Environmental Science and Pollution Research (2021) 28:31246–31255
https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-021-12937-3

RESEARCH ARTICLE

Investigating the impact of renewable energy, international trade, tourism, and foreign direct investment on carbon emission in developing as well as developed countries

Yousaf Ali Khan[1,2] · Muneeb Ahmad[3]

Received: 29 December 2020 / Accepted: 9 February 2021 / Published online: 18 February 2021

Abstract

Our research examined the renewable energy consumption, foreign direct investment, international trade, and tourism impact on carbon dioxide discharge using system GMM, FMOLS, and DOLS models in selected developed countries of Europe and developing countries of Asia Pacific of the global employment for a period spanning 2000 to 2020. The results indicate that foreign direct investment and tourism comprise a positive affiliation with carbon discharge. Simultaneously, renewable energy utilization with international trade significantly negatively relates to carbon emissions in developed countries. On the other hand, renewable energy consumption, tourism, and global trade play an essential role in increased carbon emissions. Still, carbon dioxide emission decreases by foreign direct investment in developed countries. It is discovered that with long-run estimators, the long-run relationship of variables through carbon discharge in developed and developing countries. The study findings are considered useful in future planning of renewable energy utilization, FDI, tourism policies, and trade openness to improve ecological excellence.

Keywords Carbon production · Tourism · Renewable energy · FDI · Tourism · Trade · Renewable energy · Dynamic model · Long-run estimators

JEL Classification C3 · Q4 · O1 · C5

Abbreviations

FDI	Foreign direct investment
EKC	Environmental Kuznets curve
FMOLS	Fully modified ordinary least square
DOLS	Dynamic ordinary least square model
CO_2	Carbon dioxide
SGMM	System generalized method of moments
GDP	Gross domestic product
RE	Renewable energy
GHDS	Greenhouse gases

Responsible Editor: Nicholas Apergis

✉ Yousaf Ali Khan
yousaf_hu@yahoo.com

[1] School of Statistics, Jiangxi University of Finance and Economics, Nanchang 330013, China

[2] Department of Mathematics and Statistics, Hazara University, Mansehra 23010, Pakistan

[3] School of Finance, Jiangxi University of Finance and Economics, Nanchang 330013, China

Introduction

The anthropogenic emissions of greenhouse gases (GHGs), mainly carbon dioxide (CO_2), are considered significant culprits of global warming and climate change as humankind's biggest challenges. Many human economic activities are directly responsible for increasing CO_2, continuously being multiplied, threatening future sustainability. In recent decades, considerable attention has been paid to climate change globally. The international community has agreed to take serious measures to develop mitigating strategies against human-induced carbon emissions (Damtoft et al. 2008). In this regard, reducing carbon emissions is a priority policy of international efforts to combat weather variation's undesired negative impacts. The agenda of the Kyoto protocol of 1997, which took

effect in 2005, is signed by more than 190 countries and is considered an essential step towards the formulation of a comprehensive framework to confront climate change (Hall et al. 2013).

In a commitment made by several industrialized countries and European Union in 2008–2012 below the Kyoto protocol, the signatories agreed to diminish the emanations of GHGs by an average of 5% below the levels of 1990 (Nordhaus 2018). Meanwhile, some developing countries like China and India, which have a large share of GHGs emissions, are expected to reduce emissions voluntarily. Economic development and related energy consumption are thought to play a crucial role in generating carbon emissions at a higher level. Therefore, steady levels of proposed emissions are projected to be achieved by employing alternative energy production sources and increasing the share of renewable energy sources and energy mix.

Many empirical studies have investigated the impact of different variables like economic development (López-Menéndez et al. 2014; Salahuddin et al. 2018), energy consumption (Tosam and Mbih 2015; Nathaniel and Iheonu 2019), foreign direct investment (Mert and Bölük 2016), tourism (Durbarry and Seetanah 2015; Damtoft et al. 2008), and trade (Haug and Ucal 2019; He et al. 2020) on CO_2 emanation utilizing varying econometric methods. Different studies' findings provide inconsistent results based on the study areas and methodological approach used in the analysis. Several studies have examined the linkages between economic development and environmental pollution (CO_2 emission) in the context of the environmental Kuznets curve hypothesis considering the impact of GDP per capita on environmental degradation. According to the hypothesis, the early stages of economic (Haug and Ucal 2019) development cause environmental damages while reaching a threshold level; the damages decrease to minimum levels (Agbanike et al. 2019). Besides, some of the investigations have also focused on FDI's role in increasing CO_2 emissions under the pollution haven hypothesis. Another type of research analysis also considers the impact of income level and tourism on increased CO_2 emission. However, a literature gap is still visible in employing innovative investigation methods on different geographical scenarios and additional variables of interest to encompass the complicated relationship between human economic activities and environmental degradation.

The present study is aimed to investigate the contact of renewable energy, foreign direct investment, international trade, and tourism on carbon production in selected countries of Europe and the Asia Pacific for the time of 2000 to 2019 by utilizing system GMM, FMOLS, and DOLS models. The selected European countries are Russia, Ukraine, Spain, Kazakhstan, Greece, Portugal, Austria, and Turkey, while Asia Pacific countries include China, Sri Lanka, India, Japan, South Korea, Malaysia, Singapore, and Bhutan. The present study provides useful insight into the share of different economic activities in CO_2 emissions to understand the impact of various economic variables on environmental pollution. Besides, the comparative approach employed in the study also enables us to understand the differences in mitigating strategies regarding climate change within the scope of developed and developing countries.

The remaining of this research is structured as follows: Section 2 presents a detailed literature review. Section 3 describes the methodology and data used in this research, whereas Section 4 presents empirical results and discussions. Finally, Section 5 concludes this research with policy implications.

