ORIGINAL ARTICLE

Contrasting patterns of morphology, fuctuating asymmetry and leaf herbivory in three plant species of diferent successional stages of a tropical dry forest

Joan Sebastian Aguilar‑Peralta¹ · Antonio González‑Rodríguez2 · Yurixhi Maldonado‑López³ · Marcílio Fagundes4 · Maurício L. Faria4 · Luis Daniel Ávila‑Cabadilla5 · Mariana Yolotl Álvarez‑Añorve5 · Pablo Cuevas‑Reyes[1](http://orcid.org/0000-0002-5897-919X)

Received: 17 October 2019 / Accepted: 18 April 2020 / Published online: 25 April 2020 © Springer-Verlag GmbH Germany, part of Springer Nature 2020

Abstract

Key message **This paper shows the intraspecifc plant responses in leaf morphology, herbivory and FA between mature and successional tropical dry forests, as well as the difculty associated with understanding the relationship between FA and herbivory**

Abstract Understanding the processes that afect biotic interactions during secondary succession has implications for the maintenance of species diversity in the tropics. We studied the changes in leaf morphology, fuctuating asymmetry (FA) and herbivory in three dominant tropical dry forest plant species that occur in mature and secondary forests. We selected eight study sites: four in mature and four in successional forests. At each site, a plot of 20×50 m was established to characterize the vegetation structure and soil fertility. Subsequently, leaf morphology, FA and herbivory were measured in all individuals of *Cordia elaeagnoides*, *C. alliodora* and *Achatocarpus gracilis* with DBH ≥ 2.5 cm found in the plots. Plant abundance and plant height decreased in secondary forest, while the content of nitrates and phosphates increased in soil of secondary forests. Diferences in leaf morphology between forest conditions were found for the three species. Total leaf area was higher in mature than in secondary forests for *C*. *elaeagnoides* and *A*. *gracilis*. An opposite pattern was found for *C*. *alliodora.* In both *Cordia* species, herbivory was higher in secondary than in mature forests. The opposite pattern was found for *A. gracilis* in secondary forests. For all the cases, FA was higher in mature forests than in secondary forests. Herbivory was positively correlated with FA in secondary forests in *C. elaeganoides* and in *A. gracilis*, whereas in *C. alliodora* herbivory was positively related with FA in mature forests. Overall, we detected changes in foliar morphology, fuctuating asymmetry and herbivory between mature and secondary forests, with a general pattern of higher FA levels in mature forests. Our fndings illustrate the difculty associated with understanding the relationship between FA and herbivory throughout the regeneration process in tropical dry forests due to the complexity of abiotic and biotic factors that can afect plant–herbivore interactions.

Keywords Environmental stress · Secondary succession · Tropical dry forests · Fluctuating asymmetry · Herbivory

Communicated by A. Gessler.

 \boxtimes Pablo Cuevas-Reyes pcragalla@gmail.com

- ¹ Laboratorio de Ecología de Interacciones Bióticas, Universidad Michoacana de San Nicolás de Hidalgo, Francisco J. Mújica S/N Col. Felicitas del Río, Ciudad Universitaria, C.P. 58030 Morelia, Michoacán, Mexico
- ² Laboratorio de Genética de la Conservación, Instituto de Investigaciones en Ecosistemas, Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, Antigua Carretera a Pátzcuaro No. 8701, C.P 58190 Morelia, Michoacán, Mexico
- ³ Cátedras CONACYT‑Instituto de Investigaciones sobre los Recursos Naturales, Universidad Michoacana de San Nicolás de Hidalgo, Av. San Juanito Itzícuaro S/N, Nueva Esperanza, C.P.58330 Morelia, Michoacán, Mexico
- Department of General Biology, State University of Montes Claros, 39401‑089 Montes Claros, Minas Gerais, Brazil
- ⁵ Escuela Nacional de Estudios Superiores, Unidad Mérida, Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México, Carretera Mérida‑Tetiz, Km 4.5, Ucú, C.P. 97357 Mérida, Yucatán, Mexico

Introduction

The most threatened tropical ecosystems are the tropical dry forests (TDFs), which represent 42% of the tropical forests of the world (Trejo and Dirzo [2000\)](#page-11-0). During the last decades, anthropogenic activities such as deforestation, tourism, urbanization and the conversion of mature forests to agricultural fields and livestock soils have negatively afected the TDF, generating a mosaic of fragments with natural vegetation and patches of abandoned lands under diferent stages of natural regeneration. Therefore, it is common to observe a high occurrence of secondary forests under diferent successional stages (Chazdon and Guariguata [2016\)](#page-9-0).

The secondary succession process represents a feedback phenomenon between abiotic factors and vegetation characteristics. In fact, abiotic factors such as precipitation, relative humidity, temperature and soil fertility change during the successional process and can infuence plant performance, population structure, biotic interactions, food webs and, therefore, the community structure (Loik and Holl [2001](#page-10-0); Lebrija-Trejos et al. [2011\)](#page-10-1). In turn, vegetation structure aspects such as plant species dominance, diversity, density and life forms may affect the abiotic factors, which in turn influence the forest regeneration process (Madeira et al. [2009;](#page-10-2) Lebrija-Trejos et al. [2010](#page-10-3)). In this way, some studies have shown that secondary forests of TDFs are characterized by a higher incidence of solar radiation and temperature and lower relative humidity and water availability in comparison with mature forests (Loh– beck et al. [2015](#page-10-4); Pineda-García et al. [2013\)](#page-10-5). Because secondary forests are hotter and drier environments that can represent situations of environmental stress for plants, it is possible to expect changes or adjustments in physiological and morphological attributes according to the ability of plant species to acclimate to such stress (Alvarez-Añorve et al. [2012;](#page-9-1) Schöb et al. [2013](#page-10-6)).

Fluctuating asymmetry (FA) describes the random differences in size or shape between two sides of a bilateral character in organisms and refects the developmental instability caused by stressors such as pollution, extremes of temperature, solar radiation and humidity, habitat disturbance and global climate change (Cuevas-Reyes et al. [2013,](#page-9-2) [2018a;](#page-9-3) Tucić et al. [2018\)](#page-11-1). Consequently, it has been considered a reliable indicator of environmental stress in diferent organisms such as birds (Cuervo and Restrepo [2007\)](#page-9-4), mammals (Marchand et al. [2003\)](#page-10-7) and amphibians (Niemeier et al. [2019](#page-10-8)). Particularly, in plants, high levels of FA have been correlated with the reduction of survival and reproduction (Díaz et al. [2004](#page-9-5)), increased urbaniza-tion (Cuevas-Reyes et al. [2013](#page-9-2)), extreme climatic condi-tions (Valkama and Kozlov [2001](#page-11-2)) and excesses or deficits of solar radiation, temperature and soil nutrients (Hagen et al. [2008](#page-10-9); Cornelissen and Stiling [2011\)](#page-9-6). In addition, herbivory can also be a plant stressor (Cuevas-Reyes et al. [2018b\)](#page-9-7). In some cases, FA levels are positively related with herbivory, indicating more susceptibility to herbivores (plant stress hypothesis) (Cornelissen and Stiling [2005;](#page-9-8) Cuevas-Reyes et al. [2011a](#page-9-9)). However, other studies have not found this relationship (Bañuelos et al. [2004](#page-9-10)). Diferences in nutritional quality and chemical defenses of plants have been suggested to explain these contrasting results (Cornelissen and Stiling [2011](#page-9-6)). On the other hand, plants can be directly stressed by herbivorous insects pro‑ ducing changes in leaf symmetry and increasing FA levels (herbivory-induced stress hypothesis) (Alves-Silva and Del-Claro [2016\)](#page-9-11). In this way, FA in plants can increase as a result of herbivory intensity (Cuevas-Reyes et al. [2011b](#page-9-12)).

