**RESEARCH ARTICLE**



# **Performance evaluation of moving bed bioreactor for simultaneous nitrifcation denitrifcation and phosphorus removal from simulated fertilizer industry wastewater**

**Roumi Bhattacharya1 · Debabrata Mazumder1**

Received: 4 November 2022 / Accepted: 30 January 2023 / Published online: 10 February 2023 © The Author(s), under exclusive licence to Springer-Verlag GmbH Germany, part of Springer Nature 2023

## **Abstract**

With increasing demand for agricultural production, chemical fertilizers are now being intensively manufactured and used to provide readily available nutrients in larger quantities, which often leach out and contaminate the groundwater source. At the same time, effluents from fertilizer plants also pollute water bodies, when disposed of without proper treatment. The present study evaluates nitrogen and phosphorus removal efficiencies in a single-stage aerobic moving bed bioreactor (MBBR) from diammonium phosphate (DAP)–spiked wastewater containing no organic carbon. To date, no similar study has been undertaken that treats fertilizer plant effluent or agricultural runoff without the aid of external carbon, where organic carbon is hypothesized to be supplied from endogenous degradation of biomass. Both denitrifcation and phosphorus removal occurs in the anoxic zones of deeper layers of the bioflm. The present investigation demonstrates the feasibility of the processes with the requirement of a two-stage MBBR for efective simultaneous nitrifcation, denitrifcation, and phosphorus removal (SNDPr) together with a polishing technology to bring down the phosphorus concentration within limits. A novel bio-carrier designed for efcient SND was used in the study, with a carrier flling ratio of 35% that supported the formation of deep bioflms creating anoxic zones in the inner surface. Identifcation of the bacterial species refects the occurrence of simultaneous nitrifcation, denitrifcation, and phosphorous removal (SNDPr) in the reactor. A maximum ammonium nitrogen removal efficiency of 98% was recorded with 95% total nitrogen removal, 69% phosphorus removal, and 85% SND efficiency, indicating the applicability of the process with a tertiary phosphorus removal unit to lower the nutrient concentration of efuents prior to disposal.

**Keywords** Diammonium phosphate · Moving bed bioreactor · Simultaneous nitrification and denitrification · Endogenous carbon · Phosphorous removal · SNDPr

# **Introduction**

Highly concentrated nitrogenous wastewater with an ammonium concentration between 500 and 2000 mg/L is discharged from several human activities; fertilizer industry effluents, and agricultural runoff being the major contributors (Nancharaiah et al. [2019\)](#page-12-0). The fertilizer industry is an intense water-consuming industrial sector with considerable

Responsible Editor: Guilherme L. Dotto

 $\boxtimes$  Roumi Bhattacharya roumi110993@gmail.com

> Debabrata Mazumder debabrata@civil.iiests.ac.in

 $1$  Civil Engineering Department, Indian Institute of Engineering Science and Technology, Shibpur, India wastewater generation that can contaminate both water and soil (Singh et al. [2006](#page-13-0)). Agricultural pollution from nonpoint sources has long been recognized as another important factor affecting eutrophication levels (Zhang et al. [2004](#page-13-1)). This is particularly due to the presence of high levels of agrochemicals, including nitrogen and phosphorus (Cui et al. [2002\)](#page-11-0) as a result of widespread application of chemical fertilizers. According to the Indian Standards Guide for Treatment and Disposal of Effluents of Fertilizer Industry  $(IS 9841:1981, \text{redffirmed } 2005)$ , effluents from both the nitrogenous and phosphatic fertilizer industry contain high amounts of ammonium and nitrates and phosphates together with negligible COD. As per the standard, the ammonium nitrogen content in effluents from ammonium and urea plants varies in the range of 200–1500 and 500–2000 mg/L, respectively. In the case of fertilizer effluents, presence of phosphorus in high concentration also requires proper treatment and biological removal is one of the most cost-efective methods compared to other physico-chemical treatments (Krishnaswamy et al. [2011\)](#page-12-1).

The use of fertilizers for higher crop production is constantly increasing and its demand is estimated to elevate at 1.4% annually from 2016 to 2022 (FAO [2019](#page-12-2)). Commonly used fertilizers tend to have low uptake efficiency by plants, leading to runoff, leaching, and volatilization (Azeem et al. [2014](#page-11-1)). Diammonium phosphate  $[(NH_4)_2HPO_4]$  is the diammonium salt of phosphoric acid, which is widely used as a fertilizer due to the presence of both nitrogen and phosphorus (Lu et al. [1987](#page-12-3)). When applied to crops, ammonium and phosphorus leach into agricultural runoff (Ye et al. [2018](#page-13-2)), contaminating various other water resources. This runof accounts for up to 52% and 54% of total nitrogen and phosphorus loading in China, respectively (Zhang et al. [2004](#page-13-1)). Agricultural-intensive places in India have been shown to contain large amounts of urea and DAP (diammonium phosphate) residues in canal, lake, and groundwater, the latter being present in relatively higher concentrations (Divya and Belagali [2012\)](#page-11-2). India is often considered to be the world's largest consumer of DAP (Maqsood et al. [2022](#page-12-4)), in addition to being one of the most widely used fertilizers worldwide (Zhou et al. [2020](#page-14-0)).

In the case of biological treatment of effluents characterized by high levels of ammonium and phosphorus, immobilization or attachment of nitrifying consortia in gel beads or solid surfaces, respectively, avoids the inhibitory efect of several by-products, including free ammonia  $(NH_3)$ , and improves overall nitrogen removal capacity (Liu et al. [2019](#page-12-5)). Apart from that, these have additional advantages of efective biomass separation from treated effluent, higher biomass retention, effective removal of nutrients and contaminants, and ability to tolerate toxic pollutants and fuctuating loads (Nancharaiahet al. [2019](#page-12-0)). Attempts have been made to biologically reduce the phosphorus content of fertilizer industry effluents, as reviewed by de Bashan and Bashan  $(2004)$  $(2004)$ . In order to efectively treat the ever-increasing agricultural runoff with biological methods, vegetative drainage ditches can be used, but there remains a need to improve their prop-erties for efficiency optimization (Kumwimba et al. [2018](#page-12-6)). Runofs with low TN and TP concentration can be treated using suspended biomass in wetlands, which can be a costefective method (Spangler et al. [2019](#page-13-3)), but for higher loads, attached growth processes have to be installed. Agricultural wastewater with high COD was treated in a packed bed reactor with carriers with a specific surface area of  $322 \text{ m}^2/\text{m}^3$ (Cramer et al. [2021\)](#page-11-4). Effluent from ammonium nitrate producing industry was treated using a two-stage reactor consisting of an anaerobic flter and a pond for separate removal of nitrate and ammonium content, respectively (Shivaraman et al. [2001\)](#page-13-4). von Ahnen et al. ([2015\)](#page-13-5) attempted to remove urea, ammonium, and nitrite using a moving bed bioflter and determined the kinetics. Nitrate residues in effluent have been successfully treated in a moving bed bioreactor (MBBR) via denitrifcation (Van Aken et al. [2022\)](#page-13-6).

MBBR is a promising technology for treating a wide variety of effluents and several studies have evaluated the performance of MBBR in removing carbon, nitrogen, and phosphorus. The ratio of carbon, nitrogen, and phosphorous is almost always maintained at around 100:5:1 (Iannacone et al. [2019](#page-12-7)) or multiple stages of aerobic and anaerobic reactors have been used (Tsuneda et al. [2001](#page-13-7)). In the process of biological nitrogen and phosphorus removal, the steps of denitrifcation and dephosphorylation require organic carbon, which is not inherently present in fertilizer industry effluents. Thus, aid of an external carbon source is often necessary which increases the treatment cost. An interesting approach for that would be utilization of internal carbon through endogenous decay of microbial cells of the bioflm, though its rate is comparatively less than that with external sources (Rittmann and McCarty [2001\)](#page-13-8). Proper adjustment of biomass content in the reactor signifcantly increases the denitrifcation rate using endogenous carbon (Bhattacharya and Mazumder [2019\)](#page-11-5). Studies have been reported to successfully remove nitrogen from wastewater without organic carbon content by simultaneous nitrifcation and denitrifcation in aerobic MBBR where denitrifcation occurs in the deeper layer of thick bioflms and organic carbon is provided from endogenous biomass degradation (Bhattacharya and Mazumder [2021](#page-11-6)). In such systems, phosphorus removal can be achieved along with denitrifcation due to the formation of anoxic zones in deeper bioflm (Iannacone et al. [2020\)](#page-12-8). Although bioflm thickness of 150 µm is required to form anoxic zones due to DO concentration gradient in aerobic bioflm reactors (Van Loosdrecht and Henze [1999](#page-13-9)), this value depends on bulk liquid DO concentration, hydrodynamics, and bioflm density. Oxygen penetration depth is thus observed to vary between 50 and 500 µm for signifcant aerobic nitrifcation and anoxic denitrifcation to occur in the same reactor (Liu et al. [2020;](#page-12-9) Piculell et al. [2016](#page-13-10)). It has been observed that simultaneous nitrifcation-endogenous denitrifcation requires signifcantly less carbon and oxygen by 45% and 35%, respectively, for successful removal of TN and phosphorus in constructed wetlands (Zaman et al. [2021](#page-13-11); Wang et al. [2021](#page-13-12)).

Enhanced biological phosphorus removal (EBPR), performed by phosphorus accumulating organisms (PAO) removes phosphorus in alternating anaerobic and aerobic phases (Salehi et al. [2019](#page-13-13)). Apart from the accumulation of phosphorus, polyphosphate synthesis can take place under aerobic conditions and is usually carried out by denitrifers (Shi and Lee [2006\)](#page-13-14). Denitrifying P-accumulating bacteria (DPB), also known as denitrifying phosphorus accumulating organisms (DNPAO), use nitrate or nitrite to remove phosphorus (Barak and Van Rijn [2000\)](#page-11-7) even in the absence of organic carbon under anoxic conditions (Tsuneda et al. [2001](#page-13-7)). A study conducted in MBBR with alternating aerobic and anoxic conditions showed 100%, 75%, and 62% removal efficiencies of dissolved organic carbon, phosphorus, and total nitrogen, respectively, under optimal conditions of DO ranging between 0.2 and 3 mg/L, C/N ratio of 3.6, and HRT of 24 h (Iannacone et al. [2020\)](#page-12-8). Efective combined removal of carbon, nitrogen, and phosphorus via nitrite using aerobic granular sludge has been achieved in municipal wastewaters characterized by low C/N ratio of around 3.8 (Campo et al. [2020](#page-11-8)).

