

Effect of sediment grain size and bioturbation on decomposition of organic matter from aquaculture

Elena Martinez-Garcia . Marita Sundstein Carlsson . Pablo Sanchez-Jerez · José Luis Sánchez-Lizaso · Carlos Sanz-Lazaro · Marianne Holmer

Received: 5 February 2015 / Accepted: 19 June 2015 / Published online: 30 June 2015 - Springer International Publishing Switzerland 2015

Abstract Sediment grain size plays a major role in sediment biogeochemistry and sediments with different grain size are expected to react differently to organic enrichment. Through a mesocosm approach we tested the behavior of sediments with two types of predominant grain size (sandy and muddy sediments) under two levels of organic enrichment, related to mussel and fish farming. The polychaete Hediste diversicolor was used to simulate macrofauna bioturbation and bioirrigation. H. diversicolor stimulated organic matter (OM) mineralization and nutrient recycling. Muddy sediments had more OM from nature, resulting in higher sulfate reduction rates than sandy sediments. Under low levels of organic enrichment grain size did not have any effect on benthic fluxes (sediment oxygen uptake, total $CO₂$, ammonium, nitrate, nitrite and phosphate). However, at high

Responsible Editor: Maren Voss.

Electronic supplementary material The online version of this article (doi[:10.1007/s10533-015-0119-y\)](http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s10533-015-0119-y) contains supplementary material, which is available to authorized users.

E. Martinez-Garcia (⊠) · P. Sanchez-Jerez ·

J. L. Sánchez-Lizaso · C. Sanz-Lazaro

Department of Marine Sciences and Applied Biology, University of Alicante, PO Box 99, 03080 Alicante, Spain e-mail: elena.martinez@ua.es

M. S. Carlsson - M. Holmer Department of Biology, University of Southern Denmark, 5230 Odense M, Denmark

levels of organic enrichment, sandy sediments accumulated less OM, less sulfide and less ammonium than muddy sediments, while sediment oxygen uptake and total $CO₂$ showed similar levels between sandy and muddy sediments. Thus, grain size should be considered a key parameter for site selection of fish farming facilities when aiming for a sustainable aquaculture industry.

Keywords Aquaculture - Organic enrichment - Benthic fluxes - Sediment biogeochemistry - Hediste diversicolor

Introduction

Soft sediments play a major role in biogeochemical cycles on a global scale (Papageorgiou et al. [2010](#page-14-0)). The functioning of soft sediments is complex due to the multiple variables and their interactions. Marine aquaculture facilities generate waste products that result in increased deposition rate of organic matter (OM), generally one or two orders of magnitude greater than natural background sedimentation (Wildish and Pohle [2005;](#page-15-0) Sundstein-Carlsson et al. [2009](#page-13-0)). This organic enrichment may change the sediment biogeochemistry, resulting in oxygen depletion, increased nutrient efflux and diminished benthic macrofauna diversity (Pearson and Rosenberg [1978](#page-14-0); Hargrave et al. [2008](#page-14-0)). Low oxygen concentrations in the benthic environment promote anaerobic metabolic pathways, mainly sulfate reduction leading to high concentrations of dissolved sulfide in sediment pore water (Holmer et al. [2005\)](#page-14-0). If sulfate is depleted, methanogenesis becomes the dominant microbial metabolic pathway. Under reduced conditions, sediments are prone to increase the nutrient flux to the water column as processes such as nitrification are inhibited and phosphate is released from iron-bound pools (Christensen et al. [2000;](#page-13-0) Sundstein-Carlsson et al. [2012](#page-13-0)). Sulfides and methane have deleterious consequences for the macrofauna inhabiting the sediment (Gray et al. [2002](#page-14-0); Hargrave et al. [2008](#page-14-0)). Burrowing macrofauna are responsible for bioturbation and bioirrigation, which enhance oxic conditions in sediments by maximizing the sediment surface in contact with the water column and through active transport of oxygen into the sediment (Sanz-Lázaro and Marín 2011). Such activities increase the benthic metabolic capacity, promoting phosphate retention by the sediment and nitrogen removal from the system by enhancing the coupling between nitrification and denitrification (Pelegri et al. [1994;](#page-14-0) Banta et al. [1999](#page-13-0); Christensen et al. [2003\)](#page-13-0). Thus, bioturbation and bioirrigation can diminish the possible negative effects of organic enrichment in the sediment, considering that pollution does not reach high levels causing partial or total defaunation (Pearson and Rosenberg [1978](#page-14-0)).

The environmental effects of OM enrichment from fish farming depend on the cultivation technique, feed composition (Stigebrandta et al. [2004](#page-15-0); Holmer et al. [2005\)](#page-14-0) and also site-specific conditions including the prevailing physico-chemical and biological features of the receiving environment (Islam [2005;](#page-14-0) Sweetman et al. [2014\)](#page-15-0). While studies have focused on the interactions of macrofauna and OM enrichment on sediment biogeochemistry (Kristensen [1988;](#page-14-0) Kalantzi and Karakassis [2006](#page-14-0); Martinez-Garcia et al. [2013\)](#page-14-0) few have focused on these effects in sediments with different grain size (Papageorgiou et al. [2010;](#page-14-0) Kanaya [2014\)](#page-14-0). Marine aquaculture cages are located over both muddy and sandy bottoms. Muddy sediments are generally found in areas of low physical exposure, relatively deep sediments and in sheltered areas with high sedimentation and naturally high OM pools. Sandy sediments are predominantly found in exposed and shallow areas without naturally high OM pools. Exchange rates of dissolved compounds between sediment and water column depend on lability of

OM. Muddy sediments generally have more reduced conditions than sandy sediments, which influence the mineralization rates of OM in the sediments, and therefore their metabolic capacity (Papageorgiou et al. [2010\)](#page-14-0). Thus, grain size may be an important variable in selecting sites for aquaculture facilities, since it affects the environmental sustainability of this activity and give rise to potential negative interactions with benthic ecosystem (Kalantzi and Karakassis [2006](#page-14-0)).

