



# Investigating the effect of methyl jasmonate and melatonin on resistance of *Malus crabapple* ‘Hong Jiu’ to ozone stress

Yanfen Qiu<sup>1</sup> · Kai An<sup>1</sup> · Jingjing Sun<sup>1</sup> · Xuesen Chen<sup>2</sup> · Xiaojun Gong<sup>1</sup> · Li Ma<sup>1</sup> · Shuqing Wu<sup>1</sup> · Shenghui Jiang<sup>2</sup> · Zongying Zhang<sup>2</sup> · Yanling Wang<sup>1</sup>

Received: 9 January 2019 / Accepted: 11 July 2019 / Published online: 24 July 2019  
© Springer-Verlag GmbH Germany, part of Springer Nature 2019

## Abstract

Ozone (O<sub>3</sub>) is an adverse environmental factor posing damage to ornamental plants. Thus, it is important to seek an effective way of enhancing plant tolerance to O<sub>3</sub>-induced damage. Methyl jasmonate (MJ) and melatonin (MT) are plant growth regulators (PGRs) involved in plant abiotic stress responses. In this study, compared with the control group of plants without ozone, the influence of exogenous MJ (0, 10, 50, 100, and 150 μM) and MT (0, 0.1, 0.5, 2.5, and 12.5 μM) on the resistance of *Malus crabapple* ‘Hong Jiu’ was evaluated under O<sub>3</sub> stress (100 ± 10 nL/L for 3 h). Our data revealed that levels of MDA were significantly enhanced following O<sub>3</sub> treatment compared with plants without O<sub>3</sub>. O<sub>3</sub> induced the activities of antioxidant enzymes and the accumulation of non-enzymatic antioxidants. While lower malondialdehyde (MDA) content, greater activities of antioxidant enzymes, and higher levels of soluble protein and non-enzymatic antioxidants were observed in PGRs-pretreated plants than in non-PGRs-pretreated plants under O<sub>3</sub> stress. Based on the above results and air pollution tolerance index (APTI), an exogenous supply of MJ and MT to *Malus crabapple* ‘Hong Jiu’ seedlings was protective for O<sub>3</sub>-induced toxicity. The present study provides new insights into the mechanisms of MJ and MT amelioration of O<sub>3</sub>-induced oxidative stress damages in *Malus crabapple* ‘Hong Jiu.’

**Keywords** Ozone stress · Methyl jasmonate · Melatonin

## Abbreviations

ANOVA Analysis of variance  
APTI Air pollution tolerance index  
AsA Ascorbic acid  
CAT Catalase

GSH Glutathione  
H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub> Hydrogen peroxide  
MDA Malondialdehyde  
MJ Methyl jasmonate  
MT Melatonin  
NBT Nitroblue tetrazolium  
O<sub>2</sub> Oxygen  
O<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup> Superoxide anion  
O<sub>3</sub> Ozone  
OTC Open-top chamber  
PGRs Plant growth regulators  
POD Peroxidase  
ROS Reactive oxygen species  
RWC Relative water content  
SD Standard deviation  
SDAU Shandong Agricultural University  
SE Standard error  
SOD Superoxide dismutase  
TBA 2-Thiobarbituric acid  
TCH Total chlorophyll

Yanfen Qiu and Kai An are co-first authors.

Responsible editor: Gangrong Shi

**Electronic supplementary material** The online version of this article (<https://doi.org/10.1007/s11356-019-05946-w>) contains supplementary material, which is available to authorized users.

✉ Yanling Wang  
wangyl219@126.com

<sup>1</sup> College of Forestry, Shandong Agricultural University, Tai-An, Shandong, China

<sup>2</sup> State Key Laboratory of Crop Biology, College of Horticulture Science and Engineering, Shandong Agricultural University, Tai-An, Shandong, China

## Introduction

Ozone (O<sub>3</sub>) is the major constituent of photochemical smog (a combination of smoke and fog). Since it was first investigated, it has become evident that O<sub>3</sub> is by far the most important air pollutant toxic to plants worldwide (Krupa et al. 2007). In recent years, near-surface ozone pollution has become common in many cities of Europe, North America, Japan, and China, with the increase of automobile exhaust emissions and heavy industrial energy consumption. Current models predict that ozone will recover from the effects of man-made ozone-depleting gases (Secretariat 2011). Nearly one-quarter of the earth's surface is currently at risk from tropospheric ozone in excess of 60 nL/L (Morgan et al. 2006; Zhang et al. 2011). Unlike all other climatically important trace gases, ozone is toxic, and increases in its concentration will result in serious environmental damage (Fishman 1991). Generally, exposure to O<sub>3</sub> concentrations in excess of 60 nL/L for several hours causes injury to ozone-sensitive plants (Smith et al. 2012), which is typically expressed as tiny purple-red, yellow, or black spots (described as stipple) or sometimes as a general even discoloration, reddening, or bronzing (Wang and Chen 1985; Lie et al. 2014a; Wan et al. 2014). Therefore, studying the impact of future concentrations of near-surface O<sub>3</sub> on plants is a focus of scholars in China and abroad (Gaucher et al. 2006; Wang et al. 2011, 2016a).

