Interactive effects of elevated $CO₂$ and nitrogen–phosphorus supply on the physiological properties of *Pyropia haitanensis* (Bangiales, Rhodophyta)

Binbin Chen¹ · Dinghui Zou^{1,2} · Jiahai Ma³

Received: 2 February 2015 /Revised and accepted: 24 May 2015 / Published online: 31 May 2015 \oslash Springer Science+Business Media Dordrecht 2015

Abstract The ongoing increases in atmospheric $CO₂$ concentrations and coastal eutrophication have affected the coastal environment and marine macroalgae. In this study, the interactive effects of CO₂ (390 and 1000 μ L L⁻¹) and nutrient levels (nitrogen and phosphorus supplied simultaneously) on the physiological properties of the maricultured macroalga Pyropia haitanensis(Bangiales, Rhodophyta) were investigated. The results showed that elevated $CO₂$ significantly enhanced *P. haitanensis* growth and $NO₃⁻$ uptake, but lowered the pH compensation points, regardless of nutrient levels, and enhanced photosynthesis and apparent photosynthetic efficiency (α) when the nutrient levels were high. However, CO2 had little effect on photosynthetic rates at low nutrient levels. At each nutrient level, $CO₂$ elevation lowered both the phycobiliproteins (PB) and soluble protein contents, but enhanced biomass accumulation. Chlorophyll a (Chl a) and carotenoid (Car) contents were markedly increased by high $CO₂$ concentrations at low nutrient levels. Increasing nutrient supply significantly enhanced growth, pH compensation points, and photosynthesis in P . haitanensis at each $CO₂$ level, but the differences of the effects between intermediate and high nutrient levels on this alga were not significant for photosynthesis, pigment content, and nutrient uptake, regardless of $CO₂$

 \boxtimes Dinghui Zou dhzou@scut.edu.cn

- ² The Key Lab of Pollution Control and Ecosystem Restoration in Industry Clusters, Ministry of Education, Guangzhou 510006, China
- ³ Key Laboratory of Aquatic Genetic Resources and Aquacultural Ecology, Certificated by the Ministry of Agriculture, Shanghai Ocean University, Shanghai 201306, China

levels. Our results suggest that the growth and physiological responses of P . haitanensis to $CO₂$ levels are largely dependent on the supplement of nutrients. However, the interactive effects of elevated $CO₂$ and nitrogen–phosphorus supplies on the physiological properties of P. haitanensis were limited through respective regulation by the $CO₂$ levels in the atmosphere and the nutrient concentrations in the seawater.

Keywords $CO₂$. Nutrient . Pyropia haitanensis . Photosynthesis . Pigment . Global change

Introduction

It is predicted that the atmospheric $CO₂$ concentration will continue to rise throughout this century (IPCC [2007](#page-8-0)), and great attention has been paid to how global climate change may affect the global environment. The current $CO₂$ concentration is reaching the highest it has been for the last 800,000 years (Lüthi et al. [2008\)](#page-8-0). Increased $CO₂$ levels in the atmosphere not only cause global warming (Florides and Christodoulides [2009](#page-8-0)) but also cause a decrease in the marine surface pH because more atmospheric $CO₂$ is dissolved in the ocean (Caldeira and Wickett [2003\)](#page-7-0).

Increasing atmospheric $CO₂$, together with seawater acidification, has the potential to greatly affect marine organisms (for a review, see Fabry et al. [2008\)](#page-7-0). Marine macroalgae have a considerable biomass production and $CO₂$ bioremediation potential because the ocean is one of the largest carbon sinks of atmospheric $CO₂$ on the earth (Gao and McKinley [1994;](#page-8-0) Zhang et al. 2005). Furthermore, rising $CO₂$ levels have been shown to affect photosynthesis and other physiological processes in marine macroalgae (Zou and Gao [2002a](#page-8-0); [2010](#page-8-0); Wu et al. [2008](#page-8-0)).

¹ College of Environment and Energy, South China University of Technology, Guangzhou 510006, China

Coastal eutrophication, caused by human activity, economic development, and overuse of the coastal environment, has become more and more serious (Fei [2004;](#page-7-0) Neori et al. [2004\)](#page-8-0). Nutrients, such as nitrogen (N) and phosphorus (P), directly influence the biochemical composition of macroalgae, such as nitrogenous compounds such as Rubisco, a key enzyme in photosynthesis, which affects the storage of organic compounds (Lohman and Priscu [1992](#page-8-0)).

It is thought that the large scale cultivation of macroalgae in marine areas that are affected by eutrophication may act as a nutrient buffer and help lower N–P contamination risks, such as industrial and agricultural waste water, and/or the economic production of aquatic animals (Fei [2004](#page-7-0); Troell et al. [2003\)](#page-8-0). However, excessive nutrients from terrestrial sources cause anthropogenic eutrophication, which can result in the explosive proliferation of marine algae (Lin and Lin [2000](#page-8-0); Yabe et al[.2009\)](#page-8-0). Moreover, under suitable light and temperature conditions, excessive nutrient levels may stimulate the coastal production of harmful algae and lead to expansion in toxic phytoplankton blooms (Paerl [1997](#page-8-0)).

Pyropia haitanensis (T.J. Chang and B.F. Zheng) N. Kikuchi and M. Myata (Bangiales, Rhodophyta) is a Chinese nori species that is artificially bred to be grown on a large scale in the South China Sea area (Tseng [1983\)](#page-8-0). This species naturally grows in the mid intertidal zone and is greatly affected by fluctuating environmental condition, such as light, temperature, pH, and nutrient levels.