The aim of this study is to evaluate the occurrence of SND using DAP-spiked wastewater, which would give an idea of the role of MBBR in treating fertilizer industry efuents or agricultural runoff that resemble real-world conditions. One of the challenges in establishing such reactions in the reactor is the absence of carbon in the wastewater, which is not supplied externally. The extent and efficacy of the procedure are compared with the results obtained from previous literatures under sufficient carbon. As the phosphorus content is usually high, an attempt was made to demonstrate the reduction of phosphorus together with SND, resulting in biological nutrient removal from wastewater based on internal carbon. As can be observed from the earlier literature, the treatment of wastewater containing DAP residues using an MBBR has never been investigated, which is an important area in the present aspect that deserves due attention. Establishing kinetics would further aid in the process design of the reactor for treating fertilizer industry effluents and agricultural runoff. In addition, research on removing ammonium from agricultural runoff coupled with high phosphorus content is also extremely limited. This study would be helpful in understanding the process and gaining insight into the efficiency of simultaneous nitrogen and phosphorus removal in a single system for wastewater with limited organic carbon.

# **Materials and methods**

## **Prepared of DAP‑spiked wastewater**

Commercial-grade DAP (purity 99%) was procured from a fertilizer store. As observed, DAP is not readily soluble in water and therefore available DAP granules were crushed into fne particles using a pestle and mortar to pass through a 2-mm sieve. The powdered DAP was then dissolved in water to obtain the desired concentration. The solution was dull white or greyish white in colour with a pH in the range of about 7.9  $\pm$  0.02. The synthetic wastewater was characterized for the relevant parameters according to the procedures outlined in the American Public Health Association (APHA) Standard Methods (Eaton et al. [2005](#page-12-10)). The results of the characterization are presented in Table [1.](#page-2-0) The

attached biomass in the carriers was determined according to the procedure followed by Herbert et al. [\(1971\)](#page-12-11) using Folin-Ciocalteu reagent. Minor modifcations were made to the amount of alkali copper reagent to be added for colour development of the protein.

## **Reactor setup**

To evaluate nitrogen removal via SND, studies using a laboratory-scale MBBR were conducted at the Environmental Engineering Laboratory of Civil Engineering Department, I.I.E.S.T, Shibpur, India, using DAP-spiked wastewater. An MBBR was designed with a vertical height of 63 cm and a diameter of 20 cm, and cylindrical octahedral polypropylene bio-carriers with fins with a specific surface area of  $8.9 \text{ cm}^2$ / cm<sup>3</sup> were used for the study (Bhattacharya and Mazumder [2021](#page-11-6)). The biomass used in the study was initially obtained from the soil of leguminous plants, later dissolved in water to separate soil particles, and cultured in laboratory-scale reactors for growth and enrichment of the biomass. Biomass was allowed to grow on the surface of these carriers as bioflms in these reactors, and as the bioflm reached an observable thickness of around 1–1.5 mm, the carriers were selected for experimental studies. In the biological treatment of wastewater, use of soil bacteria has been shown to be advantageous and as such bacteria isolated from garden soil have been successfully used to treat ammonium and nitrate fertilizer effluents in fixed film units (Shivaraman et al. [2001\)](#page-13-4). Both batch and continuous studies were conducted to evaluate the performance and the process kinetics of removing nitrogen from DAP-spiked wastewater. Temperature and DO were maintained at  $30 \pm 2^{\circ}$ C and 5 mg/L, respectively, throughout the studies. The presence of high DO in the reactor should ensure that there is no oxygen limitation (Iannacone et al. [2020](#page-12-8)).

#### **Experimental conditions for batch study**

Batch studies were conducted over a period ranging from 82 to 48 h and parameters were monitored at a 6-h interval. During the study, 25% carrier flling ratio was considered and the initial total equivalent suspended biomass was varied between 200 and 2570 mg/L. pH in the reactor was maintained within 7.8–8.3 without the need for external chemical

<span id="page-2-0"></span>**Table 1** Results of characterization of DAP containing wastewater

Sl. no	Parameter	Unit	Value
1	pН		$7.8 + 0.2$
2	Alkalinity	mg/L as $CaCO3$	$70 \pm 32$
3	Ammonium nitrogen (NH <sub>4</sub> -N)	$mg/L$ as N	$500 + 27$
$\overline{4}$	COD	mg/L	$86 \pm 12$
5	Phosphate $(PO4-3)$	$mg/L$ as $P$	$550 \pm 30$

<span id="page-3-0"></span>**Table 2** Operational conditions for treatment of DAP containing wastewater in batch MBBR process

Run no	<b>Batch</b> period (hr.)	Ammonium N (mg/L as N)	Nitrite N (mg/L as N)	Nitrate N (mg/L as N)	Phosphorus (mg/L as P)
	48	100	0.24	1.9	115
$\overline{c}$	56	200	0.58	2.67	200
3	65	300	1.42	0.95	350
$\overline{4}$	72	410	1.06	3.76	490
5	82	530	0.83	3.28	600

adjustment, which is considered optimal for the activities of both nitrifers and denitrifers (Rittmann and McCarty [2001](#page-13-8)). During the batch study, the initial operating conditions in the reactor are as shown in Table [2](#page-3-0) .

#### **Development of Monod's kinetics**

The detailed derivation for evaluating Monod's kinetic parameters is described in the study by Bhattacharya and Mazumder [\(2021\)](#page-11-6). To determine the kinetic coefficients of nitrification in DAP containing wastewater, the initial and final  $NH_4$ -N and biomass concentration and the batch period were taken into account. Accord ingly, the values of  $\frac{\theta X}{\theta X}$  $\frac{\theta X}{(N_O-N)}$  are plotted against that of  $\frac{1}{N}$  $\frac{1}{N}$  to determine  $k$  and  $K_N$  respectively from the slope and intercept. Similarly, the values of  $\frac{(X'-X)}{X\theta}$  $\frac{X^2 - X}{X \cdot \theta}$  are plotted with respect to those of  $\frac{N_o - N_o}{X \cdot \theta}$  $\frac{\partial}{\partial x}$  to find the values of  $Y$  and  $k_d$ , respectively, from the slope and intercept.

#### **Experimental conditions for continuous study**

<span id="page-3-1"></span>Continuous study in MBBR was initiated after enrichment of acclimated biomass in the laboratory-scale reactors. Wastewater spiked with DAP with an ammonium concentration of about 500 mg/L was prepared by diluting the stock solution of the same. To investigate the feasibility of SND for the DAP-contain ing wastewater, the MBBR was operated with varying HRT and attached biomass concentration. The carrier flling ratio (CFR) was maintained at 35% throughout the continuous study; this increase relative to the batch study is due to the absence of any suspended biomass in the reactor. HRT and pH in the reactor were maintained respectively between 18 and 24 h and 7.8 to 8.3. The operating parameters for this continuous study are listed in Table [3](#page-3-1), identifying the variation of diferent parameters in each run. DAP has a high phosphorus content and therefore an attempt was made to examine the removal of phosphorus from the spiked wastewater and to analyse the applicability of MBBR for the complete treatment of DAP-spiked effluent prior to safe disposal. It was observed that the removal of phosphorus after the one-step treatment in MBBR was insignifcant. Therefore, a continuous 2nd-stage operation was conducted at similar operat ing conditions including HRT, using the effluent from the 1ststage operation for residual phosphorous removal. The operating



conditions of the second stage are also listed in Table [3.](#page-3-1) This was performed to verify that the reactor was efficient for removing both ammonium and phosphorus from low carbon wastewater. A comparison of the results obtained in the case of a DAP-doped sample with those obtained from nitrogenous feed would give an idea of the implementation of the process in practice for effluents with and without high phosphorus content. For all continuous runs, a quasi-steady state was considered, which was resembled by varying two consecutive values within a maximum of 5%.

# **Development of overall reaction rate of ammonium oxidation**

In case of substrate removal from industrial wastewater, the overall reaction rate can be calculated using the following equation which illustrates the kinetics of oxidation (Eckenfelder and O'Connor [2013](#page-12-12)).

$$
\frac{S_o - S_e}{f_b X_v t} = K \frac{S_e}{S_o}
$$

where

- *So* infuent ammonium concentration, mg/L
- *S<sub>e</sub>* effluent ammonium concentration, mg/L
- $f<sub>b</sub>$  constant = 1.0 for no influent VSS
- *X<sub>v</sub>* active volatile biomass concentration, mg/L
- *t* time, days
- *K* overall rate constant, /day

Since the DAP-spiked wastewater resembles effluent from the nitrogenous fertilizer industry, this equation can be used to evaluate the process kinetics from the data obtained from the continuous studies. In the case of SND, the stepwise quantifcation related to the formation and utilization of nitrate and nitrite is not evaluated from the single reactor and therefore only the reaction rate related to ammonium is considered. The nitrifying biomass responsible for the process is obtained by scraping the outer surface of the carrier and used in the equation as equivalent suspended biomass (mg/L). A graph is plotted with  $(\frac{S_o - S_e}{f_b X_v t})$  on the *Y*-axis with respect to  $(\frac{S_e}{S_o})$ on the *X*-axis to obtain the rate constant  $(K)$  from the slope of the curve. The value of this rate constant *K* varies with the type of industrial effluent, especially the biodegradable material, and with temperature of the reaction.

