

Decrease in heathland soil labile organic carbon under future atmospheric and climatic conditions

E. M. Thaysen . S. Reinsch . K. S. Larsen . P. Ambus

Received: 31 May 2016 / Accepted: 31 January 2017 / Published online: 1 March 2017 - Springer International Publishing Switzerland 2017

Abstract Characterization of the impacts of climate change on terrestrial carbon (C) cycling is important due to possible feedback mechanisms to atmospheric $CO₂$ concentrations. We investigated soil organic matter (SOM) dynamics in the A1 and A2 horizons $({\sim}0$ –5.1 and ${\sim}5.1$ –12.3 cm depth, respectively) of a shrubland grass (Deschampsia flexuosa) after 8 years of exposure to: elevated $CO₂ (CO₂)$, summer drought (D), warming (T) and all combinations hereof, with $TDCO₂$ simulating environmental conditions for Denmark in 2075. The mean C residence time was highest in the heavy fraction (HF), followed by the occluded light fraction and the free light fraction (fLF) , and it increased with soil depth, suggesting that C was

Responsible Editor: Edward Brzostek.

Electronic supplementary material The online version of this article (doi[:10.1007/s10533-017-0303-3\)](http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10533-017-0303-3) contains supplementary material, which is available to authorized users.

E. M. Thaysen (\boxtimes) Institute of Environmental Assessment and Water Research (IDAEA), CSIC, Jordi Girona 18-26, 08034 Barcelona, Catalonia, Spain e-mail: eikethaysen@gmail.com

E. M. Thaysen

Hydrogeology Group (UPC-CSIC), 08034 Barcelona, Catalonia, Spain

S. Reinsch

Centre for Ecology & Hydrology, Environment Centre Wales, Deiniol Rd, Bangor LL57 2UW, Gwynedd, UK stabilized on minerals at depth. A2 horizon SOM was susceptible to climate change whereas A1 horizon SOM was largely unaffected. The A2 horizon fLF and HF organic C stocks decreased by 43 and 23% in response to warming, respectively. Organic nitrogen (N) stocks of the A2 horizon fLF and HF decreased by 50 and 17%, respectively. Drought decreased the A2 horizon fLF N stock by 38%. Elevated $CO₂$ decreased the A2 horizon $fLF \text{C}$ stock by 39% and the $fLF \text{N}$ stock by 50%. Under TDCO₂, A2 horizon $fLF \text{C}$ and N stocks decreased by 22 and 40%, respectively. Overall, our results indicate that shrubland SOM will be susceptible to increased turnover and associated net C and N losses in the future.

Keywords Climate change - SOM - Density fractionation \cdot C cycling \cdot N cycling \cdot FACE \cdot ¹³C \cdot ¹⁵N · C storage · CLIMAITE

K. S. Larsen

Department of Geosciences and Natural Resource Management, University of Copenhagen, Rolighedsvej 23, 1958 Copenhagen, Denmark

P. Ambus

Center for Permafrost (CENPERM), Department of Geosciences and Natural Resource Management, University of Copenhagen, Øster Voldgade 10, 1350 Copenhagen, Denmark

Introduction

Climate change is accelerated by increasing atmospheric concentration of carbon dioxide $(CO₂)$ (IPCC [2013\)](#page-18-0). The extent to which soil carbon (C) sequestration will counterbalance increasing atmospheric $CO₂$ concentrations depends in part on soil organic matter (SOM) dynamics (Davidson and Janssens [2006](#page-17-0); Hofmockel et al. [2011b](#page-18-0); Trumbore and Czimczik [2008\)](#page-19-0). However, it is unclear how SOM will respond to climate change (Hofmockel et al. [2011b;](#page-18-0) Nie et al. [2014\)](#page-19-0) because links and feedback mechanisms between SOM dynamics and climate are not fully understood (Heimann and Reichstein [2008](#page-18-0); Trumbore and Czimczik [2008](#page-19-0)). Changes in C and nitrogen (N) cycling within SOM pools could drastically change long-term C sequestration and soil N availability (Hofmockel et al. [2011b\)](#page-18-0).

SOM contains roughly 50% C and 0.1–6% N (Cotrofo and Gorissen [1997](#page-17-0); Schnitzer and Khan [1978\)](#page-19-0) and is mainly derived from plants through exudates, symbiotic fungi and litter (Davidson and Janssens [2006;](#page-17-0) Trumbore and Czimczik [2008](#page-19-0)), and to a minor extent from mesofauna, fungi (Mehrabanian [2013\)](#page-18-0) and bacteria/archaea. The incorporation of OM into soil aggregates or sorption onto mineral or organic surfaces slows SOM decomposition by microbes and contributes to its stabilization in soil (Kleber et al. [2007\)](#page-18-0). As changes in bulk SOM stocks can be difficult to observe due to high spatial variability in most natural ecosystems, improved understanding of climate change effects on SOM turnover and changes in soil C and N pools can be gained from SOM fractionation in combination with climate manipulation experiments (Trumbore and Czimczik [2008\)](#page-19-0).

The SOM fractionation approach is particularly valuable in climate change experiments because noncomplexed SOM pools often display more sensitive responses to environmental change than the bulk SOM pool (Christensen [2001](#page-17-0)). SOM fractionation techniques are based on the assumption that the extent and degree to which SOM is adsorbed to mineral soil particles regulates SOM dynamics and function (Gregorich et al. [2006\)](#page-17-0). Soil density fractionation provides a mean to separate SOM inside and outside of aggregates (designated occluded light fraction, oLF , and free light fraction, fLF , respectively, with densities <1.5 g cm⁻³) from mineral-associated SOM (heavy fraction, HF, with a density of typically $2.5-3.0 \text{ g cm}^{-3}$). Particles that

sink in heavy liquid are thought to be absorbed to clay and sesquioxides, and contain variable amounts of humified SOM (Beare and Gregorich [2007](#page-17-0); Kogel-Knabner et al. [2008](#page-18-0)).

In general, the youngest, most labile and least 13 C enriched $(=$ ¹³C most negative) SOM prevails as discrete particles of plant origin (fLF) whereas older, most processed, recalcitrant and ¹³C enriched SOM is associated with the HF (Gunina and Kuzyakov [2014](#page-18-0); Kogel-Knabner et al. [2008;](#page-18-0) Meyer and Leifeild [2013;](#page-18-0) Wagai et al. 2009). It is believed that the HF can be formed from the oLF or directly from fLF material (Wagai et al. 2009). The oLF is thought to originate from the fLF and may partially be more degraded and recalcitrant (Buurman and Roscoe [2011;](#page-17-0) Wagai et al. [2009\)](#page-19-0). Stabilization of soil organic C (SOC) and soil organic N (SON) is typically connected to mineral association in the HF (Bimüller et al. [2014;](#page-17-0) Marschner et al. [2008;](#page-18-0) Schrumpf et al. [2013\)](#page-19-0). Organic C pesistence via selective preservation of recalcitrant compounds such as melanoidins, black C, tannins or aliphatic structures in the oLF (Mikutta et al. [2006](#page-19-0); Poirier et al. [2003\)](#page-19-0) is probably a less important stabilization mechanism (Marschner et al. [2008\)](#page-18-0).

Climate change manipulation experiments have traditionally investigated single-factorial or combined effects of, in particular, elevated atmospheric CO2 concentrations and warming (reviewed in Dieleman et al. [2012\)](#page-17-0). These experiments, however, lack studying the effect of more severe future drought events (Dieleman et al. [2012\)](#page-17-0) or anticipated changed precipitation patterns in general (IPCC [2013\)](#page-18-0), which may also influence soil C and N turnover. In addition, changes in $CO₂$, temperature and precipitation may interact, complicating the prediction of the effects of multiple climatic and environmental stress factors from single factor studies (Andresen et al. [2010;](#page-17-0) Larsen et al. [2011](#page-18-0); Scherber et al. [2013\)](#page-19-0). Combined with the fact that changes in bulk SOC are hard to detect on an annual basis (Xu et al. [2011](#page-19-0)) this calls for research on fractionated soil C and N stocks in long-term multifactorial climate manipulation experiments.

Shrublands constitute an important component of terrestrial landscapes $\lceil \sim 7\% \rceil$ of European land area (Carter et al. [2012](#page-17-0))] and provide multiple important ecosystem services (Beier et al. [2009](#page-17-0)). The global area covered by shrublands may further increase as changes in land use cause shrub invasion in many arid and semiarid regions of the world (Schlesinger et al. [1990](#page-19-0)). Hence, shrublands deserve special attention in climate change impact research (Kröel-Dulay et al. [2015\)](#page-18-0). The objective of this study was to evaluate how eight years of elevated CO2, increased temperature and extended periods of drought, and all-factorial combinations hereof, affect soil C and N stocks in the A horizon of a temperate shrubland.