Previous research has shown that elevated $CO₂$ levels can enhance photosynthesis of emersed P. haitanensis (Zou and Gao [2002b](#page-8-0)). When the $CO₂$ concentration was between 60 and 1440 μ L L⁻¹, increased CO₂ levels enhanced both intracellular and extracellular carbonic anhydrase (CA) (Zou and Gao [2004](#page-8-0)), by which the HCO_3^- is dehydrated to CO_2 which is then transported into algal cells (Zou et al. [2004\)](#page-8-0). This suggested that $CO₂$ transport had increased, consequently leading to a rise in $CO₂$ assimilation by *P. haitanensis* (Zou and Gao [2004](#page-8-0)). Moreover, the nitrate reductase (NR) in *P. haitanensis* is positively regulated by seawater $NO₃⁻$ concentration and negatively regulated by seawater $NH⁴⁺$ (Xu et al. [2007\)](#page-8-0). However, previous laboratory studies have shown that NR levels were not directly positively correlated with $NO₃⁻$ concentration in the culture medium (Xu et al. [2007\)](#page-8-0). If the predicted rises in $CO₂$ and coastal eutrophication occur, then the physiological properties of P. haitanensis growing at elevated CO2 and enriched nitrogen–phosphorus levels need to be investigated.

In this study, we cultured *P. haitanensis* in the laboratory at different levels of $CO₂$ and at different nutrient concentrations. During the experiments, $CO₂$ concentration was controlled at either 390 or 1000 μ L L⁻¹, with low, medium, and high nitrogen–phosphorus supplies. The aim was to investigate how the elevated $CO₂$ and different nutrient concentration combinations influenced P. haitanensis and whether or not elevated $CO₂$ levels and N–P supply would have any long-term interactive effects of on this alga.

Materials and methods

Samples of P. haitanensis were collected from the mid intertidal rocky shore along the coast of Nan'ao Island, Shantou, China (23° 20′ N, 116° 55′ E). Collected algae were cleaned on-site and brought to laboratory under low temperature conditions. Healthy individuals were selected and rinsed again in sterile seawater. Then, they were pre-cultured in incubators in 5 L aquaria in filtered seawater (salinity 32‰) at a density of 0.5 g fresh weight per liter. The cultured thalli were continuously aerated using ambient air at a rate of about 9 L h⁻¹ (i.e., a renewal rate of more than 90 % per hour) under 100 μmol photons m^{-2} s⁻¹ illumination supplied by fluorescent tubes with a 12:12 (light/dark) photoperiod. Temperature was controlled at 18 °C.

The environmental $CO₂$ concentrations were respectively controlled at 390 μL L^{-1} (ambient air, AC) and 1000 μL L (elevated $CO₂$, EC) in two $CO₂$ incubators, in which the $CO₂$ concentrations were automatically adjusted by controlling the inflow of ambient air and pure $CO₂$ gas, and each $CO₂$ incubator had three levels of nutrient gradients $(NaNO₃ and$ $NaH₂PO₄$ supplied simultaneously): (i) low nutrient supplied (LN): three flasks contained filtered natural seawater $(NO_3$ ⁻ concentration ≤ 40 µmol L⁻¹, PO₄³⁻ concentration $1 \ \mu$ mol L⁻¹) with no additional N and P; (ii) intermediate N–P supply (IN): three flasks contained filtered natural seawater with additional nitrogen (300 µmol L^{-1} NO₃) and phosphorus (15 µmol L^{-1} H₂PO₄⁻); (iii) high nutrient supply (HN): three flasks contained filtered natural seawater with additional nitrogen (600 μmol L^{-1} NO₃) and phosphorus (30 µmol L^{-1} H₂PO₄⁻). Final concentrations of 20 mmol L^{-1} Tris and 20 mmol L^{-1} maleate solution buffers were used in seawater culture (Sober [1974](#page-8-0)), and the pH in every tank was adjusted with 1 mol L^{-1} HCl or 1 mol L^{-1} NaOH to maintain constant pH on the total scale (AC: $pH_{\text{nbs}}=$ 8.17; EC: $pH_{\text{nbs}} = 7.78$). The measured concentrations of dissolved inorganic carbon (DIC), estimated using the $CO₂SYS$ program (Lewis and Wallace [1998](#page-8-0)), were 2032.1 (±30.6) and 2208.5 (\pm 38.3)µmol L⁻¹ in the seawater aerated with ambient air and elevated $CO₂$, respectively. The culture medium was renewed every second day. The photosynthetic traits and biochemical criteria of each sample were determined after 10 days of culture, a period which could be enough for acclimation in marine macroalgae (Zou [2005](#page-8-0); Zou et al. [2003;](#page-8-0) Mercado et al. [1999\)](#page-8-0).

Growth rate estimation Changes in algal biomass (Fw) were measured at the end of culture to estimate growth. Mean

relative growth rate (RGR) was calculated using the formula: RGR (% day⁻¹)=ln (W_t/W_0)/t×100, where W_0 is the initial Fw and W_t is the Fw after t days.

Photosynthetic oxygen evolution Approximately 0.06 g (Fw) of algae was utilized to obtain the net photosynthetic O_2 evolution rate (P_n) at different photon irradiances (P vs. E curve) using a Clark-type oxygen electrode (YSI Model5300, USA), with a water jacket connected to a cooling circulator for maintaining the temperature at 18 °C. Light (provided by a halogen lamp) intensity, which was measured with a spherical quantum sensor (SKP 200, ELE International, UK), was set at six levels from 0 to 600 µmol photos $m^{-2} s^{-1}$ by altering the distance between the electrode chamber and the light source. The dark respiration rate (R_d) was measured by determining the dark O_2 consumption. The electrode chamber contained 8 mL culture solution for each growth treatment and was magnetically stirred. The samples of algae were allowed to acclimate to the electrode cuvette environment for 10 min before measurement. Photosynthetic rates are all expressed in μmol O₂ g⁻¹Fw h⁻¹. Photosynthetic parameters were calculated according to Henley ([1993](#page-8-0)). The gross photosynthetic rate (P_g) was the sum of the maximum net photosynthetic O₂ evolution rate (P_m) and the respiration rate. Each treatment had three replications.

pH drift experiment The pH drift experiment of *P. haitanensis* was carried out according to Zou and Gao ([2009](#page-8-0)) in order to estimate the pH compensation point of the alga grown under each treatment, indicating the ability to use HCO_3^- . Exactly 0.15 g (Fw) of alga sample was transferred into sealed glass bottle containing 20 mL natural seawater that was air-filled and stored about 1 h at 18 °C before use. The bottles were incubated at 18 °C with 100 µmol photons m^{-2} s⁻¹ illumination, and pH values were determined at regular intervals until the value remained constant.

