ORIGINAL PAPER

Age-independent climate-growth response of Chinese pine (Pinus tabulaeformis Carrière) in North China

Junyan Sun • Yu Liu

Received: 20 July 2014 / Revised: 15 October 2014 / Accepted: 28 October 2014 / Published online: 17 December 2014 - Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg 2014

Abstract

Key message This manuscript describes the characteristics and climate-growth responses of Chinese pine in different age classes; and determines the climategrowth response of Chinese pine in North China is age independent.

Abstract The Chinese pine (Pinus tabulaeformis Carrière) is a widespread conifer species in North China and has been widely used in dendrochronology studies. In this research, tree-ring samples of the Chinese pine in North China were investigated based on three age classes, 70–120, 121–170, and 171–220 years old, in one sampling site. The environment of the sampling site was properly considered and other potential influences were avoided as far as possible to highlight the possible influences of age on the climate-growth response of the trees. The individual tree-ring index series showed generally consistent variation trends with the first principal component series of the total tree-ring indices. They varied independently of their age class and showed no significant group difference during their common period from 1940 to 2009. The annual variations of the three age-class chronologies were synchronous, and the characteristics of the individual tree-ring

Communicated by J. Penuelas.

J. Sun - Y. Liu

The State Key Laboratory of Loess and Quaternary Geology, Institute of Earth Environment, Chinese Academy of Sciences, Xi'an 710075, China

Y. Liu (\boxtimes)

width chronology were also analyzed. Correlation function analyses indicated that all of the chronologies have similar responses to climate. The climate-growth response of Chinese pine in North China is age independent in the three age classes. In addition, more extensive studies with larger geographic scales and more species are required in North China.

Keywords Chinese pine · Tree ring · Climate-growth response - Age independent - North China

Introduction

Tree rings are valuable sources of information. They have been widely used in paleoclimatic studies because of their ability to record environmental signals during formation, and they provide important proxy data for paleoclimatic studies. The greatest strength of tree ring is that it has an annual resolution with a high degree of confidence. Dendroclimatology is a particularly appropriate discipline for the study of historical climate fluctuations. Numerous long historical climate series have been reconstructed based on tree-ring data (Esper et al. [2002](#page-8-0); Mann and Jones [2003;](#page-8-0) Bräuning and Mantwill [2004](#page-7-0); Sheppard et al. [2004;](#page-8-0) D'Arrigo et al. [2006](#page-8-0); Treydte et al. [2006;](#page-9-0) Buckley et al. [2007;](#page-7-0) Briffa et al. [2008](#page-7-0); Yadav et al. [2011](#page-9-0); Cook et al. [2013](#page-8-0)). The use of dendroclimatology in China has progresses recently, and some century to millennia-long precipitation, temperature, runoff, and drought reconstructions have been developed (Zhang et al. [2003](#page-9-0), [2009](#page-9-0), [2013b;](#page-9-0) Shao et al. [2005;](#page-8-0) Yu et al. [2006;](#page-9-0) Gou et al. [2007](#page-8-0); Yuan et al. [2007;](#page-9-0) Liang et al. [2009;](#page-8-0) Liu et al. [2009,](#page-8-0) [2013](#page-8-0); Wang et al. [2009;](#page-9-0) Fan et al. [2010;](#page-8-0) Wang et al. [2010](#page-9-0); Chen et al. [2011;](#page-8-0) Zhu et al. [2011;](#page-9-0) Bao et al. [2012](#page-7-0); Yang et al. [2012](#page-9-0); Li et al. [2013\)](#page-8-0).

Department of Environmental Science and Technology, School of Human Settlements and Civil Engineering, Xi'an Jiaotong University, Xi'an 710049, China e-mail: liuyu@loess.llqg.ac.cn

The physiological mechanisms used to identify climatic parameters in tree rings are complex, because a tree ring in any given year integrates the effects of both climatic variables and biological growth functions, which are influenced by endogenous and exogenous factors (Fritts [1976;](#page-8-0) Szeicz and MacDonald [1994](#page-8-0)). In dendroclimatology analyses, there is an expectation that tree-ring-recorded climate signals could be maximized; therefore, the nonclimatic effects recorded during the tree growth are usually removed by standardization (Linderholm and Linderholm [2004\)](#page-8-0). Based on the uniformitarian principle, which states that the mechanisms linking tree-ring growth to climate conditions remain unaltered over time, it is generally assumed that the relationships between the radial growth of the tree and climate are age independent once the nonclimatic effects have been removed (Szeicz and MacDonald [1994](#page-8-0); Hughes [2002](#page-8-0); Carrer and Urbinati [2004](#page-8-0); Rossi et al. [2008\)](#page-8-0). Therefore, trees with different ages will have uniform responses to climate.