The aim of this study is to understand the effects of grain size on biogeochemical processes in sediments affected by aquaculture activities. We focused on C, N, P and S cycles. For that purpose, we reproduced experimentally the effects of two levels of organic enrichment: one produced by mussel farms (low level) and one by fish farms (high level) on sandy and muddy sediments. We considered the effects of bioturbation and bioirrigation by including the polychaete Hediste diversicolor in the experiments. We hypothesized that under organic enrichment conditions, sandy sediments can maintain higher metabolic rates due to higher oxygen availability, resulting in low sulfide accumulation, faster nutrient cycling and higher metabolic capacity compared to muddy sediments.

Materials and methods

Study sites and experimental set-up

Sediment cores for the mussel fecal pellets experiment were collected in October 2011 in Denmark. Twelve cores from Limfjorden had muddy sediments (56°47'19.9"N 8°52'56.2"E) and 12 cores from Storebælt had sandy sediments (55°23'24.8"N 10°48'49.6"E). Sediment cores for the fish fecal pellets experiment were collected in June 2013 in Spain. Twelve muddy sediments cores from Almeria bay (36°49'03.7"N 2°30'04.1"W) and 12 sandy sediment cores from Alicante bay (38°15'19.4"N $0°30'24.7''W$). The grain size in the sandy sediments was between 63 and 500 μ m (>70 %) and in the muddy sediments was $\lt 63 \mu m$ ($>90 \%$) in both experiments. Sediments were sieved to remove benthic macrofauna $(>1$ mm). The cores (30 cm length; 5 cm i.d.) were submerged in an incubation chamber (157 dm^3) with seawater of 20 psu in Denmark and 37.7 psu in Alicante. The cores were maintained at oxygen saturation in darkness, and the temperature

was kept at 16 ± 1 °C in both experiments. The water overlying the sediment in each core was continuously mixed by rotation (60 rpm) of a 2 cm Teflon-coated magnet attached to the liner wall (Holmer and Kristensen [1992](#page-14-0)). In the mussel pellet experiment, the surface of half of the cores was enriched with 60 fecal pellets $(+FP)$ from mussels every day for 21 days. This corresponds to 7.7 g C m⁻² d⁻¹ and 1.3 g N m $^{-2}$ d⁻¹, similar to sedimentation rates in mussel farms (Carlsson et al. [2010\)](#page-13-0). The other half of the cores were kept without organic enrichment (-FP). Mussels were obtained from the Marine Biological Research Centre of Kerteminde (Odense), and placed in aquariums in the laboratory. The pellets produced were collected every day by 3 mL pipettes and then added to the sediment cores. In the fish pellet experiment, precisely 0.5 g of fecal pellets $(+FP)$ from Sparus aurata were added daily for 21 days to half of the cores, corresponding to 72 g C m⁻² d⁻¹ and 12 g N m⁻² d⁻¹, similar to sedimentation rates under fish farms with high organic enrichment (Heilskov et al. [2006](#page-14-0); Cromey et al. [2012\)](#page-13-0). Fish fecal pellets were collected from a fish nursery located in Guardamar (Alicante). The other half of the cores were kept without organic enrichment $(-FP)$. In both experiments, in 6 sand cores and 6 mud cores, 3 polychaete worms (H. diversicolor) were added $(+W_S, +W_M)$ corresponding to a density of 1061 individuals m^{-2} , within the range of natural abundance (Scaps [2002](#page-15-0)). Six cores remained without worms, three from sand and three from mud $(-W_s)$, $+W_M$). Polychaetes were replaced if they died during the experimental period.

Sediment enrichment and sulfides

At the end of the experiments, sediment cores were sliced at 1 cm intervals down to 4 cm depth and at 2 cm intervals down to 8 cm depth. The OM content of dry sediment was estimated by loss on ignition after being ashed at 400 \degree C for 4 h. In the mussel pellet experiment the sediments were fixed for determination of sulfides by addition of zinc acetate, after which total reduced inorganic sulfides (TRIS) were extracted by distillation in a two-step procedure, whereby acid volatile sulfides (AVS) are separated from the chromium reducible sulfur (CRS) (Fossing and Jørgensen [1989](#page-14-0)) and quantified spectrophotometrically (Cline [1969\)](#page-13-0). In the fish pellet experiment, total free sulfides (TFS) content was measured in a sulfide antioxidant buffer solution and ascorbic acid, using a silver/sulfide half-cell electrode following the method described by Wildish et al. ([1999\)](#page-15-0). Sediment cores were observed every day for cover by Beggiatoa mats.

Benthic fluxes

Benthic fluxes of sediment oxygen uptake (SOU), ammonium (NH⁺₄), nitrate (NO₃), nitrite (NO₂) and phosphate (PO_4^{3-}) were determined every day during the first week, and once a week until the end in both experiments, which lasted 3 weeks. For the mussel pellet experiment, carbon dioxide flux $(TCO₂)$ was also measured. Cores were left for acclimation 24 h, and afterwards water samples were taken and then cores were sealed with rubber stoppers and incubated for 3–6 h. At the end of the incubations, water samples were taken from each core using a 20 ml glass syringe. Incubation times were adjusted to achieve a $\langle 20 \, \% \rangle$ decrease in O_2 concentration. Fluxes were calculated from changes in concentration over time in each core, with corrections made for refilled water replacing the volume withdrawn. SOU samples were analyzed within 12 h by precipitating using standard Winkler technique (Parsons et al. 1984). TCO₂ was measured by the flow injection analysis according to Hall and Aller [\(1992](#page-14-0)). Samples for nutrients were filtered using GF/C filters and analyzed for NH_4^+ , NO_3^- , NO_2^- and PO_4^{3-} on a scalar autoanalyzer, (SCAN plusSYSTEM in Denmark and $San⁺⁺ Continuous Flow Analyzer in$ Spain). After incubation, the cores were submerged in the water tank with air saturation until the next incubation.

