RESEARCH ARTICLE

Identification and apportionment of hazardous elements in the sediments in the Yangtze River estuary

Jiawei Wang¹ • Ruimin Liu¹ • Haotian Wang¹ • Wenwen Yu¹ • Fei Xu¹ • Zhenyao Shen¹

Received: 12 September 2014 /Accepted: 19 October 2015 /Published online: 29 October 2015 \oslash Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg 2015

Abstract In this study, positive matrix factorization (PMF) and principal components analysis (PCA) were combined to identify and apportion pollution-based sources of hazardous elements in the surface sediments in the Yangtze River estuary (YRE). Source identification analysis indicated that PC1, including Al, Fe, Mn, Cr, Ni, As, Cu, and Zn, can be defined as a sewage component; PC2, including Pb and Sb, can be considered as an atmospheric deposition component; and PC3, containing Cd and Hg, can be considered as an agricultural nonpoint component. To better identify the sources and quantitatively apportion the concentrations to their sources, eight sources were identified with PMF: agricultural/industrial sewage mixed (18.6 %), mining wastewater (15.9 %), agricultural fertilizer (14.5 %), atmospheric deposition (12.8 %), agricultural nonpoint (10.6 %), industrial wastewater (9.8 %), marine activity (9.0 %), and nickel plating industry (8.8 %). Overall, the hazardous element content seems to be more connected to anthropogenic activity instead of natural sources. The PCA results laid the foundation for the PMF analysis by providing a general classification of sources. PMF resolves more factors with a higher explained variance than PCA; PMF provided both the internal analysis and the quantitative analysis. The combination of the two methods can provide more reasonable and reliable results.

Responsible editor: Philippe Garrigues

 \boxtimes Ruimin Liu liurm@bnu.edu.cn

Keywords Hazardous element . Source identification . Source apportionment \cdot Principle component analysis \cdot Positive matrix factorization

Introduction

Hazardous element pollution has drawn increasing attention due to high toxicity, wide variety of sources, nonbiodegradable properties, and accumulative behaviors (Kukrer et al. [2014\)](#page-9-0). Hazardous elements are the most persistent of pollutants in the ecosystem because of their resistance to decomposition in natural conditions (Kasa et al. [2014\)](#page-9-0). It is well known that coastal and estuarine region are important sinks for many persistent pollutants and that these pollutants accumulate in organisms and bottom sediments (Gosar and Žibret [2011;](#page-9-0) Chen et al. [2012\)](#page-8-0). With the rapid development of urbanization and industrialization in recent years, hazardous element pollution recorded in the sediments has indicated significant impacts of such pollution on the environment in estuarine areas (Xiao et al. [2013](#page-10-0)). The sediments are complex in nature, with numerous potential sources of hazardous elements, making it a challenge for researchers to assess the extent and degree of contamination (Song et al. [2011\)](#page-10-0).

The source apportionment of hazardous elements in sediments is the key approach in identifying the effects of anthropogenic activities to biota (Gonzalez-Macias et al. [2014](#page-9-0)). Distinguishing between different sources of hazardous elements in sediments is helpful to control and reduce the risk of hazardous elements and to detect hidden information regarding hazardous element pollution, and it will help to characterize the overall condition of the aquatic environment (Duan et al. [2013](#page-9-0); Ding and Hu [2013](#page-9-0)). In addition, understanding and calculating each source contribution to hazardous elements and the extent of the accuracy of the

State Key Laboratory of Water Environment Simulation, School of Environment, Beijing Normal University, No. 19, Xinjiekouwai Street, Beijing 100875, China

apportionment results is a prerequisite for the formulation of effective control strategies for controlling and reducing their pollution (Chen et al. [2013](#page-8-0)). Therefore, it is imperative to understand the concentrations and sources of hazardous elements in sediments. Currently, much effort has already gone into distinguishing between different sources of hazardous elements in sediments (Sajn and Gosar [2014\)](#page-10-0).

To study the pollution source apportionment, a variety of classical methods have been developed in the past decades. Among the numerous methods, multivariate statistical models, such as principal components analysis (PCA), has been successfully used to identify anthropogenic pollution and source profiles in many river, estuary, and lake systems (Pekey et al. [2004;](#page-9-0) Chen et al. [2013](#page-8-0)). PCA is the traditional statistical tool used to reduce the number of variables required to explain the variability in a data set (Pekey and Dogan [2013\)](#page-9-0). However, PCA also presents serious drawbacks because of the possibility that negative amounts will be present in almost all factors; in addition, the rotational indeterminacy of the solution means that multiple valid solutions can be found (Gonzalez-Macias et al. [2014](#page-9-0); Dwivedi and Vankar [2014;](#page-9-0) Wang et al. [2014](#page-10-0)). In short, as a traditional multivariate statistic approach, PCA could provide qualitative information about the sources of the contaminant, but it is not adequate for supplying quantitative information regarding the contributions of each source type (Lin et al. [2011\)](#page-9-0).

To quantitatively analyze different pollution sources, many approaches have been developed based on multivariate factor analysis (Ribeiro et al. [2010;](#page-10-0) Cerqueira et al. [2011;](#page-8-0) Cerqueira et al. [2012](#page-8-0); Oliveira et al. [2012a,](#page-9-0) [b](#page-9-0); Quispe et al. [2012](#page-10-0); Silva et al. [2012;](#page-10-0) Arenas-Lago et al. [2013](#page-8-0); Hower et al. [2013](#page-9-0); Oliveira et al. [2013](#page-9-0); Ribeiro et al. [2013](#page-10-0); Cutruneo et al. [2014;](#page-9-0) Saikia et al. [2014\)](#page-10-0). Positive matrix factorization (PMF) is one of the recently developed approaches, and it has been proven to be a powerful and flexible alternative to traditional receptor modeling (Rahman et al. [2011](#page-10-0)). Compared to PCA, the PMF approach is a useful mean of identifying sources and quantitatively apportioning concentrations to their sources, even when the sources are not reasonably defined (Pekey and Dogan [2013;](#page-9-0) Tian et al. [2013\)](#page-10-0). Unlike PCA, PMF considers the factor analysis as a weighted least square problem (Comero et al. [2014](#page-9-0)). PMF solves the factor analysis problem by integrating nonnegative constraints into the optimization process and using the error estimates for each data value as point-by-point error estimates (Comero et al. [2012;](#page-9-0) Lin et al. [2011](#page-9-0)).

