# Nitric oxide modulates redox-mediated defense in potato challenged with Phytophthora infestans

Dariusz Abramowski · Magdalena Arasimowicz-Jelonek · Karolina Izbiańska · Hanna Billert · Jolanta Floryszak-Wieczorek

Accepted: 6 May 2015 / Published online: 15 May 2015  $\odot$  Koninklijke Nederlandse Planteziektenkundige Vereniging 2015

Abstract In our experimental approach we investigated how post-infection nitric oxide-dependent signaling activated in potato leaves was related to defense against avirulent (avr) and virulent (vr) races of Phytophthora infestans. Results revealed that only in an incompatible response, early NO and superoxide  $(O_2^{\bullet})$  generation led to peroxynitrite (ONOO<sup>−</sup> ) formation and together with hydrogen peroxide  $(H_2O_2)$  production synchronized with SOD activity induced effective defense against avr pathogen. Early oxidative and nitrosative bursts triggered an imbalance in redox homeostasis in inoculated tissue. To counteract that effect, a total antioxidative capacity, ascorbate and sulfhydryl (-SH) group compounds increased both synergistically and

D. Abramowski (⊠) · J. Floryszak-Wieczorek Department of Plant Physiology, Poznan University of Life Sciences, Wolynska 35, 60 637 Poznan, Poland e-mail: d.abram@up.poznan.pl

J. Floryszak-Wieczorek e-mail: florysza@up.poznan.pl

M. Arasimowicz-Jelonek : K. Izbiańska Department of Plant Ecophysiology, Adam Mickiewicz University, Umultowska 89, 61 614 Poznan, Poland

M. Arasimowicz-Jelonek e-mail: marasimowicz@wp.pl

K. Izbiańska e-mail: karolinaizbianska@wp.pl

H. Billert

Department of Experimental Anaesthesiology, Poznan University of Medical Sciences, Sw. Marii Magdaleny 14, 60 861 Poznan, Poland e-mail: hbillert@ump.edu.pl

markedly, confirming the precise mechanism of redox re-adjustment in avr oomycete -potato interaction. Moreover, the NO-coded message was stored and converted into an enhanced total SNO pool and particular Snitrosylation of targeted proteins. Overall, we identified 104 proteins typed for S-nitrosylation in mock- or P. infestans-inoculated potato leaves. The Snitrosoproteome structure comprised a wide repertoire of proteins, i.e. defense- and redox-related. Finally, only in the incompatible interaction, NO-based signal was rewritten on the rapid *PR-1* gene and PR-2 protein activation and was tuned with a limitation of late blight disease symptoms.

Keywords Reactive nitrogen species · Reactive oxygen species . Late blight . Biotin-switch . Redox homeostasis . Biotic stress

# Introduction

During the evolutionary arms race, plants have developed many mechanisms to counteract the pathogen ingress and limit the severity of infection. Defense activation in plants is based on a complex signaling network orchestrated by reactive nitrogen (RNS) and oxygen species (ROS). Among them, nitric oxide (NO) as a free radical gas is a key player involved in diverse processes in plants, including response to multiple biotic and abiotic stress factors. A crucial role of NO in plant immune responses has been reported in different pathosystems including Solanaceae plants and

oomycete pathogens (Floryszak-Wieczorek et al. [2012](#page-21-0); Janus et al. [2013\)](#page-21-0). Noritake et al. ([1996](#page-22-0)) reported for the first time the involvement of NO in potato innate immunity and demonstrated that pre-treatment of potato tubers with an NO donor (NOC-18) induced the accumulation of rishitin, an important phytoalexin in an establishment of constitutive resistance.

Moreover, the synchronized overproduction of NO and superoxide  $(O_2^{\bullet})$  in plants may lead to the formation of peroxynitrite (ONOO<sup>−</sup> )—considered as an NO downstream signal and a potent modulator of the redox regulation in various cell signal transduction pathways. In contrast to animal system, where ONOO<sup>−</sup> executes cell death, in plants ONOO<sup>−</sup> is not indispensable in the activation of hypersensitive response (HR) (Delledonne et al. [2001](#page-21-0)). Hence, it is the co-operation of NO and active oxygen species, such as hydrogen peroxide  $(H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>)$ , induces HR in *Arabidopsis* after inoculation with Pseudomonas syringae pv. maculicola (Psm) or tomato (Pst) (Delledonne et al. [1998](#page-21-0)).

Efficient immune responses in plants are related to the early generation of highly reactive molecules with a high oxidizing potential, causing an imbalance in delicate redox homeostasis (Noctor et al. [2012\)](#page-22-0). Therefore, restoration of cell balance by redox re-adjustment processes may somehow determine future adequate re-sponse (Groß et al. [2013\)](#page-21-0). Maintaining the redox state by enzymatic and non-enzymatic apparatus in plants under stress conditions may eventually determine the efficiency of redox signaling in response to avr and vr pathogens, respectively.

Post-infection generation of NO may modify the total pool of S-nitrosothiols (SNOs) and convert NOexported bioactivity into altered metabolism and PR gene expression (Astier et al. [2011\)](#page-20-0). Interestingly, the NO-coded message may be stored in the posttranslational modification of proteins. These, in turn, may be controlled by thioredoxins system and by trans-nitrosylation reactions with low-molecular mass thiols, governed mainly by GSNO reductase activity (Chaki and Lindermayr [2014](#page-21-0)).

Protein S-nitrosylation, based on NO equivalent transfer to cysteine thiol, is a reversible and redoxdependent modification regulating the activity of an increasing repertoire of proteins. The plant Snitrosoproteome has been explored since 2005 and so far more than two hundred protein S-nitrosylation targets have been proposed (e.g. Lindermayr et al. [2005](#page-22-0); Kato et al. [2013;](#page-21-0) Vanzo et al. [2014\)](#page-22-0). Among them many await functional validation under control and stress conditions (Fares et al. [2014\)](#page-21-0). In potato more than 80 proteins were found to undergo S-nitrosylation after exposure of potato leaves and tubers to Snitrosoglutathione (Kato et al. [2013](#page-21-0)). In the presented paper, we used a modified biotin-switch technique to detect S-nitrosylation of proteins in mock- and P. infestans-inoculated potato leaves. Accumulating data suggest that storage of inactive signaling proteins and transcription factors may promote rapid immune response after de-nitrosylation and subsequent activation (Malik et al. [2011\)](#page-22-0). Thus, deciphering the mechanism of NO-based signal storage and sensing on PR gene expression are pivotal in potato resistance to P. infestans.

In this study, we investigated how potato leaves exposed to avirulent and virulent P. infestans could activate post-stress NO signaling, moving towards or compromising resistance. For this purpose early and late interactions between reactive nitrogen and oxygen species were compared in the incompatible and compatible response. Thus, we provided evidence that NOmediated changes re-written on protein S-nitrosylation were linked to redox homeostasis re-adjustment leading to PR protein accumulation and late blight disease control.

# Materials and methods

Plant material and pathogen culture

A resistant potato line, Solanum tuberosum L. cv. 'Bzura' was derived from in vitro tissue culture and kept in sterile soil in a phytochamber (16 h/8 h : day/night; 180 μmol m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup>) at 18±1 °C and 60 % relative humidity up to the stage of eight leaves.

Pathogen culture and inoculation with P. infestans

Phytophthora infestans (Mont.) de Bary avirulent 1.3.4.7.10.11 (MP946) and virulent race 1.2.3.4.6.7.10 (MP977) were obtained from the Plant Breeding and Acclimatization Institute, Research Division at Młochów, Poland. Isolate MP946 in response to the used potato line triggered hypersensitive pointed cell death (HR) identified by us earlier as TUNEL-positive (Floryszak-Wieczorek et al. [2013](#page-21-0)). Potato plants were inoculated by spraying leaves with 5 ml of an oomycete zoospore suspension at a concentration of  $1.0 \times 10^5$  per

1 ml of water and they were kept overnight at 100 % relative humidity and 18 °C and afterwards they were transferred to a growth chamber.

## Assessment of disease index

The area under disease progress was assessed on potato leaves 7 days after inoculation with P. infestans and was based on a scale from I to IV (James [1971](#page-21-0)), which represented the percentage of leaf area covered by late blight symptoms (I=1 to 9 %; II=10 to 24 %; III=25 to 49 %; IV=50 to 100 %). Disease symptoms were also determined using trypan blue staining of P. infestans mycelium according to the assay proposed by Wilson and Coffey ([1980](#page-22-0)), i.e. potato leaf discs ( $\varphi$ =2 cm) were inoculated with a zoospore suspension (40 μl). Imaging was performed by scanning leaf discs with a LIDE 210 Scanner (Canon). The blue stain corresponded to the area covered by P. infestans mycelium and was analyzed using the ImageJ 1.47v open source software (Wayne Raspand National Institutes of Health, USA).

#### Nitric oxide generation

The FL-NO fluorescence in extracts of potato leaves after inoculation was assayed spectrofluorimetrically using a selective nitric oxide sensor (CuFL) (Lim et al. [2006](#page-21-0)). The copper-complex of FL (2-{2-Chloro-6-hydroxy-5-[2-methylquinolin-8-ylamino)methyl]-3-oxo-3H-xanthen-9-l}benzoic acid) was prepared as 1 mM water stock solution according to the manufacturer's instructions (Strem Chemicals). Leaf tissue (500 mg of fresh weight) was homogenized in 2 ml of 10 mM potassium-phosphate buffer (pH 6.0). The extract was centrifuged at  $21,000 \times g$  for 30 min at 4 °C. Then, 100 μl of supernatant were immediately used for NO assay by adding CuFL to the final concentration of 2 μM. Fluorescence intensity was determined with the Fluorescence Spectrometer Perkin Elmer LS 50B (UK) using 488 and 516 nm for excitation and emission, respectively. Each value was expressed as relative fluorescence intensity [Int×g<sup>-1</sup> FW].

