#### FORUM



# A story of bodying in science education

Christie C. Byers<sup>1</sup> · Maria F. G. Wallace<sup>2</sup>

Received: 1 April 2021 / Accepted: 8 April 2021 / Published online: 22 June 2021 © The Author(s) 2021

#### Abstract

In poetic dialogue with *Becoming Alive within Science Education (Research): Thinking with Life History(ies), Bodies and Stickiness*, stories of bodying and body(ies) of work are playfully explored.

**Keywords** Poetic inquiry · Science education · Posthumanism · Affect · Research-creation

### A lived story. A body of work. Or is it, was it, the other way around?

In their article, *Becoming Alive within Science Education (Research): Thinking with Life History(ies), Bodies and Stickiness,* El Halwany et al. (2021) provide science educators and researchers of science education much to consider. We use this space to accomplish three objectives: (1) respond to the posthumanist invitation set out by El Halwany et al. (2021); (2) illuminate a body of work that has been in the making; and (3) amplify El Halwany et al.'s (2021) call to explore life history(ies) as ripe with pedagogical possibility to be/live differently. Building on El Halwany et al.'s (2021) use of *thinking with nature* (Higgins et al. 2018), we further complicate the relationship between nature, culture, and the work of research on science education.

The entangled relationship between the stories we live, the work we embody, and the bodies of work we live has enduring implications. Whether those stories capture affective experiences producing the conditions of science education or (as we show in this piece) multispecies encounters (Haraway, 2007), life history(ies) render the affective experience (ill)legitimate. Also inspired by Whatmore (2006) we recognize:

This review essay addresses issues raised in El Halwany et al. (2021) paper entitled: Becoming Alive within Science Education (Research): Thinking with Life History(ies), Bodies and Stickiness https://doi.org/10.1007/s11422-020-09994-4

Maria F. G. Wallace maria.wallace@usm.edu



Christie C. Byers cbyers3@gmu.edu

George Mason University, Fairfax, Virginia, USA

University of Southern Mississippi, Hattiesburg, Mississippi, USA

An urgent need to supplement the familiar repertoire of humanist methods that rely on generating talk and text with experimental practices that amplify other sensory, bodily and affective registers and extend the company and modality of what constitutes a research subject. (p. 606–607)

Notably, El Halwany et al. (2021) make a unique contribution in that they explicitly illuminate the ontological tensions of engaging posthumanist research for readers. We attempt to extend this commitment to transparency by sharing a glimpse into another lived story; another body of work that has been (and continues to be) in the making for several years. Taken together, these persistent inquiries encourage us to deeply question onto-epistemological and methodological boundaries of research on science education.

## "You had me at ontology."

As many researchers of science education who work in the margins know, these words are rarely spoken aloud; yet, this unlikely occurrence is how we (Christie and Maria) originally met at a science education research conference in 2016. Since then, we have exchanged infinite musings of "what if," "why must we," and "perhaps something different can exist" (e.g., Wallace & Byers, 2018). From thinking-feeling with horseshoe crabs to conversations about teaching, encountering this work on rethinking life history(ies) is just the most recent invitation for us to follow questions of nature hidden in plain sight (Wallace et al., 2018). Specifically, we were inspired to compose with this body of work and generate a new research-creation: a poetic dialogue about bodying (Manning, 2016).



Fig. 1 A lived story. A body of work



Figure 1, a data assemblage, exemplifies the countless "threshold moments" we have chosen to intentionally reside within since 2016 (Nordstrom, 2015). The cellular text messages, email exchanges, manuscripts drafts, titles, and images depict pieces of our story triggered by more-than-human entanglements. Specifically, one moment in 2018 at a museum with preservice elementary science teachers and a horseshoe crab resonated. This moment, like the stories shared by El Halwany et al. (2021), has remained on the move ever since. Wayfaring alongside these authors, we weave our own body(ies) of work together where (new) life, and/or a body of work for (or of) science education emerges (Ingold, 2011).

A Body of Work (Christie & Maria).

\*\*Becoming Alive\* (El Halwany et al., 2021).

The way that light is caught absorbed reflected spoken back in shimmer moves, is moving differently on-through this and that moves me moves into me moves with me

I-we do feel it.

An invitation for movement that refuses containment

> A sense of dissatisfaction grew out of those initial encounters accumulation of affective value<sup>2</sup>

a dimming, a puddle, a sorrow, a leak<sup>3</sup> with the too much of this, the too much of that.
Cloud bodies growing heavy and finally just letting go - a sobbing.



Yet there is also always the return of the sun a sunbeam, the shimmer, *a* shimmer: a bodying of sunlight and water, "water capturing and reflecting the sun, the sun glinting on the water" <sup>4</sup>

And so an uplift, a what's next? a what else? a splayed out stretching in-with the splendor of it a moving-on-with it all.