In the current work we tested four main hypotheses addressing the interaction between SOM pools and climate change conditions, i.e.:

- 1. Warming decreases the size of the fLF due to increased SOM turnover rates (Amundson and Davidson [1990;](#page-17-0) Kotroczo et al. [2008\)](#page-18-0). Previous investigations from the shrubland ecosystem revealed a tendency for higher leaf litter decomposition under warming (Andresen et al. [2010](#page-17-0)), higher N turnover (Larsen et al. [2011](#page-18-0)), a higher microbial biomass (Haugwitz et al. [2014\)](#page-18-0) and a stimulation of soil respiration (R_s) in most seasons (Selsted et al. [2012](#page-19-0)).
- 2. Drought increases SOC and SON stocks at the site. This hypothesis is based on literature evidence demonstrating drought-driven increases in litter input from increased plant senescence (Munné Bosch [2004](#page-19-0)), and drought-induced reductions in R_s (Linn and Doran [1984](#page-18-0); Selsted et al. [2012;](#page-19-0) Skopp et al. [1990](#page-19-0)), N mineralization (Larsen et al. [2011\)](#page-18-0) and leaf litter decomposition (Andresen et al. [2010\)](#page-17-0).
- 3. Elevated $CO₂$ increases the SOM pool size due to a stimulation of net photosynthesis (Albert et al. [2011\)](#page-17-0) and root biomass (Arndal et al. [2013\)](#page-17-0) under elevated $CO₂$ at our experimental site.
- 4. The three-factorial treatment combination of warming, drought and elevated $CO₂$ is not expected to cause significant changes of the SOM pools after eight treatment years. Previous shorter term experiments at the specific site showed that the stimulating effects of elevated $CO₂$ and warming on plant biomass, SOM turnover (measured via soil and leaf litter incubation bags after 1 year) and soil fauna cancelled out or were reduced when combined with drought (Andresen et al. [2010](#page-17-0); Kongstad et al. [2012;](#page-18-0) Larsen et al. [2011](#page-18-0); Maraldo et al. [2010](#page-18-0); Reinsch and Ambus [2013](#page-19-0)).

Methods

Experimental field site

Soil samples were collected at the site of the CLIMAITE experimental site, a temperate shrubland/grassland ca. 50 km north of Copenhagen, Denmark (55°53'N 11°58'E), matured on moraine deposits (Mikkelsen et al. [2008\)](#page-18-0). The soil is a coarse textured sandy Arenosol (FAO)/Entisol (US Soil Taxonomy) from the Weichsel glaciation with only weak signs of podsolization, a relatively low Cation Exchange Capacity (CEC) and acidic pH (Table [1](#page-3-0)). The dominating plant types are grasses (ca. 77% coverage by Deschampsia flexuosa) and evergreen shrubs (ca. 23% coverage by Calluna vulgaris) (Kongstad et al. [2012](#page-18-0)). The experiment comprises twelve octagon-shaped plots (6.8 m diameter) that have been exposed to multiple environmental treatments since October 2005. The octagons are organized pair-wise in six blocks, where one of the paired octagons is exposed to ambient (A) atmospheric $CO₂$ concentration (390 ppm) and one is exposed to elevated CO2 at 510 ppm (CO2) realized by Free-Air $CO₂$ Enrichment (FACE). All octagons are split into four equal-sized plots exposed to, in addition to ambient or elevated $CO₂$, either no treatment (A), extended spring/summer droughts (D) via horizontally moving curtains (removing 8–11% of annual precipitation and decreasing soil water content in D compared to A plots by 3.2 ± 0.5 and 5.7 ± 0.6 percentage points on average during the whole drought treatment periods and during the last 7 days of the drought treatments, respectively; Fig. [1a](#page-4-0)), to passively elevated night-time temperature (T) via a second set of horizontally moving reflective curtains (annual mean temperature at 20 cm above soil surface and at 5 cm soil depth elevated by 0.3 and $0.4 \text{ }^{\circ}\text{C}$, respectively, in T compared to A plots, ranging from 0.1 \degree C in both air and soil during winter to 0.5 and 0.7 \degree C, respectively, during spring/summer; Fig. [1b](#page-4-0)) or a combination of drought and warming (TD). Hence the experimental design allows for the test of eight treatments $(A, T, D, CO_2, TD, TCO_2, DCO_2,$ $TDCO₂$), each replicated six times. The full factorial treatment, $TDCO₂$, simulates as closely as possible a likely Danish climate scenario in 2075, as predicted by the Danish Meteorological Institute [\(www.DMI.dk\)](http://www.DMI.dk). For more details, see Mikkelsen et al. ([2008\)](#page-18-0) and Scherber et al. ([2013](#page-19-0)).

Sand $(\%$ wt)	Silt	Clay	CEC (meg 100 g ⁻¹)	pH (0.01 M CaCl ₂)
88.0 ± 0.7	9.7 ± 0.3	2.3 ± 0.8	3.32 ± 0.17	3.4 ± 0.03
91.9 ± 0.3	6.5 ± 0.2	1.6 ± 0.2	1.78 ± 0.14	3.7 ± 0.03
91.8 ± 0.5	5.9 ± 1.0	2.3 ± 0.6	$1.37 \pm 0.11^{\circ}$	$4.2 \pm 0.06^{\circ}$

Table 1 Soil physical and chemical characteristics

Soil was collected in 2004 (pre-treatment) adjacent to each experimental octagon (n = 12) for cation exchange capacity (CEC) and pH; four locations $(n = 4)$ were randomly selected in 2004 for textural analysis

data for 10–30 cm soil depth

Soil sampling and sample pre-treatment

Four to five soil cores (\varnothing 2 cm, depth 12.3 \pm 0.3 cm corresponding to the approximate depth of the A horizon) were collected randomly beneath D. flexuosa from the outer periphery of each experimental plot in December 2013. Soil cores were divided into an A1 horizon $(0-5.1 \pm 0.2 \text{ cm})$ and an A2 horizon $(5.1 \pm 0.2 - 12.3 \pm 0.3$ cm) using color- and density differences. Any litter fraction was removed from the samples. The soil was air-dried and large aggregates were gently crushed to pass a 2 mm sieve. The fraction $>$ 2 mm was removed by dry sieving. Subsequently, roots and visible plant remains were removed from the samples and the soil was homogenized using the cone and quarter technique (Raab et al. [1990\)](#page-19-0). Three subsamples of 5 g were weighed into 50 mL Falcon tubes (BD Biosciences, DK) for density fractionation, bulk (non-fractionated) soil analysis and pH measurement, respectively. Roots were dried at 70° C and analyzed as described below.

Soil fractionation

Soil density fractionation was carried out following protocols of Schrumpf et al. ([2013\)](#page-19-0) using sodium polytungstate (SPT, Sigma Aldrich No. 71913, Denmark) at a density of 1.6 g mL⁻¹. After addition of 25 mL SPT to the soil samples, the Falcon tubes were shaken gently by hand to release the free light fraction (*fLF*). Suspensions were left to settle for \sim 1 h prior to 30 min of centrifugation at $4000 \times g$. The floating fLF and SPT supernatant were pipetted onto glass fibre filters (porosity 4, DUAN, Schott, Germany) and filtered under vacuum. The filtered SPT was checked for density changes and poured back into the Falcon tubes. Density changes were not observed in the current experiment. The $f\mathcal{L}F$ on the glass fibre filters was washed with milli-Q water to a conductivity of the rinsing water $\lt 50 \mu S$. The occluded light fraction (oLF) was obtained by treating the re-suspended SPTsoil solution with ultrasound at 26 J mL⁻¹. Calorimetrical calibration of the sonicator (Digital Sonifier No. 450, Branson, USA) was performed according to Schmidt et al. ([1999\)](#page-19-0) to provide an estimate for the applied energy. The applied energy level was based on 1) a strong discoloration of the SPT at energy levels higher than 26 J m L^{-1} that indicated reallocation of C (Fig. SI1) and 2) tests on the effect of different levels of sonication energy on the amount and the C concentration of the oLF and HF (Schmidt et al. [1999\)](#page-19-0) (results not shown). Complete disruption of aggregates was assumed when no further oLF was released (i.e. the mass of oLF increased) at the next sonication step. After sonication, samples were centrifuged (4000 \times g, 30 min) and the floating oLF and SPT were pipetted onto quartz fibre filters and filtered under vacuum. The oLF was washed with milli-Q water to a conductivity of the rinsing water $\lt 50 \mu S$. The settled HF was transferred onto glass microfiber filters (GF/C, Whatman, DK) and washed with milli-Q water to a conductivity of \leq 50 µS of the rinsing water. The density separated soil fractions were transferred quantitatively onto tin trays, dried at 60° C and weighed.

The recovery of soil mass was calculated from the sum of the mass in the density fractions and the initial bulk soil sample weight. Recovery of soil C was calculated from the sum of the C in the density fractions, the SPT solution and the rinse water versus the amount of C contained in the bulk soil sample. Recovery of soil N was calculated from the sum of the N in the density fractions versus the amount of N contained in the bulk soil sample. Average soil mass, C and N recoveries were 99.1, 111.7 and 87.9%, respectively (Table SI3).

Fig. 1 a Volumetric soil water content (SWC) in ambient (A) and drought (D) plots (spline curves of monthly means). Black bars indicate drought-treated periods. SWCs were decreased compared to ambient plots by on average 3.2 ± 0.5 percentage points during drought periods (mean decrease increasing to 5.7 ± 0.6 percentage points during the last 7 days of treatment) and showed a longer-lasting effect (mean decrease compared to non-treated plots of 1.9 ± 0.3 percentage points.

Soil solution pH

A soil subsample was gently suspended in milli-Q water (5:25 w:vol) and allowed to stand for 10 min. Soil solution pH was measured using a Radiometer Copenhagen PHM92 Laboratory pH meter.

