

Widespread occurrence of natural genetic transformation of plants by *Agrobacterium*

Tatiana V. Matveeva¹ · Léon Otten²

Received: 18 June 2019 / Accepted: 21 August 2019 / Published online: 21 September 2019 © Springer Nature B.V. 2019

Abstract

Key message Naturally transgenic plant species occur on an unexpectedly large scale.

Abstract Agrobacterium-mediated gene transfer leads to the formation of crown galls or hairy roots, due to expression of transferred T-DNA genes. Spontaneous regeneration of transformed cells can produce natural transformants carrying cellular T-DNA (cT-DNA) sequences of bacterial origin. This particular type of horizontal gene transfer (HGT) could play a role in plant evolution. However, the material available today is not enough for generalizations concerning the role of Agrobacterium in HGT from bacteria to plants. In this study, we searched for T-DNA-like genes in the sequenced genomes of dicots and monocots. We demonstrate the presence of cT-DNAs in 23 out of 275 dicot species, within genera Eutrema, Arachis, Nissolia, Quillaja, Euphorbia, Parasponia, Trema, Humulus, Psidium, Eugenia, Juglans, Azadirachta, Silene, Dianthus, Vaccinium, Camellia, and Cuscuta. Analysis of transcriptome data of 356 dicot species yielded 16 additional naturally transgenic species. Thus, HGT from Agrobacterium to dicots is remarkably widespread. Opine synthesis genes are most frequent, followed by plast genes. Species in the genera Parasponia, Trema, Camellia, Azadirachta, Quillaja, and Diospyros contain a combination of plast and opine genes. Some are intact and expressed, but the majority have internal stop codons. Among the sequenced monocot species, Dioscorea alata (greater yam) and Musa acuminata (banana) also contain T-DNA-like sequences. The identified examples are valuable material for future research on the role of Agrobacterium-derived genes in plant evolution, for investigations on Agrobacterium strain diversity, and for studies on the function and evolution of cT-DNA genes in natural transformants.

Keywords Naturally transgenic plants \cdot cT-DNA \cdot Horizontal gene transfer \cdot Whole-genome shotgun contigs \cdot Transcriptome shotgun assembly

Electronic supplementary material The online version of this article (https://doi.org/10.1007/s11103-019-00913-y) contains supplementary material, which is available to authorized users.

Léon Otten leon.otten@ibmp-cnrs.unistra.fr

Tatiana V. Matveeva radishlet@gmail.com

¹ St. Petersburg State University, University Emb., 7/9, Saint Petersburg, Russia

² Institut de Biologie Moléculaire des Plantes, 12 Rue du Général Zimmer, 67084 Strasbourg, France

Introduction

Horizontal gene transfer (HGT) is widespread in prokaryotes. Comparative and phylogenetic analyses of eukaryotic genomes show that a considerable number of eukaryotic genes also result from HGT. However, mechanisms of HGT in eukaryotic organisms are poorly understood in comparison to gene transfer among the Prokaryota. Evidence of gene transfer from bacteria to the nuclei of multi-cellular eukaryotes is rare (Richards et al. 2006; Acuna et al. 2012). The close contacts frequently found in different kinds of symbiosis could promote HGT between species (Gao et al. 2014). One of the best studied examples of natural HGT from bacteria to plants is gene transfer from *Agrobacterium sp.* to plants. *Agrobacterium*-mediated HGT relies on a highly specific DNA transfer mechanism and the introduction of T-DNA genes with eucaryotic promoter sequences, which can be expressed in a wide variety of plants.

Plants with cellular T-DNA (cT-DNA) sequences can be considered as natural genetically modified organisms (natural GMO's). Species of the genera Nicotiana (White et al. 1983; Intrieri and Buiatti 2001; Chen et al. 2014, 2018), Linaria (Matveeva et al. 2012, 2018; Pavlova et al. 2013), and Ipomoea (Kyndt et al. 2015) contain different types of cT-DNA structures. In Nicotiana, six cT-DNA types have been described (TA, TB, TC, TD, TE, gT), with some species having received several cT-DNAs in succession. We have argued that Agrobacterium-mediated HGT could create new species (Chen and Otten 2017). cT-DNA expression can confer new properties on natural GMO's, as shown by opine synthesis in roots of Nicotiana tabacum (Chen et al. 2016). A search for additional natural transformants in the large number of available sequence data would provide a much better idea about the frequency of Agrobacterium-induced HGT, on the type and variation of cT-DNA structures, and on cT-DNA-induced changes in natural transformants.

Most cT-DNA sequences identified so far seem to originate from A. rhizogenes, with genes already described in various A. rhizogenes strains. However, cT-DNAs may also contain previously unknown T-DNA genes, or unusual combinations of them. N. tomentosiformis contains genes distantly related to the orf14 and agropine synthase (ags) genes, and typical A. tumefaciens and A. vitis genes resembling octopine synthase (ocs), vitopine synthase (vis), C-proteinlike, and 6b. It also contains a large, previously unknown T-DNA gene, orf511 (Chen et al. 2014; Chen and Otten 2017), with unknown function. In *Ipomoea*, a gene distantly related to *rolB* and *rolC* was found (Kyndt et al. 2015). These findings suggest that Agrobacterium T-DNA diversity is greater than expected. The TBLASTN algorithm, which compares a protein query against a translated nucleotide sequence database, allows the detection of highly diverged gene sequences, which are undetectable at the DNA level. The aim of the present work was to search for new examples of HGT from agrobacteria to plants, using T-DNA-encoded proteins as queries against sequenced plant genomes and transcriptomes.

Results

Identification of dicot cT-DNA sequences in the Whole Genome Shotgun database

To date (April 12, 2019), data on the genomes of 275 species of dicotyledonous plants, including tobacco and sweet potato, are available in the NCBI database (O'Leary et al. 2016). This database was searched with selected T-DNAencoded protein sequences ("Materials and methods", Table 1). Apart from the earlier studied tobacco and sweet potato genomes (the Linaria genome is not published), we found homologues of proteins encoded by agrobacterial T-DNA genes in 23 species belonging to 17 genera, 12 families and 10 orders (Fig. 1). The data on their T-DNA-like sequences are summarized in Table 2. As a control for Agrobacterium contamination, we searched for vir sequences, which are located outside the T-DNA. No intact vir-like genes were found in the genome data of most species listed in Table 2. In Euphorbia esula, a VirB1-like sequence was found (30% identical to YP 001967531.1). This segment is 99% identical to WP 125244063.1 from Aquabacterium sp. contig PJAD010111136.1. Unexpectedly, the entire contig (56 kb) shows strong identity to various Aquabacterium sequences. Conversely, Euphorbia esula contains sus-like and orf18-like T-DNA sequences, but the fully sequenced Aquabacterium sp. does not. Therefore, the Euphorbia VirB1-like sequence is most likely due to contamination of Euphorbia DNA with Aquabacterium DNA. In Parasponia andersonii, virH1, virH2, and virF homologs were found, close to the PaT-DNA3 region, and associated with plant sequences, suggesting abnormal co-transfer of these vir genes with the T-DNA (see below).

cT-DNA-positive contigs were analyzed in greater detail. Unfortunately, the quality of genome assembly was found to be variable among different species. In some cases (Eugenia uniflora, Euphorbia esula, and Silene latifolia), various contigs were shorter than 1000 base pairs, making it difficult to identify sequences surrounding the cT-DNA fragments, and to identify the original insertion sites. Nevertheless, the presence of homologous fragments in related species or subspecies strongly indicated their integration into the genome of the ancestral form. T-DNA-like sequences, present in groups of related species, were identified within the genera Arachis, *Cuscuta* and *Juglans*, in two subspecies of *Humulus lupulus*, in two subspecies of Silene latifolia, and in two related genera from the family Cannabaceae: Parasponia and Trema. In the following part we will describe the new natural transformants in detail, starting with the simplest cT-DNAs, which carry only opine or plast genes.

cT-DNAs with only opine genes

Several plant genera contain cT-DNA sequences which carry only opine genes. We will first discuss the well-known genera *Arachis* and *Juglans*, and then present the remaining ones.

