reports of the selection for resistance with plant tissue cultures used the amino acid threonine and tobacco (*Nicotiana tabacum*) cells (Heimer and Filner 1970) and the antibiotic streptomycin and petunia (*Petunia hybrida*) cells (Binding *et al.* 1970). Threonine inhibits cell growth by inhibiting nitrate uptake, while streptomycin inhibits protein biosynthesis by prokaryotic ribosomes in either plastids or mitochondria. Maliga *et al.* (1973) selected streptomycin-resistant tobacco callus and regenerated plants that showed maternally inherited resistance, indicating that the resistance was carried by the genomes of either plastids or mitochondria.

Subsequent work showed that the streptomycin resistance was due to a mutation in the plastid 16S mRNA-encoding gene. This mutated gene also carried another mutation that caused resistance to another antibiotic, spectinomycin, and was used as a selectable marker gene for plastid transformation of tobacco (Svab *et al.* 1990). This breakthrough technique of plastid transformation via homologous recombination into the plastid genome with a selectable marker has been

Jack M. Widholm Widholm@illinois.edu

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Department of Crop Sciences, University of Illinois, 1201 W. Gregory Drive, Urbana, IL 61801, USA

used in a number of species for insertion of multiple genes into the plastid, which allows very high expression levels and prevents gene silencing (Daniell *et al.* 2016). Transgenes carried in plastids are also not transmissible through pollen in most species, so they are contained and not spread to other plants.

### Amino Acid Analog Resistance

Widholm (1972a, b) selected tobacco and carrot (Daucus *carota*) suspension cultures resistant to the tryptophan (Trp) analog 5-methyltryptophan (5MT), which is a false-feedback inhibitor of the Trp biosynthesis control enzyme anthranilate synthase (AS). The resistant cells contained feedback-resistant AS and increased levels of free Trp. Plants have been regenerated from 5MT-resistant cultures of Datura innoxia, corn (Zea mays), and rice (Oryza sativa) that contained much higher-than-normal levels of free Trp (Ranch et al. 1983; Hibberd et al. 1986; Wakasa and Widholm 1987), showing that selection in culture can lead to nutritionally important increases in a partially deficient, nutritionally essential amino acid in regenerated plants. In contrast, tobacco plants regenerated from 5MT-resistant, high-Trp cultures did not contain high Trp or the feedback-resistant form of AS, but cultures reinitiated from leaves of these plants did contain high Trp and the feedback-resistant form of AS (Brotherton et al. 1986). This indicates that the AS promoter is tissue-culture specific, as shown in studies with soybean (Glycine max) where the tobacco AS promoter was used to drive a reporter or selectable marker gene (Inaba et al. 2007; Zernova et al. 2008).

The feedback-resistant tobacco AS gene was cloned (Song *et al.* 1998) and used as a selectable marker in transformation (Cho *et al.* 2004) including plastid transformation (Barone *et al.* 2009). The rice mutant, feedback-resistant AS was also cloned and used as a selectable marker (Yamada *et al.* 2004).

The active AS enzyme consists of two subunits, alpha and beta, with the alpha being used in the studies described above since it contains the Trp binding site. When the tobacco beta subunit was used in combination with the tobacco alpha subunit to transform tobacco, much greater increases in free Trp were found when compared with using only the alpha subunit (Zhang *et al.* 2015). The reports showing that the rice and tobacco AS alpha subunits alone can increase Trp biosynthesis in other species indicate that these subunits can bind with the beta subunits of other species to form an active enzyme (Yamada *et al.* 2004; Barone *et al.* 2009).

The combination of the amino acids lysine and threonine was shown to inhibit plant cell growth by inhibiting the synthesis of methionine. Hibberd and Green (1982) selected a maize culture resistant to lysine plus threonine and regenerated plants that had increased free threonine in the kernels.