C loss to fractionation medium and rinsing water

Water soluble components of the SOC pool may easily be lost during SPT suspension and rinsing. In order to quantify this C loss, SPT solutions and collected rinsing water samples were filtered through $0.45 \mu m$ nylon filters (Minisart, DK) and analyzed for dissolved

b Mean soil temperatures in ambient (A) and warming (T) plots (spline curves of monthly means). The warming treatment increased the annual mean temperature at 20 cm above soil surface (not shown) and at 5 cm soil depth by 0.3 and 0.4 $^{\circ}$ C, respectively, ranging from differences of 0.1 \degree C during winter to 0.5 and 0.7 \degree C, in air and soil respectively, during spring/summer

organic C (DOC) on a TOC_V CPH Analyzer (Shimadzu Suzhou Instruments, JP). Loss of C to the SPT solution and to the rinse water during density fractionation accounted for 4.8 ± 0.1 and $12.5\pm0.5\%$ of the bulk C in the A1 and A2 horizon, respectively. Five-mL subsamples of the SPT were freeze-dried and the precipitate was analyzed for total C and the ${}^{13}C/{}^{12}C$ isotope ratio.

Total C, N and stable isotope analyses

For analysis of the dry matter C and N concentrations (% C and % N) and isotopic ratios of $^{13}C/^{12}C$ and $15N/14N$, duplicates of finely ball-milled samples were

weighed into tin capsules, using 10, 0.1–1, 20, 20 and 10 mg of the fLF , oLF , HF , bulk soil and root mass, respectively. Samples were measured by Dumas combustion (1020 $^{\circ}$ C) on an elemental analyzer (CE 1110, Thermo Electron, Milan, Italy) coupled in continuous flow mode to a Finnigan MAT Delta PLUS isotope ratio mass spectrometer (Thermo Scientific, Bremen, Germany). The isotope ratios are reported by the delta notation (δ^{13} C and δ^{15} N), i.e. the change in isotopic ratio relative to international reference materials, i.e. Pee Dee Belemnite (PDB) and atmospheric air for C and N, respectively.

Newly-assimilated C and C residence time

The concentrated $CO₂$ used for the FACE treatment had a distinctly lower ¹³C isotopic value (signature of the added CO₂, ¹³CO_{2FACE} = -29‰; Reinsch and Ambus [2013](#page-19-0)) than ambient air $({}^{13}CO_{2AIR} = -8\%$. Newly assimilated C (C_{new}) in plots subjected to elevated CO2 was subsequently tracked into the SOM fractions according to the equation proposed by Bock et al. ([2007\)](#page-17-0):

$$
\%C_{new} = 100 \times \frac{\delta^{13}C_{SOM.CO2} - \delta^{13}C_{SOM.A}}{\delta^{13}C_{root} - \delta^{13}C_{SOM.A}} \tag{1}
$$

where $\delta^{13}C_{SOM,CO_2} = \delta^{13}C$ of the SOM fraction in the $CO₂$ treatment, ¹³C_{SOM.A} = ¹³C of the SOM fraction in the A treatment, and ${}^{13}C_{root} = {}^{13}C$ of the root material in the $CO₂$ treatment. The calculation assumes steady state C inputs, an instantaneous change in ${}^{13}C_{root}$, a temporal persistent value of $^{13}C_{root}$, and a negligible impact of aboveground litter on SOM formation; assumptions that are a simplification of the reality. The 13 C values of collected root materials are presented in supplementary Table SI1.

The mean residence time of C (MRT_C) in each SOM fraction was calculated according to:

$$
MRT_c = 1/k \tag{2}
$$

where $k = -\ln(\text{proportion of old C})/(\text{years elapsed})$ since the start of the experiment). A negative C_{new} was observed for 7.5% of the samples. Because k requires a positive value for C_{new} to be meaningful, the calculation of k was based on a plot average C_{new} (n = 6). Mean turnover rates for C were calculated across treatments by multiplying C_{new} with the grams of C in a given fraction, followed by division with the fraction dry weight and eight years of elevated $CO₂$ treatment.

Statistical analyses

Results are presented as means \pm standard error $(n = 6)$ unless indicated otherwise. 182 Outliers (i.e. values lower or higher than the quartile \pm interquartile range*1.5) corresponding to 4.5% of the values were removed from the dataset. Statistical analyses of treatment effects were conducted with a linear mixed effect model (lmer, $p < 0.05$) (R Core Team [2014](#page-19-0)). Data were divided into A1 and A2 horizon samples since almost all variables within the fLF , oLF and HF showed a significant difference between the horizons in Welch's t test (Welch [1947\)](#page-19-0) (Table SI2). The same statistical model was used for all variables, with all main climate factors $(T, D, CO₂)$ and their interactions included. The model included a random statement that accounted for the experimental design (block, octagon octagon \times D, octagon \times T; the CO₂ treatment is accounted for in the octagon as $CO₂$ is manipulated at octagon level). P-values ≤ 0.05 were considered significant, and trends in treatment effects ($p < 0.1$) are indicated.

Results

Distribution and characteristics of density fractions

The HF constituted at least 96 and 98% of the total soil mass in the A1 and A2 horizons, respectively. The HF was associated with high mineral contents as reflected by lower total soil C and N concentrations than in the bulk soil (Table [2](#page-7-0)). In contrast to the total mass, the light fractions constituted important reservoirs of OC and ON in both soil horizons (10–24% of the total C and 3–21% of the total N each; Table [2](#page-7-0)).

¹³C abundance under ambient $CO₂$ decreased in the order $oLF \geq$ leaf litter and roots \geq bulk soil $\geq HF > fLF$ and under elevated CO₂ in the order oLF and $HF \geq$ bulk soil F/F roots $>$ leaf litter in both horizons (Tables 2 and SI1). ¹⁵N abundance decreased in the order $HF >$ bulk soil and $oLF > fLF$, leaf litter and roots in the A1 horizon. In the A2 horizon, ¹⁵N-enrichment decreased in the order $HF >$ bulk soil $>$ oLF and $fLF >$ roots $>$ leaf litter (Tables [2](#page-7-0) and SI1).

Changes in chemistry of bulk soil and density fractions in the climate treatments

Effects of climate treatments on plant and soil C and N concentrations, and total C and N pools (OC and ON) were investigated (Figs. [2](#page-8-0) and [3\)](#page-11-0). In general, treatment effects appeared more frequently in the A2 horizon than in the A1 horizon (Table 3). An exception to this was ¹³C, which was decreased by elevated $CO₂$ in both horizons in all measured C pools (Tables [2](#page-7-0), [3](#page-9-0); Table SI1). Likewise, root material 13 C was markedly reduced in all plots exposed to elevated $CO₂$, ranging from -27.2 ± 0.1 to -35.0 ± 0.5 %, independent of soil depth (Table SI1). Samples generally showed large variability, and hence some of the statistical results have to be interpreted with reservation. It is worth mentioning that all climate treatments reduced the A2 horizon fLF N stock relative to the ambient treatment, while treatments hardly differed from each other (Fig. [3m](#page-11-0); Table [3](#page-9-0)). This could indicate that the treatments are non-additive but it could also reflect that the higher $f\mathcal{L}F$ N stock of the ambient treatment was caused by high variability between replicates.

Responses to warming

Across all treatment combinations, warming (T) significantly decreased soil C and N stocks in the A2 horizon fLF, HF and the bulk soil (Figs. [2m](#page-8-0) and [3m](#page-11-0), [2o](#page-8-0) and [3o](#page-11-0), and [2p](#page-8-0) and [3p](#page-11-0), respectively; Table [3](#page-9-0)). When combined with $CO₂$ and drought, warming reduced the bulk soil C stock from 1765 ± 61 g C m^{-2} in the A2 horizon to 1355 \pm 138 g C m⁻² (Fig. [2](#page-8-0)p; Table [3\)](#page-9-0), which was linked to a decreased C concentration (Fig. [2h](#page-8-0); Table [3](#page-9-0)). The dominant source of C loss was associated with the HF (-272 g C m⁻²), and to lesser extent with the fLF (-74 g C m⁻²).

Much in parallel to the reduction in soil C (C/N ratio remained unchanged, Fig. SI4), the N pool decreased in the A2 horizon HF, from 81.5 ± 6.2 g N m⁻² to 67.1 ± 8.1 g N m⁻² (Fig. [3](#page-9-0)o; Table 3) due to a decrease in the N content of the fraction (Fig. [3](#page-11-0)g; Table [3\)](#page-9-0); for the fLF, the N pool decreased by 2.1 g N m⁻² (Fig. [3m](#page-11-0);

Table [3\)](#page-9-0). Overall, the bulk soil showed a substantial 17 g N m^{-2} (19%) decrease of the A2 horizon N pool in response to warming (Fig. [3p](#page-11-0); Table [3](#page-9-0)).

Responses to drought

Drought decreased the A2 horizon fLF N stock from 4.2 ± 0.7 to 2.6 ± 0.5 g N m⁻², probably due to a combination of non-significant decreases in the N concentration, the fLF weight fraction, and the soil bulk density. Drought also increased the $15N$ abundance in the *oLF* from $0.2 \pm 0.3\%$ to $1.9 \pm 0.5\%$ but only in plots under ambient $CO₂$ (significant DCO2) interaction; Table [3](#page-9-0), Table SI1). Drought responses often acted in combination with $CO₂$ and/or warming (Table [3](#page-9-0)). A noticeable example is the temperaturedriven loss of N from the HF in the A2 horizon. The warming-induced N loss was 14.4 g N m^{-2} but when combined with drought, the N loss was reduced to 2.2 g N m^{-2} (Fig. [3o](#page-11-0); Table [3\)](#page-9-0).