Brief literature review

An extensive literature is present in evaluating causal relationships between different economic variables on environmental degradation and environmental pollution in terms of carbon emission. The analyses of various empirical studies have yielded varying results based on the regional disparities, methodological contrasts, and investigations. A short explanation of the literature is provided in this segment to understand the extent of the topic studied.

The dependence of economic development on large-scale energy consumption and the resultant increase in carbon emissions has become a focal point of discussion regarding environmental pollution and climate change. Many scientific inquiries have been conducted to measure the impact of renewable non-renewable energy consumption on CO_2 emission in different world regions. O'Ryan et al. (2020) have applied the computable general equilibrium (CGE) model to determine the impact of renewable energy consumption and energy mix in Chile. They found that the country is progressing towards the desired decrease in CO_2 emissions as the structural system changes are introduced in the model. A recent study conducted on a panel of E-7 countries (Aydoğan and Vardar 2020) confirmed the bi-directional causality between non-renewable energy and carbon emission while describing a negative relationship between them CO_2 emission and renewable energy consumption. Gorus and Aydin (2019) investigated the relationship between energy consumption, economic development, and CO_2 emissions and found that unidirectional causality was present among energy expenditure and carbon emission. However, no causal link was found between energy consumption and economic development, confirming that environmental conservation had no adverse effect on economic growth. Adedoyin and Zakari (2020) evaluated the impact of economic policy uncertainty in energy consumption in the UK following the Brexit period. They concluded that EPU reduced the carbon emission for the short run while yielded controversial results towards rising carbon emissions in the long run. Baloch et al. (2019) analyzed the impact of renewable energy, natural resources, and economic development on CO_2 emissions in BRICS countries. They found a significant

effect of renewable energy consumption on carbon reduction. Similar findings have been found in many other empirical studies confirming the positive impact of renewable energy consumption on environmental sustainability, particularly in reducing carbon emissions.

Foreign direct investment is often viewed as a contributor to increasing CO_2 emissions in most recent studies on developing economies. It is assumed that developing countries ignore economic development's environmental consequences and that relaxed environmental policies attract more FDI than the developed world. However, the results of empirical investigations again provide varying scenarios regarding the impact of FDI on CO_2. Mukhtarov et al. (2020) examined FDI and income on carbon emission in Azerbaijan during 1996–2013 using structural time series modeling. They found a positive impact of FDI on CO_2 emission in 2006 only. However, the results of the study showed a continuous effect of income elasticities on CO_2 emission. The study further revealed no validity of the EKC hypothesis for Azerbaijan. Another empirical study employing bootstrap autoregressive distributed lag (ARDL) model (He et al. 2020) observed the links connecting FDI, trade, and CO_2 emission in BRICS countries. The analysis revealed varying results for different countries in the long run. At the same time, in the short run, the relationship between FDI and CO_2 was found less pronounced than that of trade. Haug and Ucal (2019) used panel quantile regression analysis to estimate the impact of FDI on CO_2 emission in Chinese provinces between 199 and 2014. They found the overall positive effect of FDI on CO_2 emissions with regional differences. In contrast, using panel-corrected standard error (PCSE) and gray models (Yu and Xu 2019) revealed that FDI in China played an important role in CO_2 reduction due to increased technological advancements. EKC hypothesis for the country.

Various empirical studies have employed different economic models to calculate tourism-induced CO_2 emissions to indicate climate change (Balsalobre-Lorente et al. 2020; Katircioglu et al. 2014; Durbarry and Seetanah 2015; Lee and Brahmasrene 2013; Solarin 2014). Most of the econometric models focused on the linear relationship with varying and contradictory results regarding impacts of tourism development on climate change (Katircioglu et al. 2014; Paramati et al. 2017; Agbanike et al. 2019; Solarin 2014). While most of the studies accuse tourism as a significant source of greenhouse gas emissions, few studies appreciated tourism receipts' role in better environmental performance. A handful of studies inquired about the nonlinearity in the relationship between tourism and CO_2 emission (Sherafatian-Jahromi et al. 2017; Bi and Zeng 2019; Zaman et al. 2016), highlighting the presence of an inverted U-shaped relationship (Su and Lin 2014).

Methodology and data

The research has engaged stationary, energetic, and long-run estimators to discover the forceful and long-run relationships among the selected variables. We have composed all data from the humanity growth gauge of the World Bank. The dependent variable of the study is CO_2 emission measured in metric tons per capita. The independent variables include foreign direct investment (FDI) measured as net inflows as a percent of GDP, per capita GDP, renewable energy consumption (RE) calculated as the percentage of total final energy, and tourism (TOUR) as international tourism receipt. Moreover, the urban population, national expenditure, trade openness, and labor force are used as control variables in the static and dynamic models. Following Katircioglu et al. (2014) and Dong et al. (2020), the simple linear functional relationship between CO_2 and explanatory variables can be described as follows:

$$CO_{2it} = \int(RE_{it}, TOUR_{it}, IT_{it}, FDI_{it}, GDPPC_{it}, X_{it}) \quad (1)$$

Equation (1) can be rewritten as follows: after adding constant term (S_0) and an error term $\mathcal{E}_{it}$ wherein (S_k) (k = 1,2,…,6) represent the coefficients of RE, TOUR, IT, FDI, GDPPC, and X.

$$CO_{2it} = S_0 + S_1\, RE_{it} + S_2\, TOUR_{it} + S_3\, IT_{it} + S_4\, FDI_{it} + S_5\, GDPPC_{it} + S_6 X_{it} + \varepsilon_{it} \quad (2)$$

