ORIGINAL ARTICLE



Nonlocal strain gradient finite element analysis of nanobeams using two-variable trigonometric shear deformation theory

Tarek Merzouki¹ · Mohammed Sid Ahmed Houari² · Mohamed Haboussi³ · Aicha Bessaim² · Manickam Ganapathi⁴

Received: 12 May 2020 / Accepted: 23 August 2020 / Published online: 18 September 2020 © Springer-Verlag London Ltd., part of Springer Nature 2020

Abstract

In the present paper, a new trigonometric two-variable shear deformation beam nonlocal strain gradient theory is developed and applied to investigate the combined effects of nonlocal stress and strain gradient on the bending, buckling and free vibration analysis of nanobeams. The model introduces a nonlocal stress field parameter and a length scale parameter to capture the size effect. The governing equations derived are solved employing finite element method using a 3-nodes beam element, developed for this purpose. The predictive capability of the proposed model is shown through illustrative examples for bending, buckling and free vibration of nanobeams. Comparisons with other higher-order shear deformation beam theory are also performed to validate its numerical implementation and assess its accuracy within the nonlocal context.

Keywords Nonlocal strain gradient theory \cdot Variational formulation \cdot Finite element method \cdot Static analysis \cdot Free vibration \cdot Elastic buckling

1 Introduction

Nowadays, nanostructures such as nanorods, nanobeams and nanoplates are receiving a great attention in nanoscience and nanotechnology, due to their extraordinary mechanical, thermal, electrical, magnetic, and other properties [1–5]. Examples of applications and devices related to such nanostructures are oscillators [6], clocks [7], sensors [8–10], atomic force microscopy [11, 12], nano/micro electro-mechanical systems (NEMS/MEMS) [13, 14] and nano actuators [15, 16]. In nanostructures, the size effect is no longer negligible and becomes rather important. It is then necessary to take it account into the design of applications, such as

Tarek Merzouki tarek.merzouki@uvsq.fr

- ² Laboratoire d'Etude des Structures et de Mécanique des Matériaux, University Mustapha Stambouli of Mascara, Mascara, Algeria
- ³ Laboratoire des Sciences des Procédés et des Matériaux (LSPM), CNRS UPR 3407, Université Paris 13, Sorbonne-Paris-Cité, 93430 Villetaneuse, France
- ⁴ School of Mechanical Engineering, VIT University, Vellore 632 014, India

those mentioned above. There have been many theoretical and experimental investigations for better understanding and designing the mechanical and physical behavior of such small-scaled structures [17, 18]. It is known that classical continuum mechanics is a local theory that is sizeindependent. So, it is not really appropriate for small-scaled structures as it does not allow to capturing the size effect in such small structures. To overcome this limitation, nonclassical continuum theories are developed. Whether being of integral or gradient types, these theories utilize one or several material internal length scale parameters. Examples of such nonlocal theories are the pioneer elasticity theory of [19, 20], the strain gradient theory [21–23], the modified couple stress theory [24], and the nonlocal strain gradient theory [25]. The nonlocal elasticity theory has widely been employed to analyze the bending, vibration, buckling and wave propagation of nanostructures. Among recent works, there are [26-30], and the critical review on the topic of nanobeam and nanoplate modeling [31].

The above-mentioned studies all point out the significant influence that non-local factors can have on the static and dynamic responses of nanobeams. In particular, nonlocal elastic theory can only be used to describe material softening effect, the hardening effect reported in many experimental studies cannot be handled by such theories [32–34]. The strain gradient theory proposed by Mindlin

¹ LISV, University of Versailles Saint-Quentin, 10-12 Avenue de l'Europe, 78140 Vélizy-Villacoublay, France

[22] is a microstructure-dependent continuum theory developed to capture the hardening effect by enriching the classical continuum with additional material characteristic length scales. In this theory, the total stress is a function of additional strain gradient terms to consider microstructural deformation contributions at small scale, hence, including higher-order strain gradients [35]. Based on such nonlocal strain gradient elasticity theoretical framework, several works have been devoted to study the mechanical behavior of small scaled structures. In [24, 36–38], the linear and non-linear static, free vibration, and buckling responses of homogeneous or inhomogeneous small scaled structure are studied based on various shear deformation theories. In Li et al. [39], the flexural wave frequency response of small-scaled functionally graded Euler-Bernoulli beams is studied using a nonlocal strain gradient theory. Li et al. [40] studied the vibrational behavior of functionally graded nano/micro-scaled using a nonlocal strain gradient extension of a Timoshenko beam theory. Xu et al. [41] studied the nonlinear bending and buckling of nanobeam by a nonlocal strain gradient extension of Euler-Bernoulli beam model. Li et al. [42] examined bending, buckling and vibration of axially functionally graded beams by a nonlocal strain gradient extension of Euler-Bernoulli beam theory. Sahmani et al. [43] presented analytical solutions for nonlinear bending behavior of functionally graded porous micro/nanobeams reinforced with graphene platelets.

Allam et al. [44] analyzed the bending, buckling and vibration behaviors of viscoelastic FG curved nanobeam embedded in an elastic medium based on nonlocal strain gradient theory. Radwan et al. [45] studied the dynamic deformation of orthotropic viscoelastic graphene sheets under time harmonic thermal load. All of the previous mentioned studies were based on classical beam theory (CBT), first-order shear deformation beam theory (FSDT) and higher-order shear deformation beam theory (HSDT). The CBT is only applicable for thin beam, ignores shear deformation effects and provides reasonable results for slender beams only. However, it underestimates deflection and overestimates buckling load and frequency of moderately short or short beams [46]. The FSDT accounts for the transverse shear deformation effect and gives acceptable results for moderately short and slender beam [47], but needs a shear correction to compensate for the difference between the actual stress state and the constant stress state due to a constant shear strain assumption through the thickness [48]. In order to include shear deformation effects, several polynomial [49–51] and non polynomial [52–58] higher-order shear deformation theories (HSDTs), which are based on a non-linear variation through the thickness of the in-plane displacements, are developed. These theories provide a better prediction of response of short beam and do not require any shear correction factor and satisfy zero shear stress conditions at top and bottom surfaces of beams.

The aim of this paper is to extend the two variables trigonometric shear deformation theory of Thai [59] within a nonlocal context in order to study the bending, vibration and buckling of nanobeams. The nonlocal extension is based on the use of strain gradient constitutive relations. The most interesting features of this theory is that it accounts for a trigonometric variation of the transverse shear strains across the thickness and satisfies the zero traction boundary conditions on the top and bottom surfaces of the beam without using any shear correction factor. It should be noted that the trigonometric function was used in the first time by Levy [60] and assessed by Stein [60], and later widely used by [52] and [61]. These theories are capable of representing the section warping in the deformed configuration and the results obtained from these theories show that this theory is capable to calculate the stresses and natural frequencies more accurately than other theories. The governing equations derived are used to develop a finite element model using a 3-node beam element. Analytical solutions for bending, vibration and buckling loadings are also presented for simply supported beams. These analytical solutions are used to validate the finite element implementation of the nonlocal problem. Comparisons with existing solutions from the literature are used to assess the relevance and the accuracy of the proposed nonlocal theory in describing the mechanical behavior of nanobeam.

2 Nonlocal strain gradient theory

When dealing with nanostructures, the effect of size is important and can't be ignored in the analysis and dimensioning of the structure. In the nonlocal strain gradient elasticity, the total stress tensor is expressed as a function of the standard nonlocal stress tensor and the strain gradient stress one:

$$\sigma_{ij} = \sigma_{ij}^{(0)} - \frac{\partial \sigma_{ij}^{(1)}}{\partial x},\tag{1}$$

where the stresses $\sigma_{ij}^{(0)}$ and $\sigma_{ij}^{(1)}$ are related to strain ε_{ij} and strain gradient $\varepsilon_{ij,x}$, respectively, and are defined as follows:

$$\sigma_{ij}^{(0)} = \int_0^L C_{ijkl} \,\alpha_0(x, x', e_0 a) \varepsilon'_{kl}(x') \,\mathrm{d}x,\tag{2}$$

$$\sigma_{ij}^{(1)} = l^2 \int_0^L C_{ijkl} \,\alpha_1(x, x', e_1 a) \varepsilon'_{kl, x}(x') \mathrm{d}x', \tag{3}$$

in which C_{ijkl} are the elastic constants, e_0a and e_1a are nonlocal parameters to consider the significance of the nonlocal stress field, l is a material length scale parameter that introduces the influence of higher-order strain gradient stress field. When the nonlocal functions $\alpha_0(x, x', e_0a)$ and $\alpha_1(x, x', e_1a)$ satisfy the developed conditions by Eringen [62–64], the constitutive relation can be stated as:

$$\begin{aligned} & \left(1 - (e_1 a)^2 \nabla^2\right) \left(1 - (e_0 a)^2 \nabla^2\right) \sigma_{ij} \\ &= C_{ijkl} \left(\left(1 - (e_1 a)^2 \nabla^2\right) \varepsilon_{kl} - l^2 \right. \\ & \left. \left(1 - (e_0 a)^2 \nabla^2\right) \nabla^2 \varepsilon_{kl} \right), \end{aligned}$$
(4)

in which ∇^2 denotes the Laplacian operator. By assuming $e = e_0 = e_1$, the general constitutive equation for the size-dependent continuum can be simplified as follows:

$$\left(1 - (ea)^2 \nabla^2\right) \sigma_{ij} = C_{ijkl} \left(1 - l^2 \nabla^2\right) \varepsilon_{kl}.$$
(5)

Thus, the nonlocal constitutive relations for a shear deformable nanobeam can be stated as follows:

$$\sigma_{xx} - \mu \sigma_{xx}'' = C_{11} \left(\varepsilon_{xx} - \lambda \varepsilon_{xx}'' \right) \sigma_{xz} - \mu \sigma_{xz}'' = C_{66} \left(\gamma_{xz} - \lambda \gamma_{xz}'' \right),$$
(6)

where $\mu = (ea)^2$ and $\lambda = l^2$.

It is of interest that (6) can be simplified to some interested cases.

2.1 Nonlocal elasticity theory

The constitutive equation of the nonlocal elasticity theory can be easily obtained by setting $\lambda = 0$ in the nonlocal strain gradient constitutive (6) as follows:

$$\sigma_{xx} - \mu \sigma_{xx}^{\prime\prime} = C_{11} \epsilon_{xx}$$

$$\sigma_{xz} - \mu \sigma_{xz}^{\prime\prime} = C_{66} \gamma_{xz},$$
(7)

which are identical to Eringen [62-64].

2.2 Strain gradient theory

The constitutive equation of the strain gradient theory can be easily obtained by setting $\mu = 0$ in (6), that is:

$$\sigma_{xx} = C_{11} \left(\varepsilon_{xx} - \lambda \varepsilon_{xx}^{\prime \prime} \right) \sigma_{xz} = C_{66} \left(\gamma_{xz} - \lambda \gamma_{xz}^{\prime \prime} \right), \tag{8}$$

which are identical to Aifantis [65, 66].

It is shown that the general constitutive (6) can reasonably explain size-dependent phenomena and there is a good agreement between the molecular dynamics simulations and the nonlocal strain gradient theory [67, 68].

3 Governing equation for size-dependent nanobeams

To write the governing equations, we consider a straight nanobeam of length L, and a rectangular cross section $b \times h$. The variable x is taken as the cartesian coordinate along the length of the beam with $x \in [0.L]$, whereas z is assumed the coordinate along the thickness direction of the beam, and $z \in [-h/2, h/2]$. In this work, the y coordinate associated with the width direction is not considered in the formulation. Here, a wide range of slenderness ratios L/h can be studied by varying the length L and the thickness h of the beam.

3.1 Kinematics

A trigonometric shear deformation beam theory considering shear deformations is adopted in this study. The displacement field of the proposed theory is chosen based on the following assumptions: (1) the transverse displacement is partitioned into bending and shear components; (2) the axial displacement consists of extension, bending and shear components; (3) the bending component of axial displacement is similar to that given by the Euler–Bernoulli beam theory; and (4) the shear component of axial displacement gives rise to the trigonometric variation of shear strain and hence to shear stress through the thickness of the beam in such a way that shear stress vanishes on the top and bottom surfaces.

