ORIGINAL ARTICLE

Weiguo Sang · Hongxin Su

Interannual NPP variation and trend of *Picea schrenkiana* forests under changing climate conditions in the Tianshan Mountains, Xinjiang, China

Received: 31 October 2007 / Accepted: 20 May 2008 / Published online: 9 July 2008 The Ecological Society of Japan 2008

Abstract The interannual net primary production variation and trends of a Picea schrenkiana forest were investigated in the context of historical changes in climate and increased atmospheric $CO₂$ concentration at four sites in the Tianshan Mountain range, China. Historical changes in climate and atmospheric $CO₂$ concentration were used as Biome–BGC model drivers to evaluate the spatial patterns and temporal trends of net primary production (NPP). The temporal dynamics of NPP of P. schrenkiana forests were different in the western, middle and eastern sites of Tianshan, which showed substantial interannual variation. Climate changes would result in increased NPP at all study sites, but only the change in NPP in the western forest $(3.186 \text{ gC m}^{-2} \text{ year}^{-1}, P < 0.05)$ was statistically significant. Our study also showed a higher increase in the air temperature, precipitation and NPP during 1987– 2000 than 1961–1986. Statistical analysis indicates that changes in NPP are positively correlated with annual precipitation ($R = 0.77{\text -}0.92$) but that NPP was less sensitive to changes in air temperature. According to the simulation, increases in atmospheric $CO₂$ increased NPP by improving the water use efficiency. The results of this study show that the Tianshan Mount boreal forest ecosystem is sensitive to historical changes in climate and increasing atmospheric $CO₂$. The relative impacts of these variations on NPP interact in complex ways and are spatially variable, depending on local conditions and climate gradients.

W. Sang $(\boxtimes) \cdot H$. Su Key Laboratory of Vegetation and Environmental Change, Institute of Botany, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Nanxincun 20, Xiangshan, Haidian District, Beijing 100093, People's Republic of China E-mail: swg@ibcas.ac.cn Tel.: +86-10-82599519 Fax: +86-10-82599519

Keywords $BIOME-BGC \cdot Boreal forest \cdot Climate$ change \cdot Interannual variation \cdot Net primary production (NPP)

Introduction

The Intergovernmental Panel for Climate Change (IPCC) report clearly indicates that warming of the climate system is unequivocal—and very likely due to rapidly increasing atmospheric levels of greenhouse gas (such as $CO₂$) caused by human activities (IPCC [2007\)](#page-10-0). The climate change in Northwest China shows a considerable similarity to the global situation (Ding et al. [2006\)](#page-9-0): although climate change over the last century (since the end of Little Ice Age) has been dominated by a warm and drought trend, strong signals of climatic shift to a warm, humid pattern have been appearing in the Tianshan Mountain and neighboring regions since 1987 (Shi et al. [2002](#page-10-0), [2003\)](#page-10-0). The projection of climate change due to greenhouse effects in Northwest China, as simulated by a regional climate model under $2 \times CO_2$, has indicated that the mean annual temperature will increase 2.7 $\rm ^{\circ}C$, with about a 3.0 $\rm ^{\circ}C$ increase in the winter and spring, during the next 100 years. During this same time period, annual precipitation will usually increase by more than 20% in most of Northwest China and by 30% or more in some places (Gao et al. [2003b\)](#page-10-0). Therefore, the effects of climate change on vegetation in this region has been the focus of concern (Chen et al. [2004;](#page-9-0) Guo et al. [2007](#page-10-0); Su et al. [2007](#page-11-0); Xie et al. [2007](#page-11-0)).

Forests, which currently cover approximately 30– 40% of the vegetated area of the earth, are essential in determining the state of the global climate system and carbon cycle (Dixon et al. [1994\)](#page-10-0). Boreal forests are of particular importance in both the global climate system, as they expected to undergo the greatest climatically induced change in the twenty-first century (Bonan et al. [1992\)](#page-9-0), and in the world carbon budget, because forests have been suggested as possible sinks for the 'missing

W. Sang and H. Su contributed equally to this paper, arranged in alphabetical order by surnames.

carbon' (Ciais et al. [1995\)](#page-9-0). The boreal forests of China are mainly distributed in northeastern (Daxingan Mountains) and northwestern China (Altai and Tianshan Mountains) (ECVC [1980\)](#page-10-0). In the study reported here, we have focused on the zonal boreal forests on the northern slopes of Tianshan Mountain.

The Tianshan Mountains form a large, isolated mountain range surrounded by desert basins to the norther and south. The distribution of forest in this mountainous region is limited to areas of sufficient moisture and warmth. The tree line, where the average temperature during the warmest month is 10° C, is 2700 m a.s.l. Areas below 1500 m a.s.l., on the other hand, are generally too dry to support forest vegetation (Zhang and Tang [1989](#page-11-0)). Boreal spruce forest is the most productive and widespread forest type on the northern slopes of the Tianshan Mountains. It is also one of the most important zonal vegetations in the arid land of the Xinjiang Uygur Autonomous Region, China, accounting for 60.8% of the timber growing stock and 54.0% of forested areas (Zhang and Tang [1989\)](#page-11-0). Therefore, it is also economically important to determine how Picea schrenkiana forest ecosystems respond to climate change and increasing $CO₂$ levels. One line of evidence for projecting the future performance of P. schrenkiana forests is how they have responded to the substantial interannual climatic variation in recent decades. Many studies have focused on the growth and production of forests on the Tianshan Mountains during the last decade (Zhang et al. [1980;](#page-11-0) Sun [1994;](#page-11-0) Wang and Zhao [2000](#page-11-0); Li et al. [2003;](#page-10-0) Ni [2004](#page-10-0)), but only a few studies measured past interannual variations and long-term trends of P. schrenkiana forest to climate change in this region (Ma et al. [2003;](#page-10-0) Chen et al. [2004](#page-9-0)).