The leaf is the main medium for ozone to enter plant tissue and is therefore the first sensor of plant ozone stress (Lie et al. 2014b). As a strong oxidant, O<sub>3</sub> enters the leaf tissue through stomata and is converted to reactive oxygen species (ROS) (Xie et al. 2009). The production of ROS is considered the main cause of the serious effect of O<sub>3</sub> on the normal growth and development of plants. Supplementation of O<sub>3</sub>-exposed plants with exogenous substances can alleviate oxidative stress-induced damage through reduced lipid peroxidation and enhancement of antioxidant defense systems (Zheng et al. 2006; Xie et al. 2009). For instance, melatonin (MT) is a crucial molecule involved in plant abiotic stress responses, and previous work supports a role for MT as a free radical scavenger (Reiter et al. 2000; Galano et al. 2011), directly scavenging ROS in cellular compartments and thereby mitigating oxidative stress in plants (Reiter et al. 2015; Ding et al. 2017). Methyl jasmonate (MJ) is another phytohormone identified as a vital cellular regulator that mediates diverse developmental processes and defense responses against biotic and abiotic stresses (Cheong and Choi 2003). Studies have shown the effects of MJ on oxygen-scavenging enzyme activities and membrane lipid composition (Wang 1999; Ali et al. 2006). Moreover, MJ and MT protect plants against a variety of environmental stresses, such as cold, heat, salinity, and drought (Yang et al. 2011; Zou et al. 2011; Liu et al. 2016; Gao et al. 2017b; Yang et al. 2017).

*Malus crabapple* 'Hong Jiu' is an ornamental plant of the *Malus* genus (Rosaceae), which was independently bred by Professor Shen Xiang from Shandong Agricultural University. It is horticulturally important and planted for the brilliant autumn and winter colors of its fruits. Thus, exploring MJ- and MT-mediated O<sub>3</sub> tolerance in *Malus crabapple* 'Hong Jiu' is of practical significance. The objectives of the present work were to determine the potential effects of MJ and MT on O<sub>3</sub> damage to *Malus crabapple* 'Hong Jiu' and to investigate the possible physiological mechanisms of MJ- and MT-mediated responses to O<sub>3</sub> stress in *Malus crabapple* 'Hong Jiu.'

## Material and methods

### Plant material, stress exposure, and chamber description

The *Malus crabapple* 'Hong Jiu' from Shandong Agricultural University (SDAU) in Tai'an was chosen as the experimental material. The seeds of *Malus crabapple* 'Hong Jiu' with the same germination were selected to be sown in plastic pots filled with matrix and vermiculite (2/1 v/v) and cultured in the greenhouse of Shandong Agricultural University until plants were 6 months old with 10–12 expanded leaves.

We have done two separate experiments on plants with good growth and relatively consistent growth characters from May to June 2017. The highest monthly average temperature was recorded in May (29 °C) and June (31 °C), while the lowest monthly average temperature was recorded in May (16 °C) and June (20 °C). The average monthly relative humidity during the study period was found to be 52.6% in May and 59.8% in June (provided by the office of Tai'an meteorological department).

The one with various concentrations of MJ (0, 10, 50, 100, and 150 μM) were applied to seedling leaves, and the other one with MT concentrations (0, 0.1, 0.5, 2.5, and 12.5 μM) were applied, with 0 μM distilled water between them. After 15 days, all specimens were exposed to O<sub>3</sub> of 100 ± 10 nL/L for 3 h (9:00–12:00 a.m) in an open-top chamber (OTC) at the Forestry College's experimental station at SDAU (Gong et al. 2017). *Malus crabapple* 'Hong Jiu' seedlings grown without MJ or MT treatment under no ozone stress were used as controls. There were nine pots (6 plants per pot) with similar growth conditions per treatment arranged in a complete randomized design and the experiment was conducted three times.

An open-top chamber should provide more natural conditions than a closed chamber (Heagle et al. 1973). Here, the chamber (Fig. 1) consisted of an outer steel frame covered with polyethylene plastic film and an inner aeration pipe and was open to the atmosphere at the top. Oxygen (O<sub>2</sub>) in the oxygen tank entered the ozone

generator (SK-CFG-10P, Sankang, China), which produced O<sub>3</sub> to be output to the pipe. The O<sub>3</sub> was blown into the chamber by a fan (SF2-2, Shenli, China). An ozone detector (DR70C-O<sub>3</sub>, Wosaite, China) in the chamber monitored the O<sub>3</sub> concentration in real time and transmitted data to a computer for observation and storage through the universal USB/RS-485/422 converter UT-890. A rotor flow meter in the ozone generator was used to adjust the O<sub>2</sub> flow, and thereby control the concentration of O<sub>3</sub> in the chamber.

### Malondialdehyde content analysis

Lipid peroxidation was determined by calculating the rate of malondialdehyde (MDA), according to Heath and Packer (1968) who used the 2-thiobarbituric acid (TBA) as substrate. The absorbance was measured at 532 nm using a UV/VIS spectrophotometer (UV-2450, Shimadzu, Japan; the same as below). The value for nonspecific absorbance at 600 nm was subtracted.

### Soluble protein content analysis

A total of 0.5 g of frozen leaves was used to determine protein content according to the Bradford method (Kruger 1994). The Bradford assay relies on the binding of the dye Coomassie Blue G250 to protein.

### Antioxidant enzyme activity assays

Catalase (CAT) activity was spectrophotometrically measured by analyzing the decomposition of hydrogen peroxide (H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>) at 240 nm for at least 3 min (Aeobi 1974). Assays of peroxidase (POD) activity were carried out using guaiacol as the hydrogen donor (Putter 1978). Superoxide dismutase (SOD) activity was determined by measuring nitroblue tetrazolium (NBT) reduction by the superoxide anion (O<sub>2</sub><sup>-</sup>) according to Beauchamp and Fridovich (1971).

### Determination of glutathione and ascorbic acid content

Glutathione (GSH) content was measured by an enzymatic cycling assay method as described by Griffith (1980). A simple and sensitive procedure for the spectrophotometric determination of AsA was used as described by Besada (1987), which involved the formation of ferroin.