Based on the assumptions made above, the displacement field of the present theory can be obtained as:

$$u(x, z, t) = u_0(x) - z w_b'(x) - f(z) w_s'(x)$$

$$w(x, z, t) = w_b(x) + w_s(x),$$
(9)

where u_0 is the axial displacement along the midplane of the nanoscale beam; w_b and w_s are the bending, shear components of the transverse displacement along the midplane of the beam. *t* is the time, derivations are denoted ()' = $\frac{\partial}{\partial x}$ and () = $\frac{\partial}{\partial t}$ for the time. f(z) is a shape function representing the variation of the transverse shear strains and shear stresses through the thickness of the beam and is given as [69] follows:

$$f(z) = z - z \frac{\left(\pi + 2\cos\left(\frac{\pi z}{h}\right)\right)}{(\pi + 2)}.$$
(10)

The nonzero strains associated with the displacements field in (9) are as follows:

$$\varepsilon_x = \varepsilon_x^0 + z k_x^b + f(z) k_x^s$$

$$\gamma_{xz} = g(z) \gamma_{xz}^0,$$
(11)

where

$$\epsilon_x^0 = u_0', \quad k_x^b = -w_b'', \quad k_x^s = -w_s'', \quad \gamma_{xz}^0 = w_s'$$
 (12)

and

$$g(z) = 1 - f'(z).$$
(13)

3.2 Variational statements

The governing equations of motion in terms of displacements are derived using Hamilton's Principle.

The variation of strain energy δU is expressed according to the nonlocal strain gradient theory [67]:

$$\begin{split} \delta U &= \int_{0}^{L} \int_{-h/2}^{h/2} \left(\sigma_{xx}^{(0)} \delta \varepsilon_{xx} + \sigma_{xz}^{(0)} \delta \gamma_{xz} + \sigma_{xx}^{(1)} \nabla \delta \varepsilon_{xx} + \sigma_{xz}^{(1)} \nabla \delta \gamma_{xz} \right) \mathrm{d}z \mathrm{d}x \\ &= \int_{0}^{L} \int_{-h/2}^{h/2} \left(\left(\sigma_{xx}^{(0)} - \nabla \sigma_{xx}^{(1)} \right) \delta \varepsilon_{xx} + \left(\sigma_{xz}^{(0)} - \nabla \sigma_{xz}^{(1)} \right) \delta \gamma_{xz} \right) \mathrm{d}z \mathrm{d}x \\ &+ \left[\int_{0}^{L} \int_{-h/2}^{h/2} \left(\sigma_{xx}^{(1)} \delta \varepsilon_{xx} + \sigma_{xz}^{(1)} \delta \gamma_{xz} \right) \mathrm{d}z \mathrm{d}x \right]_{0}^{L} \\ &= \int_{0}^{L} \int_{-h/2}^{h/2} \left(\sigma_{xx} \delta \gamma_{xx} + \sigma_{xz} \delta \gamma_{xz} \right) \mathrm{d}z \mathrm{d}x \\ &+ \left[\int_{0}^{L} \int_{-h/2}^{h/2} \left(\sigma_{xx}^{(1)} \delta \varepsilon_{xx} + \sigma_{xz}^{(1)} \delta \gamma_{xz} \right) \mathrm{d}z \mathrm{d}x \right]_{0}^{L} \end{split}$$
(14)

$$\left[I_{0}, I_{1}, I_{2}, I_{3}, I_{4}, I_{5}\right] = \int_{-h/2}^{h/2} \rho\left[1, z, z^{2}, f(z), zf(z), f(z)^{2}\right] dz.$$
(18)

The variation potential energy δW of external loads can be written as:

$$\delta W = -\int_0^L \left(q \ \delta w + N_0 \left(w' \ \delta w' \right) \right) \, \mathrm{d}x,\tag{19}$$

where q is the distributed transverse load applied on the upper surface, and N_0 is the axial load acting through the mid plane.

According to Hamilton's principle, we have:

$$0 = \int_0^T (\delta U + \delta W - \delta K) \, \mathrm{d}t.$$
⁽²⁰⁾

The following governing equations are derived from the variational principle (20) by introducing (16), (17), (19), and proceeding to some integrations by parts:

$$\delta w_b : -M'' - q + N_0 (w_b'' + w_s'') = (I_1 \ddot{u}_0 - I_2 \ddot{w}_b' - I_4 \ddot{w}_s' - I_0 \ddot{w}_b - I_0 \ddot{w}_s)$$
(21)

$$\delta w_s : -\tilde{M}'' - Q' - q + N_0 (w_b'' + w_s'') = (I_3 \ddot{u}_0 - I_4 \ddot{w}_b' - I_5 \ddot{w}_s' - I_0 \ddot{w}_b - I_0 \ddot{w}_s)$$

We define the force and the moment resultants as follow:

 $\delta u_0 : -N' = \left(-I_0 \ddot{u}_0 + I_1 \ddot{w}_b' + I_3 \ddot{w}_s'\right)$

$$\begin{bmatrix} N, M, \tilde{M} \end{bmatrix} = \int_{-h/2}^{h/2} \begin{bmatrix} 1, z, f(z) \end{bmatrix} \sigma_{xx} \, \mathrm{d}z, \ Q = \int_{-h/2}^{h/2} \sigma_{xz} \, g(z) \, \mathrm{d}z$$
$$\begin{bmatrix} N^{(1)}, M^{(1)}, \tilde{M}^{(1)} \end{bmatrix} = \int_{-h/2}^{h/2} \begin{bmatrix} 1, z, f(z) \end{bmatrix} \sigma_{xx}^{(1)} \, \mathrm{d}z, \ Q^{(1)} = \int_{-h/2}^{h/2} \sigma_{xz}^{(1)} \, g(z) \, \mathrm{d}z.$$
(15)

Thus, the virtual strain energy can be rewritten as follows:

$$\delta U = \int_0^L \left(N \, \delta u_0' - M \, \delta w_b'' - \tilde{M} \, \delta w_s'' + Q \, \delta w_s' \right) \, \mathrm{d}x \\ + \left[N^{(1)} \, \delta u_0' - M^{(1)} \, \delta w_b'' - \tilde{M}^{(1)} \, \delta w_s'' + Q^{(1)} \, \delta w_s' \right]_0^L. \tag{16}$$

The variation of the kinetic energy is obtained as follows:

$$\delta K = \int_{0}^{L} \rho(\dot{u}\delta\dot{u} + \dot{w}\delta\dot{w}) \, dx = \int_{0}^{L} \left(\left(-I_{0} \ddot{u}_{0} + I_{1} \ddot{w}_{b}' + I_{3} \ddot{w}_{s}' \right) \delta u_{0} \right. \\ \left. + \left(I_{1} \ddot{u}_{0} - I_{2} \ddot{w}_{b}' - I_{4} \ddot{w}_{s}' \right) \delta w_{b} + \left(I_{3} \ddot{u}_{0} - I_{4} \ddot{w}_{b}' - I_{5} \ddot{w}_{s}' \right) \delta w_{s} \\ \left. + \left(-I_{0} \ddot{w}_{b} - I_{0} \ddot{w}_{s} \right) \delta w_{b} + \left(-I_{0} \ddot{w}_{b} - I_{0} \ddot{w}_{s} \right) \delta w_{s} \right) \, dx,$$

$$(17)$$

3.3 Nonlocal strain gradient equilibrium equations

Substituting (6) into (15), one obtains

$$\begin{bmatrix} (N - \mu N''), (M - \mu M''), (\tilde{M} - \mu \tilde{M}''), (Q - \mu Q'') \end{bmatrix}$$

= $\begin{bmatrix} N^{SG}, M^{SG}, \tilde{M}^{SG}, Q^{SG} \end{bmatrix},$ (22)

with the force/moment resultants in strain gradient theory defined as follows:

$$\begin{bmatrix} N^{SG}, M^{SG}, \tilde{M}^{SG} \end{bmatrix} = \int_{-h/2}^{h/2} \begin{bmatrix} 1, z, f(z) \end{bmatrix} C_{11} \left(\epsilon_{xx} - \lambda \epsilon_{xx}'' \right) dz$$
$$\begin{bmatrix} Q^{SG} \end{bmatrix} = \int_{-h/2}^{h/2} \begin{bmatrix} g(z) \end{bmatrix} C_{66} \left(\gamma_{xz} - \lambda \gamma_{xx}'' \right) dz.$$
(23)

Substituting the expressions of stress and moment resultants $[N, M, \tilde{M}, Q]$ from (22) into (21) and then simplifying the resulting equations, we obtain the following nonlocal strain gradient equations of motion as:

$$\begin{split} \delta u_0 &: -N^{SG\prime} = \left(1 - \mu \frac{d^2}{dx^2}\right) \left(-I_0 \ddot{u}_0 + I_1 \ddot{w}_b' + I_3 \ddot{w}_s'\right) \\ \delta w_b &: -M^{SG\prime\prime} = \left(1 - \mu \frac{d^2}{dx^2}\right) \left(q - N_0 (w_b^{\prime\prime} + w_s^{\prime\prime}) \right. \\ &+ I_1 \ddot{u}_0 - I_2 \ddot{w}_b' - I_4 \ddot{w}_s' - I_0 \ddot{w}_b - I_0 \ddot{w}_s\right) \\ \delta w_s &: -\tilde{M}^{SG\prime\prime} - Q' = \left(1 - \mu \frac{d^2}{dx^2}\right) \left(q - N_0 (w_b^{\prime\prime} + w_s^{\prime\prime}) \right. \\ &+ I_3 \ddot{u}_0 - I_4 \ddot{w}_b' - I_5 \ddot{w}_s' - I_0 \ddot{w}_b - I_0 \ddot{w}_s\right). \end{split}$$

4 Matrix formulation of the nonlocal strain gradient variational problem

From (16), (17) and (19) and introducing nonlocal strain gradient equilibrium equations (24), a finite element formulation is applied considering static, free vibration and buckling problems. After simplification, the equation is expressed in matrix form as follows:

$$\int_{0}^{L} \left(\left\{ \delta \mathcal{E}_{\epsilon} \right\}^{T} [k_{\epsilon\epsilon}] \left\{ \mathcal{E}_{\epsilon} \right\} - \lambda \frac{d^{2}}{dx^{2}} \left\{ \delta \mathcal{E}_{\epsilon} \right\}^{T} [k_{\epsilon\epsilon}] \left\{ \mathcal{E}_{\epsilon} \right\} \right) dx$$

$$= \int_{0}^{L} \left(1 - \mu \frac{d^{2}}{dx^{2}} \right) q \delta w \, dx$$

$$+ \int_{0}^{L} \left(1 - \mu \frac{d^{2}}{dx^{2}} \right) \left\{ \delta \mathcal{E}_{u} \right\}^{T} [m_{uu}] \left\{ \ddot{\mathcal{E}}_{u} \right\} \, dx$$

$$+ \int_{0}^{L} \left(1 - \mu \frac{d^{2}}{dx^{2}} \right) \left\{ \delta \mathcal{E}_{u} \right\}^{T} [k_{gg}] \left\{ \mathcal{E}_{u} \right\} \, dx,$$
(30)

where

,

$$[k_{\varepsilon\varepsilon}] = \int_{-h/2}^{h/2} [\mathbb{N}_{\varepsilon}(z)]^T [D] [\mathbb{F}_{\varepsilon}(z)] dz, \qquad (31)$$

$$[m_{uu}] = \int_{-h/2}^{h/2} \rho[\mathbb{N}_u(z)]^T [\mathbb{N}_u(z)] dz.$$
(32)

 $\int_{0}^{L} \int_{-h/2}^{h/2} \left(\{\delta \varepsilon\}^{T} [D] \{\varepsilon\} - \lambda \frac{d^{2}}{dx^{2}} \{\delta \varepsilon\}^{T} [D] \{\varepsilon\} \right) \\
= \int_{0}^{L} \left(1 - \mu \frac{d^{2}}{dx^{2}} \right) q \delta w dx + \int_{0}^{L} \int_{-h/2}^{h/2} \left[\left(1 - \mu \frac{d^{2}}{dx^{2}} \right) \{\delta u\}^{T} \right] \rho \{\ddot{u}\} dz dx \\
+ \int_{0}^{L} \left[\left(1 - \mu \frac{d^{2}}{dx^{2}} \right) \{\delta \varepsilon_{u}\}^{T} \right] [k_{gg}] \{\delta \varepsilon_{u}\} dx,$ (25)

[D] denotes the elastic moduli matrix. The displacement u of (9) and the strain ε functions of (11) can be redefined as follows:

$$\{u\}^{T} = [\mathbb{N}_{u}(z)]\{\mathcal{E}_{u}\} \text{ with} \\ \{\mathcal{E}_{u}\}^{T} = [u_{0} \ w_{b} \ w_{s} \ w_{b}' \ w_{s}'],$$

$$(26)$$

$$\{\varepsilon\}^{T} = [\mathbb{N}_{\varepsilon}(z)]\{\mathcal{E}_{\varepsilon}\} \quad with$$

$$\{\mathcal{E}_{\varepsilon}\}^{T} = [u_{0}' \ w_{b}' \ w_{s}' \ w_{b}'' \ w_{s}'',],$$
(27)

where $[\mathbb{N}_u(z)]$ and $[\mathbb{N}_{\varepsilon}(z)]$ depend only on the normal coordinate *z*, and are defined as follows:

$$\left[\mathbb{N}_{u}(z)\right] = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 & -z & f(z) \\ 0 & 1 & 1 & 0 & 0, \end{bmatrix}$$
(28)

$$[\mathbb{N}_{\varepsilon}(z)] = \begin{bmatrix} 1 & 0 & 0 & -z & f(z) \\ 0 & 0 & 1 + f(z)' & 0 & 0. \end{bmatrix}$$
(29)