Four approaches are commonly used to evaluate the response of forests to climate change in mountain forest areas: forest inventory, standard statistical dendroclimatic analysis, remote sensing method and processbased ecosystem modeling. The forest inventory provides an estimate of the actual biomass accumulation in each period (Fang and Chen [2001\)](#page-10-0). The factors considered in such biomass inventories include forest regrowth following a disturbance, enhanced growth due to climate change, $CO₂$ fertilization and nitrogen deposition (Dixon et al. [1994](#page-10-0)). While being very informative, forest inventory cannot distinguish the effects of changing temperature, precipitation and increasing atmospheric $CO₂$ on growth. Standard statistical dendroclimatic analysis, in contrast, can facilitate the identification of pertinent climatic variables and periods when tree growth was affected by climate change (Yuan and Li [1994](#page-11-0); Zhu et al. [2004;](#page-11-0) Guo et al. [2007\)](#page-10-0). Tree rings provide information on carbon allocation to stem growth, but this information cannot be taken to reflect the growth of a whole forest ecosystem. Recently, there has been increasing interest in estimating vegetation cover and production by normalized difference vegetation index (NDVI) derived from remote sensing images (NOAA/AVHRR) (Luo et al. [2003](#page-10-0); Ma et al. [2003](#page-10-0);

Chen et al. [2004](#page-9-0); Xie et al. [2007\)](#page-11-0). This technique provides a high-resolution map of current vegetation in the landscape and integrates well with regional studies.However, NDVI spatial variations result from changes in the surface density of a forest canopy, and the linkage between NDVI and the ground-based growth is not uniform, with variations depending on the terrain and environment. Moreover, the remote sensing method is limited to short-term studies, since most of the remote sensing data were obtained during or after the 1980s. Theoretically, the approach of process-based ecosystem modeling allows the researcher to determine the relative roles of climate and $CO₂$ on production and avoids many of the limitations already stated for other techniques by integrating ecosystem processes and spatial variations to environmental factors (Cramer et al. [1999\)](#page-9-0).

Models have been developed to study the responses in terms of net primary productivity (NPP), a key ecosystem variable and the most critical biotic component of the global carbon cycle, which is defined as the difference between gross primary production and the sum of the maintenance and growth respiration components (Cramer et al. [2001](#page-9-0)). A process-based ecosystem model, BIOME-BGC, simulates the storage and fluxes of water, carbon and nitrogen within the vegetation, litter and soil components of a terrestrial ecosystem and has been used to quantify the effect on NPP under different climate scenarios in oasis areas along the Tianshan Mountains in Xinjiang, China with an arid climate (Gao et al. [2003a\)](#page-10-0). The model parameters were usually derived from published information, but the ability of BIOME-BGC to simulate the NPP of P. schrenkiana forests on the Tianshan Mountains has been confirmed using independent field data (Su et al. [2007](#page-11-0)). Thus, the model can be used as tool to explore the fluctuation of forest growth as a variable of climate change.

The aim of the study reported here was to investigate the evidence of past NPP changes and trends of P. schrenkiana forest under the climate change that occurred in recent decades and to assess, using processbased ecosystem model, the historical effect of fluctuations in climate and atmospheric $CO₂$ on forest production.

Materials and methods

Study sites

The study was undertaken at the middle elevations of the northern slopes of the Tianshan Mountains (Fig. [1\)](#page-2-0). Forests in the region are dominated by P. schrenkiana. Some broad-leaved trees and shrubs, such as Sorbus tianschanica Rupr., Salix xerophila Flod., Betula tianschanica Rupr., B. verrucosa Ehrh. and B. microphylla Bunge, are found in the forest. There is also a dense understorey of Sabina pseudosabina (Fisch. et May) (Zhang and Tang [1989](#page-11-0)). Four sites, Zhaosu (ZS) in western Tianshan, Tianchi (TC) and Xiaoquzi (XQZ) in Fig. 1 Study sites of Picea schrenkiana forests in the Xinjiang Uygur Autonomous Region, China. Open circle Plot sites, filled triangle meteorological stations, E elevation of sites

Table 1 General stand characteristics of the four forest sites on the north slopes of the Tianshan Mountains, Xinjiang Uygur Autonomous Region, China

^aP. spp. *Picea schrenkiana* var. *tianschanica*; *L.* spp., *Larix sibirica* by DBH is diameter at breast beight (cm); DBH and beight are expressed

 b DBH is diameter at breast height (cm); DBH and height are expressed in mean \pm 1 SD

c MLGS, Mountain leaching gray-cinnamon forest soil; MTGS, mountain typical gray-cinnamon forest soili; MCGS, mountain carbonate gray-cinnamon forest soil

middle Tianshan, and Yiwu (YW) in eastern Tianshan, were selected for this study (Table 1). These sites have different climatic conditions in the various regions of the northern slopes of the Tianshan Mountain.

The process-based ecosystem model

The BIOME-BGC model, a multi-biome generalization of the FOREST-BGC model (Running and Coughlan [1988](#page-10-0)), is a general ecosystem process model designed to simulate daily biogeochemical and hydrologic processes from stand to global scales (Running and Hunt [1993](#page-10-0); White et al. [2000;](#page-11-0) Thornton et al. [2002\)](#page-11-0). Details of the model are presented elsewhere and the model has been successfully applied over a range of diverse biomes, spatial scales and climate regimes, including boreal forests of the Tianshan Mountains (e.g. Churkina and Running [1998](#page-9-0); Churkina et al. [2003;](#page-9-0) Gao et al. [2003a](#page-10-0); Hanson et al. [2004;](#page-10-0) Law et al. [2004](#page-10-0); Kang et al. [2006](#page-10-0); Schmid et al. [2006](#page-10-0); Kimball et al. [2007;](#page-10-0) Su et al. [2007\)](#page-11-0). Version 4.1.1 of the BIOME-BGC model was used in this study.

Model parameterization

The major input variables for the model include climate, vegetation ecophysiological parameters and site condition parameters. In this study, non-site-specific ecophysiological parameters for P. schrenkiana forests [taken from data gathered on-site when available; otherwise, species-specific values were used from a recent literature synthesis (White et al. [2000](#page-11-0))]. For details on the parameters, see Su et al. ([2007\)](#page-11-0). This parameterization reflects an important model assumption that the four P. schrenkiana forests have the same physiology and remain constant throughout all the simulation. Sitespecific parameters, such as soil texture (clay, silt and sand content) and effective soil depth, were obtained from field data (Table [1\)](#page-2-0).