We have applied the ordinary least square (OLS) fixed-effect model, fully modified ordinary least square (FMOLS), dynamic ordinary least square model (DOLS), and generalized system method of moments (SGMM) to examine the long-run association among variables. The SGMM model is functional as it is the mainly competent estimator of OLS and set outcome models and has been tested by many empirical studies. The experimental model can be demonstrated as follows;

$$CO_{2it} = S_0 + S_1 CO_{2\ it-1} + S_2\, RE_{it} + S_3\, TOUR_{it} + S_4\, IT_{it} + S_5\, FDI_{it} + S_6\, GDPPC_{it} + S_7 X_{it} + \varepsilon_{it} \quad (3)$$

In this equation, CO_2, RE, FDI, GDPPC, and TOUR stand for carbon dioxide, renewable energy utilization, foreign direct investment, gross domestic product per capita, and international tourism. $CO_{2\ it-1}$ is the first lag of descriptive variables in Eq. (1), which enumerates the previous year's pressure on the current year. At the same time, X_{it} represents the control variables of the research. The control variables included in the model are municipal people, national expenditure, trade openness, and labor force. The subscripts in the equation

designate (i = 1,…, N), (t = 2000,…,2020) directory nation and instance, correspondingly.

For the long-run opinion of the investigated variables, each variable's arrange has been experienced with a dissimilar situate of board element origin tests in primary dissimilarity and height for chosen countries. These tests have been in employment to corroborate the non-stationarity of panel data series based on previous studies of (Levin et al. 2002; Breitung 2001; Abdullah Barzinjy et al. 2019).

After checking the variables' stationary properties employing section unit basis tests, the section's cointegration test is conducted. Pedroni (2004) developed the cointegration test to examine the presence of cointegration between the research variables. The results of the test revealed the presence of cointegration among the research variables. The residual $\mathcal{E}_{it}$ represents the long-run symmetry divergences from the long run. Following the panel unit root and integration tests, the long-run estimations were calculated. For the long-run evaluation of sonatal coefficients, the study engaged a long-run assessment of FMOLS and DOLS models, which were preferred over OLS model to avoid biased results. To reduce estimator partiality, Pedroni's (2004) method is utilized to cointegrate variables by utilizing the FMOLS model. They comprise a non-parametric process in the FMOLS model for successive connection and endogeneity concerns alteration. The DOLS model of estimation suggested by Mark and Sul (2003) was also implemented to robustness the panel data analysis results.

Empirical results and discussion

Test results of panel unit root and cointegration

The result of four diverse panel unit root tests conducted on the selected variables at the level and first differences for 2002 to 2020 is given in Table 1. The unit root tests discarded the null hypothesis of unit root attendance and established all variables' stationarity at the level or 1st distinction.

The sheet cointegration is resolute following testing the variables' stationarity by using panel unit root tests. For this purpose, Pedroni's (2004) technique was used to inspect the turnout of cointegration among the investigating variables. The results of all panel cointegration tests rejected the null hypothesis of no cointegration and confirmed the research variables' cointegration. Table 2 results from the panel cointegration test for the Asia Pacific and European countries from 2002 to 2020. All the data series are cointegrated in the approach.

The outcomes of long-run estimates

Table 3 shows the consequences of a steady impact model and technique GMM assessment to gauge the relationship among CO_2, worldwide exchange and OLS, environmentally friendly power utilization, unfamiliar direct speculation, and the chosen nation's board's travel industry. The aftereffects of framework GMM both for European and the Asia Pacific nations show that the slacked subordinate factors' substantial, measurable importance demonstrates the model's reasonableness. Essentially, the p-estimations of the Sargan test, autoregressive of request 1(AR1), and (AR2) likewise show that the chose model is suitable. The assessed coefficient of sustainable power shows a negative connection with carbon emanation both for Europe and the Asia Pacific, affirming the lessening in carbon outflow according to expanded utilization of sustainable power sources. All the more explicitly, the OLS model's consequence demonstrates that 1% development in sustainable power usage decreases CO_2 release by 0.335% and 0.459% in European and the Asia Pacific nations individually. Be that as it may, as indicated by fixed impact models, 1% expansion in sustainable power usage lessens carbon dioxide release by 0.137% and 0.459% individually for European and Asia Pacific nations. Essentially, the framework GMM result likewise show that 1 % expansion in environmentally friendly power usage will diminish carbon dioxide release by 0.46% and 0.214% in the Asia Pacific and European nations separately. Jebli et al. (2019) likewise found that development in environmentally friendly power use diminishes carbon dioxide release altogether.

The outcomes further uncovered that the assessed coefficient of unfamiliar direct venture on carbon dioxide release is profoundly huge through OLS, set impact model, and framework GMM for European nations. The outcome shows a percent expansion in unfamiliarity through the venture. It will build carbon dioxide release by 0.0011% in a set impact model whereas declining carbon dioxide release by 0.035% in the framework GMM model. Our outcomes are in line with the findings of (Salahuddin et al. 2018) that FDI increment carbon dioxide release even as contradicting through the discoveries (Mert and Bölük 2016).

Moreover, the movement business coefficient is significantly basic in all models for European and Asia Pacific countries. The association among movement industry and carbon dioxide transmission is constructive in permanent result model within structure GMM for Asia Pacific countries, anyway conversely basic for Asia Pacific countries in OLS and system GMM. For illustration, the outcomes of system GMM for Asia Pacific countries show that 1% improvement in the movement business constructs the carbon dioxide liberation by 0.024% in Asia Pacific countries. These results are as per the investigation delayed consequences of De Vita et al. (2015) for Turkey, Dogan et al. (2017) for OECD countries, and Jebli et al. (2019) for Tunisia.