> Life as movement: a viscous becoming in time space<sup>5</sup>

Wings extending claws scratch, scratching vines reaching desiring, thriving flourishing-in-through-with sunlight; growing, warming up climbing in-through-with air.

The power of the weather an idea, a word a sound a drip drip a shimmer the shaping of a cloud unshaping again the twisting of a tendril the sudden uplift singsong of a bird; an unexpected invitation of liveliness from a horseshoe crab<sup>6</sup>

An overarching wonder: What might it mean to become alive in one's pedagogy and one's research?

Minor gestures<sup>7</sup> of-from life itself in its always movement-moving<sup>8</sup> reaching out and touching skin-shell-feather-claw-wing



breathing in and out in-and-through one another<sup>9</sup> aliveness living other-word-ing other-world-ing beckoning a becoming other-wise.

Becoming alive could be regarded as a continuous state of striving an invitation to think with lives; an incessant coming into presence<sup>10</sup>

The power of moments of wonder of-at-with-through bodies moving to move bodies to story a bodying toward what else might be possible is felt -

> Life history as it is lived in the moment unraveled-in-the-moment could be equated to the world (or the real)

And yet, also felt, are the scratch scratch moment-memories of other stories. sadder songs tales of hurting or giving up, leaky sorrows like the one about the once lively striving bird discouraged now and so peck pecking with less vigor; or the horseshoe crab exploited weakened and now swimming with less blood11

> Thinking with life history(ies): An invitation to think with lives with what exists



and could exist yet at times 'other' lives are made lifeless

To feel, to be felt to affect and be affected. <sup>12</sup> These are bodies. This is bodying.

What then is/or could be

the power of a body? the capacity of bodies? the why of bodies? the more of bodies?

> Some perceive the body as biological and/or social<sup>13</sup> an object, container, or vehicle for emotions: reactive

Bodies of water, of sunshine of blood, claws -

Or the body as the flesh of the world<sup>14</sup> sentient and sensible a site of knowledge and perception

The growing, knowing, becoming the moving-with;
I mean, what else is/of a body?
This body? Our bodies?
What else can this-these bodies do?

Others claim there is never a body as such; a body is its movement<sup>15</sup> threading through the world<sup>16</sup> moving through others

Are we really *bodying*<sup>17</sup> with-through this sunshine, this shimmer, this heavy rainy day? that flowing rivulet? the stillness of this puddle? that grassy field? this prehistoric 'crab'?



Who is dancing?
Who is becoming beauty?
Who is moved by who?

I mean, did we really see-feel-move-with-through those bodies becoming-capable? That moment of light moving across-on-with a pool of, the flow of, the still of water?

If so, how long—what is the duration of this com-position(ing)<sup>18</sup> of bodies? What is the shape of this presence-moving, the in-forming of bodies in a present moment?<sup>19</sup>

The chronological progression in time and place of lives is predictable and comforting; we felt attached to practices which supposedly legitimized our research—grounded it made it strong gave it meaning

Some days I feel
I want my body (and yet can I even say I want, or my body?)
I mean, how far and how wide and
what else is 'this' body?
In-with a bodying of water and sunshine,
where is the boundary of my body?
A body?

We were haunted by a search for meanings

Some days I feel ready for this bodying, this shaping of moments-moving and wonder-world-worlding with bodies.



Other days
I just want it-me, the body the constant body-ing a body + to dissolve to become sunshine<sup>20</sup> to melt like snow to just seep softly into grass.

An-other kind of bodying?

I mean, how much can a bodying body really do? Bodying bodies grow older and tired too.

Wayfaring: These lives are not traced across a world already laid out, but through a world in perpetual formation<sup>21</sup>

But maybe after a little joy some movement across (through) a puddle maybe a little bit of sparkle or sudden birdsong reminder of what else is possible

I-we might feel inspired to make a little scratch scratch scratch scratch scratch scratch scratch a leave a mark sing a little song about it write a poem together: a story of bodying

A body: that which comes into existence from its encounters with other bodies, emerging through acts of storying what comes to matter (and matter less)

Tell it, tell the story leave, share, speak the story create a story with the fullness of a body, our bodies.



A story of bodying with sunshine and water horseshoe crabs and blood<sup>23</sup> with birdsong backgrounded, foregrounded.

Points of contact of being with nature of being touched by nature here nature touches plays (with) humans

But then also, (we can't really help it, can we?). I-we may feel the return of the heaviness of rain the sogginess, the sorrow maybe a little bit of hopelessness, loneliness. a why why why tell a story, this story?

We wondered how human life may usurp rights of non-human others to come to life, limiting opportunities for storying life histories otherwise

And so comes a washing, a washing away again a soaking of bodies a monsoon feeling of drenched drippy sullen soaked, soakeness; I-we hurt, are hurting, and are soaking wet. Freezing.