In this study, based on 30 sample data of hazardous elements in the surface sediment in the Yangtze River estuary (YRE), a combined method based on PCA and PMF was applied to identify and quantitatively apportion the hazardous element pollution sources. The key objectives of this work were to (i) determine the number of independent sources, (ii) estimate the contribution of each source, and (iii) compare the PCA and PMF methods to highlight their positive and negative aspects. It is hoped that the comprehensive information obtained in this study will assist the hazardous element pollution control in this region and that these methods will have a wider applications in other regions worldwide.

Materials and methods

Study area, sample collection, and analysis

The Yangtze River estuary (YRE) is one of the world's largest estuaries and is located in one of the highest density of population and fastest economic developing areas in China (Zhao et al. [2012a,](#page-10-0) [b](#page-10-0)). The study area is divided into three parts: the innerestuary region, mouth region, and adjacent sea based on the connection line of south coast and north coast. The innerestuary region is divided into four branches by three islands: Chongming Island, Changxing Island, and Hengsha Island (Fig. [1](#page-2-0)). One of the largest cities in China, Shanghai, has a significant level of industrial activity that has a direct impact on the Yangtze delta (Chen et al. [2012\)](#page-8-0). The hazardous element pollution status of the YRE has attracted considerable attention (Dong et al. [2014](#page-9-0); Zhao et al. [2014a,](#page-10-0) [b\)](#page-10-0). Although hazardous element pollution has been investigated in the YRE, little systemic research on the source identification and apportionment has been performed in the YRE in recent years.

Surface sediment samplings were taken in the YRE in November 2010. In each station, three surface sediments were collected, and then, the samples were mixed to form a composite sample for this station. The surface sediments were sampled to a depth of 2–5 cm. A total of 30 composite samples were obtained (Fig. [1](#page-2-0)). After sampling, the sediments were kept frozen at −20 °C prior to processing and analysis. In the laboratory, all of the samples were freeze-dried with a lyophilizer and mechanically homogenized and sieved through a 1-mm mesh to remove small stones. The fine-grained fraction $(63 m)$ was used in this study to minimize the grain-size effect in the chemical analysis (Chen et al. [2013](#page-8-0)). The dry samples were digested with $HNO₃/$ HF/HClO4, and then, the digestate was mixed with deionized water at a set volume. The concentration of elements, including aluminum (Al), arsenic (As), cadmium (Cd), chromium (Cr), copper (Cu), iron (Fe), mercury(Hg), manganese (Mn), nickel (Ni), lead (Pb), antimony (Sb), and zinc (Zn) were measured by using inductively coupled plasma-mass spectrometry (ICP-MS, Thermo) and atomic fluorescence spectrometry, which have been widely applied in many other studies(Wang et al. [2011a](#page-10-0), [b;](#page-10-0) Zhao et al. [2012a,](#page-10-0) [b](#page-10-0), [2013\)](#page-10-0). The results met the accuracy demanded by the China State Bureau of Technical Supervision.

Statistical analysis

PCA is the most common multivariate statistical method used to explore the associations and origins of trace elements (Huang

Fig. 1 Study area and location of sample sites

et al. [2009\)](#page-9-0). The data obtained by the sampling was treated statistically using a statistical software package (STATISTICA).

PMF is used most frequently to obtain the source profiles (Paatero and Tapper [1993\)](#page-9-0). In this study, the EPA PMF 3.0 program was applied to the data set. PMF is based on solving the factor analysis problem by the least squares approach using a data point weighting method, which decomposes a matrix of data of dimension n rows and m columns into two matrices, G and F (Rahman et al. [2011\)](#page-10-0). The model can be written as:

$$
X = GF + E \tag{1}
$$

where X is the matrix of measured values, F is the matrix of factor loadings, G is the matrix of factor scores, AFAIK, and E is the matrix of residuals, that is, the unexplained part of X .

Briefly, a data matrix X of i by j dimensions, comprised of i number of samples and *j* chemical species, can be written as:

$$
X_{ij} = \sum_{k=1}^{p} g_{ik} f_{kj} + e_{ij} i = 1...m; j = 1...n; k = 1...p \qquad (2)
$$

where X_{ij} are the elements of the input data matrix; g_{ik} and f_{kj} are the elements of the factor scores and factor loading matrices, respectively; e_{ii} are the residuals; and p is the number of resolved factors (Khan et al. [2012](#page-9-0); Comero et al. [2012\)](#page-9-0).

The task of PMF is to minimize the object function (Q) , based upon the uncertainties:

$$
Q = \sum \sum \left(e_{ij} / s_{ij} \right)^2 \tag{3}
$$

where s_{ij} is the calculated error estimate of the measured variables.

Restoration of the missing values and the under-the-detectionlimit values are the most important step in the PMF analysis. In the dataset, there were no missing concentration values. The values that were under the detection limit were replaced with available true analytical value, instead of replacing them by 1/2 of the detection limit (Comero et al. [2011\)](#page-9-0).

Before implementing the PMF method, the choice of the number of source factors should be calculated; this number is based on the values of the statistical indicators, the diagnostic plots, and the relevance of the resolved factors to the known sources located in the area (Huston et al. [2012\)](#page-9-0). Based on the user manual, the Q value was used to determine the appropriate number of factors. The target Q value has been suggested in the literature as:

$$
Q = nm - np - mp \tag{4}
$$

where *n* is the number of samples, *m* is the number of species, and p is the number of sources included in the analysis (Chen et al. [2013](#page-8-0); Huston et al. [2012](#page-9-0)).

Quality assurance and quality control

Quality assurance and quality control were assessed using duplicates, method blanks, and standard reference materials. The accuracy of the determination method was systematically and routinely examined with standard reference materials (GSF). Three replicates were conducted to determine the total contents of the metals. The metal contents of the standard reference materials were found to be within 86–102 % of the certified values.