In recent years, ecophysiological studies have demonstrated that the physiological processes in young and old trees are different, such as lower photosynthetic rates in older trees as have been measured in various conifer species (Bond [2000](#page-7-0)). This indicates that growth-related climate signals are likely to be age dependent, which would directly lead to biased climate reconstructions based on even-aged samples. Therefore, a number of dendrochronological studies have focused on the age-dependent response differences between tree-ring growth and climate. Until now, age-dependent climate response studies have provided ambiguous results, with some studies indicating that there are age effects on climate signals (e.g., Szeicz and MacDonald [1994](#page-8-0); Ogle et al. [2000;](#page-8-0) Carrer and Urbinati [2004;](#page-8-0) Linderholm and Linderholm [2004](#page-8-0); Rozas [2005](#page-8-0); Esper et al. [2008;](#page-8-0) Vieira et al. [2009](#page-9-0); Schuster and Oberhuber [2013\)](#page-8-0) and others showing that climate-growth responses are age independent (e.g., Fritts [1976](#page-8-0); Kirkpatrick [1981](#page-8-0); Colenutt and Luckman [1991](#page-8-0), [1995;](#page-8-0) Wilson and Elling [2004\)](#page-9-0).

The limited number age-dependent climate response studies developed in China have also produced ambiguous results (Yu et al. [2008;](#page-9-0) Wang et al. [2009](#page-9-0), [2011](#page-9-0); Zhang et al. [2013a](#page-9-0); Wu et al. [2013](#page-9-0)). Yu et al. ([2008\)](#page-9-0) compared different age classes of Sabina przewalskii Kom. in the Qinghai–Tibetan Plateau. The results showed that the mean sensitivity and standard deviation of the tree-ring series did not change significantly with age; however, the radial growths of older trees were shown to be more sensitive to climate change than those of younger trees. Wang et al. [\(2009](#page-9-0)) found that the mean sensitivity and standard deviation of tree-ring widths for Larix gmelinii $\langle 150 \rangle$ years old increased with age, whereas they had no significant relationship with age in trees >150 years old; trees <150 years old responded differently to climate than trees >150 years old in northeastern China. Wu et al. ([2013\)](#page-9-0) found that younger Picea schrenkiana were more sensitive to climate than the older trees in the western area of the Tianshan Mountains.

Chinese pine (Pinus tabulaeformis Carrière) is an endemic and widespread conifer species in northern China and has been widely used in dendrochronology studies in China (Li et al. [2007](#page-8-0); Liang et al. [2007;](#page-8-0) Fang et al. [2010](#page-8-0); Liu et al. [2010](#page-8-0), [2012;](#page-8-0) Shi et al. [2008](#page-8-0); Song and Liu [2011](#page-8-0); Li et al. [2011](#page-8-0); Cai et al. [2010](#page-8-0)). Zhang et al. ([2013a](#page-9-0)) analyzed the Chinese pine in different age classes in the Qilian Mountains, northeast Tibetan Plateau and found that there were differences in the climate response between the young and old trees. Until now, analyses have not been performed for the relationship difference between climate and the growth of Chinese pine in different age classes in North China, and the question of whether the climate-growth response of Chinese pine in North China is age independent has not been resolved. In this paper, we analyzed the characteristics of Chinese pine in different age classes in North China, including mean sensitivity (MS), standard deviation (SD), signal-to-noise ratio (SNR), expressed population signal (EPS), variation in first principal component (PC1), and so on. The consistency of the annual tree growth of the samples was examined. The annual variations of the chronologies in different age classes and the relationships between the chronologies and climate were compared to determine whether the climate-growth response of Chinese pine in North China is age independent.

Materials and methods

Study area and tree-ring chronology

The study area is the Guancen Mountains, which are located in the eastern part of the Loess Plateau, North China (Fig. [1](#page-2-0)). The Guancen Mountains have comparatively abundant forest resources, and the dominant tree species is Chinese pine, which is followed by larch (Larix gmelinii). The study area is located in the temperate continental climate region, the annual precipitation is approximately 430 mm, and the average temperature is approximately 9° C. The samples were collected in the northern Guancen Mountains.

Some researches demonstrated there were some potential factors, such as crown, affecting the differences among age classes. Carrer and Urbinati [\(2004](#page-8-0)) found that the age effect in tree-ring parameters was clear in Larix decidua than in Pinus cembra and explained this may partly attribute to the different patterns observed in tree height and

age relationships. Pichler and Oberhuber [\(2007](#page-8-0)) indicated that the understory trees experienced greater growth reductions during droughts than overstory ones in Pinus sylvestris in an inner Alpine environment. Martín-Benito et al. ([2008\)](#page-8-0) showed that the dominant trees of Pinus nigra reduced growth during the drought more than suppressed trees but also recovered faster afterward in a Mediterranean climate. Therefore, the environment of the sampling site should be properly considered. Indeed, it is hard to get an ideal sampling site, excluding all the other potential factors affecting differences among age classes, in the field work. To highlight the possible influences of age on the climategrowth response of the trees in the study area, the potential factors (e.g., longitude and latitude, altitude, crown competition, and tree species) were avoided as far as possible in sampling. The samples were collected between $38^{\circ}42'14''$ and $38^{\circ}42'33''N$ and between $111^{\circ}57'44$ and $111^{\circ}58'28''E$ at an elevation between 1,700 and 1,900 m a.s.l. All of the sampled trees grew under relatively scattered conditions in a homogeneous microenvironment of thin soil and scattered shrubs and grasses in the understory, and there was no apparent anthropogenic influence. All increment cores were collected from Chinese pine of 7–9 m high. For each tree, two cores were taken at breast height (BH). Diameter at BH of the sampled trees mainly concentrated on 25–35 cm. In total, 136 cores were collected at BH from 68 Chinese pine trees.