Pigment estimation Approximately 0.1 g (Fw) of alga was ground in 10 mL 100 % methanol and extracted at 4 °C in darkness for 24 h. This extract was centrifuged at 5000 rpm for 10 min and then used to determine the contents of chlorophyll a (Chl a) and carotenoid (Car) using an ultraviolet spectrophotometer (UV-1800, Shimadzu, Japan). Chl a and Car concentrations were estimated according to Porra [\(2002](#page-8-0)) and Parsons and Strickland ([1963](#page-8-0)).

The phycobiliprotein (PB), phycoerythrin (PE), and phycocyanin (PC) contents were estimated by the equation proposed by Beer and Eshel [\(1985](#page-7-0)). The algal thallus was washed with deionized water and blotted dry. A sample of 0.2 g fresh weight (Fw) was homogenated in an ice bath with 5 mL phosphate buffer (0.1 mol L^{-1} , pH=6.8). The crude extract was centrifuged at 10,000 rpm for 20 min at 4 $^{\circ}$ C. The supernatant was transferred into centrifuge tube and the absorbances measured.

Soluble protein determination Content of soluble protein was determined by the Coomassie Brilliant Blue G-250 dye method according to Kochert [\(1978](#page-8-0)). Fw of 0.1 g was homogenized in mortar with 5 mL distilled water. The extract was centrifuged at 5000 rpm for 10 min before analysis. Bovine serum albumin (BSA) was used as standard.

 $NO₃⁻$ uptake estimation Rates of $NO₃⁻$ uptake were estimated by determining the decrease in $NO₃⁻$ in 24 h in culture medium. $NO₃⁻$ concentrations were determined according to the method of Strickland and Parsons [\(1972\)](#page-8-0). The $NO₃⁻$ uptake rate was calculated by the following equation: $\Delta NO_3^-=(N_0-N_t)\times V/(W_0\times t)$, where N_0 is the initial nitrate concentration, N_t is the nitrate concentration after t hours, V is the volume of the culture medium, and W_0 is the initial Fw of the alga. The NO_3^- uptake rate is expressed in μ mol $NO_3^$ $g^{-1} h^{-1}.$

Statistical analyses Origin 8.0 (Origin Lab Corp, USA) was used for data processing and statistical analysis. One-way (ANOVA) and two-way analysis of variance (ANOV2A) and the Tukey test were used to analyze differences among treatments. All the data are expressed as means \pm SD ($n \ge 3$). A p value of 0.05 was considered as statistically significant.

Results

Relative growth rate The RGR and biomass accumulation of P. haitanensis growing under different $CO₂$ and nitrogen– phosphorus (N–P) supplied conditions are shown in Fig. [1.](#page-3-0) At each nutrient level, elevated $CO₂$ significantly enhanced the algal growth and biomass accumulation $(p<0.01)$. Intermediate N–P supply significantly enhanced algal growth $(AC: F_{1,4}=81.56, p<0.01; EC: F_{1,4}=17.35, p=0.14)$ and biomass accumulation (AC: $F_{1,4}$ =76.48, p<0.01; EC: $F_{1,4}$ = 18.85, $p=0.12$) at both $CO₂$ levels, but there was no significant influence on algal growth (AC: $F_{1,4}$ =1.66, p=0.27; EC: $F_{1,4}=1.68$, $p=0.26$) and biomass accumulation (AC: $F_{1,4}=$ 1.68, $p=0.26$; EC: $F_{1,4}=1.69$, $p=0.26$) between the treatments of intermediate and high nutrient levels at the two $CO₂$ levels.

Photosynthesis and respiration The P_n values in P. haitanensis at different irradiances (P–E curves) are shown in Fig. [2](#page-3-0). Increased CO_2 substantially increased P_m under intermediate and high N–P supplies $(p<0.01)$, but hardly enhanced the P_m under low nutrient treatment ($F_{1,4}=3.92$, $p=0.12$) (Table [1\)](#page-4-0). Increased N–P supply significantly increased the P_m at each CO_{[2](#page-4-0)} concentration (Table 2, $p<0.01$), but there were no significant differences between the two increased nutrient levels at both CO₂ levels (AC: $F_{1,4}=0.64$, $p=$ 0.47; EC: $F_{1,4}$ =1.87, p =0.24). It is worth noting that the

Fig. 1 Relative growth rate (RGR) (a) and biomass accumulation (b) of Pyropia haitanensis grown at different $CO₂$ concentrations $(CO₂$ level of ambient air, AC, ca. 390 µL L⁻¹; elevated CO₂, EC, 1, 500 µL L⁻¹) and different nitrogen–phosphorus levels. Significant differences among the treatments are indicated by different lowercase letters (the Tukey test, $p<0.05$). Values are means \pm SD (n=3)

highest P_m values were observed at elevated CO_2 and intermediate supply treatments $(F_{5,12}=46.18, p<0.01)$.