### Air pollution tolerance index

APTI is an index used to quantify the tolerance of plants to air pollutants (Pandey et al. 2016), (Singh and Rao 1983). It is mainly based on four parameters, namely AsA, leaf extract

pH, total chlorophyll (TCH), and relative water content (RWC). The AsA content of leaf samples was determined using the above method. TCH content was determined following the spectrophotometric method of Arnon (1949), and leaf extract pH was recorded with a glass electrode pH meter (SX-620, Sanxin, China) according to Pandey et al. (2015a, b). The RWC percentage was calculated using the fresh weight, turgid weight, and dry weight of leaf samples according to Sen and Bhandari (1978). Finally, APTI was calculated by the following mathematical expression (Singh and Rao 1983):

$$\text{APTI} = [A(T + P) + R]/10$$

where *A* is the AsA content in mg/g, *T* is the TCH in mg/g, *P* is the leaf extract pH, and *R* is the RWC in percentage.

### Gradation and classification of APTI

Plant species can be divided into four different tolerance groups (Liu et al. 1983; Zhang et al. 2016) by comparing the APTI value of each target species with the mean APTI value of all studied species together with its standard deviation (SD). Accordingly, a species can be classified as tolerant (T) if its APTI is higher than the mean APTI plus SD, as moderately tolerant (MT) if its APTI value is between the mean APTI and mean APTI plus SD, as intermediate (I) if its APTI value is between the mean APTI minus SD and mean APTI, and as sensitive (S) if its APTI value is lower than the mean APTI minus SD.

### Data analysis

Each experiment was repeated at least three times. Values are expressed as means ± standard error (SE). The data were statistically analyzed using SPSS v. 22.0 and comparisons were performed using a one-way analysis of variance (ANOVA) together with Duncan's test for independent samples. In all cases, the confidence coefficient was set at *P* < 0.05.

## Results

### MJ and MT effects on MDA content in *Malus crabapple* 'Hong Jiu' under O<sub>3</sub> stress

One of the detrimental effects of ozone stress on plants is O<sub>3</sub>-induced oxidative damage to cell membranes. MDA levels were quantified in the leaf tissue of *Malus crabapple* 'Hong Jiu' to investigate the level of lipid peroxidation and oxidative damage in response to O<sub>3</sub> stress and whether MJ and MT maintained cell membrane stability under O<sub>3</sub> stress. MDA were substantially increased in O<sub>3</sub>-treated plants compared with those in control plants, while MJ and MT pretreatment

significantly reduced the content of MDA in *Malus crabapple* ‘Hong Jiu’ under O<sub>3</sub> stress (Fig. 2). As shown in Fig. 2a, O<sub>3</sub> significantly increased MDA content in leaves by 133.89% for *Malus crabapple* ‘Hong Jiu,’ compared with the control. Addition of 100 or 150 μM MJ resulted in lower MDA content than 0 μM MJ, with decreases of 55.03% and 48.49%, respectively. The lowest MDA content was observed under 2.5 μM MT, with a decrease of 38.23% (Fig. 2b) compared with 0 μM MT. These results suggest that MJ and MT reduces oxidative stress and maintains cell membrane integrity.

### MJ and MT effects on soluble protein content in *Malus crabapple* ‘Hong Jiu’ under O<sub>3</sub> stress

Overall, the accumulation of soluble protein was concomitant with increased MJ and MT concentrations in stressed *Malus crabapple* ‘Hong Jiu’ plants compared with control plants (Fig. 3). Specifically, when the concentrations of MJ and MT were increased to 150 μM and 2.5 μM, respectively, the soluble protein content was significantly enhanced ( $P < 0.05$ ) and was 97.83% and 35.63% higher, respectively, than in 0 μM, indicating that tolerance to O<sub>3</sub> stress was increased.

### MJ and MT effects on antioxidant enzyme activities in *Malus crabapple* ‘Hong Jiu’ under O<sub>3</sub> stress

To further study the roles of MJ and MT in the possible alleviation of O<sub>3</sub>-induced oxidative stress, we examined the activities of three key antioxidant enzymes in *Malus crabapple* ‘Hong Jiu’ leaves. Under O<sub>3</sub> stress, the activities of antioxidant enzymes were significantly induced compared with non-stressed plants. Application of exogenous MJ and MT further enhanced enzyme activities accumulation in *Malus crabapple* ‘Hong Jiu’ with O<sub>3</sub> treatment. Compared with CK, the activities of CAT, POD, and SOD under 0 μM MJ with O<sub>3</sub> treatment were significantly increased by 85.00%, 50.00%, and 50.60%, respectively. Compared with 0 μM MJ, the activities of CAT, POD, and SOD under 150 μM were significantly increased by 51.35%, 70.83%, and 38.88%, respectively ( $P < 0.05$ ; Fig. 4a–c). Among the MT treatments, the activities of CAT, POD, and SOD were significantly increased by 90.43%, 95.65%, and 28.87% under 2.5 μM MT compared with 0 μM ( $P < 0.05$ ; Fig. 4d–f). This result indicated that MJ and MT alleviated O<sub>3</sub> toxicity by increasing antioxidant enzyme activities in plant tissues.

### MJ and MT effects on GSH and AsA contents in *Malus crabapple* ‘Hong Jiu’ under O<sub>3</sub> stress

Figure 5 illustrates a significant stimulation of GSH and AsA contents following O<sub>3</sub> treatment in MJ- and MT-pretreated plants. O<sub>3</sub> significantly increased GSH content in leaves by 38.60% for *Malus crabapple* ‘Hong Jiu’ compared with the

control, and the GSH content was highest under 150 μM MJ and was significantly increased by 94.12% compared with 0 μM, while the AsA content under 10–150 μM MJ was significantly increased by 16.54–35.20% compared with 0 μM (Fig. 5a, b;  $P < 0.05$ ). The maximum increase in GSH content was observed under 2.5 μM MT (64.89% higher than 0 μM). Similar results were also observed for AsA content, with an increase of 12.10% (Fig. 5c, d;  $P < 0.05$ ).