## **Calculation of SND efficiency**

From the experimental data obtained, SND efficiency can be calculated by the following equation (Dobbeleers et al. [2017\)](#page-11-9)

$$
SND_{eff} = \left(1 - \frac{NO_{2_e} + NO_{3_e}}{NH_{4_i} - NH_{4_e}}\right) \times 100\%
$$

where,

 $NO<sub>2e</sub>$  nitrite concentration in effluent, mg/L as N

- $NO<sub>3e</sub>$  nitrate concentration in effluent, mg/L as N
- $NH_{4i}$  ammonium concentration in influent, mg/L as N
- $NH_{4e}$  ammonium concentration in effluent, mg/L as N

## **Identifcation of bacterial species**

In order to identify the diferent bacterial species in the bioflm grown on the surface of carriers, metagenomic analysis was conducted. Biomass attached to the carriers was frst isolated from the bio-carriers. During individual extraction, randomly selected carriers were washed with sterile water using a sterilized glass pipette. 16S rDNA was used as a gene marker for the analysis as it helps to identify the diferent responsible genera and species in the bioflm and also to predict the functional potential of the community. PCR was conducted on extracted DNA via barcoding using Ligation Sequencing Kit 1D (SQK-LSK109) and PCR Barcoding Expansion Pack 1–96 (EXP-PBC096). The workflow was designed to BLAST base called sequence against the NCBI 16S bacterial database, which contains 16S sequences from different organisms. This analysis was performed by YaazhXenomics Laboratory, Coimbatore, Tamil Nadu, India.

# **Result and discussion**

#### **Results obtained from the batch study**

Batch studies were performed to assess the feasibility of the process of both nitrogen and phosphorus in MBBR under limited organic carbon, along with the establishment of reaction kinetics that would illustrate the relationship between biomass and substrate. Batch studies with diferent ammonium and phosphorus loadings with diferent HRTs and biomass concentrations refect the trend of phosphorus and nitrogen species reduction over time. The experimental data obtained were analysed according to Monod's approach to evaluate the removal efficiency and kinetic parameters. The CFR and DO concentration of 35% and 5 mg/L were kept constant throughout the study. For MBBR, the DO requirements for nitrifcation are comparatively higher (about 3–5 mg/L) than those required in suspended growth reactors (1–2 mg/L) (Jenkins and Wanner [2014](#page-12-13)). Increasing the oxygen content beyond 5 mg/L results in accumulation of nitrate as a by-product of nitrifcation instead of being converted to nitrogen gas due to inconvenience in deni-trification, resulting in poor SND efficiency (Wang et al. [2020\)](#page-13-15).

#### **Concentration profles for recorded parameters**

Several parameters including diferent nitrogen species, phosphorus, TOC concentration, alkalinity, and pH were regularly monitored to understand the process. Figure [1](#page-5-0) shows the change in ammonium concentration with time as observed during studies with variable initial ammonium and phosphorus concentration. It can be observed that the main ammonium conversion for all batches was completed within 55 h from the initiation of the batches and a particular trend can be noticed.  $NH<sub>4</sub>-N$  removal recorded during the study ranged from 86 to 94%, confrming the results obtained with synthetic wastewater without high phosphorus loading (Bhattacharya and Mazumder [2021](#page-11-6)). Sufficient nitrite and nitrate were present in the reactor during the study showing low total nitrogen removal and hence low SND efficiency. A high DO concentration in the reactor ensured that no DO deficiency hindered the nitrification. This aerobic condition is essential not only for reducing ammonium concentrations, but also for phosphorus, along with establishing a dominance of DNPAOs over DNBs (Jenaet al. [2016](#page-12-14)). Nitrifcation process supplies the required nitrate for further phosphorus reduction in anoxic phase. This study is performed with excess phosphorus, similar to that of Kuba et al. ([1996\)](#page-12-15) in two-phase systems as it confirms the presence of sufficient phosphorus for nitrifer growth in the reactor.

No organic carbon was added to the infuent wastewater spiked with DAP and therefore, the initial TOC concentration obtained from the batches, as shown in Figure S1 (in the supplementary fle), is from the microbial cells. In the early hours of the runs, organic carbon utilization was comparatively low due to the delay in commencement of denitrifcation. Within 12–15 h of the batch runs, the organic carbon reduction rate increased rapidly revealing the use of carbon, thereby exhibiting excellent denitrifying activity. The intercellular carbon was then supplied constantly and a steady TOC concentration was observed in the reactor, indicating

a balance between supply and uptake of TOC. Ninety-three to ninety-eight percent of TOC removal was obtained from the batches. Similar results have been observed with biodegradable carriers under organic carbon defcient conditions (Chu and Wang [2011](#page-11-10)). Similar studies conducted in absence of organic carbon suggest denitrifcation using intracellular and/or extracellular biopolymers as carbon sources (Cui and Jahng [2004](#page-11-11)). In the case of external carbon addition, denitrifying activity is higher at a C/N ratio of 4.2, while the highest nitrifying activity is recorded at the lowest C/N ratio used in the study (Iannacone et al. [2019](#page-12-7)). This rapid decrease in TOC results in a limitation of readily available carbon in the reactor, which would afect denitrifcation as well as denitrifying dephosphatation for simultaneous nitrogen and phosphorus removal (Iannacone et al. [2020](#page-12-8)). To achieve complete denitrification, a  $\text{COD:NO}_3$  ratio between 3 and 6 is often recommended (Van Rijn et al. [2006\)](#page-13-16), and insufficient organic carbon content in the reactor can cause nitrite accumulation (Chu and Wang [2011\)](#page-11-10). This is refected in the data observed in Fig. [3](#page-6-0), which shows higher TN concentration along with low ammonium. When higher ammonium levels are introduced, the COD removal percentages refect the heterogeneous activity of aerobic bacteria, which is corroborated by a similar acclimation study by Zhang et al. ([2021](#page-13-17)) using fertilizer industry wastewater with gradually replacing synthetic carbon-enriched feed.

The reduction in phosphorus concentration over time during the batch study of treating DAP-spiked wastewater in MBBR is demonstrated in Fig. [2](#page-6-1). Denitrifying dephosphatation enables the removal of phosphorus and nitrogen with minimal COD requirements, minimal DO consumption, and the lowest sludge production. DO is only required for nitrifcation of ammonium (Kuba et al. [1996](#page-12-15)). In the present study, maximum and minimum phosphorus removal of 56.5% and 37.7%, respectively, was achieved, with removal efficiency decreasing as the load increased. An average total phosphorus removal of 15–55% is generally obtained along



<span id="page-5-0"></span>**Fig. 1** Profle of ammonium nitrogen during batch studies using DAP-spiked wastewater

with removal of other nutrients in MBBR (Saidulu et al. [2021](#page-13-18); Nhut et al. [2020](#page-12-16)). The main reasons that single-stage MBBR did not achieve high TP removal are longer retention times for the nitrifers, nitrate inhibition, and competition for carbon sources for denitrifcation and phosphorus removal (Chen et al. [2020\)](#page-11-12). Iannacone et al. ([2020](#page-12-8)) concluded that under stable aerobic conditions, phosphorus uptake was negligible due to the defciency of nitrite, which was not the case in the present study. The nitrogen species profle indicated denitrifcation and thus presence of anoxic zones in deeper bioflm layers (Bhattacharya and Mazumder [2021](#page-11-6)). Denitrifying PAOs use nitrate as electron acceptors and therefore can be reduced together with denitrifcation under anoxic conditions (Ma et al. [2013\)](#page-12-17). Under optimized conditions of DO, organic carbon (500 COD mg/L), and phosphorus (12.5 mg  $PO_4$ -P/L), phosphorus removal of about 95.8% was achieved in a laboratory-scale batch MBBR system (Kermani et al. [2009\)](#page-12-18).

#### **Development of kinetics**

Nitrifcation in a biological reactor is quantifed using process kinetics, which depend on a number of parameters including substrate and DO concentrations, organic matter, temperature, pH, alkalinity, salinity, and turbulence (Chen et al. [2006\)](#page-11-13). The experimental data obtained from the batch study is used to evaluate kinetic coefficients for ammonium oxidation since ammonium is the rate-limiting substrate for SND (Chen et al. [2006\)](#page-11-13). Evaluating the data using Monod's kinetics, half saturation coefficient and specific substrate utilization in terms of



<span id="page-6-0"></span>

<span id="page-6-1"></span>**Fig. 2** Profle of phosphorus



ammonium nitrogen are evaluated as 231.34 mg/L and 0.74/day, respectively, as obtained from Figure S2 (in the supplementary fle), which largely depends on biomass properties and experimental conditions and therefore varies largely when compared to other works (Poduska and Andrews [1975](#page-13-19)). Figure S3 (in the supplementary file) derives the yield coefficient and endogenous decay rate, respectively, as 0.8466 and 0.002/day. A low endogenous decay coefficient indicates lesser biomass decay, which contributes to a lower organic carbon supply, which explains the low rates of denitrifcation and phosphorus removal. Kermani et al. [\(2009](#page-12-18)) used the Stover-Kincannon model to calculate half saturation constants and maximum specifc substrate utilization rates of 43.305 g/L-day and 35.088 g/L-day respectively for nitrogen and 8.50 g/L-day and 7.71 g/L-day for phosphorus removal in anoxic, aerobic, and anaerobic reactor setup. The maximum growth rate ( $\mu_{\text{max}}$ ) is calculated to be 0.626/day, which describes the biomass growth and determines both nitri-fication rate (Barker and Dold [1997\)](#page-11-14) and the minimum required HRT of the reactor (Antoniou et al. [1990\)](#page-11-15).

#### **SND, TN, and TP removal efficiencies**

SND, TN, and phosphorus removal efficiencies obtained from the batch studies under diferent initial concentrations of ammonium and phosphorus are shown in Fig. [3.](#page-6-0) In all cases, high ammonium nitrogen removal efficiency was obtained while both TN removal efficiency and SND efficiency were found to be considerably low. The reason for this is that the reactor was operated under highly aerobic conditions with DO around 5 mg/L. The bioflm formed on the carriers was not uniformly thick enough to provide anoxic zones and as such denitrifcation was impaired. Both the suspended biomass and thin layer of attached bioflm on the outer surface and the inner surface attributed to the high ammonium oxidation and thus to high nitrifcation. Biomass sloughing from the carriers resulted in limited depth in bioflms to support anoxic regions, afecting both denitrifcation and phosphorus removal. Phosphorus removal efficiency obtained from the study corroborates the results obtained by previous researchers on nutrient removal in MBBR. In order to achieve a better removal and SND efficiency, higher attached biomass needs to be provided for continuous studies. Another reason for the low efficiency can be attributed to the absence of acclimatization of biomass with DAP-spiked wastewater.

