

Molecular and morphological identifcation of the alfalfa weevil larval parasitoids *Bathyplectes anura* **and** *Bathyplectes curculionis* **to estimate the rate of parasitism**

Alexandre Levi‑Mourao · Pilar Muñoz · Pedro Cerda‑Bennasser · Roberto Meseguer · Xavier Pons

Received: 27 October 2021 / Accepted: 24 March 2022 / Published online: 9 April 2022 © The Author(s) 2022, corrected publication 2022

Abstract The alfalfa weevil (*Hypera postica* Gyllenhal, Coleoptera: Curculionidae) is a major pest of alfalfa crops. Chemical control measures are inefficient, but the larvae are often infested by parasitoid wasps of the genus *Bathyplectes* Förster (Hymenoptera: Ichneumonidae), which offer a potential biological control strategy. The development of effective biological control requires the identifcation of parasitoid species, but conventional methods involve the rearing of parasitoids to the puparium stage for morphological confrmation. Here we designed a PCR method in which two pairs of primers are used to detect and identify *Bathyplectes curculionis* Thomson and *Bathyplectes anura* Thomson larvae in a faster way. We compared conventional rearing to the new method as a means to determine the parasitism rates caused by each species in Spain during the 2019 and 2020 seasons. In 2019, the PCR method detected fve times as many *B. curculionis* events and twice as many *B. anura* events. Similarly, in 2020, the PCR method detected seven times as many *B. curculionis* events and twice as many *B. anura* events. High mortality of *H. postica* larvae was recorded in 2020 due to an

Handling Editor: Dirk Babendreier

Department of Crop Protection and Forest Sciences,

University of Lleida – Agrotecnio CERCA, Av. Alcalde

Rovira Roure 191., 25198 Lleida, Spain

e-mail: alexandrelevi.garcia@udl.cat

epizootic attack by the fungus *Zoophthora phytonomi* Arthur (Zygomycetes: Entomophthorales), explaining the lower overall rate of parasitism and the widespread death of the larvae. Statistical analysis confrmed that the PCR method is more sensitive than conventional rearing for the detection of target parasitoids. However, only rearing can confrm the efective parasitism or the presence of unexpected species. We therefore recommend the use of both methods in parallel when evaluating host–parasitoid systems.

Keywords *Hypera postica* · Cytochrome C oxidase subunit I (COI) · Parasitism rate · Polymerase chain reaction (PCR) · Biological control · *Bathyplectes* sp

Introduction

Alfalfa (*Medicago sativa* L.) is the most valuable cultivated forage crop in the world (Orloff [1997](#page-10-0)). In Spain, it is a traditional component of crop rotations covering 250,000 ha, accounting for $\approx 20\%$ of the alfalfa land area in Europe (Delgado and Lloveras [2020\)](#page-9-0). Alfalfa is also an important reservoir for pest insects that infest alfalfa as well as surrounding crops (Pons and Nuñez [2020](#page-10-1); Madeira et al. [2022](#page-10-2)).

The alfalfa weevil (*Hypera postica* Gyllenhal; Coleoptera: Curculionidae) is native to Eurasia (Hofmann [1963\)](#page-10-3) but has spread globally and is now one of the most destructive alfalfa pests (Goosey [2012;](#page-10-4) Hoff et al. [2002;](#page-10-5) Pons and Nuñez [2020](#page-10-1); Saeidi and

A. Levi-Mourao (⊠) · P. Muñoz · P. Cerda-Bennasser · R. Meseguer · X. Pons

Moharramipour [2017;](#page-10-6) Soroka et al. [2019\)](#page-11-0). In Spain, the weevil larvae cause serious damage to the frst cutting (from March to the end of April). There is little information in the scientifc literature about the ecology and pest status of this species in Europe. Natural enemies can reduce alfalfa weevil populations (Soroka et al. [2020](#page-11-1)). Alfalfa weevil larvae are parasitized by solitary endoparasitoid wasps of the genus *Bathyplectes* (Hymenoptera: Ichneumonidae) which is native to the Old World (Kingsley et al. [1993](#page-10-7); Kuhar et al. [1999](#page-10-8); Radcliffe and Flanders [1998](#page-10-9)). *B. anura* and *B. curculionis* were introduced to North America with remarkable success as a weevil control strategy (Radclife and Flanders [1998;](#page-10-9) Rand [2013](#page-10-10)). Although eight *Bathyplectes* species have been recorded in Spain (Ribes [2012](#page-10-11)), only *B. anura* Thomson and *B. curculionis* Thomson are associated with alfalfa. The identifcation of adult wasps is challenging because there are only slight morphological diferences between species (Pons and Nuñez [2020](#page-10-1)), especially in the male (Soroka et al. [2020\)](#page-11-1). The puparia are easier to distinguish because *B. anura* forms a hard, dark-brown puparium with a narrow, raised, white horizontal band, whereas the *B. curculionis* puparium is light brown with a flat, diffuse, white horizontal band (Day [1970;](#page-9-1) Dysart and Day [1976\)](#page-9-2). For definitive parasitoid identification, each *H. postica* larva must therefore be reared until pupation, which requires optimal environmental conditions and feeding, and the avoidance of other natural factors that cause mortality. Using this approach, the rates of parasitism recorded in Spain are generally low but highly variable (Levi-Mourao et al. [2021](#page-10-12); Pons & Nuñez [2020](#page-10-1)).

In contrast to the delayed results from rearing experiments, DNA analysis allows parasitism to be followed in real time, and does not require the use of captive insects in controlled-environment chambers (Liang et al. [2015,](#page-10-13) [2018;](#page-10-14) Wolf et al. [2018](#page-11-2); Agustí et al. [2020;](#page-9-3) Molina et al. [2021\)](#page-10-15). The high sensitivity and fdelity of molecular methods also facilitate detailed studies of trophic interactions that are other-wise inaccessible (Traugott et al. [2013\)](#page-11-3). Such methods require the development of specifc molecular probes to detect target organisms. In arthropods, the evolution of mitochondrial genes has been studied in detail, and divergent sequences in related populations provide a source of species-specifc PCR primers (Black et al. [1989;](#page-9-4) Simon et al. [1994\)](#page-11-4). Several studies have used cytochrome C oxidase subunit I (*COI*) mitochondrial DNA fragments as targets to increase the specifcity of detection (Agustí et al. [2003a,](#page-9-5) [2005\)](#page-9-6). Here we report for the frst time the development of *COI* primers to detect and identify the main parasitoids of alfalfa weevil (*B. curculionis* and *B. anura*) in order to estimate the rate of parasitism in *H. postica* larvae compared to the classical rearing method.