Cultivated peanut (*Arachis hypogaea*) is an allotetraploid species whose ancestral genome is most likely derived from the A-genome species, *A. duranensis*, and the B-genome species, *A. ipaensis* (Kochert et al. 1996). *Arachis monticola* is a close relative of the domesticated peanut. It is the only other tetraploid species besides *A. hypogaea* in the

Table 1 Query sequences for searching proteins encoded by T-DNA and vir genes

Aim of search	Protein	Accession # of protein	Organism
Search for T-DNA-like sequences	RolB	CAA82552.1	A. rhizogenes 2659
		CAA34077.1	A. rhizogenes A4
		CAA27161.1	N. glauca
	RolC	CAA82553.1	A. rhizogenes 2659
		P20403.1	A. rhizogenes A4
		P07051.2	N. glauca
	RolB/C-like	AIM47586.1	I. batatas
	Orf13	CAB65897.1	A. rhizogenes 2659
		ABI54192.1	A. rhizogenes A4
		BAB85946.1	N. glauca
		CAA07584.1	N. tabacum
	Orf14	CAB65899.1	A. rhizogenes 2659
		ABI54193.1	A. rhizogenes A4
		BAB85948.1	N. glauca
		AIM40184.1	N. tomentosiformis (TD)
	6b	CAB44643.1	A. tumefaciens C58
		WP_032488313.1	A. vitis Tm4
	B protein	AAD30482.1	A. tumefaciens C58
	C' protein	AAD30484.1	A. tumefaciens C58
	D protein	AAD30485	A. tumefaciens C58
	E protein	ASK49488.1	A. larrymoorei
		ARU12465.1	A. tumefaciens Chry5
	Gene 5	AAD30487.1	A. tumefaciens C58
		AAB41867.1	A. vitis CG474
	Fungal Plast proteins	XP_001884963.1 XP_001881215.1 XP_001884861.1 XP_001884964.1 XP_001884962.1	Laccaria bicolor
	Nos	CAB44644.1	A. tumefaciens C58
	Mis	NP 066601	A. rhizogenes 1724
		WP 010900210.1	N. glauca
	Ags	 ASK40986.1	A. rhizogenes CBFP2692
	Mas2'	AIM40180.1	N. tomentosiformis (TB)
	Acs	AAK20401.1	A. tumefaciens Chry5
	Sus	ARU12438.1	A. tumefaciens Chry5
	Ocs	NP_059680.1	A. tumefaciens Ach5
	Vis	WP_080855286.1	A. deltaense
	Cus	BAB13344.1	A. rhizogenes 2659
Study of possible contamination of candidate plant species with <i>Agrobacterium</i>	VirB1	WP_080855255.1 ACM39672.1 NP_066734.1 YP_001967531.1	A. deltaense A. vitis S4 A. rhizogenes 1724 A. tumefaciens Bo542
	VirB2	NP_066735.1 ACM39671.1 BAA28696.1	A. rhizogenes 1724 A. vitis S4 A. tumefaciens
	VirD2	YP_001967546.1 WP_032488282.1 ACM39658.1	A. tumefaciens Bo542 A. rhizogenes 15834 A. vitis S4
	VirE2	AAA98372.1 GAJ95556 ACM39679.1	A. tumefaciens C58 A. rhizogenes 13257 A. vitis S4

Fig. 1 Number of species with sequenced genomes in different plant orders of Eudicots and number of naturally transgenic species among them. Relation of orders is after APG IV (Angiosperm Phylogeny Group 2016). Orders with naturally transgenic plants are in bold. The numbers in parentheses denote the number of species with sequenced genomes and the number of species with cT-DNA. *Solanales and Lamiales include data on natural transformants described earlier. **Cucurbitales and Cornales only show T-DNA-like sequences in the TSA transcriptome database



genus *Arachis*. *A. monticola* might be an immediate wild ancestor of cultivated peanut (Guillermo et al. 2007), or a weedy form, segregated from cultivated peanuts (Pattee et al. 1998). *A. duranensis* contains two copies of a cucumopine synthase (*cus*)-like gene, one complete, the other truncated. The common parts are 99% identical. The full size *cus* homologs from *A. duranensis* cultivars P1263393 (Table 2) and V14167 are 99% identical. The partially deleted copies differ in length and localization (upstream or downstream) relative to the intact gene. Probably, the A ancestor carried two full-size genes, which diverged over time. *A. ipaensis* contains a strongly rearranged *cus*-like gene, showing a deletion, a replacement of part of the gene, and insertion of a large DNA fragment (0.5 Mb). Analysis of plant sequences

🖄 Springer

next to the cT-DNA suggests that they result from different integration events. Apart from a *cus* gene, *A. ipaensis* also contains a mannopine synthase 2' (*mas2'*) homolog. Both parents' cT-DNAs are present in the peanut crop genome. However, the cT-DNA derived from *A. duranensis* contains only one full-size copy of the *cus*-like gene (Supplementary Fig. 1). The cT-DNA from *A. hypogaea* cultivar Shitouqi (CP030990.1) is 99% identical to that of cultivar Tifrunner (Table 2).

Juglans cathayensis (Chinese walnut), J. manshurica (Manchurian walnut), and J. sigillata (iron walnut) also contain cT-DNA sequences with intact, succinamopine synthase (sus)-like opine genes. These species are closely related (Stanford et al. 2000; Dong et al. 2017), and their cT-DNAs

Table 2 cT-DN	A genes detected	by analysis of WG	S database	VINCE.	C	Later		1 1		
Order	ramuy	species (cui- tivar)	Accession#	c1-DNA gene (homolog)	Copy number	IIItact	FOSIUORS	% of identity	Organism and protein ID	between 2 copies of the gene
Malpighiales	Euphorbiaceae	<i>Euphorbia</i> esula (cultivar	PJAE01404665.1	sus-like	1	; +	533-1396	67	A. rhizogenes WP_034521016.1	n/a
		1984-ND001 c294543_g1_	PJAD010880283.1	sus-like	1	; +	743–3	67	A. rhizogenes WP_034521016.1	n/a
		(li	PJAE01404667.1	sus-like	1	; +	1144–539	68	A. rhizogenes WP_034521016.1	n/a
			PJAD011597089.1	orf18-like	1	ċ	1–231	57	A. rhizogenes CAB46634.1	n/a
Fabales	Fabaceae	Arachis duran-	MAMN01003931.1	cus-like	2	+	7349–6387	71	A. vitis WP_071201425.1	%66
		ensis (cultivar P1475845)				I	8059–7499 (short)	78	A. vitis WP_071201425.1	
		Arachis duran- ensis (cultivar	JQIN01001286.1	cus-like		I	2661549– 2661427	65	A. vitis WP_071201425.1	92%
		V14167 Adur16_3)				+	2667636- 26666674	71	A. vitis WP_071201425.1	
		Arachis ipaen- sis (cultivar K30076)	JQIO01000321.1	<i>cus</i> -like (interrupted)	1	I	5265248- 5264662 5776277- 5776119	63	A. vitis WP_071201425.1	n/a
			JQIO01000351.1	mas2'-like	1	I	6282379– 6281948	47	A. rhizogenes AIM40180.1	n/a
		Arachis monti- cola (isolate	QBTX01000020.1	cus-like	1	+	24042114– 24043064	71	A. vitis WP_071201425.1	n/a
		PI 263393)	QBTX01000007.1	cus-like	1	I	23709857– 23709271 137208979– 137208908	63	A. vitis WP_071201425.1	n/a
				mas2'-like	1	I	106506829- 106507260	47	A. rhizogenes AIM40180.1	n/a
		Arachis hypogaea	PIVG01000008.1	cus-like	1	+	37350716- 37351648	71	A. vitis WP_071201425.1	n/a
		(cultivar Tifrunner)	PIVG01000018.1	cus-like (interrupted)	1	I	18314323- 18313737 18883031- 18882873	63	A. vitis WP_071201425.1	n/a
				mas2'-like	-	I	97262939- 97262508	47	A. rhizogenes AIM40180.1	n/a

Table 2 (cor	tinued)									
Order	Family	Species (cul- tivar)	Accession#	cT-DNA gene	Copy number	Intact	Positions	Identity level % of identity	to proteins from NCBI Organism and protein ID	Similarity level between 2 copies
				(goioiioii)				•	-	on une gene
			JXTB01000448.1 (PaT-DNA2)	rolB-like	1	I	330011– 329197	47	A. rhizogenes WP_034521028.1	n/a
			(rolB-sus-orf14- IS630-IS630-orf14-	sus-like	7	+	330171– 331190	64	A. rhizogenes WP_034521016.1	87%
			Sus)			I	339517- 338500	63	A. rhizogenes WP_034521016.1	
				orf14-like	5	I	332345- 331836	46	A. rhizogenes WP_042474756.1	89%
						I	337359– 337867	49	A. rhizogenes WP_042474756.1	
				IS630-like	5	I	334379- 333395	50	Alphaproteobacteria bacte- rium PA3 OYU74375.1	%LL
						I	335835- 336116	50	Alphaproteobacteria bacte- rium PA3 OYU74375.1	
			JXTB01000642.1 (PaT-DNA3)	c'-like	1	I	128737– 129210	29 ^b	Agrobacterium sp. ASK41782.1	n/a
			(c'-rolC-orf13-sus- acs-sus)	rolC-like		I	130259– 130348	47	A.rhizogenes WP_077768173.1	n/a
				orf13-like	1	I	143125- 143619	38	N. glauca BAB85946.1	n/a
				sus-like	7	I	145165- 144266	41	A. rhizogenes WP_034521016.1	88%
						I	151027- 151857	39	A. rhizogenes WP_034521016.1	
				acs-like	1	I	148051– 149046	30	<i>S. meliloti</i> WP_088199097.1	n/a
			Sequences, homolo- gous to Agrobacte-	<i>virHI-</i> like	1	I	154775- 154326	73	Mesorhizobium amorphae WP_006204707.1	n/a
			<i>rium</i> DNA outside T-DNA	<i>virF-</i> like	1	I	155583- 154954	85	A. rhizogenes ASK41115.1	n/a
				<i>virH2-</i> like	1	I	156908- 155866	70	A. tumefaciens OCJ40236.1	n/a