#### **Continuous studies using DAP‑spiked wastewater**

Treating industrial wastewater on a real scale requires a continuous infow into the system, which requires evaluation of the process in continuous mode. Previous studies have shown that continuous operation in MBBR satisfactorily removes carbon, nitrogen, and phosphorus from municipal wastewater (Leyva-Díaz et al. [2020](#page-12-19)). Since high removal efficiencies in terms of total nitrogen and phosphorus were not achieved during batch studies, continuous studies in MBBR are evaluated by introducing a second reactor under similar conditions to obtain better removal. Previous SND studies in an aerobic/anoxic MBBR to treat phosphorus and nitrogen showed up to 100%, 68%, and 72% COD, TN, and phosphorus removal, respectively, at a C/N ratio of 4.2 (Iannacone et al. [2019\)](#page-12-7). The present study attempted to investigate the efect of HRT and biomass density on nutrient removal from DAP-spiked wastewater. Phosphorus and SND removal in single-stage MBBR was observed to be low in batch studies and did not meet standard wastewater disposal limits. Therefore, the potential of two-stage MBBR with similar conditions of CFR, pH range, and temperature will be explored during the study.

## **Concentration profles recorded during continuous mode of operation**

Nitrification in MBBR was particularly efficient with a DO of around 5 mg/L and HRT in the range of 18 to 24 h showed a satisfactory removal between 90 and 96% in all cases, even at a high ammonium concentration of about 500 mg/L, as shown in Fig. [4](#page-8-0). The vertical line at 102 h shows the end of the 1st stage of MBBR and commencement of the 2nd stage. However, not much removal was achieved in the second stage as it had already entered a steady state about 100 h after the runs began. At the end of the second stage, about 96–99% ammonium removal was achieved in all cases, confrming the applicability of MBBR for removing ammonium from DAP containing wastewater.

Phosphorus removal in MBBR for DAP-spiked wastewater was observed to be relatively low compared to nitrogen removal, as can be seen in Fig. [5,](#page-8-1) where a vertical line at 102 h indicates the initiation of the 2nd stage. Several reasons can be attributed to this; the most important one being the biomass, which was initially acclimatized only to a high ammonium concentration. In addition, the C:N:P ratio required for phosphorus removing organisms was not maintained in the reactor, where there was apparently no organic carbon and both ammonium and phosphorus were present in relatively equal concentrations. At the end of the frst-stage operation in MBBR, the phosphorus removal efficiency was observed to range from 47 to  $56\%$ . As this effluent still contained phosphorus concentration too high to be disposed of, a second-stage MBBR was implemented, similar to the frst-stage reactor, to further increase the overall removal efficiency. Phosphorus removal at the end of the two-stage reactor was in the range of about  $64-70\%$ , with effluent phosphorus still being too high to dispose. Therefore, a polishing treatment unit is proposed to remove the residual phosphorus from the wastewater. As previously discussed, phosphorus removal can be attributed to PAO and EBPR organisms, which are reported to accumulate phosphorus up to 4–8% in full-scale water treatment plants, compared to only 2% in typical activated sludge

<span id="page-8-0"></span>



(Orhon and Artan [1994\)](#page-12-20). This value can reach up to 10% in laboratory-scale reactors with synthetic wastewater (Crocetti et al. [2000\)](#page-11-16). Limiting organic carbon increases competition between denitrifying heterotrophs and PAOs, often resulting in limited phosphorus removal (Wang et al. [2019\)](#page-13-20). EBPR can also remove 85% phosphorus from domestic wastewater by metabolizing polyhydroxybutyrate (PHB) stored in cells under anoxic conditions (Tchobanoglous et al. [2003](#page-13-21)).

## **Removal efficiencies with respect to TN, TP, SND, and ammonium nitrogen**

Figure [6](#page-9-0) shows ammonium, TN, and phosphorus removal efficiencies along with SND efficiencies obtained from the continuous studies in two consecutive stages. Each bar for each species represents the cumulative removal along with individual efficiencies as marked on the graph. SND efficiency in the first stage varied between 78 and  $84.3\%$ ,

which increased to the range of 88.3% and 95.4% at the end of the two-staged removal system. Total nitrogen removal was also signifcantly improved at the end of the second stage, ranging from 88 to 95.1%, which at the end of single-staged treatment ranged between 70.5 and 81.4%. This removal efficiency, obtained in both stages, depends directly on the HRT as well as the biomass density in the reactor. The efficiencies were quite high compared to the existing studies, unless external organic carbon was used. It was experimentally reported that an increase in C/N ratio from 4.3 to 7.4 improved the SND efficiency from 55 to 98% (Bueno et al. [2018](#page-11-17)). Similar results were obtained in the case of SND in SBBR using biodegradable carriers, where TN removal efficiency dropped drastically from 89.2 $\pm$ 5.2% to 58.1 $\pm$ 3.5% as COD/N decreased from 7.6 to 2.8 (Feng et al.  $2018$ ). A comparison of removal efficiencies for biological treatment of fertilizer industry effluents in diferent reactor systems is presented in Table [4.](#page-10-0)



<span id="page-8-1"></span>**Fig. 5** Phosphorus concentration profle obtained during continuous studies in MBBR with DAP-spiked wastewater

#### **Reaction rate of overall ammonium nitrogen oxidation**

To determine the overall ammonium oxidation rate, the specifc ammonium removal rates  $\left(\frac{S_o - S_e}{f_b X_v t}\right)$  for various continuous runs are plotted with respect to ammonium nitrogen remaining fraction  $(\frac{S_e}{S_o})$  as shown in Figure S3 (in the supplementary file). The slope of best-ft line in this graph is calculated as 7.641/day, which represents the overall removal rate constant for ammonium nitrogen oxidation in the DAP-spiked wastewater. The value of overall ammonium oxidation rate indicates moderate removal of ammonium nitrogen over the time period. However, it is observed to be about a third of the overall removal rate for effluents with high organic nitrogen  $(K=22.2)$  at 22 °C as men-tioned by Eckenfelder and O'Connor [\(2013](#page-12-12)). However, effluents spiked with DAP did not contain organic nitrogen and the data evaluated are representative of wastewater with high inorganic nitrogen and phosphorus. The overall reaction rate is also largely temperature dependent and therefore for more comprehensive applications of this parameter, the effect of temperature on microbial kinetics must be considered in process design (Leong et al. [2011](#page-12-22)).

## **Bacteriological analysis of the bioflm**

The carriers used in the study had thick bioflms on the inner surface and thinner biofilm on the outer surface exposed to hydraulic shear. For the inner surface bioflm, thickness of more than 1 mm would be thick enough to form anoxic zones for denitrifcation and phosphorus removal. Identifcation of bacterial species on the surface carriers, as shown in Figure S4 (in the supplementary fle), refected the dominance of aerobic nitrifying species on the outer carrier surface and more species diversity on the thick inner bioflm, protected from hydraulic shear. The abundance of various dominant bacteria genera in respective inner and

outer surface bioflm growing on the carrier is shown in the fgure. For both bioflms, proteobacteria was the most predominant group with gamma-proteobacteria dominating others which is commonly observed to play a crucial role in plant-biome interaction (Prasedya et al. [2022](#page-13-22)). *Stenotrophomonas* under the family *Xanthomonadaceae* is the dominant genus observed in the bioflm growing on the outer surface of the carrier which has shown bioflm forming (Ulrich et al. [2021\)](#page-13-23) and nitrifying abilities including heterotrophic nitrifcation and partial nitrifcation (Qiao et al. [2020\)](#page-13-24). *Pelomonas* is often predominant in nitrifying reactors (Zhou et al. [2016](#page-14-1)), often supporting high nitrogen removal in membrane reactors (Zhong et al. [2017](#page-14-2)) and biofilm reactors undergoing SND (Wu et al. [2020\)](#page-13-25). *Bosea* has denitrifcation genes (nir, nor, and nos) and actively responsible for nitrate reduction in heterotrophically hypoxic conditions (Dandie et al. [2007\)](#page-11-18). *Dokdonella* is reported to be responsible for removing nitrogenous compounds, mainly through denitrifcation (Palma et al. [2018;](#page-12-23) Zhang et al. [2021\)](#page-13-17). *Nitrococcus*, found mainly on the outer surface bioflm, is a well-known nitrifer, specifcally an ammonium oxidizing bacterial genus (Arp et al. [2007\)](#page-11-19). *Ralstonia*, isolated from outer surface of the carriers, is another plant growth–promoting rhizobacteria (PGPR) with phosphate solubilizing and denitrifying properties, extensively found in cultivation soils (Han et al. [2012](#page-12-24)).

Among the dominant bacteria in the inner surface bioflm of the carrier, *Rhodanobacter*, commonly, a denitrifying bacterial genus (van den Heuvel et al. [2010\)](#page-13-26), has been reported to undergo complete denitrifcation (Green et al. [2010](#page-12-25)). *Chujaibacter* has been reported to play a crucial role in denitrifcation (Prasedya et al. [2022](#page-13-22)) with potential genus for ammonium oxidation in MBBR-MBR systems (Rodriguez-Sanchez et al. [2018\)](#page-13-27). The species of *Mycolicibacter* obtained in the bioflm is categorized under Terrae clade and are commonly identifed as major players in denitrifcation (Mun et al. [2008\)](#page-12-26). Species