Materials and methods

Insect rearing

Adult specimens of *H. postica* were collected from a commercial alfalfa feld in Lleida, North-East Spain, in spring 2018. They were reared in 2000-ml glass jars covered with mousseline for proper ventilation, and kept at 20 \degree C, 60–70% relative humidity with an 8–16 (L:D) photoperiod. Fresh alfalfa stems were provided daily for egg laying and feeding. These were placed in a glass vial flled with water and sealed with paraflm to prevent dehydration of the plants and the drowning of adult insects. All non-parasitized *H. postica* larvae individuals used in the experiments were derived from this laboratory population.

For *B. anura* and *B. curculionis* adults obtaining, *H. postica* larvae were collected from the feld. They were kept in rearing polyethylene cages of 500 ml capacity (maximum 50 larvae/cage), covered by a mesh to facilitate aeration. Fresh alfalfa was provided in a daily basis. Larvae were maintained in a climatic chamber at 22 °C, 8:16 (L:D) photoperiod and 50% relative humidity until pupation. In the case they were parasitized, parasitoid puparia were used for morphological identifcation. The resulting *B. anura* and *B. curculionis* adults were frozen at –80 °C for posterior DNA extraction.

Primer design and testing

Fragments of the conserved *COI* gene from 10 individuals of *B. anura* and *B. curculionis* and the host *H. postica* were amplifed by PCR using the universal forward primer C1-J-1718 (5′-GGA GGA TTT GGA AAT TGA TTA GTT CC-3′) and the universal reverse primer C1-N-2191 (5′-CCC GGT AAA ATT AAA ATA TAA ACT TC-3′) (Simon et al.

[1994](#page-11-4)). Each 20-µl amplification reaction contained 1 μ l (3–50 ng/ μ l) resuspended individual DNA, 7.5 µl pure water, 9.5 µl 2.0 Taq RED Master Mix kit, 1.5 mM MgCl2 (Apex Bioresearch, Genesee Scientific) and 1 µl of each forward and reverse primer (10 µM). Samples were denatured at 94 °C for 3 min followed by 35 cycles of 94 \degree C for 30 s, 58 \degree C (for 30 s, and 72 \degree C for 1 min, and then a final extension at 72 °C for 3 min. The parasitoid amplicons were purifed using the QIAquick PCR Purifcation Kit (Qiagen, Düsseldorf, Germany) and were transferred to the vector pGEM-T easy. *Escherichia coli* DH5α Scompetent cells were transformed with the vector using an adapted heat shock method (Froger and Hall [2007\)](#page-9-7) and cultivated in lysogeny broth (LB) supplemented with 1 mg/ml ampicillin. Transformants were plated on LB agar supplemented with 20 mg/ml 5-bromo-4chloro-3-indolyl-β-D-galactopyranoside $(X-gal)$ and 80 mg/ml isopropyl β -D-1-thiogalactopyranoside (IPTG) for blue-white selection. We transferred 50 white colonies, indicating the presence of an insert to 7 ml LB supplemented with 100 µg/ml ampicillin. Plasmid DNA was extracted for PCR with the primers shown above. Thirty DNA samples yielding the anticipated band sizes for *B. anura* (442 bp) and *B. curculionis* (465 bp) were analyzed by Sanger sequencing (Stab vida, Portugal) using SP6 forward primer 5′-ATT TAG GTG ACA CTA TAG-3′ and M13 reverse primer 5′-CAG GAA ACA GCT ATG AC-3′. Sequences were aligned in UGENE for each construct and non-matching nucleotides between sequences were used to design specifc primers (following Innis and Gelfand [1990](#page-10-16) and Saiki [1990](#page-10-17)).

DNA was extracted from homogenized non-parasitized *H. postica* larvae and individual feld parasitoid adults from each species using the BioSprint 96 DNA Blood Kit (Qiagen) and the samples were stored at – 20 °C. Each 20-µl reaction contained 1 µl $(3-50 \text{ ng/µl})$ resuspended larval DNA, 7.5 μ l pure water, 9.5 µl 2.0 Taq RED Master Mix kit, 1.5 mM MgCl₂ (Apex Bioresearch, Genesee Scientific) and $1 \mu l$ of each newly forward and reverse primer (10 µM). Samples were denatured at 94 °C for 3 min followed by 35 cycles of 94 $^{\circ}$ C for 30 s, 65 $^{\circ}$ C (for *B. curculionis*) or 60 °C (for *B. anura*) for 30 s, and 72 °C for 1 min, and then a fnal extension at 72 °C for 5 min. PCR products were separated by 2.0% agarose gel electrophoresis and stained with SYBR safe (Thermo Fisher Scientifc, Waltham, MA, USA). We have tested 10 individuals of each species following this protocol.

Sensitivity and primer species specificity

Sensitivity of the assay was determined for both primer pairs by testing serial dilutions of parasitoid DNA. The original parasitoid DNA samples $(\sim 3 \text{ ng}/$ µl) were serially diluted to 600, 120, 24, 4.8, 0.9 and 0.19 pg/ μ l. The specificity of each pair of primers was tested on 10 *B. anura* and *B. curculionis* individuals and on 10 *H. postica* larvae as negative controls. 10 *Microctonus* sp. Wesmael (Hymenoptera: Braconidae), an endoparasitoid of *H. postica* adults, were also tested. DNA from seven random *H. postica* larvae was mixed with *B. anura* and *B.* curculionis DNA to ensure efficiently detection. Products were detected using a NanoDrop spectrophotometer (Thermo Fisher Scientific).