On the off chance that there should be an event of European countries, the movement business increase is found to reduce carbon dioxide discharge by 0.19% in European countries.

Table 1 Panel unit root tests

Variables	Levin Linchu		Pearson		Bruiting		Hadri	
	Level	1st difference	Level	1st difference	Level	1st difference	Level	1st difference
Asia Pacific countries								
CO_2	0.21 (0.000)[a]	-21.8 (000)[b]	2.67 (0.000)[a]	-24.34 (0.000)[b]	9.07 -1	-28.723 (0.000)[b]	30.84 (0.000)[a]	-3[illegible]4 (0.0[illegible])[b]
FDI	-6.67 (0.000)[a]	-95.55 (0.000)[b]	-8.21 (0.000)[a]	-40.61 (0.000)[b]	-9.95 (0.000)[a]	-23.88 (0.000)[b]	13.41 (0.[illegible]0)[a]	5.5[illegible] (0.000)[b]
RE	-2.65 (0.004)[a]	-15.51 (0.000)[b]	-0.07 -0.46	-18.69 (0.000)[b]	3.39 -0.99	-8.65 (0.000)[b]	23.[illegible] (0.000)	10.77 (0.000)[b]
TOUR	-0.48 -0.313	-10.47 (0.000)[b]	2.92 -0.99	-13.07 (0.000)[b]	5.45 -1	-1.35 (0.000)[b]	2.[illegible]29 (0.0[illegible])[a]	25.03 (0.000)[b]
TO	-2.98 (0.0001)[a]	-20.75 (0.000)[b]	-3.86 (0.000)[a]	-27.29 (0.000)[b]	-2.36 (0.009)[a]	-19.89 (0.000)[b]	8.89 (0.000)[a]	12.79 (0.000)[b]
GDPPC	-22.5 (0.000)[a]	-30.13 (0.000)[b]	-21.75 (0.000)[a]	-51.83 (0.000)[b]	-16.84 (0.000)[a]	-32.[illegible]6 (0.[illegible]00)[b]	1[illegible].07 (0.000)[a]	30.66 (0.000)[b]
European countries								
CO_2	-1.68 (0.000)[a]	-12.5 (0.000)[b]	-1.31 -0.093	-12.75 (0.000)[b]	2.154 -0.9844	-3.[illegible]6 (0.000)[b]	3.481 (0.000)[a]	1.76 (0.003)[b]
FDI	-5.79 (0.000)[a]	-9.63 (0.000)[b]	-6.19 (0.000)[a]	-14.95 (0.000)[b]	-1.07 -0.141	-1.[illegible] (0.001)[b]	4.26 (0.000)[a]	15.39 (0.000)[b]
RE	0.22 -0.589	-13.84 (0.000)[b]	1.135 -0.87	-14.2 (0.000)[b]	5.2 -1	-6.9 (0.000)[b]	6.31 (0.000)[a]	3.18 (0.000)[b]
TOUR	0.198 -0.57	-5.57 (0.000)[b]	0.27 -0.6095	-3.69 (0.00[illegible])[b]	[illegible]95 -0.[illegible]7	-3.97 (0.000)[b]	4.12 (0.000)[a]	4.46 (0.000)[b]
TO	-2.83 -0.833	-12.67 (0.000)[b]	-2.89 -0.001	-12.[illegible]8 (0.000[illegible])[b]	-1.29 -0.09	-6.7 (0.000)[b]	4.47 (0.000)[a]	1.97 (0.002)[b]
GDPPC	-7.98 (0.000)[a]	-13.73 (0.000)[b]	-7.58 (0.000)[a]	-15.[illegible] (0.000)[b]	-7.79 (0.000)[a]	-12.75 (0.000)[b]	1.39 -0.082	6.2 (0.000)[b]

[a,b] Prevention of the unacceptable assumption at the [illegible]int now [illegible]the first dissimilarity

These results resemble the revela[illegible]s of Katircioglu et al. (2014) and Lee and Brahmasrene (2013).

According to the results, [illegible]ere is a significant coefficient for European and Asia P[illegible]ific countries of trade openness all models together. In contrast, [illegible] OLS, FE, and SGMM models, the association th[illegible]ough carbon dioxide release is affirmative for Asia Pacific countri[illegible] showing that some growth in return straightfor[illegible]ardness will extend carbon dioxide expulsion. Even further, unequivocally, OLS and fixed-effect models' delay[illegible]ed [illegible]onseq[illegible]nces show that if there is a 1% extension in t[illegible]ve[illegible]l business, it will extend carbon dioxide release by 0.4[illegible]% in Asia Pacific countries. The SGMM result also display that if there is a 1% development in worldwide trade, it will construct carbon dioxide liberation by 0.33% in Asia Pacific countries. For the European countries, the trade sincerity coefficient is mainly basic with the association through carbon dioxide liberation in negative in all models, which shows that if straight trade forwardness augments 1%, carbon dioxide delivery will decrease by 0.66% in OLS, 0.24% in structure GMM model, and 0.31% in set result model. Our consequences affirmed (Jayanthakumaran et al. 2012) revelations that trade responsiveness diminishes carbon dioxide release on a very basic level.

Furthermore, regardless of both models OLS and SGMM, per capita GDP is found positively associated with carbon dioxide release for Asia Pacific and European countries to develop per capita total national output. The fixed-effect model results are oppositely basic, showing the extension in GDP per capita decay carbon dioxide release. Furthermore, all models are significantly basic to metropolitan people's all-encompassing coefficient; the results of SGMM reason that metropolitan people contribute to extended carbon dioxide release together in the Asia Pacific and European countries. Also, public use and effort strength are furthermore astoundingly gigantic for the most part in all models where the structure GMM results exhibit that public utilization contributes in addition of carbon dioxide release mutually in the Asia Pacific and European countries. In contrast, effort energy grows carbon dioxide liberation in Asia Pacific countries and reduces carbon dioxide expulsion in European countries.