### APTI of stressed *Malus crabapple* ‘Hong Jiu’ plants under different MJ and MT concentrations

The measured values of the four biochemical parameters and the calculated APTIs for non-stressed and stressed *Malus crabapple* ‘Hong Jiu’ plants with different MJ and MT concentrations are shown in Table 1. Among the four parameters of APTI, AsA content was found to be highest under 150 μM MJ ( $2.19 \pm 0.03$ ) and 2.5 μM MT ( $1.78 \pm 0.02$ ). Furthermore, the activity of AsA is pH-controlled and thus the AsA content of plants is generally greater at higher pH and smaller at lower pH (Pandey et al. 2015a, b). Therefore, the highest pH levels were recorded in the same MJ and MT treatments. O<sub>3</sub> significantly decreased chlorophyll contents and RWC in leaves for *Malus crabapple* ‘Hong Jiu,’ compared with plants without the O<sub>3</sub>. In stressed plants with PGRs treatments, the highest chlorophyll contents were found under 150 μM MJ ( $1.50 \pm 0.07$ ) and 2.5 μM MT ( $1.52 \pm 0.06$ ). RWC (in percentage) was also highest under 150 μM MJ ( $82.79 \pm 3.03$ ) and 2.5 μM MT ( $85.76 \pm 1.42$ ). Considering these measurements, for the MJ treatments, the APTI values ranged from  $7.88 \pm 0.41$  to  $10.06 \pm 0.30$  (Table 1A). The highest APTI value occurred under 150 μM MJ, while 10 μM MJ showed the lowest value. The MJ treatments with APTI values above the mean (9.23) were (listed from high to low) 150, CK, 100, 0 and 50 μM. An overall mean APTI value of 9.40 was obtained for the MT treatments containing CK, with the highest value of  $10.01 \pm 0.14$  at 2.5 μM MT and the lowest value of  $8.89 \pm 0.08$  at 0 μM MT (Table 1B). Two MT treatments showed values above the mean, CK, 2.5 and 12.5 μM, while the other treatments showed lower values than the mean.

### Gradation of APTI and tolerance assessment

Table 1 shows that the MJ and MT treatments induced varying degrees of tolerance to O<sub>3</sub> stress. The mean and SD of APTI for the MJ treatments were 9.23 and 0.73, while those for the MT treatments were 9.40 and 0.41. Therefore, plants under 10 μM MJ and 0 μM MT were classified as sensitive (S), while those under 0.1 and 0.5 μM MT were classified as intermediate (I). The control plants and those under 0, 50, and 100 μM MJ were classified as moderately tolerant (MT), as were plants under a MT concentration of 12.5 μM. Plants under 150 μM MJ

and 2.5  $\mu\text{M}$  MT were classified as tolerant (T). Usually, when plants are classified as T, they can be considered tolerant to  $\text{O}_3$  stress.

## Discussion

Among the various pollutants present in nature,  $\text{O}_3$  is one of the major causative factors in free radical formation in plants, limiting plant growth (Krishnaveni 2013; Gao et al. 2017a). At present, the ground-level  $\text{O}_3$  concentration exceeds the damage threshold (40 nL/L) of sensitive plants in many parts of the world and causes visible damage to them (Feng et al. 2014; Jia 2016).  $\text{O}_3$  can enter plant tissues through the stomata and induce oxidative stress damage by causing the formation of ROS. ROS can react with lipids and proteins, causing membrane damage and enzyme inactivation, and eventually decrease plant growth and biomass (Mittler 2002).

Thus, it is important to seek an effective way of enhancing plant tolerance to  $\text{O}_3$ -induced oxidative damage. MJ has been shown to alter plant metabolism (Sun et al. 2017; Hou et al. 2017). Moreover, MJ has been recently demonstrated to protect plants against diverse abiotic stresses, such as cold, heat, drought, salt, and heavy metal toxicity (Ji et al. 2009; Meng et al. 2009; Yang et al. 2015). In addition, many studies have shown that MT can not only regulate plant growth, but also improve the resistance of plants to drought, salt damage, heavy metals, UV radiation, high temperature, chilling injury, and other stress (Wang et al. 2016a, b; Wu and Jia 2017; Gong and Shi 2017). In the present study, we investigated the physiological and metabolic effects of MJ and MT on *Malus crabapple* ‘Hong Jiu’ under  $\text{O}_3$  stress.

Cell membranes are susceptible to  $\text{O}_3$ -induced oxidative stress. MDA content is generally considered a reliable indicator of cellular damage (Zhou et al. 2017). Dramatic increases in MDA content was found in *Malus crabapple* ‘Hong Jiu’ under  $\text{O}_3$  stress, suggesting severe lipid peroxidation and plasma membrane injury. Treatment with MJ and MT at appropriate concentrations, such as 150  $\mu\text{M}$  MJ and 2.5  $\mu\text{M}$  MT, could partially reverse the deleterious effects brought about by  $\text{O}_3$  stress, as shown by lower MDA and higher protein contents (Figs. 2 and 3). Yang et al. (2011) also observed that MJ application decreased the MDA content in *Phalaenopsis* seedlings under high temperature stress. MT treatment was observed to have the same effect on MDA content by Ding et al. (2017). Accumulation of ROS affects proteins. The functionality of proteins can be affected by ROS through oxidation of amino acid side chains or by secondary reactions with aldehydic products of lipid peroxidation. Both primary and secondary reactions can introduce carbonyl groups into proteins, and the appearance of such groups is taken as evidence of oxidative stress (Gonçalves et al. 2007; Ramakrishna and Rao 2012). In our study, supplementation with MJ and MT completely reversed

the damage trend and increased the protein content in  $\text{O}_3$ -stressed seedlings, implying that cellular proteins were protected from ROS-mediated oxidative damage. Consistent with this, Zhao and Dai (2012) reported that the protein content can reflect the resistance of a plant. The increase in protein content we observed might indicate greater tolerance to stress as proposed by Meng et al. (2016) and Zhu et al. (2017) in plant leaves. Therefore, these are important indicators to assess  $\text{O}_3$  stress damage. The lowest MDA content and the highest soluble protein content in *Malus crabapple* ‘Hong Jiu’ were observed in plants treated with 150  $\mu\text{M}$  MJ and 2.5  $\mu\text{M}$  MT, indicating that these are the optimal concentrations for treatment with MJ and MT in our experiments.