A number of amino acid analogs have been used to select resistant cultures, including the methionine analog ethionine. Ethionine-selected tobacco cells had 100-fold increases in free methionine, due to an increase in the level of the lysinesensitive aspartokinase enzyme (summarized in Gonzales and Widholm 1985). Hydroxyproline-resistant carrot cells accumulated 15 to 30 times the normal levels of free proline. Tobacco cells selected as resistant to phenylalanine (Phe) analog, p-fluorophenyalanine, had increased phenylalanine ammonia-lyase (PAL) activity that led to a sixfold increase in phenolics. The resistance in this case was due to the detoxification of p-fluorophenyalanine to p-fluorocinnamic acid by the PAL enzyme.

Many of the studies described above involved essential amino acids, the amino acids that animals cannot synthesize. All essential amino acids are synthesized in plastids in plants. Most animals require essential amino acids in their diet, except the ruminant animals, which have bacteria in their stomachs that make these amino acids.

The next section shows that certain herbicides inhibit enzymes involved in essential amino acid biosynthesis, such as the imadazolinones, which inhibit acetolactate synthase involved in the synthesis of isoleucine, valine, and leucine, and glyphosate that inhibits 5-enolpyruvylshikimate-3phosphate synthase (EPSPS) in the Phe and Trp biosynthetic pathways.

## Herbicide Resistance

Tobacco suspension cultured cells were selected resistant to the herbicide 4-Amino-3,5,6-trichloro-2-pyridinecarboxylic acid (picloram) by Chaleff and Parsons (1978). The regenerated plants showed resistance that was controlled in most cases by a single dominant gene. Newhouse et al. (1991) reported the selection and regeneration of plants from three corn cell lines selected as resistant to imidazolinone herbicides. The resistance was due to an alteration of the target enzyme acetolactate synthase, an enzyme involved in the synthesis of the branched chain amino acids valine, leucine, and isoleucine, that made it less sensitive to the herbicide. The resistance trait was backcrossed into commercial inbreds and then used to produce herbicide-resistant hybrids. One of these hybrids, called Clearfield® Corn, was first sold commercially in 1992 and is still being sold today (Siyuan Tan, personal communication).

A number of selections for resistance to triazine herbicides were carried out with photoautotrophic cultures that use carbon and energy produced solely by photosynthesis with no sugar added to the culture medium (summarized in Widholm 1992). In all selected triazine-resistant cases, the base and amino acid changes in the photosynthetic reaction center psbA target enzyme were different from those found in five different triazine-resistant weed species: where a base change at position 791 changed codon at position 264 from the amino acid serine to glycine. The selected triazine-resistant *Nicotiana plumbaginifolia*, *N. tabacum*, *Solanum tuberosum* (potato), and *Chenopodium rubrum* cultures had codon 264 changes of serine to asparagine or changes in other codons in

the target *psbA* gene. The herbicide N-(phosphonomethyl) glycine (glyphosate), that acts by inhibiting the shikimate pathway enzyme EPSPS, a nuclear-encoded, plastid-localized enzyme (Steinrucken and Amrhein 1980), was used to select a number of resistant plant cell suspension cultures using gradual selection with increasing concentrations. Nafziger et al. (1984) selected a carrot line shown to have a 12-fold increase in EPSPS activity and a tenfold increase in EPSPS gene copies (Hauptmann et al. 1988). Amplification of EPSPS genes was found in glyphosate-selected petunia (Shah et al. 1986), tobacco (Goldsbrough et al. 1990), D. innoxia (Papanikou et al. 2004) and Medicago sativa (alfalfa), and soybean (Widholm et al. 2001). During the glyphosate selection of carrot cells, the EPSPS enzyme activity, mRNA amounts, and gene copy numbers increased gradually, to more than 20-fold, and these increases were relatively stable with a half-life of about 2 yr when grown away from glyphosate (Murata et al. 1998).