Equation (25) can be expanded as follows:

 $[k_{\varepsilon\varepsilon}]$ is the stiffness matrix, $[m_{uu}]$ is the masse matrix. $[k_{gg}]$ is the geometric stiffness matrix of 5 × 5 dimensions, is symmetric and the non zero terms are as follows:

$$k_{gg}(4,4) = 1, \ k_{gg}(4,5) = 1, \ k_{gg}(5,4) = 1, \ k_{gg}(5,5) = 1.$$
(33)

The weak forme is then applied considering static problems, and the equation is simplified after integration by parts on RHS:

$$\int_{0}^{L} \left(\left\{ \delta \mathcal{E}_{\varepsilon} \right\}^{T} [k_{\varepsilon \varepsilon}] \left\{ \mathcal{E}_{\varepsilon} \right\} - \lambda \left\{ \delta \mathcal{E}_{\varepsilon}^{"} \right\}^{T} [k_{\varepsilon \varepsilon}] \left\{ \mathcal{E}_{\varepsilon}^{"} \right\} \right) dx$$

$$= \int_{0}^{L} \left(\delta w - \mu w^{"} \right) q \delta dx.$$
(34)

For free vibration analysis, after performing integration by parts, a weak form is derived for the following dynamic equation:

$$\int_{0}^{L} \left(\left\{ \delta \mathcal{E}_{\varepsilon} \right\}^{T} [k_{\varepsilon \varepsilon}] \left\{ \mathcal{E}_{\varepsilon} \right\} - \lambda \left\{ \delta \mathcal{E}_{\varepsilon}^{"} \right\}^{T} [k_{\varepsilon \varepsilon}] \left\{ \mathcal{E}_{\varepsilon}^{"} \right\} \right) dx$$
$$= \int_{0}^{L} \left(\left\{ \delta \mathcal{E}_{u} \right\}^{T} [m_{uu}] \left\{ \ddot{\mathcal{E}}_{u} \right\} + \mu \left\{ \delta \mathcal{E}_{u}^{"} \right\}^{T} [m_{uu}] \left\{ \ddot{\mathcal{E}}_{u}^{"} \right\} \right).$$
(35)

Deringer



Fig. 1 Beam element with the degrees of freedom per node

with $[N_u]$ and $[N_w]$ being the Hermite interpolation functions, q_{u_0} and q_w are the nodal degrees of freedom (dof) vectors of each elementary element (Fig. 1) while subscripts 1–2–3 are the node numbers ($\xi = -1, 0, +1$) (Fig. 1).

Let us consider the following vector q_e of total nodal dof for a generic elementary domain Ω_e :

$$\left\{q_{e}\right\}^{T} = \left[u_{0}^{(1)} u_{0}^{\prime(1)} w_{b}^{(1)} w_{b}^{\prime(1)} w_{b}^{\prime\prime(1)} w_{s}^{\prime(1)} w_{s}^{\prime(1)} w_{s}^{\prime\prime(1)} u_{0}^{\prime(3)} u_{0}^{\prime(3)} u_{0}^{\prime(2)} u_{0}^{\prime(2)} w_{b}^{\prime(2)} w_{b}^{\prime\prime(2)} w_{s}^{\prime\prime(2)} w_{s}^{\prime\prime(2)} w_{s}^{\prime\prime(2)} w_{s}^{\prime\prime(2)}\right].$$

$$(40)$$

Considering buckling problem subjected to axial force N_0 applied in the mid plane, the weak form is given after integration by parts on RHS as follows:

$$\int_{0}^{L} \left(\left\{ \delta \mathcal{E}_{\varepsilon} \right\}^{T} [k_{\varepsilon \varepsilon}] \left\{ \mathcal{E}_{\varepsilon} \right\} - \lambda \left\{ \delta \mathcal{E}_{\varepsilon}^{"} \right\}^{T} [k_{\varepsilon \varepsilon}] \left\{ \mathcal{E}_{\varepsilon}^{"} \right\} \right) dx$$
$$= \int_{0}^{L} \left(\left\{ \delta \mathcal{E}_{u} \right\}^{T} [k_{gg}] \left\{ \ddot{\mathcal{E}}_{u} \right\} + \mu \left\{ \delta \mathcal{E}_{u}^{"} \right\}^{T} [k_{gg}] \left\{ \ddot{\mathcal{E}}_{u}^{"} \right\} \right).$$
(36)

The above equations are used for FE modelenig, and this will be described in the next section.

5 Finite element approximations

To develop the finite element model, the beam is discretized into a set of elements of length l_e . The beam element given in Fig. 1 is defined by three nodes along the element local x-axis. The nodal coordinates x is approximated based on the reference length with respect to the reduced coordinate ξ by the following:

$$x(\xi) = \frac{1+\xi}{2} l_e.$$
 (37)

The generalized displacements and strain are given in (9) and (11) and have to be approximated by finite element method. In the present work, the Hermite interpolation is employed to satisfy C^1 and C^2 continuity requirement for the axial and transversal displacements, respectively. The displacements $u_0(\xi)$ and $w_i(\xi)$ are defined as follows:

where

From (26) and (27), the vectors $\{\varepsilon_u\}$ and $\{\varepsilon_{\varepsilon}\}$ are expressed from the dof vector $\{q_e\}$ using (38) and (39):

$$\{\varepsilon_u\} = [B_u] \{q_e\}$$

$$\{\varepsilon_\varepsilon\} = [B_\varepsilon] \{q_e\}$$

$$\{w_i''\} = [N_w'']^T \{q_{w_i}\}, \quad i = b, s$$

$$\{\varepsilon_u'\} = [B_u'] \{q_e\}$$

$$\{\varepsilon_\varepsilon'\} = [B_\varepsilon'] \{q_e\},$$

$$(41)$$

where $[B_u]$ and $[B_{\epsilon}]$ are 5 × 18 and 2 × 18 matrices, respectively, containing the shape function N_u , N_w and their derivative terms.

The final expressions of the system could be written as follows:

• Static analysis: a transversal load q is applied on the top surface of the beam, and we have the following system to solve:

$$[K]\{q\} = \{F\}.$$
(42)

• Free vibration analysis:

$$([K] - \omega^2[M])\{q\} = \{0\}.$$
(43)

 Buckling analysis: a constant axial force is acting through the mid-line and the deduce system is given by

$$([K] - N_0[K_g]) \{q\} = \{0\}, \tag{44}$$

where $\{q\}$ is the global dof vector of the beam.

[K], [M] and $[K_g]$, are the stiffness, mass and geometric stiffness matrices, respectively, and $\{F\}$ is the load vector. They are obtained by assembling the individual element contributions using the elementary matrices given as follows:

Where $\{q\}$ is the global dof vector of the beam. [K] is global the stiffness matrix, [M] is the mass matrix, $[K_g]$ is the geometric stiffness matrix and $\{F\}$ is the load vector. They are obtained by assembling the individual element contributions using the elementary matrices given as follows:

$$[K_{e}] = \int_{0}^{l} \left([B_{e}]^{T} [k_{ee}] [B_{e}] + \lambda [B_{e}']^{T} [k_{ee}] [B_{e}'] \right) dx$$

$$[M_{e}] = \int_{0}^{l} \left([B_{u}]^{T} [m_{uu}] [B_{u}] + \mu [B_{u}']^{T} [m_{uu}] [B_{u}'] \right) dx$$

$$[K_{ge}] = \int_{0}^{l} \left([B_{u}]^{T} [k_{gg}] [B_{u}] + \mu [B_{u}']^{T} [k_{gg}] [B_{u}'] \right) dx$$

$$\{F_{e}\} = q \int_{0}^{l} \left(\{N_{w}\}^{T} - \mu \{N_{w}''\}^{T} \right) dx.$$

(45)

6 Results and discussion

The first results are presented to test the robustness of the developed finite element model by considering problems for which analytical solutions are available. The study is carried out by varying parameters such as slenderness ratio S = L/h, nonlocal and strain gradient parameters ($\mu = ea^2$, $\lambda = l^2$). The results are presented to show the size dependency in the nonlocal response of the nanobeams.

The considered problem is presented as a straight nanobeams with fixed thickness h = 10 nm, and the length L (nm) is considered to be a variable. Different values of the slenderness ratio are considered allowing to study thick to thin beams $S = \{5, 10, 20, 50\}$. The values for nonlocal parameter μ (nm²) = (*ea*)² for the detailedd analysis are assumed to belong to $\{0, 1, 2, 3, 4\}$. The strain gradient parameter λ (nm²) = l^2 is considered to belong to $\{0, 1, 2, 3, 4\}$. Different Boundary conditions are considered, simply supported beam, clamped-simply supported, clamped–clamped, cantilever beam. The considered material is an isotropic with Young modulus *E* and Poisson's ratio *v*. In the present paper, the following dimensionless quantities are introduced:

$$\begin{split} \bar{w} &= w \frac{100E}{qhS^4} \\ \bar{\omega} &= \omega L^2 \sqrt{\frac{m}{EI}}, \ m = \rho h, \ I = \frac{h^3}{12} \\ \bar{N} &= N_0 \frac{L^2}{EI} \end{split}$$

6.1 Assessment of the present formulation

To verify the reliability of the present formulation, an assessment of the present formulation is carried out on a simply supported nanobeams subjected to uniform load. Before proceeding to the analysis, a convergence study is considered by varying the number of elements for both local and nonlocal nanobeams. The results are presented in Tables 1, 2 and 3 along with those of analytical solutions obtained using Navier approach. The tables present the dimensionless maximum deflection, dimensionless buckling loads and dimensionless fundamental frequency, respectively, for different values of slenderness ratio (L/h), nonlocal parameter (ea) and strain gradient parameter (l). It is seen from these tables that four elements' idealization is sufficient in obtaining converged results.

It can be seen that the nonlocal parameter and the strain gradient parameter have significant effects on the response of the nanobeam. With increasing in nonlocal parameter value, the dimensionless deflection value increases and the dimensionless critical buckling load and the frequency value decrease. Nonlocal parameter μ and strain gradient parameter l have the opposite effect. The results are compared to the analytical ones obtained using Navier approach and with those available in the literature [17, 18]. It is seen that from tables, the results obtained using the present formulation are found to be in good agreement with the analytical ones and with those in the literature.

Figures 2, 3 and 4 illustrate the influence of slenderness ratio of the simply supported nanobeam for different values of nonlocal and strain gradient parameters. It is clearly seen that when the nonlocal effect dominates ea > l, the dimensionless deflection is larger than those obtained by classical continuum theory l = ea, and the nanobeam is softened and becomes easy to deform. Also, the dimensionless buckling loads and the dimensionless fundamental frequency are lower than those of classical theory. However, when the strain gradient effect dominates l > ea, the deflection is lower than those of classical continuum theory l = ea, and the nanobeam is hardened and becomes difficult to deform. This is opposite to the case of buckling and vibration response. In addition, with the increasing slenderness ratio, the dimensionless deflection decreases when ea > land increases when l > ea, which is also counter to the situation of buckling and vibration response. Also, it can be seen that the differences between results predicted by classical theory and nonlocal strain gradient are significant for lower values of slenderness ratio but they are diminishing as the increase of slenderness ratio. Similar conclusions have also been observed about dynamic response based on the nonlocal strain gradient theory [17, 18, 40, 70].