Responses to elevated $CO₂$

With respect to elevated $CO₂$ as a driver for soil C and N stocks in this ecosystem, we observed responses in the A2 horizon fLF in particular. The C stock of this soil fraction was reduced by \sim 67 g C m⁻² under elevated CO₂ to a total size of 104 ± 22 g C m⁻² (Fig. [2](#page-8-0)m; Table [3\)](#page-9-0), despite a concurrent increase in C from 4[3](#page-9-0).6 \pm 0.8% to 51.6 \pm 1.1% (Fig. [2e](#page-8-0); Table 3). A concurrent reduction of the relative weight proportion of the A2 horizon fLF from $0.20 \pm 0.002\%$ to $0.12 \pm 0.002\%$ was measured under elevated CO₂, but only when the $CO₂$ was not combined with warming (significant antagonistic TCO2 interaction, Table [3](#page-9-0); data not shown).

The loss of C under elevated $CO₂$ was lower in combinations with both warming and drought (Fig. [2](#page-8-0)m). The A2 horizon $f\mathcal{L}F$ N stock also decreased under elevated CO₂, from 4.2 ± 0.7 to 2.1 ± 0.6 g N m⁻² (Fig. [3](#page-9-0)m; Table 3), but as for C in the fLF , the elevated $CO₂$ -induced loss of N was reduced by significant interactions with both, warming and drought.

A change in N concentration was not observed for any of the density fractions. However elevated $CO₂$ decreased the bulk A2 horizon soil N concentration from $0.06 \pm 0.003\%$ to $0.05 \pm 0.003\%$, but only when not combined with warming (significant TCO2 interaction; Table [3\)](#page-9-0).

Table 2 Characteristics of bulk soil and soil organic matter density fractions with respect to mass proportion, concentrations of carbon (C) and nitrogen (N), isotopic Table 2 Characteristics of bulk soil and soil organic matter density fractions with respect to mass proportion, concentrations of carbon (C) and nitrogen (N), isotopic

Fig. 2 Boxplots of effects of the climate treatments in soil A1 and A2 horizons $(5.1 \pm 0.2 \text{ and } 5.1 \pm 0.2 \text{ to } 12.3 \pm 0.3 \text{ cm}$, respectively) on dry matter C concentration (a–h) and the stocks of organic C (OC) (i–p) in soil organic matter (SOM) fractions and the bulk soil. fLF free light fraction, oLF occluded

Responses to future environmental conditions

The combination of all three imposed climate drivers $(TDCO₂)$, i.e. the simulation of future climate scenario, decreased the A2 horizon fLF C stock from 171 ± 17 g C m⁻² in control plots to 133 ± 15 g C

light fraction, HF heavy fraction, bulk = bulk soil. Boxes represent interquartile ranges, whiskers represent 1.5 interquartile ranges from the boxes. Thirty outliers (3.9% of the values) were removed from the figure

 m^{-2} (Fig. 2m; Table [3\)](#page-9-0); this decrease was observed in spite of the increase in relative C concentration (Fig. 2e; Table [3\)](#page-9-0). In contrast, the relative C concentration in the A2 horizon oLF decreased in the combined treatment (Fig. 2f; Table [3](#page-9-0)), but this was not accompanied by a concurrent decrease of the C

Table 3 Effects of climate treatments $(D = \text{drought},$ T = warming, CO_2 = elevated CO_2 , and combinations) on ¹³C, ¹⁵N, organic C- and N stocks of bulk soil, soil organic matter fractions $(fLF =$ free light fraction, $oLF =$ occluded light fraction, $HF =$ heavy fraction) and roots

Effects of climate treatments are assessed using a linear mixed effect model (lmer)

* 5% level, ** 1% level, *** 0.1% level, $p < 0.1$, ns non-significant. Arrows indicate an increase or decrease due to the climate treatment

stock (Fig. [2](#page-8-0)n). The full treatment combination also tended to decrease the C stock of the A2 horizon bulk soil and the HF ($p < 0.1$; Table [3;](#page-9-0) Fig. [2](#page-8-0)p and o, respectively). Furthermore, the full treatment combination caused a 40% reduction in N from the A2 horizon fLF , from 4.2 \pm 0.7 g N m⁻² under ambient conditions to 2.5 ± 0.5 g N m⁻² (Fig. [3m](#page-11-0)). This N loss was neither driven by reduced N $\%$, a smaller fLF weight fraction or by a lower soil bulk density alone (Table [3](#page-9-0)) but was probably caused by a combination of non-significant decreases in these variables.

New C and mean C residence time in SOM

The specific ${}^{13}C/{}^{12}C$ isotopic composition of the atmospheric $CO₂$ in experimental plots exposed to elevated CO_2 enabled the calculation of C_{new} into the two soil horizon SOM fractions. The C_{new} generally

Table 3 continued

Fig. 3 *Boxplots* of effects of the climate treatments in soil A1 and A2 horizons $(5.1 \pm 0.2 \text{ and } 5.1 \pm 0.2 \text{ to } 12.3 \pm 0.3 \text{ cm}$, respectively) on dry matter N concentration (a–h) and stocks of organic $N (ON) (i-p)$ in soil organic matter (SOM) fractions and the bulk soil. fLF free light fraction, oLF occluded light fraction,

decreased in the order $fLF \geq oLF \geq HF$ with an overall maximum of 46% C_{new} in the A1 horizon fLF , and a minimum of 6% C_{new} in the A2 horizon HF (Fig. [4](#page-12-0)a–c). None of the treatments affected the formation of new C, although the drought treatment tended to decrease C_{new} formation in the oLF of the A2

 HF heavy fraction, bulk = bulk soil. Boxes represent interquartile ranges, whiskers represent 1.5 interquartile ranges from the boxes. Thirtyseven outliers (4.8% of the values) were removed from the figure

horizon (Fig. [4b](#page-12-0); Table [3\)](#page-9-0). The incorporation of new C during the eight years of the experiment in relation to the current C stock further enabled an assessment of the MRT_C. The MRT_C in the HF (overall 99 \pm 10 years) exceeded the MRT_C in the fLF $(26 \pm 4 \text{ years})$ and oLF $(39 \pm 4 \text{ years})$,

Fig. 4 Newly assimilated C in the free light fraction (fLF) (a), occluded light fraction (oLF) (b) and heavy fraction (HF) (c) and mean C residence time in the fLF (d) , oLF (e) and HF (f) of the A1 and A2 horizon in treatments with elevated CO₂. Error bars represent ± 1 SE

independently of the applied treatments and horizons (Fig. 4d–f).

Effect of soil depth on soil C and N

With increasing soil depth, i.e. the transition from the A1 to the A2 horizon, the pool of bulk soil C decreased from 1745 \pm 52 g C m⁻² to 1550 \pm 72 g C m^{-2} (Fig. 21 and p; Table SI2). The pool of C bound in the *fLF* also decreased from 395 \pm 32 g C m^{-2} in the A1 horizon to 133 \pm 9 g C m⁻² in the A2 horizon, despite a slight increase in C concentration (Fig. [2e](#page-8-0), i, and m; Table [3](#page-9-0)). DOC followed the same pattern and decreased with depth, as indicated by the DOC concentration in the SPT solution (p < 0.001; Fig. SI2a). The ¹³C of the *fLF*,

HF and bulk soil increased with depth for ambient $CO₂$ (0.3‰) and elevated $CO₂$ (0.8‰) treatments (Tables [2](#page-7-0), SI2; Fig. SI3). In parallel to the depthrelated distribution of C, the N concentrations and N pools generally also decreased with depth in the SOM fractions and bulk soil (Table [2;](#page-7-0) Fig. [3\)](#page-11-0). The C:N ratio was generally higher in the deeper soil layer, most pronounced in the fLF where A2 horizon $C:N > 50$ (Table [2\)](#page-7-0). Similarly, the ¹⁵N generally increased with soil depth, up to 3.8% for the bulk soil (Table [2;](#page-7-0) Fig. SI3). Newly assimilated C in the fLF and HF decreased with soil depth $(p < 0.001$ and 0.01, respectively; Fig. 4a, c) and correspondingly, the MRT_C of the fLF and HF increased with depth ($p<0.001$ and 0.01, respectively; Fig. 4d, f).

Discussion

An ecosystem in transition

The different patterns of 13 C signatures between the SOM fractions and plant roots under elevated $CO₂$ and ambient $CO₂$, respectively, show that our ecosystem had not yet established a new equilibrium in terms of C allocation after eight years of continuous exposure to ¹³C depleted CO_2 . The reported MRT_Cs and changes in C and N allocation to SOM pools under elevated $CO₂$ discussed in the following sections have hence to be interpreted with reservation. Given the violation of the steady-state assumptions (Derrien and Amelung 2011), higher C-input under eCO₂ into our ecosystem potentially leads to an under-estimate of the actual MRT_Cs . The relative magnitude of potential errors in MRT_C estimates diminishes with the duration of the experiment and is inversely related to the decay-rate (k). This suggests that in particular the MRT_C s for the HF may be underestimated in the current study.