Field samples

Samples were collected in the Ebro basin region (north-east Spain), where 60% of Spanish alfalfa is cultivated (Delgado and Lloveras [2020\)](#page-9-0). We selected 35 commercial felds located along four diferent counties (1-Urgell, 2-Segrià, 3-Baja Cinca and 4-Monegros) during the 2019 and 2020 seasons. All felds were insecticide-free during the study period. Larvae were collected by 20 sweeps, each of 180°, with a 38-cm diameter net (Bio-quip, Rancho Dominguez, CA USA) and were separated into three groups over the next 24 h.

Field rates of parasitism detected by classical rearing

The frst set of 20–300 larvae per feld (L3–L4) were kept in 500-ml polyethylene cages (maximum 50 larvae per cage) and provided with fresh alfalfa every 2 days. Cages were maintained in a climatic chamber at 22° C, 8:16 (light: dark) photoperiod and 50% relative humidity until pupation. We counted *H. postica* pupae, *Bathyplectes* puparia and dead larvae on a daily basis, and removed them from the cage. *Bathyplectes anura* and *B. curculionis* were distinguished by the characteristics of the puparia. We also recorded (1) the total number of *H. postica* adults that emerged; (2) the number of larvae showing symptoms of infection by *Z. phytonomi* (brown or black color and soft body) according to Los and Allen [\(1982](#page-10-18)); and (3) the number of parasitoid adults that emerged from puparia. These puparia were kept under laboratory conditions (24 \pm 3 °C) for 12 months. The rate of parasitism and the efective rate (percentage of parasitoid adults that emerged among feld parasitized reared *H. postica* larvae) by each species were calculated.

Field rates of parasitism detected by molecular analysis

A second set of 50 larvae per feld (L3–L4) was immediately frozen at−80 °C and used to estimate the rate of parasitism by PCR with the newly designed primers. A third set of 150 larvae in total was used to detect parasitoid DNA in diferent larval instars. We therefore collected a similar number of L2, L3 and L4 larvae, which were immediately frozen at−80 °C. Larvae from both sets were 3% bleach rinsed and stored in individual Eppendorf before frozen. Individual larvae were squashed prior to extraction using sterile pestles. Total DNA was extracted from each larva using the DNeasy 96 Blood Kit (Qiagen). PCR was carried out to detect the presence of *B. curculionis* and/or *B. anura* as described above, with three technical replicates per sample. Products were separated by 2% agarose electrophoresis, and analyzed using a ChemiDoc transilluminator (Bio-Rad Laboratories, Hercules, CA, USA). Samples with the anticipated band sizes were recorded as positives. Parasitism rates were calculated by dividing the total number of individuals with anticipated bands by the total number of samples.

Data analysis

The Shapiro–Wilk test was used to determine whether or not the original data was normally distributed. If not, data were arcsin-transformed before

analysis. To evaluate diferences between results from both methods (classical and molecular), in the case of normally distributed data, a *t*-test was performed. For data that did not satisfy the condition of normality required for parametric tests, a Wilcoxon signed rank test was used. The same analysis was performed to compare the rate of parasitism within each larval instar between *B. anura* and *B. curculionis*. Statistical analysis was carried out using JMP Pro15 (SAS Institute, Cary, NC, USA).

Results

Design of *COI* primers specifc for *B. anura* and *B. curculionis*

COI DNA fragments were successfully amplifed from total *B. anura* (OM641987), *B. curculionis* (OL413497) and *H. postica* (OL413498) DNA. The fragments were cloned, and the corresponding sequences were confrmed against GenBank. The sequences were aligned in UGENE to identify nonmatching bases suitable for the design of unique primers (Table [1](#page-3-0)). Accordingly, the Bcfw3 forward primer and Bcrv3 reverse primer were designed to amplify a *COI* fragment specifc for *B. curculionis*, whereas the 2Bafw2 forward primer and 2Barv2 reverse primer were designed to amplify a *COI* fragment specifc for *B. anura* (Fig. [1](#page-4-0)).

Sensitivity and primer species specificity

Sensitivity of the new PCR method was tested on 1:5 serial dilutions of DNA from each parasitoid species. Successful amplifcation was achieved using as little as 3.2 pg of *B. curculionis* DNA or 15 pg of *B. anura* DNA, whereas no amplifcation products were detected when using *H. postica* or *Microctonus*

Table 1 Primer pairs that specifcally amplify *COI* gene fragments from *B. anura* and *B. curculionis*

Fig. 1 Analysis of COI amplicons by 2% agarose gel electrophoresis. The primers specifc for *B. curculionis* (Bcfw3 and Bcrv3) generate a 422-bp product. The primers specifc for *B. anura* (2Bafw2 and 2Barv2) generate a 448-bp prod-

sp. DNA. We then mixed DNA from seven random *H. postica* samples with *B. curculionis* or *B. anura* DNA, and found that the parasitoid DNA was still detected efficiently even with a large excess of *H*. *postica* DNA.

Rates of parasitism detected by classical rearing

The total mortality of *H. postica* larvae varied during the 2019 and 2020 seasons. In 2019, mortality ranged from 0% to almost 30% due to unknown causes, whereas in 2020 up to 100% of the *H. postica* larvae in some felds were killed by the entomopathogenic fungus *Zoophthora phytonomi* (Arthur) (Zygomycetes: Entomophthorales) (Table [2](#page-5-0)). Yearly parasitism rates per feld ranged from less than 2% to more than 30%, with mean values of $15.4 \pm 2.3\%$ in 2019 and $5.1 \pm 1.6\%$ in [2](#page-5-0)020 (Table 2). The parasitism rate by *B. anura* was higher in 2019 (12.0 \pm 2.6%) than 2020 $(4.2 \pm 1.3\%)$. Similarly, the parasitism rate by *B. curculionis* was higher in 2019 $(3.4 \pm 1.6\%)$ than 2020 $(0.9 \pm 0.3\%)$. In one field during 2019, the parasitism rate exceeded $17 \pm 2.6\%$ (Table [2a](#page-5-0)). The effective parasitism rates in 2019 were $6.9 \pm 1.0\%$ for *B. anura* and $3.5 \pm 2.6\%$ for *B. curculionis*, but in 2020 both species achieved effective parasitism rates of only $1 \pm 0.4\%$.