FMOLS and DOLS models' measurementestimation of long-run association

Table 4 describes broadened outcomes of all the investigation factors for the Asia Pacific and European countries by

Table 2 The Asia Pacific and European countries' panel cointegration test results

Asia Pacific countries				
Alternating hypothesis: regular AR coefficients (within component)				
			Weighted	
	Statistics	Probability	Statistics	Probability
Panel v-statistics	5.526712	0.000***	3.257126	0.000***
Panel rho-statistics	-3.523541	0.000***	-4.152753	0. 000***
Panel PP-statistics	-9.627616	0.000***	-11.82715	0.000***
Panel ADF-statistics	-9.892717	0.000***	-11.87298	0. 000***
Alternating hypothesis: ordinary AR coefficients (inside constituent)				
	Statistic	Prob.		
Group rho-statistics	-0.725717	0.000***		
Group PP-statistics	-16.87297	0.000***		
Group ADF-statistics	-17.13265	0.000***		
European countries				
Alternating hypothesis: ordinary AR coefficients (inside constituent)				
			Weighted	
	Statistics	Probability	Statistics	Probability
Panel v-statistics	-0.246151	0.000***	-0.827219	0.000***
Panel rho-statistics	-1.862876	0.000***	-2.725151	0.000***
Panel PP-statistics	-3.724525	0.000***	-6.827616	0.000***
Panel ADF-statistics	-3.326541	0.000***	-3.926726	0.000***
Alternating hypothesis: single AR coefficients (inside constituent)				
	Statistics	Probability		
Group rho-statistics	-1.527612	0.000***		
Group PP-statistics	-9.526161	0.000***		
Group ADF-statistics	-4.513242	0.000***		

***Correspond to significance at the 1 % level

strategies for two sorts of long-run co-joining since a long time before running appraisal frameworks FMOLS and DOLS. The estimation of the result shows that all ordinary coefficients are quantative. In case of Asia Pacific countries, long-run consequences of FMOLS include that FDI and supportable force uses are the critical drivers for growing CO_2 expulsion. The results are in line with Salahuddin et al. (2018) disclosures that FDI assembles CO_2 liberation in Kuwait. Sufficient number of researchers in literature used FMOLS model for long-run exploration. Such as Jebli and Youssef's (2015) assessment for Tunisia. Simionescu et al. (2019) have concluded that increasing earth amicable force use increases carbon dioxide discharge. Delayed consequences of our revelations concerning the movement business are conversely linked with carbon dioxide liberation in Asia Pacific countries. Jebli et al. (2019) have originated equivalent results and outlined that travel industry decay decline carbon dioxide emission in North and South American countries.

Our disclosures show that extension in the movement business lessens CO_2 deliveries associated with green the movement business hypothesis since adding to the zone by staying gainful degree of travelers that affluent transport mixture and neatness untamed heavenliness. The movement business sustains that the state pay with this way obtains countries to lessen affluence in the countries. The stream study revelations as for the movement business are as per the investigation disclosures (Katircioglu et al. 2014). Moreover, our revelations show that extension in money-related advancement of Asia Pacific countries diminishes carbon dioxide expulsion, which is comparing to the outcomes of Jebli and Youssef (2015), who portrays to amplify in budgetary improvement decay carbon dioxide liberation in Tunisia. The Asia Pacific countries lessen headways, energy affiliation and renewable force, utilizing during their numerous years reliably. These revelations of trade straightforwardness demonstrate that trade honesty reduces carbon dioxide release in Asia Pacific countries. It can be clarified that additional items are introduced or stocks are conveying requiring additional vehicle and fossil energy to eat up, which augment carbon dioxide liberation.

The DOLS model outcomes show that tourism business, global trade and FDI are the important drivers to construct carbon dioxide discharge in Asia Pacific nations through environmentally friendly power use and monetary improvement essentially announces carbon dioxide release in Asia Pacific nations. Our findings regarding FDI are in line with the findings of Salahuddin et al. (2018), introducing to FDI upgrades of CO_2 release in Kuwait despite (Zhu et al. 2016) consequences. The discoveries of DOLS of the momentum investigation on sustainable power use and 1% expansion in environmentally friendly power use diminish CO_2 release by 0.8%, which can be brought about by substitutability of environmentally friendly power plus vestige—at the same time, incrementing the operation of maintainable influence instead of preceding energy. Financial growth in our exploration illustrates that reducing carbon dioxide release in Asia Pacific nations is identified with the consequences (Jebli and Youssef 2015). The growth in monetary development reduces carbon dioxide release in Tunisia. Our examination aftereffects of the DOLS model concerning the travel industry shows that the growth in tourism increases the carbon dioxide discharge, which is like the discoveries of De Vita et al. (2015) on Turkey (2017) on OECD nations and Jebli and Youssef (2015) on Tunisia and opposing with the discoveries of Katircioglu et al. (2014). The consequences of Jebli et al. (2019) likewise confirm that global exchange essentially builds carbon dioxide release and environmentally. Likewise, Jayanthakumaran et al. (2012) on China and Dogan et al. (2017) on OECD nations have additionally discovered that exchange receptiveness fundamentally decreases carbon dioxide launch in the examination-tested nations.