<span id="page-9-0"></span>

Wastewater char- acteristics	Treatment unit	Reactor character- istics	Experimental con- ditions	Treatment path- ways	Removal results	References
$*NH4-N$ : $550 \text{ mg/L}$ * $NO_{3} - N$ : $300 \text{ mg/L}$ $*$ pH $> 9$ * COD: negligible	Upflow submerged biofilm reactor (packed bed type)	* Biofilm reactor * Carrier: BIO- <b>PAC 15</b> * Specific surface area: $150 \text{ m}^2/\text{m}^3$	$*$ Temp: 25 °C $*$ DO: 1.5- $4.9 \text{ mg/L}$ $*NH4-N$ loading rate: 0.077- $0.687$ kg/m <sup>3</sup> /d	Nitrification with feasibility of <b>SNAD</b>	$NH_4$ -N reduction rates: 0.023- $0.583 \text{ kg/m}^3/\text{d}$	Cecen 1996
* $NO_3-N$ : 193.87 $\pm$ 12.68 mg/L * NH <sub>4</sub> -N: 104.87 $\pm$ 3.49 mg/L $*$ pH: 7.55 $\pm$ 0.14	Anaerobic fixed film reac- $tor + oxidation$ pond	* Packing media: black gravel	* Methanol added for denitrification * Methanol:nitrate: 2.5 * HRT: 2-12 (opti- $mum 8$ ) hrs	Anoxic denitrifi- cation, aerobic nitrification	$*$ Nitrate: 97%	Shivaraman et al. 2001
			$*$ HRT: 6d * pH: $8.45 \pm 0.1$		* NH <sub>4</sub> -N: 63%	
* $NH_4-N$ : $280$ mg/L $*$ pH: 10 * Urea: 10.76 g/L	Immobilized aero- bic reactor	* Spherical glass/ foam pellets and powdered charcoal for immobilization	* Temp: 24°C $*$ HRT: 6 d * Saccharose added $(1.5 \text{ g/L})$	$SND + ammonia$ stripping	* NH <sub>4</sub> -N: 90%	Rittstieg et al. 2001
$*$ COD: 100- $600$ mg/L * $NH_4-N$ : $200 - 250$ mg/L $*$ pH: 7.48	$UASB + MBR$		* Temp: $20-25$ °C $*$ DO: 0.23- $0.27 \text{ mg/L}$ * HRT: 2.5-8 h	Anaerobic diges- tion, completely autotrophic nitrogen removal over nitrite <b>CANON</b>	* COD: $98.4\%$ * NH <sub>4</sub> -N: 96.5%	Zhang et al. 2021
$*NH4-N$ : $100 - 530$ mg/L $* P: 115 -$ $600$ mg/L * No organic carbon	Single-staged batch MBBR	* Novel indig- enous carrier $*$ CFR: 35%	* Temp: $30 \pm 2^{\circ}$ C $*$ DO: 5 mg/L * pH: around 8 * Batch period: $48 - 82h$	SND and phos- phorus removal	* NH <sub>4</sub> -N: 86–94% $*$ TN: 17-36% $*$ TP: 38-56%	Present study
$*NH_4-N$ : $500 \text{ mg/L}$ * No organic carbon	Two-staged MBBR in con- tinuous mode	* Novel indig- enous carrier $*$ CFR: 35%	* Temp: $30 \pm 2^{\circ}$ C $*$ DO: 5 mg/L * HRT: 18-24 h	SND and phos- phorus removal	$*NH4-N$ : 90–98% Present study $*$ TN: 70-95% $*$ TP: 47-69%	

<span id="page-10-0"></span>Table 4 Nitrogen and phosphorus removal efficiencies of biological treatment of fertilizer industry wastewater in various reactor systems

of *Luteibacter* has been reported to convert nitrate to nitrite under aerobic conditions (Wang et al. [2011](#page-13-28)). *Tetrasphaera* is a dominant polyphosphate-accumulating genus that has been isolated from wastewater treatment plants undergoing EBPR (Nguyen et al. [2011](#page-12-27); Nielsen et al. [2019](#page-12-28)). This genus is often abundantly found in full-scale biological treatment plants with signifcant phosphorus removal. *Frateuria* is commonly identifed as a potassium-solubilizing bacteria in soil and might be associated with simultaneous nitrogen fxation though the exact pathway is yet to be determined (Subhashini [2015\)](#page-13-29). All these bacterial genera isolated from both outer and inner surface of bioflm carriers are characterized for exhibiting properties for nitrifcation, denitrifcation, and phosphorus removal. It is, however, interesting to note that majority of the species are attributed towards nitrogen removal and that of phosphorus removal is particularly limited. This corroborates with the experimental results of restricted phosphorus removal in the system.

# **Conclusion**

With the increasing use of fertilizers for production, effluents from fertilizer industry and agricultural runoff are characterized by high phosphorus and ammonium content. Since both are nutrients, biological treatment processes for these effluents are particularly efficient and cost-effective, although the lack of sufficient organic carbon for the biological processes requires external addition of carbon sources, which in turn increases treatment costs. In an attempt to solve this challenge, the efectiveness of MBBR when organic carbon is supplied from endogenous degradation of the biomass is investigated. With a flling ratio of 35%, novel bio-carriers were used to support the growth of thicker bioflms on the inner surface. Batch studies performed with DAP-spiked wastewater demonstrate the feasibility of treatment in MBBR with approximately 95% ammonium reduction for a batch period of around 85 h. Denitrifcation and phosphorus removal occurs in the deeper layers of the bioflm, which

are anoxic due to DO depletion. However, denitrifcation and phosphorus removal was not efficient due to low organic carbon content, resulting in low SND efficiency. With the aim of improving the treatment efficiency, continuous studies were conducted using a two-stage aerobic MBBR, which achieved approximately  $90\%$  SND efficiency with over  $60\%$  phosphorus removal. The effluent after two-stage treatment still contained high levels of phosphorus, which could not be safely disposed of without any tertiary treatment. The study shows successful application of MBBR to treat high DAP-containing wastewater as a biological treatment unit, which can be followed in conjunction with a polishing step. The present study investigated the biological speciation of the bioflms which further illustrated the occurrence of the biochemical processes in the reactor system.

**Supplementary Information** The online version contains supplementary material available at<https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-023-25708-z>.

**Acknowledgements** The authors are thankful to the Ministry of Education, Government of India.

**Author contribution** All authors contributed to the study conception and design. Material preparation, data collection, and analysis along with preparation of the frst draft were performed by Roumi Bhattacharya. Debabrata Mazumder commented on previous versions of the manuscript and supervised the work. Both the authors have approved the fnal manuscript.

**Data availability** Not applicable.

## **Declarations**

**Ethical approval** Not applicable.

**Consent to participate** Not applicable.

**Consent for publication** Both authors would like to consent to publish all information provided in the manuscript.

**Competing interests** The authors declare no competing interests.

## **References**

- <span id="page-11-15"></span>Antoniou P, Hamilton J, Koopman B, Jain R, Holloway B, Lyberatos G, Svoronos SA (1990) Effect of temperature and pH on the effective maximum specific growth rate of nitrifying bacteria. Water Res 24:97–101. [https://doi.org/10.1016/0043-1354\(90\)](https://doi.org/10.1016/0043-1354(90)90070-M) [90070-M](https://doi.org/10.1016/0043-1354(90)90070-M)
- <span id="page-11-19"></span>Arp DJ, Chain PS, Klotz MG (2007) The impact of genome analyses on our understanding of ammonia-oxidizing bacteria. Annu Rev Microbiol 61:503–528. [https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.micro.61.](https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.micro.61.080706.093449) [080706.093449](https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.micro.61.080706.093449)
- <span id="page-11-1"></span>Azeem B, KuShaari K, Man ZB, Basit A, Thanh TH (2014) Review on materials & methods to produce controlled release coated urea fertilizer. J Control Release 181:11–21. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jconrel.2014.02.020) [jconrel.2014.02.020](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jconrel.2014.02.020)
- <span id="page-11-7"></span>Barak Y, Van Rijn J (2000) A typical polyphosphate accumulation by the denitrifying bacterium Paracoccus denitrifcans. Appl Environ Microbiol 66:1209–1212. [https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.66.3.1209-](https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.66.3.1209-1212.2000) [1212.2000](https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.66.3.1209-1212.2000)
- <span id="page-11-14"></span>Barker PS, Dold PL (1997) General model for biological nutrient removal activated-sludge systems: model presentation. Water Environ Res 69:969–984.<https://doi.org/10.2175/106143097X125669>
- <span id="page-11-5"></span>Bhattacharya R, Mazumder D (2019) Determination of rate and order of denitrification of nitrified effluent using activated sludge. J Indian Chem Soc 96:487–492
- <span id="page-11-6"></span>Bhattacharya R, Mazumder D (2021) Evaluation of nitrifcation kinetics for treating ammonium nitrogen enriched wastewater in moving bed hybrid bioreactor. J Environ Chem Eng 9:104589. [https://](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jece.2020.104589) [doi.org/10.1016/j.jece.2020.104589](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jece.2020.104589)
- <span id="page-11-17"></span>Bueno RF, Piveli RP, Campos F, Sobrinho PA (2018) Simultaneous nitrifcation and denitrifcation in the activated sludge systems of continuous fow. Environ Technol 39:2641–2652. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1080/09593330.2017.1363820) [10.1080/09593330.2017.1363820](https://doi.org/10.1080/09593330.2017.1363820)
- <span id="page-11-8"></span>Campo R, Sguanci S, Cafaz S, Mazzoli L, Ramazzotti M, Lubello C, Lotti T (2020) Efficient carbon, nitrogen and phosphorus removal from low C/N real domestic wastewater with aerobic granular sludge. Bioresour Technol 305:122961. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2020.122961) [biortech.2020.122961](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2020.122961)
- <span id="page-11-20"></span>Çeçen F (1996) Investigation of partial and full nitrifcation characteristics of fertilizer wastewaters in a submerged bioflm reactor. Water Sci Technol 34:77–85. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0273-1223\(96\)00823-2](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0273-1223(96)00823-2)
- <span id="page-11-13"></span>Chen S, Ling J, Blancheton JP (2006) Nitrifcation kinetics of bioflm as afected by water quality factors. Aquacult Eng 34:179–197. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaeng.2005.09.004>
- <span id="page-11-12"></span>Chen W, Lu Y, Jin Q, Zhang M, Wu J (2020) A novel feedforward control strategy for simultaneous nitrifcation and denitrifcation (SND) in aerobic granular sludge sequential batch reactor (AGS-SBR). J Environ Manage 260:110103. [https://doi.org/10.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2020.110103) [1016/j.jenvman.2020.110103](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2020.110103)
- <span id="page-11-10"></span>Chu L, Wang J (2011) Nitrogen removal using biodegradable polymers as carbon source and bioflm carriers in a moving bed bioflm reactor. Chem Eng J 170:220–225. [https://doi.org/10.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cej.2011.03.058) [1016/j.cej.2011.03.058](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cej.2011.03.058)
- <span id="page-11-4"></span>Cramer M, Schelhorn P, Kotzbauer U, Tränckner J (2021) Degradation kinetics and COD fractioning of agricultural wastewaters from biogas plants applying biofilm respirometry. Environ Technol 42:2391–2401. <https://doi.org/10.1080/09593330.2019.1701570>
- <span id="page-11-16"></span>Crocetti GR, Hugenholtz P, Bond PL, Schuler A, Keller J, Jenkins D, Blackall LL (2000) Identifcation of polyphosphate-accumulating organisms and design of 16S rRNA-directed probes for their detection and quantitation. Appl Environ Microbiol 66:1175– 1182. <https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.66.3.1175-1182.2000>
- <span id="page-11-11"></span>Cui R, Jahng D (2004) Nitrogen control in AO process with recirculation of solubilized excess sludge. Water Res 38:1159–1172. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2003.11.013>
- <span id="page-11-0"></span>Cui N, Cai M, Zhang X, Abdelhafez AA, Zhou L, Sun H, Chen G, Zou G, Zhou S (2002) Runoff loss of nitrogen and phosphorus from a rice paddy field in the east of China: effects of long-term chemical N fertilizer and organic manure applications. Glob Ecol Conserv 22:01011. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.gecco.2020.e01011>
- <span id="page-11-18"></span>Dandie CE, Burton DL, Zebarth BJ, Trevors JT, Goyer C (2007) Analysis of denitrifcation genes and comparison of nosZ, cnorB and 16S rDNA from culturable denitrifying bacteria in potato cropping systems. Syst Appl Microbiol 30:128–138. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.syapm.2006.05.002) [10.1016/j.syapm.2006.05.002](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.syapm.2006.05.002)
- <span id="page-11-3"></span>De-Bashan LE, Bashan Y (2004) Recent advances in removing phosphorus from wastewater and its future use as fertilizer (1997– 2003). Water Res 38:4222–4246. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2004.07.014) [2004.07.014](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2004.07.014)
- <span id="page-11-2"></span>Divya J, Belagali SL (2012) Impact of chemical fertilizers on water quality in selected agricultural areas of Mysore district, Karnataka, India. Int J Environ Sci 2:1449–1458. [https://doi.org/10.](https://doi.org/10.6088/ijes.00202030030) [6088/ijes.00202030030](https://doi.org/10.6088/ijes.00202030030)
- <span id="page-11-9"></span>Dobbeleers T, D'aes J, Miele S, Caluwé M, Akkermans V, Daens D, Geuens L, Dries J (2017) Aeration control strategies to stimulate