Some days I-(we?) just want to dissolve, melt away like those old limestone tombstones disappearing slowly the chiseled words,



the scratching, etching attempts at meaning-making, sense-making purpose, purposing. hoping, creating, saying, becoming something
Some thing of value?

What is science?
What does it mean to learn science?
For what?

Something is always being valued. Something is always being cared for.<sup>24</sup>

> His three science teachers they only cared about the right answer; what life is thought to be affects the ways we care

Some bodies might continue persisting, caring. A persisterhood of might.

Might: A collective of strength and possibility.

Hope?

Strong bodies. Resilient bodies. Bodies of sensitivity and grit. (stay interested<sup>25</sup> stay with the trouble<sup>26</sup> the scholars say)

450 million years of bodying other-wise, a persister, and now bodying with us? Bleeding with-for us?<sup>27</sup> Our bodies?

Bringing bodies-meanings together

This is persisterhood. And this is trouble. Stay with it?

Make an ontological move towards increased social and ecological justice?

What are we valuing and caring for here/now/then



as we body?
As we are bodying in-with-this trouble?

Enact forms of care that lie outside what is formally cared for?

For now, as a body of persisters, feeling other-wise we might: write a little something leave a record, a recording a story a restorying a restoration a scratch, scratching away

A mutual telling: in methodological striving one might encounter this work

Like her pushing up the shoreline, and though perhaps feeling tired, exploited, blood-drained<sup>28</sup> we-she might still strive to leave a little mark, make a few scratched lines sing a little song leave a tiny cluster of jiggly green jelly-eggs, (to be half-eaten by red knots<sup>29</sup>) nourishing a journey of bodies leaving a leaving of bodies leaving a body a body of work that others might digest.

Becoming alive:
a continuous state of striving
gesturing toward pedagogical possibilities
for being/living differently
with nature, science, and
science education



Remember me, my blood my blue blood, your red blood (or is it, was it, the other way around?) Purple. Our bodying together. a vibrant, lively gesture an orientation<sup>30</sup> a movement, a moving-with and on toward something else.

Life history(ies), bodies, stickiness, sticking to what is normal/natural and what is not.

Some forms of stickiness are about holding things together.<sup>31</sup>

Some are about blocking or stopping things moving.<sup>32</sup>

'I'—my body—our bodies were here bodying but now I-we are leaving waning, maybe letting go un-bodying

There is a warmth, a relief in the letting go<sup>33</sup> in the flowing out, dissolving in-with sunshine in the spreading out, dispersal (maybe like dandelion seeds?) a de-composing of bodies, of leaving stories storying leaving being partially eaten, or just carried away by wind, on wings, with air.

Finally a landing space?



Stepping into risky terrains: haunting fears mixed with desires for belonging

And perhaps a seeping in at last, a feeling deeply just for a moment (again) the quiver-shimmer of light on water of touching earth, grass of gently slipping into soil of bodying and un-bodying no-bodying back to a life<sup>34</sup> (worth living) completely release from that which has turned so sticky a felt feeling of relief, done striving just wonder(ing). Notes.

- 1. See Ahmed (2021)
- 2. See Ahmed (2004)
- 3. See Ahmed (2021)
- 4. See Rose (2017, p. G53)
- 5. See Vannini (2015)
- 6. See Byers, Jones, & Wallace (2019)
- 7. See Manning (2016)
- 8. Ibid.
- 9. See Weber (2017)
- 10. See Biesta (2010)
- 11. See Byers, Jones, & Wallace (2019)
- 12. See Spinoza (1994), Deleuze & Guattari (1987), Massumi (2015)
- 13. See Lupton (1988)
- 14. See Merleau-Ponty (1995/1945)
- 15. See Manning (2014)
- 16. See Ingold (2011)
- 17. See Manning (2013)
- 18. See Massumi's prelude in Manning (2013, p. x)
- 19. See Stern (2004)
- 20. See Manning (2016)
- 21. See Ingold (2011))
- 22. See Ahmed (2021)
- 23. See Byers, Jones, & Wallace (2019)



- 24. See Elliot, Spruill & Volpe (2021)
- 25. Jesse Bazzul, email correspondence (2020)
- 26. See Haraway (2016)
- 27. See Byers, Jones, & Wallace (2019)
- 28. Ibid.
- 29. See Funch (2017)
- 30. See Ahmed (2006)
- 31. See Ahmed (2004)
- 32. Ibid.
- 33. See King & Valentine (2015)
- 34. See Deleuze (2005)

**Acknowledgements** This work was supported by Spencer Foundation [202000049] and the University of Southern Mississippi.