The consequences of European nations of FMOLS and DOLS tests are shown in Table 4, where the aftereffects of mutually FMOLS and DOLS since quite a while ago run assessment are identified with FDI and the travel industry that are the primary drivers of expanding carbon dioxide removal

Table 3 OLS, Fixed-effect, and System GMM models result for the Asia Pacific and European countries

Dep. variable	OLS	OLS	FE	FE	(SGMM)	(SGMM)
CO_2	Asia Pacific	European	Asia Pacific	European	Asia Pacific	European
CO_{it-1}					-1.150***	3.190***
					-7.08	-2.15
Renewable energy	-0.459***	-0.335***	-0.456***	-0.137***	-0.461***	-0.214***
	-0.011	-0.0214	-0.022	-0.039	-0.003	-0.0
Foreign direct investment	-0.002	0.051***	0.0011**	0.024**	-0.035***	0.022**
	-0.017	-0.018	-0.014	-0.019	-0.024	-0.019
Tourism	-0.000***	0	0.064***	0.080***	0.054***	0.144***
	0	0	-0.008	-0.028	-0.003	-0.02
International trade	0.413***	-0.664***	0.138***	-0.312***	0.33***	-0.245***
	-0.03	-0.048	-0.024	-0.119	-0.01	-0.048
L.GDP per capita	-0.001	-0.006	-0.003***	-0.012***	0.058***	0.0224**
	-0.002	-0.005	0	-0.003	-0.003	-0.01
Urban population	0.322***	0.511***	-1.030**	3.83	0.296***	0.461***
	-0.019	-0.078	-4.96	-2.66	-0.006	-0.033
National expenditure	0.802***	0.385***	0.432***	0.922***	0.764***	0.585***
	-0.018	-0.066	-0.022	0.23	-0.007	-0.033
Labor force	2.190***	-5.941	3.320***	5.86	2.360***	-5.660***
	-1.741	-3.13	-1.22	-3.98	-6.011	-5.81
Constant	-15.28***	-3.287***	-1.03***	6.212***	-14.70***	-6.926***
		-0.774	-1.446	-0.097	-0.478	
Observations	1,611	173	1,611	173	1,280	141
Number of ID			111	9	111	9
R squared	0.953	0.982	0.664	0.416		
AR(1)					-2.48 (0.001)	-5.01 (0.000)
AR(2)					-0.85 (0.395)	-0.57 (0.566)
Sargan test					17454.7 (0.101)	836.88 (0.101)

OLS ordinary least square, *FE* fixed-effect mo *SGMM* system generalized method of moments. ** and *** show significance levels at 1% to 5% level respectively

Table 4 Long-run valua n of DOLS and FMOLS models

Variables	FMOLS			DOLS		
	Coefficient	*t*-Statistics	*P* value	Coefficient	*t*-Statistics	Probability
Asia Pacific countries						
FDI	12.401	435671	0.000***	0.1332	16.978	0.000***
RE	48.324	516278.42	0.000***	-0.142	-8.2314	0.000***
TOUR	-89.526	-1,426,551	0.000***	2.467	25.342	0.000***
GDPPC	-25.81	-18,272,811	0.000***	-0.006	-5.876	0.000***
TO	-16.42	-2,371,812	0.000***	0.324	7.627	0.000***
European countries						
FDI	0.0039	3.2738198	0.001***	0.005	3.976	0.000***
RE	-0.352	-2.826711	0.001***	-0.089	-1.621	0.001**
TOUR	1.087	4.637251	0.000***	7.789	3.89	0.000***
GDPPC	-0.0324	-3.724351	0.000***	-0.052	-7.862	0.000***
TO	-0.752	-3.8782637	0.000***	-0.03	-13.325	0.000***

***Significance level at 1%

in European nations, though sustainable power use, monetary development, and exchange transparency are essentially declined carbon dioxide launch in European nations. Our discoveries viewing FDI are similar to the discoveries of Salahuddin et al.' (2018) contentions that upgrade in FDI increment ejection even as our exploration results are diverse when contrasted with Zhu et al. (2016). Likewise, FMOLS and DOLS results concerning sustainable power use show that a 1% expansion in sustainable power usage lessens CO_2 releases by 0.15% and 1.50% individually in FMOLS and DOLS models environmentally friendly power use is expanded by not utilizing the previous energy. The momentum research discoveries concerning European nations indicate that the converse relationship of sustainable power usage with carbon dioxide ejection is upheld by Jebli et al. (2016). Utilizing the FMOLS model (Simionescu et al. 2019) determined that any expansion in environmentally friendly power use reduces the carbon dioxide launch.

Additionally, both FMOLS and DOLS models explain that any expansion in the travel industry increment the CO_2 discharge (Katircioglu et al. 2014) and (Dogan et al. 2017). However, our discoveries are subsequent to the after effects of (Katircioglu et al. 2014). Our outcomes demonstrate that financial development is related contrarily to CO_2 release in European nations like the exploration of Jebli and Youssef (2015), who also found that expansion in monetary development reduces carbon dioxide release in Tunisia. Additionally, our discoveries show that exchange transparency diminishes the CO_2 discharge in European nations, where this outcome contradicts the consequences (Jebli et al. 2019).

Conclusion and policy implications

The current examination inspects the effect of sustainable power usage, unfamiliar direct speculation, the travel industry, carbon dioxide release, worldwide exchange, and financial development on carbon dioxide release in European and the Asia Pacific nations from 2000 to 2020. The exploration employs CCEMG, fixed impact, and framework GMM models to research likely effect of sustainable power use, unfamiliar direct speculation, the travel industry, and financial development on carbon dioxide release in Asia Pacific and European nations. Further, the exploration investigates the long-run relationship between the factors, where FMOLS with DOLS models have been utilized to investigate the long-run association of factors. The aftereffects of framework GMM show sustainable power use contrarily and altogether influence carbon dioxide release in European and Asia Pacific nations, which implies that sustainable power use diminishes carbon dioxide release. Also, unfamiliar direct speculation contrarily and essentially influences carbon dioxide release in Asia Pacific nations whereas positive fundamentally in European nations, which shows exotic straight ventures and decline carbon dioxide release in Asia Pacific regions while incrementing carbon dioxide release in Asia Pacific nations. Likewise, the tourism business has a constructive result on carbon dioxide release if there should arise an occurrence of Asia Pacific nations which delineates that growth in global the tourism business increase release in these states. However, the negative sign for European nations, representing that it lessened the release in European nations. The global exchange coefficient for Asia Pacific nations is certain of carbon dioxide release, which shows that exchange receptiveness increment release in the nations while its negative for European nations demonstrates that exchange transparency reduces release in European nations.