The standard daily meteorological input file for BIOME-BGC was generated by a microclimate simulation model, MT-CLIM (version 4.3; [www.forestry.](http://www.forestry.umt.edu/ntsg) [umt.edu/ntsg](http://www.forestry.umt.edu/ntsg)) (Kimball et al. [1997](#page-10-0); Thornton and Running [1999;](#page-11-0) Thornton et al. [2000](#page-11-0)). The original climate records (including daily minimum and maximum air temperature and precipitation over the period 1961– 2000) from meteorological stations near the sites were obtained from the China National Climatic Data Center (NCDC) (Fig. [1\)](#page-2-0). A coefficient adjusting the daylight average temperature (TEMCF), which was set to 0.45 in the original MT-CLIM model, was set to -0.11 , -0.12 , -0.12 ,and -0.07 for ZS, TC, XQZ, and YW, respectively, based on the daily temperature observations in those areas. The XQZ and TC stations are centrally located in the study region and fall within the elevation range of the plots under study, so the weather data could be used without interpolation. MT-CLIM initialized the flat surface conditions of the two sites to the same elevation as the original station data to compute the variables not present in standard weather station records for the BIOME-BGC model. However, the ZS and YW stations are some distance from the study sites (about 10 and 25 km, respectively), which may have introduced some uncertainty into the climate data used for the simulations. Therefore, the daily data were adjusted for site conditions using MT-CLIM based on the elevation, longitude and latitude. Here, the precipitation pattern and lapse rates for the minimum and maximum air temperature were estimated using data obtained from earlier studies on the climate conditions of the Tianshan Mountains (Wei and Hu [1990;](#page-11-0) Zhou [1995](#page-11-0); Yang et al. [2006](#page-11-0)).

Simulation experiments

Two simulations with BIOME-BGC were performed: one considered climate and $CO₂$ changes together, and the other considered only climate change. These two runs were compared to determine the effect of $CO₂$ fertilization on NPP. All analyses were based on the run combining climate and $CO₂$ changes.

In both cases, the model was first run until a steadystate condition was achieved for each forest site (the spin-up run). Throughout this process, the 40-year climate record was repeated as often as necessary. Atmospheric $CO₂$ concentrations were set to 294.8 ppmv throughout the spin-up run, thereby approximating levels at the end of the nineteenth century (Churkina et al. [2003](#page-9-0)). Next, taking the spin-up endpoint as an initial condition, the effect of climate change was simu-

lated under historical daily climate data from 1961 to 2000. The same parameters were used in the two stages of the simulation. The runs with both climate and $CO₂$ changes used the historical $CO₂$ and daily climate data from 1961 to 2000 as inputs. Here, historical records of atmospheric $CO₂$ concentrations at the Mauna Loa Observatory were used (Keeling and Whorf [2002](#page-10-0)). The atmospheric $CO₂$ level has increased by 16.3% (from 317.2 to 368.8 ppmv) over the study period.

Data analysis

- 1. For each of the four sites, we applied simple linear regression to explore possible trends of the two climate parameters (the mean annual temperature and total annual precipitation) and simulated NPP during the 40-years period. Because recent research suggests that a climatic shift from warm–dry to warm–wet occurred in 1987 in the middle and west regions of Northwest China (Shi et al. [2002](#page-10-0), [2003\)](#page-10-0), we additionally split our data in two different time spans: 1961–1986 and 1987–2000. Essentially, we were interested in noting whether the findings of Shi et al. are consistent with those of our study. For both the time spans, again, a simple linear regression was applied to our climate.
- 2. Annual mean temperature and annual precipitation were used together with the simulated NPP to examine the patterns of interannual variability in the productivity of P. schrenkiana forests in relation to some potential climatic predictors using lagged crosscorrelation analysis with SPSS FOR WINDOWS ver. 11.0 statistical software (SPSS, Chicago, IL). The time lags (0, 1 and 2 years), which were suggested for the cross-correlation analyses, were thought to incorporate both immediate physiological alterations and delayed biogeochemical adjustments of P. schrenkiana forest ecosystems due to variable climate.
- 3. The net $CO₂$ fertilization effect on growths for the time period 1961–2000 was calculated as the difference in NPP between the two experiments (climate with $CO₂$ and climate only). Then, annual mean temperature, annual precipitation and water-use efficiency [WUE, defined as the ratio between annual NPP and annual total evapotranspiration (mm $year^{-1})$] were used to examine how these factors influence the strength of the $CO₂$ fertilization effect that governs the activity of forest ecosystem.

Results

Climate analysis

During the period between 1961 and 2000, the mean changes of the temperature were $+0.021^{\circ}$ C year⁻¹

 $(P \le 0.05)$ at the ZS and YW sites. However, the warming trends in terms of annual means at XQZ and TC (both $+0.008$ °C year⁻¹) were not statistically significant (Table 2). There was also a trend towards a higher increase in the air temperature during 1987–2000 than 1961–1986.

Precipitation change was a very complicated parameter at the four study sites during 1961–2000 (Table 2). Although the average annual precipitation decreased by 0.72 mm year⁻¹ at ZS, increased by 2.12 mm year⁻¹ at XQZ and increased by 1.36 mm year⁻¹ at TC, the linear trend test results showed that the trends over time were weak and statistically insignificant. Only the trend in YW was significant $(+2.333 \text{ mm year}^{-1}, P = 0.019)$.

Trends in NPP

Based on the BIOME-BGC simulations, we estimated the NPP of four P. schrenkiana forest ecosystems on the northern slopes of the Tianshan Mountains during the period 1961–2000 (Table 2). ZS in the west had the highest annual NPP (mean 595.9 \pm 11.0 g C m⁻² $year^{-1}$, range 479.9–757.6 gC m⁻² year⁻¹), followed by XQZ (mean 510.4 \pm 22.6 gC m⁻² year⁻¹, range 151.2-718.6 gC m⁻² year⁻¹) and TC (mean 518.3 \pm 27.5 gC m^{-2} year⁻¹, range 71.4–775.2 gC m⁻² year⁻¹); YW, the cool and dry eastern site, has the lowest NPP (mean 327.7 ± 15.4 gC m⁻² year⁻¹, range 123.2-594.4 gC m^{-2} year⁻¹).

The annual NPP showed substantial interannual variations, with very different temporal patterns for each site (Fig. [2](#page-5-0)). Higher NPP occurred in 1964, 1980 and 1998 at most of the sites, declining sharply in 1976 and 1997. Linear trend analysis revealed that NPP in the period 1961–2000 increased by an average of 0.351 gC \rm{m}^{-2} year⁻¹ at ZS, 2.139 gC m⁻² year⁻¹ at XQZ, 1.977 gC m⁻² year⁻¹ at TC and 3.186 gC m⁻² year⁻¹ at YW. The increase in NPP was only significant at YW $(P < 0.05)$. Again, we found a higher increase in the NPP during 1987–2000 than during 1961–1986 (Table 2).