The samples were dried, mounted, surfaced with progressively finer grade sandpaper, and cross-dated. The samples were then measured with a precision of 0.01 mm (Stokes and Smiley [1996\)](#page-8-0). The COFECHA program was used to control the quality of the cross-dating and measurements of the ring-width series in the three age classes (Holmes, [1983](#page-8-0)). For the cores that had no pith but were near the pith, 2–7 rings were added to estimate their age after comparing their ring patterns with the cores that had pith (Clack and Hallgren [2004](#page-8-0)). The age of the shorter core was dated by the longer one of the same tree. Some cores were far away from the pith and were excluded from the final samples. In addition, a common time span and the same number of samples in different age classes should also be taken into account for making comparable statistics. Considering the age range of the samples and reasonable sample size of the various age classes, 108 cores from 54 trees (between 70 and 220 years old) were finally involved. All the samples were grouped into three age classes based on the tree age at BH and every class included 36 cores from 18 trees. Age class one (AC1) included the young trees at 70–120 years old. Age class two (AC2) included the middle-age trees at 121–170 years

Fig. 2 The mean age, standard deviation (SD), and frequency distribution of the tree ages in the age class 1 (AC1), age class 2 (AC2), and age class 3 (AC3). N indicates the number of cores in every age class

old. Age class three (AC3) included the old trees at 171–220 years old. Figure 2 shows the mean, SD, and frequency distribution of the tree age in the three age classes.

Each individual raw ring-width measurement series was detrended and standardized to ring-width index using the program ARSTAN (Version 44h3, [http://www.ldeo.colum](http://www.ldeo.columbia.edu/tree-ring-laboratory/resources/software) [bia.edu/tree-ring-laboratory/resources/software\)](http://www.ldeo.columbia.edu/tree-ring-laboratory/resources/software). Undesirable growth trends unrelated to climatic variations were removed from each series during the detrending process.

The conservative method, negative exponential curve or a straight line, was employed to fit each ring-width measurement series. The ARSTAN program can build three kinds of chronologies, standard (STD) chronology, residual (RES) chronology, and ARSTAN (ARS) chronology. The aim of this research was to determine whether the climategrowth response of Chinese pine in North China is age independent by comparing the annual variations of the chronologies and the relationships between the chronologies and climate in different age classes. The RES chronology has more high frequency signals; therefore, the RES chronology was ultimately used in the climate-growth relationship analyses. The AC1 chronology, AC2 chronology, and AC3 chronology mentioned in this research referring to RES chronologies built based on the tree-ring width measurements of AC1, AC2, and AC3 groups.

Meteorological data

The Yuanping meteorological station is located at $112^{\circ}43'E$, $38^{\circ}44'N$, which is east of the sampling sites at 828 m a.s.l. The straight-line distance between the station and sites is approximately 50 km. Both the Yuanping meteorological station and our sampling sites are located east of the Guancen Mountains. Considering the similar climatic conditions within the study region, the local mean monthly temperature and total monthly precipitation records from the Yuanping meteorological station were used in this study (Fig. [1](#page-2-0)).

Statistical methods

To discern the growth characteristics and possible differences among the AC1, AC2, and AC3 chronologies, several commonly used descriptive statistics in dendrochronology were employed: MS, SD, SNR, EPS, PC1, mean correlation among all series, mean correlation between trees, and mean correlation within trees. MS and SD measure the relative change of the ring widths from one year to the next or the departure from the mean value. The SNR can quantify the potential signal in the chronology, whereas the EPS indicates the degree to which the particular sample chronology portrays a hypothetically perfect chronology (Fritts [1976](#page-8-0); Wigley et al. [1984](#page-9-0)). PC1 and mean correlations can estimate the amount of year-to-year growth variances that occur among the samples in the chronology (Carrer and Urbinati [2004](#page-8-0); Linderholm and Linderholm [2004;](#page-8-0) Wang et al. [2009\)](#page-9-0).

The principal component analysis (PCA) is a standard multivariate technique that can compress data and reduce data dimensionality; therefore, the majority of variation can be accounted for using only a few explanatory variables and is analyzed more easily than the original dataset.

Table 1 Statistical characteristics of the chronologies of age class 1 (AC1), age class 2 (AC2), and age class 3 (AC3) in North China

	AC1	AC2	AC3
Number of cores	36	36	36
Mean sensitivity	0.33	0.31	0.39
Standard deviation	0.25	0.26	0.31
Mean correlation among all series	0.50	0.51	0.56
Mean correlation between trees	0.50	0.50	0.56
Mean correlation within trees	0.78	0.76	0.82
Signal-to-noise ratio	24.92	32.51	29.15
Year of expressed population signal >0.85	1915	1875	1825
Variation in first principal component	52.43%	52.71 %	50.09 $%$

The PCA was applied to estimate the coherence of the series from different age classes.

The climate-growth relationships were investigated using correlation function analyses. Pearson's correlation coefficient, which is often used when measuring the influence of one time-dependent variable on another in climate time series, was employed to compare the response difference of the trees to climate in different age classes. DENDROCLIM 2002 software utilizes bootstrap confidence intervals to estimate the significance of correlation coefficients. It can accurately test the significance of correlation and without passing the erroneous significance (Biondi and Waikul [2004](#page-7-0); Mudelsee [2003](#page-8-0)). In this paper, DENDROCLIM 2002 software was used for calculating the correlations between the tree-ring chronologies and climatic data.

