# Base metal Co-fired (Na,K)NbO<sub>3</sub> structures with enhanced piezoelectric performance

Cheng Liu · Peng Liu · Keisuke Kobayashi · Clive A. Randall

Received: 4 September 2013 / Accepted: 3 February 2014 / Published online: 21 February 2014 © Springer Science+Business Media New York 2014

Abstract A NaF-Nb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> flux doped (Na,K)NbO<sub>3</sub> (NKN) based lead-free ceramic was successfully co-fired with nickel inner electrodes in reduced atmospheres. No chemical reactions and/or inter-diffusion were detected at the interface between the nickel (Ni) electrodes and the NKN-based piezoelectrics. Dielectric, resistivity, and electromechanical performance were measured with processing under different firing conditions and flux additions to obtain high densities. Ceramics are obtained with submicron grain structures with the NaF-Nb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> sintering aids (2 and 4 wt%) fluxes, and high densities when firing at low  $pO_2$  ( $10^{-10}$  atms) atmospheres at sintering temperatures ~1150 °C for 2 hours. High resistivities and low losses can be obtained through a second annealing condition at 850 °C and  $10^{-7}$  atms at 8 hours. High  $d_{33}$  values (over 350 pm/V) determined under unipolar converse electromechanical measurements were obtained in the simple prototyped co-fired structures to show feasibility towards base metal electrodes in multilayer actuators.

Keywords Lead-free  $\cdot$  Piezoelectric  $\cdot$  Reduced firing  $\cdot$  BME  $\cdot$  Cofiring

C. Liu · P. Liu

C. Liu · K. Kobayashi · C. A. Randall (🖂)

Center for Dielectric Studies, Materials Research Institute, The Pennsylvania State University, University Park, PA 16802, USA e-mail: car4@psu.edu

#### K. Kobayashi

#### **1** Introduction

Piezoelectric materials have been widely used in actuators, ultrasonic motors, and surface acoustic wave devices due to their excellent electromechanical properties [1-4]. However, most of these materials are lead-based, such as Pb(Zr,Ti)O<sub>3</sub> (PZT) and Pb(Mg<sub>1/3</sub>Nb<sub>2/3</sub>)O<sub>3</sub>-PbTiO<sub>3</sub> (PMN-PT), which have raised environmental issues. Although there are a lot of debates on this topic, it is expedient for the piezoelectric community to explore alternative strategies. However, there have been no major breakthroughs beyond the lead perovskites in completely lead free, lead-bismuth perovskite binary and ternary compositions, sometimes referred to as "lead-lite compositions", which have exceeded the performance of the best PZT compositions [5–11]. The highest completely lead-free systems are based on (Na,Bi)TiO<sub>3</sub> (NBT) and (Na,K)NbO<sub>3</sub> (NKN) [12-17]. NKN-based systems are especially interesting as they have high Curie temperatures (about 420 °C) [14]. However, pure NKN ceramics are difficult to densify in conventional air sintering due to the high volatility of alkaline elements through their sub-oxides at high sintering temperatures, and also a relatively low liquidus-solidus gap in the binary phase diagram [18]. Furthermore, the basic piezoelectric performance of these lead-free piezoelectric candidates is relatively low with direct comparison with the best lead-based piezoelectrics; this is especially the case for actuator based applications [14, 15, 19–21].

Multilayer actuator structures are one solution to engineering higher electromechanical displacements over the lower basic materials performance through decreasing the active layer thickness and increasing the number of electrodes. PZT based multilayered piezoelectric ceramics are commercially produced with co-fired silver-palladium (Ag-Pd) and copper (Cu) inner electrodes [22]. However, with the lower piezoelectric performance and the higher firing condition, the

College of Physics and Information Technology, Shaanxi Normal University, Xi'an, Shaanxi 710062, People's Republic of China

Materials R&D Department, R&D Laboratory, Taiyo Yuden Co., Ltd., 5607-2Nakamuroda, Takasaki, Gunma 370-3347, Japan

devices need more electrodes, and so Ag-Pd increases the production costs, and the Cu requires firing at temperatures between 900 and 1020 °C, which is also challenging with the NKN systems that are typically fired above the melting temperature of Cu. So nickel (Ni) inner electrodes are an important alternative base metal electrode system but should be fired in reduced atmospheres.