The levels of herbivory can vary between plant species and individuals (del-Val and Armesto [2010\)](#page-9-13) as a result of differences in the intrinsic characteristics (e.g., genetic composition, type of growth, longevity, and leaf functional traits) (Coley [1982\)](#page-9-14), temporal and spatial variation in richness and abundance of herbivores and changes in local environmental conditions, which in turn can infuence the nutritional quality and chemical defenses of plants (Silva et al. [2012](#page-10-10); Sousa-Souto et al. [2014](#page-10-11); González-Esquivel et al. [2019](#page-10-12)). According to this idea, it is possible to expect a decrease in resource availability for plants (e.g., soil nitrogen and phosphorous) during the forest succession process, where plants that occur in early successional stages invest more resources in vegetative growth and replacement of leaf tissues lost by herbivory than in chemical defense as a result of higher photosynthetic rates and faster vegetative growth (Coley et al. [1985;](#page-9-15) González-Esquivel et al. [2019\)](#page-10-12). Conversely, plants of mature forests allocate more resources for carbon-based chemical defenses because producing new leaves results in being more expensive (Silva et al. [2012\)](#page-10-10).

Considering these ideas, it is possible to test the resource availability hypothesis in plants of the same species that occur in contrasting successional habitats because they might exhibit differences in their contents of chemical defenses, nutritional quality and herbivory rates (Silva et al. [2012](#page-10-10); González-Esquivel et al. [2019\)](#page-10-12). Therefore, we hypothesized that plants immersed in secondary forests will have higher levels of herbivory because they are rich in nutrients with fewer compounds associated with defense in comparison with plants of mature forests (Silva et al. [2012](#page-10-10); González-Esquivel et al. [2019](#page-10-12)).

Finally, the relationship between FA and herbivory suggests that FA may also serve as an indicator of plant susceptibility to herbivory, where more asymmetric leaves have higher nutritional quality than symmetric leaves, making them more susceptible to herbivory and implying that leaf morphology and FA can also be used as an indicator of plant quality (Lempa et al. [2000](#page-10-13); Cornelissen et al. [2003,](#page-9-16) Cornelissen and Stiling [2005\)](#page-9-8). However, herbivory itself can also act as a stressor and directly contribute to increase the level of FA (Zvereva et al. [1997](#page-11-3); Møller and Shykoff [1999](#page-10-14); Maldonado-López et al. [2019\)](#page-10-15). Consequently, environmental factors such as temperature, humidity and incidence of light can afect both leaf morphology and plant quality, which in turn, might infuence the herbivory levels (Cunningham et al. [1999](#page-9-17); Givnish [1987](#page-10-16); Cuevas-Reyes et al. [2011a](#page-9-9), [b](#page-9-12)). Thus, based on these ideas and considering that secondary forests are hotter and drier habitats, we hypothesized that secondary forests present stressful conditions to plants that will be expressed in changes in leaf morphology, higher levels of foliar FA, and a higher preference of herbivores for asymmetric leaves that could be refected in higher levels of herbivory.

In the present study, we tested this hypothesis using geometric morphometric techniques to analyze leaf size and shape, fuctuating asymmetry and leaf herbivory in three dominant plant species in mature and secondary forests of a tropical dry forest in Chamela-Cuixmala, Mexico. Specifcally, we addressed the following questions: (1) do leaf morphology and size of *C. elaeagnoides*, *C. alliodora* and *A. gracilis* change in function of successional TDFs stages? (i.e., mature and successional TDFs); (2) do levels of FA difer between the two forest conditions and between plant species*?* (3) Are herbivory levels diferent between mature and secondary forests in the three plant species? (4) Is FA related with total leaf area and levels of herbivory in both forest conditions?

Materials and methods

Study area

This study was conducted at the Chamela-Cuixmala Biosphere Reserve on the Pacifc coast of Jalisco, Mexico (19° 22′–19° 35′ N, 104° 56′–105° 03′ W) that covers an extension of 16,000 ha, and in outside areas of abandoned agricultural felds, hereafter called secondary forests (García-Oliva et al. [2002](#page-10-17); Sánchez-Azofeifa et al. [2009](#page-10-18)).

We selected eight study sites using Google Earth highresolution imagery [\(http://earth.google.com](http://earth.google.com)) and classifed satellite images (Avila-Cabadilla et al. [2012](#page-9-18)); four sites of mature forests localized within the Chamela-Cuixmala Biosphere Reserve and four secondary forests outside the Biosphere reserve. Mature forests have remained intact in the last 60 years, while secondary forests were cattle pastures and have between 3 and 8 years of abandonment (Avila-Cabadilla et al. [2012](#page-9-18)). In general, the land use history of the secondary forests in the study sites was the following: (1) most of the original vegetation was removed through slash and burn; (2) lands were used for agriculture between 2 and 5 years and then converted to cattle ranching by burn– ing the vegetation periodically; and (3) secondary succession occurred because of the land abandonment by farmers (Jimenez-Rodríguez et al. [2018](#page-10-19)).

Because topographic variables can afect the composition of the plant community, our study sites were located at an average elevation of 143 m with slopes averaging 10° (range 15°), mainly oriented to the south and southeast (Balvan‑ era et al. [2002](#page-9-19)). We characterized each forest condition by measuring soil properties and vegetation structure (Jimenez-Rodríguez et al. [2018\)](#page-10-19).

Vegetation measurements

To characterize the vegetation structure of mature and secondary forests, in each study site, all woody plants with diameter at breast height (DBH) \geq 2.5 cm were marked and identified at the species level and then the following param– eters were measured: (1) number of primary and secondary branches up to 1.30 m, (2) DBH, (3) plant height, (4) total number of individuals, (5) plant species richness and (6) basal area (Jimenez-Rodríguez et al. [2018\)](#page-10-19).

Soil properties

Fifteen soil samples (0–10 cm depth) were randomly collected from each study site using a bucket auger and mixed into a single soil sample. This sample was divided into three subsamples that were used to obtain the following measurements: (1) total content of C, N and P, (2) soil humidity, pH, inorganic N and P, and (3) enzymatic activity of three enzymes, phosphatase, beta-glucosidase and *N*-acetylglucosaminidase. Before soil collection, all the aboveground materials were carefully removed. All soil samples were stored in sealed plastic bags and transported to the laboratory in a cooler (Jimenez-Rodríguez et al. [2018](#page-10-19)).