uct. The left-hand lane in both gels shows 100-bp size markers. Bc , *Bathyplectes curculionis*; Ba , *Bathyplectes anura*; Hp, *Hypera postica* negative control; Msp, *Microctonus* sp. and NT, no template control (without DNA)

Rates of parasitism detected by molecular analysis

A total of 1750 *H. postica* larvae were tested using this protocol. The PCR test detected much greater variability in the parasitism rate per feld compared to classical analysis, ranging from 0% to more than 60.4%. The mean parasitism rate due to *B. anura* was $20.7 \pm 2.7\%$ in 2019 and $10.7 \pm 1.7\%$ in 2020, and the equivalent values for *B. curculionis* were $18.0 \pm 5.1\%$ in 2019 and 12.4±2.6% in 2020. Accordingly, *B. curculionis* achieved a slightly lower parasitism rate than *B. anura* in 2019 but the ranking was reversed in 2020 (Table [2](#page-5-0)b). DNA from both parasitoid species was not detected in the same *H. postica* larvae.

Yearly statistical tests showed signifcant diferences between the classical and molecular methods for both parasitoids. The PCR assay detected a signifcantly greater rate of parasitism than the classical method in 2019 for *B. anura* ($t=-3.63$, *df*=13, *p*=0.0031) and for *B. curculionis* ($z=3.14$, *p*=0.0016), and the same was true for 2020 (*B. anura* z=3.00, *p*=0.0026; *B. curculionis* z=3.60, $p = 0.0003$).

The analysis of parasitized instars revealed that *B. curculionis* and *B. anura* DNA was found at a similar rate in L3 larvae (~15% of specimens) and L4 larvae (~10% of specimens), but that only *B. curculionis* parasitized L2 larvae $\left(\sim 20\% \text{ of specimens}\right)$. These results indicate that *B. anura* prefers to parasitize

Fig. 2 Rate of parasitism (mean + SE) by *B. curculionis* (Bc) and *B. anura* (Ba) during diferent stages of *H. postica* larval development (L2, L3 and L4). Diferent letters in the same instar indicate significant differences at $p < 0.05$

later-instars since no DNA was detected in L2 *H. pos tica* larvae (Fig. [2\)](#page-6-0).

Discussion

was performed in 35 felds from 4 diferent counties (1-Urgell, 2-Segrià, 3-Baja Cinca and 4-Monegros)

was performed in 35 fields from 4 different counties $(1-U$ rgell, 2 -Segrià, 3 -Baja Cinca and 4-Monegros)

We have developed a new molecular method based on the amplifcation of the mitochondrial *COI* gene for the quick detection of *B. anura* and *B. curculionis* in *H. postica* larvae. The direct analysis of parasitoid DNA is an alternative to the time-consuming morphological analysis of puparia, which requires the rearing of insects in containment. The mitochondrial *COI* gene has proven useful for the reliable identifca tion of other morphologically similar species (Nanini et al. [2019;](#page-10-19) Solà et al. [2018](#page-11-5); Traugott and Symondson [2008\)](#page-11-6). We therefore designed specifc primers that discriminate between the *B. curculionis* and *B. anura COI* genes, a strategy that has been successful for other parasitoids and predators (Agustí et al. [2003b,](#page-9-8) [2005\)](#page-9-6). The new strategy can be used to investigate interactions between *H. postica* and its larval parasi toids in more detail.

The classical technique revealed a larger num ber of emerging adults for *B. anura* compared to *B. curculionis* and thus a greater rate of parasitism, sug gesting that *B. anura* is more prevalent than *B. curcu lionis* in the study area, as previously reported (Pons and Nuñez [2020](#page-10-1)). In regions of the New World where the two species are colocalized, *B. anura* is generally dominant over *B. curculionis* and can even displace it completely due to greater reproductive capacity and aggression, and more successful host fnding (Harcourt [1990](#page-10-20)). Our new molecular method detected up to seven times as many parasitism events as the classical technique, indicating greater sensitivity and thus more reliability when estimating the rate of parasitism, as suggested for other species (Agustí et al. [2005;](#page-9-6) Gariepy et al. [2008;](#page-9-9) Gomez-Polo et al. [2014](#page-10-21)). Furthermore, the molecular method suggested for the frst time that the rate of parasitism caused by *B. anura* and *B. curculionis* does not difer by so wide a margin as suggested by the classical method (Pons and Nuñez [2020;](#page-10-1) Levi-Mourao et al. [2021\)](#page-10-12). The mean rate of parasitism was similar for both species, suggesting that the two species coexist in the alfalfa crops of north-east Spain. Moreover, the classical and molecular methods both showed that *B. anura* was the prevalent species in March, when *H. postica* begins to attack alfalfa crops, whereas *B.curculionis* was slightly more prevalent during April. This indicates a succession from one species to the other, as recently reported (Levi-Mourao et al. [2021\)](#page-10-12) and may explain the absence of multiparasitism by both species.

The major and most efective parasitoid of *H. postica* in some regions of North America is thought to be *B. curculionis* (Berberet and Bisges [1998](#page-9-10); Radclife and Flanders [1998](#page-10-9); Soroka et al. [2019](#page-11-0)). However, its efectiveness is often comprised by the encapsulation of the parasitoid egg by hemocytes in the host hemocoel (Berberet et al. [2003](#page-9-11); Salt and van den Bosch [1967](#page-11-7); Shoubu et al. [2005\)](#page-11-8). *H. postica* L1 larvae have little defense against parasitism, but 30–50% of the L2–L4 instars survive as a result of encapsulation (Berberet et al. [1987;](#page-9-12) van Den Bosch and Dietrick [1959](#page-11-9)). This may explain why we detected a larger number of *B. curculionis* parasitism events by PCR compared to conventional rearing. PCR-based methods can overestimate the rate of parasitism because they detect parasitoids that are already neutralized by the host immune system, whereas the classical method allows the direct measurement of parasitoid survival (Traugott et al. [2006](#page-11-10)). On the other hand, classical rearing techniques are infuenced by the mortality of parasitoids under laboratory conditions, which can result in partial data loss (Tilmon et al. [2000](#page-11-11)). Furthermore, the puparia of each species have diferent environmental requirements to complete their life cycle, which can also infuence the results. For example, *B. curculionis* can extend its diapause up to 10–12 months in an unfavorable environment (Radclife and Flanders [1998](#page-10-9)), but high emergence rates were achieved by placing the puparia in a refrigerator for 4–6 months before transfer to an environment set at 21 $^{\circ}$ C with a 12-h photoperiod (Jacob and Evans [2000](#page-10-22); [2004](#page-10-23)). The low efective rate of parasitism we observed in the case of *B. curculionis* may be due to the maintenance of the puparia in rearing cages under laboratory conditions. In contrast to *B. curculionis*, *B. anura* eggs are almost never encapsulated by *H. postica* (Maund and Hsiao [1991;](#page-10-24) Puttler [1967](#page-10-25)). This may explain the correlation between the two methods during 2019, when there was no additional mortality caused by *Z. phytonomi*.