It is recently reported that an NKN-based system shows a capability of co-firing with Ni inner electrode under low  $pO_2$  atmospheres based on mixtures of nitrogen and hydrogen gases [18, 23]. In our earlier studies, we reported an enhancement of sinterability and piezoelectric performance of NKN-based ceramics via a superior flux—NaF with excess Nb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> (NaF-Nb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>) [24]. Here we extend this investigation of Ni co-firing with NKN piezoelectric ceramics in low  $pO_2$  atmospheres.

## 2 Experimental procedures

## 2.1 Powder preparation

 $x(NaF-0.5Nb_2O_5)-(1-x)[Na_{0.5}K_{0.5}(Nb_{0.8}Ta_{0.2})O_3]$  (abbreviated as 100xNN-NKNT, x=0.02, 0.04, 0.06) powders were synthesized via a solid-state reaction method. The starting materials used in this study were all reagent grade NaF, K<sub>2</sub>CO<sub>3</sub>, Na<sub>2</sub>CO<sub>3</sub>, Ta<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>, Nb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> (>99.5 % purity, Alfa Aesar, Ward Hill, MA) and were pre-dried at 200 °C for 24 hours to minimize humidity effects and aid in the weighing out of all stoichiometric ratios. NKNT powders were accurately weighed in stoichiometric ratios and ball milled with zirconia media and ethanol for 24 hours. After the calcination process at 900 °C for 4 hours, different amounts of NaF-Nb2O5 flux were later added into NKNT powders and milled for another 24 hours. Then the 100xNN-NKNT powders were dried and divided into two groups: one group was subsequently granulated and pressed into disk-shaped pellet of 10 mm diameter for density and microstructure characterization; another group of samples was processed via a tape casting method to fabricate co-fired multilayer piezoelectric actuators. The tape casting approach is outlined below.

#### 2.2 Co-fired BME NKN processing

The cofired-actuator structures were prepared via the tape casting method, which has also been adopted in fabricating single dielectric layer capacitors in our laboratory [25]. The calcined powders was first mixed in a solution (named Vehicle A), which consisted of 32 wt% methylethylketone (MEK, Alfa Aesar, Ward Hill, MA), 32 wt% ethyl alcohol (Pharmco—AAPER, Brookfield, CT), and 1 wt% fish oil (Z-3 Blown Menhaden, Tape Casting Warehouse, Yardley, PA) as a dispersant. Then the powder mixed solution was ball

milled with zirconia media (9 mm height and 9 mm diameter. TOSOH Ceramics, Tokyo, Japan) for 24 hours. Vehicle B, containing 10 wt% PVB binder (BMS FB-C96, Sekisui, Tokyo, Japan) and 4 wt% plasticizer (Butyl Benzyl Phthalate S-160, Tape Casting Warehouse, Yardley, PA), was added to the solution and followed by an additional 20 hours ball milling. Before tape casting, the slurry was slowly rotated for 6 hours to aid in the removal of air. Tape casting was performed on a sheet of Mylar using a commercial casting machine (A. J. Carstern Co. Inc., Powell River, Canada), with a casting speed of about 8 cm/s. The thickness of the tape was controlled by changing the space between the doctor blade and the casting stage. The resulting tape thickness ranged from about 75 to 80 µm. The tape was dried at least 1 h after casting before the printing and stacking processes. Ni electrode paste was mixed with 55 wt% Ni electrode powder (NI-609 s, Shoei Chemical Inc., Osaka, Japan), 8.5 wt% ceramic powder, 3 wt% ethyl cellulose (Alfa Aesar, Ward Hill, MA), and 33.5 wt% terpineol (Alfa Aesar, Ward Hill, MA). The mixture was grinded and milled for 4 hours and then screen printed on the tape in 2 mm by 3 mm to serve as inner electrodes. Electroded tapes were stacked with a 1 mm offset from each other so that the effective electrode area was approximately 2 mm by 2 mm. More layers were respectively laminated on the top and bottom of the active layer to form cover layers and support the structure (350 µm thick in total for each side). The capacitor structure was stacked together in a uniaxial press at 80 °C for 20 min under 30 MPa, then isostatically laminated (IL-4004, Pacific Trinetics Co., San Marcos, CA) at 80 °C for 20 min under a hydrostatic pressure of 200 MPa. Then these stacked layered sheets with Ni inner electrodes were diced into individual components 6 mm in length and 3 mm in width, followed by a binder burnout at 270 °C for at least 12 hours in air with a heating rate of 0.5 °C/min. The bulk and diced multilayered samples could be sintered within a temperature range of 1100-1200 °C for 2 hours in a reduced atmosphere with  $pO_2=10^{-10}$  atm. The furnace was a tube furnace with gas flow controllers that are computer controlled, the  $pO_2$  was monitored with an Oxygen probe sensor (DS probe, Australian Oxytrol Systems, Eaglehawk, Australia) in the furnace. All these as-sintered samples were followed by an annealing process at 850 °C for 8 h in a reduced atmosphere with  $pO_2 = 10^{-7}$  atm. This condition is very similar to the reoxidation conditions used in the fabrication of BaTiO<sub>3</sub> based Multilayer Ceramic Capacitor devices, which is selected to minimize the oxygen vacancy concentration, but also selected at conditions that permit no oxidation of the Ni electrodes [26-28]. The terminations to make electrical contact to the inner electrodes are made from the sides. We first polished the sides just sufficiently to expose the inner electrodes for a platinum (Pt) terminal electrodes sputtering. A schematic of the prepared cofired Ni electrode actuator prototype is showed in Fig. 1.