To scavenge ROS and counter oxidative stress, plants have evolved an efficient antioxidant defense system.  $\text{O}_3$  ( $100 \pm 10$  nL/L for 3 h) induced the activities of antioxidant enzymes and the accumulation of non-enzymatic antioxidants (Figs. 4 and 5). The results correspond with Alscher et al. (2002) and Wu et al. (2011). However, Zheng et al. (2005) reported that long-term or high-intensity ozone stress destroys plant antioxidant defense systems. Previous studies have established that MJ and MT promote the activities of antioxidant enzymes and the accumulation of non-enzymatic antioxidants to counteract the harmful effects caused by various environmental stresses (Wang 1999; Fan et al. 2015; Ding et al. 2017). SOD constitutes the first line of defense against ROS in plants, catalyzing the detoxification of  $\text{O}_2^-$  to  $\text{H}_2\text{O}_2$  and  $\text{O}_2$  (Hu et al. 2016). In the present study, a significant increase in SOD activity was observed in  $\text{O}_3$ -stressed seedlings with foliar application of MJ and MT, suggesting SOD has an important role in removing  $\text{O}_2^-$  induced by oxidative stress (Fig. 4c, f). CAT and POD further break down  $\text{H}_2\text{O}_2$  to  $\text{H}_2\text{O}$  and  $\text{O}_2$ . Consistent with this, the MJ and MT treatments dramatically stimulated the activities of CAT and POD (Fig. 4a, b, d, e), implying MJ and MT have a protective effect through efficient scavenging of ROS. These results agree well with Ye (2015), who reported that MJ increased the CAT, POD, and SOD activities under high temperature stress in *Actinidia deliciosa*. Similarly, Jiang et al. (2016) reported that MT enhanced the levels of antioxidant enzymes under stress in plant seedlings. Additionally, non-enzymatic antioxidants, GSH and AsA, were substantially increased in  $\text{O}_3$ -stressed *Malus crabapple* ‘Hong Jiu’ with application of MJ and MT (Fig. 5). Increased contents of GSH and AsA have been reported to increase tolerance to stress (Nagalakshmi and Prasad 2001; Mahalingam et al. 2006). Our results further support roles for MJ and MT in improving the antioxidant capacity of plants under stress conditions.

To evaluate the susceptibility of *Malus crabapple* ‘Hong Jiu’ plants under MJ and MT treatments to  $\text{O}_3$  stress, four

parameters, namely AsA, TCH, RWC, and pH, were measured and used to calculate the APTI of each treatment. Plants with a high index value are tolerant to air pollutants and vice versa (Singh et al. 1991). The present study showed that plants under the 150  $\mu\text{M}$  MJ and 2.5  $\mu\text{M}$  MT treatments were tolerant to  $\text{O}_3$  stress, with the highest APTI values (Table 1). The tolerance of plants to air pollutants varies with these parameters (Ogunkunle et al. 2015; Pandey et al. 2015a, b). AsA is an antioxidant involved in the defense against ROS and thus affects the resistance to air pollution in plants (Pathak et al. 2011). An increased level of AsA in leaves has been reported to increase air pollution tolerance in plants (Mittler 2002; Suganthi. et al. 2013). Furthermore, higher leaf extract pH levels indicate greater tolerance to air pollution (Singh and Verma 2007; Pandey et al. 2015a, b). Similarly, higher TCH content might increase tolerance to air pollutants in plants (Rai and Panda 2014; Fan et al. 2015). The RWC of a leaf is associated with protoplasmic permeability; thus, plants with higher RWC values are probably more tolerant to air pollutants (Singh et al. 1991). High RWC within the plant leaf helps to maintain physiological balance under stress conditions such as exposure to air pollution when transpiration rates usually remain high.

On the basis of APTI, the tolerance levels of plants under different MJ and MT treatments were classified into four groups including tolerant (T), moderate tolerant (MT), intermediate (I), and sensitive (S), using the formula described by Liu et al. (1983). Our data show that plants under 150  $\mu\text{M}$  MJ and 2.5  $\mu\text{M}$  MT were classified as T, suggesting they were tolerant to  $\text{O}_3$  stress (Table 1). These results are consistent with previous indexes and APTI values. The susceptibility levels of *Malus crabapple* ‘Hong Jiu’ plants under MJ and MT treatments to  $\text{O}_3$  stress, as indicated by their index values, compared well with the physiological responses. Thus, APTI determination provides a reliable method for screening sensitive or tolerant plants under stress.

## Conclusion

In conclusion,  $\text{O}_3$  (100  $\pm$  10 nL/L for 3 h) induced oxidative stress damage in *Malus crabapple* ‘Hong Jiu’ causing membrane damage, inducing the activities of antioxidant enzymes and the accumulation of non-enzymatic antioxidants. Treatment with MJ and MT at appropriate concentrations can improve the tolerance of *Malus crabapple* ‘Hong Jiu’ to  $\text{O}_3$  stress. The optimal concentrations were 150  $\mu\text{M}$  for MJ treatment and 2.5  $\mu\text{M}$  for MT treatment. Exogenous MJ and MT had a protective effect on lipid peroxidation, protein oxidation, membrane integrity, and the antioxidant defense system in *Malus crabapple* ‘Hong Jiu’ and thus significantly alleviated  $\text{O}_3$ -induced oxidative stress damage. Moreover, 150  $\mu\text{M}$  MJ had a greater effect

than 2.5  $\mu\text{M}$  MT on tolerance to  $\text{O}_3$  stress in terms of soluble protein content, SOD activity, accumulation of non-enzymatic antioxidants, and APTI value. The focus of future research should be to elucidate the mechanism by which MJ and MT confer tolerance to  $\text{O}_3$  stress at the cellular and molecular levels.