 $\underline{\textcircled{O}}$ Springer

Table 2 (co	ntinued)									
Order	Family	Species (cul-	Accession#	cT-DNA	Copy number	Intact	Positions	Identity level	to proteins from NCBI	Similarity level
		ti var)		gene (homolog)				% of identity	Organism and protein ID	between 2 copies of the gene
			JXTB01000079.1 (PaT-DNA4)	orf2-like	5	I	864853– 864039	59	A. thizogenes GAJ95538.1	%06
			(orf2-orf3n-orf8- rolB-rolC-sus1-			I	944836- 945167	59	A. rhizogenes GAJ95538.1	
			sus2-sus2-sus1- rolC-rolC-orf8-	orf3n-like	2	I	865102– 866436	58	A. rhizogenes WP_034521034.1	81%
			(7/10-11c/10			I	910409– 909306 944853– 944683	58	A. rhizogenes WP_034521034.1	
				orf8-like	2	I	873819– 875939	42	A. rhizogenes WP_034521028.1	81%
						I	907430- 905922	50	A. rhizogenes WP_034521028.1	
				<i>rolB</i> -like	1	I	878840– 878293	36	A. rhizogenes P49409.1	n/a
				<i>rolC</i> -like	ю	I	881736- 882002	42	A. rhizogenes XP_016495712.1	1 and 2 or 3 -84%
						I	892939– 892691	48	A. rhizogenes ART94485.1	2 and 3 - 100%
						I	899881– 899807	48	A. rhizogenes ART94485.1	
				sus-like 1	2	I	884634- 883678	38	A. rhizogenes WP_034521016.1	76%
						I	889476– 890000	31	A. rhizogenes WP_034521016.1	
				sus-like 2	2	I	886379– 885446	56	A. rhizogenes WP_034521016.1	78%
						I	888141– 888934	42	A. rhizogenes WP_034521016.1	

Table 2 (cor	ntinued)								
Order	Family	Species (cul-	Accession#	cT-DNA	Copy number Inta	ct Positions	Identity level	to proteins from NCBI	Similarity level
		tivar)		gene (homolog)			% of identity	Organism and protein ID	between 2 copies of the gene
			JXTB01000406.1 (PaT-DNA5)	<i>rolC</i> -like	1 -	195235- 195552	45	A. thizogenes P20403.1	n/a
			(rolC-IS66-orf2orf3- orf8-iaaM-IS66)	IS66-like	2	218288– 217887	59	A. vitis WP_071205530.1	n/a
					Ι	263183– 262547	67	A. vitis WP_071205530.1	n/a
				orf2-like	1	220050- 219363	62	A. rhizogenes GAJ95538.1	n/a
				orf3-like	1	235228- 236565	51	A. rhizogenes WP_034521034.1	n/a
				orf8-like		241782- 242509 250720- 251199 253145- 254150	42	A. rhizogenes WP_034521028.1	n/a
			JXTB01000435.1 (PaT-DNA6)	orf14-like	- 7	152389– 152946	58	N. tomentosiformis AIM40184.1	87%
			(orf14-IS630-sus1- acs-sus2-sus1-		I	163215- 162659	53	N. tomentosiformis AIM40184.1	
			IS630-orf14)	IS630-like	- 2	153796– 153368	67	Rhizobium sp. WP_107106966.1	87%
					I	161163– 161998	67	Rhizobium sp. WP_107106966.1	
				sus-like1		154860– 153872	50	A. rhizogenes WP_034521016.1	81%
					I	159662– 160597	46	A. rhizogenes WP_034521016.1	
				acs-like		156106– 156492	26 ^b	S. meliloti ASP89596.1	n/a
				sus-like2	1	157714- 158707	51	A. rhizogenes WP 034521016.1	n/a

Table 2 (c	continued)								
Order	Family	Species (cul-	Accession#	cT-DNA	Copy number In	ntact Positions	Identity lev	el to proteins from NCBI	Similarity level
		tı var)		gene (homolog)			% of identi	ty Organism and protein ID	between 2 copies of the gene
			JXTB01000069.1 (PaT-DNA7)	sus-like	-	544819- 545793	39	A. rhizogenes ARU12438.1	n/a
			(orf14-orf14-IS630- sus-IS630-orf14)	IS630-like	-	544339- 543648	99	S. fredii WP_097588257.1	82%
					I	545803- 546275	66	S. fredii WP_097588257.1	
				orf14-like	ς, I	542268- 542537	50	N. tomentosiformis AIM40184.1	1 and 2 – 94% 2 and 3 – 87%
					ſ	542658- 543214	52	N. tomentosiformis AIM40184.1	1 and 3 – 84%
					ſ	547244- 546834	55	N. tomentosiformis AIM40184.1	
			JXTB01000289.1 (PaT-DNA8)	orf511-like	1	215885- 215651	56	N. tomentosiformis AIM40183.1	n/a
			(sus-orf511-orf14- sus-d)	orf14-like	-	- 216446- 216664	50	A. rhizogenes AIM40184.1	n/a
				sus-like		214332- 215179	41	A. rhizogenes WP_034521016.1	78%
					I	220139-219475	36	A. rhizogenes WP_034521012.1	
				<i>d</i> -like		221129-221534	30	A. tumefaciens WP_099086244.1	n/a
			JXTB01000192.1 (PaT-DNA9)	vis-like	1	- 284083- 285156	53	A. deltaense WP_080855286.1	n/a
		Trema orien- talis isolate RG33-2	JXTC01000104.1 (ToT-DNA1) (d-sus-orf14-orf14- sus-d)	<i>d</i> -like	-	858368- 858009	30	A. tumefaciens WP_099086244.1	69%
					I	866532- 866939	30	A. tumefaciens WP_099086244.1	
				<i>orf</i> 8-like	-	858332- 857733	30	A. rhizogenes WP_034521028.1	87%
					I	866532- 867000	31	A. rhizogenes WP_034521028.1	
				<i>orf14-</i> like	-	862759- 863301	50	N. tomentosiformis AIM40184.1	86%
					I	859804- 859528	51	N. tomentosiformis AIM40184.1	

🙆 Springer

Table 2 (conti	nued)									
Order	Family	Species (cul-	Accession#	cT-DNA	Copy number	Intact	Positions	Identity level 1	to proteins from NCBI	Similarity level
		ti var)		gene (homolog)				% of identity	Organism and protein ID	between 2 copies of the gene
				sus-like	2	I	865644- 864644	52	A. rhizogenes WP_034521016.1	91%
						I	859297- 859515	42	A. rhizogenes WP_034521016.1	
			JXTC01000290.1 (ToT-DNA2)	vis-like	1	+	15220–16293	52	A. vitis WP_012649057.1	n/a
		Humulus lupulus var.	BBPC01123852.1 (HIIT-DNA1)	vis-like	7	+	8242–9315	54	A. deltaense WP_08055286.1	%66
		snInqul				+	10444-11517	54	A. deltaense WP_08055286.1	
			BBPC01047313.1 (HIIT-DNA2)	vis-like	1	+	7250-8323	54	A. deltaense WP_08055286.1	n/a
		Humulus lupulus var.	BBPB01123852.1 (HlcT-DNA1)	vis-like	2	+	8224-9315	54	A. deltaense WP_08055286.1	%66
		cordifolius				+	10534–11520	54	A. deltaense WP_08055286.1	
			BBPB01047313.1 (HlcT-DNA2)	vis-like	1	+	7250-8323	54	A. deltaense WP_08055286.1	n/a
Fagales	Juglandaceae	Juglans cathay- ensis	QEOU01000974.1	sus-like	1	+	212576- 213586	66	A. rhizogenes WP_034521016.1	n/a
		Juglans mandshurica (isolate M4)	PKSJ01002911.1	sus-like	-	+	1584–574	66	A. rhizogenes WP_034521016.1	n/a
		Juglans sigil- lata (isolate DJUG951.04)	QEOY01004675.1	sus-like	1	+	7654-8670	66	A. rhizogenes WP_034521016.1	n/a
Brassicales	Brassicaceae	Eutrema yun- nanense	PKML01043526.1	ocs-like	1	+	238572- 239651	82	A. vitis WP_060718528.1	n/a
Myrtales	Myrtaceae	Psidium gua- java	NTGF01001690.1	mas1'	1	I	72971-71705	74	A. rhizogenes WP_034520976.1	n/a
				mas2'	1	I	73467–73742	66	A. rhizogenes WP_032488585.1	n/a
		Eugenia uni-	RQIG01001211.1	rolB-like	1	I	23-457	66	A. rhizogenes CAA34077.1	n/a
		flora		e-like	1	I	801-1103	45	A. rhizogenes ASK44378.1	n/a

425

Table 2 (contin	(ned)									
Order	Family	Species (cul-	Accession#	cT-DNA	Copy number	Intact	Positions	Identity level	to proteins from NCBI	Similarity level
		tı var)		gene (homolog)				% of identity	Organism and protein ID	between 2 copies of the gene
Sapindales	Meliaceae	Azadirachta indica	AMWY02033922.1	<i>orf</i> 8-like	2	I	534-2108	34	A. rhizogenes WP_034521028.1	72%
						I	2689–2177	36	A. rhizogenes WP_034521028.1	
			AMWY02058681.1	orf8-like	1	ļ	986–393	33	A. rhizogenes P09178.1	81% ^c
			AMWY02033921.1	orf14-like	1	I	1250–930	35	N. tomentosiformis AIM40184.1	n/a
			AMWY02012435.1	cus-like	1	I	6435-5620	53	A. vitis WP_071201425.1	n/a
Caryophyllales	Caryophyl-	Silene latifolia	FMHP01041951.	cus-like	ż	+	37–966	64	A. vitis WP_071208191.1	n/a
	laceae		(similar sequences in FMHP01031079.1)				1–237	64	A. vitis WP_071208191.1	
		Silene latifolia	LHUT01012347.1	cus-like	2	+	917–1846	64	A. vitis WP_071208191.1	86%
		subsp. alba				I	5266-6154	63	A. vitis WP_071208191.1	
		cultivar	(similar sequences in	cus-like		+	1220-2149	63	A. vitis WP 071208191.1	n/a
		K-line	LHUT01032243.1 LHUT01032243.1 LHUT01035309.1 LHUT01034187.1 LHUT01087374.1 etc.)			-	2396–1524 1623–2555 1300–371	3		
		Silene latifolia	QBIE01063662.1	cus-like	ż	Ι	1041 - 2020	63	A. vitis WP_071208191.1	n/a
		isolate Sa984	(similar sequences in QBIE01113379.1 QBIE01011535.1 QBIE01027236.1 QBIE01037485.1 etc.)	cus-like		I	1387–460 11877–10926 13268–12410 1307–522	63	A. vitis WP_071208191	
		Dianthus caryophyllus	BAUD01000269.1	cus-like		+	77778–78743	64	A. vitis WP_071201425.1	n/a