Influence of climate fluctuation on NPP

In the west (ZS) , middle (XQZ, TC) and east (YW) of the Tianshan Mountains, different climate-driven processes regulated forest production over the period 1961– 2000 (Fig. [2](#page-5-0)). Annual mean temperature and precipitation were the major climatic factors governing the NPP of the P. schrenkiana forest (Table [3\)](#page-6-0). The weakly positive zero-lag correlations between temperature and NPP in the ZS and YW forests indicated an immediate response to warmer temperatures through the enhancement of plant production. The central sites, XQZ and TC, however, displayed significantly negative zero-lag correlations. Interestingly, almost all of the NPP values

Table 2 Trends in precipitation, temperature and NPP in four study sites within a given time span

Trends in precipitation, temperature and NPP in four study sites within

Table 2

time spar

given \overline{a}

aT , Annual temperature (-

C); P, annual precipitation (mm); NPP, net primary production (gC m⁻² year⁻¹

 $\widehat{}$

Fig. 2 Effects of interannual variations in temperature (°C) and precipitation (mm) on net primary production (NPP, gC m⁻² year⁻¹) at the four study sites over the period 1961–2000. a Zhaosu (ZS), **b** Xiaoquzi (XQZ), **c** Tianchi (TC), **d** Yiwu (YW)

Table 3 The lagged correlations (R values) of annual NPP versus temperature and precipitation at the four forest sites

Study site	Precipitation			Temperature		
	0 -Lag	1-year Lag	2-year Lag	0 -Lag	1-year Lag	2-year Lag
ZS	$0.774**$	0.275	-0.246	0.036	0.174	0.112
$_{\rm TC}^{\rm XQZ}$	$0.882**$	-0.011	-0.256	$-0.324*$	0.308	0.209
	$0.851**$	-0.073	-0.228	$-0.322*$	0.372	-0.014
YW	$0.832**$	0.124	-0.130	0.159	0.454	0.189

*Correlation is significant at the α < 0.05 level (single-tailed); **correlation is significant at the α < 0.01 level (single-tailed)

Fig. 3 The response of net primary production (NPP, $qC m^{-2}$ year⁻ 1) to precipitation (*P*, mm) in the four forest sites over the period 1961–2000

were positively correlated with the 1- or 2-year lagged temperature.

Strongly positive zero-lag correlations were found between NPP and annual precipitation at all four sites. This indicated a direct and immediate enhancement of forest production following an increase in precipitation, which on some occasions persisted into the next year (see the 1-year lagged correlations). However, negative correlations between growth and precipitation were found in the 2-year lagged data at all four sites.

These results revealed that the effects of precipitation on the NPP were greater at the dry sites (XQZ, TC, and YW) than at the wet site (western Tianshan, ZS) (Fig. 3). The correlations between precipitation and NPP were strong at the dry sites $(R \text{ in the range } 0.83-$ 0.92, $P \le 0.001$) with relatively steep slopes. The correlation in ZS, the wet area, was weaker ($R = 0.77$, $P \leq 0.01$, and the slope was relatively shallow. These results suggest that a small decrease in precipitation at the dry sites could lead to a large decrease in growth, while a similar decrease in precipitation at the wet site might not affect growth to any major extent. It is interesting to note that NPP tended to decrease when annual precipitation was greater than 648.4 mm at TC and 681.8 mm at XQZ. However, the NPP of the other two sites was positively correlated with annual precipitation at all levels.

The effect of $CO₂$ fertilization on NPP

Climate variability coupled with $CO₂$ fertilization generally resulted in a higher annual NPP than did climate variability without $CO₂$ fertilization (Fig. [4\)](#page-7-0). The strength of the $CO₂$ fertilization effect for the P. schrenkiana forests showed site-to-site variations, with a mean 21.03 \pm 2.40 gC m⁻² year⁻¹ (or 3.82 \pm 0.47%) for ZS, 22.02 \pm 2.20 gC m⁻² year⁻¹ (or 5.27 \pm 0.71%) for XQZ, 9.43 \pm 1.61 gC m⁻² year⁻¹ (or 4.30 \pm 1.81%) for TC and 7.74 \pm 1.04 gC m⁻² year⁻¹ (or 3.05 \pm 0.55%) for YW in the period 1961–2000.

The net effect of $CO₂$ fertilization on NPP showed great temporal and spatial variations and did not show a monotonic increase in magnitude as atmospheric $CO₂$ concentration increased from 317.2 to 368.8 ppmv during the study period (Fig. [4\)](#page-7-0). Other environmental factors, however, could also play a part in the observed trends (Table [4\)](#page-7-0). Correlation analysis suggested that both temperature and precipitation can influence the strength of the $CO₂$ fertilization effect. The results of our analysis further indicated that interannual variations in the $CO₂$ fertilization effect were strongly correlated with inter-annual WUE.

Fig. 4 Effect of $CO₂$ on net primary production (NPP, $gC \text{ m}^{-2}$ year⁻¹) of P. schrenkiana forests in the four forest sites over the period of 1961–2000. Solid lines indicate the changing trends

Table 4 Correlative coefficients between precipitation, temperature, water use efficient changes (ΔWUE) and net $CO₂$ effect on the NPP of P. schrenkiana forests

*Correlation is significant at the α < 0.05 level (single-tailed); ** correlation is significant at the α < 0.01 level (single-tailed)

T, Annual temperature (°C); P, annual precipitation (mm); NPP, net primary production ($gC \text{ m}^{-2}$ year⁻¹)

Discussion

Interannual climate change

Based on our analysis of the temperature records from four meteorological stations in the Tianshan Mountains, there was a trend for annual mean air temperature to increase at all four sites. This result is in agreement with observed trends for Xinjiang as a whole (Su et al. [2003](#page-11-0); Xu and Wei [2004](#page-11-0)). Both local and provincial data show that (1) most of the temperature increase occurred during the last two decades of the twentieth century, and (2) in many places the degree of warming was well above the global average.

Annual precipitation at the four sites showed significant variation over the years studied. Our results suggest that any long-term, monotonic trend was weak and statistically insignificant in all regions except for site YW. These results are consistent with those of Song and

Zhang (2003) and Chen et al. (2004) (2004) who found that mean precipitation displayed a slight upward trend towards the end of the twentieth century in the Tianshan Mountains. Even combining their analysis with our own, it is still too early to conclude that there has been a systematic, monotonic, regional trend in precipitation or temperature in Tianshan Mountains over the past 40 years. Consequently, we conclude that the results of our study do not support the conclusion of Shi et al. ([2002](#page-10-0), [2003](#page-10-0)) that a climatic shift from warm–dry to warm–wet occurred in 1987 in Northwest China.

Trends in NPP

Based on the climate and $CO₂$ concentration information for the period 1991–2000, the BIOME-BGC estimations of mean NPP were similar to those previously published estimates of productivity on the north slopes of the Tianshan Mountains (Wang and Zhao [2000](#page-11-0); Ni [2004\)](#page-10-0). Despite the uniform physiognomy of forest cover in these regions, our simulations also suggest that the NPP decreased from west to east, responding strongly to the rainfall and temperature gradient (Sun [1994;](#page-11-0) Wang and Zhao [2000\)](#page-11-0).