Statistical analysis

SOU, $TCO₂$ production and nutrient concentration $(NH_4^+$, NO_3^- , NO_2^- and PO_4^{3-}) were analyzed in timeintegrated efflux up to 21 days. OM, TRIS and TFS were analyzed by depth-integration to 8 cm. The results were analyzed by 3-way factorial analysis of variance (ANOVA) to compare between sediments (2 levels: sand and mud), polychaetes (2 levels: with and without polychaetes) and fecal pellets (2 levels: with and without fecal pellets), as well as the interaction between these factors. Heterogeneity of variance was tested with Cochran's test and data were transformed

if necessary (Underwood [1997](#page-15-0)). All statistical tests were conducted with a significance level of $\alpha = 0.05$. In the case of significant differences, data were subsequently investigated using SNK test (Student– Newman–Keuls) to determine which samples were implicated in the differences. We used the software R (R Development Core Team [2011\)](#page-14-0) with the GAD package (Sandrini-Neto and Camargo [2014\)](#page-14-0).

Results

In the mussel pellets experiment, $+FP$ sediments were characterized by a 0.5 cm thick pale brown oxidized layer and underneath there was a 0.8 cm thick dark gray zone. Beneath this depth, sandy sediments were brown and muddy sediments were dark brown. -FP sediments had a 0.4 cm thick pale brown oxidized layer and beneath this depth the color was brown in sandy sediments and dark brown in muddy sediments, without any dark gray zone. In the fish pellets experiment, $+FP$ were characterized by 1 cm thick black zone and underneath there was a 1 cm thick dark gray zone. Below a depth of 3 cm, sandy sediments were brown and muddy sediments were dark brown. $-FP_S$ sediments were brown and $-FP_M$ sediments had a 0.3 cm pale brown oxidized layer and beneath this depth they were dark brown.

Sediment enrichment

At the end of the mussel pellet experiment, OM percentage in muddy sediments was significantly higher than in sandy sediments (Fig. 1). No significant differences were found between $+FP$ and $-FP$, or between $+W$ and $-W$ sediments (Table [1\)](#page-5-0). In the fish pellet experiment, there was a significant OM increase down to 3 cm in depth, with higher OM content in muddy than in sandy sediments. Beneath that depth, there was no effect of increased OM levels due to organic enrichment, independently of grain size. OM in $+FP_S$ were 5–8-fold higher than $-FP_S$ samples, and OM in $+FP_M$ was 2–2.5-fold higher than $-FP_M$ samples when integrating over the top 8 cm. The OM content was significantly reduced in $+W$ sediments. $+FP+W_S$ had 43 % less than $+FP-W_S$, $-FP+W_M$ had 31 % less than $-FP-W_M$ and $+FP+W_M$ had 9 % less than $+FP-W_M$ (supplementary material Fig. A). Fig. 1 Change in organic matter percentage (OM%) with \blacktriangleright depth. Left panels represent sandy sediments and right panels represent muddy sediments. Mussel and fish symbols indicate the organic enrichment by mussel and fish fecal pellets, respectively. *Error bars* indicate SE $(n = 3)$

Sulfide accumulation

In the mussel pellet experiment, AVS accumulation in the sandy sediments only occurred in $+FP$ in the first cm, where AVS in $+FP_S$ were 2–6-fold higher than in $-FP_S$ (Fig. [2\)](#page-7-0). In the first cm, $+FP_M$ was 1.5-fold higher than $-FP_M$. Below 1 cm, all samples had a similar range of AVS $(9-26 \mu mol cm^{-3})$ (Fig. [2\)](#page-7-0). Depth integrated pools of AVS were 24-fold higher in muddy than in sandy sediments (Fig. [3](#page-8-0)). The presence of polychaetes significantly increased AVS in muddy sediments (Table [1\)](#page-5-0), $+W+FP_M$ being 30 % higher than $-W+$ FP_M , whereas there was no effect in the sandy sediments (Fig. [3\)](#page-8-0). Levels of CRS in sandy sediments were low, except in the first cm, where $+FP$ samples were 3–4-fold higher than $-FP$. In contrast, in muddy sediments, CRS was the dominant form of reduced sulfur, being significantly higher than CRS in sandy sediments. Maximum levels were found in $+W+FP_M$ (Fig. [2\)](#page-7-0). Depth-integrated CRS showed a significant increase in $+W_M$ (Table [1\)](#page-5-0), where the increases were 43 % in $-FP+W_M$ and 9 % in $+FP+W_M$ (Fig. [3\)](#page-8-0).

In the fish pellet experiment, highest values of TFS were found in the first cm. TFS showed major changes with depth and a wide difference between $+FP$ and -FP in the upper 4 cm. Sandy sediments always had lower TFS concentration than muddy sediments. In sandy sediments, maximum TFS values were found in $+W+FP_S$. In the first cm, TFS values in $+FP_S$ were 129-fold higher in $-W_S$ and 979-fold higher in $+W_S$ than in $-FP_S$ (Fig. [4](#page-9-0)). In $+FP_M$ in the first cm, TFS values were sevenfold higher in $-W_M$ and 14-fold higher in $+W_M$ than $-FP_M$. When TFS were integrated (0–8 cm), TFS values in $+FP_M$ were 2–3fold higher than $+FP_S$. In sandy sediments, the increase in $+FP_S$ over $-FP_S$ was 276-fold (Fig. [5](#page-10-0)). In muddy sediments, levels of TFS in $+FP_M$ were double the levels in $-FP_M$, but this increase is no significant due to high variability, and the analysis showed an interaction in sediment under organic enrichment conditions. No significant differences were found between $+W$ and $-W$ (Table [1](#page-5-0)).