Results and discussion

Description statistics

The statistical summary of the concentrations of hazardous elements in the surface sediment indicated that only small amount of elements exhibit wide variations in the elemental concentrations (Table 1). The highest variation was observed for Pb, with a maximum mean concentration of 105.10 μ g g⁻¹ and a minimum mean concentration of 48.00 μ g g⁻¹. The lowest variation was for Hg, with a maximum mean concentration of 0.12 μ g g⁻¹ and a minimum mean concentration of 0.02 μg g^{-1} .

For As, Hg, Cu, Mn, Zn, and Cd, the lower concentrations were primarily in the inner-estuary region, and the higher concentrations were primarily in the mouth region. However, for Cr, Fe, and Ni, the high concentrations were primarily in the adjacent sea, and the low concentrations were primarily in the inner-estuary region. The different distribution patterns might reflect the different sources.

Source qualitative identification

Three principal components were responsible for the data structure, and they explained over 92 % of the total variance (Table [2\)](#page-4-0). In the rotated component matrix, the first, second, and third principle components (PCs) accounted for 53.4, 19.0, and 20.1 % of the total sample variability, respectively. The results of the comparison between the component matrix data and the rotated component matrix data indicated that Hg, which exhibited a high correlation with PC1 before being rotated, exhibited a deflection toward PC3 after being rotated. Hg exhibited a combined relationship with both PC1 and PC3 in this case.

Source identification is a multiclass classification problem. In this study, Al, Fe, Mn, Cr, and Ni were found to have high loadings on PC1. At the same time, moderate loadings of As, Cu, and Zn were also observed in this factor. Some previous studies indicated that Cu, as an important part of Cu-contained agrochemicals, was mainly derived from agricultural and sewage runoff (Mico et al. [2006\)](#page-9-0). Ni, as a nonferrous element, is the main production in the industrial zone (Balachandran et al. [2006\)](#page-8-0). Cr, as a ferrous element, is also an important material for industrial production (Miler and Gosar [2012\)](#page-9-0). In addition, some studies also indicated that hazardous elements, such as Zn, Al, Fe, and Mn, appeared to be associated with mining wastewater (Silva et al. [2013](#page-10-0)). Note that all of these elements had a close relationship with sewage sludge and wastewater. As a result, PC1, including Al, Fe, Mn, Cr, Ni, As, Cu, and Zn, can be defined as a sewage component.

Atmospheric deposition is an important reason for the occurrence of the anthropogenic contamination of hazardous elements in the sediment environment. The hazardous elements in the atmosphere might come from industrial production, manufacturing processes, automobile exhaust, and waste incineration (Collins and Anthony [2008](#page-8-0); Miler and Gosar [2012;](#page-9-0) Tian et al. [2012](#page-10-0)). Previous studies found that in the economically developed areas, atmospheric inputs of Pb and

Table 1 Summary statistics for the measured elements

Table 2 Component matrixes for total heavy metal contents (three-components extracted)

Element	Component matrix			Rotated component matrix			Extraction sums of squared loadings			Rotation sums of squared loadings		
	PC ₁	PC ₂	PC ₃	PC ₁	PC ₂	PC ₃	Total	% of variance	Cumulative $(\%)$	Total	% of variance	Cumulative $(\%)$
Al	0.870	-0.371	-0.028	0.925	-0.034	0.198	7.981	66.506	66.506	6.411	53.428	53.428
As	0.762	0.075	-0.180	0.664	0.374	0.193	2.009	16.743	83.250	2.283	19.024	72.452
C _d	0.573	0.504	0.609	0.129	0.265	0.931	1.119	9.326	92.575	2.415	20.123	92.575
Cr	0.947	-0.173	-0.170	0.934	0.222	0.185						
Cu		$0.935 -0.096 0.286$		0.786	0.048	0.588						
Fe	0.936	-0.185	-0.261	0.950	0.255	0.101						
Hg		0.774 0.347	0.485	0.402	0.259	0.853						
Mn	0.936	-0.149	-0.173	0.914	0.239	0.187						
Ni	0.913	-0.337	-0.083	0.959	0.035	0.182						
Pb	0.531	0.767	-0.342	0.189	0.950	0.222						
Sb	0.413	0.815	-0.354	0.068	0.961	0.182						
Zn	0.952	-0.170	0.147	0.865	0.065	0.452						

Extraction method: principal component analysis; rotation method: varimax

Sb were fairly significant (Li et al. [2009](#page-9-0)). Many experts believed that Pb, which was mainly derived from automobile exhaust in the economically developed areas, and Sb, which was produced from element smelting and refining, were unfortunately widespread throughout the exhaust gas in the atmosphere environment (Song et al. [2011](#page-10-0); Cheng and Hu [2010;](#page-8-0) Simonetti et al. [2004\)](#page-10-0). The study area was easily affected by the atmospheric deposition because it belonged to an estuary, for which the atmospheric conditions were complex and changeable. Therefore, PC2, which exhibited high loadings of Pb and Sb, could be considered as an atmospheric deposition component.

The highest loadings in PC3 were Cd and Hg. Cd and Hg, highly toxic hazardous elements, are widely used in pesticides. Some research studies proved that pesticides are potential sources of heavy elements in soil (Yang et al. [2013](#page-10-0); Oliveira et al. [2013](#page-9-0); Zhao et al. [2014a](#page-10-0), [b\)](#page-10-0). Cd and Hg in the field were transported to surface water and then accumulated in the sediment by means of farm drainage surface runoff. It is well known that the Yangtze River basin has played a very important role in the grain production in China due to its superior natural conditions and combinations of natural resources, such as water, soil, light, and energy. The study area was significantly affected by the agriculture activity in the Yangtze River basin (Yi and Zhang [2012;](#page-10-0) Zhao et al. [2012a,](#page-10-0) [b\)](#page-10-0). Hence, PC3 could be defined as an agricultural nonpoint component.

Source apportionment estimations

Before running the PMF model, the number of source factors should be calculated. Taking into account the Q value, the number of source factors of PMF was set to eight (Fig. [2\)](#page-5-0).