For soil moisture determination (H), a subsample (100 g) was oven-dried at 75° C to constant weight, using the gravimetric method to adjust for water content when expressing nutrient concentration on the basis of dry soil mass. Carbon forms analyzed in all samples were determined in a total carbon analyzer (UIC model CM5012, Chicago, USA), while the N and P forms analyzed were determined colorimetrically in a Bran–Luebbe AutoAnalyzer 3 (Norderstedt, Germany). Prior to the total soil nutrient analyses, soil samples were dried and ground with a pestle and mortar. Total carbon (Ct) was determined by combustion and colorimetric detection (Hufman [1977](#page-10-20)). Total organic carbon (Cti) was calculated as the difference between TC and inorganic carbon. For total N (Nt) and total P (Pt) determination, samples were acid digested at 360 °C. Soil N (N) was determined by the macro-Kjeldahl method (Bremner [1996\)](#page-9-20), while soil P (P) was determined by the molybdate colorimetric method following ascorbic acid reduction (Murphy and Riley [1962](#page-10-21)).

Available, dissolved and microbial nutrient forms were extracted from feld moist soil samples. Available inorganic $N(NH_4^+$ and $NO_3^-)$ was extracted from 10 g of fresh soil subsamples with 2 M KCl, followed by fltration through a Whatman No. 1 paper flter and determined colorimetrically by the phenol-hypochlorite method. The $PO₄$ content was determined by extraction with 0.5 M NaHCO₃ at pH 8.5 according to Hedley sequential P fractionation (Tiessen and Moir [1993\)](#page-10-22). Enzyme activity was analyzed colorimetrically and expressed as micromoles of product formed per gram dry weight of soil per hour.

Study species

Cordia elaeagnoides A. DC. It is a deciduous tree that can grow up to 20 m, distributed exclusively on the Pacifc coast of Mexico, including the states of Sinaloa, Jalisco and Oaxaca. It has been shown that herbivores such as *Coptocycla leprosa* (Chrysomelidae) are associated with *C. elaeagnoides* (Trager and Bruna [2006\)](#page-10-23).

Cordia alliodora (Ruíz and Pav.) Oken. It iss a deciduous tree growing up to 25 m. In Mexico, it is distributed along the Gulf of Mexico and Pacific coast from Sinaloa to Chiapas (Pennington and Sarukhán [2005](#page-10-24)). Herbivorous insects attacking *C. alliodora* belong to Saturniidae, Chrysomelidae and Tingidae (Trager and Bruna [2006](#page-10-23)).

Achatocarpus gracilis H. Walter. It iss a deciduous shrub typical of mature forests with a low frequency in secondary forests (Boege et al. 2019). To our knowledge, the herbivore community associated with *A. gracilis* has not been documented, but during the study, we observed at least four species of Lepidoptera of diferent families responsible for most of the apparent herbivory.

Sampling design

Sampling was conducted at the end of the rainy season, after the peak of herbivore activity and the leaves were completely expanded. In each study site, a transect of 20×50 m (0.1 ha) was established. On each transect, all individuals of the three species with diameter at breast height (DBH) \geq to 2.5 cm were selected, and then marked and georeferenced to avoid sampling the same individual twice (*C. elaeagnoides*: $N = 67, 33$ individuals of mature and 34 of secondary forests; *C. alliodora*: *N* = 68, 34 in mature and 34 for secondary forests; and *A. gracilis*: *N* = 106, 55 in mature and 51 in secondary forest). Plants sampled from mature forest ranged in DBH as follows: *C. elaeagnoides* varied from 7.8 to 10.2 cm, *C. alliodora* from 8.5 to 11.4 cm and *A. gracilis* from 3.8 to 6.4 cm, while in secondary forests the DBH ranged in *C. elaeagnoides* from 7.6. to 11.6 cm,

C. alliodora from 8.1 to 12.2 cm and *A. gracilis* from 3.7 to 6.9 cm. For each individual, three branches were randomly chosen of each tree canopy strata (i.e., high, middle and low) (Cuevas-Reyes et al. [2011b\)](#page-9-12), and then we selected 50 leaves in total: 25 undamaged leaves to determine the patterns of leaf morphology and fuctuating asymmetry using geometric morphometric techniques and 25 randomly selected leaves to evaluate herbivory levels using ImageJ software (Cuevas-Reyes et al. [2018a](#page-9-3)).

Morphometric analysis of leaves

To evaluate the diferences in leaf morphology and size of the three plant species between forest conditions (mature forest vs secondary forest), a digital image was obtained of each undamaged leaf (25 leaves in total per individual) and then 32 anatomical marks (i.e., landmarks) were placed on each image. These landmarks represent the leaf shape and correspond to homologous loci, which are unambiguous and repeatable in all the leaves (Cuevas-Reyes et al. [2018a](#page-9-3)). For each leaf image, the coordinates (*x* and *y*) of the 32 landmarks were recorded using a TpsDig program (Rohlf [2015\)](#page-10-25). We performed a Procrustes superimposition analysis using the Integrated Morphometric Package (IMP series: [http://www.canisius.edu/~sheets/morphsoft.html\)](http://www.canisius.edu/%7esheets/morphsoft.html) to confgure the landmark coordinates. After that, the average confguration of all leaves was considered as reference to eliminate the leaf size efect (Bookstein [1991](#page-9-22)). The shape variables (Procrustes distances) were calculated by a super‑ imposition coordinates analysis (Cuevas-Reyes et al. [2011b](#page-9-12)). Finally, for each plant species separately, a principal components analysis was applied to determine the diferences in leaf morphology between mature and secondary forests (Cuevas-Reyes et al. [2018a](#page-9-3)).

Fluctuating asymmetry measurements

Fluctuating asymmetry was measured in 25 fully expanded and intact mature leaves of each tree sampled in the two forest conditions. For this, we obtained a digital image of each leaf and measured the distance from the right side (RW) and the left side (LW) from the leaf border to the midrib at the midpoint of the leaf corresponding to its widest part, using the program ImageJ 1.51j87 [\(https://imagej.nih.gov/](https://imagej.nih.gov/ij/) [ij/](https://imagej.nih.gov/ij/)) (Cuevas-Reyes et al. [2018b](#page-9-7)). FA was calculated as the absolute value of the diference between the distances from the midrib to the left and right borders of the leaf (|*Ai*−*Bi*|), divided by the average distance $(Ai + Bi/2)$, to correct for the fact that asymmetry may be size dependent (Cornelis‑ sen and Stiling [2005\)](#page-9-8). A value of FA was obtained for each tree from the average of the 25 leaves measured. Besides, a subsample of 30 leaves was measured again to control the measurement error in FA, and then we calculated the signifcance of FA relative to measurement error using a two-way mixed-model ANOVA (Palmer and Strobeck [2003](#page-10-26); Cuevas-Reyes et al. [2018b\)](#page-9-7). The significance of the interaction (individual \times leaf \times side) showed that the variation in FA between sides was greater than expected by measurement error $(F = 102.4 = 26; P < 0.0001)$.