Fig. 1 Schematic of the NKN based ceramic cofired with Ni inner electrodes

### 2.3 Characterization

The densities of the as-sintered bulk samples were measured by Archimedes method. The relative density was calculated by the expression  $\rho_r = \rho_{bulk} / \rho_{theo} \times 100$  %, where  $\rho_r$ ,  $\rho_{bulk}$  and  $\rho_{\text{theo}}$  denoted the relative density, bulk density, and X-ray theoretical density of the samples, respectively. A phase and structure analysis of the as-sintered bulk samples were examined through a X-ray diffractometer (XRD, Philips X'pert Pro MPD, PANalytical Company, Almelo, Holland) with a scanning rate of 10 °/min in the range of 15 ° $\leq 2\theta \leq 80$  °, using  $CuK\alpha$  radiation. Morphology studies of the multilayer crosssection and surface of the actuator prototyped devices were observed using a scanning electron microscope (SEM, S-3500, Hitachi Corp., Tokyo, Japan). Spatial chemical variation through scans across the interfaces was investigated via an energy dispersion spectroscopy (EDS, IMIX X-ray Microanalysis System, Princeton Gamma-Tech, Inc., Princeton, NJ) attached to the SEM. The electrical characterization was extensive. Temperature-dependent dielectric constant and loss tangent were measured by a LCR meter (HP4274A, Agilent Technologies Inc., Santa Clara, CA). The resistivity of the samples was evaluated with a Picoammeter/DC voltage source (HP4140B, Agilent Technologies Inc., Santa Clara, CA) by a two-electrode method at room temperature. Polarization-Electric field (P-E) hysteresis loops and unipolar strain response were measured at 1 Hz with sine waves, using a modified Sawyer-Tower circuit and a linear variable differential strain transducer. High field  $d_{33}$  measurements were calculated as the ratio of maximum



Fig. 2 Relative densities of the 100xNN-NKNT bulk ceramics sintered at different temperatures in low  $pO_2$  atmospheres



Fig. 3 XRD patterns of the 100xNN-NKNT bulk ceramics fired in low  $pO_2$  atmospheres

electric-field-induced thickness strain to the maximum electric field.

#### 3 Results and discussion

An important aspect about producing any electroceramic device is to maximize the mechanical strength of the component in the handling and packaging of the system. Typically the maximizing of the densification is important for both mechanical and electrical performance. Figure 2 shows the relative density of the as-sintered 100xNN-NKNT (x=0.02, 0.04, 0.06) ceramics fired within a temperature range of 1100–1180 °C for 2 hours in low  $pO_2$  atmospheres, and annealed in a post treatment to improve electrical properties with an annealing process at 850 °C for 8 h in a reduced atmosphere with  $pO_2$ =10<sup>-7</sup> atm. The relative densities of the low  $pO_2$ 



Fig. 4 Cross-section SEM morphology(a) and EDS result(b) of the 2NN-NKNT ceramic cofired with Ni inner electrodes



Fig. 5 Temperature dependence of the dielectric properties of the 100xNN-NKNT (x=0.02, 0.04, 0.06) ceramics cofired with Ni inner electrodes

fired bulk samples are increased with the sintering temperatures, reaching up to around 97 % at 1150 °C, and then started to drop through de-densification processes due to extensive grain growth and trapped porosity, and also partial melting. High densities were already obtained in air fired samples using this flux addition [24]. Such densities are typically difficult to achieve in alkaline niobate perovskite ceramics. It should be noted that the optimal sintering temperatures for the low  $pO_2$  fired samples are 50 °C less than those of the air fired specimens [24], consistent with the low  $pO_2$  sintering of the alkali niobates-tantalates lowering the sintering temperatures. For the sake of the cofiring studies, we will only report the sintering temperatures for 1150 °C.