### Superoxide radical production

Superoxide accumulation was determined by monitoring the reduction of NBT to diformazan in the presence of  $O_2$ <sup> $-$ </sup> according to Doke ([1983](#page-21-0)). The amount of reduced NBT was measured at a wavelength of 580 nm. The reference sample consisted of the incubation mixture lacking plant material. The  $O_2$ <sup>--</sup> level was expressed as  $\Delta A_{580}$  [h<sup>-1</sup> × g<sup>-1</sup> FW].

#### Peroxynitrite formation

The level of peroxynitrite was assayed according to Huang et al. [\(2007\)](#page-21-0) using folic acid as the peroxynitrite scavenger, giving a high fluorescent emission product. Fluorescence intensity of the solution was recorded at 460 nm with the excitation wavelength set at 380 nm. The standard curve was prepared for SIN-1 (Sigma-Aldrich) as a donor of peroxynitrite.

#### Hydrogen peroxide accumulation

The concentration of  $H_2O_2$  was assayed spectrophotometrically using a titanium  $(Ti^{4+})$  method described by Becana et al. [\(1986\)](#page-21-0). Fresh leaves (0.25 g) were homogenized in 3 ml of 0.1 M potassium phosphate buffer (pH 7.8). After centrifugation  $(15,000 \times g)$  for 30 min), the supernatant was used for further assays. The reaction mixture (1.5 ml) contained 0.1 M potassium-phosphate buffer (pH 7.8), enzymatic extract (400 μl) and titanium reagent. Titanium reagent was prepared on the day of assay by mixing 0.6 mM solution of 4-(2-pyridylazo) resorcinol and 0.6 mM potassium titanium tartrate at a 1:1 ratio. The concentration of  $H_2O_2$  was determined by measuring absorbance at a wavelength of 508 nm against a calibration curve and expressed as μmol  $H_2O_2\times g^{-1}$  FW.

S-nitrosothiol total pool quantification

Total SNO content was determined by chemiluminescence using a Sievers® Nitric Oxide Analyzer NOA 280i (GE Analytical Instruments, USA) according to the procedure proposed by Chaki et al. [\(2009](#page-21-0)). The detection of SNOs was based on reductive decomposition of nitroso compounds by an iodine/triiodide mixture in the presence of copper and conducted under red safety light. Fresh leaves (0.250 g) were homogenized in Tris–HCl 0.1 M buffer pH 7.5 (1:4, w/v) containing 100 μM DTPA, 1 mM EDTA, 1 mM EGTA, 1 mM PMSF, 0.1 mM neocuproine, 3.5 % (w/v) PVPP, 0.25 % (v/v) Triton X-100 and centrifuged at  $3,000 \times g$  for 10 min. The supernatants were incubated with 10 mM NEM (N-ethylmaleimide) for 15 min at 4 °C and subsequently two aliquots were prepared for each sample. To remove nitrite one aliquot was incubated for 15 min with 10 mM sulphanilamide at 4 °C. To eliminate nitrite and decompose SNOs the next aliquot was treated with 10 mM sulphanilamide and 7.3 mM HgCl<sub>2</sub> for 15 min at 4 °C. The difference between detected signals obtained from these aliquots demonstrated the total SNO content.

#### Total sulfhydryl group content

The status of -SH groups was assayed spectrophotometrically according to Rice-Evans et al. [\(1991](#page-22-0)). Fresh leaves (250 mg) were homogenized in 2 ml of 0.1 m citrate buffer (pH 3.0). After centrifugation at  $15,000 \times g$ for 15 min, 300 μl of supernatant were collected and 10 % sodium dodecyl sulfate (SDS) and 10 mM sodium-phosphate buffer (pH 8.0) were added. Initial absorbance  $(A_0)$  was measured after mixing at a wavelength of 412 nm. Next, 5,5′-dithiobis-(2-nitrobenzoic acid) (DTNB) was added and the mixture was incubated for 1 h at 37 °C. Simultaneously, the control sample was prepared with 10 mM sodium-phosphate buffer (pH 8.0) instead of DTNB. Final absorbance  $(A_1)$  was measured at a wavelength of 412 nm. The difference in absorbance  $A_1$ - $A_0$  (after subtracting an analogous value obtained for the control sample) was a measure of –SH group content in the sample. Sulfhydryl group content was expressed as glutathione equivalents [µmol  $GSH \times g^{-1}$  FW].

# Ascorbate level

For the determination of ascorbate the spectrophotometric assay was used as described by Mukherjee and Choudhuri [\(1983\)](#page-22-0). Fresh leaves (250 mg) were homogenized in 5  $\%$  triacetic acid (TCA) (1:8; w/v) and then centrifuged at  $15,000 \times g$  for 20 min at 4 °C. To TCAdiluted supernatant 10 μl of 10 % thiourea and 500 μl of 0.28 % dinitrophenyl hydrazine in 1 M HCl (w/v) were added. After 20 min incubation at 100 °C and cooling on ice bath, 1.25 ml 80 % H2SO4 was added to stop the reaction. Absorbance was measured at 530 nm and obtained results were calculated according to the standard curve in the range  $1-12 \mu g \text{ ml}^{-1}$  ascorbate.

#### Total antioxidantive capacity

Total antioxidative capacity was based on leaf extract capacity to reduce the 2,2′-azinobis-(3-ethylbenzothiazoline-6-sulfonic acid) (ABTS) cation radical according to the method proposed by Re et al. ([1999\)](#page-22-0). Initial  $ABTS<sup>+</sup>$  solution was diluted with 0.1 M potassiumphosphate buffer (pH 7.4) to set absorbance at a wavelength of 414 nm on 1.0. Fresh leaves (250 mg) were homogenized in 2 ml of 5 % TCA and centrifuged at  $15,000 \times g$  for 15 min. The volume of 980 μl diluted  $ABTS^+$  was pipetted to a cuvette and absorbance  $(A_0)$ was measured at a wavelength of 414 nm. Next, 20 μl of the extract were added and absorbance was measured again after 10 s  $(A_2)$  and 30 min  $(A_1)$ , respectively. Fast antioxidants were calculated as  $\Delta A_{\text{fast}} = A_1 - A_0$ . Slow antioxidants were calculated as  $\Delta A_{slow} = (A_2 - A_1) - (A_2 - A_1)$  $A_1$ ). The calibration curve was prepared by successively adding 5 μl portions of 0.01 mM Trolox<sup>®</sup> to ABTS<sup>+</sup> and measuring a decrease of absorbance. The final result of total antioxidative capacity was expressed in mM Trolox×g<sup>-1</sup> FW.

# Enzyme activities

#### NADPH oxidase [EC 1.6.3.1]

The NADPH dependent  $O_2$ <sup>--</sup> generating activity was determined by a modified assay based on a reduction of XTT by  $O_2$ <sup> $-$ </sup> anions according to the method of Able et al. [\(1998\)](#page-20-0). Fresh leaves (0.5 g) were homogenized in 50 mM potassium-phosphate buffer, pH 7.0 (1:4; w/v), containing 0.1 % Triton X-100 (v/v), 1 % PVP, 0.04 % Na  $_2O_5$ , 1 mM EDTA and centrifuged at 18,000 × g for 20 min. Supernatants were passed through Sephadex G-25 gel filtration columns (Illustra NAP-10, GE Healthcare) and served as the enzyme extract. The volume of 1 ml assay reaction mixture contained 0.5 mM XTT, 0.1 mM NADPH and 30 μl enzyme extract in 50 mM Tris–HCl buffer, pH 7.5. XTT reduction was determined at 470 nm and rates of  $O_2$ <sup>--</sup> generation were calculated using an extinction coefficient for XTT of  $2.16 \times 10^4$  M<sup>-1</sup> cm<sup>-1</sup> and the enzyme activity was expressed as  $\mu$ mol O<sub>2</sub><sup>- $\times$ </sup>min<sup>-1</sup> $\times$ mg<sup>-1</sup> protein.

## Superoxide dismutase [EC 1.15.1.1.]

SOD activity was assayed by measuring SOD ability to inhibit the photochemical reduction of NBT using the method of Beauchamp and Fridovich [\(1971](#page-21-0)). Fresh leaves (250 mg) were homogenized in 0.05 M potassium-phosphate buffer, pH 7.0 (1:12; w/v), containing 1 % PVPP, 1 mM EDTA, 0.01 M NaCl and centrifuged at  $20,000 \times g$  for 30 min. The assay mixture contained 0.05 M sodium phosphate buffer (pH 7.8),

13 mM methionine, 75 μM NBT, enzymatic extract and 2 μM of riboflavin. The reaction was initiated by UV radiation (15 W) and was run for 15 min. The absorbance was measured at a wavelength of 560 nm. The amount of enzyme that caused inhibition of the NTB reduction reaction by 50 % was assumed as a unit of SOD activity ( $U \times mg^{-1}$  protein).