Dark respiration (R_d) increased with increased nutrient levels at ambient air (IN: $F_{1,4}$ =36.99, p<0.01; HN: $F_{1,4}$ = 141.20, $p<0.01$), and significant enhancements were also observed at elevated CO₂ (IN: $F_{1,4}$ =24.73, p<0.01; HN: $F_{1,4}$ = 23.68, p <0.01). It was noticed that R_d under low N–P level at ambient $CO₂$ had the lowest value among all the treatments $(F_{5,12}=29.73, p<0.01)$. The culture conditions of CO₂ and nutrient levels significantly influenced the P_m and R_d in P. haitanensis (Table [2\)](#page-4-0).

The apparent photosynthetic efficiency (α) values were significantly increased at intermediate and high N–P levels at both CO_2 levels ($p<0.01$), but no significant difference was observed in α values between intermediate and high nutrient levels, regardless of CO_2 concentration (AC: $F_{1,4}=0.33$, $p=0.60$; EC: $F_{1,4}=1.09$, $p=0.35$). Elevated CO₂ markedly increased α values regardless of nutrient level treatments $(p<0.01)$.

Increasing values of the compensation irradiance point (E_c) and the irradiance saturation point (E_k) were observed at

Fig. 2 Rates of photosynthetic O_2 evolution vs. irradiance (P–E) curves of Pyropia haitanensis at growth temperature (18 °C) for algae under different CO_2 level (AC ambient air, EC elevated CO_2 level) and nitrogen–phosphorus concentrations. Values are means \pm SD for triplicate samples

ambient air with N–P supply $(p<0.01$; Table [1\)](#page-4-0). In the elevated CO₂ treatment, E_c (IN: $F_{1,4}$ =35.10, p<0.01; HN: $F_{1,4}$ = 18.09, $p=0.01$) and E_k (IN: $F_{1,4}=191.42$, $p<0.01$; HN: $F_{1,5}$ $4=48.53, p<0.01$) also increased with intermediate and high nutrient supply, whereas at elevated $CO₂$ level, E_c and E_k values all decreased in algae cultured at the intermediate to high nutrient levels $(E_c; F_{1,4} = 9.47, p=0.04; E_k; F_{1,4} = 15.13,$ $p=0.02$). The values of α , E_c , and E_k were all significantly influenced by $CO₂$ and nutrient supply conditions (Table [2\)](#page-4-0).

As shown in Fig. [3](#page-4-0), under low nutrient level, the value of R_d/P_g at ambient air condition was remarkably higher than that at high $CO₂$ level ($F_{1,4}=24.53$, $p<0.01$); however, it was substantially lower than that at elevated $CO₂$ under high nutrient supply ($F_{1,4}$ =645.67, p<0.01). The R_d/P_g values were markedly increased with increased nutrient supplies with ambient air $(F_{1,4}=28.66, p<0.01)$, but apparently declined at elevated CO₂ condition ($F_{1,4}$ =2.00, p=0.22).

pH compensation point The pH compensation points were obtained during 8 h pH drift period (Fig. [4](#page-5-0)). At each $CO₂$ level, the pH compensation points under low N–P supply were all lower than at increased nutrient levels (AC: $F_{1,4}$ =64.76,

Table 1 The photosynthetic parameters of P-E curves presented in Fig. [4](#page-5-0) for Pyropia haitanensis grown at different CO₂ levels and nitrogenphosphorus concentrations

	Air			Elevated $CO2$		
	LN	IN	HN	LN	IN	HN
P_m	$50.71 \pm 4.14a$	$67.33 \pm 1.63b$	$68.80 \pm 2.73b$	$55.82 \pm 1.68a$	$82.66 \pm 4.32c$	$78.36 \pm 3.33c$
R_d	$-6.04 \pm 0.61a$	-10.16 ± 1.00 bce	-11.05 ± 0.40 bde	$-9.12 \pm 0.62c$	-12.27 ± 0.91 de	$-11.25 \pm 0.44e$
α	$0.221 \pm 0.006a$	0.251 ± 0.008	0.254 ± 0.005	$0.236 \pm 0.004c$	$0.270 \pm 0.008d$	$0.278 \pm 0.010d$
E_c	$27.30 \pm 2.03a$	$40.40 \pm 3.21b$	$46.92 \pm 2.32c$	33.71 ± 1.82 d	$48.25 \pm 3.84c$	40.50 ± 2.07 b
E_k	$229.26 \pm 12.28a$	267.92 ± 2.25 h	$292.05 \pm 14.96c$	$206.64 \pm 10.20d$	$324.88 \pm 10.73e$	282.09 ± 15.74 bc

Significant differences among the treatments are indicated by different lowercase letters (Tukey test, p < 0.05). Values are means \pm SD ($n=3$)

 P_m maximum net photosynthetic rate (μmol O₂ g⁻¹ Fw h⁻¹), R_d dark respiration rate (μmol O₂ g⁻¹ Fw h⁻¹), α apparent photosynthetic efficiency [(μmol O_2 g⁻¹ Fw h⁻¹)/(µmol photons m⁻² s⁻¹)], E_c compensation irradiance point (µmol photons m⁻² s⁻¹), E_k irradiance saturation point (µmol photons m^{-2} s⁻¹)

 $p<0.01$; EC: $F_{1,4}=64.92, p<0.01$). Under each nutrient level, the pH compensation points at ambient air (Fig. [4a\)](#page-5-0) were all higher than the values at elevated CO₂ (Fig. [4b](#page-5-0)) ($F_{2,5}$ =554.86, $p<0.01$).