Table 2 (conti	nued)								
Order	Family	Species (cul-	Accession#	cT-DNA	Copy number In	tact Positions	Identity leve	I to proteins from NCBI	Similarity level
		tı var)		gene (homolog)			% of identit	/ Organism and protein ID	between 2 copies of the gene
Ericales	Ericaceae	Vaccinium macrocarpon (cultivar Ben Lear (CNJ99- 125-1 clone)	JOT001169953.1	<i>plast</i> -like	+	2069-1320	40	Laccaria bicolor XP_001881215.1	n/a
	Theaceae	Camellia sin- ensis	SDRB01002054.1 (acs1-rolB-sus-acs2)	acs-like	- 1	1834755 - 1835240	25 ^b	A. larrymoorei WP_084631721.1	n/a
					I	1838742– 1837927	34	S. meliloti ASP89596.1	n/a
				rolB-like		1835551- 1835210	42	A. rhizogenes AAA22095.1	n/a
				sus-like		1837085 - 1836100	53	A. rhizogenes WP_034521016.1	n/a
Solanales	Convolvulaceae	Cuscuta aus- tralis	NQVE01000054.1	mis-like	+	1050893 - 1049952	62	N. glauca BAB85949.1	n/a
		Cuscuta camp- estris	OOIL.01000121.1	mis-like	+	353475- 352534	62	N. glauca BAB85949.1	n/a
n/a not applica	the								

^aOrder of the gene homologs in extended cT-DNAs

^bIn some cases fragments with low identity to ref. sequences are also shown to give more information about the insert structure

°Similar to AMWY02033922.1 fragment

 $\underline{\textcircled{O}}$ Springer

Fig. 2 Vaccinium Plast protein clusters with fungal Plast proteins. Molecular phylogenetic analysis of Plast proteins from Agrobacterium, Fungi and Vaccinium was done with the Maximum Likelihood method. The tree with the highest log likelihood (-3418.91) is shown. The percentage of trees in which the associated taxa clustered together is shown next to the branches. The tree is drawn to scale, with branch lengths measured in number of substitutions per site. The analysis involved 16 amino acid sequences. All positions containing gaps and missing data were eliminated. There were a total of 144 positions in the final dataset. Evolutionary analyses were conducted in MEGA7 (Kumar et al. 2016)



are 99% similar. J. regia is closely related to J. sigillata, but their exact relationships are not yet fully established. Interestingly, cT-DNA sequences were found in J. sigillata, but not in J. regia. The phylogenetically more distant species J. microcarpa, and J. hindsii do not contain cT-DNA (Supplementary Fig. 2).

Apart from Arachis and Juglans, homologs of opine genes were also found in Euphorbia esula (green spurge), Nissolia schottii (yellowhoods), Humulus lupulus (hops, used in beer production), Eutrema yunnanense (japanese horseradish or wasabi, used for seasoning), Psidium guajava (goyave), Silene latifolia (white campion), Dianthus caryophyllus (carnation), Cuscuta australis, and Cuscuta campestris (dodder). Humulus, Eutrema, Silene, Dianthus and Cuscuta contain intact opine genes. The opine genes of N. schottii and P. guajava are interrupted by stop codons. In Euphorbia esula, five contigs with sus-like sequences were found. The three longest sequences are mentioned in Table 2. However, none of the contigs covers the gene completely. No stop codons were detected within these fragments. Overlapping parts are 97-99% similar. Additional studies are required to determine the precise copy numbers and extent of these genes.

In *Nissolia schottii*, three contigs contain mikimopine synthase (*mis*)-like sequences. The similarity of the sequences surrounding the first two copies of the *mis*-like gene (Table 2) is about 80%. One *mis* copy is full-length, the other truncated, and 100% identical to the complete copy. The third copy is located in a different region, and 92% identical to the first and second copy. *vis*-like sequences from *Humulus* will be considered below, in comparison with genes from other Cannabaceae.

In the case of *Eutrema*, an intact ocs-like gene was found in E. yunnanense, but no T-DNA-like sequences were detected in E. salsugineum or E. heterophyllum. Psidium contains a full-size mannopine synthase 1' (mas1')-like sequence and a mas2'-like fragment. Silene is represented in the database with three genotypes belonging to two subspecies. They contain a large amount of cus-like genes or gene fragments with small sequence differences. One contig of S. latifolia subsp. alba (LHUT01012347.1) contains two copies of the cus gene in direct orientation, one full-size, the second with deletions. The relatively poor quality of the genome assembly may cause an artifical increase in cT-DNA copies. To clarify the situation about these multiple *cus*-like copies, molecular studies are required. Dianthus caryophyllus carries an intact cus-like gene. It is interesting to note, that carnation plants with blue flowers are a well-known example of a man-made GMO ornamental plant (Tanaka et al. 2009). The two Cuscuta species carry highly similar mis sequences (99% identity), surrounded by similar plant sequences. This indicates a common and recent origin.

cT-DNAs with only plast genes

Two species contain only *plast*-like genes (Otten 2018) on their cT-DNAs, *Eugenia* and *Vaccinium. Eugenia uni-flora* (pitanga or Suriname cherry) (Nascimento e Santos et al. 2015) is a plant of the Myrtaceae family. It is native



Fig. 3 cT-DNAs in *Parasponia andersonii* (Pa1 to Pa9) and *Trema* orientalis (To1 and To2). Dark brown arrows: plant genes, green arrows: T-DNA-like sequences, thin green arrows: cT-DNA inverted

repeats. Orange arrows with numbers: genes found by database annotation. Thin blue and red arrows show different direct repeats

to tropical South America's east coast, but is also grown in the West Indies and Florida (Morton 1987). *Eugenia uniflora* contains *rolB*-like and *e*-like sequences; both are truncated and contain stop codons. Unfortunately, the assembly quality of this genome is not very good. Therefore, the structure and localization of the cT-DNA are unclear. *Vaccinium macrocarpon* (American cranberry) belongs to the Ericaceae family, and forms a symbiotic relationship with ericoid mycorrhizal fungi. It has an single, apparently intact *plast* gene. Interestingly, the predicted protein sequence is more related to Plast proteins from the fungus *Laccaria bicolor* than to agrobacterial Plast sequences. This group also contains a protein from the bacterium *Ensifer* sp. YR511 (Fig. 2). In the following paragraphs we will present natural transformants with more complex cT-DNA structures, carrying both opine and *plast* genes.

cT-DNAs with *plast* and opine genes in Cannabaceae

cT-DNAs were detected in three genera from the Cannabaceae family: *Parasponia*, *Trema* and *Humulus*. Whereas *Humulus* only contains opine gene homologs, *Parasponia*

Order	Family	Species, cultivar	Expressed genes	Acc #
Fabales	Fabaceae	Arachis hypogaea Ahy.Unigene39445	cus (from A genome)	JR576408.1
Rosales	Cannabaceae	Humulus lupulus var. lupulus, cv. Shinshu Wase	vis-like	LA344641.1
Caryophyllales	Caryophyllaceae	Silene conica	<i>cus</i> -like ^a	GDJG01032840.1 GDJG01032843.1 GDJG01032843.1 GDJ01014094.1 GDIV01034313.1 GDIS01022199.1 GDJG01032839.1 GDIV01034315.1 GDIX01022641.1 GDIV01034317.1 GDIR01030138.1 GDIV01034312.1 GDIT01036057.1 GDJF01032276.1 GDJF01032275.1 GDIV01034316.1 GDIT01036064.1 GDJD01001444.1 GDIT01036067.1 GDIT01036056.1 GDIT01036067.1
		S. dioica		GDI101036061.1 GDJF01032277.1 GFCH01054977.1 GFCH01054978.1 GFCG01034229.1 GFCH01054976.1
Ericales		S. vulgaris		JL416294.1
		S. undulata		GEYX01050718.1 GEYX01050715.1
		S. sartorii		GEZA01127296.1
	Ericaceae	Vaccinium vergatum	<i>plast</i> -like ^b	GGAB01084477.1
	Ericaceae Theaceae	Camellia sinensis	plast-like ^b GGAB01084477.1 sus-like GHEL01136624.1 acs-like1 GHEL01140452.1 GGT	GHEL01136624.1
	Ericaceae Theaceae	eae <i>Camellia sinensis</i>	acs-like1	GHEL01140452.1 GGTM01069769.1
			acs-like2	GGTM01066813.1
Solanales	Convolvulaceae	Cuscuta gronovii	acs-like2 mis-like	GDKE01020856.1 GDKE01010421.1 GDKE01024882.1
		Cuscuta pentagona		GAON01250168.1 GAON01250169.1 GAON01250170.1 GAON01250171.1 GAON01250175.1 GAON01250165.1
		Cuscuta suaveolens		GAQC01002147.1