Our analysis of the BIOME-BGC simulations revealed an increase in the NPP of P. schrenkiana forests in the Tianshan Mountains and also showed that the forest NPP has changed even more in the latter two decades of the twentieth century in response to significant temperature changes. Evidence for a substantial increase in productivity can also be found using forest inventory surveys. The total growing stock and standing volume per hectare of Xinjiang forests have increased enormously in recent decades according to forest inventory data (Fang and Chen [2001;](#page-10-0) Li et al. [2003\)](#page-10-0). Depending on the regional scale, results of satellitebased studies indicate that forest growth and vegetation production have increased on the northern slopes of the Tianshan Mountains since the early 1980s (Ma et al. [2003](#page-10-0); Chen et al. [2004\)](#page-9-0), which is consistent with the trends in plant growth or NPP in the northern high and middle latitudes at the same time (Myneni et al. [1997](#page-10-0); Hicke et al. [2002;](#page-10-0) Fang et al. [2003;](#page-10-0) Nemani et al. [2003](#page-10-0); Slayback et al. [2003;](#page-10-0) Cao et al. [2004](#page-9-0); Kimball et al. [2007](#page-10-0)). This may partially explain the increased carbon sinks in the northern region (Schimel et al. [2001\)](#page-10-0). In comparing our work with other studies, our most striking result is the sustained climate signal and favorable growth response from the 1980s to the present. This suggests that the NPP trends estimated from the three approaches are comparable. We also evaluated the results of our model and were able to identify key information gaps that can be filled by appropriate observational and research programs.

Changes in NPP due to climate change and $CO₂$

Recent climate changes have enhanced plant growth in the northern mid-latitudes and high latitudes, and multiple mechanisms (e.g. climate changes, $CO₂$ fertilization, nitrogen deposition, forest regrowth and management) have promoted increases in NPP (Nemani et al. 2003 ; Hyvönen et al. 2007). In the temperate and boreal zones, nutrient availability is the main limiting factor, but in large parts of Northwest China, forest growth is primarily limited by temperature (high latitudes) or water availability (arid, semi-arid) (Zhang and Tang [1989](#page-11-0)). Given the focus of this study on estimating the NPP of P. schrenkiana forests at an ecosystem level, we only discuss here the relationship between climate variables, atmospheric $CO₂$ concentration and NPP; NPP variability associated with other factors is beyond the scope of our study.

It is well established that temperature and precipitation are dominant controlling factors of plant photosynthesis, and the interaction of their effects on general growth patterns has been obtained from long-term experiments (Lieth [1975](#page-10-0)). Our analysis suggests that precipitation is an important factor affecting the growth of P. schrenkiana, accounting for at least 70% of the total variance in NPP at all four study sites (Fig. [3\)](#page-6-0). In other words, an increase in precipitation in the future will tend to alleviate the moisture stress for forest growth and have, therefore, a positive effect on the NPP of P. schrenkiana forests in the Tianshan Mountain region (Su et al. [2007](#page-11-0)). These results are in general agreement with those from other P. schrenkiana studies in which growthring evidence at Xinjiang showed that precipitation is critical to growth (e.g. Yuan et al. [2000](#page-11-0); Yuan et al. [2001](#page-11-0); Zhu et al. [2004;](#page-11-0) Guo et al. [2007](#page-10-0)). These results are

also in agreement with those from studies of waterlimited regions by Nemani et al. ([2003](#page-10-0)) and Mohamed et al. [\(2004](#page-10-0)), which showed that increasing precipitation will dramatically increase the simulated NPP in the future. Our analysis also indicated a negative correlation between NPP and 2-year lagged precipitation for all four sites (Table [3](#page-6-0)). The lagged correlations provide a possible explanation for a delayed negative impact of precipitation on forest production: the NPP was positively related with the current year rainfall, but rainfall did not influence or had a negative relation with lagged the 2 year NPP.

In contrast, the results from our study suggest that temperature had relatively little effect on the NPP of P. schrenkiana forests. In other words, the precipitation increase had a greater influence than the temperature changes on P. schrenkiana forest productivity in the Tianshan Mountains (Su et al. [2007\)](#page-11-0). This result is consistent with the analysis of Hunt and Running ([1992](#page-10-0)), who suggested that the temperature effect in BIOME-BGC simulation is small. Almost all of the NPP, however, showed positive 1- and 2-year lagged correlations with the temperature. This was difficult to explain as being simply a composite effect of the forest ecosystem. The following mechanism, however, may provide an explanation for this result. Warm temperatures result in an increase of biomass input to the soil pool, while precipitation increases soil moisture and facilitates the transformation of organic matter into readily available inorganic nutrients (mainly phosphorous and nitrogen). Warm temperatures therefore benefit forest growth, but only after a certain delay (Tian et al. [1998\)](#page-11-0). Consequently, in the BIOME-BGC model, the interaction of temperature, precipitation and nutrients in terms of their effects on forest general growth patterns seems to be well estimated (Su et al. [2007\)](#page-11-0). Elevated temperatures may increase NPP through metabolically enhanced photosynthesis and by prolonging the growing season as well as increasing nutrient availability through higher rates of decomposition. Elevated temperatures, however, may also decrease NPP by decreasing soil moisture and enhancing plant respiration (Churkina and Running [1998](#page-9-0); Thornton et al. [2002\)](#page-11-0). Our results suggest that the positive effects of the temperature increase more than just compensate for the negative effects on the NPP of the P. schrenkiana forest at the ZS and YW sites. Without an increase in precipitation, increases in temperature may limit the production of P. schrenkiana forests at the XQZ and TC sites. This proposal is in agreement with other *P. schrenkiana* studies, which have determined that lower production may be attributed to a temperature-induced increase in water stress in these water-deficient environments (Yuan and Li [1994,](#page-11-0) [1995](#page-11-0); Zhu et al. [2004\)](#page-11-0). It has been suggested that the effects of temperature on productivity may be dependent on local conditions (Nemani et al. [2003;](#page-10-0) Mohamed et al. [2004](#page-10-0)).