Our results also showed that *B. anura* females prefers L3 *H. postica* larvae because no DNA was found in L2 larvae, agreeing with previous fndings (Bartell and Pass [1980;](#page-9-13) Dowell and Horn [1977](#page-9-14)). In contrast, *B. curculionis* targeted L2 larvae, concurring with reports showing that this species favors early-instar *H. postica* larvae and that this is strictly related to high parasitoid larval survival (Duodu and Davis [1974;](#page-9-15) Barney et al. [1978\)](#page-9-16). The differences in larval instar preference probably refects the length of the ovipositor, which is longer for *B. curculionis* and facilitates the utilization of early instars still hidden in unfolded leaves and buds (Dowell and Horn [1977](#page-9-14)). Our results also suggest that *B. anura* has a shorter larval development phase than *B. curculionis*.

Given the diferences in parasitoid occurrence, development, and host instar preferences, alfalfa crop management during the frst cutting could be optimized to enhance the survival and development of *B. anura* and *B. curculionis*. *Bathyplectes anura* can survive and complete its development during alfalfa weevil infestation because it appears earlier in the feld, favors late-instar host larvae and develops more quickly (Levi-Mourao et al. [2021](#page-10-12)). In contrast, the survival of *B. curculionis* can be seriously compromised by the timing of frst cutting because it appears later in the feld (mainly during the second half of April, when most *H. postica* larvae have nearly completed development) and favors young larvae which are increasingly scarce by this time point (Levi-Mourao et al. [2021;](#page-10-12) Levi et al. in preparation). The commercial cutting of alfalfa at the end of April eliminates almost the entire *H. postica* population, so bringing this forward to reduce yield losses could severely limit the availability of hosts for *B. curculionis*. A delay in this practice can help to the survival of this parasitoid species. Beside this, a recent study in the Ebro Basin on the efficacy of a winter alfalfa cutting (Levi-Mourao et al. [2022](#page-10-26)) to reduce the egg population and to prevent the development of larvae of *H. postica* at the frst alfalfa commercial cutting, shows that the larval density was signifcantly reduced, whereas the rate of parasitism increased, especially *B. anura*, the prevalent species at the beginning of the spring. Furthermore, the reduction of alfalfa weevil larvae below the economic thresholds, enhanced by the winter cutting, would allow delaying the date of the frst commercial cutting and, in turn, *B. curculionis* survival.

Parasitism rates in 2020 were lower than in 2019 due to the presence of *Z. phytonomi.* Epizooties of this fungus occur in years with high rainfall (Barney and Armbrust [1981;](#page-9-17) Kuhar et al. [1999](#page-10-8)). This was the case in 2020 but not in 2019, which featured a dry winter. Although, *Z. phytonomi* kills *H. postica* larvae and is considered an important biological control agent (Harcourt and Guppy, [1991](#page-10-27); Giles and Obricky, [1997\)](#page-9-18), it also kills parasitoid larvae (Giles et al. [1994](#page-10-28); Kuhar et al. [1999](#page-10-8)). Our results show that epizootic infections of this fungus disrupt the alfalfa weevil–parasitoid system under Spanish crop conditions. The lower *B. anura* parasitism rate in 2020 suggests that this species was probably the most afected by the fungus. *B. curculionis* appears later in the study area and therefore has an advantage over *B. anura* because the environmental conditions no longer favor the spread of the disease, increasing the likelihood of host survival until pupation and thus the survival of the parasitoid.

Parasitism rates in 2019 varied at the feld level, with maximum values of 37% for *B. anura* and 17% for *B. curculionis*. This agrees with other studies in the same area, where variable rates were reported with a maximum of 30% (Pons and Nuñez [2020](#page-10-1)). These parasitoids were most effective when introduced into North America to control the alfalfa weevil. The rate of parasitism with *B. curculionis* tended to be high, at times exceeding 90% in the mild San Francisco Bay and Pleasanton areas, but this approach was much less efective in the hotter San Joaquin Valley (Radclife and Flanders [1998](#page-10-9)). Rearing studies conducted in south-western Canada revealed *B. curculionis* parasitism rates of up to 17% (Soroka et al. [2020\)](#page-11-1). This suggests that environmental conditions play a key role in the success of parasitism, with hotter temperatures inhibiting parasitoid performance, and can explain our lower rates recorded in our study area. In other regions of North America, where *B. anura* tends to be the prevalent species (as is the case in Spain), the rate of parasitism was similar to our fndings (Harcourt [1990](#page-10-20); Berberet and Bisges [1998](#page-9-10)).

In conclusion, our new molecular strategy provides information about the ecology of *B. anura* and *B. curculionis*, reveals the prevalence of both species, and contributes to the development of biological control strategies in Europe. Our results show that specifc primers can be used to detect and identify both endoparasitoid wasps in alfalfa weevil specimens, and provided an alternative way to estimate the rate of parasitism in the feld. One drawback of the new method is its tendency to overestimate the rate of parasitism by counting unsuccessful events. Accordingly, we recommend that DNA analysis should be combined with conventional rearing to determine the efective rate of parasitism and also to accommodate interactions with other species that are not specifcally targeted by the molecular assay. In spite of the potential of *Bathyplectes* sp. as a biological control agent for *H. postica*, it seems that the alfalfa crop management system currently performed in Spain may be unfavorable to their control capacity. However, the incorporation of a winter cutting and the delay of the frst spring alfalfa cutting, which increase the rates of parasitism of *B. anura* and can help to the survival of *B. curculionis*, respectively, are tools that can be included in integrated pest management strategies in Spain and, potentially, in other Mediterranean countries.