Results and discussion

Tree-ring growth coherence

The raw ring-width measurements indicated that annual growth variations of the samples in the study region have high coherence during their common period from 1940 to 2009 (figure not shown). The series intercorrelations of the ring-width measurements in AC1, AC2, and AC3 were 0.71, 0.69, and 0.73, respectively; and it was 0.70 in the total 108 raw ring-width (TRW) measurements of the sampling site.

We summarized the chronology statistics in Table 1. As shown, the statistics in the age-class chronologies have common features. A slightly higher MS and SD occur in the old group. The mean correlations among all series, between trees, and within trees are also higher in the old group. All of the statistics convey approximate values in the three age classes.

Table 2 Correlation coefficients between the three age-class chronologies and mixed-age chronology (TRW) during their common period from 1915 to 2009 in North China

	AC1	AC2	AC ₃	TRW
AC1	1.00			
AC2	0.95	1.00		
AC3	0.91	0.88	1.00	
TRW	0.98	0.96	0.97	1.00

The TRW chronology was built by the total 108 raw ring-width measurements of the sampling site. All values are significant at the 99 % confidence level

The comparisons of the age-class chronologies during their common period (EPS >0.85) from 1915 to 2009 indicated that the growth patterns of the chronologies have synchronous annual variations (figure not shown). The correlations between the three chronologies range from $r = 0.88$ to $r = 0.95$ ($p < 0.0001$, $n = 95$). The age-class chronologies also have high coherence with the mixed-age chronology built from TRW series (TRW chronology) and their correlation coefficients range from $r = 0.96$ to $r = 0.98$ ($p < 0.0001$, $n = 95$) (Table 2). The significant correlation coefficients among these chronologies further confirmed their synchronous growth patterns.

A PCA was also used to estimate the common growth patterns of the three age-class chronologies and to determine whether the different age-class chronologies have a coherent signal. We selected the eigenvalues greater than 1 in extracting the components. One component was extracted. The first principal component has an eigenvalue of 94.34 % and explained 94.34 % of the variance. The first principal component explained the majority of the variances in the three age-class chronologies, which indicated that the three age-class chronologies have consistent information and have no age differences.

To more objectively estimate if the growth patterns of the series from different age classes stayed together within their groups or they spread around independently of their ages, all the individual tree-ring indices (after being standardized) were compared in Fig. [3](#page-5-0). The upper, middle, and bottom part of Fig. [3](#page-5-0) represent the individual tree-ring indices of AC1, AC2, and AC3, respectively. The first principal component series of the total 108 tree-ring indices was also shown as PC1-T in Fig. [3](#page-5-0), which was for acquiring the common signal of the tree-growth pattern in study region and for examining whether the growth variations of the sampled trees are age independent. For better visual comparison, PC1-T series was depicted twice among the three groups. As shown in Fig. [3,](#page-5-0) the annual variations of the individual tree-ring indices series have similar patterns. There is no significant group difference among the three age classes. The series varied independently of their

Fig. 3 Comparison of all the individual tree-ring indices (after being standardized) during their common period from 1940 to 2009. The upper (AC1), middle (AC2), and bottom part (AC3) represent the individual tree-ring indices of AC1, AC2, and AC3, respectively. PC1-T is the first principal component series of the total 108 tree-ring indices series in the sampling site

age class and showed generally consistent variation trends with the PC1-T series. Moreover, the first principal components of the tree-ring indices in every age classes were also extracted individually and were depicted as PC1-AC1, PC1-AC2, and PC1-AC3 in Fig. 4. Comparisons of the three first principal component series were to further examine whether there has group characteristics in some certain age class. To assess the frequency-dependent coherence, PC1-AC1, PC1-AC2, and PC1-AC3 were filtered by a 5-year high-pass filter (Fritts, [1976](#page-8-0)), which were depicted as PC1-AC1H, PC1-AC2H, and PC1-AC3H in the bottom half of Fig. 4. As shown, both of the original first principal component series and their high-pass components demonstrated high consistent variations, especially the latter one.

Climate-growth response of different age classes

Except for a number of chronology statistics that are slightly higher in the older trees than in the younger ones, the three age-class chronologies have similar variations. All of the age-class chronologies have similar signals and are highly consistent with the regional mixed-age TRW chronology.

Fig. 4 Comparison of the first principal component series of the treering indices (after being standardized) in the three individual age class from 1940 to 2009. PC1-AC1, PC1-AC2, and PC1-AC3 are the first principal component series of the individual tree-ring indices series in AC1, AC2, and AC3. PC1-AC1H, PC1-AC2H, and PC1-AC3H are the 5-year high-pass filtered series of PC1-AC1, PC1-AC2, and PC1- AC3

Some studies have indicated that old trees have higher chronology statistics and a higher sensitivity to climatic variables than young trees. For example, the old Pinus cembra and Larix decidua in the Italian Alps have higher climate-growth responses than the young trees, and the tree-ring chronology statistics of Larix decidua are higher in the old trees (Carrer and Urbinati [2004\)](#page-8-0). The tree-ring chronology statistics of Picea abies in the Alps are also higher in the old trees, and the radial growth of the old Picea abies trees has a highly significant response to May– June precipitation, whereas the young trees are insensitive to precipitation (Schuster and Oberhuber [2013\)](#page-8-0). The growth in old Quercus alba trees of South Central Virginia, USA is more sensitive to drought than that of the young trees. Regarding the Chinese pine, Zhang et al. [\(2013a\)](#page-9-0) found that the MS and SD of the old trees are higher than that of the young trees in the northeastern Tibetan Plateau,