The first factor (F1) had high factor loading for Fe. As mentioned in our earlier discussion, Fe occurred primarily in mining wastewater. Hence, it seemed reasonable to conclude that F1 appeared to be associated with mining wastewater.

The second factor (F2) was characterized by enrichment with Al, Cr, and Cu. From our earlier discussion, Cr, as a ferrous element, was also an important material for industrial production (Miler and Gosar [2012\)](#page-9-0). Cu, as an important part of Cu-contained agrochemicals, was derived from agricultural runoff (Mico et al. [2006](#page-9-0)). Note that Al also had high loadings on F2. In the PCA, the accumulation of Al was identified as being influenced by the mining wastewater. In the PMF result, Al was also regarded as controlled by the sewage factor, and some research has indicated that Al in industrial wastewater would be precipitation when the pH value was changed (Wang et al. [2011a,](#page-10-0) [b](#page-10-0)). Hence, F2 appears to represent a mixture of agricultural/industrial sewage.

The third factor (F3) had elevated values of Cd and Hg, and the fourth factor (F4) was enriched with Pb and Sb. These results all exhibited good agreement with the PCA result. Therefore, F3, including Cd and Hg, could be defined as an agricultural nonpoint component, and F4, including Cd and Hg, could be considered as an atmospheric deposition source.

The fifth factor (F5) has elevated values of Ni. Ni, as a nonferrous element, is the main raw material in the industrial zone (Balachandran et al. [2006\)](#page-8-0). It is well known that Ni is very common in industrial production, such as the nickel plating industry, machinery manufacturing, and element processing industry (Ding and Hu [2013](#page-9-0)). Large amounts of Nicontaining waste water and industrial residue have been produced in the nickel plating industry, causing serious pollution of water bodies (Rahman et al. [2014](#page-10-0)). Through the analysis of PMF, Ni was proposed to be from the nickel plating industry.

Fig. 2 Source profiles of the heavy metals from PMF model analysis

The sixth factor (F6) is characterized by enrichment with Mn. Mn enrichment in the surface sediments of aquatic environment around the world is common and often is attributed to the redox cycling of Mn in sediments. Mn in sediments is dissolved under reducing conditions and then migrates upward and is accumulated in the oxidized surface sediments (Yao and Xue [2014\)](#page-10-0). Some research studies indicated that Mn was the main chemical composition in marine sediments (Lim et al. [2006](#page-9-0)). Thus, F6 might primarily represent the marine activity.

The seventh factor had elevated values of Zn (F7). Zn is generally regarded as being sourced from anthropogenic source in recent research (Liu and Li [2011\)](#page-9-0). Zn is an essential trace element for plant growth, which is mainly involved in the synthesis of auxin and the activities of some enzyme system (Cruz et al. [2014](#page-9-0)). In agricultural production, zinc sulfate

Table 3 Results from two different receptor models

PCA		PMF				
Source	Explained variance $(\%)$	Sources	Contribution to the total mass $(\%)$			
Atmospheric deposition	19.0	Atmospheric deposition	12.8			
Agricultural nonpoint	20.1	Agricultural nonpoint	10.6			
Sewage component	53.4	Nickel plating industry	8.8			
Others	7.5	Marine activity	9.0			
		Industrial wastewater	9.8			
		Agricultural fertilizer	14.5			
		Mining wastewater	15.9			
		Agricultural/industrial sewage mixed	18.6			

is applied as a base fertilizer, and it is widely used in practice. China is one of the largest fertilizer producers and users worldwide, and the Yangtze River basin is one of the most developed areas of agriculture. Due to the wide applications of fertilizers, the agricultural nonpoint source has been the key pollution source of water environment (Ayoubi et al. [2014](#page-8-0); Jayawardana et al. [2014](#page-9-0)). Hence, it seemed reasonable to conjecture that Zn is from an agricultural nonpoint source and that F7 appears to represent an agricultural fertilizer source.

The eighth factor (F8) had high factor loading for As. In PCA, As was considered as being derived from both parent rocks and sewage. However, through the analysis of PMF, As was separated from rocks and sewage. Research has shown that As mainly comes from industrial wastewater discharged by the electroplating, battery, alloy manufacturing, pigment, mining, and refining processes (Oliveira et al. [2013](#page-9-0); Li et al. [2014b](#page-9-0)). Thus, F8 might mainly represent industrial wastewater. Similar results were previously reported by other authors (Silva et al. [2009](#page-10-0), [2011a,](#page-10-0) [b,](#page-10-0) [c;](#page-10-0) Ribeiro et al. [2010](#page-10-0); Kronbauer et al. [2013;](#page-9-0) Rodríguez-Vázquez, et al. [2013](#page-10-0); Dias et al. [2014](#page-9-0); Garcia et al. [2014;](#page-9-0) Martinello et al. [2014;](#page-9-0) Pérez et al. [2014](#page-9-0); Sanchís et al. [2015\)](#page-10-0).

The source apportionment results of the PCA and PMF methods are listed in Table 3. Considering the two techniques, PCA provides a mixed source profile of three sources, while in PMF, eight sources are identified: agricultural/industrial sewage mixture (18.6 %), mining wastewater (15.9 %), agricultural fertilizer (14.5 %), atmospheric deposition (12.8 %), agricultural nonpoint (10.6 %), industrial wastewater (9.8 %), marine activity (9.0 %), and nickel plating industry (8.8 %).

F3 and F4 were found to be synchronized with PC1 and PC2, which represented atmospheric deposition source and agricultural nonpoint source, respectively. In addition, in PMF, the remaining six factors were the continual extension and refinement of PC1 toward the desired goal of precise source identification. Overall, the results from the PCA method are consistent with the results from the PMF analysis, and to some degree, the former is the foundation of the latter, and the latter provides more details and expands upon the former. Although PCA and PMF have their own advantages and drawbacks, the combination of the two methods can provide more valuable information. The combined method could be used to identify and interpret different sources and to quantify the contributions of the sources.