Table 3 Expressed cT-DNA genes

^aThere are numerous *cus*-like fragments of *Silene* species in TSA, they are not identical, but additional molecular studies are needed to verify all of them

^bGGAB01084477.1 is 96% identical to part of V. macrocarpon (JOTO01169953.1)

and *Trema* contain both *plast* and opine gene homologs and have complex multiple cT-DNA structures. *Prunus andersonii* contains no less than nine cT-DNAs, each being part of a long contig (Fig. 3). All PaT-DNA regions, except PaT-DNA9, are imperfect inverted repeats. Based on the degree of divergence between the repeats (indicated between brackets), we propose that PaT-DNA1 (78%), 4 (78%) and 8 (78%) were the first to enter the plant genome, followed by PaT-DNA5 (80%), 7 (82%), 6 (85%), 3 (88%) and 2 (89%). PaT-DNA9 cannot be dated by this method. The PaT-DNA3 and PaT-DNA4 sequences display large gaps, which may carry additional cT-DNA sequences. PaT-DNA1 contains orf3, orf8, rolB, and orf14 homologs on each of the two arms. PaT-DNA2 contains sus and orf14 homologs on the two arms of its inverted repeat, the left part of PaT-DNA2 also contains a rolB homolog. The right arm orf14-like sequence is shorter than the left arm one. In addition to these T-DNA-like sequences, PaT-DNA2 contains two IS630-like transposase genes from Alphaproteobacteria, a complete gene on the left arm, and a partial one on the right arm. Bacterial insertion sequences have been detected in T-DNAs from various Agrobacteria (Machida et al. 1984; Otten et al. 1992; Fournier et al. 1993). The PaT-DNA2 IS630-like

Table 4 New cT-DNAs in the genomes of dicots, based on TSA data

Order	Family	Species, cultivar	Accession	cT-DNA gene (homolog)	Nucleotides
Fabales	Fabaceae	Aeschynomene evenia var. serrulata	GFVI01019205.1	mis-like	3-389
Malpighiales	Salicaceae	Salix purpurea	GGGM01142278.1	ags-like	143-624
			GGGM01084155.1	nos-like	148-1061
			GGGM01092451.1	mas2'-like	57-1001
Cucurbitales	Cucurbitaceae	Luffa aegyptiaca	GDHR01052107.1	ags-like	160-1376
			GDHR01016077.1	mas2'-like	201-1150
Fagales	Juglandaceae	Cyclocarya paliurus	GEUI01000098.1	sus-like	40-1050
Sapindales	Rutaceae	Citrus maxima	GGUJ01012965.1	ags-like	254-1543
			GGWA01030381.1	mas2'-like	79–1155
Cornales	Cornaceae	Camptotheca acuminata	GACF01083404.1	orf8-like	3-827
Ericales	Ebenaceae	Diospyros lotus	GBSJ01178504.1	orf8-like	148-921
				orf3-like	1512-2861
				orf2-like	3133–3954
				acs-like	4554–5778
				Plant retrotransposon	6496-end
			GBSJ01376739.1	CUS	668-1558
				orf14-like	3058-3618
			GBSJ01097499.1	IS5 family transposase	473-1176
				orf8-like (partial)	1846–2834
			GBSJ01021238.1	orf14-like	11–364
			GBSJ01120913.1	orf13-like	312-629
			GBSJ01097825.1	orf511-like	1-1141
				orf14-like	1905–2453
			GBSJ01101836.1	orf2-like	1-212
				acs-like	870-2168
			GBSJ01376992.1	orf511-like	3-371
				sus-like	799–1652
			GBSJ01098934.1	orf3-like	1-1181
			GBSJ01115705.1	orf2-like	26-718
			GBSJ01020915.1	sus-like	52-273
			GBSJ01374851.1	orf8-like	2463-3602

Table 5	Sequence identity (%)
between	fragments of Diospyros
lotus con	ntigs and genes, located
in overla	apping fragments

	GBSJ01178504.1	GBSJ01376739.1	BSJ01097499.1	GBSJ01101836.1
GBSJ01098934.1	85 (orf13)			100 (81 bp of <i>orf</i> 2)
GBSJ01115705.1	83 (orf2)			
GBSJ01101836.1	69 (acs, orf2)			
GBSJ01097499.1	72 (<i>orf</i> 8)			
GBSJ01021238.1		81 (orf14)		
GBSJ01376992.1		74 (<i>orf</i> 511)		
GBSJ01020915.1		73 (sus)		
GBSJ01374851.1			74 (<i>orf</i> 8)	

sequences were most likely part of the original T-DNA insert.

PaT-DNA3 contains c'-gene, rolC, orf13, sus, and agrocinopine synthase (acs) homologs on its left part. The right part is smaller and contains a sus-like sequence. About 2.5 kb to the right, a plant retrotransposon sequence is found, followed by a 3 kb region with *Agrobacterium virF-*, *virH1-* and *virH2-*like sequences, and a plant sequence with unknown function. Thus, the PaT-DNA3 insert is closely linked to a Ti plasmid fragment from outside the T-DNA

borders. Another *Parasponia* contig, JXTB01000142.1 (850 kb), also contains a bacterial, non-T-DNA pTi sequence (492–5522), 69% identical to several fragments of pTi_Tun151 (KY000068). These code for an ABC transporter permease, a phosphodiesterase, and an arabinose phosphate phosphatase. This pTi-like sequence is connected to a plant sequence beyond nucleotide 5522. No T-DNA-like sequences were found on JXTB01000142.1.

The PaT-DNA4 left and right arm contain *orf2-*, *orf3n-*, *orf8-*, *rolB-*, and *rolC-*like sequences, and two different *sus-*like sequences (*sus-*like1 and *sus-*like2). The *orf3n* copy on the right is interrupted by a 34 kb plant sequence (910411–944678). Apart from its inverted repeat, PaT-DNA4 also shows several direct repeats (Fig. 3). The 6 kb long direct repeat A1 (892861–898343) is 99% identical to A2 (1899807–905285). The A repeats contain smaller, direct repeats (C2 and C3 for A1, C4 and C5 for A2, 94% identity), an isolated copy (C1) is found on the left part of PaT-DNA4. Repeat B2 (886476-887492), localized between the two cT-DNA arms, is 82% identical to B1 (880331–881415). B3 (893372–894466) is inverted with respect to B1 and B2.

PaT-DNA5 also has a complex structure, in which *rolC-*, *orf2*-like, *orf3*-like, and *orf8*-like sequences alternate with plant genes of unknown function, one coding for DNA polymerase, and one coding for an Ig-like domain-containing protein. In addition, PaT-DNA5 carries two *IS66*-like fragments (unrelated to *IS630*). Fragments A1, B1, C1 and A2, B2, C2 form an inverted repeat with 80% identity between the two arms, but do not seem to contain T-DNA-like genes.

PaT-DNA6 contains *orf14-* and *sus*-like genes on both arms of its inverted repeat. *IS630*-like sequences (one full-size, the other partial) are found between the *orf14-* and *sus*-like sequences and belong to the initial T-DNA structure. The PaT-DNA6 *IS630*-like sequences are different from the PaT-DNA2 *IS630*-like sequences (50% protein identity). An *acs*-like sequence and an additional *sus*-like gene are localized between the two arms, the latter has 63% and 66% identity to the *sus*-like genes of the left and right arm. PaT-DNA7 is a shortened version of PaT-DNA6, and is surrounded by similar plant sequences. It contains a *sus*-like gene surrounded by two inverted *orf14*-like sequences and an additional, partial *orf14*-like sequence.

PaT-DNA8 carries an unusual *plast* gene which encodes a protein with weak homology to protein D and other Plast proteins, one *orf14*-like gene, and two copies of a *sus*-like gene. It also carries a remnant of an *orf511*-like gene. An *orf511* gene has sofar only been found in the *N. tomentosiformis* TD cT-DNA (Chen et al. 2014), its function is unknown. PaT-DNA9 contains an intact vis-like sequence.

Another naturally transgenic species from the Cannabaceae family is Trema orientalis, closely related to Parasponia. cT-DNA sequences were found in two contigs. ToT-DNA1 is similar to PaT-DNA8, the average identity of their matching fragments being 84%. ToT-DNA1 is organized as an imperfect inverted repeat, containing two copies of a truncated sus-like gene, and two copies of an orf14-like and d-like gene. Average similarity between the two T-DNA arms is 85%. ToT-DNA2 is 95% identical to PaT-DNA9 and contains a vis-like sequence. Most likely, the insertion events which gave rise to ToT-DNA1/PaT-DNA8 and ToT-DNA2/ PaT-DNA9 predate the Trema/Parasponia separation. Nearly all cT-DNA genes of Parasponia and Trema are degenerated. However, the left PaT-DNA2 sus-like gene and the vis-like genes of ToT-DNA2 and PaT-DNA9 are intact, and may be functional. Additional studies are needed to confirm this.