Fig. 5 Correlation coefficients between the tree-ring chronologies (AC1, AC2, AC3, and TRW) with the total monthly/seasonal precipitation (left column) and mean monthly/seasonal temperature (right column) from the previous August to the following September (1954–2009). F–J is from February to July. M–J is from May to July. The asterisks indicate 0.05 significance level

showing that the climate-growth responses are different between the young and old trees. The old Chinese pines have higher significant correlations with precipitation in May (positive) and with temperature in the previous October, previous December, and current September (positive) compared with that of young trees. However, the negative correlations between the radial growth of Chinese pines and temperature in the current January, June, and August are higher in the young trees than in the old trees (Zhang et al. [2013a](#page-9-0)). The increasing climatic sensitivity of old trees may be explained by an endogenous parameter linked to hydraulic conditions that becomes increasingly limiting as trees grow; thus, older trees have more hydraulic resistance and a higher climate sensitivity (Carrer and Urbinati [2004](#page-8-0)).

Correlation function analyses were employed to investigate the climate-growth relationships and to determine whether the old Chinese pines have higher climate-growth responses than young trees or the climate-growth response of Chinese pine in the study region is age independent. The individual correlation coefficients between the tree-ring chronologies (AC1, AC2, and AC3) with total monthly precipitation and mean monthly temperatures from the previous August to September in the following year were calculated. The correlations between TRW chronology and climatic data were also analyzed. All the correlation coefficients were depicted in Fig. 5.

The correlation analyses demonstrated that both precipitation and temperature affected the radial growth of Chinese pine in the study region, and similar climategrowth relationships with slight fluctuations occurred between the radial growth and climate. As shown in the left column of Fig. 5, all the significant correlation coefficients between the age-class chronologies and monthly precipitation have the same phase. Thus, the tree growth of different age classes has a nearly synchronous response to monthly precipitation.

Further, we can determine that almost all of the three age-class chronologies have significantly positive correlations with precipitation in the previous September and current growth season. In addition, the AC1 chronology is the only chronology that has a significant correlation with February precipitation, and the AC2 chronology is the only chronology that has a significant correlation with the previous October precipitation. The highest correlation coefficients are between the three age-class chronologies and June precipitation. Except for these slight differences, all of the other significant correlations between the individual age-class chronologies and monthly precipitation have similar or equal correlation coefficients.

The right column of Fig. 5 showed the relationships between age-class chronologies and temperature. The temperature from May to August mainly has negative effects on the radial growth of the Chinese pine in the study region; and the temperature of the previous August and December has positive effects on the tree growth. All of the correlation coefficients between the temperature from May to July and the three age-class chronologies are significant. The highest correlation coefficients between the age-class chronologies and temperature are also in June. Similar to precipitation, the differences in the correlations between the three age-class chronologies and monthly temperatures are also small and insignificant.

In dendrochronology, the responses of tree growth to seasonal or annual climate always have reasonable biological explanations. Seasonal or annual climate reconstructions are always more valuable in climate analyses and can supply comparable signals for other relevant research fields. Therefore, we analyzed the growth response of Chinese pine in different age classes to seasonal precipitation and temperature. Because the monthly precipitation

from February to July and monthly temperature from May to July significantly affected the radial growth of the Chinese pine in the study region, we calculated the relationships between the age-class chronologies and the total precipitation from February to July and mean temperature from May to July. As shown in Fig. [5](#page-6-0), the growth responses of the different age-class chronologies to seasonal precipitation and temperature also showed no significant difference.

Climate-growth response comparison between ageclass chronologies and mixed-age chronology

In general, there is no significant difference in the response for the three age-class chronologies to different monthly and seasonal precipitation and temperature, which leads to the following questions: whether do the regional mixed-age TRW chronology has same responses to precipitation and temperature, and can a certain representative age-class chronology represent the population of Chinese pine in the study region? The bottom part of Fig. [5](#page-6-0) described the responses of TRW chronology to monthly and seasonal precipitation and temperature. As shown, the regional mixed-age chronology has similar responses to monthly and seasonal precipitation and temperature as the three ageclass chronologies. The correlation coefficients have no specific bias in the climate-growth responses of the three age-class chronologies. At times, the values are similar to the mean of the corresponding correlation coefficients between the climate and age-class chronologies or similar to the higher (lower) values. Certainly, these differences are slight and insignificant.

Conclusion

In this research, the characteristics and climate-growth responses of ring-width chronologies for the Chinese pine of North China were investigated. The results indicated that the climate-growth response of Chinese pine in North China is age independent. Although the MS, SD, mean correlations among all series, between trees, and within trees are slightly higher in the old group, the annual growth variations of the individual tree-ring index in sampling site are synchronous. There is no significant group difference among the three age classes. The individual tree-ring index series varied independently of their age class and showed generally consistent variation trends with the first principal component series of the total 108 tree-ring indices. The statistical indicators of the age-class chronologies have common features and all of the three age-class chronologies have similar growth pattern with the regional mixedage chronology during their common period. The age-class chronologies and the mixed-age chronology have similar responses to monthly and seasonal precipitation and temperature.