Origins of the oLF and HF and their relative roles in SOC stabilization

This section discusses possible origins of the *oLF* and HF under ambient $CO₂$ concentration using the indicators C:N ratio, 13 C, and 15 N, and localizes the stabilization of SOC using the indicators MRT_C and SOM weight fraction. Considering the general pattern of enrichment in 13 C of SOM with age, the observed higher ¹³C enrichment of the oLF relative to the HF ($p < 0.001$) suggests that the HF was mainly formed from the more 13 C depleted *fLF* (Table [2](#page-7-0)). Meanwhile, selective degradation of 13 C depleted compounds within the oLF such as plant or microbial lipids, lignin or aliphatic compounds (Badeck et al. [2005](#page-17-0); Park and Epstein [1961\)](#page-19-0) provides a pathway for HF formation from the oLF . A MRT_C of the HF in the A2 horizon of more than 100 years and a rather slow mean C turnover in the HF and oLF of 0.03 and 1.7 mg C mg dry weight^{-1} yr^{-1}, respectively, further suggest little transfer of C from the HF to the oLF . Chemical analysis of the SOM fractions is needed to ultimately determine the predominant sources of C for the *oLF* and *HF*. The differences in ¹⁵N and C:N ratios between fLF and oLF in the A1 horizon (but not the A2 horizon) suggest that the oLF had undergone additional chemical transformation, possibly due to a longer inclusion period (Buurman and Roscoe [2011](#page-17-0)).

To our best knowledge this is the first study that consistently shows a higher 13 C enrichment of *oLF* C relative to HF C. John et al. (2005) (2005) also observed higher or equal ¹³C-enrichment of oLF C relative to HF C for some of their samples, but mainly reported ¹³C signatures of *oLF* C intermediate between C in the HF and fLF. The latter was also observed for a loamy soil with three different plant covers (Gunina and Kuzyakov [2014\)](#page-18-0) and for most of the sandy loam or loamy sand grassland soils in Baisden et al. ([2002](#page-17-0)). Other researchers have reported similar ${}^{13}C$ signatures of oLF C and fLF C, e.g. across 12 European study sites of different land use (Schrumpf et al. [2013](#page-19-0)) or more ¹³C depleted C in the oLF compared to the fLF (Buurman and Roscoe [2011;](#page-17-0) Roscoe et al. [2004](#page-19-0)). The apparent variance in the origin of the oLF suggests that SOM dynamics are indeed dependent on initial precursors and soil type, which is in line with findings by Thockmorton et al. ([2012](#page-19-0)) and Baisden et al. [\(2002](#page-17-0)), but contrary to findings by Gunina and Kuzyakov [\(2014](#page-18-0)) and Schrumpf et al. ([2013\)](#page-19-0).

The long MRT_C of the HF relative to fLF and oLF and the high weight fraction of the HF ($>95\%$ of the bulk soil) suggest that most C in the investigated soil was stabilized by association with minerals. The *oLF* constituted only a small part of the bulk SOM in terms of weight $(0.3-1\%)$ due to little aggregate formation in sandy soils (Juo and Franzluebbers [2003\)](#page-18-0), as shown previously (Roscoe et al. [2004\)](#page-19-0). However, due to the high C concentration in the oLF , C storage within aggregates at intermediate MRT_Cs was considerable in our ecosystem $(4-12\%$ of total C).

Effect of soil depth on SOM turnover

The increases in ${}^{15}N$ and ${}^{13}C$ in the SOM fractions and the bulk soil with soil depth (except the ^{13}C of the oLF) were presumably caused by isotopic discrimination by the microbial community, and suggest that SOM age increases with depth, in accordance with the general conceptual understanding of SOM formation and turnover (Brunn et al. [2014;](#page-17-0) Schrumpf et al. [2013](#page-19-0)). The relatively higher C input to the A1 horizon reflected a substantial contribution from aboveground litter to C_{new} , as also indicated by the different ^{13}C signatures of the fLF and the roots (Table [2](#page-7-0)). Decreases in C and N concentration with depth have

been reported previously (e.g., Johnsen et al. [2013](#page-18-0); Ostrowska and Porębska [2012\)](#page-19-0) and are probably due to a lower SOM input (lower C_{new}) in the A2 horizon combined with a different quality of the SOM entering the soil (Bowden et al. [2014](#page-17-0)). The increases in C:N ratios of the oLF and fLF with depth were probably due to concurrent increases in the C:N ratio of the roots but could also originate from higher concentration of recalcitrant compounds (Brunn et al. [2014\)](#page-17-0). The higher MRT_C of the HF in the A2 horizon compared to the A1 horizon suggests increased C stabilization with depth.

Effect of climate treatments on SOM cycling

Depth-dependent responses to climate treatments

While 13 C labeling of the SOC occurred in both horizons, the majority of all changes in response to climate treatments were observed in the A2 horizon (Figs. [2](#page-8-0), [3;](#page-11-0) Table [3\)](#page-9-0). This was contrary to the expected, as C turnover was generally higher in the A1 horizon. The higher responsiveness to climate change of the A2 horizon compared to the superior A1 horizon may be caused by the observed pattern of relatively large changes of belowground plant processes, in particular increased deep root productivity (Arndal et al. [2013\)](#page-17-0), compared to relatively small changes in the aboveground plant biomass in response to the climate treatments at the experimental site (Kongstad et al. [2012\)](#page-18-0).

Warming

Decreases of the fLF C and N pools were in accordance with hypothesis 1. The HF lost less C and N compared to the fLF , which confirms the previous observations by Leifeld et al. [\(2013](#page-18-0)) of a higher temperature sensitivity of labile SOM (high C:N ratio) relative to slowly decomposing/recalcitrant SOM. However, other studies have shown a higher temperature sensitivity of slowly decomposing SOM (e.g., Follett et al. [2012;](#page-17-0) Suseela et al. [2013\)](#page-19-0). In their review, Conant et al. (2011) concluded that most longterm, cross-site studies indicate that the degradation of slowly decomposing SOM is relatively insensitive to temperature. In contrast, the majority of incubation studies, which typically capture mostly the responses of readily decomposable SOM, presenting only

5–15% of the total SOM pool, show that the decomposition of slowly decomposing SOM is more temperature sensitive than labile SOM (Conant et al. 2011).

The combined annual loss of C from the fLF C and HF C stocks of 43 g m⁻² y⁻¹ was similar to the increase in R_s induced by warming of 56–58 g m⁻² y^{-1} at our site (Selsted et al. [2012](#page-19-0)). These values are in line with an increase in R_s in a tall-grass prairie of 59 g C m⁻² y⁻¹ in response to 2 °C warming (Luo et al. [2009\)](#page-18-0) but slightly higher than the estimated decrease in OC at temperature increase of 3° C in a range of grassland soils (19 g C m⁻² y⁻¹; Follett et al. [2012](#page-17-0)), however in the latter study only C stocks from 0 to 10 cm depth were considered. Our results imply an increased $CO₂$ release due to soil decomposition in a warming world. Additionally, a stronger decrease of the fLF N stock (-51%) compared to the fLF C stock $(-43%)$ may indicate progressive N limitation of the ecosystem under warming.

Drought

Contrary to hypothesis 2, the $fLF \text{C}$ stock and $fLF \text{C}$ and N concentrations did not increase in response to drought and the fLF N stock furthermore decreased. Possibly, the duration and timing of the drought (applied during selected periods each spring or summer, Fig. [1\)](#page-4-0) was not long enough to manifest the predicted changes in the SOM pool. In addition, any changes manifested during the relatively short-term drought events (3-4 weeks) may rapidly diminish due to the fast recovery of photosynthetic rates, R_s and plant growth after rewetting (Albert et al. [2011](#page-17-0); Kongstad et al. [2012](#page-18-0); Selsted et al. [2012\)](#page-19-0). Our results therefore contrast previous reports of attenuated N turnover (Bimüller et al. 2014), increases in the labile SOC stocks and labile SOM C and N concentrations, and a generally slower SOM turnover (Garten et al. [2009\)](#page-17-0) under drought.

Elevated $CO₂$

Contrary to hypothesis 3, elevated $CO₂$ concentration decreased A2 horizon fLF C and fLF N stocks and tended to decrease the A1 horizon $fLF \text{ C}$ and $fLF \text{ N}$ stocks. Decreases in the fLF C and N stocks under elevated $CO₂$ were the direct consequence of the decrease of the weight fractions of the fLF in both horizons as the concentrations of C and N in the $f\mathcal{L}F$ were either unchanged or increased under elevated $CO₂$ (Table [3\)](#page-9-0). Given the simultaneous increases in net photosynthesis (Albert et al. 2011) and R_s (Selsted et al. [2012\)](#page-19-0), increased root growth (Arndal et al. [2013\)](#page-17-0) and unchanged aboveground biomass (Kongstad et al. [2012\)](#page-18-0) at the experimental site, the decreased weight fractions of the fLF , and decreased fLF C and N stocks indicate a faster turnover of labile SOM under elevated CO2. Our finding is in agreement with previous studies showing that elevated $CO₂$ may not lead to a higher content of SOC since not only the C input, but also C turnover in the soil is stimulated (Carney et al. [2007](#page-17-0); Hofmockel et al. [2011b;](#page-18-0) Van Groenigen et al. [2014](#page-19-0)). Increased C turnover is possibly triggered by the stimulation of microbial degradation by enhanced labile C input under elevated $CO₂$ (Van Groenigen et al. [2014\)](#page-19-0). An altered microbial community structure and composition under elevated $CO₂$, potentially involving the up-regulation of functional genes and enzymes involved in labile C decomposition (Carney et al. [2007;](#page-17-0) He et al. [2010](#page-18-0); Nie et al. [2014](#page-19-0)) and decreased soil aggregation (Henry et al. [2005](#page-18-0)) provide alternative explanations. Progressive N limitation is often anticipated to hinder increases in SOC stocks under increased atmospheric $CO₂$, (e.g. Hungate et al. [2006\)](#page-18-0). While plant growth was not N limited under elevated $CO₂$, increased leaf C:N ratios, both mea-sured after two treatment years (Larsen et al. [2011](#page-18-0)), may have reduced ecosystem N availabilty after eight years of treatment and may have contributed to the decreases in the fLF C and N stocks. Changes in more stable SOM (HF) and in the bulk soil C and N stocks under elevated $CO₂$ were not detected, perhaps due to longer turnover times of SOM within the HF.