Figure 3 shows room temperature X-ray diffraction (XRD) patterns of the 100xNN-NKNT bulk ceramics sintered at high temperatures 1150 °C for 2 hours in low  $pO_2$  atmospheres. All

specimens have diffraction data that could be indexed as orthorhombic symmetry with no detectable secondary phases, indicating that there is no major microstructural difference between the samples fired in air [24] or under reduced atmospheres.

To assess the co-firing, we show in Fig. 4(a) the crosssection SEM micrograph of the co-fired 2NN-NKNT samples. The thicknesses of the ceramic and electrode layer are 70  $\mu$ m and 5  $\mu$ m, respectively. The coverage and connectivity of the Ni inner electrode is continuous. The inset of Fig. 4(a) shows the dense surface morphology with highly faceted grains. It is observed that the grain size distribution is homogeneous with an average grain size of~0.8  $\mu$ m, that is, a fine-grain piezoelectric ceramic relative to typical lead free NKN or PZT microstructures. Furthermore, the EDS data suggest that there is no reaction and/or diffusion between the Ni electrodes and NKN-material, as illustrated in Fig. 4(b).

Figure 5 shows the temperature dependence of the dielectric properties of permittivity and dielectric loss for the 100xNN-NKNT (x=0.02, 0.04, 0.06) Ni co-fired ceramics measured at 10 kHz across a temperature range of 25 to 450 °C. Two displacive phase transitions, the ferroelectric/tetragonal to paraelectric/cubic ( $T_{\rm C}$ ) and ferroelectric/orthorhombic to tetragonal ( $T_{\rm O-T}$ ) phase transitions, as shown in Fig. 5(a), are located around 298 °C and 126 °C, respectively. Compared with the same compositions fired in air [24], the  $T_{\rm C}$  shifts toward higher temperatures (around 8 °C higher) while the  $T_{\rm O-T}$  almost stays at the same temperature; as for the dielectric losses, these are also increased slightly with low  $pO_2$  co-firing.

Figure 6 shows the high field electrical and electromechanical properties, the polarization hysteresis (P-E) loops, and

**Fig. 6** *P-E* loops and unipolar *S-E* curves of the 2NN-NKNT(**a**), 4NN-NKNT(**b**), and 6NN-NKNT(**c**) ceramics cofired with Ni inner electrodes



Table 1 Dc resistivity and di-   electric loss values of the	Samples	$\rho \left( \Omega \cdot \mathbf{m} \right)$ (as-sintered)	$\rho \left( \Omega \cdot \mathbf{m} \right)$ (annealed)	tand (as-sintered)	tand (annealed)
100xNN-NKN1 ( $x$ =0.02, 0.04, 0.06) ceramics (as-sintered and	2NN-NKNT	$3.5 \times 10^{7}$	$1.6 \times 10^{8}$	0.15	0.073
annealed) cofired with Ni inner electrodes	4NN-NKNT	$7.9 \times 10^{6}$	$8.3 \times 10^{7}$	0.26	0.077
	6NN-NKNT	$2.3 \times 10^{6}$	$1.8 \times 10^{7}$	0.34	0.081

unipolar strain-electric field (*S*-*E*) curves, respectively, for the co-fired 100xNN-NKNT samples measured at room temperature. All specimens exhibit typical ferroelectric hysteresis with well-saturated remnant polarization and no significant space charge. The unipolar *S*-*E* curves are exhibited in Fig. 6(a2–c2) below the *P*-*E* loops, from which we calculated the high field piezoelectric coefficients via an equation of  $d_{33}=S_{max}/E_{max}$  and exhibit the corresponding results in Table 2.