Within the Cannabaceae family, Humulus contains a vislike gene, like Parasponia and Trema, but Cannabis sativa does not. In two subspecies of Humulus, the vis-like gene is present in three copies. Two of them form a direct repeat, the third one is located in another contig. The vis-like genes of Parasponia, Trema and Humulus are highly similar (Supplementary Fig. 3). However, in Humulus the surrounding sequences differ from those in Parasponia and Trema. This indicates independent acquisition of the gene by Humulus and the Parasponia/Trema ancestor. The 6854-8448 fragment of Humulus contig BBPC01047313.1 is similar to Parasponia PaT-DNA7, the intact vis-like ORF (7250-8323) is located within this fragment. The 6854-8448 fragment most likely delimits the cT-DNA insert. The high similarity of the cT-DNA sequences in these species may be due to recent transformation by similar Agrobacterium strains.

cT-DNAs with plast and opine genes in Azadirachta indica, Quillaja saponaria, and Camellia sinensis

Azadirachta indica, or neem tree, has been used in folk medicine in India for over 2000 years (Kausik et al. 2002). Four *Azadirachta indica* contigs contain cT-DNA sequences. They are relatively short, but also contain plant sequences, demonstrating integration of T-DNA into the plant genome. These contigs contain sequences similar to *orf8*, *orf14*, and *cus*. Because the contigs are small, it is not possible to tell whether they are part of the same cT-DNA or located on different cT-DNAs. To elucidate the fine structure of the cT-DNA in *Azadirachta indica*, additional experiments are required.

Quillaja saponaria (soap bark tree) is a medicinal plant native to South America (Muravieva 1983). It contains *rolB*like, *orf13*-like, *e*-like, and *sus*-like sequences. The *e*-like sequence is associated with a bacterial *IS3*-like sequence. The *rolB*-like gene on contig PVLG01028938.1 is situated at the right border of the contig, and therefore partial. A TBLASTN search with RolB did not yield additional *Quillaja* contigs, indicating that coverage may be incomplete. The quality of the assembly does not allow us to draw conclusions about the structure of the *Quillaja* cT-DNA(s).

Camellia sinensis is a species of evergreen shrub or small tree, and has been used for thousands of years to make tea. Its genome has been sequenced (Wei et al. 2018) and our search showed that it contains homologs of *rolB*, *sus*, and two *acs*-like genes. These sequences are located in the same contig, and organized as an imperfect inverted repeat of 5.3 kb, the common parts are 90% identical. No intact ORFs are found on this fragment.

Summarizing the analysis of the plant genomes, we note that opine genes are more common and better preserved. Most of the *plast* genes acquired stop codons and probably lost their function. The presence of intact *Agrobacterium*derived ORFs in several natural transformants suggests that these genes may be expressed. This led us to analyze the TSA database to search for expressed cT-DNA genes.

Identification of dicot cT-DNA sequences in the Transcriptome Shotgun Assembly database

The Transcriptome Shotgun Assembly (TSA) database was searched for cT-DNA-like sequences with the BLASTX option, using the T-DNA protein query sequences (Table 1), and with BLASTN using the nucleotide sequences of natural transformants listed in Table 2. It should be noted that the lack of TSA sequences for a given species does not mean a lack of such sequences in the genome, because transcripts could be missing in the libraries if expression is limited to certain tissues or stages. For this reason, the results of this section should not be viewed as definitive, but as starting material for future research. At this stage, it is not possible to match the data of the fully sequenced genomes and the transcriptomes. Within some genera, some species have only sequenced genomes, while others have only sequenced transcriptomes. The TSA library was found to contain transcript sequences from some of the cT-DNA genes of the abovementioned species, or from closely related species, these are summarized in Table 3.

The TSA database analysis yielded representatives of seven additional dicot genera with cT-DNAs (Table 4). These are *Aeschynomene evenia* (shrubby jointvetch), *Salix purpurea* (purple willow), *Luffa aegyptiaca* (sponge gourd), *Cyclocarya paliurus* (sweet tea), *Citrus maxima* (pomelo), and *Diospyros lotus* (Caucasian persimmon, one of the oldest cultivated plants). Among these candidates, *Diospyros lotus* is especially worth mentioning. Its transcriptome contains opine genes and *plast* genes. They show similarity to *acs, cus, sus, orf2, orf3n, orf8, orf13, orf14, orf17n and orf511* sequences. Some of these are combined into longer sequences, which may result from abnormal read-through transcription. Table 5 shows the identity percentages of extended areas among contigs. The TSA data require verification by additional methods, since they cannot exclude contamination with *Agrobacterium* DNA, and do not provide information on the location and structure of the inserts. The TSA analysis confirmed the predominance of opine genes, already noticed for the WGS data.

Search for monocot cT-DNA sequences in the WGS and TSA databases

As of June 2019, 73 monocot sequences were available in the WGS database. We searched these sequences in the same way as for dicots. T-DNA-like sequences were found in Dioscorea alata (greater yam), but not in D. rotundata (white Guinea yam). Greater yam is an important and geographically widely distributed staple food (Cormier et al. 2019). Although sweet potato (Ipomoea batatas) is also called yam, it is unrelated to Dioscorea alata. Dioscorea alata contigs CZHE02045212.1 (3009 nt) and CZHE02050078.1 (2550 nt) are 96% similar. CZHE02045212.1 potentially encodes an intact Cus-like protein, 85% identical to WP_071201425.1 from Agrobacterium vitis, CZHE02050078.1 encodes a truncated Cus-like protein. Another Dioscorea species, Dioscorea bulbifera (potato yam) was among the first monocot species to be transformed (Schäfer et al. 1987).

The TSA database contains 132 monocot sequences. We found *cus*-like sequences in *Musa acuminata* AAA group (dessert banana), in accession numbers JV331205.1 (157–1071), JV353951.1 (3–554), and JV360234.1 (8–316), with identity values to WP_071201425.1 of 64%, 57%, and 63% respectively. JV331205.1 is intact, the two other ones are truncated. Banana is one of the oldest cultivated plants, found on all continents.

Discussion

In 2012, we reported the identification of a new natural transgenic plant, *Linaria vulgaris* (toadflax) by analyzing more than a hundred species of dicotyledonous plants, using PCR primers designed from typical T-DNA gene sequences (Matveeva et al. 2012). The current study shows that a search for HGT sequences by bioinformatic methods is an order of magnitude more efficient. This is not surprising, since such an approach allows detection of highly diverged sequences, not possible with PCR primers. Our analysis of the WGS and TSA databases (in all, 631 dicot and 205 monocot species) revealed numerous examples of naturally transgenic plants. New T-DNA-like dicot sequences were found in representatives of 39 (23 + 16) species, 24 (17 + 7) genera, 17 (12 + 5) families, and 12 (10 + 2) orders. Previously, six species

from these databases (*N. tabacum*, *N. tomentosiformis*, *N. otophora*, *N. noctiflora*, *Ipomoea batatas* and *I. trifida*) were already found to be transgenic. Thus, our data indicate that about 7% of the sequenced dicot species are naturally transformed. With an estimated number of 175,000–200,000 dicot species, this yields a minimum of 10,000 naturally transformed dicot species. Out of 205 available WGS and TSA monocot sequences, only those of *Dioscorea alata* and *Musa acuminata* contain T-DNA-like sequences.

Many of the cT-DNA sequences appear to be relatively small T-DNA fragments. They may result from incomplete transfer of T-DNA, or from partial cT-DNA deletion subsequent to the initial insertion event. In some cases, these fragments may have been amplified. Partial deletions of cT-DNA sequences are known for various cultivars of *N. tabacum* (Chen et al. 2014), and a cT-DNA duplication was detected in *N. otophora* (Chen et al. 2018). Many cT-DNA structures are inverted repeats (Chen et al. 2014), with typical LB-associated sequences at both ends. PaT-DNA1, 4, 6, and 7 from *Parasponia* are organized in the same way. Such structures are consistent with the proposed mechanism of T-DNA integration by polymerase theta (PolQ), which can link two T-DNA molecules with their 3' ends (LB ends) to plant DNA breaks (van Kregten et al. 2016).

Apart from Agrobacterium and plants, various Fungi (Mohajjel-Shoja et al. 2011) and *Rhizobium* species (Chen et al. 2014; Chen 2016) also contain genes encoding Plastlike sequences. In the case of Fungi, these sequences could result from Agrobacterium transformation. In the case of the Rhizobia, these bacteria do not contain pTi/pRi sequences, and their Plast-like sequences cluster separately from the Agrobacterium ones (Chen 2016). Thus, their origin remains unclear. In most plant cases described here, the T-DNA-like sequences were phylogenetically closer to Agrobacterium sequences than to sequences from other taxons. However, in two species of the genus Vaccinium, a cT-DNA plast-like gene was found which is closer to fungal (Laccaria bicolor) and bacterial (Ensifer sp.) plast sequences. We have proposed (Mohajjel-Shoja et al. 2011; Chen and Otten 2017) that fungal *plast* genes are derived from transformation with an unknown Agrobacterium strain, because of their rare and patchy distribution among fungal groups. A similar Agrobacterium strain could then also be the source of the Vaccinium plast-like genes. Additional unusual types of T-DNA-like genes include a c'-like gene in PaT-DNA3, a d-like gene in PaT-DNA8 and a highly diverged acs-like gene in PaT-DNA6. The corresponding Agrobacterium strains remain to be identified.