The relationship analysis between climate-growth response and tree age in North China is in the preliminary stage. The study region and researched tree species are limited, and more extensive studies are required, including larger geographic scales and additional species, to determine whether tree age could influence dendroclimatic reconstructions in North China. Moreover, the original intention of this research was to determine whether the climate-growth response of Chinese pine is age related, which would produce a bias in the relevant climate reconstructions. Therefore, trees younger than 70 years old were not included in this research.

Author contribution statement Junyan Sun and Yu Liu conceived and designed the experiments. Yu Liu contributed analysis tools. Junyan Sun performed the experiments, analyzed the data, and wrote the manuscript.

Acknowledgments The authors thank the editor and anonymous reviewers for their great help. We thank Guang Bao, Bo Sun, Yanchao Wang, Ruiyuan Wang, and Renyi He for their great help in the field work. This research is supported by grants from the West Light foundation of Chinese Academy of Sciences, the National Natural Science Foundation of China (No. 41023006, 40901060), the National Basic Research Program of China (No.2010CB833405, 2013CB955903), the fund of the Chinese Academy of Sciences (KZZD-EW-04), and the State Key Laboratory of Loess and Quaternary Geology. This is a Sino-Swedish Tree-Ring Research Center (SISTRR) Contribution (028).

Conflict of interest We have no conflict of interest.