Because there are three types of asymmetry (i.e., fluctuating asymmetry, directional asymmetry and antisym-metry) (Palmer and Strobeck [2003\)](#page-10-26), it is important to discriminate between them (Cuevas-Reyes et al. [2018b](#page-9-7)). FA calculates the variance of random diferences between the two sides of a bilateral trait distributed with a mean value of zero. Directional asymmetry is defned as the diferences between the two sides that are distributed about a mean that is significantly greater or less than zero. Finally, antisymmetry is the absence of symmetry and is characterized by presenting a bimodal or platykurtic distribution of the differences between two sides about a mean of zero (Palmer and Strobeck [1992\)](#page-10-27). Therefore, FA determines small random variation from the optimal development of a trait with bilateral symmetry, whereas directional asymmetry and antisymmetry are unsuitable descriptors of developmental instability, since they are developmentally controlled and are probably adaptive (Palmer and Strobeck [1986](#page-10-28)).

To test if our data presented only FA and no other type of symmetry, a Student's *t* test was performed to discard directional asymmetry, considering if the average value of the differences of the right side minus the left $(L-R)$ differed from zero. Additionally, to discard antisymmetry, a Lilliefors' normality test was used, considering the distribution of the diferences of L–R (Alves-Silva and Del-Claro [2016\)](#page-9-11). Since we did not fnd a signifcant deviation from zero ($t = 1.6$; $P > 0.05$) in the average value of the L–R differences, and the distribution of L–R diferences showed a normal distribution ($P > 0.05$), the values were considered a reliable measure of FA.

Measurement of herbivory

The herbivory by insects was assessed in 25 leaves of each tree sampled in the two forest conditions, from digital images that were taken for each leaf previously. To calculate the percentage of herbivory, we frst estimated the total leaf area and leaf area removed by herbivores using the program ImageJ 1.51j87 [\(https://imagej.nih.gov/ij/\)](https://imagej.nih.gov/ij/). Then, herbivory data were transformed as square root arcsine and then the normal distribution was confrmed in all cases (Cuevas-Reyes et al. [2018b\)](#page-9-7).

Statistics analyses

We performed a one-way permutation test based on Monte Carlo resampling separately to determine the diferences

between mature and secondary forests in vegetation structure (species richness, plant abundance, basal area, plant height) and soil properties (humidity, pH, C, N, P, C:N, C:P, N:P, $NH₄, NO₃, PO₄).$

To determine the effects of forest condition (mature forest vs secondary forest) on total leaf area of each plant species, we conducted a one-way ANOVA test for each plant species separately, where forest condition was considered as the explanatory variable and the total leaf area as the response variable (SAS [2000\)](#page-10-29). We conducted a Student's *t* test to compare the mean of foliar FA levels between mature and secondary forests for each plant species, respectively. We used a two-way ANOVA test to determine the effects of forest condition and plant species on herbivory. The model considered forest condition and plant species as explanatory variables, and herbivory was used as response variable. A posteriori tests of LSMeans were performed to compare means when ANOVA tests presented signifcant diferences (*P*< 0.05) (SAS [2000](#page-10-29)). Finally, to assess the relationship between total leaf area, FA levels and herbivory, a Spearman's rank correlation was used within each forest condition for each plant species separately. Because these tests involved multiple comparisons, a Bonferroni correction was applied to adjust *P* values.

Results

We found that plant abundance and plant height were higher in mature than in secondary forests. We did not find differences in the other vegetation measurements analyzed (Table [1\)](#page-5-0). In the same way, only nitrates and phosphate content of the soil was diferent between forest conditions (Table [1\)](#page-5-0).

Based on coordinate superimposition analysis, we found diferences between mature forests and secondary forests in the leaf shape of *C*. *elaeagnoides*. Leaves of mature forests were more elongated and thinner than leaves of secondary forests (Fig. [1](#page-6-0)a). This result is supported by the principal components analysis, where the PC1 and PC2 accounted for 57.61 and 14.37% of the total variation, respectively, and separated two diferent groups (Fig. [2a](#page-6-1)). Similarly, in *C*. *alliodora*, leaves of mature forests were more elongated and wider than leaves of secondary forests (Fig. [1](#page-6-0)b). This result was confrmed by the principal components analysis, where the PC1 accounted for 49.76% and PC2 explained the 17.57% of variation, separating two distinct groups of leaves (Fig. [2b](#page-6-1)). Finally, in the case of *A*. *gracilis*, leaves of mature forests were wider at the base in comparison with leaves of secondary forests (Fig. [1c](#page-6-0)). The principal components analy– sis separated leaves into two groups: leaves from mature forest and leaves of secondary forest, where PC1 explained 62.76% and PC2 13.13% of variation (Fig. [2](#page-6-1)c).

Table 1 Comparison of vegetation attributes and soil properties between mature and secondary forests

Comparisons were made using one-way permutation tests based on Monte Carlo resampling. The means and the SE are shown

Total leaf area of *C. elaeagnoides* difered signifcantly between forest conditions $(F = 7.3; d.f. = 1; P < 0.007)$. In mature forests, the mean of total leaf area was 95.0 cm² \pm 1.67 SE and in secondary forests 88.1 cm² \pm 1.9 SE (Fig. [3a](#page-7-0)). We found signifcant diferences in leaf size of *C. alliodora* between the two successional stages ($F = 51.8$; $d.f. = 1$; $P < 0.0001$). For this species, the leaf size was smaller in mature forests $(35.3 \text{ cm}^2 \pm 0.6 \text{ cm}^2 \text{ SE})$ than in secondary forests $(41.9 \text{ cm}^2 \pm 0.7 \text{ cm}^2 \text{ SE})$. For *A. gracilis*, the total leaf area was different between the forest conditions ($F = 98.3$; $d.f. = 1$; $P < 0.0001$), being higher in mature forest (6.0 cm² \pm 0.08 cm² SE) than in secondary forests $(4.9 \text{ cm}^2 \pm 0.06 \text{ cm}^2 \text{ SE})$ (see Fig. [3](#page-7-0)a).

The herbivory differed significantly between forest conditions ($F = 7.4$; $d.f. = 1$; $P < 0.006$) and between plant species (*F* = 12.1; *d.f.* = 2; *P* < 0.0001). In both *Cordia* species, the herbivory was higher in secondary forests in comparison with mature forests. In contrast, herbivory was higher in mature than in secodary forests for *A. gracilis. Cordia alliodora* had higher herbivory levels than *A. gracilis* and *C*. *elaeagnoides* (Fig. [3](#page-7-0)b).

For all plant species analyzed, FA was higher in mature forests than in secondary forests: *C. elaeagnoides* (*t*¹⁴⁰² *=* 24.5; *P*< 0.01); *C. alliodora* (*t1*⁶⁶⁹ *=* 30.8*; P*< 0.001); *A. gracilis* (t_{2585} = 18.2; *P*< 0.02) (Fig. [4\)](#page-7-1). In the case of *C. elaeganoides,* after a Bonferroni correction, Spearman's rank correlation revealed that herbivory was positively correlated with FA in secondary forests (Table [2a](#page-8-0)), whereas in *C. alliodora* herbivory was positively related with FA in mature forests (Table [2b](#page-8-0)). A positive relationship between herbivory and FA in *A. gracilis* was found in secondary forest (Table [2](#page-8-0)c).