Acknowledgements This study was funded by the Ministerio de Ciencia e Innovación of the Spanish Government (project AGL2017-84127-R). The authors would like to thank Dr. Nuria Agustí for all her suggestions during the experiments and her comments when writing this article. Dr. Addy García, Dr. Carmen Lopez and Marta Franch for support with the laboratory and feld experiments. We also thank J. Piqué, Oses-Nafosa, Aldhara-Europe S.R.L., Granja San José and Cooperatives de Bell-lloc d'Urgell, and Verge de les Sogues—Bellvís for allowing sampling in their commercial alfalfa felds. We also thank Dr. Jaume Almacelles from the Laboratori de Sanitat Vegetal and Dr. Enrique Quesada from the Universidad de Córdoba. A.L-M. was funded by a Jade Plus Grant from the Universitat de Lleida, and R.M. was funded by an FPI Grant from the Ministerio de Ciencia e Innovación.

Author contributions Conceptualization: XP; Methodology: AL-M; PM; PC-B; Formal analysis: AL-M; PC-B; XP. Investigation: AL-M; PC-B; RM and XP; Writing—original draft preparation: AL-M; PC-B; XP; Writing—review and editing: AL-M; RM PC-B; PM and XP; Funding acquisition: XP; Resources: XP; Supervision: PM; XP. All authors have read and agreed to the published version of the manuscript.

Funding Open Access funding provided thanks to the CRUE-CSIC agreement with Springer Nature. This study was funded by Ministerio de Ciencia, Innovación y Universidades, Spanish Government. Project AGL2017-84127-R: Arable crop management and landscape interactions for pest control. Alexandre Levi-Mourao was funded by a predoctoral JADE plus grant from the University of Lleida and Roberto Meseguer by a predoctoral grant FPI-PRE2018-083602, Ministerio de Ciencia, Innovación y Universidades.

Declarations

Confict of interest The authors declare no conficts of interest.

Ethical approval This article does not contain any studies with human participants or animals performed by any of the authors.

Open Access This article is licensed under a Creative Commons Attribution 4.0 International License, which permits use, sharing, adaptation, distribution and reproduction in any medium or format, as long as you give appropriate credit to the original author(s) and the source, provide a link to the Creative Commons licence, and indicate if changes were made. The images or other third party material in this article are included in the article's Creative Commons licence, unless indicated otherwise in a credit line to the material. If material is not included in the article's Creative Commons licence and your intended use is not permitted by statutory regulation or exceeds the permitted use, you will need to obtain permission directly from the copyright holder. To view a copy of this licence, visit <http://creativecommons.org/licenses/by/4.0/>.

References

- Agustí N, Shayler SP, Harwood JD, Vaughan IP, Sunderland KD, Symondson WOC (2003a) Collembola as alternative prey sustaining spiders in arable ecosystems: Prey detection within predators using molecular markers. Mol Ecol 12:3467–3475
- Agustí N, Unruh TR, Welter SC (2003b) Detecting *Cacopsylla pyricola* (Hemiptera: Psyllidae) in predator guts using COI mitochondrial markers. Bull Entomol Res 93:179–185
- Agustí N, Bourguet D, Spataro T, Delos M, Eychenne N, Folcher L, Arditi R (2005) Detection, identifcation and geographical distribution of European corn borer larval parasitoids using molecular markers. Mol Ecol 14:3267–3274
- Agustí N, Castañé C, Fraile I, Alomar O (2020) Development of a PCR-based method to monitor arthropod dispersal in agroecosystems: *Macrolophus pygmaeus* (Hemiptera: Miridae) from banker plants to tomato crops. Insect Sci 27:1125–1134
- Barney RJ, Armbrust EJ (1981) List of the insect predators of the alfalfa weevil, *Hypera postica* (Coleoptera: Curculionidae). Bull Entomol Soc Am 27:241–244
- Barney RJ, Armbrust EJ, Bartell DP, Goodrich MA (1978) Frequency occurrence of *Bathyplectes curculionis* within instars of *Hypera postica* larvae in Illinois. Environ Entomol 7:241–245
- Bartell DP, Pass BC (1980) Morphology, development, and behavior of the immature stages of the parasite *Bathyplectes anurus* (Hymenoptera: Ichneumonidae). Can Entomol 112:481–487
- Berberet RC, Bisges AD (1998) Potential for competition among natural enemies of larvae of *Hypera postica* (Coleoptera: Curculionidae) in the southern plains. Environ Entomol 27:743–751
- Berberet RC, Willson LJ, Odejar M (1987) Probabilities for encapsulation of eggs of *Bathyplectes curculionis* (Hymenoptera: Ichneumonidae) by larvae of *Hypera postica* (Coleoptera: Curculionidae) and resulting reduction in efective parasitism. Ann Entomol Soc Am 80:483–485
- Berberet RC, Zarrabi AA, Payton ME, Bisges AD (2003) Reduction in efective parasitism of *Hypera postica* (Coleoptera: Curculionidae) by *Bathyplectes curculionis* (Hymenoptera: Ichneumonidae) due to encapsulation. Environ Entomol 32:1123–1130
- Black W, McLain D, Rai K (1989) Patterns of variation in the rDNA cistron within and among world populations of a mosquito, *Aedes albopictus* (Skuse). Genetics 121:539–550
- Day WH (1970) The survival value of its jumping cocoons to *Bathyplectes anurus*, a parasite of the alfalfa weevil. J Econ Entomol 63:586–589
- Delgado I, Lloveras J (2020) Historia y distribución de la alfalfa. In: Lloveras J, Delgado I, Chocarro C (eds) La alfalfa, agronomía y utilización, 1st edn. Edicions de la Universitat de Lleida, Lleida, Spain, pp 17–32
- Dowell RV, Horn DJ (1977) Adaptive strategies of larval parasitoids of the alfalfa weevil (Coleoptera: Curculionidae). Can Entomol 109:641–648
- Duodu YA, Davis DW (1974) Selection of alfalfa weevil larval instars by, and mortality due to, the parasite *Bathyplectes curculionis* (Thomson). Environ Entomol 3:549–552
- Dysart RJ, Day WH (1976) Release and recovery of introduced parasites of the alfalfa weevil in Eastern North America, 1st edn. Agricultural Research Service - United States Department of Agriculture, Washington
- Froger A, Hall JE (2007) Transformation of Plasmid DNA into E. coli using the heat shock method. J vis Exp 6:253
- Gariepy T, Kuhlmann U, Gillott C, Erlandson M (2008) A large-scale comparison of conventional and molecular methods for the evaluation of host-parasitoid associations in non-target risk-assessment studies. J Appl Ecol 45:708–715
- Giles KL, Obrycki JJ (1997) Reduced insecticide rates and strip-harvesting efects on alfalfa weevil (Coleoptera: Curculionidae) larval populations and prevalence of