6.2 Bending, vibration and buckling analysis of nanobeams

The second result is a nanobeam with one end fixed and the other simply supported. Tables 4, 5 and 6 depict the dimensionless maximum deflection, dimensionless buckling loads and dimensionless fundamental frequency for different values of nonlocal parameter (*ea*), strain gradient parameter (*l*) and slenderness ratio (*L/h*). From the tables, the deflection decreases with increase in nonlocal parameter value, the dimensionless critical buckling load and the dimensionless frequency decreases. The strain gradient parameter *l* has a

 Table 1
 Comparison of dimensionless maximum deflections of simply supported nanobeam

$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$	ea (nm)	Beam theory	L/h = 10			L/h = 20			L/h = 50		
O Present (FEM) No of elements 2 1.3345 1.2168 0.9598 1.3102 1.2794 1.1945 1.304 1.2984 1.2836 4 1.3344 1.2167 0.9597 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3044 1.2984 1.2836 16 1.3344 1.2167 0.9597 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3044 1.2984 1.2836 32 1.3344 1.2167 0.9597 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3044 1.2984 1.2836 BET [18] 1.3345 1.2169 0.9598 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3044 1.2984 1.2836 SSDBT [18] 1.3345 1.2169 0.9598 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3044 1.2984 1.2836 ISDBT [18] 1.3345 1.2167 0.9596 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3044 1.2844 1.2836 MO of elements 2 1.4623 1.3344 1.2676 1.3102			l = 0 nm	l = 1 nm	l = 2 nm	l = 0 nm	l = 1 nm	l = 2 nm	l = 0 nm	$l = 1 \mathrm{nm}$	l = 2 nm
No of elements - 2 1.345 1.2167 0.9597 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3044 1.2984 1.2836 8 1.3344 1.2167 0.9597 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3044 1.2984 1.2836 16 1.3344 1.2167 0.9597 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3044 1.2984 1.2836 32 1.3344 1.2167 0.9597 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3044 1.2984 1.2836 BTSIT[18] 1.3346 1.2169 0.9598 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 SSDBT[18] 1.3346 1.2169 0.9598 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 SSDBT[18] 1.3344 1.2167 0.9596 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 ASDBT[18] 1.3344 1.2167 0.9596 1.3102 1.2234 1.3	0	Present (FEM)									
2 1.3345 1.2168 0.9598 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2886 4 1.3344 1.2167 0.9597 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2884 1.2836 16 1.3344 1.2167 0.9597 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2884 1.2836 32 1.3344 1.2167 0.9597 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 FBF [18] 1.3021 1.2167 0.9597 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2823 TBT [18] 1.3346 1.2169 0.9598 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 SSDET [18] 1.3346 1.2169 0.9598 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2844 1.2836 HSDET [18] 1.3344 1.2167 0.9596 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.304 1.2844 1.2836		No of elements									
4 1,3344 1,2167 0.9597 1,3102 1,2794 1,1944 1,3034 1,2984 1,2836 8 1,3344 1,2167 0.9597 1,3102 1,2794 1,1944 1,3034 1,2984 1,2836 32 1,3344 1,2167 0.9597 1,3102 1,2794 1,1944 1,3034 1,2984 1,2836 BTS 1,3344 1,2167 0.9597 1,3102 1,2794 1,1944 1,3034 1,2984 1,2836 BTS 1,3346 1,2169 0.9598 1,3102 1,2794 1,1944 1,3034 1,2984 1,2836 SDBT [18] 1,3346 1,2169 0.9598 1,3102 1,2794 1,1944 1,3034 1,2984 1,2836 ESDBT [18] 1,3344 1,2167 0.9596 1,3102 1,2794 1,1944 1,3034 1,2984 1,2836 ESDBT [18] 1,3344 1,2167 0.9596 1,3102 1,2234 1,3084 1,3034 1,2886 <		2	1.3345	1.2168	0.9598	1.3102	1.2794	1.1945	1.3034	1.2984	1.2836
8 1.3344 1.2167 0.9597 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 16 1.3344 1.2167 0.9597 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 21 1.3344 1.2167 0.9597 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 EBT [18] 1.3021 1.1870 0.9959 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 TSDBT [18] 1.3346 1.2169 0.9598 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 SSDBT [18] 1.3346 1.2167 0.9596 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 BYDET [18] 1.3344 1.2167 0.9596 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 SDBT [18] 1.3344 1.0533 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2836		4	1.3344	1.2167	0.9597	1.3102	1.2794	1.1944	1.3034	1.2984	1.2836
16 1.3344 1.2167 0.9597 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 32 1.3344 1.2167 0.9597 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 EBFT[18] 1.3346 1.2167 0.9597 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 TBFT[18] 1.3346 1.2169 0.9598 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 SSDBTT[18] 1.3346 1.2169 0.9598 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 BSDBT[18] 1.3344 1.2167 0.9596 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 ASDBT[18] 1.3344 1.2167 0.9596 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2848 1.2836 ASDBT[18] 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 <td></td> <td>8</td> <td>1.3344</td> <td>1.2167</td> <td>0.9597</td> <td>1.3102</td> <td>1.2794</td> <td>1.1944</td> <td>1.3034</td> <td>1.2984</td> <td>1.2836</td>		8	1.3344	1.2167	0.9597	1.3102	1.2794	1.1944	1.3034	1.2984	1.2836
32 1.3344 1.2167 0.9597 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 EBT [18] 1.3041 1.2167 0.9597 1.3102 1.2715 1.1870 1.3034 1.2823 TBT [18] 1.3346 1.2169 0.9598 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 SSDBT [18] 1.3346 1.2168 0.9597 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 MSDBT [18] 1.3346 1.2169 0.9598 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 ASDBT [18] 1.3344 1.2167 0.9596 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 ASDBT [18] 1.3344 1.2167 0.9596 1.3102 1.2234 1.3034 1.2886 ASDBT [18] 1.3414 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 16 1.4620<		16	1.3344	1.2167	0.9597	1.3102	1.2794	1.1944	1.3034	1.2984	1.2836
Present (Navier) 1.3344 1.2167 0.9597 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 EBT [18] 1.3021 1.1870 0.9360 1.3021 1.2715 1.1870 1.3021 1.2974 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 TSDBT [18] 1.3346 1.2169 0.9598 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 SSDBT [18] 1.3346 1.2169 0.9596 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 ESDBT [18] 1.3344 1.2167 0.9596 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 ASDBT [18] 1.3344 1.2167 0.9596 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.2034 1.2886 ASDBT [18] 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 A 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234		32	1.3344	1.2167	0.9597	1.3102	1.2794	1.1944	1.3034	1.2984	1.2836
EBT [18] 1.321 1.1870 0.9360 1.3021 1.2715 1.1870 1.3021 1.2971 1.2823 TBT [18] 1.3346 1.2169 0.9598 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 SSDBT [18] 1.3345 1.2169 0.9598 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 BSDBT [18] 1.3344 1.2167 0.9596 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 ASDBT [18] 1.3344 1.2167 0.9596 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 ASDBT [18] 1.3344 1.2167 0.9596 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 ASDBT [18] 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 A 1.4620 1.3444 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886		Present (Navier)	1.3344	1.2167	0.9597	1.3102	1.2794	1.1944	1.3034	1.2984	1.2836
TBT [18] 1.3346 1.2169 0.9598 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 SSDBT [18] 1.3345 1.2168 0.9598 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 HSDBT [18] 1.3345 1.2169 0.9598 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 ESDBT [18] 1.3344 1.2167 0.9596 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 ASDBT [18] 1.3344 1.2167 0.9596 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 ASDBT [18] 1.3344 1.2167 0.9596 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 4 1.4619 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 16 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.288		EBT [18]	1.3021	1.1870	0.9360	1.3021	1.2715	1.1870	1.3021	1.2971	1.2823
TSDBT [18] 1.3346 1.2169 0.9598 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 SSDBT [18] 1.3345 1.2168 0.9597 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 ESDBT [18] 1.3344 1.2167 0.9596 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 ASDBT [18] 1.3344 1.2167 0.9596 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 Present (FEM) No of elements 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 4 1.4619 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 8 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 16 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 EBT [18] 1.4621 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.		TBT [18]	1.3346	1.2169	0.9598	1.3102	1.2794	1.1944	1.3034	1.2984	1.2836
SSDBT [18] 1.3345 1.2168 0.9597 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 HSDBT [18] 1.3344 1.2167 0.9596 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 ASDBT [18] 1.3344 1.2167 0.9596 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 ASDBT [18] 1.3344 1.2167 0.9596 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 1 Present (FEM) 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 16 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 32 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 EBT [18] 1.4621 1.3344 1.0535 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886		TSDBT [18]	1.3346	1.2169	0.9598	1.3102	1.2794	1.1944	1.3034	1.2984	1.2836
HSDBT [18] 1.3346 1.2169 0.9598 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 ASDBT [18] 1.3344 1.2167 0.9596 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 ASDBT [18] 1.3344 1.2167 0.9596 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 ASDBT [18] 1.3344 1.2167 0.9596 1.3102 1.2234 1.3044 1.2886 4 1.4619 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 4 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 32 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 BEBT [18] 1.4621 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.2034 1.2886		SSDBT [18]	1.3345	1.2168	0.9597	1.3102	1.2794	1.1944	1.3034	1.2984	1.2836
ESDBT [18] 1.3344 1.2167 0.9596 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 ASDBT [18] 1.3344 1.2167 0.9596 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 Present (FEM) 2 1.4623 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 4 1.4619 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 8 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 97 Present (Navier) 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 BT [18] 1.4622 1.3346 1.0535 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886		HSDBT [18]	1.3346	1.2169	0.9598	1.3102	1.2794	1.1944	1.3034	1.2984	1.2836
ASDBT [18] 1.3344 1.2167 0.9596 1.3102 1.2794 1.1944 1.3034 1.2984 1.2836 1 Present (FEM) No of elements - <td></td> <td>ESDBT [18]</td> <td>1.3344</td> <td>1.2167</td> <td>0.9596</td> <td>1.3102</td> <td>1.2794</td> <td>1.1944</td> <td>1.3034</td> <td>1.2984</td> <td>1.2836</td>		ESDBT [18]	1.3344	1.2167	0.9596	1.3102	1.2794	1.1944	1.3034	1.2984	1.2836
Present (FEM) No of elements 2 1.4623 1.3344 1.0534 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 4 1.4619 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 8 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 32 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 32 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 BTE [18] 1.4621 1.3346 1.0555 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 SSDBT [18] 1.4622 1.3346 1.0535 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 SSDBT [18] 1.4621 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.		ASDBT [18]	1.3344	1.2167	0.9596	1.3102	1.2794	1.1944	1.3034	1.2984	1.2836
No of elements 2 1.4623 1.3344 1.0534 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 4 1.4619 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 8 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 32 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 32 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3024 1.2886 EBT [18] 1.4622 1.3346 1.0535 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 SSDBT [18] 1.4621 1.3345 1.0535 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 SSDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 <td< td=""><td>1</td><td>Present (FEM)</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></td<>	1	Present (FEM)									
2 1.4623 1.3344 1.0534 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 4 1.4619 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 8 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 16 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 22 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 EBT [18] 1.4271 1.3021 1.0275 1.3333 1.3021 1.2157 1.3071 1.3021 1.2886 SDBT [18] 1.4622 1.3346 1.0535 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 SDBT [18] 1.4622 1.3346 1.0535 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 <td></td> <td>No of elements</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>		No of elements									
4 1.4619 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 8 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 16 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 32 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 BT 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 EBT [18] 1.4622 1.3346 1.0535 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 SSDBT [18] 1.4621 1.3345 1.0535 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 SSDBT [18] 1.4621 1.3346 1.0535 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 ESDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1		2	1.4623	1.3344	1.0534	1.3416	1.3102	1.2234	1.3084	1.3034	1.2886
8 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 16 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 32 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 BT 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3031 1.2886 EBT [18] 1.4622 1.3346 1.0535 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 SSDBT [18] 1.4621 1.3345 1.0535 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 SSDBT [18] 1.4622 1.3346 1.0535 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 ESDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3034 1.2886		4	1.4619	1.3344	1.0533	1.3416	1.3102	1.2233	1.3084	1.3034	1.2886
16 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 32 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 Present (Navier) 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 EBT [18] 1.4271 1.3021 1.0275 1.3333 1.3021 1.2157 1.3071 1.3021 1.2873 TBT [18] 1.4622 1.3346 1.0535 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 SSDBT [18] 1.4622 1.3346 1.0535 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 SSDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 ESDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 10 Present (FEM) 1.6875 1.3344		8	1.4620	1.3344	1.0533	1.3416	1.3102	1.2233	1.3084	1.3034	1.2886