Discussion

The process of ecological succession not only implies sequential changes in species richness, composition and abundance, but also variations in abiotic factors (Lebrija-Trejos et al. [2010\)](#page-10-3). For example, previous studies in TDF have found that the vegetation canopy openness varies from 5.3 to 18.7% in mature forest and from 5.9 to 32% for secondary forests, producing diferences in solar radiation, temperature and availability of water between the two conditions, with the secondary forests being hotter and drier (Maza-Villalobos et al. [2011;](#page-10-30) Alvarez-Añorve et al. [2012\)](#page-9-1). In our study, we found that abundance and basal area of plants were higher in mature than in secondary forests. These results suggest that secondary forests are hotter and drier as a result of differences in solar radiation and temperature associated with the vegetation structure (Jimenez-Rodríguez et al. [2018](#page-10-19)). Diferences in these environmental conditions along forest succession impose physiological demands to plants, resulting in adjustment in some traits such as leaf morphology, symmetry and leaf size according to both the degree of tolerance of individuals to environmental stress and phenotypic plasticity (Cuevas-Reyes et al. [2011b](#page-9-12); Alvarez-Añorve et al. [2012](#page-9-1)). This is in accord with our results, because all plant species studied presented diferences in leaf morphology and size between mature and secondary forests. For example, *C.*

Fig. 1 Leaf morphological variation between mature (black circles) and secondary forests (black crosses) for each plant species: mean of coordinates of landmark confguration of leaves. *C. elaeagnoides* (**a**), *C. alliodora* (**b**) and *A. gracilis* (**c**)

elaeagnoides and *A. gracilis* had smaller leaves in secondary than in mature forests, which can be the result of morphological and physiological adjustment to avoid water loss in hotter and drier sites such as secondary forests (Alvarez-Añorve et al. [2012](#page-9-1); Pineda-García et al. [2013](#page-10-5)). In contrast, *C. alliodora* had larger leaves in secondary than in mature forest, supporting the hypothesis of resources availability (Coley et al. [1985\)](#page-9-15), which predicts that fast-growing plant species such as *C. alliodora* develop larger leaves in sites with more availability of resources (e.g., light incidence, N and P) (Cole and Ewel [2006](#page-9-23)). Therefore, an increase of light

-0.2 -0.1 0 0.1 0.2 0.3

PC1

 \bigcap Mature forest \times Secondary forest

 800_o

 -0.15 -0.1 -0.05 0 ဥ _{0.05} $\overline{0}$. 0.15 0.2

b)

-0.1 -0.05 0

c)

 Ω

-0.2 -0.15 -0.1 -0.05 ϵ 0.05 0.1 0.15 0.2

PC2

 0.0 $\overline{0}$. 0.15 0.2

PC2

a)

Fig. 3 Comparison of total leaf area between mature and intermediate successional forests for each plant species (a), differences in herbivory by insects between mature and secondary forests and between plant species (**b**)

Fig. 4 Diferences in leaf fuctuating asymmetry between mature and secondary forests for each plant species

incidence in secondary forests can be associated with high photosynthetic rates to absorb nutrients quickly, grow fast and produce large leaves (Lohbeck et al. [2015\)](#page-10-4).

Fluctuating asymmetry is one of the main indicators used to evaluate environmental stress in plants (Cuevas-Reyes et al. [2018a\)](#page-9-3). However, contrary to our prediction, based on the idea that secondary forests are hotter and drier sites and therefore present stressful conditions to plants, our results showed that in the three plant species analyzed, the FA levels were highest in mature forest in comparison with secondary forests. Thus, it is possible that the environmental conditions such as high radiation incidence and extremes of temperature and humidity of secondary forests do not act as stressor agents for the plant species studied. In fact, plant species of TDFs have optimal strategies for dealing with drought (e.g., a better water use efficiency) and are adapted to high temperatures (Pineda-García et al. [2013;](#page-10-5) Lohbeck et al. [2015\)](#page-10-4). On the other hand, the vegetation of mature forest has higher density and larger sized trees that can promote greater dispute for light and soil nutrients. Thus, it is probable that resource limitations, especially light and soil nutrients, may be the stressor agents responsible for the highest FA observed in plant species of mature TDF (Alvarez-Añorve et al. [2012\)](#page-9-1).

Moreover, another important result in this study is the fact that herbivory levels were higher in the mature forests, and in both forest conditions there was a signifcant relationship between herbivory and FA levels. A similar correlation has been shown in other ecological studies (Zvereva et al., [1997](#page-11-3); Cornelissen et al. [2003\)](#page-9-16), suggesting that FA also may serve as an indicator of plant susceptibility to herbivory (plant stress hypothesis) (Cornelissen and Stiling [2011](#page-9-6)), but also can indicate that herbivory itself acts as a plant stressor and directly increases the level of FA (herbivory-induced stress hypothesis) (Zvereva et al. [1997](#page-11-3); Møller and Shykoff [1999](#page-10-14)).

Unfortunately, in our study, the positive correlation between foliar FA and herbivory is not enough to distinguish between both hypotheses, because the FA measurements were made after herbivory had occurred. Hence, for future studies, it is necessary to include analyses of nutritional quality and chemical defense in leaves undamaged by herbivory throughout the successional stages of tropical dry forest. Particularly, it is possible that individuals of *C. elaeagnoides* and *A. gracilis* experience more favorable developmental conditions in mature than in secondary forests considering that they had more elongated, wider and larger leaves in mature forests. As a result of these morphological diferences, we hypothesize that in plants from the mature forests defense chemical compounds should be lower and foliar nutritional quality should be higher and, as a consequence, herbivorous insects respond with higher consumption rates in mature forest. This idea is supported by studies that have proposed that the variation in plant chemistry is a possible cause for these diferences (Lempa et al. [2000](#page-10-13); Bañuelos et al. [2004;](#page-9-10) Cornelissen et al. [2003](#page-9-16); Cuevas-Reyes et al. [2011a,](#page-9-9) [b,](#page-9-12) [2018a](#page-9-3)).

Herbivory is an antagonistic interaction that negatively afects the survival, growth and reproduction of plants (López-Carretero et al. [2014\)](#page-10-31). However, plants have evolved physical, nutritional and chemical defenses to prevent the loss of plant tissue by herbivores (Coley et al. [1985\)](#page-9-15). Previous studies have demonstrated that herbivory levels vary along successional gradients due to variations

Table 2 Spearman's correlation coefficients of total leaf area. herbivory and fuctuating asymmetry (** $P < 0.05$)