**Funding information** The work was supported by grants from the National Natural Science Foundation of China (CN) (31730080) and the National Key Research and Development Project (2016YFC0501505).

## References

- Aeobi H (1974) In: Bergmayer (ed) Catalase: H.U methods of enzymatic analysis, vol 2. Academic, Cambridge, pp 673–684
- Ali MB, Yu KW, Hahn EJ, Paek KY (2006) Methyl jasmonate and salicylic acid elicitation induces ginsenosides accumulation, enzymatic and non-enzymatic antioxidant in suspension culture panax ginseng, roots in bioreactors. *Plant Cell Rep* 25:613–620
- Alscher RG, Erturk N, Heath LS (2002) Role of superoxide dismutases (sods) in controlling oxidative stress in plants. *J Exp Bot* 53(372): 1331–1341
- Arnon DI (1949) Copper enzymes in isolated chloroplasts, polyphenoloxidase in *Beta vulgaris*. *Plant Physiol* 24:1–13
- Beauchamp C, Fridovich I (1971) Superoxide dismutase: improved assays and an assay applicable to acrylamide gels. *Anal Biochem* 44(1):276–287
- Besada A (1987) A facile and sensitive spectrophotometric determination of ascorbic acid. *Talanta* 34(8):731–732
- Cheong JJ, Choi YD (2003) Methyl jasmonate as a vital substance in plants. *Trends Genet* 19(7):409–413
- Ding F, Liu B, Zhang S (2017) Exogenous melatonin ameliorates cold-induced damage in tomato plants. *Sci Hortic* 219:264–271
- Fan J, Hu Z, Xie Y, Chan Z, Chen K, Amombo E et al (2015) Alleviation of cold damage to photosystem ii and metabolisms by melatonin in bermudagrass. *Front Plant Sci* 6:925
- Feng Z, Sun J, Wan W, Hu E, Calatayud V (2014) Evidence of widespread ozone-induced visible injury on plants in Beijing, China. *Environ Pollut* 193(1):296–301
- Fishman J (1991) The global consequences of increasing tropospheric ozone concentrations. *Chemosphere* 22(7):685–695
- Galano A, Tan DX, Reiter RJ (2011) Melatonin as a natural ally against oxidative stress: a physicochemical examination. *J Pineal Res* 51(1): 1–16
- Gao F, Li P, Feng ZZ (2017a) Interactive effects of ozone and drought stress on plants: a review. *Chin J Plant Ecol* 41(2):252–268
- Gao F, Xia H, Yuan X, Huang S, Liu J, Liang D (2017b) Effects of exogenous melatonin on phenolic substance content and antioxidant ability of kiwifruit seedlings under salt stress. *Acta Agric Zhejiangensis* 29(7):1144–1150
- Gaucher C, Costanzo N, Widden P, Renaud JP, Dizengremel P, Mauffette Y, Chevrier N (2006) Response to an ozone gradient of growth and enzymes implicated in tolerance to oxidative stress in *Acer saccharum* (Marsh.) seedlings. *Ann For Sci* 63(4):387–397
- Gonçalves JF, Becker AG, Cargnelutti D, Tabaldi LA, Pereira LB, Battisti V et al (2007) Cadmium toxicity causes oxidative stress and induces response of the antioxidant system in cucumber seedlings toxicidade