References

- Bao G, Liu Y, Linderholm HW (2012) April–September mean maximum temperature inferred from Hailar pine (Pinus sylvestris var. mongolica) tree rings in the Hulunbuir region, Inner Mongolia, back to 1868 AD. Palaeogeogr Palaeocol 313–314:162–172
- Biondi F, Waikul K (2004) DENDROCLIM2002: a C++ program for statistical calibration of climate signals in tree-ring chronologies. Comput Geosci 30:303–311
- Bond BJ (2000) Age-related changes in photosynthesis of woody plants. Trends Plant Sci 5:349–353
- Bräuning A, Mantwill B (2004) Summer temperature and summer monsoon history on the Tibetan plateau during the last 400 years recorded by tree rings. Geophys Res Lett 31:L24205. doi:[10.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2004GL020793) [1029/2004GL020793](http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2004GL020793)
- Briffa KR, Shishov VV, Melvin TM, Vaganov EA, Grudd H, Hantemirov RM, Eronen M, Naurzbaev MM (2008) Trends in recent temperature and radial tree growth spanning 2000 years across northwest Eurasia. Phil Trans R Soc B 363:2271–2284
- Buckley BM, Palakit K, Duangsathaporn K, Sanguantham P, Prasomsin P (2007) Decadal scale droughts over northwestern Thailand over the past 448 years: links to the tropical Pacific and Indian Ocean sectors. Clim Dynam 29:63–71
- Carrer M, Urbinati C (2004) Age-dependent tree-ring growth responses to climate in Larix decidua and Pinus cembra. Ecology 85:730–740
- Chen ZJ, He XY, Cook ER, He HS, Chen W, Sun Y, Cui MX (2011) Detecting dryness and wetness signals from tree-rings in Shenyang, Northeast China. Palaeogeogr Palaeocol 302:301–310
- Clack SL, Hallgren SW (2004) Age estimation of Quercus marilandica and Quercus stellata: applications for interpreting stand dynamics. Can J For Res 21:1222–1233
- Colenutt ME, Luckman BH (1991) Dendrochronological investigation of Larix lyallii at Larch Valley, Alberta. Can J For Res 21:1222–1233
- Colenutt ME, Luckman BH (1995) The dendrochronological characteristics of alpine larch. Can J For Res 25:777–789
- Cook ER, Palmer JG, Ahmed M, Woodhouse CA, Fenwick P, Zafer MU, Wahab M, Khan N (2013) Five centuries of Upper Indus River flow from tree rings. J Hydrol 486:365–375
- D'Arrigo RD, Wilson R, Jacoby G (2006) On the long-term context for late twentieth century warming. J Geophys Res 111:D03103. doi[:10.1029/2005JD006352](http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2005JD006352)
- Esper J, Cook ER, Schweingruber FH (2002) Low frequency signals in long tree-ring chronologies for reconstructing past temperature variability. Science 295:2250–2253
- Esper J, Niederer R, Bebi P, Frank D (2008) Climate signal age effects-evidence from young and old trees in the Swiss Engadin. For Ecol Manag 255:3783–3789
- Fan ZX, Bräuning A, Tian OH, Yang B, Cao KF (2010) Tree ring recorded May–August temperature variations since A.D. 1585 in the Gaoligong Mountains, southeastern Tibetan Plateau. Palaeogeogr Palaeocol 296:94–102
- Fang KY, Gou XH, Chen FH, D'Arrigo RD, Li JB (2010) Tree-ring based drought reconstruction for the Guiqing Mountain (China): linkages to the Indian and Pacific Oceans. Int J Climatol 30(8):1137–1145
- Fritts HC (1976) Tree rings and climate. Academic Press, New York
- Gou XH, Chen FH, Cook ER, Jacoby GC, Yang MX, Li JB (2007) Streamflow variations of the Yellow River over the past 593 years in western China reconstructed from tree rings. Water Resour Res 43:W06434. doi:[10.1029/2006WR005705](http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2006WR005705)
- Holmes RL (1983) Computer-assisted quality control in tree-ring dating and measurement. Tree Ring Bull 43:69–78
- Hughes MK (2002) Dendrochronology in climatology: the state of the art. Dendrochronologia 20:95–116
- Kirkpatrick M (1981) Spatial and age dependent patterns of growth in New England black birch. Am J Bot 68:535–543
- Li JB, Cook ER, Chen FH, Gou XH, Zhang YX (2007) Drought reconstruction for north central China from tree rings: the value of the Palmer drought severity index. Int J Climatol 27:903–909
- Li Q, Nakatsuka T, Kawamura K, Liu Y, Song HM (2011) Hydroclimate variability in the North China Plain and its link with ENSO since 1784 AD: insights from tree-ring cellulose d18O. J Geophys Res 116:D22106. doi:[10.1029/2011JD015987](http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2011JD015987)
- Li JB, Xie SP, Cook ER, Morales MS, Christie DA, Johnson NC, Chen FH, D'Arrigo R, Fowler AM, Gou XH, Fang KY (2013) El Niño modulations over the past seven centuries. Nat Clim Chang 3:822–826
- Liang EY, Shao XM, Liu HY, Eckstein D (2007) Tree-ring based PDSI reconstruction since AD 1842 in the Ortindag Sand Land, east Inner Mongolia. Chin Sci Bull 52(19):2715–2721
- Liang EY, Shao XM, Liu XH (2009) Annual precipitation variation inferred from tree rings since AD 1770 for the western Qilian Mts., northern Tibetan plateau. Tree Ring Res 65(2):95–103
- Linderholm HW, Linderholm K (2004) Age-dependent climate sensitivity of Pinus sylvestris L. in the central Scandinavian Mountains. Boreal Environ Res 9:307–317
- Liu Y, An ZS, Linderholm HW, Chen DL, Song HM, Cai QF, Sun JY, Tian H (2009) Annual temperatures during the last 2485 years in the mid-eastern Tibetan Plateau inferred from tree rings. Sci China Ser D 52(3):348–359
- Liu Y, Tian H, Song HM, Liang JM (2010) Tree ring precipitation reconstruction in the Chifeng-Weichang region, China, and East Asian summer monsoon variation since A.D. 1777. J Geophys Res 115:D06103. doi[:10.1029/2009JD012330](http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2009JD012330)
- Liu Y, Lei Y, Sun B, Song HM, Sun JY (2012) Annual precipitation in Liancheng, China, since 1777 AD derived from tree rings of Chinese pine (Pinus tabulaeformis Carr.). Int J Biometeorol. doi[:10.1007/s00484-012-0618-7](http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s00484-012-0618-7)
- Liu Y, Lei Y, Sun B, Song HM (2013) Annual precipitation variability inferred from tree-ring width chronologies in the Changling-Shoulu region, China, during AD 1853–2007. Dendrochronologia. doi[:10.1016/j.dendro.2013.02.001](http://dx.doi.org/10.1016/j.dendro.2013.02.001)
- Mann ME, Jones PD (2003) Global surface temperatures over the past two millennia. Geophys Res Lett 30(15):1820. doi[:10.1029/](http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2003GL017814) [2003GL017814](http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2003GL017814)
- Martín-Benito D, Cherubini P, Del Río M, Caňellas I (2008) Growth response to climate and drought in Pinus nigra Arn. trees of different crown classes. Trees 22:363–373
- Mudelsee M (2003) Estimating Pearson's correlation coefficient with bootstrap confidence interval from serially dependent time series. Math Geol 35:651–665
- Ogle K, Whitham TG, Cobb NS (2000) Tree-ring variation in pinyon predicts likelihood of death following severe drought. Ecology 81:3237–3243
- Pichler P, Oberhuber W (2007) Radial growth response of coniferous forest trees in an inner Alpine environment to heat-wave in 2003. For Ecol Manage 242:688–699
- Rossi S, Deslauriers A, Anfodillo T, Carrer M (2008) Age-dependent xylogenesis in timberline conifers. New Phytol. doi:[10.1111/j.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-8137.2007.02235.x) [1469-8137.2007.02235.x](http://dx.doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-8137.2007.02235.x)
- Rozas V (2005) Dendrochronology of pedunculate oak (Quercus robur L.) in an old-growth pollarded woodland in northern Spain: tree-ring growth responses to climate. Ann Sci. doi:[10.](http://dx.doi.org/10.1051/forest:2005012) [1051/forest:2005012](http://dx.doi.org/10.1051/forest:2005012)
- Schuster R, Oberhuber W (2013) Age-dependent climate-growth relationships and regeneration of Picea abies in a drought-prone mixed-coniferous forest in the Alps. Can J For Res 43:609–618
- Shao XM, Huang L, Liu HB, Liang EY, Fang XQ, Wang LL (2005) Reconstruction of precipitation variation from tree rings in recent 1000 years in Delingha, Qinghai. Sci China Ser D 48:939–949
- Sheppard PR, Tarasov PE, Graumlich LJ, Heussner KU, Wagner M, Sterle H, Thompson LG (2004) Annual precipitation since 515 BC reconstructed from living and fossil juniper growth of northeastern Qinghai Province, China. Clim Dynam 23:869–881
- Shi JF, Liu Y, Vaganov EA, Li JB, Cai QF (2008) Statistical and process-based modeling analyses of tree growth response to climate in semi-arid area of north central China: a case study of Pinus tabulaeformis. J Geophys Res 113:G01026. doi[:10.1029/](http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2007JG000547) [2007JG000547](http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2007JG000547)
- Song HM, Liu Y (2011) PDSI variations at Kongtong Mountain, China, inferred from a 283-year Pinus tabulaeformis ring-width chronology. J Geophys Res 116:D22111. doi[:10.1029/2011](http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2011JD016220) [JD016220](http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2011JD016220)
- Stokes MA, Smiley TL (1996) An introduction to tree-ring dating. The University of Arizona Press, Tucson, pp 1–73
- Szeicz JM, MacDonald GM (1994) Age-dependent tree-ring growth response of subarctic white spruce to climate. Can J For Res 24:120–132
- Treydte K, Schleser GH, Helle G, Frank DC, Winiger M, Haug GH, Esper J (2006) Millennium-long precipitation record from treering oxygen isotopes in northern Pakistan. Nature 440:11791182
- Vieira J, Campelo F, Nabais C (2009) Age-dependent responses of tree-ring growth and intra-annual density fluctuations of Pinus pinaster to Mediterranean climate. Trees Struct Funct 23:257–265
- Wang XC, Zhang YD, McRae DJ (2009) Spatial and age-dependent tree-ring growth responses of Larix gmelinii to climate in northeastern China. Trees Struct Funct 23(4):875–885
- Wang LL, Duan JP, Chen J, Huang L, Shao XM (2010) Temperature reconstruction from tree-ring maximum density of Balfour spruce in eastern Tibet, China. Int J Climatol 30:972–979
- Wang XM, Zhao XH, Gao LS, Jiang QB (2011) Age-dependent growth responses of Pinus koraiensis to climate in the north slope of Changbai Mountain, North-Eastern China. Acta Ecol Sin 31(21):6378–6387
- Wigley TML, Briffa KR, Jones PD (1984) On the average value of correlated time series with application in dendroclimatology and hydrometeorology. J Clim Appl Meteorol 23:201–213
- Wilson R, Elling W (2004) Temporal instability in tree-growth/ climate response in the Lower Bavarian Forest region: implications for dendroclimatic reconstruction. Trees Struct Funct. doi[:10.1007/s00468-003-0273-z](http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s00468-003-0273-z)
- Wu GJ, Xu GB, Chen T, Liu XH, Zhang YF, An WL, Wang WZ, Fang ZA, Yu SL (2013) Age-dependent tree-ring growth responses of Schrenk spruce (Picea schrenkiana) to climate-A case study in the Tianshan Mountain, China. Dendrochronologia 31(4):318–326
- Yadav RR, Bräuning A, Singh J (2011) Tree ring inferred summer temperature variations over the last millennium in western Himalaya, India. Clim Dynam 36(7–8):1545–1554
- Yang B, Qin C, Shi F, Dmitry MS (2012) Tree ring-based annual streamflow reconstruction for the Heihe River in arid