 \hat{Z} Springer

In the fish pellet experiment, Beggiatoa mats appeared covering the surface in $-W+FP_M$ from day 14, followed by $+W+FP_M$ 2 days after. Beggia*toa* appeared on day 19 in $-W+FP_S$ and $+W+FP_S$. After Beggiatoa mats appeared, polychaetes started to die; firstly on day 14 in the muddy sediments and 5 days later in sandy sediments. When they were replaced, they died in one or 2 days.

Benthic fluxes

In the mussel pellet experiment, samples with organic enrichment achieved similar SOU levels (Fig. [6](#page-11-0)), whereas under conditions of no organic enrichment, muddy sediments had higher levels of SOU than sandy sediments (Table [1](#page-5-0)). $+FP_S$ and $+FP_M$ SOU levels were 6.4 fold higher than $-FP_S$ and 2.5 fold higher than $-FP_M$ (Fig. [6](#page-11-0)). No differences were observed between $+W$ or $-W$ (Table [1](#page-5-0)). In the fish pellet experiment, analogous results were observed, in samples with organic enrichment, both sediments reached similar levels of SOU and there were no differences between $+W$ and $-W$ (Fig. [6](#page-11-0)). Under conditions of no organic enrichment, muddy sediments had higher levels of SOU than sandy sediments (Table [1](#page-5-0)) and also $+W_S$ had 49 % higher SOU flux than $-W_S$, and $+W_M$ had 118 % higher SOU flux than $-W_M$ (Fig. [6\)](#page-11-0).

 $TCO₂$ flux in the mussel fecal pellets experiment showed no differences between sandy and muddy sediments (Fig. [6\)](#page-11-0). Only significant differences were found between $+FP$ and $-FP$ (Table [1\)](#page-5-0). The significant increases after organic enrichment were 121 times in $+FP-W_S$, 5 times in $+FP+W_S$ and 4 times in $+FP+W_M$ compared to $-FP$ (Fig. [6](#page-11-0)). No differences were observed between $-W$ and $+W$ (Fig. [6\)](#page-11-0).

The NH_4^+ flux showed no significant differences between sandy and muddy sediments in mussel pellet experiment (Table [1\)](#page-5-0). Rates of NH_4^+ in +FP increased $7-12$ $7-12$ -fold respect to $-FP$ (Fig. 7). No differences were found between $+W$ and $-W$ with $+FP$ (Table [1](#page-5-0)). In the fish pellet experiment, sandy sediment showed a 39 % lower NH_4^+ efflux than muddy sediments (supplementary material Fig. B). There was a significant 6–10-fold increase in NH_4^+ in +FP compared with -FP (Fig. [7](#page-12-0)). Significant differences were found in $+FP$ (Table [1](#page-5-0)), $+W_S$ had 34 % less NH_4^+ flux than $-W_S$ and $+W_M$ had 20 % less NH_4^+

Fig. 2 Vertical profiles of acid volatile sulfides (AVS) and chromium reducible sulfides (CRS) in mussel pellet experiment. Left panels represent sandy sediment and right, muddy sediments. Error bars indicate SE $(n = 3)$

Fig. 3 Depth-integrated (0–8 cm) pools of acid volatile sulfides (AVS) and chromium reducible sulfides (CRS). Mussel symbols indicate the low level of organic enrichment in sediments below a mussel farm. $-W$ symbols represent no

flux than $-W_M$. In contrast, in $-FP$ samples, $+W$ had higher NH_4^+ flux than $-W$, increasing eightfold in $+W_S$ and fivefold in $+W_M$ (Fig. [7\)](#page-12-0). Fluxes of $NO₃⁻ + NO₂⁻$ in mussel pellet experiment were low (supplementary material Fig. C) and there was no difference between any treatments (Table [1](#page-5-0)). However, in the fish pellet experiment, organic enrichment increased $NO_3^- + NO_2^-$ fluxes significantly. Significant differences were found between $+FP+W_S$ and $+FP+W_M$, being $+FP+W_S$, 130 % higher than $+FP+W_M$ (Fig. [7](#page-12-0)). $+FP-W_S$ were also higher than $+FP-W_M$ but not significant (Table [1](#page-5-0)). The increase in $NO_3^- + NO_2^-$ due to +FP was eightfold in $-W_S$ and twofold in $+W_S$, threefold in $-W_M$ and fivefold in $+W_M$ (Fig. [7\)](#page-12-0).

In the mussel pellet experiment, PO_4^{3-} fluxes showed no differences between sandy and muddy sediments (Table [1\)](#page-5-0). Whereas PO_4^{3-} fluxes in +FP were significant higher than in $-FP$ (Fig. [7](#page-12-0)), no differences were found between $+W$ and $-W$. With fish pellets however, there was a significant difference between sandy and muddy sediments in $-FP$ (Table [1](#page-5-0)). A large increase in PO_4^{3-} flux was observed between $-FP$ and $+FP$ (supplementary material Fig. D). $+FP-W_M$ had 19 % (significant) higher rates of PO_4^{3-} fluxes than $+FP+W_M$ (Table [1](#page-5-0)). There was also a notable but non-significant increase of 22 % in $+FP-W_S$ compared to $+FP_S+W$ (Fig. [7](#page-12-0)).

polychaete addition and $+W$ symbols polychaete addition. The left side of the graphs represents sandy sediment and the right, muddy sediments. *Error bars* indicate SE $(n = 3)$

Discussion

Sediment enrichment

Muddy sediments had a naturally higher content of OM compared to the sandy sediments. Under low organic enrichment conditions, none of the sediments increased their respective OM content at any depth, indicating that the metabolic capacity of the sediments was not exceeded. However, a high level of enrichment from fish pellets resulted in an increase in the OM content in the surface layer, in both sandy and muddy sediments, although this increase was more marked in muddy sediments. This finding indicated that the metabolic capacity of the sediments was exceeded there, particularly in the muddy sediments. Excess OM can change the biogeochemical conditions of the sediment and subsequently diminish its metabolic capacity (McKindsey et al. [2006\)](#page-14-0). Reduced conditions favor anaerobic pathways, which are less efficient than aerobic ones (Kristensen and Holmer [2001](#page-14-0)).