#### S-nitrosoglutathione reductase [EC 1.2.1.46]

The GSNOR activity was determined according to the procedure proposed by Barroso et al. ([2006](#page-21-0)) with minor modifications. Fresh leaves (500 mg) were homogenized in 0.1 M Tris–HCl buffer, pH 7.5 (1:4 w/v) containing 0.2 % Triton X-100 (v/v), 10 % glycerol (v/v), 0.1 mM EDTA, 2 mM DTT at 4 °C and centrifuged at  $27,000 \times g$  for 25 min. The supernatant was passed through Sephadex G-25 gel filtration columns (Illustra NAP-10, GE Healthcare), then immediately through Amicon Ultra 3 K Filters (Millipore) and served as the enzyme extract. The assay reaction mixture of 1 ml contained 0.5 mM EDTA, 0.2 mM NADH, 0.4 mM GSNO and 30 μl enzyme extract in 25 mM Tris–HCl buffer, pH 8.0. The reaction was held at 25 °C and initiated with an addition of GSNO (Sigma Aldrich). NADH oxidation was determined at 340 nm and rates of NADH consumed at min<sup>-1</sup> were calculated using an extinction coefficient of 6220  $M^{-1} \times cm^{-1}$ .

#### β-1,3-glucanase [EC 3.2.1.6]

The β-1,3-glucanse (PR-2) activity was determined according to the procedure proposed by Abeles and Forrence ([1970](#page-20-0)) in a colorimetric assay utilizing laminarin as a substrate. Fresh leaves (250 mg) were homogenized in 0.05 M potassium-acetate buffer, pH 5.0 (1:16; w/v), containing 0.125 g Polyclar AT and then centrifuged at  $15,000 \times g$  for 25 min. The supernatant (0.5 ml) was added to 0.5 ml 2  $\%$  (w/v) laminarin aqueous solution and was incubated for 2 h at 50 °C. After stopping the reaction and dilution (1 : 10), optical density was read at 500 nm. The  $\beta$ -1,3-glucanase activity was determined as the level of reducing sugars produced and served as glucose equivalents [µmol glucose× min−<sup>1</sup> ×mg−<sup>1</sup> protein]; finally PR-2 activity was expressed as % of control.

### Chitinase [EC 3.2.1.14]

The chitinase (PR-3) activity was determined in a colorimetric assay utilizing CM–Chitin–RVB (LOEWE Biochemica) as a substrate (Pauly et al. [1999](#page-22-0)). Fresh leaves (250 mg) were homogenized in 0.05 M potassium-acetate buffer, pH 5.0 (1:16;  $w/v$ ), and then centrifuged at  $10,000 \times g$  for 10 min. The volume of 0.2 ml of the enzymatic fraction was added to 0.2 ml CM–Chitin–RVB ( $2 \text{ mg} \times \text{ml}^{-1}$ ) and 0.4 ml of homogenization buffer. Then the reaction mixture was incubated for 1 h at 37  $\degree$ C and stopped by adding 0.2 ml 2 M HCl. The reaction mixture was centrifuged at  $10,000 \times g$  for 5 min and the supernatant was collected to measure optical density at 550 nm. Chitinase activity was calculated according to the standard curve prepared with the use of recombinant Streptomyces griseus chitinase at 0.005–0.130 mU (Sigma-Aldrich). Enzyme activity was expressed as % of control.

#### Gene expression measurement

The RNAwas isolated from 150 mg of frozen leaf using TriReagent® (Sigma) according to the method of Chomczynski and Sacchi ([1987](#page-21-0)). The obtained RNA was purified with the use of a Deoxyribonuclease I Kit (Sigma). For the reverse transcription 1 μl of RNA from every experimental variant was processed with a RevertAid™ Reverse Transcriptase Kit (Thermo Scientific) according to the manufacturer's instructions. Real-time PCR was performed on a Rotor Gene 6000 Thermocycler (Corbett Life Sciences). The reaction mixture contained 0.1 μM of each primer, 1 μl of  $5\times$ diluted cDNA, 10 μl of the Power SYBR® Green PCR Master mix (Applied Biosystems) and DEPC-treated water to the total volume of 20 μl. The real-time PCR reaction conditions included an initial 5-min denaturation at 95 °C, followed by 55 cycles consisting of 10 s at 95 °C, 20 s at 53 °C and 30 s at 72 °C. The reaction was finalized by denaturation at a temperature rising from 72 to 95 °C by one degree at every 5 s. Reaction specificity was confirmed by the occurrence of one peak in the melting curve analysis. PR-1 primers used in realtime detection were as follows:

F: CCGCGTTGAGCTGGGGGAAA, R: GAGCTG GGGACTGCAGGATGC  $(T_m=53 \text{ °C})$ . The data were normalized to the reference gene encoding elongation factor (ef1α, AB061263; F: ATTGGAAACGGATATG CTCCA, R: TCCTTACCTGAACGCCTGTCA,  $T_m=$ 

53 °C). All used primers were designed using Primer-BLAST (Ye et al. [2012](#page-23-0)). The  $C_t$  values were determined with the use of a Real-time PCR Miner (Zhao and Fernald [2005](#page-23-0)) and the relative gene expression was calculated with the use of efficiency corrected calculation models presented by Pfaffl ([2001](#page-22-0)).

# Detection of endogenously S-nitrosylated proteins in potato leaves by the modified biotin-switch technique

The in vivo S-nitrosylated proteins were detected with the use of the modified biotin-switch technique (Lindermayr et al. [2005;](#page-22-0) Vanzo et al. [2014](#page-22-0)). Briefly, 250 mg of frozen leaf powder was mixed with 1 ml of HENT buffer containing 100 mM HEPES-NaOH pH 7.4, 10 mM EDTA, 0.1 mM neocuproine and  $1\%$  (v/v) Triton X-100. After 15 min incubation the mixture was centrifuged at 4 °C for 10 min at  $12,000 \times g$ . Protein concentration was measured using Bradford reagent and was adjusted to 1  $\mu$ g× $\mu$ l of HEN buffer, containing cOmplete™ protease inhibitor cocktail tablets (Roche). The blocking step was performed with the use of four volumes of freshly prepared HENS buffer (225 mM HEPES-NaOH pH 7.2, 0.9 mM EDTA, 0.1 mM Neocuproine, 2.5 % (w/v) SDS) and 30 mM NEM. Then the extracts were incubated at 37 °C for 30 min. After incubation excess blocking agent was removed by ice-cold acetone precipitation. The pellet was resuspended in 0.1 ml HENS buffer (without NEM) per 1 mg of protein. Reduction of –SNOs and simultaneous biotinylation were performed using 1 mM biotin-HPDP (EZ-LinkTM Biotin-HPDP; Thermo scientific) and 3 mM reductant sinapinic acid (Sigma-Aldrich) for 1 h at 25 °C in darkness. Next, the precipitation using icecold acetone was conducted and the obtained pellets were re-suspended in non-reducing sample buffer and subjected to electrophoresis and Western blot analysis. Series of controls were performed including the positive signal control (omitting the blocking step) and the falsepositive signal (omitting the biotinylation step). Electrophoresis was performed in non-reducing SDS-PAGE on gradient 4-20 % polyacrylamide gels (Mini-PROTEAN® Precast Gels, Biorad) followed by electrotransfer to the PFDF membrane (Millipore). The membrane was blocked using 1 % bovine serum albumin for 1 h, and the blots were then incubated with the anti-biotin mouse monoclonal antibody conjugated with alkaline-phosphatase (dilution 1:25000; Sigma-Aldrich) for 24 h. Further, the protein bands were visualized

using 5-bromo-4-chloro-3-indolyl phosphate and nitro blue tetrazolium (SigmaFast BCIP, Sigma-Aldrich) according to the manufacturer's instructions.

### Identification of proteins using mass spectrometry

Identification and analyses of proteins were performed with the use of a liquid chromatograph coupled with a mass spectrometer at the Mass Spectrometry Laboratory, the Institute of Biochemistry and Biophysics, the Polish Academy of Sciences. Protein bands were excised from the PVDF membrane and placed in 100 mM ammonium carbonate (pH 8.0) and directly subjected to the digestion procedure (overnight with 10 ng ×  $\mu$ <sup>-1</sup> trypsin). After simultaneous reduction with 10 mM DTT (30 min at 56 °C) and alkylation with iodoacetamide (in darkness for 45 min at room temperature) the resulting peptide mixtures were concentrated and desalted on a RP-C18 pre-column (Waters). Further peptide separation was run on a nano- Ultra Performance Liquid Chromatography (UPLC) RP-C18 column (Waters, BEH130 C18 column, 75 μm i.d., 250 mm long) of a nanoACQUITY UPLC system, using a 45-min linear acetonitrile gradient. The column outlet was directly coupled to the Electrospray ionization (ESI) ion source of the Orbitrap Velos type mass spectrometer (Thermo), working in the regime of data dependent on the MS to MS/MS switch with HCD type peptide fragmentation. An electrospray voltage of 1.5 kV was used. Raw data files were pre-processed with the Mascot Distiller software (version 2.4.2.0, MatrixScience). The obtained peptide masses and fragmentation spectra were matched to the National Center Biotechnology Information (NCBI) nonredundant database (37425594 sequences; 13257553858 residues) with a Viridiplantae filter (1760563 sequences) using the Mascot search engine (Mascot Daemon v. 2.4.0, Mascot Server v. 2.4.1, MatrixScience). The following search parameters were applied: enzyme specificity was set to semiTrypsin, peptide mass tolerance to  $\pm 30$  ppm and fragment mass tolerance to $\pm 0.1$  Da. The protein mass was left unrestricted, while mass values were set as monoisotopic with two missed cleavages being allowed. Alkylation of cysteine by carbamidomethylation, oxidation of methionine and carboxymethylation on lysine were set as a variable modification.

#### Statistical analysis

All results were based on at least three independent experiments, each with at least three biological replicates. Analysis of variance was conducted and the least significant differences (LSD) between means were determined using Tukey's test at a level of significance  $P=$ 0.05. SigmaPlot 11.0 (Systat) was used to perform statistical tests. Randomization was performed during collection of samples in histochemical assay of trypan blue staining.