By utilizing board co-joining FMOLS and DOLS models show a relative association of the exploration factors with carbon dioxide launch in European and the Asia Pacific nations. Since quite a while ago, in Asia Pacific nations, run penalty of FMOLS characteristic, FDI, and ecologically friendly power usage are the significant drivers for expanding CO_2 releases. Moreover, the travel industry is unpleasantly related with carbon dioxide release in Asia Pacific nations, which outlines that expansion in global the travel industry lessen release which might be the connection to the speculation of green the travel industry since it appears to be that travel industry add to the biodiversity and neatness of the nation. In like manner, financial development and exchange transparency additionally decline carbon dioxide release in Asia Pacific nations. Additionally, the DOLS model for Asia Pacific nations shows that FDI, the travel industry, and global exchange are the significant drivers to build carbon dioxide release in Asia Pacific nations. At the same time, sustainable power use and financial development fundamentally announce carbon dioxide release in Asia Pacific nations. In the event of European nations, FMOLS and DOLS since a long time ago run assessment demonstrates that FDI and the travel industry are the fundamental drivers of expanding carbon dioxide release in European nations while environmentally friendly power use financial development and exchange transparency are altogether diminishing carbon dioxide release in European nations.

Our discoveries have extensive proposals explicitly for Europe by expanding environmentally friendly power use, which can be a significant driver to upgrade the nature of climate. Additionally, nations are encouraged to draw in more FDI to improve the framework, likewise adding to the travel industry. Approaches should be embraced to improve the travel industry and speculations identified with the travel industry, a decent commitment to an unnatural weather change. Moreover, these tasks related to regulatory expense should be decreased, such as specialized, promoting, and business-related charges that can uphold the travel industry exercises. Approaches concerning the travel industry area could be a decent technique to grow environmentally friendly power,

and empowering environmentally friendly power could improve vacationers' exercises to the nations. Exchange receptiveness should likewise be advanced in the two nations as it additionally assumes a significant function in ecological debasement. Our exploration is restricted to the examination factors, European and Asia Pacific nations. Further examinations ought to consider various areas and nations and incorporate different factors to explore carbon dioxide release determinants.

Author's contributions Yousaf Ali Khan initiated the idea and carried out the research; Muneeb Ahmad collected the data; Yousaf Ali Khan analyzed the data; Yousaf Ali Khan and Muneeb Ahmad wrote the manuscript and approved the final version for submission.

Data availability All results reported in this research were carried out in R-studio computational environment. Data used in this research is available online (https://databank.worldbank.org/home.aspx).

Declarations

Ethics approval and consent to participate This article does not contain any studies with human participants or animals performed by any of the authors.

Consent for Publication N/A.

Competing interests The authors declare no competing interests.

References

Abdullah Barzinjy A, Jalal Ismael M, Mustafa Hamad S (2019) A theoretical analysis of transport characteristics of nanoparticles in porous medium. Eurasian J Sci Eng 5:3–18

Adedoyin FF, Zakari A (2020) Energy consumption, economic expansion, and CO2 emission in the UK: the role of economic policy uncertainty. Sci Total Environ 738:140014

Agbanike TF, Nwani C, Uwazie UI, Anochiwa LI, Onoja T-GC, Ogbonnaya CO (2019) Oil price, energy consumption and carbon dioxide (CO2) emissions: insight into sustainability challenges in Venezuela Latin. Am Econ Rev 28:1–26

Aydoğan B, Vardar G (2020) Evaluating the role of renewable energy, economic growth and agriculture on CO2 emission in E7 countries. Int J Sustainable Energy 39:335–348

Baloch MA, Mahmood N, Zhang JW (2019) Effect of natural resources, renewable energy and economic development on CO2 emissions in BRICS countries. Sci Total Environ 678:632–638

Balsalobre-Lorente D, Driha OM, Shahbaz M, Sinha A (2020) The effects of tourism and globalization over environmental degradation in developed countries. Environ Sci Pollut Res 27:7130–7144

Bi C, Zeng J (2019) Nonlinear and spatial effects of tourism on carbon emissions in China: a spatial econometric approach. Int J Environ Res Public Health 16:3353

Breitung J (2001) The local power of some unit root tests for panel data. Emerald Group Publishing Limited

Damtoft JS, Lukasik J, Herfort D, Sorrentino D, Gartner EM (2008) Sustainable development and climate change initiatives. Cem Concr Res 38:115–127

De Vita G, Katircioglu S, Altinay L, Fethi S, Mercan M (2015) Revisiting the environmental Kuznets curve hypothesis in a tourism development context. Environ Sci Pollut Res 22:16652–16663

Dogan E, Seker F, Bulbul S (2017) Investigating the impacts of energy consumption, real GDP, tourism and trade on CO2 emissions by accounting for cross-sectional dependence: a panel study of OECD countries. Curr Issue Tour 20:1701–1719

Dong K, Dong X, Jiang Q (2020) How renewable energy consumption lower global CO2 emissions? Evidence from countries with different income levels. World Econ 43:1665–1698