Macrofauna enhances the metabolic capacity of the sediments (Banta et al. [1999\)](#page-13-0). In our case, sediments with polychaetes had lower OM content compared to defaunated ones even after OM enrichment. This suggests that the metabolic capacity of the sediment was enhanced by the bioturbation and bioirrigation of the macrofauna. These processes enhance mineralization through active transport of electron acceptors to

Fig. 4 Vertical profile of total free sulfides (TFS) in fish pellet experiment. Fish symbols indicate the high organic enrichment in sediments below a fish farm. Left panels represent sandy sediment and right panels muddy sediments. Error bars indicate SE $(n = 3)$

microbial communities deeper in the sediment and by removal of potential toxic metabolites as well as consuming OM (Kristensen [1988](#page-14-0); Heilskov et al. [2006;](#page-14-0) Kristensen et al. [2012](#page-14-0)).

Sulfides

Accumulation of sulfides, under low and high levels of organic enrichment, was always higher in muddy than in sandy sediments. Despite the fact that we measured TFS in one experiment and AVS in the other, the increase in sulfides was greater at high than at low levels of organic enrichment. At a low level of organic enrichment, sulfide pools were mainly influenced by sediment type rather than by polychaetes or organic enrichment. In sandy sediments, sulfide content increased only in the first cm

of the sediment under low organic enrichment, while in muddy sediments sulfide content was high throughout the sediment. This difference in sulfide content is possibly due to the naturally high OM content in muddy sediments leading to naturally high sulfide pools (Hargrave et al. [2008](#page-14-0)). At high levels of organic enrichment, the sulfide accumulation was also higher in muddy than in sandy sediments. Muddy sediments have smaller grain size than sandy sediments, resulting in a low diffusion capacity of solutes between the water column and the sediments (Papageorgiou et al. [2010](#page-14-0)). This also results in high sulfide accumulation compared to sandy sediments, where sulfides are reoxidized to a greater extent. According to Hargrave et al. [\(2008](#page-14-0)), TFS in organic enriched muddy sediments reached Hypoxic level B (between 3000 and 6000 μ M S) in the first two cm of

Fig. 5 Depth-integrated (0–8 cm) pools of total free sulfides (TFS). Fish symbols indicate the high organic enrichment in sediments below a fish farm. –W symbols represent no polychaete addition and $+W$ symbols polychaete addition. The left side of the graph represents sandy sediment and the right side, muddy sediment. Error bars indicate SE $(n = 3)$

the sediment. At this level, sulfate reduction is the dominant metabolic pathway (Holmer et al. [2005](#page-14-0)). Pearson and Rosenberg [\(1978](#page-14-0)) described this level as Stage 1 or Polluted in their organic enrichment gradient classification. Also, Beggiatoa mat cover on sediments becomes more extensive at TFS higher than 3000 μ M, which were found here (Brooks and Mahnken [2003;](#page-13-0) Hargrave et al. [2008](#page-14-0)). In sandy sediments, the maximum TFS in the superficial sediment reached Hypoxic A levels (between 1500 and 3000 μ M S) and *Beggiatoa* mats appeared on the sediment (Hargrave et al. [2008](#page-14-0)). The bioturbation and bioirrigation produced by the polychaetes in muddy sediments delayed Beggiatoa development and reduced sulfide accumulation. Beggiatoa grows at the interface of oxic and anoxic conditions and is typically associated with high sulfide levels (Preisler et al. [2007](#page-14-0)). Sulfides are toxic to the inhabiting fauna at high concentrations and may, along with the depletion of oxidized compounds in the pore water, lead to depletion of the most sensitive species, resulting in sediment defaunation (Brooks and Mahnken [2003](#page-13-0); Heilskov et al. [2006\)](#page-14-0). Our results confirm that polychaetes play an important role in inhibiting the proliferation of Beggiatoa mats in muddy sediments by increasing the electron acceptor availability in the sediment porewater (Kristensen and Kostka [2005\)](#page-14-0).

Benthic fluxes

Despite the fact that sandy sediments generally have a deeper oxygen penetration than finer grained sediments (Andersen and Helder [1987;](#page-13-0) Hargrave et al. [2008\)](#page-14-0), the SOU results showed similar maximum levels under organic enrichment, regardless of sediment type and presence of polychaetes. The accumulation of added OM in the upper layer of the sediment could explain these results, since grain size or macrofauna have less effect on SOU. This is because oxygen uptake in the surface layer is controlled primarily by diffusive processes (Glud [2008](#page-14-0)). However, SOU was three times greater at high than at low organic enrichment. So, high SOU is expected under high organic enrichment conditions because oxygen is used as electron acceptor in aerobic metabolism as well as in the reoxidation of sulfides (Holmer et al. [2005;](#page-14-0) Piedecausa et al. [2012\)](#page-14-0). The increase in SOU was in the same range as other studies under similar levels of organic enrichment (Glud [2008;](#page-14-0) Carlsson et al. [2009;](#page-13-0) Valdemarsen et al. [2009](#page-15-0)), suggesting similar metabolic rates.