Zoophthora phytonomi (Entomophthorales: Entomophthoraceae). J Econ Entomol 90:933–944

- Giles KL, Obrycki JJ, Degoover TA (1994) Prevalence of predators associated with *Acyrthosiphon pisum* (Homoptera: Aphididae) and *Hypera postica* Gyllenhal (Coleoptera: Curculionidae) during growth of the frst crop of alfalfa. Biol Control 4:170–177
- Gomez-Polo P, Traugott M, Alomar O, Castañé C, Rojo S, Agustí N (2014) Identifcation of the most common predatory hoverfies of Mediterranean vegetable crops and their parasitism using multiplex PCR. J Pest Sci 87:371–378
- Goosey HB (2012) A degree-day model of sheep grazing infuence on alfalfa weevil and crop characteristics. J Econ Entomol 105:102–112
- Harcourt DG (1990) Displacement of *Bathyplectes curculionis* (Thoms.) (Hymenoptera: Ichneumonidae) by *B. anurus* (Thoms.) in eastern Ontario populations of the alfalfa weevil, *Hypera postica* (Gyll.) (Coleoptera: Curculionidae). Can Entomol 122:641–645
- Harcourt DG, Guppy JC (1991) Numerical analysis of an outbreak of the alfalfa weevil (Coleoptera: Curculionidae) in eastern Ontario. Environ Entomol 20:217–223
- Hoff KM, Brewer MJ, Blodgett SL (2002) Alfalfa weevil (Coleoptera: Curculionidae) larval sampling: comparison of shake-bucket and sweep-net methods and efect of training. J Econ Entomol 95:748–753
- Hofman A (1963) Sous famille des Curculionidae. Tribu des Hyperini. Les Hypera (Syn Phytonomus). In: Balachowsky A (ed) Entomologe appliquée a l'agriculture Tome I Coleoptères, second volume. París, Masson et Cie, pp 984–989
- Innis M, Gelfand D (1990) Optimization of PCRs. In: Innis M, Gelfand D, Sninsky J, White T (eds) PCR protocols. Academic Press, San Diego, pp 3–12
- Jacob HS, Evans EW (2000) Infuence of carbohydrate foods and mating on longevity of the parasitoid *Bathyplectes curculionis* (Hymenoptera: Ichneumonidae). Environ Entomol 29:1088–1095
- Jacob HS, Evans EW (2004) Infuence of diferent sugars on the longevity of *Bathyplectes curculionis* (Hym., Ichneumonidae). J Appl Entomol 128:316–320
- JMP, version *Pro* 15. SAS Institute Inc, Cary, NC, 1989–2021
- Kingsley PC, Bryan MD, Day WH, Burger TL, Dysart RJ, Schwalbe CP (1993) Alfalfa weevil (Coleoptera: Curculionidae) biological control: spreading the benefts. Environ Entomol 22:1234–1250
- Kuhar TP, Youngman RR, Laub CA (1999) Alfalfa weevil (Coleoptera: Curculionidae) pest status and incidence of *Bathyplectes* spp. (Hymenoptera: Ichneumonidae) and *Zoophthora phytonomi* (Zygomycetes: Entomophthorales) in Virginia. J Econ Entomol 92:1184–1189
- Levi-Mourao A, Núñez E, García A, Meseguer R, Pons X (2022) Alfalfa winter cutting: Efectiveness against the alfalfa weevil, Hypera postica (Gyllenhal) (Coleoptera: Curculionidae) and efect on its rate of parasitism due to Bathyplectes spp. (Hymenoptera: Ichneumonidae). Crop Prot 152:105858
- Levi-Mourao A, Meseguer R, Pons X (2021) Parasitism of the alfalfa weevil *Hypera postica* Gyllenhal by *Bathyplectes* sp in Spain, in Proceedings of the 1st International Electronic Conference on Entomology. 10505
- Liang GH, Jang EB, Heller WP, Chang CL, Chen JH, Zhang FP, Geib SM (2015) A qPCR-based method for detecting parasitism of *Fopius arisanus* (Sonan) in oriental fruit fies, *Bactrocera dorsalis* (Hendel). Pest Manag Sci 71:1666–1674
- Liang GH, Fu LQ, Zheng JX, Lin HY, Lin JH, Sim SB, Jang BJ, Heller WP, Geib SM (2018) Molecular characterization of interspecifc competition of *Diachasmimorpha longicaudata* (Ashmead) and *Fopius arisanus* (Sonan) parasitizing the oriental fruit fy, *Bactrocera dorsalis* (Hendel). Biol Control 118:10–15
- Los LM, Allen WA (1982) Visual technique for determining presence and stage of *Zoophthora phytonomi* in dead alfalfa weevil larvae. J Econ Entomol 75:375–377
- Madeira F, Clemente-Orta G, Alomar O, Batuecas I, Sossai S, Albajes R (2022) Land use alters the abundance of herbivore and predatory insects on crops: the case of alfalfa. J Pest Sci 95:473–491
- Maund CM, Hsiao TH (1991) Diferential encapsulation of two *Bathyplectes* parasitoids among alfalfa weevil strains, *Hypera postica* (Gyllenhal). Can Entomol 123:197–203
- Molina P, Martínez-Ferrer MT, Campos-Rivela JM, Riudavets J, Agustí N (2021) Development of a PCR-based method for the screening of potential predators of the African citrus psyllid *Trioza erytreae* (Del Guercio). Biol Control 160:104661
- Nanini F, Maggio DH, Ferronato P, Rugno G, Yamamoto PT, Corrêa AS (2019) Molecular marker to identify *Diaphorina citri* (Hemiptera: Liviidae) DNA in gut content of predators. Neotrop Entomol 48:927–933
- Orlof SB (1997) Introduction. In: Orlof SB, Karlson HL, Tauber LR (eds) Intermountain alfalfa management. University of California. Division of Agriculture and Natural Resources, Oakland, pp 2–3