Source contribution analysis

The contributions of the eight sources to the hazardous elements in the sediment from the PMF analysis are presented in Fig. 3. Most of the hazardous elements were found to be affected by a number of sources. Most notable among these was Sb, which was controlled by only two sources: "atmospheric deposition" (51.5 %) and "mining wastewater" (48.5 %). Hazardous elements, such as As, Cd, Cu, Pb, and Hg, were controlled by six sources. For As, "industrial wastewater" contributed to 29.9 % of the total concentration of measured contaminant, along with "agricultural fertilizer" (26.0%) and the "agricultural/industrial sewage mixture" (13.1%) . However for Cu, the total contribution of the "agricultural/industrial

Second Industrial wastewater \boxed{ZZ} Agricultural fertilizer Second Marine activity Second Nickel plating industry Mining sewage

Fig. 3 The contributions of all the identified sources to the heavy metals in the sediment

sewage mixture" and "agricultural fertilizer" to Cu was 65.9 %, which was far higher than the contribution of "mining" wastewater". For Cd, "agricultural nonpoint" contributed 50.9 %, which was far higher than the contributions of the other related factors. However, for Mn, the total contribution of "marine activity", "agricultural/industrial sewage mixture", and "agricultural fertilizer" was only 60.7 % (26.0+17.9+ 16.7 %). The major sources contributing to Pb were "atmospheric deposition" (45.5 %), followed by "mining" wastewater" (33.7 %). Al and Mn were controlled by seven sources. The large difference between Al and Mn was that Al was affected by "agricultural nonpoint source" but Mn was affected by "mining sewage". The rest of the elements, such as Cr, Fe, Ni, and Zn, were influenced by all of the eight sources, and the key point was that the proportions of each type of source had significant differences.

 24.2

Fig. 4 Explained contributions of the elements in each source with PMF analysis $(\%$

 $2.792.10 - 0.08$

The contribution of the elements in each factor with positive matrix factorization indicated that the contributions of the elements in each factor were different and that every source was connected to different proportions of the elements in the study areas (Fig. [4\)](#page-7-0). The hazardous element contents in sediments appeared to be more connected to anthropogenic activity than to natural sources. The hazardous elements in the surface sediments were largely influenced by wastewater discharge from the nearby industrial plants, and atmospheric deposition from automobile exhaust and industrial waste gas emission, fossil fuel combustion in the nearby cities, the mining industry, and so on (Cruz et al. [2014;](#page-9-0) Li et al. [2014a,](#page-9-0) [b](#page-9-0)).

Compared to PCA, the main advantage of PMF is that PMF could quantitatively analyze different pollution sources (Qadir et al. [2014](#page-10-0)). The contributions of the eight sources to each hazardous element were different (Fig. [3](#page-6-0)), and the contributions of the elements in each source were also different (Fig. [4\)](#page-7-0). In addition, the profile factors produced by the PMF method are better at describing the source structure than those derived by the PCA approach (Pekey and Dogan [2013\)](#page-9-0). However, the results obtained from the PMF method might introduce uncertainty into the conclusions. Thus, pollution sources identified by the PMF model must be confirmed by PCA to improve its reliability (Huang et al. [2009](#page-9-0); Lin et al. [2011](#page-9-0); Saba and Su [2013](#page-10-0); Ielpo et al. [2014](#page-9-0)). Furthermore, more scientific research should be carried out to verify the conclusion combining the eight sources to the hazardous elements in the sediment from the PMF analysis and other dataset.

Conclusions

To identify and target pollution sources and their relative contributious to the total pollution load, PMF combined with PCA was proposed and applied to apportion the sources of hazardous elements in surface sediments in the Yangtze River estuary.

The distribution patterns of As, Hg, Cu, Mn, Zn, and Cd were found to be similar, all with lower concentrations in the inner-estuary region and with higher concentrations in the mouth region. However, for Cr, Fe, and Ni, the higher concentration zone was in the adjacent sea, and the lower concentration zone was in the inner-estuary region.

The PCA performed on 12 elements identified three principal components that controlled their variability in the sediment samples. PC1, including Al, Fe, Mn, Cr, Ni, As, Cu, and Zn, seemed to be controlled by a sewage component. PC2, which included Pb and Sb, could be considered as an atmospheric deposition component. PC3, containing Cd and Hg, could be considered as an agricultural nonpoint component.

To further clarify the possible sources, the PMF method was also applied. Eight sources were identified: agricultural/ industrial sewage mixture (18.6 %), mining wastewater (15.9 %), agricultural fertilizer (14.5 %), atmospheric deposition (12.8 %), agricultural nonpoint (10.6 %), industrial wastewater (9.8 %), marine activity (9.0 %), and the nickel plating industry (8.8 %). Moreover, the contributions of the eight sources to the hazardous elements in the sediment were also calculated; the hazardous elements content in tributary sediments were found to be more connected to anthropogenic activity than to natural sources.

As a result, PCA offered a general classification of the sources, and PMF resolved more factors with higher explained variances, that is, PMF provided more details and expanded the source classification. PMF is superior to PCA in source identification and the apportionment of hazardous elements, providing both the internal analysis and the quantitative analysis. The simultaneous use of these methods can provide valuable information.

Acknowledgments The research was funded by the National Basic Research Program of China (973 Project, 2010CB429003) and the National Natural Science Foundation of China (Grant No. 41001352). The authors thank the editors and the anonymous reviewers for their valuable comments and suggestions on this paper.