simultaneous nitrifcation-denitrifcation via nitrite during the formation of aerobic granular sludge. Appl Microbiol Biotechnol 101:6829–6839.<https://doi.org/10.1007/s00253-017-8415-1>

- <span id="page-12-10"></span>Eaton AD, Clesceri LS, Rice EW (2005) Greenberg AE (2005) American Public Health Association (APHA) Standard methods for the examination of water and wastewater. American Water Works Association; Water Pollution Control Federation, Washington
- <span id="page-12-12"></span>Eckenfelder WW, O'Connor DJ (2013) Biological waste treatment. Elsevier. [https://books.google.co.in/books?hl=en&lr=&](https://books.google.co.in/books?hl=en&lr=&id=3fUbBQAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PP1&dq=Eckenfelder+WW,+O%27Connor+DJ+(2013)+Biological+waste+treatment.+&ots=HK8gkqCbFf&sig=Z2FO0ftXTXnvsKJAPn-6t69klCM&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q=Eckenfelder%20WW%2C%20O) [id=3fUbBQAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PP1&dq=Eckenfelder+](https://books.google.co.in/books?hl=en&lr=&id=3fUbBQAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PP1&dq=Eckenfelder+WW,+O%27Connor+DJ+(2013)+Biological+waste+treatment.+&ots=HK8gkqCbFf&sig=Z2FO0ftXTXnvsKJAPn-6t69klCM&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q=Eckenfelder%20WW%2C%20O) [WW,+O%27Connor+DJ+\(2013\)+Biological+waste+treat](https://books.google.co.in/books?hl=en&lr=&id=3fUbBQAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PP1&dq=Eckenfelder+WW,+O%27Connor+DJ+(2013)+Biological+waste+treatment.+&ots=HK8gkqCbFf&sig=Z2FO0ftXTXnvsKJAPn-6t69klCM&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q=Eckenfelder%20WW%2C%20O) [ment.+&ots=HK8gkqCbFf&sig=Z2FO0ftXTXnvsKJAPn-6t69k](https://books.google.co.in/books?hl=en&lr=&id=3fUbBQAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PP1&dq=Eckenfelder+WW,+O%27Connor+DJ+(2013)+Biological+waste+treatment.+&ots=HK8gkqCbFf&sig=Z2FO0ftXTXnvsKJAPn-6t69klCM&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q=Eckenfelder%20WW%2C%20O) [lCM&redir\\_esc=y#v=onepage&q=Eckenfelder%20WW%2C%](https://books.google.co.in/books?hl=en&lr=&id=3fUbBQAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PP1&dq=Eckenfelder+WW,+O%27Connor+DJ+(2013)+Biological+waste+treatment.+&ots=HK8gkqCbFf&sig=Z2FO0ftXTXnvsKJAPn-6t69klCM&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q=Eckenfelder%20WW%2C%20O) [20O'Connor%20DJ%20\(2013\)%20Biological%20waste%20tre](https://books.google.co.in/books?hl=en&lr=&id=3fUbBQAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PP1&dq=Eckenfelder+WW,+O%27Connor+DJ+(2013)+Biological+waste+treatment.+&ots=HK8gkqCbFf&sig=Z2FO0ftXTXnvsKJAPn-6t69klCM&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q=Eckenfelder%20WW%2C%20O) [atment.&f=false](https://books.google.co.in/books?hl=en&lr=&id=3fUbBQAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PP1&dq=Eckenfelder+WW,+O%27Connor+DJ+(2013)+Biological+waste+treatment.+&ots=HK8gkqCbFf&sig=Z2FO0ftXTXnvsKJAPn-6t69klCM&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q=Eckenfelder%20WW%2C%20O)
- <span id="page-12-2"></span>FAO (2019) World fertilizer trends and outlook to 2022. Rome, Italy. <http://faostat3.fao.org>
- <span id="page-12-21"></span>Feng LJ, Jia R, Zeng Z, Yang GF, Xu XY (2018) Simultaneous nitrifcation denitrifcation and microbial community profle in an oxygen-limiting intermittent aeration SBBR with biodegradable carriers. Biodegradation 29:473–486. [https://doi.org/10.1007/](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10532-018-9845-x) [s10532-018-9845-x](https://doi.org/10.1007/s10532-018-9845-x)
- <span id="page-12-25"></span>Green SJ, Prakash O, Gihring TM, Akob DM, Jasrotia P, Jardine PM, Watson DB, Brown SD, Palumbo AV, Kostka JE (2010) Denitrifying bacteria isolated from terrestrial subsurface sediments exposed to mixed-waste contamination. Appl Environ Microbiol 76:3244–3254. <https://doi.org/10.1128/AEM.03069-09>
- <span id="page-12-24"></span>Han C, Wright GS, Fisher K, Rigby SE, Eady RR, Hasnain SS (2012) Characterization of a novel copper-haem c dissimilatory nitrite reductase from Ralstonia pickettii. Biochem J 444:219–226. <https://doi.org/10.1042/BJ20111623>
- <span id="page-12-11"></span>Herbert D, Phipps PJ, Strange RE (1971) Chapter III chemical analysis of microbial cells. Methods Microbiol 5:209–344. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0580-9517(08)70641-X) [10.1016/S0580-9517\(08\)70641-X](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0580-9517(08)70641-X)
- <span id="page-12-7"></span>Iannacone F, Di Capua F, Granata F, Gargano R, Pirozzi F, Esposito G (2019) Efect of carbon-to-nitrogen ratio on simultaneous nitrifcation denitrifcation and phosphorus removal in a microaerobic moving bed bioflm reactor. J Environ Manag 250:109518. [https://](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2019.109518) [doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2019.109518](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2019.109518)
- <span id="page-12-8"></span>Iannacone F, Di Capua F, Granata F, Gargano R, Esposito G (2020) Simultaneous nitrification, denitrification and phosphorus removal in a continuous-fow moving bed bioflm reactor alternating microaerobic and aerobic conditions. Bioresour Technol 310:123453.<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2020.123453>
- <span id="page-12-14"></span>Jena J, Kumar R, Saifuddin M, Dixit A, Das T (2016) Anoxic–aerobic SBR system for nitrate, phosphate and COD removal from high-strength wastewater and diversity study of microbial communities. Biochem Eng J 105:80–89. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bej.2015.09.007) [bej.2015.09.007](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.bej.2015.09.007)
- <span id="page-12-13"></span>Jenkins D, Wanner J (2014) Activated sludge-100 years and counting. IWA publishing. [https://books.google.co.in/books?hl=en&lr=&](https://books.google.co.in/books?hl=en&lr=&id=J7cDBAAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PP1&dq=Jenkins+D,+Wanner+J+(2014)+Activated+sludge-100+years+and+counting.+&ots=fqGBSD__CX&sig=Ol_nzGY4ZOQuqJZtHCyoKa8lCL4&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q=Jenkins%20D%2C%20Wanner%20J%20(2014)%20Activated%20sludge-100%20years%20and%20counting.&f=false) [id=J7cDBAAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PP1&dq=Jenkins+D,+Wan](https://books.google.co.in/books?hl=en&lr=&id=J7cDBAAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PP1&dq=Jenkins+D,+Wanner+J+(2014)+Activated+sludge-100+years+and+counting.+&ots=fqGBSD__CX&sig=Ol_nzGY4ZOQuqJZtHCyoKa8lCL4&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q=Jenkins%20D%2C%20Wanner%20J%20(2014)%20Activated%20sludge-100%20years%20and%20counting.&f=false)[ner+J+\(2014\)+Activated+sludge-100+years+and+counting.+&](https://books.google.co.in/books?hl=en&lr=&id=J7cDBAAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PP1&dq=Jenkins+D,+Wanner+J+(2014)+Activated+sludge-100+years+and+counting.+&ots=fqGBSD__CX&sig=Ol_nzGY4ZOQuqJZtHCyoKa8lCL4&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q=Jenkins%20D%2C%20Wanner%20J%20(2014)%20Activated%20sludge-100%20years%20and%20counting.&f=false) [ots=fqGBSD\\_\\_CX&sig=Ol\\_nzGY4ZOQuqJZtHCyoKa8lCL4&](https://books.google.co.in/books?hl=en&lr=&id=J7cDBAAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PP1&dq=Jenkins+D,+Wanner+J+(2014)+Activated+sludge-100+years+and+counting.+&ots=fqGBSD__CX&sig=Ol_nzGY4ZOQuqJZtHCyoKa8lCL4&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q=Jenkins%20D%2C%20Wanner%20J%20(2014)%20Activated%20sludge-100%20years%20and%20counting.&f=false) [redir\\_esc=y#v=onepage&q=Jenkins%20D%2C%20Wanner%](https://books.google.co.in/books?hl=en&lr=&id=J7cDBAAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PP1&dq=Jenkins+D,+Wanner+J+(2014)+Activated+sludge-100+years+and+counting.+&ots=fqGBSD__CX&sig=Ol_nzGY4ZOQuqJZtHCyoKa8lCL4&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q=Jenkins%20D%2C%20Wanner%20J%20(2014)%20Activated%20sludge-100%20years%20and%20counting.&f=false) [20J%20\(2014\)%20Activated%20sludge-100%20years%20and%](https://books.google.co.in/books?hl=en&lr=&id=J7cDBAAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PP1&dq=Jenkins+D,+Wanner+J+(2014)+Activated+sludge-100+years+and+counting.+&ots=fqGBSD__CX&sig=Ol_nzGY4ZOQuqJZtHCyoKa8lCL4&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q=Jenkins%20D%2C%20Wanner%20J%20(2014)%20Activated%20sludge-100%20years%20and%20counting.&f=false) [20counting.&f=false](https://books.google.co.in/books?hl=en&lr=&id=J7cDBAAAQBAJ&oi=fnd&pg=PP1&dq=Jenkins+D,+Wanner+J+(2014)+Activated+sludge-100+years+and+counting.+&ots=fqGBSD__CX&sig=Ol_nzGY4ZOQuqJZtHCyoKa8lCL4&redir_esc=y#v=onepage&q=Jenkins%20D%2C%20Wanner%20J%20(2014)%20Activated%20sludge-100%20years%20and%20counting.&f=false)
- <span id="page-12-18"></span>Kermani M, Bina B, Movahedian H, Amin MM, Nikaein M (2009) Biological phosphorus and nitrogen removal from wastewater using moving bed bioflm process. Iran J Biotechnol 7:19–27
- <span id="page-12-1"></span>Krishnaswamy U, Muthuchamy M, Perumalsamy L (2011) Biological removal of phosphate from synthetic wastewater using bacterial consortium. Iran J Biotechnol 9:37–49
- <span id="page-12-15"></span>Kuba TMCM, Van Loosdrecht MCM, Heijnen JJ (1996) Phosphorus and nitrogen removal with minimal COD requirement by integration of denitrifying dephosphatation and nitrifcation in a