Among the newly described naturally transgenic plant species, those containing only opine genes predominate (16 out of 23 species from the WGS database and 14 out of 16 from the TSA database). This might be due to several reasons. The first one is related to the T-DNA transfer mechanism. T-DNA transfer starts from the right T-DNA border, and is not always complete. Because opine genes like mas2' (in A. rhizogenes strain 8196, Hansen et al. 1991), nopaline synthase (nos), cus, sus, mis, vis, and ocs are situated close to the right border, they are more likely to be transferred in case of incomplete transfer. Since opine genes are not known to favour regeneration, regeneration of such incompletely transformed cells most likely occurred spontaneously. The second possibility is that the opine genes were initially located on a T-DNA fragment together with *plast* genes like *rolB* and *rolC*, allowing formation of hairy roots with a high potential for regeneration. If plast genes reduced growth or fertility of the regenerant plants, they may have been lost by negative selection. Alternatively, if the initial transformation event involved the insertion of different T-DNA fragments, some with *plast* genes, the others with opine genes, the plast genes could have been lost by segregation. Some of the potential opine enzymes reported here, are only distantly related to known sequences and could produce new types of opines. Thus, their properties should first be extensively investigated in vitro, before searching the corresponding opines in the natural transformants. In addition, it will be necessary to determine where these genes are expressed by using reporter genes. In several N. tabacum cultivars, the TB-mas2' gene is expressed in roots and leads to measurable amounts of opines (Chen et al. 2016).

Longer cT-DNAs with a combination of opine and *plast* genes, usually have an imperfect repeat structure. This was already noted for *Nicotiana* and *Ipomoea*, and could reflect a basic property of the T-DNA transfer system, or a higher stability of such repeats over longer periods.

Of particular interest are the complex cT-DNA sequences from Parasponia, Trema, Quillaja, Camellia and Azadirachta. Most of their genes are degenerated and carry stop codons. However, two opine genes of Parasponia have an intact ORF and may still encode opine synthesis, in spite of the rather large divergence between the repeats. In Parasponia, these divergence rates range from 12 to 22%. In Linaria, Nicotiana, and Ipomoea these are 8%, 1-6% and less than 1% respectively (Chen and Otten, 2017). As in the case of the TA, TB, TC and TD regions of N. tomentosiformis, the different Parasponia cT-DNA sequences are footprints of multiple transformation events, that took place well before the transformation of Linaria, Nicotiana and Ipomoea. PaT-DNA6 and 7 result from duplication of the same original insert, like the TE region of N. otophora (Chen et al. 2018), adding to the complexity of cT-DNA structure and function in natural transformants. The ancestor sequences of ToT-DNA1/PaT-DNA8 and ToT-DNA-2/ PaT-DNA9 were inserted before the Parasponia-Trema divergence. PaT-DNA8 shows 22% divergence between the two arms, ToT-DNA1 only 15%. Thus, the divergence rate between the repeats was faster in Parasponia as in Trema.

The insertion of ToT-DNA2/PaT-DNA9 seems to be more recent, with only 5% divergence. Parasponia andersonii and Trema orientalis are non-legume plants, which evolved nitrogen fixation capability through symbiosis with a large range of Rhizobium species (Op den Camp et al. 2012). The strong association between Parasponia/Trema and Rhizobiaceae and the close relationship between Rhizobium and Agrobacterium may have favored multiple T-DNA transformation events. In this scenario, Agrobacterium strains would have transmitted their Ri plasmids to Rhizobium strains, which then transferred T-DNA sequences to their host plants. It would be interesting to test whether some Rhizobia associated with Parasponia and ersonii and Trema orientalis carry Ri plasmids, and whether such strains can lead to transformation and regeneration of their hosts. More generally, natural transgenic species may have a higher spontaneous regeneration capacity than non-transformed species.

PaT-DNA2, and PaT-DNA6 and 7 of Parasponia carry different IS630-like bacterial insertion elements, PaT-DNA5 shows an IS66-like sequence. In Quillaja, an IS3-like element is found close to an e-like plast gene sequence. IS elements can be easily transferred between bacteria, and their frequent insertion in the Agrobacterium genome, including the Ti plasmids, strongly contributes to Agrobacterium evolution, pTi structure and modification of T-DNA function (Otten et al. 1992). The presence of IS630-, IS66- and IS3-like sequences in natural transformants shows that Agrobacterium can transfer bacterial elements to plants in a two-step HGT process. In the first step, IS elements from other bacteria insert into a T-DNA (probably in a random way). In the second step, they are transferred to a plant as part of the T-DNA. IS elements are not expected to function in plants, as they lack plant expression signals. We could not find free IS-like elements in Parasponia, indicating that they did not transpose. These elements may have been transferred by chance, without influence on the plant, but they could have played a role in allowing efficient regeneration, by inactivating a T-DNA gene interfering with that process. Agrobacterium strain A66 for example, carries an IS66 insertion element in the auxin synthesis gene *iaaH*, which leads to shooty tumors (Binns et al. 1982; Machida et al. 1984). Apart from IS elements, we also found other agrobacterial sequences in Parasponia. One fragment carried vir genes and was situated close to a T-DNA, the other fragment carried Ti plasmid genes, unconnected to T-DNA sequences. These two cases represent another type of HGT, with a more or less random transfer of non-T-DNA sequences, probably through abnormal activity of the Agrobacterium DNA transfer system.

Transformed plants carrying non-T-DNA sequences like *vir* region DNA and vector backbone sequences have been reported by several authors (Ooms et al. 1982;

Ramanathan and Veluthambi 1995; Kononov et al. 1997; Gelvin 2017). The more or less frequent occurrence of such abnormal structures may depend on the properties of the virulence genes. In the case of the natural GMOs, the original Ri plasmids and their *vir* genes are unknown. Since *Agrobacterium* can transfer large fragments of its chromosomal DNA via the T-DNA transfer system (Ulker et al. 2008), these sequences may also be found in natural GMOs. This interesting possibility has not been tested sofar.

The present findings expand the list of natural GMOs to a much larger number of plant taxa and suggest some directions for further research. One of these is the functional study of intact cT-DNA genes. Another concerns the variability and evolution of cT-DNA sequences in natural plant populations and in cultivated species. Among the new natural GMOs are several plants used for food, drinks and medicine, with large collections of accessions and cultivares already available, and rapidly increasing amounts of sequence data. Such data will provide excellent material for studies on cT-DNA evolution. Based on our results, it is clear that throughout their history, almost all human cultures have encountered natural transformants, which they adopted for food, drinks, medicine or decorative purposes.

Materials and methods

Identification of cT-DNA

In order to detect new cT-DNA sequences, we performed a 4-step blast search. In the first step, representative protein sequences of A. rhizogenes oncogenes, their homologs from Ipomoea and Nicotiana plants, from the fungus Laccaria bicolor and protein sequences of opine genes of different strains of Agrobacterium sp. (Table 1) were recovered, and used as queries to search the National Center for Biotechnology Information (NCBI) Whole-Genome Shotgun (WGS) contigs of all plant genomes sequenced to date, using the TBLASTN algorithm. In the second step, Vir protein sequences (Table 1) were used to search for possible Agrobacterium contaminations in those genomes, where T-DNAlike sequences were detected. In case homologs of vir genes were detected, the surrounding sequences were studied. When plant genes were found to be linked to vir genes, the hypothesis of contamination was rejected. In the third step, contigs that potentially encoded T-DNA-like protein sequences with identity levels 30% or higher, were analyzed further. They were used as gueries in BLASTX to detect the closest protein homologs and to identify proteins encoded by plant genes surrounding the cT-DNA. The resulting cT-DNA maps (based on sequence similarities) were mapped to annotated sequences from the same plant species, wherever possible. The Vector NTI AdvanceTM software was used to build the combined maps. In the fourth step, the TSA database was used to search for expressed new cT-DNA genes, using sequences described in the third step as a query. In addition to this, the TSA database was used to search for cT-DNA transcripts, as described for step one.

Phylogenetic analysis of cT-DNA sequences

Phylogenetic analysis of cT-DNA sequences was done in MEGA 7.0 (Kumar et al. 2016). Evolutionary history was inferred by using the Maximum Likelihood method based on the Tamura-Nei model (Tamura and Nei 1993). The boot-strap consensus tree inferred from 500 replicates is taken to represent the evolutionary history of the taxa analyzed (Felsenstein 1985). Initial tree(s) for the heuristic search were obtained automatically by applying Neighbor-Join and BioNJ algorithms to a matrix of pairwise distances estimated using the Maximum Composite Likelihood (MCL) approach, and then selecting the topology with superior log likelihood value.

Acknowledgements This work was partially carried out using the software of the St. Petersburg State University Resource Center "Development of molecular and cellular technologies". We would like to dedicate this work to the memory of Rob Schilperoort, one of the pioneers in *Agrobacterium* research and founder of Plant Molecular Biology.

Author contributions TM found new naturally transgenic plants, TM and LO characterized cT-DNA structures and prepared the manuscript.

Funding Funding for T.M. was obtained from the Russian Science Foundation (Grant No. 16-16-10010).

Compliance with ethical standards

Conflict of interest The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.