The average loss of C from the fLF observed under elevated CO₂ (ca. 8 g C m⁻² y⁻¹ after eight treatment years in this study) was much smaller than the increase in R_s (124–146 g C m⁻² y⁻¹) during the initial three treatment years (Selsted et al. [2012\)](#page-19-0). This suggests a substantial increase in root respiration and/or flux of labile organic compounds such as root exudates rapidly utilized and respired by the soil microbial community, but also potentially additional losses of C from deeper soil layers than those sampled in this study (the average sampling depth was 17.4 cm).

The loss of N from the fLF under elevated $CO₂$ averaged ca. 0.25 g N m^{-2} y⁻¹. However, neither N-leaching [0.1–0.6 g N m⁻² y⁻¹; Larsen et al. (2011)]

nor nitrous oxide (N₂O) degassing $\left[\langle 8.8 \times 10^{-4} \right]$ $g N m^{-2} y^{-1}$; Carter et al. [\(2011](#page-17-0))] were affected by $CO₂$ levels, and the increase in root mass under elevated $CO₂$ was not accompanied by a proportional increase in root N uptake (Arndal et al. [2013\)](#page-17-0). Emissions of dinitrogen (N_2) were not quantified, but as nitrate levels at the experimental site are low $(\ll 1 \text{ mM};$ Larsen et al. [\(2011\)](#page-18-0)) the production of N_2 as the end product of denitrification is favored. As such, N_2 emission may have been the pathway for the loss of fLF N.

The apparent persistence of organic C and N stocks of the bulk soil and the HF in response to elevated $CO₂$ indicates that stabilization of C and N does not change under elevated $CO₂$ alone after eight treatments years. Our findings contrast those by Van Groenigen et al. [\(2014](#page-19-0)) who used a two-pool model to simulate equal increases in the turnover rate of old and new C under elevated $CO₂$.

Similarly to the observed effects of elevated $CO₂$ on organic C and N stocks, increases in soil C concentration were only observed for the A2 horizon fLF, and were probably caused by higher plant C concentrations under elevated $CO₂$ (reviewed in Dieleman et al. [2012\)](#page-17-0). Nitrogen concentrations of the bulk A2 horizon soil decreased under elevated $CO₂$, in line with previous reports on enhanced organic N mineralization to support increased primary production under elevated $CO₂$ (Hofmockel et al. [2011a\)](#page-18-0).

Changes in organic C and N stocks in a future climate

In accordance with the SOM response under elevated $CO₂$ only, the full treatment combination, simulating a future climate scenario, decreased the A2 horizon fLF C and N stocks and tended to decrease the A2 horizon HF C and bulk C stocks. Net photosynthesis (Albert et al. 2011) and R_s (Selsted et al. 2012) were increased under the full treatment combination, however neither aboveground (Kongstad et al. [2012\)](#page-18-0) nor belowground biomass (Arndal et al. [2013\)](#page-17-0) changed significantly relative to ambient conditions. Hence, with unchanged litter inputs to the ecosystem across treatments, the decline of the $fLF \text{C}$ and N stocks suggest a faster SOM turnover under future environmental conditions. Contrary to our observations under elevated $CO₂$ alone, future conditions tended to reduce SOM stabilization. Our findings contrast previous short-term observations on unchanged plant biomass, SOM turnover and soil fauna at the experimental site in the three-factorial treatment (hypothesis 4) and indicate different responses of ecosystem C turnover in the short- and longer term.

The increase in R_s of 140–150 g C m⁻² y⁻¹ under the full treatment combination (Selsted et al. [2012\)](#page-19-0) by far exceeded the annual C loss from the fLF C pool $(5 \text{ g C m}^{-2} \text{ y}^{-1})$, in analogy to the conditions under elevated $CO₂$ only. Reasons for the deviation between the increase in R_s and the observed SOC losses are similar to ones stated in the previous section, but can further result from a decline in the SOC stocks of the HF and bulk soil under the full treatment combination.

Few studies have investigated the combined controls of atmospheric CO₂, warming and drought on SOM dynamics. In a replanted, N-poor old-field ecosystem (seven plant species including two N_2 -fixers), moderate increases of the labile SOC stock were reported (Garten et al. [2009](#page-17-0)) after four years with experimental factors similar to the current work. Contrasting changes in SOM stocks in response to similar experimental conditions are possible for several reasons: (1) differences in the magnitude of the applied climate treatments. In the old-field experiment (Garten et al. [2009](#page-17-0)), the imposed temperature and $CO₂$ increases were 1.5 \degree C and 180 ppm higher, respectively, relative to our experiment; (2) differences in the plant succession, geological material and ecosystem at the experimental sites; (3) adaptable effects of climate change on different plant species (Albert et al. [2011;](#page-17-0) Andresen et al. [2010\)](#page-17-0). The relative allocation of C to soluble low molecular weight compounds and insoluble lipids differs among plant types, potentially affecting litter decay rates and C stabilization (Cotrofo et al. [2013\)](#page-17-0); (4) different timescales of investigations. Short-term ecosystem responses to climate change may increase (Kröel-Dulay et al. 2015) or decrease (Boesgaard 2013) in the long term or may be reversed (Suttle et al. [2007](#page-19-0)); and (5) recent disturbance of the ecosystem equilibrium in Garten et al. (2009) . According to Kröel-Dulay et al. [\(2015\)](#page-18-0) the dynamic state of an ecosystem may determine its responsiveness to climate change with recently disturbed ecosystems being more sensitive than ecosystems that are in equilibrium.

Conclusions

Soil organic matter beneath the shrubland species Deschampsia flexuosa was older in the A2 horizon than in the overlying A1 horizon, and within each horizon, SOM was oldest in the mineral-associated, more recalcitrant soil fraction, indicating C stabilization on minerals at depth. A2 horizon SOM was susceptible to environmental change whereas A1 horizon SOM was largely unaffected; in the A2 horizon, significant decreases of the fLF (labile) C and N stocks (precursor to HF (stable) SOM) were observed under warming, elevated $CO₂$ and the three-factorial treatment, i.e. the 2075 climate scenario for Denmark. These results suggest reduced C stabilization in this heathland soil under future climatic conditions. Combined with previous reports of increased net photosynthesis and soil respiration at the experimental site, our results further provide evidence to the hypothesis that shrubland SOM will be susceptible to increased C and N turnover, increased N mineralization, and increased associated net C losses in the future.

Danish shrublands have hitherto been anticipated to be CO_2 neutral (Gyldenkærne et al. [2005\)](#page-18-0). Extrapolating our results on 98.000 ha shrubland in Denmark (or 2.3% of the country's area; Gyldenkærne et al. [2005\)](#page-18-0), under the assumption of an unchanged plant cover of 77% D. flexuosa with time (Kongstad et al. 2012) and a linear decrease of the $fLF \text{C}$ stock, our results imply a release of 14 Gg CO_2 y⁻¹ to the atmosphere. This corresponds to only $\sim 0.5\%$ of the $CO₂$ emissions from land use and land use change in Denmark (2600 Gg CO_2 equivalents y⁻¹, 2003 figures; Gyldenkærne et al. ([2005\)](#page-18-0)), and a decline in Danish shrubland topsoil OC stocks is hence not expected to contribute substantially to the national greenhouse gas budget. In countries with larger shrubland cover, however, a future C loss in this ecosystem type could have a much higher significance.

Based on our results we suggest that future research efforts should be centered around the characterization of potential long-term effects of climate change on SOC and SON dynamics beneath different shrubland plant species with augmented focus on the detailed examination of the ingoing and outgoing C and nutrient fluxes.

Acknowledgements The authors thank Nina Thomsen, Mette Flodgaard and Anja Nielsen for skilled technical and laboratory support. Professor Bent T. Christensen at Aarhus University, Denmark, provided competent guidance on initial methodology test trials. Stina Rasmussen and Henrik Breuning-Madsen at the University of Copenhagen are thanked for contributing with the

textural analysis of the studied soil. The CLIMAITE experiment is financially supported by the Villum Kann Rasmussen Foundation with co-funding from Air Liquide, DONG Energy and SMC Pneumatic A/S.