There are other reports of gene amplification in plant tissue cultures selected with herbicides. Donn *et al.* (1984) used (*RS*)-2-Amino-4-(hydroxy (methyl)phosphonoyl) butanoic acid (phosphinothricin) to select resistant alfalfa cells with amplified glutamine synthetase genes. Sulfonylurea herbicides were used to select resistant lines of tobacco (Harms *et al.* 1992) and carrot (Caretto *et al.* 1994) with amplified acetolactate synthase genes.

Papanikou *et al.* (2004) reported that newly initiated *D. innoxia*, tobacco, and carrot cultures often produce glyphosate-resistant cultures through mechanisms other than *EPSPS* gene amplification, although older cultures usually are resistant due to *EPSPS* gene amplification. The resistance mechanism in cells where gene amplification did not occur was either increased EPSPS levels due to increased mRNA or some other unknown mechanism, because in the latter cases, the EPSPS levels were not increased and the enzyme activity did not exhibit resistance to glyphosate inhibition. Hollander-Czytko *et al.* (1988) also selected glyphosate-resistant *Corydalis sempervirens* cells that contained higher EPSPS activity due to increased mRNA.

The finding by Papanikou *et al.* (2004), that younger cultures often did not show gene amplification while older ones did, might indicate that the control of gene amplification in plant cells may be similar to that in animal cells. Normal animal cells have controls that do not allow the DNA breaks needed for gene amplification, as this occurrence causes the cells to not divide or to die. Tumor cells, in contrast, do not have these controls, so gene amplification can occur. There are examples of the development of resistance to chemotherapy agents due to the amplification of the target enzyme gene (Stark 1993).

Plant cell cultures are known to be genetically unstable, as shown by retrotransposon activation (Hirochika *et al.* 1996), chromosomal breaks and rearrangements (Lee and Phillips 1988), and somaclonal variation that can be described as tissue culture-induced mutations (Larkin and Scowcroft 1981). Somaclonal variations and retrotransposon activation could be caused by epigenetic mechanisms. Usually, the selected resistant cells occurred at frequencies compatible with possible mutations. In some cases, the frequency of resistance was increased by the use of mutagens, which shows that, in most cases, the usual mutation mechanisms are probably involved.

The apparent inability to select glyphosate-resistant cultures with alterations in EPSPS that make the enzyme resistant to glyphosate inhibition may be due to the relative ease of selection for increased EPSPS activity. Shyr *et al.* (1993) found that at least 0.8% of the cultured carrot cells grown in the presence of growth-inhibiting levels of glyphosate were able to grow after a period of time due to *EPSPS* gene amplification that occurred stepwise upon further selection. It is possible that if higher levels of glyphosate are used for selection, rare cells with an altered *EPSPS* gene could be selected.

Several attempts to select glyphosate resistance at the whole plant level, aimed to test if gene amplification could be selected for, were unsuccessful (summarized in Brotherton *et al.* 2007). However, the weed *Amaranthus palmeri* (Palmer amaranth), which became resistant to glyphosate under field conditions, has been shown to contain *EPSPS* genes amplified up to over 160-fold (Gaines *et al.* 2010), showing that gene amplification can be selected for at the whole plant level with-in certain species. Weeds can also become resistant to glyphosate due to mutations in EPSPS that make it less sensitive to glyphosate inhibition and vacuolar sequestration that reduces translocation.

## **Selection for Enzyme Deficiency**

Allyl alcohol, a compound that can be converted to the toxic compound acrolein by the enzyme alcohol dehydrogenase, was used to treat corn pollen before pollination to produce alcohol dehydrogenase null mutants (Schwartz and Osterman 1976). A suspension culture line of *N. plumbaginifolia* was selected as resistant to toxic levels of allyl alcohol (Widholm and Kishinami 1988). The cells contained one half the normal cell amount of alcohol dehydrogenase activity due to the loss of two of the three isozyme bands on starch gels.

Haploid tobacco cells were selected resistant to chlorate, a compound that is converted by nitrate reductase to the toxic compound chlorite (Muller and Grafe 1978). The selected cells lacked nitrate reductase and thus would not grow in a medium with nitrate as the sole nitrogen source. Chlorate has

also been used with whole plants to select for nitrate reductase deficiency (Nelson *et al.* 1983).