Pigment contents At each $CO₂$ level, increased nutrient supply significantly increased Chl a and Car contents in the algae $(p<0.01)$ (Table [3](#page-5-0)). The Chl *a* and Car contents were increased by elevated $CO₂$ only under low nutrient level (Chl a: $F_{1,4}$ =25.42, p<0.01; Car: $F_{1,4}$ =80.32, p<0.01), while these

Table 2 Results of two-way ANOVA for photosynthetic parameters derived from P–E curves (in Table 1) of Pyropia haitanensis grown at different $CO₂$ levels and nitrogen–phosphorus concentrations

DF	MS	F value	<i>p</i> value
1	449.91	45.13	< 0.01
\overline{c}	886.58	88.93	< 0.01
\overline{c}	39.47	3.96	0.05
1	14.47	29.52	< 0.01
$\overline{2}$	25.98	53.01	< 0.01
\mathfrak{D}	3.21	6.56	0.01
1	14.47	29.52	< 0.01
\overline{c}	25.98	53.01	< 0.01
\overline{c}	3.21	6.56	0.01
1	< 0.01	33.17	< 0.01
$\overline{2}$	< 0.01	50.77	< 0.01
\overline{c}	< 0.01	0.61	0.56
1	30.79	4.38	0.06
\overline{c}	365.43	51.99	< 0.01
\mathfrak{D}	92.61	13.18	< 0.01

contents were respectively increased by the additional nutrients (Chl *a*: $p<0.01$; Car: $p<0.01$).

Contents of PE in P. haitanensis significantly increased as the N–P supply increased at each $CO₂$ level ($p<0.01$), and the PC contents also increased with intermediate nutrient supply at both $CO₂$ levels ($p<0.01$) (Tables [3](#page-5-0) and [4\)](#page-5-0), while elevated $CO₂$ apparently lowered the PE and PC contents under each nutrient level, although the declines were not significant at intermediate nutrient supply (PE: $F_{1,4}$ =5.91, p=0.07; PC: $F_{1,4}$ =5.78, p=0.07). The culture conditions of CO₂ and nutrient levels exhibited significant influences on the pigment contents in P. haitanensis (Table [4\)](#page-5-0).

 $NO₃⁻$ uptake and protein contents As shown in Fig [5,](#page-6-0) the intermediate and high nutrient supplies significantly increased the ΔNO_3^- and the SP contents, regardless of CO_2 level (p <0.01). At each nutrient level, elevated CO_2 markedly increased the $\Delta NO_3^- (p<0.01)$, with a significant decline in the SP contents in the alga (p <0.01). At each CO₂ level, an

Fig. 3 Ratios of Rd to Pg of Pyropia haitanensis to different $CO₂$ levels $(AC$ ambient air, EC elevated $CO₂$ level) and nutrient supplies. Values are means \pm SD (*n*=3). *Double asterisks*: Correlation is significant at the 0.01 level

Fig. 4 The pH drifts of Pyropia haitanensis exposed to different $CO₂$ levels (AC ambient air, EC elevated $CO₂$ level) and different nitrogen– phosphorus supplemented conditions. Values are means±SD for triplicate samples

increase in nutrient supply from intermediate to high levels hardly influenced the ΔNO_3^- and the SP contents ($p > 0.05$). The values of ΔNO_3^- in this alga exhibited a low correlation with SP contents (Fig. [5c\)](#page-6-0).

Discussion

This study showed that *P. haitanensis* growth was significantly enhanced by elevated $CO₂$, and this increase was not related

Table 4 Results of two-way ANOVA for the results of the pigment contents in Table 3 in *Pyropia haitanensis* growing at different $CO₂$ levels and nitrogen–phosphorus concentrations

to nutrient supply. Similar findings have been reported for Pyropia yezoensis (Gao et al. [1991](#page-8-0)) and for Hizikia fusiforme (Zou [2005](#page-8-0)). Moreover, at each $CO₂$ concentration, increasing the nutrient supply also enhanced the growth and biomass accumulation by the alga. Elevated $CO₂$ also lowered the P. haitanensis pH compensation points, regardless of nutrient levels, which indicated that there had been a reduction in activities of the $CO₂$ concentrating mechanisms (CCMs). The growth response of the alga may partly depend on the presence of CCMs, which may have substantial energetic and metabolic costs (Israel and Hophy [2002](#page-8-0)), but may eventually contribute to algal biomass accumulation.

Under the low N–P supply treatment, the P. haitanensis photosynthetic rates were not markedly affected by $CO₂$ levels. In contrast, under the low N–P supply treatment, the P. haitanensis dark respiration, photosynthetic efficiency, and the compensation irradiance significantly increased when $CO₂$

Table 3 Pigment contents in Pyropia haitanensis growing at different $CO₂$ levels and nitrogen–phosphorus concentrations

Significant differences among the treatments are indicated by different lowercase letters (Tukey test, p <0.05). Values are means \pm SD (*n*=3)

Chl a chlorophyll a (mg g⁻¹ Fw), Car carotenoid (mg g⁻¹ Fw), PE phycoerythrin (mg g⁻¹ Fw), PC phycocyanin $(mg g^{-1} Fw)$

Fig. 5 Rates of NO_3 ⁻ uptake (ΔNO_3^-) (a) and soluble protein (SP) contents (b) and the relationships between $\log \Delta \text{NO}_3^$ and log SP (c) in Pyropia haitanensis grown at different $CO₂$ levels (*AC* ambient air, *EC* elevated CO₂ level) and different nitrogen–phosphorus concentrations. Significant differences among the treatments are indicated by different lowercase letters (the Tukey test, $p<0.05$). Linear regressions in (c) were used to test the correlation between the ΔNO_3^- and SP $(p<0.05)$. Values are means \pm SD for triplicate samples

levels were high, but the algal irradiance saturation point was decreased by $CO₂$ elevation. The Chl a and Car contents in the alga also rose.