two-sludge system. Water Res 30:1702–1710. [https://doi.org/10.](https://doi.org/10.1016/0043-1354(96)00050-4) [1016/0043-1354\(96\)00050-4](https://doi.org/10.1016/0043-1354(96)00050-4)

- <span id="page-12-6"></span>Kumwimba MN, Meng F, Iseyemi O, Moore MT, Zhu B, Tao W, Liang TJ, Ilunga L (2018) Removal of non-point source pollutants from domestic sewage and agricultural runoff by vegetated drainage ditches (VDDs): design, mechanism, management strategies, and future directions. Sci Total Environ 639:742–759. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2018.05.184) [10.1016/j.scitotenv.2018.05.184](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2018.05.184)
- <span id="page-12-22"></span>Leong SK, Chang SH, Kassim NA, Nasuha N (2011) Determination of treatability constant and reaction-rate constant for an attachedgrowth upfow fxed-flm reactor on pulp and paper wastewater treatment. Int J Chem Eng Appl 2:14–19
- <span id="page-12-19"></span>Leyva-Díaz JC, Monteoliva-García A, Martín-Pascual J, Munio MM, García-Mesa JJ, Poyatos JM (2020) Moving bed bioflm reactor as an alternative wastewater treatment process for nutrient removal and recovery in the circular economy model. Bioresour Technol 299:122631.<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2019.122631>
- <span id="page-12-5"></span>Liu W, Chen W, Yang D, Shen Y (2019) Functional and compositional characteristics of nitrifers reveal the failure of achieving mainstream nitritation under limited oxygen or ammonia conditions. Biores Technol 275:272–279. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2018.12.065) [2018.12.065](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2018.12.065)
- <span id="page-12-9"></span>Liu T, He X, Jia G, Xu J, Quan X, You S (2020) Simultaneous nitrifcation and denitrifcation process using novel surface-modifed suspended carriers for the treatment of real domestic wastewater. Chemosphere 247:125831. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2020.125831) [2020.125831](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2020.125831)
- <span id="page-12-3"></span>Lu DQ, Chien SH, Henao J, Sompongse D (1987) Evaluation of shortterm efficiency of diammonium phosphate versus urea plus single superphosphate on a calcareous soil. Agron J 79:896–900. [https://](https://doi.org/10.2134/agronj1987.00021962007900050028x) [doi.org/10.2134/agronj1987.00021962007900050028x](https://doi.org/10.2134/agronj1987.00021962007900050028x)
- <span id="page-12-17"></span>Ma B, Wang S, Zhu G, Ge S, Wang J, Ren N, Peng Y (2013) Denitrifcation and phosphorus uptake by DPAOs using nitrite as an electron acceptor by step-feed strategies. Front Environ Sci Eng 7:267–272.<https://doi.org/10.1007/s11783-012-0439-2>
- <span id="page-12-4"></span>Maqsood MA, Ashraf I, Rasheed N (2022) Sources of nitrogen for crop growth: Pakistan's case. In Nitrogen assessment 13–28, Academic Press. <https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-12-824417-3.00005-8>
- <span id="page-12-26"></span>Mun HS, Park JH, Kim H, Yu HK, Park YG, Cha CY, Kook YH, Kim BJ (2008) Mycobacterium senuense sp. nov., a slowly growing, non-chromogenic species closely related to the Mycobacterium terrae complex. Int J Syst Evol Microbiol 58:641–646. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1099/ijs.0.65374-0) [org/10.1099/ijs.0.65374-0](https://doi.org/10.1099/ijs.0.65374-0)
- <span id="page-12-0"></span>Nancharaiah YV, Mohan SV, Lens PNL (2019) Removal and recovery of metals and nutrients from wastewater using bioelectrochemical systems. In Microbial Electrochemical Technology 693–720, Elsevier.<https://doi.org/10.1016/B978-0-444-64052-9.00028-5>
- <span id="page-12-27"></span>Nguyen HTT, Le VQ, Hansen AA, Nielsen JL, Nielsen PH (2011) High diversity and abundance of putative polyphosphate-accumulating Tetrasphaera-related bacteria in activated sludge systems. FEMS Microbiol Ecol 76:256–267. [https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1574-6941.](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1574-6941.2011.01049.x) 2011.01049 x
- <span id="page-12-16"></span>Nhut HT, Hung NTQ, Sac TC, Bang NHK, Tri TQ, Hiep NT, Ky NM (2020) Removal of nutrients and organic pollutants from domestic wastewater treatment by sponge-based moving bed bioflm reactor. Environ Eng Res 25:652–658.<https://doi.org/10.4491/eer.2019.285>
- <span id="page-12-28"></span>Nielsen PH, McIlroy SJ, Albertsen M, Nierychlo M (2019) Re-evaluating the microbiology of the enhanced biological phosphorus removal process. Curr Opin Biotechnol 57:111–118. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.copbio.2019.03.008) [org/10.1016/j.copbio.2019.03.008](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.copbio.2019.03.008)
- <span id="page-12-20"></span>Orhon D, Artan N (1994) Modeling of activated sludge systems. Technomic Publ. Co., Lancaster
- <span id="page-12-23"></span>Palma TL, Donaldben MN, Costa MC, Carlier JD (2018) Putative role of Flavobacterium, Dokdonella and Methylophilus strains in paracetamol biodegradation. Water Air Soil Pollut 229:1–23. [https://](https://doi.org/10.1007/s11270-018-3858-2) [doi.org/10.1007/s11270-018-3858-2](https://doi.org/10.1007/s11270-018-3858-2)
- <span id="page-13-10"></span>Piculell M, Welander P, Jönsson K, Welander T (2016) Evaluating the efect of bioflm thickness on nitrifcation in moving bed bioflm reactors. Environ Technol 37:732–743. [https://doi.org/10.1080/](https://doi.org/10.1080/09593330.2015.1080308) [09593330.2015.1080308](https://doi.org/10.1080/09593330.2015.1080308)
- <span id="page-13-19"></span>Poduska RA, Andrews JF (1975) Dynamics of nitrifcation in the activated sludge process. J (Water Pollution Control Federation) 47:2599–2619
- <span id="page-13-22"></span>Prasedya ES, Kurniawan NSH, Kirana IAP, Ardiana N, Abidin AS, Ilhami BTK, Jupri A, Widyastuti S, Sunarpi H, Nikmatullah A (2022) Seaweed fertilizer prepared by EM-fermentation increases abundance of benefcial soil microbiome in paddy (Oryzasativa L.) during vegetative stage. Fermentation 8:46. [https://doi.org/10.](https://doi.org/10.3390/fermentation8020046) [3390/fermentation8020046](https://doi.org/10.3390/fermentation8020046)
- <span id="page-13-24"></span>Qiao Z, Sun R, Wu Y, Hu S, Liu X, Chan J, Mi X (2020) Characteristics and metabolic pathway of the bacteria for heterotrophic nitrifcation and aerobic denitrifcation in aquatic ecosystems. Environ Res 191:110069.<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.envres.2020.110069>
- <span id="page-13-8"></span>Rittmann BE, McCarty PL (2001) Environmental biotechnology: principles and applications. McGraw-Hill Education. [https://www.](https://www.accessengineeringlibrary.com/content/book/9781260440591) [accessengineeringlibrary.com/content/book/9781260440591](https://www.accessengineeringlibrary.com/content/book/9781260440591)
- <span id="page-13-30"></span>Rittstieg K, Robra KH, Somitsch W (2001) Aerobic treatment of a concentrated urea wastewater with simultaneous stripping of ammonia. Appl Microbiol Biotechnol 56:820–825. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1007/s002530100696) [org/10.1007/s002530100696](https://doi.org/10.1007/s002530100696)
- <span id="page-13-27"></span>Rodriguez-Sanchez A, Muñoz-Palazon B, Hurtado-Martinez M, Rivadeneyra MA, Poyatos JM, Gonzalez-Lopez J (2018) Maximum infuent salinity afects the diversity of mineral-precipitationmediating bacterial communities in membrane bioflm of hybrid moving bed bioflm reactor-membrane bioreactor. Water Air Soil Pollut 229:1–17.<https://doi.org/10.1007/s11270-018-4020-x>
- <span id="page-13-18"></span>Saidulu D, Majumder A, Gupta AK (2021) A systematic review of moving bed bioflm reactor, membrane bioreactor, and moving bed membrane bioreactor for wastewater treatment: comparison of research trends, removal mechanisms, and performance. J Enviro Chem Eng 9:106112. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jece.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jece.2021.106112) [2021.106112](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jece.2021.106112)
- <span id="page-13-13"></span>Salehi S, Cheng KY, Heitz A, Ginige MP (2019) Simultaneous nitrifcation, denitrifcation and phosphorus recovery (SNDPr) - an opportunity to facilitate full-scale recovery of phosphorus from municipal wastewater. J Environ Manage 238:41–48. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2019.02.063) [org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2019.02.063](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.jenvman.2019.02.063)