The stimulated $TCO₂$ at low organic enrichment showed an increase in benthic metabolism, which is consistent with the lack of accumulation of added OM, suggesting that all OM added was mineralized in both sandy and muddy sediments. $TCO₂$ results at low organic enrichment were in the same range as other mesocosm studies (Banta et al. [1999](#page-13-0); Papaspyrou et al. [2010\)](#page-14-0), where yeast and detritus were used as organic enrichment. For high organic enrichment, Valdemarsen et al. (2009) (2009) found that $TCO₂$ flux increased by 5–6 times, which is in the same range or double what we found in our study at low organic enrichment, for sandy and muddy sediments respectively. Differences in $TCO₂$ between sandy and muddy sediments were only detected in non-enriched sediments, where $TCO₂$ rates were higher in mud. This could be due to their naturally higher OM content. Surprisingly, we found no difference in $TCO₂$ between samples with and without polychaetes, maybe due to stimulation of chemoautotrophic processes like nitrification by polychaetes (Kristensen et al. [1991\)](#page-14-0). Despite this, polychaetes also stimulate benthic metabolism by indirectly stimulating microbial metabolism besides contributing to the overall sediment metabolism (Banta et al. [1999;](#page-13-0) Sanz-Lazaro and Marin [2008](#page-14-0)).

Fig. 6 Sediment oxygen uptake (SOU) and total CO_2 (TCO₂) calculated as time-integrated excess flux. Fish symbols indicate the high organic enrichment in sediments below a fish farm. –W symbols represent no polychaete addition and $+W$ symbols

 NH_4^+ and PO_4^{3-} effluxes were stimulated similarly to SOU at low and high levels of organic enrichment which agrees with previous authors (Carlsson et al. [2009;](#page-13-0) Stadmark and Conley [2011](#page-15-0)). However, at high levels of OM, NH_4^+ and PO_4^{3-} release rates were almost 8 times higher than in low organic enrichment, reflecting high carbon oxidation rates and prevalence of anaerobic metabolism at high OM (Nizzoli et al. 2006). NH^{$+$} values in the fish pellet experiment were higher than expected and higher than found previously in the literature (21-40 mmol m^{-2} d⁻¹) (Holmer et al. [2003;](#page-14-0) Valdemarsen et al. [2009](#page-15-0)). These high figures possibly could be due to the high level of organic enrichment. This study shows that sediment grain size influenced NH_4^+ release rates only under high levels of organic enrichment. Under these conditions, muddy

polychaete addition. The left side of the graph represents sandy sediment and the right side muddy sediments. Error bars indicate SE $(n = 3)$

sediments released more $NH₄⁺$ than sandy sediments. This could be because muddy sediments showed more reduced conditions with higher sulfide levels. When sediments become sulfidic, nitrogen mineralization pathways can shift to production of $NH₄⁺$ via dissimilatory NO ³ reduction (DNRA) (Christensen et al. [2000;](#page-13-0) Carlsson et al. [2012](#page-13-0)). Also under reduced conditions, iron hydroxides become reduced and the $PO₄³⁻$ adsorbed to hydroxides is released to the water column (Sundby et al. [1993;](#page-15-0) Papageorgiou et al. [2010\)](#page-14-0).

Release rates of $NO_3^- + NO_2^-$ were not increased at low organic enrichment as Carlsson et al. ([2012\)](#page-13-0) described before, whereas high organic enrichment increased $NO_3^- + NO_2^-$ efflux, possibly due to the nitrification of ammonium accumulating in the cores. Muddy sediments showed lower efflux of

Fig. 7 Ammonium (NH₄⁺), nitrate + nitrite (NO₃⁺ NO₂⁻) and phosphate $(PO₄)$ calculated as time-integrated excess flux. Fish symbols indicate the high organic enrichment in sediments below a fish farm. $-W$ symbols represent no polychaete addition

and $+W$ symbols polychaete addition. The *left side* of the graph represents sandy sediment and the right side muddy sediments. Error bars indicate SE $(n = 3)$

 $NO₃⁻ + NO₂⁻$ than sandy sediments. $NO₃⁻$ could be transformed through different metabolic pathways such as denitrification and DNRA, $NO₂⁻$ being the first intermediary in this reduction (Thamdrup and Dalsgaard [2000](#page-15-0)). Beggiatoa likewise uses these components as electron acceptors (Preisler et al. [2007](#page-14-0)), and the lowest values of $NO_3^- + NO_2^-$ in muddy sediments correspond to intense Beggiatoa cover.

As mentioned earlier, polychaetes stimulate sediment metabolism (Banta et al. 1999). Indeed, our results showed a contrasting effect on nutrient recycling depending on the organic enrichment content of the sediment. Under conditions without organic enrichment, polychaetes moderately increased sediment release of NH^{$+$} and, to some extent of PO³⁻. But, at high levels of organic enrichment, the release of NH_4^+ , $NO_3^- + NO_2^-$ and PO_4^{3-} from sediment decreased due to bioturbation. The lower $NH₄⁺$ and $NO₃⁻ + NO₂⁻$ release suggests that polychaetes enhance metabolic pathways that transform these nutrients to N_2 , such as coupled nitrification–denitrification (Christensen et al. 2003). Low levels of PO_4^{3-} suggest that bioturbation by polychaetes promotes oxidation of the sediment increasing its capacity to retain PO_4^{3-} by means of iron hydroxides (Sundby et al. [1993](#page-15-0)).

This study demonstrates that under the low organic enrichment found in sediments below mussel farms, there is no significant difference between sandy and muddy sediments (with contrasting grain size) regarding nutrient effluxes and sulfide accumulation. At high organic enrichment, such as below fish farms, there were however, significant differences between sandy and muddy bottoms. The two types of sediment differed not only in the accumulation of OM, but also in their metabolic capacity. Sandy sediments accumulated less OM, less sulfide and less ammonium, resulting in a less reduced environment. These reduced conditions, higher in muddy sediments, could have important consequences in the recovery process, because sediments that have suffered hypoxia events are prone to undergo again these events (Conley et al. 2009). On the long run, sandy sediments are likely to have a greater sediment buffering capacity than muddy sediments at fish farming sites, since sandy sediments have a greater metabolic capacity resulting in a lower OM accumulation. Polychaetes also contribute to reduce the accumulation of these products by stimulating OM mineralization and nutrient recycling. A balance between OM input and mineralization rates is crucial to allow polychaetes survival, keeping the resistance of the sediment high.