32 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 Present (Navier) 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 EBT [18] 1.4271 1.3021 1.0275 1.3333 1.3021 1.2157 1.3071 1.3021 1.2873 TBT [18] 1.4622 1.3346 1.0535 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 SSDBT [18] 1.4622 1.3346 1.0535 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 SSDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 ESDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 ESDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3081		16	1.4620	1.3344	1.0533	1.3416	1.3102	1.2233	1.3084	1.3034	1.2886
Present (Navier) 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 EBT [18] 1.4271 1.3021 1.0275 1.3333 1.3021 1.2157 1.3071 1.3021 1.2873 TBT [18] 1.4622 1.3346 1.0535 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 SSDBT [18] 1.4621 1.3345 1.0535 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 SSDBT [18] 1.4621 1.3345 1.0535 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 BSDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 BSDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 BSDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.304 <td></td> <td>32</td> <td>1.4620</td> <td>1.3344</td> <td>1.0533</td> <td>1.3416</td> <td>1.3102</td> <td>1.2233</td> <td>1.3084</td> <td>1.3034</td> <td>1.2886</td>		32	1.4620	1.3344	1.0533	1.3416	1.3102	1.2233	1.3084	1.3034	1.2886
EBT [18] 1.4271 1.3021 1.0275 1.3333 1.3021 1.2157 1.3071 1.3021 1.2873 TBT [18] 1.4622 1.3346 1.0535 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 TSDBT [18] 1.4622 1.3346 1.0535 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 SSDBT [18] 1.4621 1.3345 1.0534 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 ESDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 ASDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 ASDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 ASDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.4359 1.4024 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183		Present (Navier)	1.4620	1.3344	1.0533	1.3416	1.3102	1.2234	1.3084	1.3034	1.2886
TBT [18] 1.4622 1.3346 1.0535 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 TSDBT [18] 1.4622 1.3346 1.0535 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 SSDBT [18] 1.4621 1.3345 1.0534 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 HSDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3346 1.0535 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 ESDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 ASDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 ASDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 ASDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.6353 1.3414 1.4359 1.4024 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034 1.8 1.8447 1.6875 <td></td> <td>EBT [18]</td> <td>1.4271</td> <td>1.3021</td> <td>1.0275</td> <td>1.3333</td> <td>1.3021</td> <td>1.2157</td> <td>1.3071</td> <td>1.3021</td> <td>1.2873</td>		EBT [18]	1.4271	1.3021	1.0275	1.3333	1.3021	1.2157	1.3071	1.3021	1.2873
TSDBT [18] 1.4622 1.3346 1.0535 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 SSDBT [18] 1.4621 1.3345 1.0534 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 HSDBT [18] 1.4622 1.3346 1.0535 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 ESDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 ASDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 ASDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 ASDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 ASDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.4358 1.4025 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034 ASDBT [18] 1.8447 1.6875 1.3344 1		TBT [18]	1.4622	1.3346	1.0535	1.3416	1.3102	1.2234	1.3084	1.3034	1.2886
SSDBT [18] 1.4621 1.3345 1.0534 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 HSDBT [18] 1.4622 1.3346 1.0535 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 ESDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 ASDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 ASDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 ASDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 I Present (FEM) No of elements		TSDBT [18]	1.4622	1.3346	1.0535	1.3416	1.3102	1.2234	1.3084	1.3034	1.2886
HSDBT [18] 1.4622 1.3346 1.0535 1.3416 1.3102 1.2234 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 ESDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 ASDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 ASDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 I Present (FEM)		SSDBT [18]	1.4621	1.3345	1.0534	1.3416	1.3102	1.2234	1.3084	1.3034	1.2886
ESDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 ASDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 Present (FEM)		HSDBT [18]	1.4622	1.3346	1.0535	1.3416	1.3102	1.2234	1.3084	1.3034	1.2886
ASDBT [18] 1.4620 1.3344 1.0533 1.3416 1.3102 1.2233 1.3084 1.3034 1.2886 1 Present (FEM) No of elements 2 1.8460 1.6872 1.3344 1.4359 1.4024 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034 4 1.8445 1.6875 1.3344 1.4358 1.4025 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034 8 1.8447 1.6875 1.3344 1.4358 1.4025 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034 16 1.8447 1.6875 1.3344 1.4358 1.4025 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034 32 1.8447 1.6875 1.3344 1.4358 1.4025 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034 BET [18] 1.8447 1.6875 1.3344 1.4358 1.4025 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034 BET [18] 1.8447 1.6875 1.3021 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 BET [18] 1.8450 1.6877		ESDBT [18]	1.4620	1.3344	1.0533	1.3416	1.3102	1.2233	1.3084	1.3034	1.2886
Present (FEM) No of elements 1.3034 1.4359 1.4024 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034 4 1.8445 1.6875 1.3344 1.4359 1.4024 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034 4 1.8445 1.6875 1.3344 1.4358 1.4025 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034 8 1.8447 1.6875 1.3344 1.4358 1.4025 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034 16 1.8447 1.6875 1.3344 1.4358 1.4025 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034 32 1.8447 1.6875 1.3344 1.4358 1.4025 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034 32 1.8447 1.6875 1.3344 1.4358 1.4025 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034 BET [18] 1.8447 1.6875 1.3344 1.4359 1.4026 1.3102 1.3224 1.3184 1.3034 <t< td=""><td></td><td>ASDBT [18]</td><td>1.4620</td><td>1.3344</td><td>1.0533</td><td>1.3416</td><td>1.3102</td><td>1.2233</td><td>1.3084</td><td>1.3034</td><td>1.2886</td></t<>		ASDBT [18]	1.4620	1.3344	1.0533	1.3416	1.3102	1.2233	1.3084	1.3034	1.2886
No of elements 2 1.8460 1.6872 1.3344 1.4359 1.4024 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034 4 1.8445 1.6875 1.3344 1.4358 1.4025 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034 8 1.8447 1.6875 1.3344 1.4358 1.4025 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034 16 1.8447 1.6875 1.3344 1.4358 1.4025 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034 32 1.8447 1.6875 1.3344 1.4358 1.4025 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034 32 1.8447 1.6875 1.3344 1.4358 1.4025 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034 EBT [18] 1.8447 1.6875 1.3344 1.4359 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 EBT [18] 1.8021 1.6475 1.3021 1.3221 1.3170 1.3021	1	Present (FEM)									
21.84601.68721.33441.43591.40241.31021.32341.31831.303441.84451.68751.33441.43581.40251.31021.32341.31831.303481.84471.68751.33441.43581.40251.31021.32341.31831.3034161.84471.68751.33441.43581.40251.31021.32341.31831.3034321.84471.68751.33441.43581.40251.31021.32341.31831.3034Ber [18]1.84271.68751.33441.43591.40261.31021.32341.31841.3034EBT [18]1.84211.68751.30211.42711.39401.30211.32211.31701.3021TBT [18]1.84501.68771.33461.43591.40261.31021.32341.31841.3034SSDBT [18]1.84501.68771.33461.43591.40261.31021.32341.31841.3034HSDBT [18]1.84501.68771.33461.43591.40261.31021.32341.31841.3034BSDBT [18]1.84471.68741.33461.43591.40261.31021.32341.31841.3034BSDBT [18]1.84471.68741.33441.43581.40261.31021.32341.31841.3034BSDBT [18]1.84471.68741.33441.43581.40261.31021.3234 <td< td=""><td></td><td>No of elements</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></td<>		No of elements									
41.84451.68751.33441.43581.40251.31021.32341.31831.303481.84471.68751.33441.43581.40251.31021.32341.31831.3034161.84471.68751.33441.43581.40251.31021.32341.31831.3034321.84471.68751.33441.43581.40251.31021.32341.31831.3034Present (Navier)1.84471.68751.33441.43591.40261.31021.32341.31841.3034EBT [18]1.80211.64751.30211.42711.39401.30211.32211.31701.3021TBT [18]1.84501.68771.33461.43591.40261.31021.32341.31841.3034SSDBT [18]1.84501.68771.33461.43591.40261.31021.32341.31841.3034HSDBT [18]1.84471.68761.33451.43581.40261.31021.32341.31841.3034ESDBT [18]1.84471.68761.33451.43581.40261.31021.32341.31841.3034ESDBT [18]1.84471.68741.33441.43581.40261.31021.32341.31841.3034Stolber [18]1.84471.68741.33441.43581.40261.31021.32341.31841.3034		2	1.8460	1.6872	1.3344	1.4359	1.4024	1.3102	1.3234	1.3183	1.3034
8 1.8447 1.6875 1.3344 1.4358 1.4025 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034 16 1.8447 1.6875 1.3344 1.4358 1.4025 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034 32 1.8447 1.6875 1.3344 1.4358 1.4025 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034 32 1.8447 1.6875 1.3344 1.4358 1.4025 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034 Ber [18] 1.8447 1.6875 1.3344 1.4359 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034 EBT [18] 1.8021 1.6475 1.3021 1.4271 1.3940 1.3021 1.3221 1.3170 1.3021 TBT [18] 1.8450 1.6877 1.3346 1.4359 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 SSDBT [18] 1.8450 1.6877 1.3346 1.4359 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 SSDBT [18] 1.8449 1.6876 1.3345 1.4358		4	1.8445	1.6875	1.3344	1.4358	1.4025	1.3102	1.3234	1.3183	1.3034
161.84471.68751.33441.43581.40251.31021.81021.81041.8004321.84471.68751.33441.43581.40251.31021.32341.31831.3034Present (Navier)1.84471.68751.33441.43591.40261.31021.32341.31831.3034EBT [18]1.80211.64751.30211.42711.39401.30211.32211.31701.3021TBT [18]1.84501.68771.33461.43591.40261.31021.32341.31841.3034SSDBT [18]1.84491.68761.33451.43581.40261.31021.32341.31841.3034HSDBT [18]1.84491.68761.33451.43581.40261.31021.32341.31841.3034HSDBT [18]1.84471.68741.33461.43591.40261.31021.32341.31841.3034HSDBT [18]1.84471.68741.33461.43591.40261.31021.32341.31841.3034		8	1.8447	1.6875	1.3344	1.4358	1.4025	1.3102	1.3234	1.3183	1.3034
32 1.8447 1.6875 1.3344 1.4358 1.4025 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034 Present (Navier) 1.8447 1.6875 1.3344 1.4359 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034 EBT [18] 1.8021 1.6475 1.3021 1.4271 1.3940 1.3021 1.3221 1.3170 1.3021 TBT [18] 1.8450 1.6877 1.3346 1.4359 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 SSDBT [18] 1.8450 1.6877 1.3346 1.4359 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 HSDBT [18] 1.8450 1.6877 1.3346 1.4359 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 HSDBT [18] 1.8449 1.6876 1.3345 1.4358 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 HSDBT [18] 1.8447 1.6877 1.3346 1.4359 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 HSDBT [18] 1.8447 1.6874 1.3344<		16	1.8447	1.6875	1.3344	1.4358	1.4025	1.3102	1.3234	1.3183	1.3034
Present (Navier) 1.8447 1.6875 1.3344 1.4359 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 EBT [18] 1.8021 1.6475 1.3021 1.4271 1.3940 1.3021 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 TBT [18] 1.8450 1.6877 1.3346 1.4359 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 TSDBT [18] 1.8450 1.6877 1.3346 1.4359 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 SSDBT [18] 1.8450 1.6877 1.3346 1.4359 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 HSDBT [18] 1.8449 1.6876 1.3345 1.4358 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 HSDBT [18] 1.8449 1.6877 1.3346 1.4359 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 ESDBT [18] 1.8447 1.6874 1.3344 1.4358 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 ESDBT [18] 1.8447 1.6874 <th< td=""><td></td><td>32</td><td>1.8447</td><td>1.6875</td><td>1.3344</td><td>1.4358</td><td>1.4025</td><td>1.3102</td><td>1.3234</td><td>1.3183</td><td>1.3034</td></th<>		32	1.8447	1.6875	1.3344	1.4358	1.4025	1.3102	1.3234	1.3183	1.3034
EBT [18] 1.8011 1.6475 1.3021 1.4271 1.3940 1.3021 1.3221 1.3170 1.3021 TBT [18] 1.8450 1.6877 1.3346 1.4359 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3170 1.3021 TBT [18] 1.8450 1.6877 1.3346 1.4359 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 SSDBT [18] 1.8449 1.6876 1.3345 1.4358 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 HSDBT [18] 1.8449 1.6876 1.3346 1.4359 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 HSDBT [18] 1.8449 1.6877 1.3346 1.4359 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 HSDBT [18] 1.8447 1.6874 1.3344 1.4358 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 ESDBT [18] 1.8447 1.6874 1.3344 1.4358 1.4025 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034		Present (Navier)	1.8447	1.6875	1 3344	1 4359	1 4026	1 3102	1 3234	1 3184	1 3034
TBT [18] 1.8450 1.6877 1.3346 1.4359 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 TSDBT [18] 1.8450 1.6877 1.3346 1.4359 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 SSDBT [18] 1.8449 1.6876 1.3345 1.4358 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 HSDBT [18] 1.8449 1.6876 1.3345 1.4358 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 HSDBT [18] 1.8449 1.6877 1.3346 1.4359 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 HSDBT [18] 1.8447 1.6874 1.3344 1.4358 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 ESDBT [18] 1.8447 1.6874 1.3344 1.4358 1.4025 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034		EBT [18]	1.8021	1.6675	1 3021	1 4271	1 3940	1 3021	1 3221	1 3170	1.3021
TSDBT [18] 1.8450 1.6877 1.3346 1.4359 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 SSDBT [18] 1.8449 1.6876 1.3345 1.4358 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 HSDBT [18] 1.8450 1.6877 1.3346 1.4359 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 HSDBT [18] 1.8450 1.6877 1.3346 1.4359 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 ESDBT [18] 1.8447 1.6874 1.3344 1.4358 1.4025 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034		TBT [18]	1.8450	1.6877	1.3346	1.4359	1.4026	1.3102	1.3234	1.3184	1.3034
SSDBT [18] 1.8449 1.6876 1.3345 1.4358 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3164 1.3034 HSDBT [18] 1.8450 1.6877 1.3346 1.4359 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 HSDBT [18] 1.8450 1.6877 1.3346 1.4359 1.4026 1.3102 1.3234 1.3184 1.3034 ESDBT [18] 1.8447 1.6874 1.3344 1.4358 1.4025 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034		TSDBT [18]	1 8450	1 6877	1 3346	1 4359	1 4026	1 3102	1 3234	1 3184	1 3034
HSDBT [18] 1.8450 1.6877 1.3346 1.4358 1.4026 1.3102 1.324 1.3164 1.3034 ESDBT [18] 1.8447 1.6874 1.3344 1.4358 1.4025 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034		SSDBT [18]	1.8449	1.6876	1.3345	1.4358	1.4026	1.3102	1.3234	1.3184	1.3034
ESDBT [18] 1.8447 1.6874 1.3344 1.4358 1.4025 1.3102 1.3234 1.3183 1.3034		HSDBT [18]	1.8450	1.6877	1.3346	1.4359	1.4026	1.3102	1.3234	1.3184	1.3034
		ESDBT [18]	1.8447	1.6874	1.3344	1.4358	1.4025	1.3102	1.3234	1.3183	1.3034
ASDBT [18] 1 8447 1 6874 1 3344 1 4358 1 4025 1 3102 1 3234 1 3183 1 3034		ASDBT [18]	1 8447	1 6874	1 3344	1 4358	1 4025	1 3102	1 3234	1 3183	1 3034