## Results

# Generation of reactive nitrogen and oxygen species in potato leaves exposed to P. infestans

Semi-quantitative measurement of NO generation in potato leaves after inoculation was performed using the NO-selective fluorescent probe copper-complex of FL (Cu-FL). The avirulent race triggered an enhanced NO generation in potato leaves early after inoculation, with the maximum overproduction at 3 hpi (Fig. [1a](#page-7-0)). In contrast, virulent P. infestans provoked minor changes in the NO status similar to that of the mock-inoculated leaves. Augmented NO synthesis in avr P. infestansinoculated potato was accompanied by enhanced  $O_2$ <sup>\*</sup> generation (Fig. [1b\)](#page-7-0). Both races of the pathogen caused a sustained increase of the  $O_2$ <sup> $\sim$ </sup> level with the similar kinetics. Synchronized generations of NO and  $O_2$ <sup>\*</sup> in the avr P. infestans-potato system increased the formation of peroxynitrite (ONOO<sup>−</sup> ) at 3 hpi (Fig. [1c](#page-7-0)). In turn, in the compatible interaction the kinetics of ONOO<sup>−</sup> formation showed a late accumulation at 24 hpi (Fig. [1c\)](#page-7-0). Boosted generation of  $O_2$ <sup>+</sup> could be a result of controlled  $O_2$ <sup>\*</sup> synthesis by NADPH oxidase. Hence, in the incompatible interaction the activity of NADPH oxidase was strongly induced from 1 hpi, reaching a two-fold increase in relation to uninoculated leaves (Fig. [1d\)](#page-7-0). In the compatible interaction an upregulation of NADPH oxidase was recorded later from 3 hpi (Fig. [1d](#page-7-0)). It was also found that avr P. infestans caused a considerably enhanced  $H_2O_2$  overproduction in each tested time-point after inoculation (Fig. [1e](#page-7-0)), whereas in the compatible interaction only moderate changes were recorded. Moreover, in the incompatible interaction the above-mentioned changes in  $H_2O_2$  content correlated in the time-dependent manner with the

activity of superoxide dismutase (SOD). SOD was significantly up-regulated throughout the whole analyzed 24-h-period, reaching a steady two-times higher level in relation to healthy leaves (Fig. [1f\)](#page-7-0).

### Metabolic status of NO in potato leaves after inoculation

To gain further insight into NO-dependent down-stream signaling in potato, the S-nitrosothiols (SNOs) total pool was analyzed using precise chemiluminescence assay. An increased storage of the NO message in the total SNOs content was observed in avr P. infestans-treated potato from 1 hpi, attaining the highest level at 24 hpi (Fig. [2a](#page-8-0)). In contrast, the SNO pool remained unchanged in potato inoculated with the virulent race of the pathogen. The SNO level is prone to be regulated by GSNO reductase, capable of GSNO turn-over and affecting trans-nitrosylation processes. GSNOR activity was only moderately down-regulated in *avr P*. infestans-inoculated leaves (Fig. [2b\)](#page-8-0). However, it must be stated that a lack of strong time-dependent correlation was found between GSNOR activity and the SNO pool. Furthermore, the complex management of NO-initiated pathway involves changes in S-nitrosoproteome structure. By performing the modified biotin-switch assay coupled to quantitative LC-MS/MS analysis, 104 protein targets of S-nitrosylation in potato were proposed. Supplementary Table [1](#page-14-0) presents a list of in vivo Snitrosylated proteins in mock- and P. infestans-treated potato leaves. Proteins typed for S-nitrosylation were clustered into 5 main functional groups (Fig. 6d [Appendix\)](#page-20-0). The most abundant cluster of 'metabolic enzymes' involved 44 % of the identified Snitrosoproteome. 'Photosynthesis-involved proteins' comprising proteins orchestrating photosynthetic light reactions and the Calvin-Benson cycle were the second most intensely represented (24 %). The following less frequent groups included 'redox-related proteins' and 'defense-related proteins' each representing 6 % of the total number of modified proteins, respectively. Approx. 60 % of identified S-nitrosylation candidates have not been presented so far as potential members of the Snitrosoproteome in plants and only 17 of them were reported earlier as S-nitrosylation targets in potato leaves and tubers supplied with GSNO (Kato et al. [2013](#page-21-0)). Since S-nitrosylation is under strong control of redox status of the cell, antioxidative enzymatic and non-enzymatic changes have been recorded upon P. infestans inoculation.

<span id="page-7-0"></span>

Fig. 1 The effect of P. infestans inoculation on potato leaves cv. 'Bzura': a nitric oxide (NO) and **b** superoxide radical  $(O_2$ <sup>+</sup>) generation, c formation of peroxynitrite (ONOO<sup>−</sup> ), d activity of NADPH oxidase (NOX), e accumulation of hydrogen peroxide

 $(H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>)$ , **f** activity of superoxide dismutase (SOD), \* significantly different from mock-inoculated potato leaves,  $P < 0.05$ . Values represent the average of data±SD of three independent experiments

<span id="page-8-0"></span>

Fig. 2 The effect of *P. infestans* inoculation on potato leaves cv. 'Bzura': a activity of GSNO reductase (GSNOR), b total content of S-nitrosothiols (SNOs) determined by chemiluminescence assay using Sievers® Nitric Oxide Analyzer NOA 280i, \*

Redox balance in inoculated leaves

Pathogens could trigger an imbalance in redox homeostasis in host-plant cells to maximize the opportunity of colonization. Therefore, selected nonenzymatic and enzymatic components of the redox maintenance apparatus were analyzed in potato leaves. In the incompatible interaction with P. infestans the total content of free sulfhydryl groups (-SH) (Fig. [3a\)](#page-9-0) and ascorbate (Fig. [3b](#page-9-0)) increased notably at the early phase (1-3 hpi). It reached an approximately 2-fold and 3-fold higher concentration in relation to mock-inoculated and vr P. infestans-treated leaves, respectively. The early shift into the reductive potential was also confirmed by the expanded total antioxidative capacity referred to both the slow (Fig. [3c\)](#page-9-0) and the fast (Fig. [3d\)](#page-9-0) antioxidants. Thus, non-enzymatic components of the redox apparatus had a significant impact on the redox state re-adjustment towards the reductive potential in potato after ROS and RNS generation (Fig. [1a, b, c\)](#page-7-0).

Pathogenesis-related protein up-regulation and disease progress

Late blight disease spots developed mainly after colonization with the virulent race of P. infestans. Severe foliar damage was observed in more than 75 % of leaves at 7 dpi (Fig. [4d](#page-10-0)) and the oomycete mycelium covered more



significantly different from mock-inoculated potato leaves,  $P<0.05$ . Values represent the average of data $\pm$ SD of three independent experiments

than 20 % of leaf discs at 5 dpi (Fig. 5 [Appendix\)](#page-20-0). In avr P. infestans-treated leaves disease spots were smaller than 3 % of total area. The reduced disease symptoms corresponded to the enhanced defense responses in avr P. infestans-inoculated potato. Semi-quantitative real time RT-PCR revealed that PR-1 gene expression was rapidly activated upon inoculation with avr P. infestans at the early phase (10-fold increase) and the mRNA level remained multiplied till 24 hpi (Fig. [4a\)](#page-10-0). In the compatible interaction the robust PR-1 gene transcript accumulation was recorded solely at the late phase at 24 hpi. However, the PR-1 mRNA level raised gradually since 3 hpi. The indication of *PR-1* gene was accompanied by an effectively up-regulated β-1,3-glucanase activity (PR-2) (Fig. [4b](#page-10-0)). A less intense activation of PR-2 was found in the compatible interaction after pathogen ingress. In turn, chitinase (PR-3) activity was induced with a distinct magnitude at 3 hpi in both interactions (Fig. [4c](#page-10-0)), showing slight contributions to the effective defense against oomycete pathogens. The comparison of spatiotemporal PR-1 and PR-2 analyses revealed stronger induction of the aforementioned PRs in response to the avirulent rather than the virulent race of P. infestans.

# Discussion

In order to gain further insight into the NO-mediated multilevel interaction leading to potato immune

<span id="page-9-0"></span>

Fig. 3 The effect of P. infestans inoculation on redox state readjustments in potato leaves cv. 'Bzura': a total sulfhydryl (–SH) group content, b ascorbate concentration, c slow and d fast antioxidants referred to as total antioxidant capacity, \* significantly



different from mock-inoculated potato leaves,  $P<0.05$ . Values represent the average of data±SD of three independent experiments

response, two P. infestans races were used to induce the incompatible and compatible interaction, respectively. The activated defense signaling network was potentially NO-initiated and ranged from the Snitrosylation of proteins to the execution of PR proteins storage. To date, NO functions in plants are far from being fully described. However, much progress has been achieved in the understanding of NO pleiotropic effects in plant system, considering the last two decades of intensive research. Since NO biosynthesis remains unknown, a myriad of its down-stream effects was found to be affected by the cellular redox state. Therefore, the maintenance of the redox state in inoculated tissue appeared to

have a pivotal role in the immune response establishment in potato.