The rise in atmospheric $CO₂$ concentration is one of the best documented global atmospheric changes of the

past half century, and enormous research efforts have been undertaken to understand how plants and ecosystems will respond to it (Ainsworth and Long 2005). The results of our study suggest that the increasing $CO₂$ concentration had a comparatively small positive effect on the NPP of P. schrenkiana forests (range 3.05– 5.27%). This positive response resulted primarily from the higher rates of photosynthesis due to the direct effect of $CO₂$ fertilization, but also to a reduction in stomatal conductance and transpiration and improved WUE in the simulation. This result is in agreement with that of Chen et al. (2000), who reported a similar decrease in isotopic discrimination and increase in WUE over the same period using historical records of P. schrenkiana tree rings. Our result is also consistent with the simulation results of Xiao et al. [\(1998\)](#page-11-0), Ni [\(2002\)](#page-10-0) and Su et al. ([2007\)](#page-11-0), who both reported that an increase in atmospheric $CO₂$ concentration had no significant effect on the NPP of the boreal forests in China. Similarly, Melillo et al. ([1993](#page-10-0)) found that increasing simulated atmospheric $CO₂$ levels did not change the NPP of the boreal woodland and boreal forest as predicted by the terrestrial ecosystem model (TEM).

Our analysis also indicated that interannual climate variability could alter the effect of $CO₂$ fertilization on the production of P. schrenkiana forests, which show that different ecosystems respond to increased levels of $CO₂$ quite differently depending on environmental factors (Fig. [4](#page-7-0)). In particular, we found that the effect of $CO₂$ fertilization on the forests in the Tianshan Mountains depended strongly on temperature (Table [4\)](#page-7-0). The simultaneous elevation of $CO₂$ and temperature had been observed to have a positive effect in most tree organs (Aranjuelo et al. 2005). This positive interaction between $CO₂$ and temperature could be explained by an increase in the photosynthetic thermal optimum due to changes in the Rubisco kinetic properties (Long [1991\)](#page-10-0). Therefore, these results emphasize the importance of resource interactions and feedback in the analysis of forest response to rising $CO₂$ concentrations (Hanson et al. [2005\)](#page-10-0).

Conclusion

The climate data reported here shown that the annual mean temperature increased significantly and precipitation varied greatly at all four sites in the Tianshan Mountain range between 1961 and 2000. The NPP of the P. schrenkiana forests exhibited a substantial year-toyear variation, and most production variations did not show any significant trends due to the dominance of high frequencies. Thus, NPP estimates based on a single year's measurement must be treated cautiously in view of the temporal and spatial variations in climate. Our sensitivity analysis suggested that the NPP is sensitive to temperature and rainfall changes and that precipitation appears to be a determinant of production of P. schrenkiana forests. The results show that the most striking feature of the climate and NPP record is

continuing temperature and rainfall changes and a favorable growth response from the 1980s to the present in the Tianshan Mountains. They also reveal that the recent increase in atmospheric $CO₂$ may already have had impacts on the production of P. schrenkiana forests. Our analysis indicates that climate change and $CO₂$ fertilization explain most of the NPP variation observed in P. schrenkiana forests.

Acknowledgments The study was financially supported by a major project of National Natural Science Foundation (Grand No. 30590382) and ''111 program'' from Bureau of Foreign Expert of China (contract no. 2008-B08044). BIOME-BGC (version 4.1.1) and MT-CLIM were provided by the Numerical Terradynamic Simulation Group (NTSG) at the University of Montana. The authors thank the two anonymous reviewers for their comments and suggestions to improve the early version of this manuscript.