Table 1 compares the dc resistivity and the dielectric loss values of the 100xNN-NKNT (x=0.02, 0.04, 0.06) singlelayered ceramics before and after the reoxidation annealing process. It is obvious that the dc resistivity is significantly enhanced and the dielectric loss by an order of magnitude through this heat treatment. After this heat treatment high field bi-polar switching of the ferroelectric and unipolar electromechanical strain field measurements can be performed. Table 2 lists the dielectric and piezoelectric properties of the 100xNN-NKNT (x=0.02, 0.04, 0.06) cofired ceramics (annealed) with Ni inner electrodes. The dielectric properties of the reduced fired monolithic specimens are similar with those of the airfired samples [24]. However, the  $E_{\rm C}$  values of the reduced fired samples increased about 4 times compared with the air fired specimens; meanwhile, the  $P_{\rm r}$  values decreased with the flux. When  $E_{\text{max}}$ =50 kV/cm, it is noted that the high field  $d_{33}$ values for 2NN-NKNT, 4NN-NKNT, and 6NN-NKNT are 385 pm/V, 367 pm/V, and 269 pm/V, respectively.

We anticipate that after processing in low  $pO_2$ , the defect concentrations of  $V'_{Na}$  and  $V'_O$  are smaller than the air processed case, and the suppressed volatility of the alkali suboxides through rate limited surface diffusion is analogous to our earlier observations of PbO loss in Nb-doped PZT [18, 29]. In addition, the presence of excess NaF can also aid to compensate these vacancies:

$$NaF + 2V'_{Na} + V^{\cdot}_{o} \underset{\leftarrow}{\longrightarrow} Na^{x}_{Na} + F^{\cdot}_{o} + V'_{Na}$$
(1)

Also, the anionic  $F^-$  substitution for the  $O^{2-}$  acts as a donor, so the oxygen vacancy concentration is lowered by a number

of scenarios. The domain wall motion would then be expected to be more dynamic and contributes to a higher piezoelectric effect through the extrinsic response.

This paper shows that there is a large potential area of study required in detailed consideration of low  $pO_2$  formulations of NKN piezoelectric ceramics, as it provides an important engineering solution towards multilayer actuator devices with high densities, high electromechanical performance, and low cost with lead free materials. In the exploration for effective sintering fluxes we note that the high field piezoelectric performance can be very sensitive to flux chemistry, for example earlier we used fluxes based on LiF, and here we considered NaF-Nb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub>, and this significantly increased the piezoelectric high field strain, and the microstructure was reduced in size to sub-micron. We wish to point out that although this is an advance in a strategy towards lead free materials, the compositional space across low  $pO_2$  firing conditions and cofiring is largely unexplored in the open literature.

## 4 Summary and conclusions

NaF-Nb<sub>2</sub>O<sub>5</sub> flux doped NKN-based co-fired piezoelectric ceramics with Ni inner electrodes were successfully fabricated. It was necessary to fire in low  $pO_2$  ( $10^{-10}$  atms and 1150 °C for two hours) and then improve the resistivity and dielectric loss with a secondary anneal (850 °C at  $10^{-7}$  atms for 8 hours) before high fields could be applied and enable ferroelectric switching with negligible space charge polarization. After the annealing processes, high field polarization and strain field measurements were applied, and the resistivity and loss improved by an order of magnitude. No detectable reactions or diffusion between Ni electrodes and NKN-based matrix were observed through a cross sectioned SEM and EDS study. The high field converse piezoelectric  $d_{33}$  values of over 350 pm/V are gained in the prototyped actuators and are high for untextured NKN samples. It should also be pointed out that in the electrode configurations used, there is still clamping with the capacitive interdigited electrodes, so

Table 2Dielectric and piezo-<br/>electric properties of the 100xNN-NKNT (x=0.02, 0.04, 0.06) ce-<br/>ramics (annealed) cofired with Ni<br/>inner electrodes

Samples	$T_{\rm C}$ (°C)	$T_{\text{O-T}}$ (°C)	ε <sub>r</sub>	d <sub>33</sub> (pm/V, @50 kV/cm)	$E_{\rm C}$ (kV/cm)	$P_{\rm r}$ ( $\mu$ C/cm <sup>2</sup> )
2NN-NKNT	296	125	900	385	20	7.7
4NN-NKNT	298	128	836	367	21	9.2
6NN-NKNT	300	126	780	269	23	12.5

we expect that higher performance could be released with better electrode design.