When nutrient supplies were increased, photosynthesis and the photosynthetic efficiency in P. haitanensis were markedly enhanced by elevated $CO₂$. The Chl a and Car contents in the algae at the intermediate and high nutrient levels were also increased by elevated $CO₂$. It has been reported that N enrichment could enhance photosynthesis rate and photosynthetic efficiency in algae (Dawes and Koch [1990;](#page-7-0) Crawford [1995](#page-7-0); Chen et al. [2011](#page-7-0)). High nutrient supplies increased the contents of photosynthetic pigments and nitrogenous compounds, such as Rubisco, a key enzyme in photosynthesis, and finally enhanced photosynthesis. However, the PB contents, including PE and PC, declined under elevated $CO₂$ and low nutrient conditions, but increased when additional nutrients were supplied. It has also been reported that PE and PC contents in Pyropia leucosticta (Mercado et al. [1999](#page-8-0)) and in Gracilaria lemaneiformis (Zou and Gao [2009](#page-8-0)) cultured at high levels of inorganic carbon (Ci) also decreased.

The DIC in seawater increased under elevated $CO₂$ conditions, and the increased $CO₂$ levels enhanced both the intracellular and extracellular CA in P. haitanensis (Zou and Gao [2004\)](#page-8-0). Thus, more nutrients and increased light were required to meet the demands of the enhanced photosynthesis activity caused by $CO₂$ elevation. Under the low nutrient treatment, P. haitanensis photosynthesis was depressed by the lack of N and P. Nitrogen plays an important role in photosynthesis and is an important component of many plant compounds, such as Rubisco, the key enzyme in photosynthesis (Dawes and Koch

[1990;](#page-7-0) Crawford [1995\)](#page-7-0), and phosphorus is required for various chloroplast functions, including ATP generation and photosynthetic protein and enzyme phosphorylation (Zer and Ohad [2003\)](#page-8-0). Under the low nutrient level treatment, newly synthesized carbohydrates could not be used in protein synthesis and organic structure development due to the lack of N and P. This led to excessive carbohydrate accumulation, which probably depressed the relative expressions of photosynthetic enzyme genes that normally upregulated for the photosynthate production. Moreover, PB is used as an N reservoir in case N was needed for algal growth (Kursar and Alberte [1983;](#page-8-0) Zou and Gao [2009\)](#page-8-0). This probably resulted in an increased allocation of energy to nutrient uptake and assimilation processes and ultimately affected dark respiration.

When nutrients levels were high, increased $CO₂$ levels enhanced photosynthesis and consequently led to a rise in photosynthetic pigment contents, which indicated more carbohydrates were being synthesized. Nitrogen enrichment can stimulate pigment synthesis by promoting nitrogen metabolism (Fujii et al. [2012\)](#page-8-0), which competes for energy and electrons sinks with photosynthesis (Falkowski and Raven [2007](#page-7-0)). When N and P levels were high, the photosynthate in P. haitanensis at elevated $CO₂$ concentrations was functionally utilized for algal growth and protein synthesis, and when combined with sufficient Rubisco and phosphorylation intermediates, this led to photosynthesis enhancement in P. haitanensis.

It was noted that, under low nutrient level, the value of $R_d/$ P_g at ambient air was remarkably higher than that at high CO_2

level. This result was inconsistent with the results of Zou et al. [\(2011](#page-8-0)), who found that the R_d/P_g in Hizikia fusiformis was not significantly influenced by $CO₂$ elevation. Under low nutrient level, CO₂ enrichment slightly enhanced the photosynthesis of P. haitanensis, and this stimulated the nutrient demands for algal growth. Thus, more energy was probably needed for nutrient uptake and active transport or utilization of the N reservoir (such as PB) (Kursar and Alberte [1983](#page-8-0)). Thus, dark respiration was enhanced by $CO₂$ elevation. However, the value of R_d/P_φ at ambient air was significantly lower than that at elevated $CO₂$ under high nutrient supply, which was consistent with Zou et al. [\(2011](#page-8-0)). Under high nutrient level, a high CO2 level decreases photorespiration in algae (Stitt and Krapp [1999;](#page-8-0) Zou et al. [2011](#page-8-0)), and $CO₂$ enrichment enhanced the nutrient uptake and assimilation, which would permit decreased investment of nitrogen in the nitrogen-intensive process of photosynthesis and photorespiration (Zou [2005](#page-8-0)).

Nitrogen metabolism in P. haitanensis was highly correlated with the $NO₃⁻$ concentration in the culture medium. At each CO₂ concentration, increased nutrient levels markedly enhanced NO_3 ⁻ uptake and soluble protein synthesis. Increased nutrient uptake at high nutrient level has also been reported in some other species of Pyropia (Pedersen et al. [2004\)](#page-8-0) and in Gracilaria lemaneiformis (Xu et al. [2008](#page-8-0)). At each nutrient level, CO_2 elevation increased NO_3 ⁻ uptake, especially at the intermediate and high nutrient levels. It is possible that $CO₂$ enrichment of the culture medium increased both $NO₃⁻$ uptake and NR activity (Mercado et al. [1999](#page-8-0); Zou [2005\)](#page-8-0). However, the soluble protein contents in the algae fell when the $CO₂$ concentration was high. This is consistent with the results for some *Gracilaria* species (Andria et al. 1999; Xu et al. [2008\)](#page-8-0). In this study, $NO₃⁻$ uptake by *P. haitanensis* had a low correlation with soluble protein contents. It could be that the enhanced algal growth caused by high $CO₂$ levels accelerated the assimilation and fixation of inorganic nitrogen or the NR activity was not directly related to $NO₃⁻-N$ concentration in the culture, although $\overline{NO_3}^-$ enhanced NR activity in P. haitanensis (Xu et al. [2007](#page-8-0)).