References

- Arenas-Lago D, Veja FA, Silva LS, Andrade L (2013) Soil interaction and fractionation of added cadmium in some Galician soils. Microchem J (Print) 110:681–690
- Ayoubi S, Mehnatkesh A, Jalalian A, Sahrawat KL, Gheysari M (2014) Relationships between grain protein, Zn, Cu, Fe and Mn contents in wheat and soil and topographic attributes. Arch Agron Soil Sci 60(5):625–638
- Balachandran KK, Laluraj CM, Martin GD, Srinivas K, Venugopal P (2006) Environmental analysis of heavy metal deposition in a flow-restricted tropical estuary and its adjacent shelf. Environ Forensics 7(4):345–351
- Cerqueira B, Vega FA, Serra C, Silva LFO, Andrade ML (2011) Time of flight secondary ion mass spectrometry and high-resolution transmission electron microscopy/energy dispersive spectroscopy: a preliminary study of the distribution of Cu^{2+} and Cu^{2+}/Pb^{2+} on a Bt horizon surfaces. J Hazard Mater 195:422–431
- Cerqueira B, Vega FA, Silva LFO, Andrade L (2012) Effects of vegetation on chemical and mineralogical characteristics of soils developed on a decantation bank from a copper mine. Sci Total Environ 421–422:220–229
- Chen Y, Liu R, Sun C, Zhang P, Feng C, Shen Z (2012) Spatial and temporal variations in nitrogen and phosphorous nutrients in the Yangtze River estuary. Mar Pollut Bull 64(10):2083–2089
- Chen H, Teng Y, Wang J, Song L, Zuo R (2013) Source apportionment of trace element pollution in surface sediments using positive matrix factorization combined support vector machines: application to the Jinjiang River, China. Biol Trace Elem Res 151(3):462–470
- Cheng H, Hu Y (2010) Lead (Pb) isotopic fingerprinting and its applications in lead pollution studies in China: a review. Environ Pollut 158(5):1134–1146
- Collins AL, Anthony SG (2008) Assessing the likelihood of catchments across England and Wales meeting 'good ecological status' due to sediment contributions from agricultural sources. Environ Sci Pol 11(2):163–170
- Comero S, Locoro G, Free G, Vaccaro S, De Capitani L, Gawlik BM (2011) Characterisation of Alpine lake sediments using multivariate statistical techniques. Chemom Intell Lab Syst 107(1):24–30
- Comero S, Servida D, De Capitani L, Gawlik BM (2012) Geochemical characterization of an abandoned mine site: a combined positive matrix factorization and GIS approach compared with principal component analysis. J Geochem Explor 118:30–37
- Comero S, Vaccaro S, Locoro G, De Capitani L, Gawlik BM (2014) Characterization of the Danube River sediments using the PMF multivariate approach. Chemosphere 95:329–335
- Cruz N, Rodrigues SM, Coelho C, Carvalho L, Duarte AC, Pereira E, Romkens PFAM (2014) Urban agriculture in Portugal: availability of potentially toxic elements for plant uptake. Appl Geochem 44:27–37
- Cutruneo CMNL, Oliveira MLS, Ward CR, Hower JC, de Brum IAS, Sampaio CH, Kautzmann RM, Taffarel SR, Teixeira EC, Silva LFO (2014) A mineralogical and geochemical study of three Brazilian coal cleaning rejects: demonstration of electron beam applications. Int J Coal Geol 130:33–52
- Dias CL, Oliveira MLS, Hower JC, Taffarel SR, Kautzmann RM, Silva LFO (2014) Nanominerals and ultrafine particles from coal fires from Santa Catarina, South Brazil. Int J Coal Geol 122:50–60
- Ding Z, Hu X (2013) Assessment of As and metallic element contamination of riverine sediments from Yangtze River in Nanjing reach, China. Fresenius Environmental Bulletion 22(3A):824–831
- Dong C, Zhang W, Ma H, Feng H, Lu H, Dong Y, Yu L (2014) A magnetic record of heavy metal pollution in the Yangtze River subaqueous delta. Sci Total Environ 476:368–377
- Duan X, Li Y, Li X, Li M, Zhang D (2013) Distributions and sources of polychlorinated biphenyls in the coastal East China Sea sediments. Sci Total Environ 463:894–903
- Dwivedi AK, Vankar PS (2014) Source identification study of heavy metal contamination in the industrial hub of Unnao, India. Environ Monit Assess 186(6):3531–9
- Garcia KO, Teixeira EC, Agudelo-Castaneda DM, Braga M, Alabarse PG, Wiegand F, Kautzmann RM, Silva LFO (2014) Assessment of nitro-polycyclic aromatic hydrocarbons in PM1 near an area of heavy-duty traffic. Sci Total Environ 479–480:57–65
- Gonzalez-Macias C, Sanchez-Reyna G, Salazar-Coria L, Schifter I (2014) Application of the positive matrix factorization approach to identify heavy metal sources in sediments. A case study on the Mexican Pacific Coast. Environ Monit Assess 186(1):307–324
- Gosar M, Žibret G (2011) Mercury contents in the vertical profiles through alluvial sediments as a reflection of mining in Idrija (Slovenia). J Geochem Explor 110(2):81–91
- Hower JC, O'Keefe JMK, Henke KR, Wagner NJ, Copley G, Blake DR, Garrison T, Oliveira MLS, Kautzmann RM, Silva LFO (2013) Gaseous emissions and sublimates from the Truman Shepherd coal fire, Floyd County, Kentucky: a re-investigation following attempted mitigation of the fire. Int J Coal Geol 116:63–74