References

- Albert KR, Ro-Poulsen H, Mikkelsen TN, Michelsen A, Van der Linden L, Beier C (2011) Interactive effects of elevated CO2, warming, and drought on photosynthesis of Deschampsia flexuosa in a temperate heath ecosystem. J Exp Bot 62(12):4253–4266
- Amundson RG, Davidson EA (1990) Carbon dioxide and nitrogenous gases in the soil atmosphere. J Geochem Explor 38(1–2):13–41
- Andresen LC, Michelsen A, Jonasson S, Schmidt IK, Mikkelsen T, Ambus P, Beier C (2010) Plant nutrient mobilization in temperate heathland responds to elevated $CO₂$, temperature and drought. Plant Soil 328(1):381–396
- Arndal MF, Schmidt IK, Kongstad J, Beier C, Michelsen A (2013) Root growth and N dynamics in response to multiyear experimental warming, summer drought and elevated CO2 in a mixed heathland-grass ecosystem. Funct Plant Biol 42(1):1–10
- Badeck FW, Tcherke G, Nogue S, Piel C, Ghashghaie J (2005) Post-photosynthetic fractionation of stable carbon isotopes between plant organs—a widespread phenomenon. Rapid Commun Mass Spectronom 19(11):1381–1391
- Baisden WT, Amundson R, Cook AC, Brenner DL (2002) Turnover and storage of C and N in five density fractions from California annual grassland surface soils. Global Biogeochem Cy 16(4):1117–1132
- Beare MH, Gregorich EG (2007) Physically uncomplexed organic matter. In: Carter MR, Gregoric EG (eds) Soil sampling and methods of analysis, 2nd edn. CRC Press, Boca Raton
- Beier C, Emmett BA, Tietema A, Schmidt IK, Penuelas J, Kovács Láng E, Duce P, De Angelis P, Gorissen A, Estiarte M, de Dato D, Sowerby A, Kröel-Dulay G, Lellei-Kovács E, Kull O, Mand P, Petersen H, Gjelstrup P, Spano D, Estiarte M (2009) Carbon and nitrogen balances for six shrublands across Europe. Global Biogeochem Cy 23(4):1–13
- Bimüller C, Dannenmann M, Tejedor J, von Lützow M, Buegger F, Meier R, Haug S, Schroll R, Kögel-Knabner I (2014) Prolonged summer droughts retard soil N processing and stabilization in organo-mineral fractions. Soil Biol Biochem 68:241–251
- Bock M, Glaser B, Millar N (2007) Sequestration and turnover of plant- and microbially derived sugars in a temperate grassland soil during 7 years exposed to elevated atmospheric pCO₂. Global Change Biol 13:478-490
- Boesgaard K (2013) Long-term ecophysiological responses to climate change. Technical University of Denmark, Kgs Lyngby. [http://orbit.dtu.dk/files/74245683/Thesis_FINAL_](http://orbit.dtu.dk/files/74245683/Thesis_FINAL_kboe.PDF) [kboe.PDF](http://orbit.dtu.dk/files/74245683/Thesis_FINAL_kboe.PDF)
- Bowden RD, Deemb L, Plantec AF, Peltre C, Nadelhoffer K, Lajtha K (2014) Litter input controls on soil carbon in a temperate deciduous forest. Soil Sci Soc Am J 78:S66–S75
- Brunn M, Spielvogel S, Sauer T, Oelmann Y (2014) Temperature and precipitation effects on δ^{13} C depth profiles in SOM under temperate beech forests. Geoderma 235–236:146–153
- Buurman P, Roscoe R (2011) Different chemical composition of free light, occluded light and extractable SOM fractions in soils of Cerrado and tilled and untilled fields, Minas Gerais, Brazil: a pyrolysis-GC/MS study. Eur J Soil Sci 62:253–266
- Carney K, Hungate B, Drake B, Megonigal J (2007) Altered soil microbial community at elevated $CO₂$ leads to loss of soil carbon. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 104(12):4990–4995
- Carter MS, Ambus P, Albert K, Larsen KS, Anderson M, Prieme A, Van der Linden L, Beier C (2011) Effects of elevated atmospheric $CO₂$, prolonged summer drought and temperature increase on N_2O and CH₄ fluxes in a temperate heathland. Soil Biol Biochem 43(8):1660–1670
- Carter MS, Larsen KS, Emmett B, Estiarte M, Field C, Leith ID, Lund M, Meijide A, Mills RTE, Niinemets Ü, Peñuelas J, Portillo-Estrada M, Schmidt IK, Selsted MB, Sheppard LJ, Sowerby A, Tietema A, Beier C (2012) Synthesizing greenhouse gas fluxes across nine European peatlands and shrublands—responses to climatic and environmental changes. Biogeosciences 9:3739–3755
- Christensen BT (2001) Physical fractionation of soil and structural and functional complexity in organic matter turnover. Eur J Soil Sci 52(3):345–353
- Cotrofo MF, Gorissen A (1997) Elevated $CO₂$ enhances belowground C allocation in three perennial grass species at different levels of N availability. New Phytol 137:421–431
- Cotrofo MF, Wallenstein MD, Boot CM, Denef K, Paul E (2013) The microbial efficiency-matrix stabilization (MEMS) framework integrates plant litter decomposition with soil organic matter stabilization: do labile plant inputs form stable soil organic matter? Global Change Biol 19(4):988–995
- Davidson EA, Janssens IA (2006) Temperature sensitivity of soil carbon decomposition and feedbacks to climate change. Nature 440(9):165–173
- Derrien D, Amelung W (2011) Computing the mean residence time of soil carbon fractions using stable isotopes: impacts of the model framework. Eur J Soil Sci 62:237–252
- Dieleman WIJ, Vicca S, Dijkstra FA, Hagedorn F, Hovenden MJ, Larsen KS, Morgan JA, Volder A, Beier C, Dukes JS, King J, Leuzinger S, Linder S, Luo YQ, Oren R, de Angelis P, Tingey D, Hoosbeek MR, Janssens IA (2012) Simple additive effects are rare: a quantitative review of plant biomass and soil process responses to combined manipulations of $CO₂$ and temperature. Global Change Biol 18(9):2681–2693
- Follett RF, Stewart CE, Preuessner EG, Kimble JM (2012) Effects of climate change on soil carbon and nitrogen storage in the US Great Plains. J Soil Water Conserv 67(5):331–342
- Garten C, Classen AT, Norby RJ (2009) Soil moisture surpasses elevated CO2 and temperature as a control on soil carbon dynamics in a multi-factor climate change experiment. Plant Soil 319(1):85–94
- Gregorich EG, Beare MH, Mckim UF, Skjemstad JO (2006) Chemical and biological characteristics of physically uncomplexed organic matter. Soil Sci Soc Am J 70(3):975–985
- Gunina A, Kuzyakov Y (2014) Pathways of litter C by formation of aggregates and SOM density fractions: implications from 13C natural abundance. Soil Biol Biochem 71:95–104
- Gyldenkærne S, Münier B, Olsen J, Elsnab Olesen S, Petersen B, Christensen B (2005) Opgørelse af $CO₂$ -emissioner fra arealanvendelse og ændringer i arealanvendelse. Arbejdsrapport fra DMU, nr. 213. In. Danmarks Miljøundersøgelser. Miljøministeriet
- Haugwitz MS, Bergmark L, Prieme A, Christensen S, Beier C, Michelsen A (2014) Soil microorganisms respond to five years of climate change manipulations and elevated atmospheric $CO₂$ in a temperate heath ecosystem. Plant Soil 374:211–222
- He Z, Xu M, Deng Y, Kang S, Kellogg L, Wu L, Van Nostrand J, Hobbie S, Reich P, Zhou J (2010) Metagenomic analysis reveals a marked divergence in the structure of belowground microbial communities at elevated CO₂. Ecol Lett 13(5):564–575
- Heimann M, Reichstein M (2008) Terrestrial ecosystem carbon
dynamics and climate feedbacks. Nature and climate feedbacks. Nature 451(7176):289–292
- Henry H, Juarez J, Field C, Vitousek P (2005) Interactive effects of elevated $CO₂$. N deposition and climate change on extracellular enzyme activity and soil density fractionation in a California annual grassland. Global Change Biol 11(10):1808–1815
- Hofmockel KS, Gallet-Budynek A, McCarthy HR, Currie WS, Jackson RB, Finzi A (2011a) Sources of increased N uptake in forest trees growing under elevated CO_2 : results
of a large-scale $15N$ study. Global Change Biol 17:3338–3350
- Hofmockel KS, Zak DR, Moran KK, Jastrow JD (2011b) Changes in forest soil organic matter pools after a decade of elevated $CO₂$ and $O₃$. Soil Biol Biochem 43(7):1518–1527
- Hungate BA, Johnson DW, Dijkstra FA, Hymus G, Stiling P, Megonigal JP, Pagel AL, Moan JL, Day F, Li J, Hinkle R, Drake BG (2006) Nitrogen cycling during seven years of atmospheric $CO₂$ enrichment in a shrub oak woodland. Ecology 87(1):26–40
- IPCC (2013) Summary for Policymakers. In: Stocker TF, Qin D, Plattner G-K, Tignor M, Allen SK, Boschung J, Nauels A, Xia Y, Bex V and Midgle PM (eds) Climate change 2013: the physical science basis. Contribution of working group I to the fifth assessment report of the intergovernmental panel on climate change. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge
- John B, Yamashita T, Ludwig B, Flessa H (2005) Storage of organic carbon in aggregate and density fractions of silty soils under different types of land use. Geoderma 128(1–2):63–79
- Johnsen KH, Samuelson LJ, Sanchez FG, Eaton RJ (2013) Soil carbon and nitrogen content and stabilization in mid-rotation, intensively managed sweetgum and loblolly pine stands. Forest Ecol Manag 302:144–153
- Juo ASR, Franzluebbers K (2003) Tropical soils. Properties and management for sustainable agriculture. Oxford University Press, New York
- Kleber M, Sollins P, Sutton R (2007) A conceptual model of organo-mineral interactions in soils: self-assembly of organic molecular fragments into zonal structures on mineral surfaces. Biogeochemistry 85(1):9–24
- Kogel-Knabner I, Guggenberger G, Kleber M, Kandeler E, Kalbitz K, Scheu S, Eusterhues K, Leinweber P (2008) Organo-mineral associations in temperate soils: integrating biology, mineralogy, and organic matter chemistry. J Plant Nutr Soil Sci 171(1):61–82
- Kongstad J, Schmidt IK, Riis-Nielsen T, Arndal MF, Mikkelsen TN, Beier C (2012) High resilience in heathland plants to changes in temperature, drought, and $CO₂$ in combination: results from the CLIMAITE experiment. Ecosystems 15(2):269–283
- Kotroczo Z, Fekete I, Toth JA, Tothmeresz B, Balazsy S (2008) Effect of leaf- and root-litter manipulation for carbondioxide efflux in forest soil. Cereal Res Commun 36:663–666
- Kröel-Dulay G, Ransijn J, Schmidt IK, Beier C, De Angelis P, de Dato G, Dukes JS, Emmett B, Estiarte M, Garadnai J, Kongstad J, Kovacs-Lang E, Larsen KS, Liberati D, Ogaya R, Riis-Nielsen T, Smith AR, Sowerby A, Tietema A, Penuelas J (2015) Increased sensitivity to climate change in disturbed ecosystems. Nat Commun 6:1–6
- Larsen KS, Andresen LC, Beier C, Jonasson S, Albert KR, Ambus P, Arndal MF, Carter MS, Christensen S, Holmstrup M, Ibrom A, Kongstad J, van der Linden L, Maraldo K, Michelsen A, Mikkelsen TN, Pilegaard K, Prieme A, Ro-Poulsen H, Schmidt IK, Selsted MB, Stevnbak K (2011) Reduced N cycling in response to elevated $CO₂$, warming, and drought in a Danish heathland: synthesizing results of the CLIMAITE project after two years of treatments. Global Change Biol 17(5):1884–1899
- Leifeld J, Bassin S, Conen F, Hajdas I, Egli M, Fuhrer J (2013) Control of soil pH on turnover of belowground organic matter in subalpine grassland. Biogeochemistry 112:59–69
- Linn DM, Doran JW (1984) Effect of water-filled pore space on carbon dioxide and nitrous oxide production in tilled and nontilled soils. Soil Sci Soc Am J 48:1268–1272
- Luo Y, Sherry R, Zhou X, Wan S (2009) Terrestrial carboncycle feedback to climate warming: experimental evidence on plant regulation and impacts of biofuel feedstock harvest. Global Change Biol 1(1):62–74
- Maraldo K, Krogh PH, van der Linden L, Christensen BT, Mikkelsen TN, Beier C, Holmstrup M (2010) The counteracting effects of elevated atmospheric $CO₂$ concentrations and drought episodes: studies of enchytraeid communities in a dry heathland. Soil Biol Biochem 42(11):1958–1966
- Marschner B, Brodowski S, Dreves A, Gleixner G, Gude A, Grootes PM, Hamer U, Heim A, Jandl G, Ji R, Kaiser K, Kalbitz K, Kramer C, Leinweber P, Rethemeyer J, Schäffer A, Schmidt MWI, Schwark L, Wiesenberg GLB (2008) How relevant is recalcitrance for the stabilization of organic matter. J Plant Nutr Soil Sci 171:91–110
- Mehrabanian M (2013) Molecular geochemistry of soil organic matter by pyrolysis gas chromatography/mass spectrometry (GC/MS) technique: a review. J Soil Sci Environ Manag 4(2):11–16
- Meyer S, Leifeild J (2013) Concurrent increase in ^{15}N and radiocarbon age in soil density fractions. J Plant Nutr Soil Sci 176:505–508
- Mikkelsen TN, Beier C, Holmstrup M, Schmidt IK, Ambus P, Pilegaard K, Michelsen A, Albert K, Andresen LC, Arndal MF, Bruun N, Christensen S, Danbæk S, Gundersen P,