northwestern China from AD 575 and its implications for water resource management. Holocene 22(7):773–784

- Yu DP, Zhai LJ, Wang QL, Dai LM (2006) Dynamics of dominant tree species in a forest ecotone on the northern slop of Changbai Mountain. J For Res 17(3):216–220
- Yu GR, Liu YB, Wang XC, Ma KP (2008) Age-dependent tree-ring growth responses to climate in Qilian juniper (Sabina przewalskii Kom.). Trees Struct Funct 22(2):197–204
- Yuan YJ, Shao XM, Wei WS, Yu SL, Gong Y, Trouet V (2007) The potential to reconstruct Manasi River streamflow in the northern Tien Shan Mountains (NW China). Tree Ring Res 63(2):81–93
- Zhang QB, Cheng GD, Yao TD, Kang XC, Huang JG (2003) A 2326-year tree-ring record of climate variability on the northeastern Qinghai-Tibetan Plateau. Geophys Res Lett 30(14):1739. doi[:10.1029/2003GL017425](http://dx.doi.org/10.1029/2003GL017425)
- Zhang Y, Gou XH, Chen FH, Tian QH, Yang ML, Peng JF, Fang KY (2009) A 1232 years tree-ring record of climate variability in the Qilian Mountains, Northwestern China. IAWA J 30:407–420
- Zhang F, Gou XH, Liu WH, Levia DF, Li YJ (2013a) Individual and time-varying tree-ring growth to climate sensitivity of Pinus tabuliformis Carr. and Sabina przewalskii Kom. in the eastern Qilian Mountains, China. Trees Struct Funct 27:359–370
- Zhang TW, Yuan YJ, Liu Y, Wei WS, Zhang RB, Chen F, Yu SL, Shang HM, Qin L (2013b) A tree-ring based temperature reconstruction for the Kaiduhe River watershed, northwestern China, since A.D. 1680: Linkages to the North Atlantic Oscillation. Quatern Int 311:71–80
- Zhu HF, Shao XM, Yin ZY, Xu P, Xu Y, Tian H (2011) August temperature variability in the southeastern Tibetan Plateau since AD 1385 inferred from tree rings. Palaeogeogr Palaeocol 305(1–4):84–92