Durbarry R, Seetanah B (2015) The impact of long-haul destinations on carbon emissions: the case of Mauritius. J Hosp Mark Manag 24:401–410

Gorus MS, Aydin M (2019) The relationship between energy consumption, economic growth, and CO2 emission in MENA countries: Causality analysis in the frequency domain. Energy 168:815–822

Hall CM, Scott D, Gössling S (2013) The primacy of climate change for sustainable international tourism. Sustain Dev 21:112–121

Haug AA, Ucal M (2019) The role of trade and FDI for CO2 emissions in Turkey: nonlinear relationships. Energy Econ 81:297–307

He F, Chang K-C, Ali M, Li X, Li F (2020) Bootstrap ARDL test on the relationship among trade, FDI, and CO2 emissions: based on the experience of BRICS countries. Sustainability 12:1060

Jayanthakumaran K, Verma R, Liu Y (2012) CO2 emissions, energy consumption, trade and income: a comparative analysis of China and India. Energy Policy 42:450–460

Jebli MB, Youssef SB (2015) The environmental Kuznets curve, economic growth, renewable and non-renewable energy, and trade in Tunisia. Renew Sust Energ Rev 47:173–185

Jebli MB, Youssef SB, Ozturk I (2016) Testing environmental Kuznets curve hypothesis: the role of renewable and non-renewable energy consumption and trade in OECD countries. Ecol Indic 60:824–831

Jebli MB, Youssef SB, Apergis N (2019) The dynamic linkage between renewable energy, tourism, CO 2 emissions, economic growth, foreign direct investment, and trade Latin. Am Econ Rev 28:1–19

Katircioglu ST, Feridun M, Kilinc C (2014) Estimating tourism-induced energy consumption and CO2 emissions: the case of Cyprus. Renew Sust Energ Rev 29:634–640

Lee JW, Brahmasrene T (2013) Investigating the influence of tourism on economic growth and carbon emissions: evidence from panel analysis of the European Union. Tour Manag 38:69–76

Levin A, Lin C-F, Chu C-SJ (2002) Unit root tests in panel data: asymptotic and finite-sample properties. J Econ 108:1–24

López-Menéndez AJ, Pérez R, Moreno B (2014) Environmental costs and renewable energy: re-visiting the environmental Kuznets curve. J Environ Manag 145:368–373

Mark NC, Sul D (2003) Cointegration vector estimation by panel DOLS and long-run money demand. Oxf Bull Econ Stat 65:655–680

Mert M, Bölük G (2016) Do foreign direct investment and renewable energy consumption affect the CO 2 emissions? New evidence from a panel ARDL approach to Kyoto Annex countries. Environ Sci Pollut Res 23:21669–21681

Mukhtarov S, Aliyev S, Mikayilov JI, Ismayilov A, Rzayev A (2020) The FDI-CO2 nexus from the sustainable development perspective: the case of Azerbaijan. Int J Sust Dev World Ecol 00(00):1–9. https://doi.org/10.1080/13504509.2020.1804479

Nathaniel SP, Iheonu CO (2019) Carbon dioxide abatement in Africa: the role of renewable and non-renewable energy consumption. Sci Total Environ 679:337–345

Nordhaus W (2018) Projections and uncertainties about climate change in an era of minimal climate policies. Am Econ J Econ Pol 10:333–360

O'Ryan R, Nasirov S, Álvarez-Espinosa A (2020) Renewable energy expansion in the Chilean power market: A dynamic general

equilibrium modeling approach to determine CO_2 emission baselines. J Clean Prod 247:119645

Paramati SR, Alam MS, Chen C-F (2017) The effects of tourism on economic growth and CO_2 emissions: a comparison between developed and developing economies. J Travel Res 56:712–724

Pedroni P (2004) Panel cointegration: asymptotic and finite sample properties of pooled time series tests with an application to the PPP hypothesis. Economet Theor 597–625

Salahuddin M, Alam K, Ozturk I, Sohag K (2018) The effects of electricity consumption, economic growth, financial development and foreign direct investment on CO_2 emissions in Kuwait. Renew Sust Energ Rev 81:2002–2010

Sherafatian-Jahromi R, Othman MS, Law SH, Ismail NW (2017) Tourism and CO 2 emissions nexus in South[illegible]st Asia: new evidence from panel estimation. Environ Dev Sustain 1[illegible]–1423

Simionescu M, Bilan Y, Krajňáková E, S[illegible]iene D, Gędek S (2019) Renewable energy in the electricity sector and GDP per capita in the European Union. Energies [illegible]520

Solarin SA (2014) Tourist arrivals and macroeconomic determinants of CO_2 emissions in Malaysia. Anatolia 25:228–241

Su Y-W, Lin H-L ([illegible]4) Analysis of international tourist arrivals worldwide: the role of world heritage sites. Tour Manag 40:46–58

T[illegible]m MJ, M[illegible]h RA (2015) Climate change, health, and sustainable development in Africa. Environ Dev Sustain 17:787–800

Yu Y, [illegible]u W (2019) Impact of FDI and R&D on China's industrial CO_2 emissions reduction and trend prediction. Atmos Pollut Res 10: 1627–1635

Zaman K, Shahbaz M, Loganathan N, Raza SA (2016) Tourism development, energy consumption and environmental Kuznets curve: trivariate analysis in the panel of developed and developing countries. Tour Manag 54:275–283

Zhu H, Duan L, Guo Y, Yu K (2016) The effects of FDI, economic growth and energy consumption on carbon emissions in ASEAN-5: evidence from panel quantile regression. Econ Model 58:237–248

Publisher's note Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.