# P. infestans triggered NO burst in potato

Since NO burst is one of the first events observed after pathogen ingress, it is crucial to execute NO-dependent message to immune response in plants. At first, in the presented study we showed that potato leaves have had generated NO following inoculation with the avirulent race of P. infestans. In turn, the virulent race failed to initiate an early NO production. Primary NO overproduction was shown to be specific for the incompatibility of potato and the attacker. Many reports showed

<span id="page-10-0"></span>

Fig. 4 The effect of *P. infestans* inoculation on potato leaves cv. 'Bzura': a time-course of PR-1 gene expression upon inoculation using real-time RT-PCR semi-quantitative analysis, b relative activity of PR-2 protein (β-1,3-glucanase), c relative activity of PR-3

that NO action is dependent on its concentration and spatial production patterns (Besson-Bard et al. [2008](#page-21-0); Kovacs and Lindermayr [2013\)](#page-21-0). Others represented the standpoint that an early spatiotemporal NO burst is restricted to the incompatible interaction (Bennett et al. [2005](#page-21-0); Mur et al. [2005](#page-22-0)). On this basis, we attempt to record NO-driven down-stream effects in both interactions. The attention was given to peroxynitrite and SNOs. A rapid formation of ONOO<sup>−</sup> as a result of the equimolar reaction of NO and  $O_2$ <sup>+</sup> in potato leaves treated with the avirulent race of pathogen indirectly indicated the activation of signaling towards resistance (Arasimowicz-Jelonek and Floryszak-Wieczorek [2011\)](#page-20-0). However, Delledonne et al. ([2001](#page-21-0)) documented that ONOO<sup>−</sup> is not a direct executor of HR in plants unlike



protein (chitinase), d index of disease development at 7 dpi, \* significantly different from mock-inoculated potato leaves,  $P<0.05$ . Values represent the average of data $\pm$ SD of at least three independent experiments

in the animal system. It is worth noting that our previous findings revealed that in potato-P. infestans system oxidative burst has occurred since first hpi in both interactions. The difference between these responses has been observed afterwards, between 6 and 10 hpi (Floryszak-Wieczorek et al. [2011](#page-21-0)). The superoxide radical as the main component of oxidative burst may be produced in a controlled manner by plasma membrane NADPH oxidase (Noirot et al. [2014](#page-22-0)). In the presented study total NADPH oxidase activity was shown to be up-regulated since 1 hpi in *avr P*. infestans-treated leaves, what comprehensively correlated with the boosted  $O_2$  accumulation. In turn, an increase in NADPH oxidase activity was weaker and occurred later in vr P. infestans-inoculated leaves. Additionally, it needs to be emphasized that  $H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>$  accumulation governed by SOD activity increased greatly only in the incompatible interaction.

Obtained data are in line with previous findings that HR in soybean cells was activated after NO cooperation with  $H_2O_2$  generated from  $O_2$ <sup>\*</sup> by superoxide dismutase (De Stefano et al. [2006\)](#page-22-0). These results revealed that in tobacco NO and  $H_2O_2$  can act independently or in synergy and can share common components in regulating gene expression during defense responses in and outside the cell death program.

Collectively, these data highlighted the involvement of NO burst in the induction of redox changes in avr P. infestans-treated leaves. Further, the up-regulation of NADPH oxidase and the controlled  $O_2$ <sup>\*</sup> production were tuned with SOD-mediated dismutation of  $O_2$ <sup>\*</sup> to  $H<sub>2</sub>O<sub>2</sub>$  triggering, in combination with NO, the cell death in potato inoculated leaves.

#### Redox re-adjustments determined resistance

Since an efficient immune response of potato leaves to P. infestans necessitates rapid changes in reactive nitrogen and oxygen species, an imbalance in redox homeostasis may occur as a result of these changes. To counteract oxidative stress, a spatiotemporally synchronized accumulation of non-enzymatic and enzymatic antioxidants must be employed (Groß et al. [2013\)](#page-21-0). The cytoprotective effect of NO was reported to be linked to the NO-dependent regulation of the redox state and the controlling of ROS generation (Arasimowicz-Jelonek et al. [2014a,](#page-20-0) [b](#page-20-0)). During the incompatible response of potato leaves an enhanced accumulation of ascorbate and total thiol content was observed early after pathogen recognition (1-6 hpi). This effect was triggered only in avr P. infestans-inoculated leaves, indicating fast and precisely controlled redox state re-adjustment. Markedly increased total antioxidative capacity recorded after inoculation with avr P. infestans was a symptom of the shifted redox potential to more reductive conditions. Interestingly, Arabidopsis pad2-1 mutants, with an insufficient GSH supply, were unable to activate defense against the biotrophic Phytophthora brassicae or bacterial pathogen Pseudomonas syringae (Dubreuil-Maurizi et al. [2011](#page-21-0)). In turn, 6 phosphogluconolactonase 3 knock-down mutants of Arabidopsis (pgl3) with an enhanced PRs gene expression and a decreased redox potential possessed the constitutive activation of immune responses against

# P. syringae pv. maculicola and Hyaloperonospora arabidopsidis Noco2 (Xiong et al. [2009\)](#page-22-0).

Summarizing, the ability of potato plants to control the redox state precisely under the pathogen pressure may modify the level of susceptibility/resistance to P. infestans. The implementation of redox readjustment processes was highly relevant to the type of interplay between potato and an oomycete pathogen. In fact, the antioxidative counteractions to redox imbalance impinged on the efficiency of defense expression in potato.

#### Nitric oxide-mediated S-nitrosylation

Considering NO bioactivity in plants, emphasis must be given to the storage of NO-coded message into the total SNO pool and S-nitrosylation of targeted proteins. The presence of NO-sensitive reactive Cys residues in lowand high-molecular mass molecules may serve as the molecular switch of NO functions in plants (Spadaro et al. [2010\)](#page-22-0). Since particular Cys residues are sensitive to both the oxidative status of the cell and NO generation, they may combine two pathways that orchestrate early signaling, i.e. NO- and ROS-dependent (Yu et al. [2014](#page-23-0)). An augmented NO production in potato inoculated with the avirulent pathogen was tuned in time with a significant rise in the SNO pool (from 1 hpi). By contrast, no significant changes were noted in the compatible response. In proteins Cys may be a direct target of NO itself albeit NO may act indirectly via transnitrosylation reactions (Yu et al. [2014](#page-23-0)). Overall, the covalent attachment of NO to –SH groups of cysteine residues in protein and non-protein thiols may serve as a reversible redox-based modification, responsible for the execution of the NO-converted signal to a physiological response in plants (Spadaro et al. [2010\)](#page-22-0). S-nitrosylation may modulate the activity of enzymes, the localization of proteins and the likelihood of interactions with other high-molecular mass molecules. Emerging evidence from particular studies indicate that an elevated SNO formation promoted plant resistance to a pathogen (Rustérucci et al. [2007\)](#page-22-0). However, the accumulation of SNOs above a certain threshold may affect the SAsignaling pathway by a negative feedback loop, promoting NPR1 oligomerization in the cytoplasm and the suppression of defense (Malik et al. [2011\)](#page-22-0). Therefore, SNO turnover controlled by an array of processes i.e. trans-nitrosylation reactions and enzymatic decomposition may be critical in the defense execution. Often, the total SNO pool reflects the change of GSNO level – a mobile reservoir of NO bioactivity in plants. Discrepancies in GSNO content found in diverse pathosystem and GSNO localization must be kept in mind and may be a result of GSNOR distribution and different activity in plant cell compartments, tissues and organs (Corpas et al. [2013](#page-21-0)). For example, the tendency towards GSNO allocation in epidermal cells of sunflower plants was observed after inoculation with avr Plasmopara halstedii (Chaki et al. [2009](#page-21-0)). Emphasizing the role of denitrosylation processes, it must be stated that GSNOR is mainly involved in the breakdown of GSNO and currently limited information concerns other cellular specific SNO reductases or SNO lyases (Malik et al. [2011\)](#page-22-0). Nevertheless, the excessive SNOs promoted the susceptibility of plants (Feechan et al. [2005](#page-21-0)). An emerging aspect of SNOs turn-over is the existence of specific forms of de-nitrosylation and the identification of cellular machinery to fine-tune SNOs pool.

It is generally accepted that changes in SNO contents, mediated by GSNO reductase, together with ROS governed by NADPH oxidase facilitated the immune promoting activity (Yun et al. [2011\)](#page-23-0). However, in the presented study the postinfection GSNOR activity did not interfere entirely with the kinetics of SNO formation. The importance of GSNO reductase as a potato immune response controller was also highlighted in our previous reports concerning systemic acquired resistance and cross-tolerance of potato (Floryszak-Wieczorek et al. [2012;](#page-21-0) Janus et al. [2013](#page-21-0); Arasimowicz-Jelonek et al. [2014a](#page-20-0), [b](#page-20-0)). As noted before, NO exported bioactivity was exhibited as an enhanced SNO storage at a relatively low threshold, governed temporarily by GSNOR activity.

One of the basic requirements of signal generation and transduction must be its transient character, enabling the reverse of signaling when it is required. Therefore, Cys residues may serve as an ideal substrate for targeted signaling since their NO-based modifications are mostly reversible and, as mentioned previously, exclusively redox-dependent (Spadaro et al. [2010](#page-22-0)).