References

- Ainsworth EA, Long SP (2005) What have we learned from 15 years of free air $CO₂$ enrichment (FACE)? A meta-analytic review of the responses of photosynthesis, canopy properties and plant production to rising $CO₂$. New Phytol 165:351–372
- Aranjuelo I, Irigoyen JJ, Perez P, Martinez-Carrasco R, Sanchez-Diaz M (2005) The use of temperature gradient tunnels for studying the combined effect of $CO₂$, temperature and water availability in N_2 fixing alfalfa plants. Ann Appl Biol 146:51–60
- Bonan GB, Pollard D, Thompson SL (1992) Effects of boreal forests vegetation on global climate. Nature 359:716–718
- Cao MK, Prince SD, Small J, Goetz SJ (2004) Remotely sensed interannual variations and trends in terrestrial net primary productivity 1981–2000. Ecosystems 7:233–242
- Chen T, Qin DH, Li JF, Ren JW, Liu XH, Sun WZ (2000) Study on climatic significance of fir tree–ring δ 13C from Zhaosu county of Xinjiang region, China (in Chinese). J Glaciol Geocryol 22(4):347–352
- Chen X, Luo G, Xia J, Zhou K, Lou S, Ye M (2004) A study of ecological responses to climatic change on the North Slopes of the Tianshan Mountains in Xinjiang China. Sci China Ser D Earth Sci 34(12):1166–1175
- Churkina G, Running SW (1998) Contrasting climatic controls on the estimated productivity of global terrestrial biomes. Ecosystems 1:206–215
- Churkina G, Tenhunen J, Thornton P, Falge EM, Elbers JA, Erhard M, Grűnwald T, Kowalski AS, Rannik \tilde{U} , Sprinz D (2003) Analyzing the ecosystem carbon dynamics of four European coniferous forests using a biogeochemistry model. Ecosystems 6:168–184
- Ciais P, Tan PP, Trolier M, White JWC, Francey RJ (1995) A large northern hemisphere terrestrial $CO₂$ sink indicated by 13C/12C of atmospheric CO₂. Science 269:1098-1102
- Cramer W, Kicklighter DW, Bondeau A, Moore B, Moore B, Churkina G, Nemry B, Ruimy A, Schloss A, of the Potsdam NPP, Intercomparison Model (1999) Comparing global models of terrestrial net primary productivity (NPP): overview and key results. Global Change Biol 5[Suppl 1]:1–15
- Cramer W, Bondeau A, Woodward FI, Prentice IC, Betts RA, Brovkin V, Cox PM, Fisher V, Foley J, Friend AD, Kucharik C, Lomas MR, Ramankutty N, Sitch S, Smith B, White A, Youngmolling C (2001) Global response of terrestrial ecosystem structure and function to $CO₂$ and climate change: results from six dynamic global vegetation models. Glob Change Biol 7:357–373
- Ding YH, Ren GY, Shi GY, Zheng XH, Zhai PM, Zhang D, Zhao ZC, Wang SW, Wang HJ, Luo Y, Chen DL, Gao XJ, Dai XS (2006) National assessment report of climate change (I): climate change in China and its future trend. Adv Clim Change Res $2(1):3-8$
- Dixon RK, Brown S, Houghton RA, Solomon AM, Trexler MC, Wisniewski J (1994) Carbon pools and flux of global forest ecosystems. Science 263:185–190
- ECVC (editorial committee for vegetation of China) (1980) Vegetation of China (in Chinese). Science Press, Beijing
- Fang JY, Chen AP (2001) Dynamic forest biomass carbon pools in China and their significance (in Chinese). Acta Bot Sin 43(9):967–973
- Fang JY, Piao SL, Field CB, Pan YD, Guo QH, Zhou LM, Peng CH, Tao S (2003) Increasing net primary production in China from 1982 to 1999. Front Ecol Environ 1(6):293–297
- Gao W, Gao ZQ, Slusser JR, Pan XL, Ma YJ (2003a) The responses of net primary production (NPP) to different climate scenarios with Biome-BGC model in oasis areas along the Tianshan Mountains in Xinjiang, China. Proc SPIE 4890:141– 150
- Gao XJ, Zhao ZC, Ding YH (2003b) Climate change due to greenhouse effects in northwest China as simulated by a regional climate model (in Chinese). J Glaciol Geocryol 25(2):165–169
- Guo YY, Liu HY, Ren J, Zhan XF, Cao SP (2007) Responses of tree growth to vertical climate gradient in the middle section of the Tianshan Mountains (in Chinese). Quat Sci 27(3):322–331
- Hanson PJ, Amthor JS, Wullschleger SD, Wilson KB, Grant RF, Hartley A, Hui D, Hunt ER Jr, Johnson DW, Kimball JS, King AW, Luo Y, McNulty SG, Sun G, Thornton PE, Wang S, Williams M, Baldocchi DD, Cushman RM (2004) Oak forest carbon and water simulations: model intercomparisons and evaluations against independent data. Ecol Monogr 74:443–489
- Hanson PJ, Wullschleger SD, Norby RJ, Tschaplinski TJ, Gunderson CA (2005) Importance of changing $CO₂$, temperature, precipitation, and ozone on carbon and water cycles of an upland-oak forest: incorporating experimental results into model simulations. Glob Change Biol 11:1402–1423
- Hicke JA, Asner GP, Randerson JT, Tucker C, Los S, Birdsey R, Jenkins JC, Field C, Holland E (2002) Satellite-derived increases in net primary productivity across North America, 1982–1998. Geophys Res Lett 29(10):1427
- Hunt ER Jr, Running SW (1992) Simulated dry matter yields for aspen and spruce stands in the North American boreal forest. Can J Remote Sens 3:126–133
- Hyvönen R, Ågren GI, Linder S, Persson T, Cotrufo MF, Ekblad A, Freeman M, Grelle A, Janssens IA, Jarvis PG, Kellomäki S, Lindroth A, Loustau D, Lundmark T, Norby RJ, Oren R, Pilegaard K, Ryan MG, Sigurdsson BD, Stromgren M, van Oijen M, Wallin G (2007) The likely impact of elevated $CO₂$, nitrogen deposition, increased temperature and management on carbon sequestration in temperate and boreal forest ecosystems: a literature review. New Phytol 173:463–480
- Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (IPCC) (2007) Climate Change 2007: the physical science basis. In: Solomon S, Qin D, Manning M, Chen Z, Marquis M, Averyt KB, Tignor M, Miller HL (eds) Contribution of working group I to the fourth assessment report of the Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge
- Kang S, Kimball JS, Running SW (2006) Simulating effects of fire disturbance and climate change on boreal forest productivity and evapotranspiration. Sci Total Environ 362:85–102
- Keeling CD, Whorf TP (2002) Atmospheric CO_2 records from sites in the SIO air sampling network/trends: a compendium of data on global change. Carbon Dioxide Information Analysis Center, U.S. Department of Energy, Oak Ridge National Laboratory, Oak Ridge
- Kimball JS, Running SW, Nemani R (1997) An improved method for estimating surface humidity from daily minimum temperature. Agric For Meteorol 85:87–98
- Kimball JS, Zhao M, McGuire AD, Heinsch FA, Clein J, Calef M, Jolly WM, Kang S, Euskirchen SE, McDonald KC, Running SW, Kimball JS (2007) Recent climate-driven increases in vegetation productivity for the western Arctic: Evidence of an acceleration of the northern terrestrial carbon cycle. Earth Interact 11(4):1–30
- Law BE, Turner D, Campbell J, Sun OJ, Van Tuyl S, Ritts WD, Cohen WB (2004) Disturbance and climate effects on carbon stocks and fluxes across Western Oregon, USA. Glob Change Biol 10:1429–1444
- Li H, Lu XX, Chen SJ, Hou P (2003) Dynamic analysis and evaluation of Xinjiang forest resources based on remote sensing and GIS (in Chinese). Acta Geograph Sin 58(1):133–138
- Lieth H (1975) Modeling primary productivity of the world. In: Lieth H, Whittaker RH (eds) Primary productivity of the biosphere, vol 14. Springer, New York, pp 237–263