Nitrate reductase auxotrophs were used to make so-called universal hybridizer lines by selecting for resistance to a compound such as the amino acid analog azetidine-2-carboxylate (A2C) that produces a dominant resistance. A2C is toxic when it is incorporated into protein in place of proline. Resistance, in this case, is caused by an accumulation of increased levels of proline in the cells. Protoplasts of the universal hybridizer cell line can then be fused with protoplasts of any wild type cell line that has nitrate reductase to complement the deficiency and is sensitive to A2C (Ye *et al.* 1987).

Protoplast fusion hybrids can also be selected using two cell lines that carry different dominant resistance markers, such as resistance to 5MT and glyphosate (Kothari *et al.* 1986).

Protoplast fusion should be useful since many species can be fused, and the selected hybrids could have a unique combination of genes. Fusion of different species has shown that the mitochondria apparently fuse to allow recombination of their genomes to form new combinations (Kothari *et al.* 1986). Conventional plant breeding does not allow the mixing of different cytoplasmic genomes (plastid and mitochondrial) or the changing of plastid versus mitochondrial combinations; situations that might result in plant improvement. In most plant species, both plastids and mitochondria are maternally inherited during pollination.

## **Conclusions and Future Prospects**

Many things have been learned and commercially important products produced as a result of tissue culture selection for resistance to toxic compounds. There are still possibilities, but the rise of genomics, genetic transformation, and genome editing has shifted the emphasis to these more directed methodologies. However, due to public perception issues and concerns about gene introduction and genome editing approaches, tissue culture selection systems continue to offer promise for the generation of novel and valuable products through the selection of useful variants.

#### References

- Barone P, Zhang X-H, Widholm JM (2009) Tobacco plastid transformation using the feedback-insensitive anthranilate synthase  $\alpha$ -subunit of tobacco as selectable marker. J Exp Bot 60:3195–3202
- Binding H, Binding K, Straub J (1970) Selektion in gewebekulturen mit haploiden zellen. Naturwissen 57:138–139
- Brotherton JE, Hauptmann RM, Widholm JM (1986) Anthranilate synthase forms in plants and cultured cells of *Nicotiana tabacum* L. Planta 168:214–221