- de cádmio causa estresse oxidativo e induz resposta do sistema antioxidante em plântulas de pepino. *Braz J Plant Physiol* 19(3): 119–123
- Gong B, Shi QH (2017) Review of melatonin in horticultural crops. *Sci Agric Sin* 50(12):2326–2337
- Gong X, Chen X, Feng S, Sun J, Qiu Y, Ma L (2017) Effects of ozone stress on physiological and biochemical characteristics dwarfing rootstock M9T337. *Agric Sci Technol* 18(4):579–582
- Griffith OW (1980) Determination of glutathione and glutathione disulfide using glutathione reductase and 2-vinylpyridine. *Anal Biochem* 106(1):207–212
- Heagle AS, Body DE, Heck WW (1973) An open-top field chamber to assess the impact of air pollution on plants. *J Environ Qual* 2(3): 365–368
- Heath RL, Packer L (1968) Photoperoxidation in isolated chloroplasts: i. kinetics and stoichiometry of fatty acid peroxidation. *Arch Biochem Biophys* 125(1):189–198
- Hou S, Zou T, Wang J, Sun X, Xu N (2017) Effects of methyl jasmonate and salicylic acid on the growth and resistance of *Pyropia haitanensis*. *Mar Sci* 41(1):104–112
- Hu Z, Fan J, Xie Y, Amombo E, Liu A, Gitau MM, Khaldun ABM, Chen L, Fu J (2016) Comparative photosynthetic and metabolic analyses reveal mechanism of improved cold stress tolerance in bermuda grass by exogenous melatonin. *Plant Physiol Biochem Ppb* 100: 94–104
- Ji YY, Hamayun M, Lee SK, Lee IJ (2009) Methyl jasmonate alleviated salinity stress in soybean. *J Crop Sci Biotechnol* 12(2):63–68
- Jia Y (2016) Effects of ozone stress on grain yield, quality and plant lodging resistance of different wheat varieties. (Doctoral dissertation, Yangzhou University)
- Jiang C, Cui Q, Feng K, Xu D, Li C, Zheng Q (2016) Melatonin improves antioxidant capacity and ion homeostasis and enhances salt tolerance in maize seedlings. *Acta Physiol Plant* 38(4):1–9
- Krishnaveni M (2013) Air pollution tolerance index and antioxidant activity of *Parthenium hysterophorus*. *J Pharm Res* 7(4):296–298
- Kruger NJ (1994) The Bradford method for protein quantitation. *Methods Mol Biol* 32(32):9
- Krupa S, McGrath MT, Andersen CP, Booker FL, Burkey KO, Chappelka AH et al (2007) Ambient ozone and plant health. *Plant Dis* 85(1):4–12
- Lie GW, Guo SH, Xue L (2014a) Effects of ozone stress on plant growth. *Ecol Sci* 33(3):607–612
- Lie GW, Ye LH, Xue L (2014b) Effects of ozone stress on major plant physiological functions. *Acta Ecol Sin* 34(2):294–306
- Liu RK, Shen YW, Liu XJ (1983) A study on physiological responses of plant to SO<sub>2</sub>. *Plant Physiol Commun* 4:25–28
- Liu SX, Huang YZ, Luo ZJ, Huang YC, Bao QL, Wang PP et al (2016) Effects of exogenous melatonin on germination of rice seeds under cd stresses. *J Agro Environ Sci* 35(6):1034–1041
- Mahalingam R, Jambunathan N, Gunjan SK, Faustin E, Weng H, Ayoubi P (2006) Analysis of oxidative signalling induced by ozone in *Arabidopsis thaliana*. *Plant Cell Environ* 29(7):1357–1371
- Meng X, Jin H, Wang Q, Tian S (2009) Changes in physiology and quality of peach fruits treated by methyl jasmonate under low temperature stress. *Food Chem* 114(3):1028–1035
- Meng X, Zhang Y, Xue Y, Liu Y et al (2016) Analysis of the soluble substances, grouting rate and yield factors of different wheat varieties (strains) in coastal saline-alkali soil. *Crops* 1:135–139
- Mittler R (2002) Oxidative stress, antioxidants and stress tolerance. *Trends Plant Sci* 7(9):405–410
- Morgan PB, Mies TA, Bollero GA, Nelson RL, Long SP (2006) Season-long elevation of ozone concentration to projected 2050 levels under fully open-air conditions substantially decreases the growth and production of soybean. *New Phytol* 170(2):333–343
- Nagalakshmi N, Prasad MN (2001) Responses of glutathione cycle enzymes and glutathione metabolism to copper stress in *Scenedesmus bijugatus*. *Plant Sci* 160(2):291–299
- Ogunkunle CO, Suleiman LB, Oyedeji S, Awotoye OO, Fatoba PO (2015) Assessing the air pollution tolerance index and anticipated performance index of some tree species for biomonitoring environmental health. *Agrofor Syst* 89(3):447–454
- Pandey AK, Pandey M, Tripathi BD (2015a) Air pollution tolerance index of climber plant species to develop vertical greenery systems in a polluted tropical city. *Landsc Urban Plan* 144:119–127
- Pandey AK, Pandey M, Mishra A, Tiwary SM, Tripathi BD (2015b) Air pollution tolerance index and anticipated performance index of some plant species for development of urban forest. *Urban For Urban Green* 14(4):866–871
- Pandey AK, Pandey M, Tripathi BD (2016) Assessment of air pollution tolerance index of some plants to develop vertical gardens near street canyons of a polluted tropical city. *Ecotoxicol Environ Saf* 134(Pt 2):358–364
- Pathak V, Tripathi BD, Mishra VK (2011) Evaluation of anticipated performance index of some tree species for green belt development to mitigate traffic generated noise. *Urban For Urban Green* 10(1):61–66
- Putter J (1978) Peroxydase. In: Bergmayer HU (ed) methods of enzymatic analysis, vol 2. Academic, Cambridge, pp 685–690
- Rai PK, Panda LLS (2014) Dust capturing potential and air pollution tolerance index (APTI) of some road side tree vegetation in Aizawl, Mizoram, India: an indo-Burma hot spot region. *Air Qual Atmos Health* 7(1):93–101
- Ramakrishna B, Rao SSR (2012) 24-epibrassinolide alleviated zinc-induced oxidative stress in radish (*Raphanus sativus*, L.) seedlings by enhancing antioxidative system. *Plant Growth Regul* 68(2):249–259
- Reiter RJ, Tan DX, Osuna C, Gitto E (2000) Actions of melatonin in the reduction of oxidative stress. *J Biomed Sci* 7(6):444–458
- Reiter RJ, Tan DX, Zhou Z, Cruz MH, Fuentesbroto L, Galano A (2015) Phytomelatonin: assisting plants to survive and thrive. *Molecules* 20:7396–7437
- Secretariat O (2011) Environmental effects of ozone depletion and its interactions with climate change: 2002 assessment. *Photochem Photobiol Sci* 10(2):178–181
- Sen DN, Bhandari MC (1978) Ecological and water relation to two *Citrullus* spp. In: Althawadi AM (ed) Environmental physiology and ecology of plants. Indian arid zone, pp 203–228
- Singh SK, Rao DN (1983) Evaluation of plants for their tolerance to air pollution. In: Control IAfAP (ed) Proceedings symposium on air pollution control. New Delhi, India, pp 218–224
- Singh SN, Verma A (2007) Phytoremediation of air pollutants: a review. *Environmental Bioremediation Technologies*. Springer, Berlin p 409–443
- Singh SK, Rao DN, Agrawal M, Pandey J, Naryan D (1991) Air pollution tolerance index of plants. *J Environ Manag* 32(1):45–55
- Smith GC, Morin RS, McCaskill GL (2012) Ozone injury to forests across the northeast and north central United States, 1994–2010. Gen. Tech. Rep. NRS-103. U.S. Department of Agriculture, Forest Service, Northern Research Station, Newtown Square 46 p
- Suganthi. P, Ganeshkumar RS, Govindaraju M, Selvaraj M, Kumar P (2013) Estimation of biochemical characters of plants in response to vehicular air pollution stress in Tiruchirappalli city corporation, Tamil Nadu, India. *J Exp Biol* 203(8):3425–3434
- Sun J, Wang Y, Chen X, Gong X, Wang N, Ma L, Qiu Y, Wang Y, Feng S (2017) Effects of methyl jasmonate and abscisic acid on anthocyanin biosynthesis in callus cultures of red-fleshed apple (*Malus sieversii*, f. *niedzwetzkyana*). *Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult* 130(2):227–237
- Wan W, Manning WJ, Wang X, Zhang H, Sun X, Zhang Q (2014) Ozone and ozone injury on plants in and around Beijing, China. *Environ Pollut* 191(1):215–222