- Huang S, Tu J, Liu H, Hua M, Liao Q, Feng J, Weng Z, Huang G (2009) Multivariate analysis of trace element concentrations in atmospheric deposition in the Yangtze River delta, East China. Atmosphere Environment 43(36):5781–5790
- Huston R, Chan YC, Chapman H, Gardner T, Shaw G (2012) Source apportionment of heavy metals and ionic contaminants in rainwater tanks in a subtropical urban area in Australia. Water Res 46(4): 1121–1132
- Ielpo P, Paolillo V, de Gennaro G, Dambruoso PR (2014) PM10 and gaseous pollutants trends from air quality monitoring networks in Bari province: principal component analysis and absolute principal component scores on a two years and half data set. Chemistry Central Journal 8(14):1–12
- Jayawardana DT, Pitawala HMTG, Ishiga H (2014) Assessment of soil geochemistry around some selected agricultural sites of Sri Lanka. Environmental Earth Sciences 71(9):4097–4106
- Kasa E, Felix-Henningsen P, Duering R, Gjoka F (2014) The occurrence of heavy metals in irrigated and non-irrigated arable soils, NW Albania. Environ Monit Assess 186(6):3595–3603
- Khan MF, Hirano K, Masunaga S (2012) Assessment of the sources of suspended particulate matter aerosol using US EPA PMF 3.0. Environ Monit Assess 184(2):1063–1083
- Kronbauer MA, Izquierdo M, Dai S, Waanders FB, Wagner NJ, Mastalerz M, Hower JC, Oliveira MLS, Taffarel SR, Bizani D, Silva LFO (2013) Geochemistry of ultra-fine and nanocompounds in coal gasification ashes: a synoptic view. Sci Total Environ 456–457:95–103
- Kukrer S, Seker S, Abaci ZT, Kutlu B (2014) Ecological risk assessment of heavy metals in surface sediments of northern littoral zone of Lake Cildir, Ardahan, Turkey. Environ Monit Assess 186(6):3847–3857
- Li J, He M, Han W, Gu Y (2009) Analysis and assessment on heavy metal sources in the coastal soils developed from alluvial deposits using multivariate statistical methods. J Hazard Mater 164(2-3):976–981
- Li C, Zhong H, Wang S, Xue J (2014a) Leaching behavior and risk assessment of heavy metals in a landfill of electrolytic manganese residue in western Hunan, China. Hum Ecol Risk Assess 20(5):1249–1263
- Li F, Huang J, Zeng G, Huang X, Li X, Liang J, Wu H, Wang X, Bai B (2014b) Integrated source apportionment, screening risk assessment, and risk mapping of heavy metals in surface sediments: a case study of the Dongting Lake, middle China. Hum Ecol Risk Assess 20(5): 1213–1230
- Lim DI, Jung HS, Choi JY, Yang S, Ahn KS (2006) Geochemical compositions of river and shelf sediments in the Yellow Sea: grain-size normalization and sediment provenance. Continental Shelf Reserach 26(1):15–24
- Lin Y, Zhao Y, Hu G, Su G (2011) The application of multivariate statistical analysis in the pollution source recognition and analysis of heavy metals in soils. Earth and Environment 39:536–542
- Liu H, Li W (2011) Dissolved trace elements and heavy metals from the shallow lakes in the middle and lower reaches of the Yangtze River region, China. Environmental Earth Sciences 62(7):1503–1511
- Martinello K, Oliveira MLS, Molossi FA, Ramos CG, Teixeira EC, Kautzmann RM, Silva LFO (2014) Direct identification of hazardous elements in ultra-fine and nanominerals from coal fly ash produced during diesel co-firing. Sci Total Environ 470–471:444–452
- Mico C, Recatala L, Peris A, Sanchez J (2006) Assessing heavy metal sources in agricultural soils of an European Mediterranean area by multivariate analysis. Chemosphere 65(5):863–872
- Miler M, Gosar M (2012) Characteristics and potential environmental influences of mine waste in the area of the closed Mežica Pb-Zn mine (Slovenia). J Geochem Explor 112:152–160
- Oliveira MLS, Ward CR, French D, Hower JC, Querol X, Silva LFO (2012a) Mineralogy and leaching characteristics of beneficiated coal products from Santa Catarina, Brazil. Int J Coal Geol 94:314–325
- Oliveira MLS, Ward CR, Izquierdo M, Sampaio CH, de Brum IAS, Kautzmann RM, Sabedot S, Querol X, Silva LFO (2012b) Chemical composition and minerals in pyrite ash of an abandoned sulphuric acid production plant. Sci Total Environ 430:34–47
- Oliveira MLS, Ward CR, Sampaio CH, Querol X, Cutruneo CMNL, Taffarel SR, Silva LFO (2013) Partitioning of mineralogical and inorganic geochemical components of coals from Santa Catarina, Brazil, by industrial beneficiation processes. Int J Coal Geol 116:75–92
- Paatero P, Tapper U (1993) Analysis of different modes of factor-analysis as least-squares fit problems. Chemom Intell Lab Syst 18(2):183–194
- Pekey H, Dogan G (2013) Application of positive matrix factorisation for the source apportionment of heavy metals in sediments: a comparison with a previous factor analysis study. Microchem J 106:233–237
- Pekey H, Karakas D, Bakoglu M (2004) Source apportionment of trace metals in surface waters of a polluted stream using multivariate statistical analyses. Mar Pollut Bull 49(9-10):809–818
- Pérez F, Llorca M, Kock-Schulmeyer M, Krbi B, Oliveira LS, Da Boit Martinello K, Al-Dhabi NA, Anti I, Farré M, Barcelò D (2014)