- Brotherton JE, Jeschke MR, Tranel PJ, Widholm JM (2007) Identification of Arabidopsis thaliana variants with differential glyphosate responses. J Plant Physiol 164:1337–1345
- Caretto S, Giadina MC, Nicolodi C, Mariotti (1994) Chlorsulfuron resistance in *Daucus carota* cell lines and plants: involvement of gene amplification. Theor Appl Genet 88:520–524
- Chaleff RS, Parsons MF (1978) Direct selection in vitro for herbicideresistant mutants of Nicotiona tabacum. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A 75:5104–5107
- Cho H-J, Brotherton JE, Widholm JM (2004) Use of the tobacco feedback-insensitive anthranilate synthase gene (ASA2) as a selectable marker for legume hairy root transformation. Plant Cell Rep 23: 104–113
- Daniell H, Lin C-S, Yu M, Chang W-J (2016) Chloroplast genomes: diversity, evolution, and applications in genetic engineering. Genome Biol 17:134
- Donn G, Tischer E, Smith JA, Goodman HM (1984) Herbicide-resistant alfalfa cells: an example of gene amplification in plants. J Mol Appl Genet 2:621–635
- Gaines TA, Zhang W, Wang D, Bukun B, Chisholm ST, Shaner DL, Nissen SJ, Patzoldt WL, Tranel PJ, Culpepper AS, Grey TL, Webster TM, Vencill WK, Sammons RD, Jiang J, Preston C, Leach JE, Westra P (2010) Gene amplification confers glyphosate resistance in *Amaranthus palmeri*. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A 107: 1029–1034
- Goldsbrough PB, Hatch EM, Huang B, Kosinski WG, Dyer WE, Herrmann KM, Weller SC (1990) Gene amplification in glyphosate tolerant tobacco cells. Plant Sci 72:53–62
- Gonzales RA, Widholm JM (1985) Altered amino acid biosynthesis in amino acid analog and herbicide-resistant cells. In: Neumann KH, Barz W, Reinhard E (eds) Primary and secondary metabolism of plant cell cultures. Springer-Verlag, Heidelberg, pp 337–343
- Harms CT, Armour SL, DiMaio JJ, Middlesteadt LA, Murray D, Negrotto DV, Thompson-Taylor H, Weymann K, Montoya AL, Shillito RD, Jen GC (1992) Herbicide resistance due to amplification of a mutant acetohydroxyacid synthase gene. Mol Gen Genet 233:427–435
- Hauptmann RM, Della-Cioppa G, Smith AG, Kishore GM, Widholm JM (1988) Expression of glyphosate resistance in carrot somatic hybrid cells through the transfer of an amplified 5-enolpyruvylshikimic acid-3phosphate synthase gene. Mol Gen Genet 211:352–363
- Heimer YM, Filner P (1970) Regulation of the nitrate assimilation pathway of cultured tobacco cells. II. Properties of a variant line. Biochem Biophys Acta 215:152–165
- Hibberd KA, Green CE (1982) Inheritance and expression of lysine plus threonine resistance selected in maize tissue culture. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A 79:559–563
- Hibberd KA, Barker M, Anderson PC, Linder L (1986) Selections for high tryptophan maize. VI Int Cong Plant Tissue Cell Culture. Abstracts Univ Minn, Minneapolis, MN 440
- Hirochika H, Sugimoto K, Otsuki Y, Tsugawa H, Kanda M (1996) Retrotransposons of rice involved in mutations induced by tissue culture. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A 93:7783–7788
- Hollander-Czytko H, Johanning D, Meyer HE, Amrhein N (1988) Molecular basis for the overproduction of 5-enolpyruvylshikimate-3-phosphate synthase in a glyphosate-tolerant cell suspension culture of *Corydalis sempervirens*. Plant Mol Biol 11:215–220
- Inaba Y, Zhong WQ, Zhang X-H, Widholm JM (2007) Specificity of expression of the *uidA* reporter gene driven by the tobacco ASA2 promoter in soybean plants and tissue cultures. J Plant Physiol 164: 824–834
- Kothari SL, Monte DC, Widholm JM (1986) Selection of *Daucus* carota somatic hybrids using drug resistance markers and characterization of their mitochondrial genomes. Theor Appl Genet 72:494–502

- Larkin PJ, Scowcroft WR (1981) Somaclonal variation—a novel source of variability from cell cultures for plant improvement. Theor Appl Genet 60:197–214
- Lee M, Phillips RL (1988) The chromosomal basis of somaclonal variation. Ann Rev Plant Physiol Plant Mol Biol 39:413–437
- Maliga P, Sz.-Breznovits A, Marton L (1973) Streptomycin resistant plants from callus culture of haploid tobacco. Nat New Biol 244: 29–30
- Muller AJ, Grafe R (1978) Isolation and characterization of cell lines of Nicotiana tabacum lacking nitrate reductase. Mol Gen Genet 161: 67–76
- Murata M, Ryu JH, Caretto S, Rao D, Song HS, Widholm JM (1998) Stability and culture medium limitations of gene amplification in glyphosate resistant carrot cell lines. J Plant Physiol 152:112–117
- Nafziger ED, Widholm JM, Steinrucken HC, Killmer JL (1984) Selection and characterization of a carrot cell line tolerant to glyphosate. Plant Physiol 76:521–524
- Nelson RS, Ryan SA, Harper JE (1983) Soybean mutants lacking constitutive nitrate reductase. I. Selection and initial characterization. Plant Physiol 72:503–509
- Newhouse K, Singh B, Shaner D, Stidham M (1991) Mutations in corn (*Zea mays* L.) conferring resistance to imidazolinone herbicides. Theor Appl Genet 83:65–70
- Papanikou E, Brotherton JE, Widholm JM (2004) Length of time in culture can affect the selected glyphosate resistance mechanism. Planta 218:589–598
- Ranch JP, Rick S, Brotherton JE, Widholm JM (1983) The expression of 5-methyltryptophan resistance in plants regenerated from resistant cell lines of *Datura innoxia*. Plant Physiol 71:136–140
- Schwartz D, Osterman J (1976) A pollen selection system for alcoholdehydrogenase-negative mutants in plants. Genet 83:63–65
- Shah DM, Horsch RB, Klee HJ, Kishore GM, Winter JA, Tumer NE, Hironaka CM, Sanders PR, Gasser CS, Aykent S, Siegel NR, Rogerts SG, Frayley RT (1986) Engineering herbicide tolerance in transgenic plants. Sci 233:478–481
- Shyr Y-YJ, Caretto S, Widholm JM (1993) Characterization of the glyphosate selection of carrot suspension cultures resulting in gene amplification. Plant Sci 88:219–228
- Song H-S, Brotherton JE, Gonzales RA, Widholm JM (1998) Tissue culture specific expression of a naturally occurring tobacco