- Wang SY (1999) Methyl jasmonate reduces water stress in strawberry. *J Plant Growth Regul* 18(3):127–134
- Wang XL, & Chen QC (1985). Study on monitoring ozone indicator plant of *Chaenomeles speciosa*. *Environmental Research and Monitoring (S1)*, 44–46
- Wang J, Wang Y, Zhao T, Cao Y, Liu Y, Duan M (2011) Effects of ozone on as-a-gsh cycle in soybean leaves. *Acta Ecol Sin* 31(8):2068–2075
- Wang J, Geng Q, Xing H, Sun Y, Wang Y, Zhai H et al (2016a) Effects of shading on photosynthesis and reactive oxygen metabolism in *Vitis vinifera* ‘cabemet sauvignon’ leaves under ozone stress. *J Fruit Sci* 33(7):823–831
- Wang W, Zhang R, Sun Y, Liu J (2016b) Effect of exogenous melatonin on the antioxidant system of cucumber seedlings under nitrate stress. *Acta Hortic Sin* 43(4):695–703
- Wu Y, Jia S (2017) Alleviation effects of melatonin and Ca<sup>2+</sup> on melon seedlings under salt stress. *Chin J Appl Ecol* 28(6):1925–1931
- Wu FF, Zheng YF, Wu RJ, Wang JQ (2011) Concentration of O<sub>3</sub> at the atmospheric surface affects the changes characters of antioxidant enzyme activities in *Triticum aestivum*. *Acta Ecol Sin* 31(14):4019–4026
- Xie JQ, Wang XK, Li GX, Zheng QW, Feng ZZ (2009) Effects of ozone on growth of rice and prevention of exogenous ascorbic acid. *J Agro Environ Sci* 28(6):1235–1239
- Yang H, Yan S, Chen H, Yang C, Yang F, Liu Z (2011) Effect of exogenous methyl jasmonate, calcium and salicylic acid on the heat tolerance in phalaenopsis seedlings under high temperature stress. *Chin Agric Sci Bull* 27(28):150–157
- Yang Y, Chang D, Wang Y, Xueyan Z, Fuguang LI, Zhang F (2015) Effects of ja and meja pretreatment on seed germination and seedling physiological characteristics of *Gossypium hirsutum* under drought stress. *Acta Botan Boreali-Occiden Sin* 35(2):302–308
- Yang XL, Xu H, Li T, Wang R (2017) Effects of exogenous melatonin on photosynthesis of tomato leaves under drought stress. *Sci Agric Sin* 50(16):3186–3195
- Ye X (2015) Effect of methyl jasmonate on the peroxidation and related antioxidant enzymes of kiwi seedlings under high temperature stress. *Jiangsu Agric Sci* 43(5):173–175
- Zhang WW, Niu JF, Wang XK, Tian Y, Yao FF, Feng ZZ (2011) Effects of elevated ozone concentration on slash pine (*Pinus elliottii*) seedlings. *Environ Sci* 32(6):1710–1716
- Zhang PQ, Liu YJ, Xing C, Zheng Y, Zhu MH, Li YP (2016) Pollution resistance assessment of existing landscape plants on Beijing streets based on air pollution tolerance index method. *Ecotoxicol Environ Saf* 132:212–223
- Zhao Q, Dai S (2012) Salt-responsive mechanisms in the plant root revealed by proteomic analyses. *Acta Ecol Sin* 32(1):274–283
- Zheng QW, Wang XK, Feng ZZ, Song WZ, Feng ZW (2005) Ozone effects on chlorophyll content and lipid peroxidation in the in situ leaves of winter wheat. *Acta Botan Boreali-Occiden Sin* 25(11):2240–2244
- Zheng QW, Wang XK, Xie JQ, Feng ZZ, Feng ZW, Ni XW et al (2006) Effects of exogenous ascorbate acid on membrane protective system of in situ rice leaves under o<sub>3</sub> stress. *Acta Ecol Sin* 26(4):1131–1137
- Zhou Y, Wen Z, Zhang J, Chen X, Cui J, Xu W, Liu HY (2017) Exogenous glutathione alleviates salt-induced oxidative stress in tomato seedlings by regulating glutathione metabolism, redox status, and the antioxidant system. *Sci Hortic* 220:90–101
- Zhu Y, Meng X, Gai W, Liu Y, Shi C, Zhang Y et al (2017) Effects of salt stress on antioxidant enzymes and osmotic adjustment substances of winter wheat. *Chin Agric Sci Bull* 33(19):1–6
- Zou QC, Zhu KY, Liu HC, Zhou JH (2011) Effect of exogenous methyl jasmonate on chlorophyll fluorescence and antioxidant characteristics in the leaves of *Phalaenopsis amabilis* under abiotic stress. *Plant Physiol J* 47(9):913–917

**Publisher's note** Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.