Nitric oxide-mediated SNO formation influences rearrangements in the S-nitrosoproteome structure in physiological timelines and stress conditions (Fares et al. [2014\)](#page-21-0). By performing the biotin-switch technique coupled with LC-MS/MS analysis, 104 proteins typed for S-nitrosylation were found in potato leaves at a decisive time-point after pathogen ingress (3 hpi). The presented list of potato S-nitrosylation targets (Table 1

[Appendix](#page-20-0)) contains only in vivo S-nitrosylated proteins identified in mock and *P. infestans* challenge inoculated potato leaves. So far, a limited repertoire of functionally described S-nitrosylated proteins was uncovered in plants. Proteins subjected to S-nitrosylation presented in this study orchestrate an ample scope of cellular processes, including primary and secondary metabolism, redox maintenance and defense-related changes. Since available methods of SNOs identification in proteins are imperfect, we presented the supplemental list of potential S-nitrosylation targets in potato. Many among identified proteins are abundant in plant system and have been indicated as NO targets in different plant species. In the presented study, both CA and StSABP2 isoforms were found to be S-nitrosylation targets in potato challenged with P. infestans. It is worth noting that the attachment of NO to the cysteine residue of carbonic anhydrase was earlier recorded in GSNOtreated potato (Kato et al. [2013](#page-21-0)). Additionally, the role of CA in plant immunity is possibly linked to the lipidbase signaling and JA-responsive gene down-regulation (Hoang and Chapman [2002\)](#page-21-0). These changes are believed to be profound in the relevant disease resistance development in plants. As documented before, the transfer of NO moiety to a specific Cys<sup>280</sup> of AtSABP3 led to the inhibition of its carbonic anhydrase activity as well as blocked the ability of the protein to bind SA in an NO dose-dependent manner (Wang et al. [2008b](#page-22-0)). Both functions of AtSABP3 are essential in the establishment of Arabidopsis defense against virulent bacterial pathogens PstDC3000, so that their inhibition by S-nitrosylation potentially contributed to the negative feedback loop, modulating SA-dependent plant immune responses. We would like to indicate that in potato exposed to P. infestans, thioredoxin M4 and 2-Cys peroxiredoxin – important players in the thioredoxin/thioredoxin reductase system, also undergo S-nitrosylation (Lindermayr et al. [2005;](#page-22-0) Romero-Puertas et al. [2007;](#page-22-0) Kato et al. [2013\)](#page-21-0). In turn, superoxide dismutase as the following redox-related enzyme reported herein as Snitrosylation target confirmed the findings of Kato et al. [\(2013\)](#page-21-0). SOD activity has been believed to raise upon Snitrosylation (Sehrawat et al. [2013](#page-22-0)) and that could potentially explain the up-regulation of SOD in the incompatible interaction of potato and P. infestans. So far, Snitrosylation of SOD was presented in Arabidopsis (Lindermayr et al. [2005\)](#page-22-0), Kalanchoe pinnata (Abat et al. [2008\)](#page-20-0), citrus plants (Tanou et al. [2010\)](#page-22-0) and potato (Kato et al. [2013\)](#page-21-0). As well, the functional validation of

SOD S-nitrosylation was performed only in *Brassica* juncea (Sehrawat et al. [2013](#page-22-0)). Intriguingly, recently SOD has been reported to undergo inhibition by nitration of Tyr $^{63}$  (Holzmeister et al. [2015](#page-21-0)).

From 104 presented S-nitrosylation candidates in the potato-P. infestans system, 17 were identified by us as nitration targets (unpublished data). The above mentioned list included e.g, two isoforms of carbonic anhydrase, chitinase, subtilisin-like protease-like, 2- Cys peroxiredoxin A, Rubisco small and large subunits, aldolase and chloroplast manganese stabilizing protein. This finding underpins the importance of dual protein regulation by Cys S-nitrosylation and Tyr residue nitration. It may serve as a basis of NO-based re-programming of the cell physiological status.

#### Hallmarks of potato defense

In our experimental approach, treatment of potato with avr P. infestans has activated PR-1 and PR-2, the key indicators of plant defense against pathogens at the level of transcript accumulation and protein activity up-regulation, respectively. These findings are in line with previous reports concerning the compatible and incompatible interaction of plants and hemibiotrophic pathogens (Vleeshouwers et al. [2000](#page-22-0); Wang et al. [2008a](#page-22-0)). Early upregulation of the PR-1 gene and  $β-1,3$ -glucanase were restricted only to the incompatible interaction. Activation of the PR-1 gene depends on the signaling cascade often initiated by the NO burst and is orchestrated by salicylic acid bioactivity and redox state readjustments (Tada et al. [2008\)](#page-22-0). As it was reported previously PR-2 activation at the transcript accumulation and protein activity level is likewise a part of potato defense against P. infestans (Arasimowicz-Jelonek et al. [2014a,](#page-20-0) [b](#page-20-0)). However, the precise mode of action accompanying NO-mediated PR gene expression in potato is far from being resolved and needs further research. Nevertheless, PRs became fully operational at the early phase after inoculation. The delayed timing of PR-1 expression (starting at 24 hpi) indicated insufficient defense activation against the virulent race of the pathogen. Wang et al. [\(2008a\)](#page-22-0) demonstrated that a less virulent US-1 genotype of *P. infestans* caused the accumulation of the *PR-1* gene transcript earlier, from 8 hpi, in relation to the new more aggressive US-8 linage. Aggressive race induced the late gene up-regulation (at 48 hpi). In turn, only a slight increase of PR-3 activity in potato leaves was observed at 3 hpi, suggesting a less evident role of this enzyme in response to pathogens lacking chitin in cell walls. Consequently, in the light of presented findings, it may be concluded that mainly PR-1 and PR-2 effectively participated in the limiting of late blight disease.

### Concluding remarks

The cross-talk of ROS- and RNS-based signaling is largely linked with redox-dependent modification on targeted cysteines in proteins, which may be considered as redox-switches of immune responses in potato leaves. So far, many protein targets were found to be subjected to S-nitrosylation, but still the precise mechanism is not fully understood and needs further research. Moreover, special emphasis must be given to perform a functional analysis of S-nitrosylated proteins engaged in nonmodel plant resistance, i.e. potato challenged by a pathogen. In consequence, the apprehension of NO fate is essential to warrant full understanding of NO influence on defense-orientated signaling in plants.

It is also true that currently we have no information as to whether and to what extent NO mediates P. infestans pathogenicity. Generally it is known that P. infestans is thought to accomplish colonization by molecular reprograming of the host defense strategy specifically by introducing an array of effectors (Vleeshouwers and Oliver [2014\)](#page-22-0). According to Arasimowicz-Jelonek and Floryszak-Wieczorek ([2014\)](#page-20-0), the pathogen metabolic equipment to reset the NO signal and counteract nitrosative stress not only plays a role as a modulator of the host immune response, but might also be implicated in virulence. It is time to enrich our knowledge on P. infestans NO sensing and signaling, which may complete our understanding of pathogen-triggered re-programing of plant metabolism, moving elementarily the host-organism towards resistance or susceptibility.

Acknowledgments This study was funded from the National Science Centre (Preludium - grant number 2011/03/ N/NZ9/00290). D. Abramowski would like to thank Dr. Christian Lindermayr, Institute of Biochemical Plant Pathology, Helmholtz Zentrum München, for advice in the biotinswitch assay.

Conflict of Interest The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.

# <span id="page-14-0"></span>Appendixes





#### Table 1 (continued)



# Eur J Plant Pathol (2015) 143:237–260 253

# Table 1 (continued)



# Table 1 (continued)



Table 1 (continued)

no.	Band Protein	Seq. identifier	Organism		Score Mass	Function
16	salicylic acid-binding protein 2		565390197 Solanum tuberosum <sup>a</sup>	94		16493 Defense-related proteins
16	Rubber elongation factor protein		132270 Hevea brasiliensis	161	14713	Others
16	chlorophyll a-b binding protein CP26, chloroplastic-like <sup>f</sup>		565382242 Solanum tuberosum <sup>a</sup>	401		30438 Photosynthesis- involved proteins
16	chlorophyll a-b binding protein 3C-likeb		413968456 Solanum tuberosum	247		25059 Photosynthesis- involved proteins
16	triosephosphate isomerase cytosolic isoform <sup>b,,e,f</sup>		565400366 Solanum tuberosum <sup>a</sup>	193		27195 Metabolic enzymes
16	triosephosphate isomerase, chloroplastic-like		565403781 Solanum tuberosum <sup>a</sup>	174		34208 Metabolic enzymes
17	Photosystem I reaction center subunit II, chloroplastic	565380579	Solanum tuberosum <sup>a</sup>	379		22838 Photosynthesis- involved proteins
17	putative Rieske Fe-S protein precursor <sup>d</sup>		413968462 Solanum tuberosum	58		24591 Others
18	cytochrome b6-f complex iron-sulfur subunit, chloroplastic		568214334 Solanum tuberosum	173	24527	Metabolic enzymes
18	aspartic proteinase inhibitor / Kunitz-type protease inhibitor precursor <sup>b,c</sup>		20386375 Solanum tuberosum	100		24339 Metabolic enzymes
18	cytochrome b6/f complex subunit IV	91209018	Solanum bulbocastanum	91	17507	Metabolic enzymes
18	nucleoside diphosphate kinase 2, chloroplastic-like		565361307 Solanum tuberosum <sup>a</sup>	91	24875	Others
18	peptidylprolyl isomerase		210062274 Solanum tuberosum <sup>a</sup>	76		27870 Metabolic enzymes

a Predicted sequence

 $<sup>b</sup>$  Reported earlier as S-nitrosylated in potato (Kato et al. [2013](#page-21-0))</sup>

c Nitrated in potato (data unpublished)

<sup>d</sup> Identified by Lindermayr et al. [2005](#page-22-0)

e Identified by Abat et al. [2008](#page-20-0)

f Identified by Vanzo et al. [2014](#page-22-0)

- <sup>g</sup> By Fares et al. [2011](#page-21-0)
- <sup>h</sup> By Tanou et al. [2009](#page-22-0)
- h Romero-Puertas et al. [2007](#page-22-0)
- <sup>i</sup> Ortega-Galisteo et al. [2012](#page-22-0)