- Long SP (1991) Modifications of the response of photosynthetic productivity to rising temperature by atmospheric $\dot{CO_2}$ concentration: has its importance been understood? Plant Cell Environ 14:729–739
- Luo GP, Chen X, Hu RJ (2003) Vegetation change during the last 10 years derived from satellite images of the north slopes of the Tianshan Mountains (in Chinese). J Glaciol Geocryol 25(2):237–242
- Ma MG, Dong LX, Wang XM (2003) Dynamically monitoring and simulating the vegetation cover in Northwest China over the past 21 years (in Chinese). J Glaciol Geocryol 25(2):232–236
- Melillo JM, McGuire AD, Kicklighter DW, Moore B, Vorosmarty CJ, Schloss AL (1993) Global climate change and terrestrial net primary production. Nature 363:234–240
- Mohamed MAA, Babiker IS, Chen Z, Ikeda K, Ohta K, Kato K (2004) The role of climate variability in the inter-annual variation of terrestrial net primary production (NPP). Sci Total Environ 332:123–137
- Myneni RB, Keeling CD, Tucker CJ, Asrar G, Nemani RR (1997) Increased plant growth in the northern high latitudes from 1981 to 1991. Nature 386:698–702
- Nemani RR, Keeling CD, Hashimoto H, Jolly WM, Piper SC, Tucker CJ, Myneni RB, Running SW (2003) Climate-driven increases in global terrestrial net primary production from 1982 to 1999. Science 300:1560–1563
- Ni J (2002) Effects of climate change on carbon storage in boreal forests of China: a local perspective. Clim Change 55:61–75
- Ni J (2004) Forest productivity of the Altay and Tianshan Mountains in dry land, northwestern China. For Ecol Manage 202(1–3):13–22
- Running SW, Coughlan JC (1988) A general model of forest ecosystem processes for regional applications I. Hydrologic balance, canopy gas exchange and primary production processes. Ecol Model 42:125–154
- Running SW, Hunt ERJ (1993) Generalization of a forest ecosystem processes for other biomes, BIOME-BGC, and an application for global-scale models. In: Ehleringer JR, Field C (eds) Scaling processes between leaf and landscape levels. Academic, San Diego, pp 141–158
- Schimel DS, House JI, Hibbard KA, Bousquet P, Ciais P, Peylin P, Braswell BH, Apps MJ, Baker D, Bondeau A, Canadel J, Churkinal G, Cramer W, Denning AS, Field CB, Friedlingstein P, Goodale C, Heimannl M, Houghton RA, Melillo JM, Moore BIII, Murdiyarso D, Noble I, Pacala SW, Prenticel IC, Raupach MR, Rayner PJ, Scholes RJ, Steffen WL, Wirth C (2001) Recent patterns and mechanism of carbon exchange by terrestrial ecosystems. Nature 414:169–72
- Schmid S, Zierl B, Bugmann H (2006) Analyzing the carbon dynamics of central European forests: comparison of Biome-BGC simulations with measurements. Reg Environ Change 6:167–180
- Shi YF, Shen YP, Hu RJ (2002) A preliminary study of signal, impact and foreground of climatic shift from warm-dry to warm-humid in Northwest China (in Chinese). J Glaciol Geocryol 24(3):219–226
- Shi YF, Shen YP, Li DL, Zhang GW, Ding YJ, Hu RJ, Kang ES (2003) Discussion on the present climate change from warm-dry to warm-wet in northwest China (in Chinese). Quat Sci 23(2):152–164
- Slayback D, Pinzon J, Los S, Tucker C (2003) Northern hemisphere photosynthetic trends 1982–1999. Glob Change Biol 9:1–15
- Song LC, Zhang CJ (2003) Changing features of precipitation over northwest China during the $20th$ century (in Chinese). J Glaciol Geocryol 25(2):143–148
- Su HC, Wei WS, Han P (2003) Changes in air temperature and evaporation in Xinjiang during the recent 50 years (in Chinese). J Glaciol Geocryol 25(2):174–178
- Su HX, Sang WG, Wang YX, Ma KP (2007) Simulating Picea schrenkiana forest productivity under climatic changes and atmospheric $CO₂$ increase in Tianshan Mountains, Xinjiang Autonomous Region, China. For Ecol Manage 246:273–284
- Sun JK (1994) The productivity of forest stand and the distribution regularity of forest types and in Tianshan forest (in Chinese). Arid Zone Res 11(1):1–6
- Thornton PE, Running SW (1999) An improved algorithm for estimating incident daily solar radiation from measurements of temperature, humidity, and precipitation. Agric For Meteorol 93:211–228
- Thornton PE, Hasenauer H, White MA (2000) Simultaneous estimation of daily solar radiation and humidity from observed temperature and precipitation: an application over complex terrain in Austria. Agric For Meteorol 104:255–271
- Thornton PE, Law BE, Gholz HL, Clark KL, Falge E, Ellsworth DE, Goldstein AH, Monson RH, Hollinger DY, Falk M, Chen J, Sparks JP (2002) Modeling and measuring the effects of disturbance history and climate on carbon and water budgets in evergreen needleleaf forests. Agric For Meteorol 113:185–222
- Tian H, Mellilo JM, Kicklighter DW, McGuire AD, Helfrich JVK, Moore B, Vorosmarty CJ (1998) The effect of interannual climate variability on carbon storage in Amazonian ecosystems. Nature 396:664–667
- Wang Y, Zhao SD (2000) Productivity pattern of Picea schrenkiana var. tianshanica forest (in Chinese). Acta Phytoecol Sin 24:186– 190
- Wei WS, Hu RJ (1990) Precipitation and climate conditions of Tianshan Mountains (in Chinese). Arid Land Geogr 13(1):29– 36
- White MA, Thornton PE, Running SW, Nemani RR (2000) Parameterization and sensitivity analysis of the BIOME-BGC terrestrial ecosystem model: net primary production controls. Earth Interact 4(3):1–85
- Xiao XM, Melillo JM, Kicklighter DW, Pan YD, McGuire AD, Helfrich J (1998) Net primary production of terrestrial ecosystems in China and its equilibrium responses to changes in climate and atmospheric $CO₂$ concentration. Acta Phytoecol Sin 22(2):97–118
- Xie GH, Li XD, Zhou LP, Wang RY, Wu PF (2007) The study of variation in NDVI driven by climate factors on the northern slopes of the Tianshan Mountain (in Chinese). Adv Earth Sci 22(6):618–624
- Xu and Wei (2004)
- Yang Q, Shi YQ, Yuan YJ, Li Y (2006) Temperature and precipitation series in the Tianshan Mountains calculated based on DEM (in Chinese). J Glaciol Geocryol 28(3):337–342
- Yuan YJ, Li JF (1994) The response functions of tree-ring chronologies in the east end of Tianshan Mountain (in Chinese). Arid Zone Res 11(1):27–34
- Yuan YJ, Li JF (1995) The response functions of tree-ring chronologies in the western Tianshan Mountains (in Chinese). J Glaciol Geocryol 17(2):170–177
- Yuan YJ, Ye WD, Dong GR (2000) Reconstruction and discussion of 314a precipitation in Yili Prefecture, western Tianshan Mountains (in Chinese). J Glaciol Geocryol 22(2):121–127
- Yuan YJ, Li JF, Hu RJ, Liu CH, Jiao KQ, Li ZQ (2001) Reconstruction of precipitation in the recent 350a from tree-rings in the Middle Tianshan Mountains (in Chinese). J Glaciol Geocryol 23(1):36–40
- Zhang YS, Wang XL, Zhou LS (1980) Primary study on biomass of Picea schrenkiana (in Chinese). J Xinjiang August 1st Agric College 3:19–25
- Zhang YS, Tang GC (1989) Picea schrenkiana forest. In: Editorial Committee of Xinjiang Forest (ed) Xinjiang Forest (in Chinese). Xinjiang People Press, Urumchi; Chinese Forestry Press, Beijing, pp 121–149
- Zhou \hat{X} (1995) Vertical climatic difference in the middle part of northern slope of Tianshan Mountains (in Chinese). Arid Land Geogr 18(2):52–60
- Zhu HF, Wang LL, Shao XM, Fang XQ (2004) Tree ring-width response of Picea schrenkiana to climate change (in Chinese). Acta Geogr Sin 59(6):863–870