- <span id="page-13-14"></span>Shi HP, Lee CM (2006) Combining anoxic denitrifying ability with aerobic–anoxic phosphorus-removal examinations to screen denitrifying phosphorus-removing bacteria. Int Biodeterior Biodegrad 57:121–128.<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ibiod.2006.01.001>
- <span id="page-13-4"></span>Shivaraman N, Vaidya AN, Waghmare SV, Paunikar WN, Tankhiwale A, Padoley K (2001) A two-stage biological treatment system for ammonium-nitrate-laden wastewater. World J Microbiol Biotechnol 17:447–453. <https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1011996323850>
- <span id="page-13-0"></span>Singh PP, Mall M, Singh J (2006) Impact of fertilizer factory effluent on seed germination, seedling growth and chlorophyll content of gram (Cicer aeritenum). J Environ Biol 27:153–156
- <span id="page-13-3"></span>Spangler JT, Sample DJ, Fox LJ, Owen JS Jr, White SA (2019) Floating treatment wetland aided nutrient removal from agricultural runof using two wetland species. Ecol Eng 127:468–479. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoleng.2018.12.017) [10.1016/j.ecoleng.2018.12.017](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoleng.2018.12.017)
- <span id="page-13-29"></span>Subhashini DV (2015) Growth promotion and increased potassium uptake of tobacco by potassium-mobilizing bacterium Frateuriaaurantia grown at diferent potassium levels in vertisols. Commun Soil Sci Plant Anal 46:210–220. [https://doi.org/10.1080/](https://doi.org/10.1080/00103624.2014.967860) [00103624.2014.967860](https://doi.org/10.1080/00103624.2014.967860)
- <span id="page-13-21"></span>Tchobanoglous G, Burton FL, Stensel HD (2003) Wastewater engineering treatment and reuse (No. 628.3 T252s). McGraw-Hill Higher Education, Boston, US
- <span id="page-13-7"></span>Tsuneda S, Park S, Hayashi H, Jung J, Hirata A (2001) Enhancement of nitrifying bioflm formation using selected EPS produced by heterotrophic bacteria. Water Sci Technol 43:197-204. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.2166/wst.2001.0374) [org/10.2166/wst.2001.0374](https://doi.org/10.2166/wst.2001.0374)
- <span id="page-13-23"></span>Ulrich K, Kube M, Becker R, Schneck V, Ulrich A (2021) Genomic analysis of the endophytic Stenotrophomonas strain 169 reveals features related to plant-growth promotion and stress tolerance. Front Microbiol 12:1542.<https://doi.org/10.3389/fmicb.2021.687463>
- <span id="page-13-6"></span>Van Aken P, Lambert N, Appels L (2022) Low temperature moving bed bioreactor denitrifcation as mitigation measure to reduce agricultural nitrate losses. Sci Total Environ 810:152110. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2021.152110) [10.1016/j.scitotenv.2021.152110](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2021.152110)
- <span id="page-13-9"></span>Van Loosdrecht MC, Henze M (1999) Maintenance, endogeneous respiration, lysis, decay and predation. Water Sci Technol 39:107– 117. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0273-1223\(98\)00780-X](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0273-1223(98)00780-X)
- <span id="page-13-16"></span>Van Rijn J, Tal Y, Schreier HJ (2006) Denitrifcation in recirculating systems: theory and applications. Aquacult Eng 34:364–376. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaeng.2005.04.004>
- <span id="page-13-26"></span>van den Heuvel RN, van der Biezen E, Jetten MSM, Hefting MM, Kartal B (2010) Denitrifcation at pH 4 by a soil-derived Rhodanobacter dominated community. Environ Microbiol 12:3264–3271. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1462-2920.2010.02301.x>
- <span id="page-13-5"></span>von Ahnen M, Pedersen LF, Pedersen PB, Dalsgaard J (2015) Degradation of urea, ammonia and nitrite in moving bed bioflters operated at diferent feed loadings. Aquac Eng 69:50–59. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaeng.2015.10.004) [10.1016/j.aquaeng.2015.10.004](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.aquaeng.2015.10.004)
- <span id="page-13-28"></span>Wang L, Wang GL, Li SP, Jiang JD (2011) Luteibacterjiangsuensis sp. nov.: a methamidophos-degrading bacterium isolated from a methamidophos-manufacturing factory. Curr Microbiol 62:289– 295.<https://doi.org/10.1007/s00284-010-9707-1>
- <span id="page-13-20"></span>Wang X, Zhao J, Yu D, Chen G, Du S, Zhen J, Yuan M (2019) Stable nitrite accumulation and phosphorous removal from nitrate and municipal wastewaters in a combined process of endogenous partial denitrifcation and denitrifying phosphorus removal (EPDPR). Chem Eng J 355:560–571.<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cej.2018.08.165>
- <span id="page-13-15"></span>Wang J, Rong H, Cao Y, Zhang C (2020) Factors afecting simultaneous nitrifcation and denitrifcation (SND) in a moving bed sequencing batch reactor (MBSBR) system as revealed by microbial community structures. Bioprocess Biosyst Eng 43:1833–1846
- <span id="page-13-12"></span>Wang J, Xia L, Chen J, Wang X, Wu H, Li D, Wells GF, Yang J, Hou J, He X (2021) Synergistic simultaneous nitrifcation-endogenous denitrifcation and EBPR for advanced nitrogen and phosphorus removal in constructed wetlands. Chem Eng J 420:127605. [https://](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cej.2020.127605) [doi.org/10.1016/j.cej.2020.127605](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cej.2020.127605)
- <span id="page-13-25"></span>Wu Z, Zhu W, Liu Y, Peng P, Li X, Zhou X, Xu J (2020) An integrated threedimensional electrochemical system for efficient treatment of coking wastewater rich in ammonia nitrogen. Chemosphere 246:125703.<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2019.125703>
- <span id="page-13-2"></span>Ye Y, Ngo HH, Guo W, Liu Y, Chang SW, Nguyen DD, Liang H, Wang J (2018) A critical review on ammonium recovery from wastewater for sustainable wastewater management. Biores Technol 268:749–758.<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2018.07.111>
- <span id="page-13-11"></span>Zaman M, Kim M, Nakhla G (2021) Simultaneous nitrifcation-denitrifying phosphorus removal (SNDPR) at low DO for treating carbon-limited municipal wastewater. Sci Total Environ 760:143387. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.scitotenv.2020.143387>
- <span id="page-13-1"></span>Zhang WL, Wu SX, Ji HJ, Kolbe H (2004) Estimation of agricultural non-point source pollution in China and the alleviating strategies I. Estimation of agricultural non-point source pollution in China in early 21 century. Scientiaagriculturasinica 37:1008–1017
- <span id="page-13-17"></span>Zhang X, Zhang H, Chen Z, Wei D, Song Y, Ma Y, Zhang H (2021) Achieving biogas production and efficient pollutants removal from nitrogenous fertilizer wastewater using combined

anaerobic digestion and autotrophic nitrogen removal process. Bioresour Technol 339:125659. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biort](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2021.125659) [ech.2021.125659](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.biortech.2021.125659)

- <span id="page-14-2"></span>Zhong L, Lai CY, Shi LD, Wang KD, Dai YJ, Liu YW, Ma F, Rittmann BE, Zheng P, Zhao HP (2017) Nitrate effects on chromate reduction in a methane based bioflm. Water Res 115:130–137. [https://](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2017.03.003) [doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2017.03.003](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.watres.2017.03.003)
- <span id="page-14-1"></span>Zhou Q, Zhang L, Chen J, Luo Y, Zou H, Sun B (2016) Enhanced stable long-term operation of biotrickling flters treating VOCs by low-dose ozonation and its afecting mechanism on bioflm. Chemosphere 162:139–147.<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.chemosphere.2016.07.072>
- <span id="page-14-0"></span>Zhou J, Ji L, Gong C, Lu L, Cheng X (2020) Ceramsite vegetated concrete with water and fertilizer conservation and light weight: efect

of w/c and fertilizer on basic physical performances of concrete and physiological characteristics of *Festucaarundinacea*. Constr Build Mater 236:117785. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.conbuildmat.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.conbuildmat.2019.117785) [2019.117785](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.conbuildmat.2019.117785)

**Publisher's note** Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.

Springer Nature or its licensor (e.g. a society or other partner) holds exclusive rights to this article under a publishing agreement with the author(s) or other rightsholder(s); author self-archiving of the accepted manuscript version of this article is solely governed by the terms of such publishing agreement and applicable law.