References

- Acuna R, Padilla BE, Florez-Ramos CP, Rubio JD, Herrera JC, Benavides P, Lee SJ, Yeats TH, Egan AN, Doyle JJ, Rose JK (2012) Adaptive horizontal transfer of a bacterial gene to an invasive insect pest of coffee. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 109:4197–4202
- Angiosperm Phylogeny Group (2016) An update of the angiosperm phylogeny group classification for the orders and families of flowering plants: APG IV. Bot J Linn Soc 181(1):1–20
- Binns AN, Sciaky D, Wood HN (1982) Variation in hormone autonomy and regenerative potential of cells transformed by strain A66 of Agrobacterium tumefaciens. Cell 31:605–612
- Chen K (2016) Sequencing and functional analysis of cT-DNAs in *Nicotiana*. PhD Thesis University of Strasbourg, France
- Chen K, Otten L (2017) Natural Agrobacterium transformants: recent results and some theoretical considerations. Front Plant Sci 8:e1600

- Chen K, Dorlhac de Borne F, Szegedi E, Otten L (2014) Deep sequencing of the ancestral tobacco species *Nicotiana tomentosiformis* reveals multiple T-DNA inserts and a complex evolutionary history of natural transformation in the genus *Nicotiana*. Plant J 80:669–682
- Chen K, Dorlhac de Borne F, Julio E, Obszynski J, Pale P, Otten L (2016) Root-specific expression of opine genes and opine accumulation in some cultivars of the naturally occurring GMO *Nicotiana tabacum*. Plant J 87:258–269
- Chen K, Dorlhac de Borne F, Sierro N, Ivanov NV, Alouia M, Koechler S, Otten L (2018) Organization of the TC and TE cellular T-DNA regions in *Nicotiana otophora* and functional analysis of three diverged TE-6b genes. Plant J 94:274–287
- Cormier F, Lawac F, Maledon E, Gravillon MC, Nudol E, Mourmet P, Vignes H, Chaïr H, Arnau G (2019) A reference high-density genetic map of greater yam (*Dioscorea alata* L.). Theor Appl Genet 132:1733–1744
- Dong W, Xu C, Li W, Xie X, Lu Y, Liu Y, Jin X, Suo Z (2017) Phylogenetic resolution in *Juglans* based on complete chloroplast genomes and nuclear DNA sequences. Front Plant Sci 8:e1148
- e Santos DN, de Souza L, Nilson JF, de Oliveira AL (2015) Study of supercritical extraction from Brazilian cherry seeds (*Eugenia uniflora* L.) with bioactive compounds. Food Bioprod Process 94:365–374
- Felsenstein J (1985) Confidence limits on phylogenies: an approach using the bootstrap. Evolution 39:783–791
- Fournier P, Paulus F, Otten L (1993) IS870 requires a 5'-CTAG-3' sequence to generate the stop codon for its large ORF1. J Bact 175:3151–3160
- Gao C, Reno X, Mason AS, Liu H, Xiao M, Li J, Fu D (2014) Horizontal gene transfer in plants. Funct Integr Genomics 14(1):23–29
- Gelvin SB (2017) Integration of *Agrobacterium* T-DNA into the plant genome. Annu Rev Genet 51:195–217
- Guillermo S, Lavia GI, Fernandez A, Krapovickas A, Ducasse DA, Bertioli DJ, Moscone EA (2007) Genomic relationships between the cultivated peanut (*Arachis hypogaea*, Leguminosae) and its close relatives revealed by double GISH. Am J Bot 94(12):1963–1971
- Hansen G, Larribe M, Vaubert D, Tempé J, Biermann B, Montoya AL, Chilton M-D, Brevet J (1991) Agrobacterium rhizogenes pRi8196: mapping and DNA sequence of functions involved in mannopine synthesis and hairy root function. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 88:7763–7767
- Intrieri MC, Buiatti M (2001) The horizontal transfer of *Agrobacterium rhizogenes* genes and the evolution of the genus Nicotiana. Mol Phylogenet Evol 20:100–110
- Kausik B, Chattopadhyay I, Banerjee RK, Bandyopadhyay U (2002) Biological activities and medicinal properties of Neem (Azadirachta indica). Curr Sci 82(11):1336–1345
- Kochert G, Stalker HT, Gimenes M, Galgaro L, Lopes CR, Moore K (1996) RFLP and cytogenetic evidence on the origin and evolution of allotetraploid domesticated peanut, *Arachis hypogaea* (Leguminosae). Am J Bot 83:1282–1291
- Kononov ME, Bassuner B, Gelvin SB (1997) Integration of T-DNA binary vector 'backbone' sequences into the tobacco genome: evidence for multiple complex patterns of integration. Plant J 11:945–957
- Kumar S, Stecher G, Tamura K (2016) MEGA7: molecular evolutionary genetics analysis version 7.0 for bigger datasets. Mol Biol Evol 33:1870–1874
- Kyndt T, Quispe D, Zhai H, Jarret R, Ghislain M, Gheysen Liu Q, Kreuze JF (2015) The genome of cultivated sweet potato contains Agrobacterium T-DNAs with expressed genes: an example of a naturally transgenic food crop. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 112(18):5844–5849
- Machida Y, Sakurai M, Kiyokawa S, Ubasawa A, Suzuki Y, Ikeda J-E (1984) Nucleotide sequence of the insertion sequence found in the

T-DNA region of mutant Ti plasmid pTiA66 and distribution of its homologues in octopine Ti plasmid. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 81:7495–7499

- Matveeva TV, Bogomaz DI, Pavlova OA, Nester EW, Lutova LA (2012) Horizontal gene transfer from genus *Agrobacterium* to the plant *Linaria* in nature. Mol Plant Microbe Interact 25(12):1542–1551
- Matveeva TV, Bogomaz OD, Golovanova LA, Li YuS, Dimitrov D (2018) Homologs of the *rolC* gene of naturally transgenic toadflaxes *Linaria vulgaris* and *Linaria creticola* are expressed in vitro. Vavilovskii Zhurnal Genetiki i Selektsii 22(2):273–278
- Mohajjel-Shoja H, Clément B, Perot J, Alioua M, Otten L (2011) Biological activity of the Agrobacterium rhizogenes-derived trolC gene of Nicotiana tabacum and its functional relationship to other plast genes. Mol Plant Microbe Interact 24:44–53
- Morton J (1987) Surinam cherry. In: Fruits of warm climates. Miami, p 386–388
- Muravieva DA (1983) Tropical and subtropical medicinal plants. Moscow: Medicine (in Russian)
- O'Leary NA, Wright MW, Brister JR et al (2016) Reference sequence (RefSeq) database at NCBI: current status, taxonomic expansion, and functional annotation. Nucleic Acids Res 44(D1):D733–D745
- Ooms G, Bakker A, Molendijk L, Wullems GJ, Gordon MP, Nester EW, Schilperoort RA (1982) T-DNA organization in homogeneous and heterogeneous octopine-type crown gall tissues of *Nicotiana tabacum*. Cell 30:589–597
- Op den Camp RHM, Polone E, Fedorova E, Roelofsen W, Squartini A, Op den Camp HJM, Bisseling T, Geurts R (2012) Nonlegume *Parasponia andersonii* deploys a broad *Rhizobium* host range strategy resulting in largely variable symbiotic effectiveness. Mol Plant Microbe Interact 25:954–963
- Otten L (2018) The Agrobacterium phenotypic plasticity (*plast*) genes. Curr Top Microbiol Immunol 418:375–419
- Otten L, Canaday J, Gérard JC, Fournier P, Crouzet P, Paulus F (1992) Evolution of agrobacteria and their Ti plasmids: a review. Mol Plant Microbe Interact 5:79–87
- Pattee HE, Stalker HT, Giesbrecht FG (1998) Reproductive efficiency in reciprocal crosses of Arachis monticola with A. hypogaea subspecies. Peanut Sci 25:7–12

- Pavlova OA, Matveeva TV, Lutova LA (2013) *Linaria dalmatica* genome contains a homologue of *rolC* gene of *Agrobacterium rhizogenes*. Ecol Genet 11:10–15
- Ramanathan V, Veluthambi K (1995) Transfer of non-T-DNA portions of the Agrobacterium tumefaciens Ti plasmid from the left terminus of TL-DNA. Plant Mol Biol 28:1149–1154
- Richards TA, Dacks JB, Campbell SA, Blanchard JL, Foster PG, McLeod R, Roberts CW (2006) Evolutionary origins of the eukaryotic shikimate pathway: gene fusions horizontal gene transfer and endosymbiotic replacements. Eukaryot Cell 5(9):1517–1531
- Schäfer W, Görz A, Kahl G (1987) T-DNA integration and expression in a monocot crop plant after induction of Agrobacterium. Nature 327:529–532
- Stanford AM, Harden R, Parks CR (2000) Phylogeny and biogeography of *Juglans* (Juglandaceae) based on *matK* and ITS sequence data. Am J Bot 87:872–882
- Tamura K, Nei M (1993) Estimation of the number of nucleotide substitutions in the control region of mitochondrial DNA in humans and chimpanzees. Mol Biol Evol 10:512–526
- Tanaka Y, Brugliera F, Chandler S (2009) Recent progress of flower colour modification by biotechnology. Int J Mol Sc 10:5350–5369
- Ulker B, Li Y, Rosso MG, Logemann E, Somssich IE, Weisshaar B (2008) T-DNA-mediated transfer of Agrobacterium tumefaciens chromosomal DNA into plants. Nat Biotech 26:1015–1017
- van Kregten M, de Pater S, Romeijn R, van Schendel R, Hooykaas PJJ, Tijsterman M (2016) T-DNA integration in plants results from polymerase-0—mediated DNA repair. Nat Plants 2:16164
- Wei C, Yang H, Wang S et al (2018) Draft genome sequence of *Camellia sinensis* var. sinensis provides insights into the evolution of the tea genome and tea quality. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 115(18):E4151–E4158
- White FF, Garfinkel DJ, Huffman GA, Gordon MP, Nester EW (1983) Sequence homologous to *Agrobacterium rhizogenes* T-DNA in the genomes of uninfected plants. Nature 301:348–350

Publisher's Note Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.