C. elaeagnoides (a), *C. alliodora* (b) and *A. gracilis* (c) in mature and secondary forests

in herbivory abundance, chemical defenses of plants and high temperatures that interfere with the plant defensive system and physiological processes (Brown et al. [1987](#page-9-24); Bach and Tabashnik [1990;](#page-9-25) Silva et al. [2012](#page-10-10); González-Esquivel et al. [2019](#page-10-12)). For example, plant species of secondary forests tend to be more consumed as a result of higher abundance of herbivore insects and lower chemical defenses. In this way, the resource availability hypothesis proposes that plant chemical defense varies with the successional position of species (Coley et al. [1985\)](#page-9-15). Because plant species of mature forests are characterized by slow growth in low light environments, they produce more chemical defenses because it is less costly to produce them than to replace lost tissues by herbivory. Therefore, these species are well defended against herbivores and other factors that cause plant damage. In contrast, plant species of secondary forests growing in habitats of high-light availability (e.g., gaps) invest more resources in replacing lost tissues by herbivory than in chemical defense. This idea is in agreement with our results, since both species of *Cordia* had higher herbivory levels in secondary than in mature forests. Contrary to this, *A. gracilis* had higher levels of herbivory in mature forest condition. This result could be due to diferences in leaf nutritional quality between individuals of mature and secondary forests (bottom-up efects), which can be infuenced by diferences in soil fertility (Cuevas-Reyes et al. [2004\)](#page-9-26). In our study, the content of nitrates and phosphates was higher in soils of secondary forests. Nitrates are often limited and represent an important structural component of proteins, nucleic acids and many secondary metabolites of plants, while an increase of availability of phosphates is associated

with a high nutritional quality of plants (Patterson et al. [2010](#page-10-32)). Therefore, to explain our results, we invoke the soil fertility hypothesis that proposes that low soil fertility, indicated by low contents of phosphorous, has been associated with higher herbivore incidence considering that plant species that grow under conditions of infertile soils tend to have lower rates of growth and accumulate higher concentrations of secondary metabolites such as oils, phenols, alkaloids and terpenoids affecting the herbivory levels (Fernandes and Price [1991](#page-9-27); Fernandes et al. [1994;](#page-10-33) Cuevas-Reyes et al. [2004](#page-9-26)).

In conclusion, our study shows changes in morphological leaf traits along regeneration processes and their efects on herbivory patterns in plant species of tropical dry forests. We detected differences in foliar morphology, fluctuating asymmetry and herbivory between mature and secondary forests. The general pattern showed higher levels of FA in mature forests. Our findings illustrate the difficulty associated with understanding the relationship between FA and herbivory throughout the regeneration process of tropical dry forests due to the complexity of abiotic and biotic factors involved that afect plant–herbivore interaction.

Author contribution statement PCR, JAP and YML pro‑ posed the ideas and design of the study. LDAC and MAA provided information of the biotic and abiotic character‑ istics of the study sites. JAP contributed to the sampling and estimates of total leaf area, herbivory and fuctuating asymmetry. JAP, PCR and YML wrote the manuscript. JAP, MF, MLF and AGR performed the statistical analysis and helped discuss the manuscript. All authors participated in the review of the manuscript.

Acknowledgements Aguilar-Peralta is a PhD student from Pro‑ grama de Doctorado en Ciencias Biomédicas, Universidad Nacional Autónoma de México (UNAM) and is supported by CONACyT (scholarship no. 620147). The study was funded by Coordination of Scientifc Research (UMSNH), as part of research project 001. This project was supported by CONACYT Project No. CB222202.

Compliance with ethical standards

Conflict of interest The authors mentioned above declare that there is no conflict of interest associated with this manuscript. The work represents an original research carried out by the authors. All authors agree with the contents of the manuscript and its submission to the journal.