This research showed that increased nutrient supply greatly influenced the physiological properties of P. haitanensis, especially in combination with elevated $CO₂$. The interactive effect of elevated $CO₂$ and nutrient supply has also been shown in G. lemaneiformis (Xu et al. [2008\)](#page-8-0). It also has been shown that the photosynthesis and growth of Gracilaria gaditana (Andria et al. 1999) were enhanced only under sufficient N nutrient condition. However, there must be an upper limit to the positive growth improvements brought about by increasing nutrient concentrations. The positive effects included rises in photosynthesis, pigment content, and nitrogen metabolism, but the differences in these improvements between the intermediate and high nutrient levels were not great. Moreover, excessive nutrient levels may result in the expansion of harmful blooms (Paerl [1997](#page-8-0); Lin and Lin [2000](#page-8-0); Yabe et al. [2009\)](#page-8-0). Thus, a controlled fertilization strategy should be used during P. haitanensis mariculture. Additionally, as considered by Schanz and Juon ([1983](#page-8-0)), N is the limiting factor for algal growth at NO_3 ⁻-N/PO₄³⁻-P ratios less than 10, while P is limiting at ratios greater than 20. In this study, the N/P ratios in three nutrient treatments were all greater than 20:1. It is worth to further investigate if P was a limited factor for P. haitanensis growth and photosynthesis.

In summary, the growth and physiological properties of P. haitanensis to elevated $CO₂$ levels were considerably affected by the nutrient concentrations in the seawater. When nutrient levels were insufficient, increasing the $CO₂$ concentration hardly had any effect on biomass accumulation and photosynthetic rate, whereas when nutrients were enriched, enhanced $CO₂$ levels significantly enhanced P . haitanensis photosynthesis and growth. However, the interactive effect of elevated $CO₂$ and nitrogen–phosphorus supplies on the physiological properties of P. haitanensis was limited because the processes were regulated by the $CO₂$ levels in the atmosphere and the nutrient concentrations in the seawater. Further studies need to explore whether P. haitanensis growth and photosynthesis would be further enhanced by the high nutrient level treatment combined with even higher $CO₂$ levels compared to the increase seen under the low and intermediate nutrient level treatments and the two $CO₂$ concentrations used in this study.

Acknowledgments This study was supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (41276148 and 41076094).