Open Access This article is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License, which permits use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons licence, and indicate if changes were made. The images or other third party material in this article are included in the article's Creative Commons licence, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the article's Creative Commons licence and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder. To view a copy of this licence, visit http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/.

### References

Ahmed, S. (2004). The cultural politics of emotion. Edinburgh University Press.

Ahmed, S. (2006). Orientations: Toward a queer phenomenology. GLQ: A Journal of Lesbian and Gay Studies, 12(4), 543–574.

Ahmed, S. (2021). *Knocking on the door: Complaints and other stories about institutions* [Online Lecture and Discussion]. The Glasgow School of Art + The Art School: GSA Students' Association.

Biesta, G. (2010). A new logic of emancipation: The methodology of Jacques Ranciere. Educational Theory, 60(1), 39–59.

Byers, C., Jones, A., Wallace, M. F. G. (2019). "You were fearless!" Thinking with/through horseshoe crabs toward intersectional justice. International Congress of Qualitative Inquiry, Champaign-Urbana, IL, United States. (2019).

Deleuze, G. (2005). Pure immanence: Essays on life. Zone Books.

Deleuze, G., & Guattari, F. (1987). A thousand plateaus: Capitalism and schizophrenia. Trans. and foreword by Brian Massumi: University of Minnesota Press.

Elliott, C. H., Spruill, N. & Volpe, D. D. (2021, January 27–31) Who cares? Care as sociomaterial practice and implications for imagining futures with STEM education. [Wondering session presentation]. Science Educators for Equity Diversity and Social Justice. Online conference. https://sites.google.com/view/seedshome/conferences/january-2021-conference/january-2021-program?authuser=0

Funch, P. (2017). Synchronies at risk: The intertwined lives of horseshoe crabs and red knot birds. In A. Tsing, H. Swanson, E. Gan & N. Bubandt (Eds.) Arts of living on a damaged planet (pp. M143-M154). University of Minnesota Press.

Haraway, D. (2007). When species meet. Minneapolis: University of Minnesota Press.

Haraway, D. (2016). Staying with the trouble: Making kin in the Chthulucene. Duke University Press.

Higgins, M., Wallace, M. F. G., & Bazzul, J. (2018). Disrupting and displacing methodologies in STEM education: From engineering to tinkering with theory for eco-social justice. *Canadian Journal of Science, Mathematics and Technology Education*, 18, 187–192. https://doi.org/10.1007/s42330-018-0020-5

Ingold, T. (2011). Being alive: Essays on movement, knowledge and description. Routledge.



King, D. & Valentine, C. G. (Eds.). (2015). Letting go: Feminism and social justice insight and activism. Vanderbilt University Press.

Lupton, (1988). The emotional self: A sociocultural exploration. Sage.

Manning, E. (2013). Always more than one: Individuation's dance. Duke University Press.

Manning, E. (2014). Wondering the world directly-or, how movement outruns the subject. Body & Society, 20(3-4), 162-188.

Manning, E. (2016). The minor gesture. Duke University Press.

Massumi, B. (2015). The politics of affect. Duke University Press.

Merleau-Ponty, M. (1995). Phenomenology of perception. Trans. C. Smith: Routledge.

Nordstrom, S. (2015). A data assemblage. *International Review of Qualitative Research*, 8(2), 166–193. https://doi.org/10.1525/irqr.2015.8.2.166

Rose, D. B. (2017). Shimmer: When all you love is being trashed. In A. Tsing, H. Swanson, E. Gan & N. Bubandt (Eds.) *Arts of living on a damaged planet* (pp. G51-G63). University of Minnesota Press.

Spinoza, B. (1994). A spinoza reader: The ethics and other works. Trans. by Edwin M. Curley: Princeton University Press.

Stern, D. N. (2004). The present moment in psychotherapy and everyday life. W. W. Norton and Company.

Vannini, P. (2015). Non-representational methodologies: Re-envisioning research (Vol.12). Routledge.

Wallace, M. F. G., Higgins, M., & Bazzul, J. (2018). Thinking with nature: Following the contour of minor concepts for ethico-political response-ability in science education. *Canadian Journal of Science, Mathematics and Technology Education*, 18, 199–209. https://doi.org/10.1007/s42330-018-0026-z

Wallace, M. F. G., & Byers, C. C. (2018). Duo-currere: Nomads in dialogue (re)searching for possibilities of permeability in elementary science teacher education. *Currere Exchange Journal*, 2(1), 59–68.

Weber, A. (2017). Matter and desire: An erotic ecology. Chelsea Green Publishing.

Whatmore, S. (2006). Materialist returns: Practising cultural geography in and for a more-than-human world. *Cultural Geographies*, 13(4), 600–609. https://doi.org/10.1191/1474474006cgj377oa

**Publisher's Note** Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