feedback-insensitive anthranilate synthase. Plant Physiol 117:533-543

- Stark GR (1993) Regulation and mechanisms of mammalian gene amplification. Adv Cancer Res 61:87–113
- Steinrucken HC, Amrhein N (1980) The herbicide glyphosate is a potent inhibitor of 5-enolpyruvylshikimic acid-3-phosphate synthase. Biochem Biophys Res Commun 94:1207–1212
- Svab Z, Hajdukiewicz P, Maliga P (1990) Stable transformation of plastids in higher plants. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A 87:8526–8530
- Wakasa K, Widholm JM (1987) A 5-methyltryptophan resistant rice mutant MTR1, selected in tissue culture. Theor Appl Genet 74:49–54
- Widholm JM (1972a) Cultured Nicotiana tabacum cells with an altered anthranilate synthetase which is less sensitive to feedback inhibition. Biochim Biophys Acta 261:52–58
- Widholm JM (1972b) Anthranilate synthetase from 5-methyltryptophansusceptible and -resistant cultured *Daucus carota* cells. Biochim Biophys Acta 279:48–57
- Widholm JM (1992) Properties and uses of photoautotrophic plant cell cultures. Int Rev Cytol 132:109–125
- Widholm JM, Kishinami L (1988) Allyl alcohol selection for lower alcohol dehydrogenase activity in *Nicotiana plumbaginifolia* cultured cells. Plant Physiol 86:266–269
- Widholm JM, Chinnala AR, Ryu J-H, Song H-S, Eggett T, Brotherton JE (2001) Glyphosate selection of gene amplification in suspension cultures of three plant species. Physiol Plant 112:540–545
- Yamada T, Tozawa Y, Hasegawa H, Terakawa T, Ohkawa Y, Wakasa K (2004) Use of feedback-insensitive  $\alpha$  subunit of anthranilate synthase as a selectable marker for transformation of rice and potato. Mol Breeding 14:363–373
- Ye J, Hauptmann RM, Smith AG, Widholm JM (1987) Selection of a Nicotiana plumbaginafolia universal hybridizer and its use in intergeneric somatic hybrid formation. Mol Gen Genet 208:474–480
- Zernova O, Zhong W, Zhang X-H, Widholm JM (2008) Tissue culture specificity of the tobacco ASA2 promoter driving hpt as a selectable marker for soybean transformation selection. Plant Cell Rep 27: 1705–1711
- Zhang X-H, Brotherton JE, Widholm JM (2015) Co-expression of the tobacco anthranilate synthase  $\beta$  subunit with its feedback-insensitive subunit as a selectable marker that also markedly increases the free tryptophan content. In Vitro Cell Dev Biol 51: 564–570