- Pons X, Nuñez E (2020) Plagas da la alfalfa: Importancia, daños y estrategias de control. In: Lloveras J, Delgado I, Chocarro C (eds) La alfalfa, agronomía y utilización, 1st edn. Edicions de la Universitat de Lleida, Lleida, Spain, pp 167–202
- Puttler B (1967) Interrelationship of *Hypera postica* (Coleoptera: Curculionidae) and *Bathyplectes curculionis* (Hymenoptera: Ichneumonidae) in the Eastern United States with particular reference to encapsulation of the parasite eggs by the weevil larvae. Ann Entomol Soc Am 60:1031–1038
- Radclife EB, Flanders KL (1998) Biological control of alfalfa weevil in North America. Integr Pest Manag Rev 3:225–242
- Rand TA (2013) Host density drives spatial variation of the alfalfa weevil, *Hypera postica*, across dryland and irrigated alfalfa cropping systems. Environ Entomol 42:116–122
- Ribes A (2012) Himenòpters de Ponent. [http://ponent.atspace.](http://ponent.atspace.org/fauna/ins/index.htm) [org/fauna/ins/index.htm.](http://ponent.atspace.org/fauna/ins/index.htm) Accessed 3 May 2021
- Saeidi M, Moharramipour S (2017) Physiology of cold hardiness, seasonal fuctuations, and cryoprotectant contents in overwintering adults of *Hypera postica* (Coleoptera: Curculionidae). Environ Entomol 46:960–966
- Saiki R (1990) Amplifcation of genomic DNA. In: Innis M, Gelfand D, Sninsky J, White T (eds) PCR protocols. Academic Press, San Diego, pp 13–20
- Salt G, van den Bosch R (1967) The defense reactions of three species of *Hypera* (Coleoptera: Curculionidae) to an ichneumon wasp. J Invertebr Pathol 9:164–177
- Shoubu M, Okumura M, Shiraishi A, Kimura H, Takagi M, Ueno T (2005) Establishment of *Bathyplectes anurus* (Hymenoptera: Ichneumonidae), a larval parasitoid of the alfalfa weevil, *Hypera postica* (Coleoptera: Curculionidae) in Japan. Biol Control 34:144–151
- Simon C, Frati F, Beckenbach A, Crespi B, Liu H, Flook P (1994) Evolution, weighting, and phylogenetic utility of mitochondrial gene sequences and a compilation of conserved polymerase chain reaction primers. Ann Entomol Soc Am 87:651–701
- Solà M, Riudavets J, Agustí N (2018) Detection and identifcation of fve common internal grain insect pests by multiplex PCR. Food Control 84:246–254
- Soroka J, Grenkow L, Cárcamo H, Meers S, Barkley S, Gavloski J (2019) An assessment of degree-day models to predict the phenology of alfalfa weevil (Coleoptera: Curculionidae) on the Canadian Prairies. Can Entomol 152:110–129
- Soroka J, Bennett AMR, Kora C, Schwarzfeld MD (2020) Distribution of alfalfa weevil (Coleoptera: Curculionidae) and its parasitoids on the Canadian Prairies, with a key to described species of Nearctic *Bathyplectes* (Hymenoptera: Ichneumonidae). Can Entomol 152:663–701
- Tilmon KJ, Danforth BN, Day WH, Hofmann MP (2000) Determining parasitoid species composition in a host population: a molecular approach. Ann Entomol Soc Am 93:640–647
- Traugott M, Symondson WOC (2008) Molecular analysis of predation on parasitized hosts. Bull Entomol Res 98:223–231
- Traugott M, Zangerl P, Juen A, Schallhart N, Pfiffner L (2006) Detecting key parasitoids of lepidopteran pests by multiplex PCR. Biol Control 39:39–46
- Traugott M, Kamenova S, Ruess L, Ruess L, Seeber J, Plantegenest M (2013) Empirically characterising trophic networks: what emerging DNA-based methods, stable isotope and fatty acid analyses can offer. Adv Ecol Res 49:177–224
- Van Den Bosch R, Dietrick EJ (1959) The interrelationships of *Hypera brunneipennis* (Coleoptera: Curculionidae) and *Bathyplectes curculionis* (Hymenoptera: Ichneumonidae) in Southern California. Ann Entomol Soc Am 52:609–616
- Wolf S, Zeisler C, Sint D, Romeis J, Traugott M, Collatz J (2018) A simple and cost-efective molecular method to track predation on *Drosophila suzukii* in the feld. J Pest Sci 91:927–935

Alexandre Levi‑Mourao is a PhD student at the University of Lleida. His research focuses on *Hypera postica* ecology and integrated pest management. This study is part of his PhD thesis.

Pilar Muñoz is an aggregate professor of biology and biotechnology at the University of Lleida. Her research line mainly focuses on the physiological and molecular efects of transgenic plants on insect pests.

Pedro Cerda-Bennasser is a master student at the University of Lleida. He is nowadays working with plant biotechnology and entomology fnishing his master thesis.

Roberto Meseguer is a PhD student at the University of Lleida. His research focuses on the ecology of alfalfa aphids and its natural enemies.

Xavier Pons is a full-professor and senior researcher at the University of Lleida. His research lines are focused on integrated pest management of arable crops and urban green areas.