References

- Alvarez-Añorve MY, Quesada M, Sánchez-Azofeifa G, Avila-Cabadilla LD, Gamon JA (2012) Functional regeneration and spectral reflectance of trees during succession in a highly diverse tropical dry forest ecosystem. Am J Bot 99:816–826. [https://doi.org/10.3732/](https://doi.org/10.3732/ajb.1100200) [ajb.1100200](https://doi.org/10.3732/ajb.1100200)
- Alves-Silva E, Del-Claro K (2016) Herbivory-induced stress: leaf developmental instability is caused by herbivore damage in early stages of leaf development. Ecol Indic 61:359–365. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolind.2015.09.036) [org/10.1016/j.ecolind.2015.09.036](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolind.2015.09.036)
- Avila-Cabadilla LD, Sanchez-Azofeifa GA, Stoner KE, Alvarez-Añorve MY, Quesada M, Portillo-Quintero CA (2012) Local and landscape factors determining occurrence of phyllostomid bats in tropical secondary forests. PLoS One 7:e35228. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0035228) [org/10.1371/journal.pone.0035228](https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0035228)
- Bach CE, Tabashnik BE (1990) Efects of nonhost plant neighbors on population densities and parasitism rates of the diamondback moth (Lepidoptera: Plutellidae). Environ Entomol 19(4):987–994
- Balvanera P, Lott E, Segura G, Siebe C, Islas A (2002) Patterns of β-diversity in a Mexican tropical dry forest. J Veg Sci 13(2):145–158
- Bañuelos MJ, Sierra M, Obeso JR (2004) Sex, secondary compounds and asymmetry: effects on plant–herbivore interaction in a dioecious shrub. Acta Oecol 25:151–157. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.actao.2004.01.001) [actao.2004.01.001](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.actao.2004.01.001)
- Boege K, Villa-Galaviz E, López-Carretero A, Pérez-Ishiwara R, Zal‑ divar-Riverón A, Ibarra A, del-Val E (2019) Temporal variation in the infuence of forest succession on caterpillar communities: a long-term study in a tropical dry forest. Biotropica 51:529–537. <https://doi.org/10.1111/btp.12666>
- Bookstein FL (1991) Morphometric tools for landmark data: geometry and biology. New York, US
- Bremner JM (1996) Nitrogen-total. In: Sparks DL (ed) Methods of soil analysis. Part 3 Chemical Methods. SSSA Inc, Madison, WI, USA, pp 1085–1121
- Brown VK, Gange AC, Evans IM, Storr AL (1987) The efect of insect herbivory on the growth and reproduction of two annual vicia species at diferent stages in plant succession. J Ecol 75(4):1173
- Chazdon RL, Guariguata MR (2016) Natural regeneration as a tool for large-scale forest restoration in the tropics: prospects and challenges. Biotropica 48:716–730.<https://doi.org/10.1111/btp.12381>
- Cole TG, Ewel JJ (2006) Allometric equations for four valuable tropical tree species. Forest Ecol Manag 229:351–360. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foreco.2006.04.017) [org/10.1016/j.foreco.2006.04.017](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foreco.2006.04.017)
- Coley PD (1982) Rates of herbivory on diferent tropical trees. In: Leigh EG, Rand AS, Windsor DM (eds) Ecological of a tropical forest: seasonal rhythms and long-term changes. Smithsonian Institution Press, Washington, pp 123–132
- Coley PD, Bryant JP, Chapin FS (1985) Resource availability and plant antiherbivore defense. Science 230:895–899. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1126/science.230.4728.895) [org/10.1126/science.230.4728.895](https://doi.org/10.1126/science.230.4728.895)
- Cornelissen T, Stiling P (2005) Perfect is best: low leaf fluctuating asymmetry reduces herbivory by leaf miners. Oecologia 142:46–56.<https://doi.org/10.1007/s00442-004-1724-y>
- Cornelissen T, Stiling P (2011) Similar responses of insect herbi‑ vores to leaf fuctuating asymmetry. Arthropod-Plant Interact 5:59–69. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11829-010-9116-1>
- Cornelissen T, Stiling P, Drake B (2003) Elevated CO₂ decreases leaf fuctuating asymmetry and herbivory by leaf miners on two oak species. Glob Change Biol 10:27–36. [https://doi.org/10.11](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2486.2003.00712.x) [11/j.1365-2486.2003.00712.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2486.2003.00712.x)
- Cuervo AM, Restrepo C (2007) Assemblage and population-level consequences of forest fragmentation on bilateral asymmetry in tropical montane birds. Biol J Linn Soc 92:119–133. [https://](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1095-8312.2007.00884.x) doi.org/10.1111/j.1095-8312.2007.00884.x
- Cuevas-Reyes P, Quesada M, Hanson P, Dirzo R, Oyama K (2004) Diversity of gall- forming insects in a Mexican tropical dry forest: the importance of plant species richness, life forms, host plant age and plant density. J Ecol 92:707–716. [https://doi.org/](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.0022-0477.2004.00896.x) [10.1111/j.0022-0477.2004.00896.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.0022-0477.2004.00896.x)
- Cuevas-Reyes P, Fernandes GW, González-Rodríguez A, Pimenta M (2011a) Efects of generalist and specialist parasitic plants (Loranthaceae) on the fuctuating asymmetry patterns of rupre‑ strian host plants. Basic Appl Ecol 12:449–455. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.baae.2011.04.004) [org/10.1016/j.baae.2011.04.004](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.baae.2011.04.004)
- Cuevas-Reyes P, Oyama K, González-Rodríguez A, Fernandes GW, Mendoza-Cuenca L (2011b) Contrasting herbivory patterns and leaf fluctuating asymmetry in *Heliocarpus pallidus* between different habitat types within a Mexican tropical dry forest. J Trop Ecol 27:383–391. <https://doi.org/10.1017/S026646741100006X>
- Cuevas-Reyes P, Gilberti L, González-Rodríguez A, Fernandes GW (2013) Patterns of herbivory and fuctuating asymmetry in *Solanum lycocarpum* St. Hill (Solanaceae) along an urban gradient in Brazil. Ecol Indic 24:557–561. [https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecoli](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolind.2012.08.0117) [nd.2012.08.0117](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolind.2012.08.0117)
- Cuevas-Reyes P, Canché-Delgado A, Maldonado-López Y, Fer‑ nandes GW, Oyama K, González-Rodríguez A (2018a) Patterns of herbivory and leaf morphology in two Mexican hybrid oak complexes: importance of fuctuating asymmetry as indicator of environmental stress in hybrid plants. Ecol Indic 90:164–170. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ecolind.2018.03.009>
- Cuevas-Reyes P, Pereira GC, Gélvez-Zúñiga I, Fernandes GW, Venâncio H, Santos JC, Maldonado-López Y (2018b) Efects of ferric soils on arthropod abundance and herbivory on *Tibouchina heteromalla* (Melastomataceae): is fuctuating asymmetry a good indicator of environmental stress? Plant Ecol 219:69–78. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11258-017-0778-y>
- Cunningham SA, Summerhayes B, Westoby M (1999) Evolutionary divergences in leaf structure and chemistry, comparing rainfall and soil nutrient gradients. Ecol Monogr 69(4):569–588
- del-Val E, Armesto JJ (2010) Seedling mortality and herbivory damage in subtropical and temperate populations: testing the hypothesis of higher herbivore pressure toward the tropics. Biotropica 42:174–179.<https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1744-7429.2009.00554.x>
- Díaz M, Pulido MJ, Møller AM (2004) Herbivore effects on developmental instability and fecundity of holm oaks. Oecologia 139:224–234.<https://doi.org/10.1007/s00442-004-1491-9>
- Fernandes GW, Price PW (1991) Comparison of tropical and temperate galling species richness: the roles of environmental harshness and plant nutrient status. In: Price PW, Lewinsohn TM, Fernandes GW, Benson WW (eds) Plant-animal interactions: evolutionary ecology in tropical and temperate regions. Wiley, New York, pp 91–115
- Fernandes GW, Lara ACF, Price PW (1994) The geography of galling insects and the mechanisms that result in pat- terns. In: Price PW, Mattson WJ, Baranchikov YN (eds) The ecology and evolution of gall forming insects. USDA Forest Service Tech. Report NC-174, Minn, pp 49–55
- García-Oliva F, Camou A, Maass JM (2002) El clima de la región central de la costa del Pacífco mexicano. In: Noguera FA, Vega-Rivera JH, García Aldrete AN, Quesada M (eds) Historia natural de Chamela, 1st edn. UNAM, Mexico, pp 3–10
- Givnish TJ (1987) Comparative studies of leaf form: assessing the relative roles of selective pressures and phylogenetic constraints. New Phytol 106(1):131–160
- González-Esquivel JG, Cuevas-Reyes P, González-Rodríguez A, Ávila-Cabadilla LD, Yolotl Álvarez-Añorve M, Fagundes M, Maldonado-López Y (2019) Functional attributes of two Croton species in diferent successional stages of tropical dry forest: efects on herbivory and fuctuating asymmetry patterns. Trop Ecol 60:238–251.<https://doi.org/10.1007/s42965-019-00027-y>
- Hagen SB, Ims RA, Yoccoz NG (2008) Fluctuating asymmetry as an indicator of elevation stress and distribution limits in mountain birch (*Betula pubescens*). Plant Ecol 195:157–163. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1007/s11258-007-9312-y) [org/10.1007/s11258-007-9312-y](https://doi.org/10.1007/s11258-007-9312-y)