References

- Andria JR, Vergara JJ, Perez-Llorens JL (1999) Biochemical responses and photosynthetic performance of Gracilaria sp. (Rhodophyta) from Cádiz, Spain, cultured under different inorganic carbon and nitrogen levels. Eur J Phycol 34:497–504
- Beer S, Eshel A (1985) Determining phycoerythrin and phycocyanin concentrations in aqueous crude extracts of red algae. Aust J Mar Freshwat Res 36:785–792
- Caldeira K, Wickett ME (2003) Anthropogenic carbon and ocean pH. Nature 425:365
- Chen L, Zou D, Liu Z, Zhao G, Li F, Zheng Q (2011) Effects of different level of nitrogen and phosphorus on growth and physiological biochemical characteristics of Gracilaria lemaneiformis. Mar Environ Sci 30(2):211–215 (In Chinese with English abstract)
- Crawford NM (1995) Nitrate: nutrient and signal for plant growth. Plant Cell 7:859–868
- Dawes CJ, Koch W (1990) Physiological responses of the red algae Gracilaria verrucosa and G. tikvahiae before and after nutrient enrichment. Bull Mar Sci 46:335–344
- Fabry VJ, Seibel BA, Feely RA, Orr JC (2008) Impacts of ocean acidification on marine fauna and ecosystem processes. ICES J Mar Sci 65:414–432
- Falkowski PG, Raven JA (2007) Aquatic photosynthesis. Princeton University Press, Princeton, p 484
- Fei X (2004) Solving the coastal eutrophication problem by large scale seaweed cultivation. Hydrobiologia 512:145–151
- Fujii R, Kita M, Doe M, Iinuma Y, Oka N, Takaesu Y, Taira T, Iha M, Mizoguchi T, Cogdell RJ, Hashimoto H (2012) The pigment stoichiometry in a chlorophyll a/c photosynthetic antenna. Photosynth Res 111:165–172
- Florides GA, Christodoulides P (2009) Global warming and carbon dioxide through sciences. Environ Int 35:390–401
- Gao K, Aruga Y, Asada K, Ishihara T, Akano T, Kiyohara M (1991) Enhanced growth of the red alga Porphyra yezoensis Ueda in high CO2 concentrations. J Appl Phycol 3:356–362
- Gao K, McKinley KR (1994) Use of macroalgae for marine biomass production and $CO₂$ remediation: a review. J Appl Phycol 6:45–60
- Henley WJ (1993) Measurement and interpretation of photosynthetic light-response curves in algae in the context of photoinhibition and diel changes. J Phycol 29:729–739
- IPCC (Intergovernmental Panel on Climate Change (2007) Climate Change 2007 Synthesis Report. Cambridge University Press, New York
- Israel A, Hophy M (2002) Growth, photosynthetic properties and Rubisco activities and amounts of marine macroalgae grown under current and elevated seawater $CO₂$ concentration. Global Chang Biol 8:831–840
- Kochert G (1978) Protein determination by dye binding. In: Hellebust JA, Craigie JS (eds) Handbook of phycological methods: physiological and biochemical methods. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge, pp 92–93
- Kursar TA, Alberte RS (1983) Photosynthetic unit organization in a red alga: relationships between light-harvesting pigments and reaction centres. Plant Physiol 72:409–414
- Lewis E, Wallace DWR (1998) Program developed for $CO₂$ system calculations. ORNL/CDIAC-105. Carbon Dioxide Information Analysis Center, Oak Ridge National Laboratory, US Department of Energy, Oak Ridge, Tenessee
- Lin Y, Lin RC (2000) Research on red tide occurrences using enclosed experimental ecosystem in West Xiamen Harbor, China—relationship between nutrients and red tide occurrence. Chin J Oceanol Limnol 18:253–259
- Lohman K, Priscu JC (1992) Physiological indicators of nutrient deficiency in Cladophora (Chorophyta) in the Clark Fork of the Columbia River, Montana. J Phycol 28:443–448
- Lüthi D, Floch ML, Bereiter B, Blunier T, Barnola JM, Siegenthaler U, Raynaud D, Jouzel J, Fischer H, Kawamura K, Stocher TF (2008) High-resolution carbon dioxide concentration record 650,000-800, 000 years before present. Nature 453:379–82
- Mercado JM, Javier F, Gordillo L, Niell X, Figueroa FL (1999) Effects of different levels of $CO₂$ on photosynthesis and cell components of the red alga Porphyra leucosticte. J Appl Phycol 11:455–461
- Neori A, Chopin T, Troell M, Buschmann AH, Kraemer GP, Halling C, Shpigel M, Yarish C (2004) Integrated aquaculture: Rationale, evolution and state of the art emphasizing seaweed biofiltration in modern mariculture. Aquaculture 231:361–391
- Paerl HW (1997) Coastal eutrophication and harmful algal blooms: Importance of atmospheric deposition and groundwater as "new" nitrogen and other nutrient sources. Limnol Oceanogr 42:1154– 1165
- Parsons TR, Strickland JDH (1963) Discussion of spectrophotometric determination of marine plant pigments, with revised equations for ascertaining chlorophylls and carotenoids. J Mar Res 21:155–163
- Pedersen A, Kraemer G, Yarish C (2004) The effects of temperature and nutrient concentrations on nitrate and phosphate uptake in different species of Porphyra from Long Island Sound (USA). J Exp Mar Biol Ecol 312:235–252
- Porra RJ (2002) The chequered history of the development and use of simultaneous equations for the accurate determination of chlorophylls a and b. Photosynth Res 73:149–156
- Schanz F, Juon H (1983) Two different methods of evaluating nutrient limitation of periphyton biomassays using water from the River Rhine and eight of its tributaries. Hydrobiologia 102:187–195
- Sober HA (1974) Handbook of biochemistry, Selected Data for Molecular Biology, 2nd ed., p:J-234
- Stitt M, Krapp A (1999) The interaction between elevated carbon dioxide and nitrogen nutrient: the physiological and molecular background. Plant Cell Environ 22:583–621
- Strickland JDH, Parsons TR (1972) A practical handbook of seawater analysis. Fisheries Research Board of Canada, Ottawa, pp 71–79
- Tseng CK (1983) Common seaweeds of China. Science Press, Beijing
- Troell M, Halling C, Neori A, Chopin T, Buschmann AH, Kautsky N, Yarish C (2003) Integrated mariculture: asking the right questions. Aquaculture 226:69–90
- Wu H, Zou D, Gao K (2008) Impacts of increased atmospheric $CO₂$ concentration on photosynthesis and growth of micro- and macroalgae. Sci China C Life Sci 51:1144–1150
- Xu Z, Zou D, Zhang X, Liu S, Gao K (2007) Effect of light and different forms of nitrogen on the activity of nitrate reductase of Porphyra haitanensis (Rhodophyta). J Fish China 31(1):90-96 (In Chinese with English abstract)
- Xu Z, Zou D, Zhang X et al (2008) Effects of increased atmospheric $CO₂$ and N supply on growth, biochemical compositions and uptake of nutrients in Gracilaria lemaneiformis (Rhodophyta). Acta Ecol Sin 28:3752–3759 (In Chinese with English abstract)
- Yabe T, Ishii Y, Amano Y, Koga T, Hayashi S, Nohara S, Tatsumoto H (2009) Green tide formed by free-floating Ulva spp. at Yatsu tidal flat, Japan. Limnology 10:239–245
- Zer H, Ohad I (2003) Light, redox state, thylakoid-protein phosphorylation and signaling gene expression. Trends Biochem Sci 28:467– 470
- Zhang J, Fang J, Tang Q (2005) The contribution of shellfish and seaweed mariculture in China to the carbon cycle of coastal ecosystem. Adv Earth Sci 20(3):359–365 (In Chinese with English abstract)
- Zou D (2005) Effects of elevated atmospheric $CO₂$ on growth, photosynthesis and nitrogen metabolism in the economic brown seaweed, Hizikia fusiforme (Sargassaceae, Phaeophyta). Aquaculture 250: 726–735
- Zou D, Gao K (2002a) Effects of elevated $CO₂$ concentration on the photosynthesis and related physiological processes in marine macroalgae. Acta Ecol Sin 22(10):1750–1757 (In Chinese with English abstract)
- Zou D, Gao K (2002b) Effects of desiccation and $CO₂$ concentrations on emersed photosynthesis in Porphyra haitanensis (Bangiales, Rhodophyta), a species farmed in China. Eur J Phycol 37:587–592
- Zou D, Gao K, Xia J (2003) Photosynthetic utilization of inorganic carbon in the economic brown alga, Hizikia fusiforme (Sargassaceae) from the South China Sea. J Phycol 36:1095–1100
- Zou D, Gao K (2004) Exogenous carbon acquisition of photosynthesis in Porphyra haitanensis(Bangiales, Rhodophyta) under emersed state. Prog Nat Sci 14:138–144
- Zou D, Xia J, Yang Y (2004) Photosynthetic use of exogenous inorganic carbon in the agarophyte Gracilaria lemaneiformis (Rhodophyta). Aquaculture 237:421–431
- Zou D, Gao K (2009) Effects of elevated $CO₂$ on the red seaweed Gracilaria lemaneiformis (Gigartinales, Rhodophyta) growing at different irradiance levels. Phycologia 48:510–517
- Zou D, Gao K (2010) Physiological responses of seaweeds to elevated atmospheric $CO₂$ concentrations. Cell Orig Life Extrem Habitats Astrobiology 15:115–126
- Zou D, Gao K, Luo H (2011) Short- and long-term effects of elevated $CO₂$ on photosynthesis and respiration in the marine macroalga Hizikia fusiformis (Sargassaceae, Phaeophyta) grown at low and high N supplies. J Phycol 47:87–97