Assessment of perfluoroalkyl substances in food items at global scale. Environ Res 135:181–189

- Qadir RM, Schnelle-Kreis J, Abbaszade G, Arteaga-Salas JM, Diemer J, Zimmermann R (2014) Spatial and temporal variability of source contributions to ambient PM10 during winter in Augsburg, Germany using organic and inorganic tracers. Chemosphere 103:263–273
- Quispe D, Pérez-López R, Silva LFO, Nieto JM (2012) Changes in mobility of hazardous elements during coal combustion in Santa Catarina power plant (Brazil). Fuel 94:495–503
- Rahman SA, Hamzah MS, Wood AK, Elias MS, Salim NAA, Sanuri E (2011) Sources apportionment of fine and coarse aerosol in Klang Valley, Kuala Lumpur using positive matrix factorization. Atmospheric Pollution Research 2(2SI):197–206
- Rahman MS, Saha N, Molla AH, Al-Reza SM (2014) Assessment of anthropogenic influence on heavy metals contamination in the aquatic ecosystem components: water, sediment, and fish. Soil & Sediment Contamination 23(4):353–373
- Ribeiro J, DaBoit K, Flores D, Ward CR, Silva LFO (2010) Identification of nanominerals and nanoparticles in burning coal waste piles from Portugal. Sci Total Environ 408:6032–6041
- Ribeiro J, Taffarel SR, Sampaio CH, Flores D, Silva LFO (2013) Mineral speciation and fate of some hazardous contaminants in coal waste pile from anthracite mining in Portugal. Int J Coal Geol 109–110:15–23
- Rodríguez-Vázquez N, Salzinger S, Silva LF, Amorín M, Granja JR (2013) Synthesis of cyclic γ -amino acids for foldamers and peptide nanotubes. Eur J Org Chem 3477–3493
- Saba T, Su S (2013) Tracking polychlorinated biphenyls (PCBs) congener patterns in Newark Bay surface sediment using principal component analysis (PCA) and positive matrix factorization (PMF). J Hazard Mater 260:634–643
- Saikia BK, Ward CR, Oliveira MLS, Hower JC, Braga M, Silva LF (2014) Geochemistry and nano-mineralogy of two medium-sulfur Northeast Indian coals. Int J Coal Geol 122:1
- Sajn R, Gosar M (2014) Multivariate statistical approach to identify metal sources in Litija area (Slovenia). J Geochem Explor 138:8–21
- Sanchís J, Oliveira LFS, De Leão FB, Farrè M, Barcelò D (2015) Liquid chromatography-atmospheric pressure photoionization-Orbitrap analysis of fullerene aggregates on surface soils and river sediments from Santa Catarina (Brazil). Sci Total Environ 505:172–179
- Silva LFO, Moreno T, Querol X (2009) An introductory TEM study of Fenanominerals within coal fly ash. Sci Total Environ 407:4972–4974
- Silva LFO, Querol X, da Boit KM, Fdez-Ortiz de Vallejuelo S, Madariaga JM (2011a) Brazilian coal mining residues and sulphide oxidation by Fenton's reaction: an accelerated weathering procedure to evaluate possible environmental impact. Journal of Hazardous Materials (Print) 186:516–525
- Silva LFO, Macias F, Oliveira MLS, da Boit MK, Waanders F (2011b) Coal cleaning residues and Fe-minerals implications. Environmental Monitoring and Assessment (Print) 172:367–378
- Silva LFO, Oliveira MLS, Erika RN, OKeefe JMK, Henke KR, Hower JC (2011c) Nanominerals and ultrafine particles in sublimates from the Ruth Mullins coal fire, Perry County, Eastern Kentucky, USA. Int J Coal Geol 85:237–245
- Silva LFO, Sampaio CH, Guedes A, Fdez-Ortiz de Vallejuelo S, Madariaga JM (2012) Multianalytical approaches to the characterisation of minerals associated with coals and the diagnosis of their potential risk by using combined instrumental microspectroscopic techniques and thermodynamic speciation. Fuel 94:52–63
- Silva LFO, de Vallejuelo SFO, Martinez-Arkarazo I, Castro K, Oliveira MLS, Sampaio CH, de Brum IAS, de Leao FB, Taffarel SR,

Madariaga JM (2013) Study of environmental pollution and mineralogical characterization of sediment rivers from Brazilian coal mining acid drainage. Sci Total Environ 447:169–178

- Simonetti A, Gariepy C, Banic CM, Tanabe R, Wong HK (2004) Pb isotopic investigation of aircraft-sampled emissions from the Horne smelter (Rouyn, Quebec): implications for atmospheric pollution in northeastern North America. Geochim Cosmochim Acta 68(16):3285–3294
- Song Y, Ji J, Yang Z, Yuan X, Mao C, Frost RL, Ayoko GA (2011) Geochemical behavior assessment and apportionment of heavy metal contaminants in the bottom sediments of lower reach of Changjiang River. Catena 85(1):73–81
- Tian HZ, Lu L, Cheng K, Hao JM, Zhao D, Wang Y, Jia WX, Qiu PP (2012) Anthropogenic atmospheric nickel emissions and its distribution characteristics in China. Sci Total Environ 417:148–157
- Tian Y, Shi G, Han S, Zhang Y, Feng Y, Liu G, Gao L, Wu J, Zhu T (2013) Vertical characteristics of levels and potential sources of water-soluble ions in PM10 in a Chinese megacity. Sci Total Environ 447:1–9
- Wang L, Wang Y, Xu C, An Z, Wang S (2011a) Analysis and evaluation of the source of heavy metals in water of the River Changjiang. Environ Monit Assess 173(1-4):301–313
- Wang Y, Yang Z, Shen Z, Tian Z, Niu J, Gao F (2011b) Assessment of heavy metals in sediments from a typical catchment of the Yangtze River, China. Environ Monit Assess 172(1-4):407–417
- Wang Z, Chen L, Zhang H, Sun R (2014) Multivariate statistical analysis and risk assessment of heavy metals monitored in surface sediment of the Luan River and its tributaries, China. Hum Ecol Risk Assess 20(6):1521–1537
- Xiao R, Bai J, Huang L, Zhang H, Cui B, Liu X (2013) Distribution and pollution, toxicity and risk assessment of heavy metals in sediments from urban and rural rivers of the Pearl River delta in southern China. Ecotoxicology 22(10):1564–1575
- Yang L, Huang B, Hu W, Chen Y, Mao M (2013) Assessment and source identification of trace metals in the soils of greenhouse vegetable production in eastern China. Ecotoxicol Environ Saf 97:204–209
- Yao S, Xue B (2014) Heavy metal records in the sediments of Nanyihu Lake, China: influencing factors and source identification. J Paleolimnol 51(1):15–27
- Yi Y, Zhang S (2012) Heavy metal (Cd, Cr, Cu, Hg, Pb, Zn) concentrations in seven fish species in relation to fish size and location along the Yangtze River. Environ Sci Pollut Res 19(9):3989–3996
- Zhao S, Feng C, Quan W, Chen X, Niu J, Shen Z (2012a) Role of living environments in the accumulation characteristics of heavy metals in fishes and crabs in the Yangtze River estuary, China. Mar Pollut Bull 64(6):1163–1171
- Zhao S, Feng C, Yang Y, Niu J, Shen Z (2012b) Risk assessment of sedimentary metals in the Yangtze estuary: new evidence of the relationships between two typical index methods. J Hazard Mater 241:164–172
- Zhao S, Feng C, Wang D, Liu Y, Shen Z (2013) Salinity increases the mobility of Cd, Cu, Mn, and Pb in the sediments of Yangtze estuary: relative role of sediments' properties and metal speciation. Chemosphere 91(7):977–984
- Zhao L, Xu Y, Hou H, Shangguan Y, Li F (2014a) Source identification and health risk assessment of metals in urban soils around the Tanggu chemical industrial district, Tianjin, China. Sci Total Environ 468:654–662
- Zhao S, Feng C, Wang D, Tian C, Shen Z (2014b) Relationship of metal enrichment with adverse biological effect in the Yangtze estuary sediments: role of metal background values. Environ Sci Pollut Res 21(1):464–472