<sup>j</sup> Palmieri et al. [2010](#page-22-0)

<sup>k</sup> Wang et al. [2008b](#page-22-0)



Fig. 5 Late blight disease progress in potato leaves-excised discs inoculated with avr and vr P. infestans. Average area of P. infestans mycelium growth was 2.98±0.17 % in avr P. infestans-treated

potato; and  $20.1 \pm 1.6$  % in vr *P. infestans*-treated potato. Values represent the average of data±SD of six independent experiments with maintained randomization

<span id="page-20-0"></span>

Fig. 6 Identification of S-nitrosylation targets in potato leaves: a immunodetection of S-nitrosylated proteins with the indication of the bands subjected to densytometric analysis, b negative and

positive controls in BST, c protein content visualization using Coomassie blue staining, d functional categorization of the 104 identified S-nitrosylated proteins in potato leaves

### References

- Abat, J. K., Mattoo, A. K., & Deswal, R. (2008). S-nitrosylated proteins of a medicinal CAM plant Kalanchoe pinnataribulose-1,5-bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase activity targeted for inhibition. FEBS Journal, 275, 2862–2872.
- Abeles, F., & Forrence, L. (1970). Temporal and Hormonal Control of β-1,3-Glucanase in Phaseolus vulgaris L. Plant Physiology, 45, 395–400.
- Able, A. J., Guest, D. I., & Sutherland, M. W. (1998). Use of a new tetrazolium-based assay to study the production of superoxide radicals by tobacco cell cultures challenged with avirulent zoospores of Phytophthora parasitica var nicotianae. Plant Physiology, 117, 491–499.
- Arasimowicz-Jelonek, M., & Floryszak-Wieczorek, J. (2011). Understanding the fate of peroxynitrite in plant cells–from

physiology to pathophysiology. Phytochemistry, 72, 681– 688.

- Arasimowicz-Jelonek, M., & Floryszak-Wieczorek, J. (2014). Nitric oxide: an effective weapon of the plant or the pathogen? Molecular Plant Patholology, 15(4), 406–416.
- Arasimowicz-Jelonek, M., Floryszak-Wieczorek, J., Drzewiecka, K., Chmielowska-Bąk, J., Abramowski, D., & Izbiańska, K. (2014a). Aluminum induces cross-resistance of potato to Phytophthora infestans. Planta, 239, 679–694.
- Arasimowicz-Jelonek, M., Floryszak-Wieczorek, J., Abramowski, D., Izbiańska, K. (2014b) Nitric oxide and reactive nitrogen species. In: nitric oxide in plants: metabolism and role ins tress physiology. Springer International Publishing, pp 165– 184.
- Astier, J., Rasul, S., Koen, E., Manzoor, H., Besson-Bard, A., Lamotte, O., Jeandroz, S., Durner, J., Lindermayr, C., & Wendehenne, D. (2011). S-nitrosylation: an emerging post-

<span id="page-21-0"></span>translational protein modification in plants. Plant Science: An International Journal of Experimental Plant Biology, 181, 527–533.

- Barroso, J. B., Corpas, F. J., Carreras, A., Rodríguez-Serrano, M., Esteban, F. J., Fernández-Ocaňa, A., Chaki, M., Romero-Puertas, M. C., Valderrama, R., Sandalio, L. M., & del Río, L. A. (2006). Localization of S-nitrosoglutathione and expression of S-nitrosoglutathione reductase in pea plants under cadmium stress. Journal of Experimental Botany, 57, 1785– 1793.
- Beauchamp, C., & Fridovich, I. (1971). Superoxide dismutase: improved assays and an assay applicable to acrylamide gels. Analytical Biochemistry, 44, 276–287.
- Becana, M., Aparicio-Tejo, P., Irigoyen, J. J., & Sanchez-Diaz, M. (1986). Some enzymes of hydrogen peroxide metabolism in leaves and root nodules of Medicago sativa. Plant Physiology, 82, 1169–1171.
- Bennett, M., Mehta, M., & Grant, M. (2005). Biophoton imaging: a nondestructive method for assaying R gene responses. Molecular Plant-Microbe Interactions, 18, 95–102.
- Besson-Bard, A., Griveau, S., Bedioui, F., & Wendehenne, D. (2008). Real-time electrochemical detection of extracellular nitric oxide in tobacco cells exposed to cryptogein, an elicitor of defence responses. Journal of Experimental Botany, 59, 3407–3414.
- Chaki M., Lindermayr C. (2014) S-Nitrosoglutathione Reductase: Key Regulator of Plant Development and Stress Response. In: Khan MN, Mobin M, Mohammad F, Corpas FJ (eds) Nitric oxide in plants: metabolism and role in stress physiology. Springer International Publishing, pp 139–151.
- Chaki, M., Fernández-Ocaňa, A. M., Valderrama, R., Carreras, A., Esteban, F. J., Luque, F., Gómez-Rodrígez, M. V., Begara-Morales, J. C., Corpas, F. J., & Barroso, J. B. (2009). Involvement of reactive nitrogen and oxygen species (RNS and ROS) in sunflower-mildew interaction. Plant and Cell Physiology, 50, 265–279.
- Chomcznski, P., & Sacchi, N. (1987). Single-step method of RNA isolation by acid quanidinium thiocyanate-phenolchloroform extraction. Analytical Biochemistry, 162, 156.
- Corpas, F. J., Palma, J. M., Del Río, L. A., & Barroso, J. B. (2013). Protein tyrosine nitration in higher plants grown under natural and stress conditions. Frontiers in Plant Science, 4, 29.
- Delledonne, M., Xia, Y., Dixon, R. A., & Lamb, C. (1998). Nitric oxide functions as a signal in plant disease resistance. Nature, 394, 585–588.
- Delledonne, M., Zeier, J., Marocco, A., & Lamb, C. (2001). Signal interactions between nitric oxide and reactive oxygen intermediates in the plant hypersensitive disease resistance response. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences, 98, 13454–13459.
- Doke, N. (1983). Involvement of superoxide anion generation in the hypersensitive response of potato tuber tissues to infection with an incompatible race of Phytophthora infestans and to the hyphal wall components. Physiologial Plant Pathology, 23, 345–357.
- Dubreuil-Maurizi, C., Vitecek, J., Marty, L., Branciard, L., Frettinger, P., Wendehenne, D., Meyer, A. J., Mauch, F., & Poinssot, B. (2011). Glutathione deficiency of the Arabidopsis mutant pad2-1 affects oxidative stress-related events, defense gene expression, and the hypersensitive response. Plant Physiology, 157, 2000–2012.
- Fares, A., Rossignol, M., & Peltier, J. B. (2011). Proteomics investigation of endogenous S-nitrosylation in Arabidopsis. Biochemical and Biophysical Research Communications, 416(3-4), 331–336.
- Fares, A., Nespoulous, C., Rossignol, M., & Peltier, J.-B. (2014). Simultaneous identification and quantification of nitrosylation sites by combination of biotin switch and ICAT labeling. Methods in Molecular Biology, 1072, 609– 620.
- Feechan, A., Kwon, E., Yun, B.-W., Wang, Y., Pallas, J. A., & Loake, G. J. (2005). A central role for S-nitrosothiols in plant disease resistance. Proceedings of the National Academy of Sciences of the United States of America, 102(22), 8054– 8059.
- Floryszak-Wieczorek, J., Górski, W., & Arasimowczi-Jelonek, M. (2011). Functional imaging of biophoton responses of plants to fungal infection. European Journal of Plant Pathology, 130, 249–258.
- Floryszak-Wieczorek, J., Arasimowicz-Jelonek, M., Milczarek, G., Janus, L., Pawlak-Sprada, S., Abramowski, D., Deckert, J., & Billert, H. (2012). Nitric oxide–mediated stress imprint in potato as an effect of exposure to a priming agent. Molecular Plant-Microbe Interactions, 25, 1469–1477.
- Floryszak-Wieczorek J., Arasimowicz-Jelonek M., Abramowski D. (2013) Redox-sensing responses in the potato-Phtophthora infestans system. Oxidative stress and cell death in plants: mechanisms and implications Florence, Italy, p. 53.
- Groß, F., Durner, J., & Gaupels, F. (2013). Nitric oxide, antioxidants and prooxidants in plant defence responses. Frontiers in Plant Science, 4, 419.
- Hoang, C. V., & Chapman, K. D. (2002). Biochemical and molecular inhibition of plastidial carbonic anhydrase reduces the incorporation of acetate into lipids in cotton embryos and tobacco cell suspensions and leaves. Plant Physiology, 128, 1417–1427.
- Holzmeister, C., Gaupels, F., Geerlof, A., Sarioglu, H., Sattler, M., Durner, J., & Lindermayr, C. (2015). Differential inhibition of Arabidopsis superoxide dismutases by peroxynitritemediated tyrosine nitration. Journal of Experimental Botany, 66(3), 989–999.
- Huang, J., Li, D., Diao, J., Hou, J., Yuan, J., & Zou, G. (2007). A novel fluorescent method for determination of peroxynitrite using folic acid as a probe. Talanta, 72, 1283–1287.
- James, W. C. (1971). An illustrated series of assessment keys for plant diseases, their preparation and usage. Canadian Plant Disease Survey, 51, 39–65.
- Janus, Ł., Milczarek, G., Arasimowicz-Jelonek, M., Abramowski, D., Billert, H., & Floryszak-Wieczorek, J. (2013). Normoergic NO-dependent changes, triggered by a SAR inducer in potato, create more potent defense responses to Phytophthora infestans. Plant Science, 211, 23–34.
- Kato, H., Takemoto, D., & Kawakita, K. (2013). Proteomic analysis of S-nitrosylated proteins in potato plant. Physiologia Plantarum, 148, 371–386.
- Kovacs, I., & Lindermayr, C. (2013). Nitric oxide-based protein modification: formation and site-specificity of protein Snitrosylation. Frontiers in Plant Science, 4, 137.
- Lim, M. H., Xu, D., & Lippard, S. J. (2006). Visualization of nitric oxide in living cells by a copper-based fluorescent probe. Nature Chemical Biology, 2, 375–380.
- <span id="page-22-0"></span>Lindermayr, C., Saalbach, G., & Durner, J. (2005). Proteomic Identification of S-Nitrosylated Proteins in Arabidopsis. Plant Physiology, 137, 921–930.
- Malik, S. I., Hussain, A., Yun, B.-W., Spoel, S. H., & Loake, G. J. (2011). GSNOR-mediated de-nitrosylation in the plant defence response. Plant Science, 181, 540–544.
- Mukherjee, S. P., & Choudhuri, M. A. (1983). Implications of water stress-induced changes in the levels of endogenous ascorbic acid and hydrogen peroxide in Vigna seedlings. Physiologia Plantarum, 58, 166–170.
- Mur, L. A. J., Santosa, I. E., Laarhoven, L. J. J., Holton, N. J., Harren, F. J. M., & Smith, A. R. (2005). Laser photoacoustic detection allows in planta detection of nitric oxide in tobacco following challenge with avirulent and virulent Pseudomonas syringae Pathovars. Plant Physiology, 138, 1247–1258.
- Noctor, G., Mhamdi, A., Chaouch, S., Han, Y., Neukermans, J., Marquez-Garcia, B., Queval, G., & Foyer, C. H. (2012). Glutathione in plants: an integrated overview. Plant, Cell & Environment, 35, 454–484.
- Noirot, E., Der, C., Lherminier, J., Robert, F., Moricova, P., Kieu, K., Leborgne-Castel, N., Simon-Plas, F., & Bouhidel, K. (2014). Dynamic changes in the subcellular distribution of the tobacco ROS-producing enzyme RBOHD in response to the oomycete elicitor cryptogein. Journal of Experimental Botany, 65, 5011–5022.
- Noritake, T., Kawakita, K., & Doke, N. (1996). Nitric oxide induces phytoalexin accumulation in potato tuber tissues. Plant Cell Physiology, 37, 113–116.
- Ortega-Galisteo, A. P., Rodriguez-Serrano, M., Pazmino, D. M., Gupta, D. K., Sandalio, L. M., & Romero-Puertas, M. C. (2012). S-Nitrosylated proteins in pea (Pisum sativum L.) leaf peroxisomes: changes under abiotic stress. Journal of Experimental Botany, 63, 2089–2103.
- Palmieri, M. C., Lindermayr, C., Bauwe, H., Steinhauser, C., & Durner, J. (2010). Regulation of plant glycine decarboxylase by s-nitrosylation and glutathionylation. Plant Physiology, 152(3), 1514–1528.
- Pauly, M., Andersen, L. N., Kauppinen, S., Kofod, L. V., York, W. S., Albersheim, P., & Darvill, A. (1999). A xyloglucanspecific endo-beta-1,4-glucanase from *Aspergillus aculeatus*: expression cloning in yeast, purification and characterization of the recombinant enzyme. Glycobiology, 9, 93–100.
- Pfaffl, M. W. (2001). A new mathematical model for relative quantification in real-time RT-PCR. Nucleic Acids Research, 29, 2004–2007.
- Re, R., Pellegrini, N., Proteggente, A., Pannala, A., Yang, M., & Rice-Evans, C. (1999). Antioxidant activity applying an improved ABTS radical cation decolorization assay. Free Radical Biology & Medicine, 26, 1231–1237.
- Rice-Evans, C. A., Diplock, A. T., & Symons, M. C. R. (1991). Techniques in free radical research. Laboratory Techniques in Biochemistry and Molecular Biology, 22, 143–147.
- Romero-Puertas, M. C., Laxa, M., Matte, A., Zaninotto, F., Finkemeier, I., Jones, A. M. E., Perazzolli, M., Vandelle, E., Dietz, K.-J., & Delledonne, M. (2007). S-Nitrosylation of peroxiredoxin ii e promotes peroxynitrite-mediated tyrosine nitration. The Plant Cell, 19, 4120–4130.
- Rustérucci, C., Espunya, M. C., Díaz, M., Chabannes, M., & Martínez, M. C. (2007). S-Nitrosoglutathione reductase