In conclusion, under a low level of organic enrichment, sediment grain size is not a critical parameter to take into account in selecting locations for aquaculture. However, under high organic enrichment, sandy sediments are more suitable to harbor aquaculture facilities than muddy sediments, since their metabolic capacity is higher. Therefore, sediment grain size should indeed be considered a key parameter for fish farming site selection.

Acknowledgments We thank Ecolab of University of Southern Denmark, the Marine Biological Research Centre in Kerteminde (Denmark), Alevines de Guardamar SL and Centro de Invesigación Marina de Santa Pola (Spain) for the usage of their facilities. We are grateful to Irene Aragoneses, José Luis Villar and David Izquierdo for assistance during the experiments and Javier Aguilar for helping with nutrient analyses. We also appreciate the comments of two anonymous reviewer, which have improved the manuscript.

References

- Andersen FO, Helder W (1987) Comparison of oxygen microgradients, oxygen flux rates and electron transport system activity in coastal marine sediments. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 37:259–264
- Banta GT, Holmer M, Jensen MH, Kristensen E (1999) Effects of two polychaete worms, Nereis diversicolor and Arenicola marina, on aerobic and anaerobic decomposition in a sandy marine sediment. Aquat Microb Ecol 19:189–204
- Brooks KM, Mahnken CVW (2003) Interactions of atlantic salmon in the pacific northwest environment. II. organic wastes. Fish Res 62:255–293
- Carlsson MS, Holmer M, Petersen JK (2009) Seasonal and spatial variations of benthic impacts of mussel longline farming in a eutrophic danish fjord, limfjorden. J Shellfish Res 28(4):791–801
- Carlsson MS, Glud RN, Petersen JK (2010) Degradation of mussel (Mytilus edulis) fecal pellets released from hanging long-lines upon sinking and after settling at the sediment. Can J Fish Aquat Sci 67:1376–1387
- Carlsson MS, Engström P, Odd Lindahl O, Ljungqvist L, Petersen SL, Holmer M (2012) Effects of mussel farms on the benthic nitrogen cycle on the Swedish west coast. Aquacult Environ Interact 2:177–191
- Christensen B, Vedel A, Kristensen E (2000) Carbon and nitrogen fluxes in sedimentinhabited by suspension-feeding (Nereis diversicolor) and non-suspension feeding (N. virens) polychaetes. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 192:203–217
- Christensen PB, Glud RN, Gillespie P (2003) Impacts of longline mussel farming on oxygen and nitrogen dynamics and biological communities of coastal sediments. Aquaculture 218:567–588
- Cline JD (1969) Spectrophotometric determination of hydrogensulfide in natural waters. Limnol Oceanogr 14:454–458
- Conley DJ, Carstensen J, Vaquer-Sunyer R, Duarte CM (2009) Ecosystem thresholds with hypoxia. Hydrobiologia 629:21–29
- Cromey CJ, Thetmeyer H, Lampadariou N, Black KD, Kögeler J, Karakassis I (2012) MERAMOD: predicting the

deposition and benthic impact of aquaculture in the eastern Mediterranean Sea. Aquacult Environ Interact 2:157–176