 Table 2
 Comparison of dimensionless buckling loads of simply supported nanobeam

$ \begin{array}{ c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c c$	ea (nm)	Beam theory	L/h = 10			L/h = 20			L/h = 50		
Present (FEM) No of elements Present (FEM) 2 9.6241 10.5740 13.4240 9.8070 10.0490 10.7751 9.8595 9.8985 10.0153 4 9.6240 10.5739 13.4235 9.8070 10.0490 10.7749 9.8595 9.8985 10.0152 16 9.6240 10.5739 13.4234 9.8070 10.0490 10.7749 9.8595 9.8985 10.0152 32 9.6240 10.5739 13.4234 9.8070 10.0490 10.7749 9.8595 9.8985 10.0152 Present (Navier) 9.6227 10.5713 13.4234 9.8070 10.0493 10.7746 9.8595 9.8984 100125 TSDBT [18] 9.6228 10.5725 13.4217 9.8067 10.0487 10.7746 9.8595 9.8984 100152 SDBT [18] 9.6242 10.5714 13.4237 9.8071 10.0491 10.7750 9.8595 9.8984 100152 ASDBT [18] 9.6242 10.2116 9.5709			l = 0 nm	l = 1 nm	l = 2 nm	l = 0 nm	l = 1 nm	l = 2 nm	l = 0 nm	$l = 1 \mathrm{nm}$	l = 2 nm
No of elements View	0	Present (FEM)			·		,				
2 9.6241 10.5740 13.4240 9.8070 10.0490 10.7751 9.8395 9.8985 10.0153 4 9.6240 10.5739 13.4234 9.8070 10.0490 10.7749 9.8595 9.8985 10.0152 16 9.6240 10.5739 13.4234 9.8070 10.0490 10.7749 9.8595 9.8985 10.0152 2 9.6240 10.5739 13.4234 9.8070 10.0490 10.7749 9.8595 9.8985 10.0152 EBT [18] 9.6227 10.5721 13.4216 9.8067 10.0487 10.7746 9.8595 9.8984 10.0152 TSDBT [18] 9.6228 10.5725 13.4217 9.8067 10.0487 10.7746 9.8595 9.8984 10.0152 SSDBT [18] 9.6242 10.5714 13.4237 9.8071 10.0497 10.7746 9.8595 9.8884 10.0152 HSDBT [18] 9.6242 10.571 13.4237 9.8071 10.0491 10.755 9.8295 <td></td> <td>No of elements</td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td> <td></td>		No of elements									
4 9.6240 10.5739 13.4235 9.8070 10.0490 10.7749 9.8595 9.8985 10.0152 16 9.6240 10.5739 13.4234 9.8070 10.0490 10.7749 9.8595 9.8985 10.0152 32 9.6240 10.5739 13.4234 9.8070 10.0490 10.7749 9.8595 9.8985 10.0152 BT 9.8066 10.8437 13.7660 9.8067 10.0487 10.7746 9.8595 9.8984 10.0125 TSDBT [18] 9.6221 10.5725 13.4217 9.8067 10.0487 10.7746 9.8595 9.8984 10.0152 SSDBT [18] 9.6222 10.5725 13.4217 9.8067 10.0487 10.7746 9.8595 9.8984 10.0152 SSDBT [18] 9.6242 10.5714 13.4237 9.8071 10.0491 10.7750 9.8956 9.8985 10.0152 ASDBT [18] 9.6242 10.5714 13.4237 9.8071 10.0491 10.7750 9.89		2	9.6241	10.5740	13.4240	9.8070	10.0491	10.7751	9.8596	9.8985	10.0153
8 9.6240 10.5739 13.4234 9.8070 10.0490 10.7749 9.8595 9.8985 10.0152 32 9.6240 10.5739 13.4234 9.8070 10.0490 10.7749 9.8595 9.8985 10.0152 Bresent (Navier) 9.6251 10.5751 13.4234 9.8070 10.0490 10.7749 9.8595 9.8985 10.0152 EBT [18] 9.6267 10.5724 13.4216 9.8067 10.0487 10.7746 9.8595 9.8984 10.0152 SSDBT [18] 9.6228 10.5725 13.4217 9.8067 10.0487 10.7746 9.8595 9.8984 10.0152 SSDBT [18] 9.6228 10.5724 13.4217 9.8067 10.0487 10.7746 9.8595 9.8985 10.0152 SSDBT [18] 9.6242 10.5741 13.4237 9.8071 10.0491 10.750 9.8595 9.8985 10.0152 ASDBT [18] 9.6240 12.2176 9.5709 9.8071 10.5155 9.8208		4	9.6240	10.5739	13.4235	9.8070	10.0490	10.7749	9.8595	9.8985	10.0152
16 9.6240 10.5739 13.4234 9.8070 10.0490 10.7749 9.8555 9.8985 10.0152 32 9.6240 10.5739 13.4234 9.8070 10.0493 10.7739 9.8595 9.8985 10.0152 EBT [18] 9.6251 10.5721 13.4234 9.8066 10.1131 10.8437 9.8596 9.8984 10.0125 TSDBT [18] 9.6227 10.5724 13.4216 9.8067 10.0487 10.7746 9.8595 9.8984 10.0125 SSDBT [18] 9.6223 10.5725 13.4217 9.8067 10.0487 10.7746 9.8595 9.8984 10.0152 SSDBT [18] 9.6242 10.5741 13.4237 9.8071 10.0491 10.7750 9.8595 9.8984 10.0152 ASDBT [18] 9.6242 10.5741 13.4237 9.8071 10.0491 10.7750 9.8595 9.8984 10.0152 ASDBT [18] 9.6242 10.5741 5.4237 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208		8	9.6240	10.5739	13.4234	9.8070	10.0490	10.7749	9.8595	9.8985	10.0152
32 9,6240 10,5739 13,4234 9,8073 10,0490 10,7749 9,8595 9,8985 10,0152 EBT [18] 9,6621 10,5751 13,4250 9,8073 10,0493 10,7739 9,8596 9,8085 10,0152 EBT [18] 9,6227 10,5724 13,4216 9,8067 10,0487 10,7746 9,8595 9,8984 10,0152 SDBT [18] 9,6228 10,5725 13,4217 9,8067 10,0487 10,7746 9,8595 9,8984 10,0152 SDBT [18] 9,6228 10,5725 13,4217 9,8067 10,0487 10,7746 9,8595 9,8984 10,0152 ASDBT [18] 9,6242 10,5741 13,4237 9,8071 10,0491 10,7750 9,8595 9,8985 10,0152 ASDBT [18] 9,6242 10,5741 13,4237 9,8071 10,5156 9,8208 9,8596 9,9759 4 8,7595 9,6240 12,2176 9,5709 9,8070 10,5155 9,8208 <t< td=""><td></td><td>16</td><td>9.6240</td><td>10.5739</td><td>13.4234</td><td>9.8070</td><td>10.0490</td><td>10.7749</td><td>9.8595</td><td>9.8985</td><td>10.0152</td></t<>		16	9.6240	10.5739	13.4234	9.8070	10.0490	10.7749	9.8595	9.8985	10.0152
Present (Navier) 9.6251 10.5751 13.4250 9.8073 10.0493 10.733 9.8596 9.8985 10.0125 EBT [18] 9.6696 10.8437 13.7660 9.8696 10.1131 10.8437 9.8696 10.0255 TBD T [18] 9.6227 10.5724 13.4216 9.8067 10.0487 10.7746 9.8595 9.8984 10.0152 SSDBT [18] 9.6228 10.5725 13.4217 9.8071 10.0488 10.7746 9.8595 9.8984 10.0152 ESDBT [18] 9.6242 10.5711 13.4237 9.8071 10.0491 10.7750 9.8595 9.8985 10.0152 ASDBT [18] 9.6242 10.5741 13.4237 9.8071 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.8985 10.0152 ASDBT [18] 9.6242 12.2176 9.5709 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 A 8.7595 9.6240 12.2176 9.5709 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595<		32	9.6240	10.5739	13.4234	9.8070	10.0490	10.7749	9.8595	9.8985	10.0152
EBT [18] 9.8696 10.8437 13.7660 9.8696 10.1131 10.8437 9.8696 9.0086 10.0152 TSDBT [18] 9.6227 10.5724 13.4216 9.8067 10.0487 10.7746 9.8595 9.8984 10.0152 SSDBT [18] 9.6228 10.5725 13.4217 9.8067 10.0487 10.7746 9.8595 9.8984 10.0152 ESDBT [18] 9.6242 10.5741 13.4237 9.8071 10.0481 10.7750 9.8595 9.8985 10.0152 ASDBT [18] 9.6242 10.5741 13.4237 9.8071 10.0491 10.7750 9.8595 9.8985 10.0152 ASDBT [18] 9.6242 12.2176 9.5709 9.8071 10.5156 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 4 8.7595 9.6240 12.2176 9.5709 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 32 8.7595 9.6240 12.2176 9.5709 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208 <t< td=""><td></td><td>Present (Navier)</td><td>9.6251</td><td>10.5751</td><td>13.4250</td><td>9.8073</td><td>10.0493</td><td>10.7753</td><td>9.8596</td><td>9.8985</td><td>10.0152</td></t<>		Present (Navier)	9.6251	10.5751	13.4250	9.8073	10.0493	10.7753	9.8596	9.8985	10.0152
TBT [18] 9.6227 10.5724 13.4216 9.807 10.0487 10.7746 9.8595 9.8984 10.0152 SSDBT [18] 9.6228 10.5725 13.4217 9.8067 10.0487 10.7746 9.8595 9.8984 10.0152 HSDBT [18] 9.6228 10.5725 13.4217 9.8067 10.0487 10.7746 9.8595 9.8984 10.0152 ISDBT [18] 9.6242 10.5741 13.4237 9.8071 10.0491 10.7750 9.8595 9.8985 10.0152 ASDBT [18] 9.6242 10.5741 13.4237 9.8071 10.0491 10.7750 9.8595 9.8985 10.0152 ASDBT [18] 9.6242 12.2181 9.5709 9.8070 10.5156 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 16 8.7595 9.6240 12.2176 9.5709 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208 9.8596 9.9758 16 8.7595 9.6240 12.2176 9.5709 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208 <t< td=""><td></td><td>EBT [18]</td><td>9.8696</td><td>10.8437</td><td>13.7660</td><td>9.8696</td><td>10.1131</td><td>10.8437</td><td>9.8696</td><td>9.9086</td><td>10.0255</td></t<>		EBT [18]	9.8696	10.8437	13.7660	9.8696	10.1131	10.8437	9.8696	9.9086	10.0255
TSDBT [18] 9.6228 10.5725 13.4217 9.8067 10.0487 10.7746 9.8955 9.8984 10.0152 SSDBT [18] 9.6228 10.5725 13.4227 9.8068 10.0488 10.7746 9.8595 9.8984 10.0152 ESDBT [18] 9.6242 10.5714 13.4237 9.8071 10.0491 10.750 9.8595 9.8985 10.0152 ASDBT [18] 9.6242 10.5714 13.4237 9.8071 10.0491 10.750 9.8595 9.8985 10.0152 ASDBT [18] 9.6242 10.5714 13.4237 9.8071 10.0491 10.750 9.8595 9.9759 ASDBT [18] 9.6240 12.2176 9.5709 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 B 8.7595 9.6240 12.2176 9.5709 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 32 8.7595 9.6251 12.2190 9.5706 9.8071 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595		TBT [18]	9.6227	10.5724	13.4216	9.8067	10.0487	10.7746	9.8595	9.8984	10.0152
SSDBT [18] 9.6231 10.5729 13.4222 9.8068 10.0488 10.7747 9.8595 9.8984 10.0152 HSDBT [18] 9.6242 10.5741 13.4217 9.8071 10.0491 10.7750 9.8595 9.8985 10.0152 ASDBT [18] 9.6242 10.5741 13.4237 9.8071 10.0491 10.7750 9.8595 9.8985 10.0152 ASDBT [18] 9.6242 10.5714 13.4237 9.8071 10.0491 10.7750 9.8595 9.8985 10.0152 No of clements 8.7595 9.6240 12.2176 9.5709 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 3 8.7595 9.6240 12.2176 9.5709 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 32 8.7595 9.6240 12.2176 9.5709 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 BEBT [18] 8.7583 9.6221 12.2160 9.5706 9.8067 <td></td> <td>TSDBT [18]</td> <td>9.6228</td> <td>10.5725</td> <td>13.4217</td> <td>9.8067</td> <td>10.0487</td> <td>10.7746</td> <td>9.8595</td> <td>9.8984</td> <td>10.0152</td>		TSDBT [18]	9.6228	10.5725	13.4217	9.8067	10.0487	10.7746	9.8595	9.8984	10.0152
HSDBT [18] 9.6228 10.5725 13.4217 9.8067 10.0487 10.7760 9.8955 9.8984 10.0152 LESDBT [18] 9.6242 10.5741 13.4237 9.8071 10.0491 10.7750 9.8595 9.8985 10.0152 ASDBT [18] 9.6242 10.5741 13.4237 9.8071 10.0491 10.7750 9.8595 9.8985 10.0152 ASDBT [18] 9.6242 12.2116 9.5709 9.8071 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9759 4 8.7595 9.6240 12.2176 9.5709 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 32 8.7595 9.6240 12.2176 9.5709 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208 9.8596 9.9758 32 8.7595 9.6240 12.2176 9.5712 9.8070 10.515 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 32 8.7595 9.6240 12.2160 9.5712 9.8077 10.515 9.8207 9.8595		SSDBT [18]	9.6231	10.5729	13.4222	9.8068	10.0488	10.7747	9.8595	9.8984	10.0152