affords protection against pathogens in Arabidopsis, both locally and systemically. Plant Physiology, 143, 1282–1292.

- Sehrawat A., Abat J.K., Deswal R. (2013) RuBisCO depletion improved proteome coverage of cold responsive Snitrosylated targets in Brassica juncea. Frontiers in Plant Science, 4, doi:[10.3389/fpls.2013.00342.](http://dx.doi.org/10.3389/fpls.2013.00342)
- Spadaro, D., Yun, B.-W., Spoel, S. H., Chu, C., Wang, Y.-Q., & Loake, G. J. (2010). The redox switch: dynamic regulation of protein function by cysteine modifications. Physiologia Plantarum, 138, 360–371.
- Stefano, M., Vandelle, E., Polverari, A., Ferrarini, A., & Delledonne, M. (2006). Nitric oxide-mediated signaling functions during the plant hypersensitive response. In L. Lamattina & J. C. Polacco (Eds.), Nitric oxide in plant growth (pp. 207–222). Berlin, Heidelberg: Development and Stress Physiology. Springer Berlin Heidelberg.
- Tada, Y., Spoel, S. H., Pajerowska-Mukhtar, K., Mou, Z., Song, J., Wang, C., Zuo, J., & Dong, X. (2008). Plant immunity requires conformational changes of NPR1 via Snitrosylation and thioredoxins. Science, 321, 952–956.
- Tanou, G., Job, C., Rajjou, L., Arc, E., Belghazi, M., Diamantidis, G., Molassiotis, A., & Job, D. (2009). Proteomics reveals the overlapping roles of hydrogen peroxide and nitric oxide in the acclimation of citrus plants to salinity. Plant Journal, 60(5), 795–804.
- Tanou, G., Job, C., Belghazi, M., Molassiotis, A., Diamantidis, G., & Job, D. (2010). Proteomic signatures uncover hydrogen peroxide and nitric oxide cross-talk signaling network in citrus plants. Journal of Proteome Research, 2010(11), 5994–6006.
- Vanzo, E., Ghirardo, A., Merl-Pham, J., Lindermayr, C., Heller, W., Hauck, S. M., Durner, J., & Schnitzler, J.-P. (2014). S-Nitroso-proteome in poplar leaves in response to acute ozone stress. PLoS ONE, 9(9), e106886. doi[:10.1371/journal.pone.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0106886) [0106886.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0106886)
- Vleeshouwers, V. G. A. A., & Oliver, R. P. (2014). Effectors as tools in disease resistance breeding against biotrophic, hemibiotrophic, and necrotrophic plant pathogens. Molecular Plant-Microbe Interactions, 27, 196–206.
- Vleeshouwers, V. G., van Dooijeweert, W., Govers, F., Kamoun, S., & Colon, L. T. (2000). The hypersensitive response is assiociated with host and non-host resistance to Phytophthora infestans. Planta, 210, 853–864.
- Wang, X., El Hadrami, A., Adam, L. R., & Daayf, F. (2008a). Differential activation and suppression of potato defence responses by Phytophthora infestans isolates representing US-1 and US-8 genotypes. Plant Pathology, 57, 1026–1037.
- Wang, Y.-Q., Feechan, A., Yun, B.-W., Shafiei, R., Hofmann, A., Taylor, P., Xue, P., Yang, F.-Q., Xie, Z.-S., Pallas, J. A., Chu, C.-C., & Loake, G. J. (2008b). S-Nitrosylation of AtSABP3 antagonizes the expression of plant immunity. Journal of Biological Chemistry, 284, 2131–2137.
- Wilson, U. E., Coffey M. D. (1980). Cytological evaluation of general resistance to Phytophthora infestans in potato foliage. Annals of Botany, 45, 81–90.
- Xiong, Y., DeFraia, C., Williams, D., Zhang, X., & Mou, Z. (2009). Characterization of Arabidopsis 6 phosphogluconolactonase T-DNA insertion mutants reveals an essential role for the oxidative section of the plastidic pentose phosphate pathway in plant growth and development. Plant & Cell Physiology, 50, 1277–1291.
- <span id="page-23-0"></span>Ye, J., Coulouris, G., Zaretskaya, I., Cutcutache, I., Rozen, S., & Madden, T. L. (2012). Primer-BLAST: a tool to design targetspecific primers for polymerase chain reaction. BMC Bioinformatics, 13, 134.
- Yu, M., Lamattina, L., Spoel, S. H., & Loake, G. J. (2014). Nitric oxide function in plant biology: a redox cue in deconvolution. New Phytologist, 202, 1142–1156.
- Yun, B.-W., Feechan, A., Yin, M., Saidi, N. B. B., Le Bihan, T., Yu, M., Moore, J. W., Kang, J.-G., Kwon, E., Spoel, S. H., Pallas, J. A., & Loake, G. J. (2011). S-nitrosylation of NADPH oxidase regulates cell death in plant immunity. Nature, 478, 264–268.
- Zhao, S., & Fernald, R. D. (2005). Comprehensive algorithm for quantitative real-time polymerase chain reaction. Journal of Computational Biology, 12, 1047–1064.