- Fossing H, Jørgensen BB (1989) Measurement of bacterial sulfate reduction in sediments: evaluation of the single-step chromium reduction method. Biogeochemistry 8:205–222
- Glud RN (2008) Oxygen dynamics of marine sediments. Mar Biol Res 4:243–289
- Gray JS, Wu RS, Or YY (2002) Effects of hypoxia and organic enrichment on the coastal marine environment. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 238:249–279
- Hall POJ, Aller RC (1992) Rapid, small volume flow injectionanalysis for $\sum CO_2$ and NH_4^+ in marine and freshwaters. Limnol Oceanogr 37:1113–1119
- Hargrave BT, Holmer M, Newcombe CP (2008) Towards a classification of organic enrichment in marine sediments based on biogeochemical indicators. Mar Pollut Bull 56:810–824
- Heilskov AC, Alperin M, Holmer M (2006) Benthic fauna bioirrigation effects on nutrien regeneration in fish farm sediments. J Exp Mar Biol Ecol 339:204–225
- Holmer M, Kristensen E (1992) Impact of marine fish cage farming on metabolism and sulfate reduction of underlying sediments. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 80:191–201
- Holmer M, Duarte CM, Heilskov A, Olesen B, Terrados J (2003) Biogeochemical conditions in sediments enriched by organic matter from net-pen fish farms in the Bolinao área, Philippines. Mar Pollut Bull 46:1470–1479
- Holmer M, Duarte CM, Marba N (2005) Iron additions reduce sulphate reduction rates and improve seagrass growth on organic-enriched carbonate sediments. Ecosystems 8:721–730
- Islam MS (2005) Nitrogen and phosphorus budget in coastal and marine cage aquaculture and impacts of effluent loading on ecosystem: review and analysis towards model development. Mar Pollut Bull 50:48–61
- Kalantzi I, Karakassis I (2006) Benthic impacts of fish farming: meta-analysis of community and geochemical data. Mar Pollut Bull 52:484–493
- Kanaya G (2014) Recolonization of macroozoobenthos on defaunated sediments in a hypertrophic brackish lagoon: effects of sulfide removal and sediment grain size. Mar Environ Res 95:81–88
- Kristensen E (1988) Benthic fauna and biogeochemical processes in marine sediments: microbial activities and fluxes. In: Blackburn TH, Sørensen J (eds) Nitrogen cycling in coastal marine environments. Wiley, Chichester, pp 275–299
- Kristensen E, Holmer M (2001) Decomposition of plant materials in marine sediment exposed to different electron acceptors $(O_2, NO_3^-$ and $SO_4^{2-})$, with emphasis on substrate origin, degradation kinetics, and the role of bioturbation. Geochim Cosmochim Acta 65(3):419–433
- Kristensen E, Kostka JE (2005) Mangrove-microbe-soil relations. In: Kristensen E, Haese RR, Kostka JE (eds) Coastal and estuarine studies: interactions between macro- and microorganisms in marine sediments. American Geophysical Union, EEUU, Washington, DC, pp 125–157
- Kristensen E, Hjorth Jensen M, Aller RC (1991) Direct measurement of dissolved inorganic nitrogen exchange and denitrification in individual polychaete (Nereis virens) burrows. J Mar Res 49:355–377
- Kristensen E, Penha-Lopes G, Delefosse M, Valdemarsen T, Quintana CO, Banta GT (2012) What is bioturbation? The need for a precise definition for fauna in aquatic sciences. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 446:285–302
- Martinez-Garcia E, Pablo Sanchez-Jerez P, Aguado-Giménez F, Ávila P, Guerrero A, Sánchez-Lizaso JL, Fernandez-Gonzalez V, González N, Gairin JI, Carballeira C et al (2013) A meta-analysis approach to the effects of fish farming on soft bottom polychaeta assemblages in temperate regions. Mar Pollut Bull 69:165–171
- McKindsey CM, Thetmeyer H, Landry T, Silvert W (2006) Review of recent carrying capacity models for bivalve culture and recommendations for research and management. Aquaculture 261:451–462
- Nizzoli D, Welsh DT, Fano EA, Viaroli P (2006) Impact of clam and mussel farming on benthic metabolism and nitrogen cycling, with emphasis on nitrate reduction pathways. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 315:151–165
- Papageorgiou N, Ioanna Kalantzi I, Karakassis I (2010) Effects of fish farming on the biological and geochemical properties of muddy and sandy sediments in the mediterranean sea. Mar Environ Res 69:326–336
- Papaspyrou S, Thessalou-Legaki M, Kristensen E (2010) The influence of infaunal (Nereis diversicolor) abundance on degradation of organic matter in sandy sediments. J Exp Mar Biol Ecol 393:148–157
- Parsons T, Maita Y, Lalli C (1984) A manual of chemical and biological methods for seawater analysis. Pergamon Press Ltd, Oxford
- Pearson TH, Rosenberg R (1978) Macrobenthic succession in relation to organic enrichment and pollution of the marine environment. Oceanogr Mar Biol Ann Rev 16: 229–331
- Pelegri SP, Nielsen LP, Blackburn TH (1994) Denitrification in estuarine sediment stimulated by the irrigation activity of the amphipod corophium volutator. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 105:285–290
- Piedecausa MA, Aguado-Gimenez F, Cerezo-Valverde J, Llorente MDH, Garcia-Garcia B (2012) Influence of fish food and faecal pellets on short-term oxygen uptake, ammonium flux and acid volatile sulphide accumulation in sediments impacted by fish farming and non-impacted sediments. Aquacult Res 43:66–74
- Preisler A, de Beer D, Lichtschlag A, Lavik G, Boetius A, Barker Jorgensen B (2007) Biological and chemical sulphide oxidation in a Beggiatoa inhabited marine sediment. ISME J 1:341–353
- R Development Core Team (2011) R: a language and environment for statistical computing. R Foundation for Statistical Computing, Vienna, Austria. ISBN 3- 900051-07-0. [www.](http://www.R-project.org) [R-project.org](http://www.R-project.org)
- Sandrini-Neto L and Camargo MG (2014) GAD: An R package for ANOVA designs from general principles, available on **CRAN**
- Sanz-Lazaro C, Marin A (2008) Assessment of finfish aquaculture impact on the benthic communities in the Mediterranean sea. In: Russo R (ed) Aquaculture I. Dynamic biochemistry, process biotechnology and molecular biology 2 (special issue 1), Global Science Books, Ikenobe, pp 21–32. ISBN 978-4-903313-16-0
- Sanz-Lázaro C, Marín A (2011) Diversity patterns of benthic macrofauna caused by marine fish farming. Diversity 3:176–199
- Scaps P (2002) A review of the biology, ecology and potential use of the common ragworm Hediste diversicolor (O.F. müller) (annelida: Polychaeta). Hydrobiologia 470:203–218
- Stadmark J, Conley DJ (2011) Mussel farming as a nutrient reduction measure in the Baltic sea: consideration of nutrient biogeochemical cycles. Mar Pollut Bull 62:1385–1388
- Stigebrandta A, Aureb J, Ervikb A, Hansenb PK (2004) Regulating the local environmental impact of intensive marine fish farming III. A model for estimation of the holding capacity in the Modelling-Ongrowing fish farm-Monitoring system. Aquaculture 234:239–261
- Sundby B, Gobeil C, Silverberg N, Mucci A (1993) The phosphorus cycle in coastal marine sediments bjøorn. Hydrobiologia 253:320
- Sweetman A, Norling K, Gunderstad C, Haugland T, Dale T (2014) Benthic ecosystem functioning beneath fish farms

in different hydrodynamic environments. Limmol Oceanogr 59(4):1139–1151

- Thamdrup B, Dalsgaard T (2000) The fate of ammonium in anoxic manganese oxide-rich marine sediment. Geochim Cosmochim Acta 64:4157–4164
- Underwood AJ (1997) Experiments in Ecology: their logical design and interpretation using analysis of variance. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge
- Valdemarsen T, Kristensen E, Holmer M (2009) Metabolic threshold and sulfide-buffering in diffusion controlled marine sediments impacted by continuous organic enrichment. Biogeochemistry 95:335–353
- Wildish DJ, Pohle G (2005) Benthic macrofaunal changes resulting from finfish mariculture. In: Hargrave BT (ed) Environmental effects of marine finfish aquaculture. Handbook of environmental chemistry, vol Vol 5M. Springer-Verlag, Berlin, pp 239–251
- Wildish DJ, Akagi HM, Hamilton N, Hargrave BT (1999) A recommended method for monitoring sediments to detect organic enrichment from mariculture in the Bay of Fundy. Can Tech Rep Fish Aquat Sci 2286:iii+31p