ESDBT [18] 9.6242 10.5741 13.4237 9.8071 10.0491 10.7750 9.8955 9.8985 10.0152 ASDBT [18] 9.6242 10.5741 13.4237 9.8071 10.0491 10.750 9.8955 9.8985 10.0152 Present (FEM) No 6 8.7595 9.6240 12.2176 9.5709 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 8 8.7595 9.6240 12.2176 9.5709 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 16 8.7595 9.6240 12.2176 9.5709 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 32 8.7595 9.6240 12.2176 9.5709 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 32 8.7595 9.6240 12.2170 9.5712 9.8071 10.515 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 BEBT [18] 8.7633 9.6221 12.2159 9.5706 9.8067 10.5151		HSDBT [18]	9.6228	10.5725	13.4217	9.8067	10.0487	10.7746	9.8595	9.8984	10.0152
ASDBT [18] 9.6242 10.571 13.4237 9.8071 10.0491 10.7750 9.8595 9.8985 10.0152 1 Present (FEM) No of elements -		ESDBT [18]	9.6242	10.5741	13.4237	9.8071	10.0491	10.7750	9.8595	9.8985	10.0152
Present (FEM) No No 0		ASDBT [18]	9.6242	10.5741	13.4237	9.8071	10.0491	10.7750	9.8595	9.8985	10.0152
No of elements View	1	Present (FEM)									
2 8.7595 9.6242 12.2181 9.5709 9.8071 10.5156 9.8208 9.8596 9.9759 4 8.7595 9.6240 12.2176 9.5709 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 8 8.7595 9.6240 12.2176 9.5709 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 32 8.7595 9.6240 12.2176 9.5709 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 32 8.7595 9.6240 12.2176 9.5709 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 32 8.7595 9.6240 12.2176 9.5706 9.8071 10.5158 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 5DBT [18] 8.7583 9.6227 12.2159 9.5706 9.8067 10.5151 9.8207 9.8595 9.9758 SDBT [18] 8.7587 9.6231 12.2160 9.5706 9.8067 10.5151 9.8207 9.8595 <td< td=""><td></td><td>No of elements</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></td<>		No of elements									
4 8.7595 9.6240 12.2176 9.5709 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 8 8.7595 9.6240 12.2176 9.5709 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 32 8.7595 9.6240 12.2176 9.5709 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 Present (Nave 8.7605 9.6251 12.2190 9.5712 9.8073 10.5155 9.8208 9.8596 9.9758 BEBT [18] 8.7603 9.6227 12.2190 9.5716 9.8067 10.5151 9.8207 9.8595 9.9758 SDBT [18] 8.7583 9.6228 12.2160 9.5706 9.8067 10.5151 9.8207 9.8595 9.9758 SDBT [18] 8.7597 9.6242 12.2169 9.5706 9.8067 10.5151 9.8207 9.8595 9.9758 SDBT [18] 8.7597 9.6242 12.2179 9.5709 9.8071 10.5151 9.8208		2	8.7595	9.6242	12.2181	9.5709	9.8071	10.5156	9.8208	9.8596	9.9759
8 8.7595 9.6240 12.2176 9.5709 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 16 8.7595 9.6240 12.2176 9.5709 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 32 8.7595 9.6240 12.2176 9.5709 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 Present (Navier) 8.7605 9.6251 12.2190 9.5712 9.8073 10.5158 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 EBT [18] 8.7583 9.6227 12.2190 9.5706 9.8067 10.5151 9.8207 9.8595 9.9758 SSDBT [18] 8.7583 9.6228 12.2160 9.5706 9.8067 10.5151 9.8207 9.8595 9.9758 SSDBT [18] 8.7597 9.6242 12.2179 9.5709 9.8071 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 ASDBT [18] 8.7597 9.6242 12.2179 9.5709 9.8071 10.5155 9.8208		4	8.7595	9.6240	12.2176	9.5709	9.8070	10.5155	9.8208	9.8595	9.9758
16 8.7595 9.6240 12.2176 9.5709 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 32 8.7595 9.6240 12.2176 9.5709 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 Present (Navier) 8.7605 9.6251 12.2190 9.5712 9.8073 10.5155 9.8208 9.8596 9.9758 EBT [18] 8.9830 9.8696 12.5294 9.6320 9.8666 10.5151 9.8207 9.8595 9.9758 TSDBT [18] 8.7583 9.6228 12.2169 9.5706 9.8067 10.5151 9.8207 9.8595 9.9758 SSDBT [18] 8.7587 9.6228 12.2160 9.5706 9.8067 10.5151 9.8207 9.8595 9.9758 BSDBT [18] 8.7587 9.6242 12.2179 9.5709 9.8071 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9759 ASDBT [18] 8.7597 9.6242 12.2179 9.5709 9.8071 10.5155 9.8208		8	8.7595	9.6240	12.2176	9.5709	9.8070	10.5155	9.8208	9.8595	9.9758
32 8.7595 9.6240 12.2176 9.5709 9.8070 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 Present (Navier) 8.7605 9.6251 12.2190 9.5712 9.8073 10.5158 9.8208 9.8596 9.9758 EBT [18] 8.9830 9.8696 12.5294 9.6320 9.8696 10.5826 9.8308 9.8696 9.9860 TBT [18] 8.7583 9.6227 12.2160 9.5706 9.8067 10.5151 9.8207 9.8595 9.9758 SSDBT [18] 8.7587 9.6228 12.2160 9.5706 9.8067 10.5151 9.8207 9.8595 9.9758 BSDBT [18] 8.7587 9.6242 12.2179 9.5709 9.8071 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9758 ASDBT [18] 8.7597 9.6242 12.2179 9.5709 9.8071 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9759 ASDBT [18] 8.7597 9.6242 12.2179 9.5709 9.8071 10.5155		16	8.7595	9.6240	12.2176	9.5709	9.8070	10.5155	9.8208	9.8595	9.9758
Present (Navier) 8.7605 9.6251 12.2190 9.5712 9.8073 10.5158 9.8208 9.8596 9.9758 EBT [18] 8.9830 9.8696 12.5294 9.6320 9.8696 10.5826 9.8308 9.8696 9.9869 TBT [18] 8.7583 9.6227 12.2159 9.5706 9.8067 10.5151 9.8207 9.8595 9.9758 SSDBT [18] 8.7583 9.6228 12.2160 9.5706 9.8067 10.5151 9.8207 9.8595 9.9758 SSDBT [18] 8.7587 9.6242 12.2169 9.5709 9.8067 10.5151 9.8207 9.8595 9.9758 ASDBT [18] 8.7597 9.6242 12.2179 9.5709 9.8071 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9759 ASDBT [18] 8.7597 9.6242 12.2179 9.5709 9.8071 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9759 ASDBT [18] 8.7597 9.6242 12.2179 9.5709 9.8071 10.5155		32	8.7595	9.6240	12.2176	9.5709	9.8070	10.5155	9.8208	9.8595	9.9758
EBT [18] 8,9830 9,8696 12.5294 9,6320 9,8696 10.5826 9,8308 9,8696 9,9860 TBT [18] 8,7583 9,6227 12.2159 9,5706 9,8067 10.5151 9,8207 9,8595 9,9758 TSDBT [18] 8,7583 9,6228 12.2160 9,5706 9,8067 10.5151 9,8207 9,8595 9,9758 SSDBT [18] 8,7583 9,6228 12.2160 9,5706 9,8067 10.5151 9,8207 9,8595 9,9758 BSDBT [18] 8,7597 9,6242 12.2179 9,5709 9,8071 10.5155 9,8208 9,8595 9,9759 ASDBT [18] 8,7597 9,6242 12.2179 9,5709 9,8071 10.5155 9,8208 9,8595 9,9759 ASDBT [18] 8,7597 9,6242 12.2179 9,5709 9,8071 10.5155 9,8208 9,8595 9,9759 ASDBT [18] 8,7597 9,6242 12.2179 9,5709 9,8071 10.5155 <t< td=""><td></td><td>Present (Navier)</td><td>8.7605</td><td>9.6251</td><td>12.2190</td><td>9.5712</td><td>9.8073</td><td>10.5158</td><td>9.8208</td><td>9.8596</td><td>9.9758</td></t<>		Present (Navier)	8.7605	9.6251	12.2190	9.5712	9.8073	10.5158	9.8208	9.8596	9.9758
TBT [18] 8.7583 9.6227 12.2159 9.5706 9.8067 10.5151 9.8207 9.8595 9.9758 TSDBT [18] 8.7583 9.6228 12.2160 9.5706 9.8067 10.5151 9.8207 9.8595 9.9758 SSDBT [18] 8.7587 9.6231 12.2165 9.5706 9.8067 10.5151 9.8207 9.8595 9.9758 HSDBT [18] 8.7587 9.6231 12.2165 9.5706 9.8067 10.5151 9.8207 9.8595 9.9758 ESDBT [18] 8.7597 9.6242 12.2179 9.5709 9.8071 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9759 ASDBT [18] 8.7597 9.6242 12.2179 9.5709 9.8071 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9759 ASDBT [18] 8.7597 9.6242 12.2179 9.5709 9.8071 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9759 2 6.9000 7.5810 9.6240 8.9261 9.1463 9.8070 9.7063<		EBT [18]	8.9830	9.8696	12.5294	9.6320	9.8696	10.5826	9.8308	9.8696	9.9860
TSDBT [18] 8.7583 9.6228 12.2160 9.5706 9.8067 10.5151 9.8207 9.8595 9.9758 SSDBT [18] 8.7587 9.6231 12.2165 9.5706 9.8068 10.5152 9.8207 9.8595 9.9758 HSDBT [18] 8.7583 9.6228 12.2160 9.5706 9.8067 10.5151 9.8207 9.8595 9.9758 ESDBT [18] 8.7597 9.6242 12.2179 9.5709 9.8071 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9759 ASDBT [18] 8.7597 9.6242 12.2179 9.5709 9.8071 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9759 ASDBT [18] 8.7597 9.6242 12.2179 9.5709 9.8071 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9759 ASDBT [18] 8.7597 9.6242 12.2179 9.5709 9.8071 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9759 ASDBT [18] 6.9000 7.5810 9.6240 8.9261 9.1463 9.8070		TBT [18]	8.7583	9.6227	12.2159	9.5706	9.8067	10.5151	9.8207	9.8595	9.9758
SSDBT [18] 8.7587 9.6231 12.2165 9.5706 9.8068 10.5152 9.8207 9.8595 9.9758 HSDBT [18] 8.7583 9.6228 12.2160 9.5706 9.8067 10.5151 9.8207 9.8595 9.9758 ESDBT [18] 8.7597 9.6242 12.2179 9.5709 9.8071 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9759 ASDBT [18] 8.7597 9.6242 12.2179 9.5709 9.8071 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9759 ASDBT [18] 8.7597 9.6242 12.2179 9.5709 9.8071 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9759 ASDBT [18] 8.7597 9.6242 12.2179 9.5709 9.8071 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9759 ASDBT [18] 8.7597 9.6242 12.2179 9.5709 9.8071 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9759 ASDBT [18] 6.9000 7.5810 9.6240 8.9261 9.1463 9.8070		TSDBT [18]	8.7583	9.6228	12.2160	9.5706	9.8067	10.5151	9.8207	9.8595	9.9758
HSDBT [18] 8.7583 9.6228 12.2160 9.5706 9.8067 10.5151 9.8207 9.8595 9.9758 ESDBT [18] 8.7597 9.6242 12.2179 9.5709 9.8071 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9759 ASDBT [18] 8.7597 9.6242 12.2179 9.5709 9.8071 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9759 2 Present (FEM) No of elements - <		SSDBT [18]	8.7587	9.6231	12.2165	9.5706	9.8068	10.5152	9.8207	9.8595	9.9758
ESDBT [18] 8.7597 9.6242 12.2179 9.5709 9.8071 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9759 ASDBT [18] 8.7597 9.6242 12.2179 9.5709 9.8071 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9759 Present (FEM)		HSDBT [18]	8.7583	9.6228	12.2160	9.5706	9.8067	10.5151	9.8207	9.8595	9.9758
ASDBT [18] 8.7597 9.6242 12.2179 9.5709 9.8071 10.5155 9.8208 9.8595 9.9759 2 Present (FEM) No of elements 2 6.9000 7.5811 9.6244 8.9261 9.1464 9.8072 9.7063 9.7446 9.8596 4 6.9000 7.5810 9.6240 8.9261 9.1463 9.8070 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595 8 6.9000 7.5810 9.6240 8.9261 9.1463 9.8070 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595 16 6.9000 7.5810 9.6240 8.9261 9.1463 9.8070 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595 32 6.9000 7.5810 9.6240 8.9261 9.1463 9.8070 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595 32 6.9000 7.5810 9.6240 8.9263 9.1467 9.8073 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595 BET [18] 7.0761 7.7745 9.8696 8.9830 9.2047 9.8696 9.7162 9.7545 9.8696 EBT [18] 6.8991 7.5800		ESDBT [18]	8.7597	9.6242	12.2179	9.5709	9.8071	10.5155	9.8208	9.8595	9.9759