Jørgensen P, Linden LG, Kongstad J, Maraldo K, Prieme´ A, Riis-Nielsen T, Ro-Poulsen H, Stevnbak K, Selsted MB, Sørensen P, Larsen KS, Carter MS, Ibrom A, Martinussen T, Miglietta F, Sverdrup H (2008) Experimental design of multifactor climate change experiments with elevated CO₂, warming and drought: the CLIMAITE project. Funct Ecol 22:185–195

- Mikutta R, Kleber M, Torn MS, Jahn R (2006) Stabilization of soil organic matter: association with minerals or chemical recalcitrance? Biogeochemistry 77:25–56
- Munné Bosch S (2004) Die and let live: leaf senescence contributes to plant survival under drought stress. Funct Plant Biol 31(3):203–216
- Nie M, Pendall E, Bell C, Wallenstein MD (2014) Soil aggregate size distribution mediates microbial climate change feedbacks. Soil Biol Biochem 68:357–365
- Ostrowska A, Porębska G (2012) Assement of TOC-SOM and SOM-TOC conversion in forest soil. Proc J Environ Stud 21(6):1767–1775
- Park R, Epstein S (1961) Metabolic fractionation of C^{13} and C^{12} in plants. Plant Physiol 36(2):133–138
- Poirier N, Derenne S, Balesdent J, Mariotti A, Massiot D, Largeau C (2003) Isolation and analysis of the non-hydrolysable fraction of a forest soil and an arable soil (Lacadee, southwest France). Eur J Soil Sci 54(2):243–255
- R Core Team (2014) R: A language and environment for statistical computing. In. R Foundation for statistical computing, Vienna, Austria
- Raab GA, Bartling MH, Stapanian MA, Cole WH, Tidwell RL, Cappo KA (1990) The homogenization of environmental soil samples in bulk. In: Simmons MS (ed) Hazardous waste measurements. CRC Press, Boca Raton
- Reinsch S, Ambus P (2013) In situ ${}^{13}CO_2$ pulse-labeling in a temperate heathland—development of a mobile multi-plot field setup. Rapid Commun Mass Spectronom 27:1417–1428
- Roscoe R, Buurman P, van Lagen B, Velhorst E (2004) Transformation in occluded light fraction organic matter in a clayey oxisol; evidence from ¹³C-CPMAS-NMR and $d^{13}C$ signature. Rev Bras Cienc Solo 28:811–818
- Scherber C, Gladbach DJ, Stevnbak K, Karsten RJ, Schmidt IK, Michelsen A, Albert KR, Larsen KS, Mikkelsen TN, Beier C, Christensen S (2013) Multi-factor climate change effects on insect herbivore performance. Ecol Evol 3(6):1449–1460
- Schlesinger WH, Reynolds JF, Cunningham GL, Huenneke LF, Jarrel WM, Virginia RA, Whitford WG (1990) Biological feedbacks in global desertification. Sci Total Environ 247(4946):1043–1048
- Schmidt MWI, Rumpel C, Kogel-Knabner I (1999) Evaluation of an ultrasonic dispersion procedure to isolate primary organomineral complexes from soils. Eur J Soil Sci 50(1):87–94
- Schnitzer M, Khan SU (1978) Soil organic matter. Developments in soil science 8. Elsevier, Amsterdam
- Schrumpf M, Kaiser K, Guggenberger G, Persson T, Kogel-Knabner I, Schulze ED (2013) Storage and stability of organic carbon in soils as related to depth, occlusion within aggregates, and attachment to minerals. Biogeosciences 10(3):1675–1691
- Selsted MB, van der Linden L, Ibrom A, Michelsen A, Larsen KS, Pedersen JK, Mikkelsen T, Pilegaard K, Beier C, Ambus P (2012) Soil respiration is stimulated by elevated CO2 and reduced by summer drought: three years of measurements in a multifactor ecosystem manipulation experiment in a temperate heathland (CLIMAITE). Global Change Biol 18:1216–1230
- Skopp J, Jawson MD, Doran JW (1990) Steady-state aerobic microbial activity as a function of soil water content. Soil Sci Soc Am J 54(6):1619–1625
- Suseela V, Tharayil N, Xing B, Dukes JS (2013) Labile compounds in plant litter reduced the sensitivity of decomposition to warming and altered precipitation. New Phytol 200:122–133
- Suttle KB, Thomsen MA, Power ME (2007) Species interactions reverse grassland responses to changing climate. Science 315(5812):6640–6642
- Thockmorton HM, Bird JA, Dane L, Firestone MK, Horwarth WR (2012) The source of microbial C has little impact on soil organic matter stabilisation in forest ecosystems. Ecol Lett 15:1257–1265
- Trumbore SE, Czimczik CI (2008) Geology—an uncertain future for soil carbon. Science 321(5895):1455–1456
- Van Groenigen K, Qi X, Osenberg C, Luo Y, Hungate B (2014) Faster decomposition under increased atmospheric CO₂ limits soil carbon storage. Science 344(6183):508–509
- Wagai R, Mayer LM, Kitayama K (2009) Nature of the ''occluded'' low-density fraction in soil organic matter studies: a critical review. Soil Sci Plant Nutr 55(1):13–25
- Welch BL (1947) The generalization of "Student's" problem when several different population variances are involved. Biometrika 34(1–2):28–35
- Xu M, Lou Y, Sun X, Wang W, Baniyamuddin M, Zhao K (2011) Soil organic carbon active fractions as early indicators for total carbon change under straw incorporation. Biol Fert Soils 47:745–752