- Hufman EWD (1977) Performance of a new automatic carbon dioxide coulometer. Microchem J 22(4):567–573
- Jimenez-Rodríguez DL, Alvarez-Añorve MY, Flores-Puerto JI, Oyama K, Avila-Cabadilla LD, Pineda-Cortes M, Benítez-Malvido J (2018) Structural and functional traits predict short term response of tropical dry forests to a high intensity hurricane. Forest Ecol Manag 426:101–114.<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foreco.2018.04.009>
- Lebrija-Trejos E, Meave JA, Poorter L, Pérez-García EA, Bongers F (2010) Pathways, mechanisms and predictability of vegetation change during tropical dry forest succession. Perspect Plant Ecol 12:267–275.<https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ppees.2010.09.002>
- Lebrija-Trejos E, Pérez-García EA, Meave JA, Poorter L, Bongers F (2011) Environmental changes during secondary succession in a tropical dry forest in Mexico. J Trop Ecol 27:477–489. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1017/S0266467411000253) [org/10.1017/S0266467411000253](https://doi.org/10.1017/S0266467411000253)
- Lempa K, Martel J, Koricheva J (2000) Covariation of fuctuating asymmetry, herbivory and chemistry during birch leaf expansion. Oecologia 122:354–360.<https://doi.org/10.1007/s004420050041>
- Lohbeck M, Lebrija-Trejos E, Martínez-Ramos M et al (2015) Functional trait strategies of trees in dry and wet tropical forests are similar but difer in their consequences for succession. PLoS One 10:e0123741.<https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0123741>
- Loik ME, Holl KD (2001) Photosynthetic responses of tree seedlings in grass and under shrubs in early-successional tropical old felds, Costa Rica. Oecologia 127:40–50. [https://doi.org/10.1007/s0044](https://doi.org/10.1007/s004420000566) [20000566](https://doi.org/10.1007/s004420000566)
- López-Carretero A, Díaz-Castelazo C, Boege K, Rico-Gray V (2014) Evaluating the spatio-temporal factors that structure network parameters of plant–herbivore interactions. PLoS One 9:e110430. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0110430>
- Madeira BG, Espírito-Santo MM, Neto SD, Nunes YRF, Sánchez-Azofeifa GA, Fernandes GW, Quesada M (2009) Changes in tree and liana communities along a successional gradient in a tropical dry forest in south-eastern Brazil. Plant Ecol 201:291–304. [https](https://doi.org/10.1007/s11258-009-9580-9) [://doi.org/10.1007/s11258-009-9580-9](https://doi.org/10.1007/s11258-009-9580-9)
- Maldonado-López Y, Vaca-Sánchez MS, Canché-Delgado A, García-Jaín SE, González-Rodríguez A, Cornelissen T, Cuevas-Reyes P (2019) Leaf herbivory and fuctuating asymmetry as indicators of mangrove stress. Wetlands Ecol Manage 27(4):571–580
- Marchand H, Paillat G, Montuire S, Butet A (2003) Fluctuating asymmetry in bank vole populations (Rodentia, Arvicolinae) refects stress caused by landscape fragmentation in the Mont-Saint-Michel Bay. Biol J Linn Soc 80:37–44. [https://doi.org/10.104](https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1095-8312.2003.00206.x) [6/j.1095-8312.2003.00206.x](https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1095-8312.2003.00206.x)
- Maza-Villalobos S, Balvanera P, Martínez-Ramos M (2011) Early regeneration of tropical dry forest from abandoned pastures: contrasting chronosequence and dynamic approaches. Biotropica 43:666–675.<https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1744-7429.2011.00755.x>
- Møller AP, Shykoff JA (1999) Morphological developmental stability in plants: patterns and causes. Int J Plant Sci 160:S135– S146. <https://doi.org/10.1086/314219>
- Murphy J, Riley JP (1962) A modifed single solution method for the determination of phosphate in natural waters. Anal Chim Acta 27:31–36
- Niemeier S, Mueller J, Roedel MO (2019) Fluctuating asymmetryappearances are deceptive. Comparison of methods for assessing developmental instability in European Common Frogs (*Rana temporaria*). Salamandra 55:14–26
- Palmer AR, Strobeck C (1986) Fluctuating asymmetry: measurement, analysis, patterns. Annu Rev Ecol Syst 17:391–421. [https](https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.es.17.110186.002135) [://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.es.17.110186.002135](https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.es.17.110186.002135)
- Palmer AR, Strobeck C (1992) Fluctuating asymmetry as a measure of developmental stability: implications of non-normal distributions and power of statistical tests. Acta Zool Fenn 191:57–72
- Palmer AR, Strobeck C (2003) Fluctuating asymmetry analyses revisited. In: Polak M (ed) Developmental instability (DI): causes and consequences. Oxford University Press, Oxford, pp 1–36
- Patterson K, Cakmak T, Cooper A, Lager I, Rasmusson AG, Escobar MA (2010) Distinct signalling pathways and transcriptome response signatures diferentiate ammoniumand nitrate-supplied plants. Plant Cell Environ 33:1486–1501. [https://doi.org/10.11](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-3040.2010.02158.x) [11/j.1365-3040.2010.02158.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-3040.2010.02158.x)
- Pennington TD, Sarukhán J (2005) Árboles tropicales de México. Manual para la identificación de las principales especies. Mexico City, Mexico
- Pineda-García F, Paz H, Meinzer FC (2013) Drought resistance in early and late secondary successional species from a tropical dry forest: the interplay between xylem resistance to embolism, sapwood water storage and leaf shedding. Plant Cell Environ 36:405–418.<https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-3040.2012.02582.x>
- Rohlf FJ (2015) The tps series of software. It J Mammal 26:9–12. <https://doi.org/10.4404/hystrix-26.1-11264>
- Sánchez-Azofeifa GA, Quesada M, Cuevas-Reyes P, Castillo A, Sánchez-Montoya G (2009) Land cover and conservation in the area of infuence of the Chamela-Cuixmala Biosphere Reserve, Mexico. Forest Ecol Manag 258:907–912. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foreco.2008.10.030) [org/10.1016/j.foreco.2008.10.030](https://doi.org/10.1016/j.foreco.2008.10.030)
- SAS (2000) Categorical data analysis using the SAS system. SAS, North Carolina
- Schöb C, Armas C, Guler M, Prieto I, Pugnaire FI (2013) Variability in functional traits mediates plant interactions along stress gradients. J Ecol 101:753–762. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1111/1365-2745.12062) [org/10.1111/1365-2745.12062](https://doi.org/10.1111/1365-2745.12062)
- Silva JO, Espírito-Santo MM, Melo GA (2012) Herbivory on *Handroanthus ochraceus* (Bignoniaceae) along a successional gradient in a tropical dry forest. Arthropod Plant Interact 6:45–57. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11829-011-9160-5>
- Sousa-Souto L, Santos ED, Figueiredo PM, Santos AJ, Neves FS (2014) Is there a bottom-up cascade on the assemblages of trees, arboreal insects and spiders in a semiarid Caatinga? Arthropod Plant Interact 8:581–591. [https://doi.org/10.1007/s1182](https://doi.org/10.1007/s11829-014-9341-0) [9-014-9341-0](https://doi.org/10.1007/s11829-014-9341-0)
- Tiessen H, Moir JO (1993) Characterization of available P by sequential extraction. In: Carter MR (ed) Soil sampling and methods of analysis. Lewis Publ, Boca Raton, pp 75–86
- Trager MD, Bruna EM (2006) Efects of plant age, experimental nutrient addition and ant occupancy on herbivory in a neotropical myrmecophyte. J Ecol 94:1156–1163. [https://doi.org/10.111](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2745.2006.01165.x) [1/j.1365-2745.2006.01165.x](https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1365-2745.2006.01165.x)
- Trejo I, Dirzo R (2000) Deforestation of seasonally dry tropical forest: a national and local analysis in Mexico. Biol Conserv 94:133–142. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S0006-3207\(99\)00188-3](https://doi.org/10.1016/S0006-3207(99)00188-3)
- Tucić B, Budečević S, Manitašević Jovanović S, Vuleta A, Klingenberg CP (2018) Phenotypic plasticity in response to environmental heterogeneity contributes to fuctuating asymmetry in plants: frst empirical evidence. J Evolution Biol 31:197–210. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.5061/dryad.8th5m) [org/10.5061/dryad.8th5m](https://doi.org/10.5061/dryad.8th5m)
- Valkama J, Kozlov MV (2001) Impact of climatic factors on the developmental stability of Mountain birch growing in a contaminated area. J Appl Ecol 38:665–673. [https://doi.org/10.104](https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-2664.2001.00628.x) [6/j.1365-2664.2001.00628.x](https://doi.org/10.1046/j.1365-2664.2001.00628.x)
- Zvereva E, Kozlov M, Niemelä P (1997) Delayed induced resistance and increase in leaf fuctuating asymmetry as responses of Salix borealis to insect herbivory. Oecologia 109:368–373. [https://doi.](https://doi.org/10.1007/s004420050095) [org/10.1007/s004420050095](https://doi.org/10.1007/s004420050095)

Publisher's Note Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.