Acknowledgments The authors gratefully acknowledge technical assistance from Jeff Long, Steven Perini, and Amanda Baker at The Pennsylvania State University (Penn State). Cheng Liu also wishes to thank China Scholarship Council (CSC) for providing the opportunity to study as a visiting scientist at Penn State. Clive Randall also wishes to thank the Center for Dielectrics and Piezoelectrics (CDP) for support of the experimental costs.

## References

- 1. K. Uchino, *Piezoelectric actuator/ultrasonic motors* (Kluwer Academic Publisher, Boston, 1996)
- C.A. Randall, A. Kelnberger, G.Y. Yang, R.E. Eitel, T.R. Shrout, J. Electroceram. 14, 177 (2005)
- 3. L.E. Cross, Relaxor ferroelectrics. Ferroelectrics 76, 241 (1987)
- 4. G.H. Haertling, J. Am. Ceram. Soc. 82, 797 (1999)
- C.A. Randall, R. Eitel, B. Jones, T.R. Shrout, D.I. Woodward, I.M. Reaney, J. Appl. Phys. 95, 3633 (2004)
- S.M. Choi, C.J. Stringer, T.R. Shrout, C.A. Randall, J. Appl. Phys. 98, 034108 (2005)
- C.A. Randall, R.E. Eitel, T.R. Shrout, D.I. Woodward, I.M. Reaney, J. Appl. Phys. 93, 9271 (2003)
- 8. S. Zhang, C.A. Randall, T.R. Shrout, J. Appl. Phys. 95, 4291 (2004)
- S. Zhang, R. Xia, C.A. Randall, T.R. Shrout, R. Duan, R.F. Speyer, J. Mater. Res. 20, 2067 (2005)

- I. Grinberg, M.R. Suchomel, W. Dmowski, S.E. Mason, H. Wu, P.K. Davies, A.M. Rappe, Phys. Rev. Lett. 98, 107601 (2007)
- 11. M.R. Suchomel, P.K. Davies, J. Appl. Phys. 96, 4405 (2004)
- T. Takenaka, K. Maruyama, K. Sakata, Jpn. J. Appl. Phys. 30, 2236 (1991)
- 13. H. Nagata, T. Takenaka, J. Eur. Ceram. Soc. 21, 1299 (2001)
- 14. G. Shirane, R. Newnham, R. Pepinsky, Phys. Rev. 96, 581 (1954)
- 15. L. Egerton, D.M. Dillon, J. Am. Ceram. Soc. 42, 438 (1959)
- Y. Saito, H. Takao, T. Tani, T. Nonoyama, K. Takatori, T. Honma, T. Nagaya, M. Nakamura, Nature 432, 84 (2004)
- M. Matsubara, T. Yamaguchi, W. Sakamoto, K. Kikuta, T. Yogo, S. Hirano, J. Am. Ceram. Soc. 88, 1190 (2005)
- K. Kobayashi, Y. Doshida, Y. Mizuno, C.A. Randall, J. Am. Ceram. Soc. 95, 2928 (2012)
- 19. T.R. Shrout, S.J. Zhang, J. Electroceram. 19, 111 (2007)
- 20. R.E. Jaeger, L. Egerton, J. Am. Ceram. Soc. 45, 209 (1962)
- 21. G.H. Haertling, J. Am. Ceram. Soc. 50, 329 (1967)
- 22. K. Uchino, Acta Mater. 46, 3745 (1998)
- S. Kawada, M. Kimura, Y. Higuchi, H. Takagi, Appl. Phys. Express 2, 111401 (2009)
- 24. C. Liu, P. Liu, K. Kobayashi, W. Qu, C.A. Randall, J. Am. Ceram. Soc. (2013). doi:10.1111/jace.12461
- H. Ogihara, C.A. Randall, S. Trolier-McKinstry, J. Am. Ceram. Soc. 92, 1719 (2009)
- C. Chiang, Y. Lee, F. Shiao, W. Lee, D. Hennings, J. Eur. Ceram. Soc. 32, 865 (2012)
- H. Saito, H. Chazono, H. Kishi, N. Yamaoka, Jpn. J. Appl. Phys. 30, 2307 (1991)
- 28. D. Hennings, J. Eur. Ceram. Soc. 21, 1637 (2001)
- 29. N.J. Donnelly, C.A. Randall, J. Appl. Phys. 109, 104107 (2011)