2 Present (FEM) No of elements 2 6.9000 7.5811 9.6244 8.9261 9.1464 9.8072 9.7063 9.7446 9.8596 4 6.9000 7.5810 9.6240 8.9261 9.1463 9.8070 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595 8 6.9000 7.5810 9.6240 8.9261 9.1463 9.8070 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595 16 6.9000 7.5810 9.6240 8.9261 9.1463 9.8070 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595 32 6.9000 7.5810 9.6240 8.9261 9.1463 9.8070 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595 32 6.9000 7.5810 9.6240 8.9261 9.1463 9.8070 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595 Present (Navier) 6.9008 7.5819 9.6251 8.9263 9.1467 9.8073 9.7063 9.7446 9.8596 EBT [18] 7.0761 7.7745 9.8696 8.9230 9.2047 <		ASDBT [18]	8.7597	9.6242	12.2179	9.5709	9.8071	10.5155	9.8208	9.8595	9.9759
No of elements 2 6.9000 7.5811 9.6244 8.9261 9.1464 9.8072 9.7063 9.7446 9.8596 4 6.9000 7.5810 9.6240 8.9261 9.1463 9.8070 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595 8 6.9000 7.5810 9.6240 8.9261 9.1463 9.8070 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595 16 6.9000 7.5810 9.6240 8.9261 9.1463 9.8070 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595 32 6.9000 7.5810 9.6240 8.9261 9.1463 9.8070 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595 32 6.9000 7.5810 9.6240 8.9261 9.1463 9.8070 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595 Bresent (Navier) 6.9008 7.5819 9.6251 8.9263 9.1467 9.8073 9.7063 9.7446 9.8596 EBT [18] 7.0761 7.7745 9.8696 8.9238 9.1460 9.8067 9.7062 9	2	Present (FEM)									
26.90007.58119.62448.92619.14649.80729.70639.74469.859646.90007.58109.62408.92619.14639.80709.70639.74469.859586.90007.58109.62408.92619.14639.80709.70639.74469.8595166.90007.58109.62408.92619.14639.80709.70639.74469.8595326.90007.58109.62408.92619.14639.80709.70639.74469.8595326.90007.58109.62408.92619.14639.80709.70639.74469.8595Present (Navier)6.90087.58199.62518.92639.14679.80739.70639.74469.8596EBT [18]7.07617.77459.86968.98309.20479.86969.71629.75459.8696TBT [18]6.89907.58009.62278.92589.14609.80679.70629.74459.8595SSDBT [18]6.89917.58009.62288.92589.14609.80679.70629.74459.8595SSDBT [18]6.89917.58009.62288.92589.14619.80689.70629.74459.8595HSDBT [18]6.89917.58009.62288.92589.14609.80679.70629.74459.8595ESDBT [18]6.90027.58129.62428.92619.14639.80719.7063 <td< td=""><td></td><td>No of elements</td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td><td></td></td<>		No of elements									
46.90007.58109.62408.92619.14639.80709.70639.74469.859586.90007.58109.62408.92619.14639.80709.70639.74469.8595166.90007.58109.62408.92619.14639.80709.70639.74469.8595326.90007.58109.62408.92619.14639.80709.70639.74469.8595326.90007.58109.62408.92619.14639.80709.70639.74469.8595Present (Navier)6.90087.58199.62518.92639.14679.80739.70639.74469.8596EBT [18]7.07617.77459.86968.98309.20479.86969.71629.74459.8595TSDBT [18]6.89907.58009.62278.92589.14609.80679.70629.74459.8595SSDBT [18]6.89917.58039.62318.92589.14609.80679.70629.74459.8595HSDBT [18]6.89917.58009.62288.92589.14609.80679.70629.74459.8595ESDBT [18]6.90027.58129.62428.92589.14609.80679.70629.74459.8595ESDBT [18]6.90027.58129.62428.92619.14639.80719.70639.74469.8595ASDBT [18]6.90027.58129.62428.92619.14639.8071		2	6.9000	7.5811	9.6244	8.9261	9.1464	9.8072	9.7063	9.7446	9.8596
8 6.9000 7.5810 9.6240 8.9261 9.1463 9.8070 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595 16 6.9000 7.5810 9.6240 8.9261 9.1463 9.8070 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595 32 6.9000 7.5810 9.6240 8.9261 9.1463 9.8070 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595 32 6.9000 7.5810 9.6240 8.9261 9.1463 9.8070 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595 Present (Navier) 6.9008 7.5819 9.6251 8.9263 9.1467 9.8073 9.7063 9.7446 9.8596 EBT [18] 7.0761 7.7745 9.8696 8.9830 9.2047 9.8696 9.7162 9.7445 9.8595 TSDBT [18] 6.8990 7.5800 9.6227 8.9258 9.1460 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 SSDBT [18] 6.8991 7.5803 9.6231 8.9258 9.1460 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 SDBT [18] 6.8991 7.5803 9.6231 8.9258 <td></td> <td>4</td> <td>6.9000</td> <td>7.5810</td> <td>9.6240</td> <td>8.9261</td> <td>9.1463</td> <td>9.8070</td> <td>9.7063</td> <td>9.7446</td> <td>9.8595</td>		4	6.9000	7.5810	9.6240	8.9261	9.1463	9.8070	9.7063	9.7446	9.8595
16 6.9000 7.5810 9.6240 8.9261 9.1463 9.8070 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595 32 6.9000 7.5810 9.6240 8.9261 9.1463 9.8070 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595 Present (Navier) 6.9008 7.5819 9.6251 8.9263 9.1467 9.8073 9.7063 9.7446 9.8596 EBT [18] 7.0761 7.7745 9.8696 8.9830 9.2047 9.8696 9.7162 9.7445 9.8595 TBT [18] 6.8990 7.5800 9.6227 8.9258 9.1460 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 SSDBT [18] 6.8991 7.5800 9.6228 8.9258 9.1460 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 SSDBT [18] 6.8994 7.5803 9.6231 8.9258 9.1460 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 SSDBT [18] 6.8991 7.5803 9.6231 8.9258 9.1460 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 ESDBT [18] 6.8991 7.5800 9.6228		8	6.9000	7.5810	9.6240	8.9261	9.1463	9.8070	9.7063	9.7446	9.8595
32 6.9000 7.5810 9.6240 8.9261 9.1463 9.8070 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595 Present (Navier) 6.9008 7.5819 9.6251 8.9263 9.1467 9.8073 9.7063 9.7446 9.8596 EBT [18] 7.0761 7.7745 9.8696 8.9830 9.2047 9.8696 9.7162 9.7545 9.8696 TBT [18] 6.8990 7.5800 9.6227 8.9258 9.1460 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 TSDBT [18] 6.8991 7.5800 9.6228 8.9258 9.1460 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 SSDBT [18] 6.8994 7.5803 9.6231 8.9258 9.1460 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 HSDBT [18] 6.8991 7.5800 9.6228 8.9258 9.1461 9.8068 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 SSDBT [18] 6.8991 7.5803 9.6218 8.9258 9.1461 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 ESDBT [18] 6.9002 7.5812 9.6228<		16	6.9000	7.5810	9.6240	8.9261	9.1463	9.8070	9.7063	9.7446	9.8595
Present (Navier) 6.9008 7.5819 9.6251 8.9263 9.1467 9.8073 9.7063 9.7446 9.8596 EBT [18] 7.0761 7.7745 9.8696 8.9830 9.2047 9.8696 9.7162 9.7545 9.8696 TBT [18] 6.8990 7.5800 9.6227 8.9258 9.1460 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 TSDBT [18] 6.8991 7.5800 9.6228 8.9258 9.1460 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 SSDBT [18] 6.8994 7.5803 9.6231 8.9258 9.1461 9.8068 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 HSDBT [18] 6.8991 7.5800 9.6228 8.9258 9.1461 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 SSDBT [18] 6.8991 7.5800 9.6228 8.9258 9.1461 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 HSDBT [18] 6.8991 7.5800 9.6228 8.9258 9.1461 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 ESDBT [18] 6.9002 7.5812 <td< td=""><td></td><td>32</td><td>6.9000</td><td>7.5810</td><td>9.6240</td><td>8.9261</td><td>9.1463</td><td>9.8070</td><td>9,7063</td><td>9.7446</td><td>9.8595</td></td<>		32	6.9000	7.5810	9.6240	8.9261	9.1463	9.8070	9,7063	9.7446	9.8595
EBT [18] 7.0761 7.7745 9.8696 8.9830 9.2047 9.8696 9.7162 9.7545 9.8696 TBT [18] 6.8990 7.5800 9.6227 8.9258 9.1460 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 TSDBT [18] 6.8991 7.5800 9.6228 8.9258 9.1460 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 SSDBT [18] 6.8994 7.5803 9.6231 8.9258 9.1461 9.8068 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 HSDBT [18] 6.8991 7.5800 9.6228 8.9258 9.1461 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 HSDBT [18] 6.8991 7.5800 9.6228 8.9258 9.1461 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 HSDBT [18] 6.8991 7.5800 9.6228 8.9258 9.1460 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 ESDBT [18] 6.9002 7.5812 9.6242 8.9261 9.1463 9.8071 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595 ASDBT [18] 6.9002 7.5812 9.624		Present (Navier)	6.9008	7.5819	9.6251	8.9263	9.1467	9.8073	9.7063	9.7446	9.8596
TBT [18] 6.8990 7.5800 9.6227 8.9258 9.1460 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 TSDBT [18] 6.8991 7.5800 9.6228 8.9258 9.1460 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 SSDBT [18] 6.8994 7.5803 9.6231 8.9258 9.1461 9.8068 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 HSDBT [18] 6.8991 7.5800 9.6228 8.9258 9.1461 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 HSDBT [18] 6.8991 7.5800 9.6228 8.9258 9.1461 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 HSDBT [18] 6.8991 7.5800 9.6228 8.9258 9.1460 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 ESDBT [18] 6.9002 7.5812 9.6242 8.9261 9.1463 9.8071 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595 ASDBT [18] 6.9002 7.5812 9.6242 8.9261 9.1463 9.8071 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595		EBT [18]	7.0761	7.7745	9.8696	8.9830	9.2047	9.8696	9.7162	9.7545	9.8696
TSDBT [18] 6.8991 7.5800 9.6228 8.9258 9.1460 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 SSDBT [18] 6.8994 7.5803 9.6228 8.9258 9.1461 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 HSDBT [18] 6.8991 7.5800 9.6228 8.9258 9.1461 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 HSDBT [18] 6.8991 7.5800 9.6228 8.9258 9.1460 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 ESDBT [18] 6.9002 7.5812 9.6242 8.9261 9.1463 9.8071 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595 ASDBT [18] 6.9002 7.5812 9.6242 8.9261 9.1463 9.8071 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595		TBT [18]	6.8990	7.5800	9.6227	8.9258	9.1460	9.8067	9.7062	9.7445	9.8595
SSDBT [18] 6.8994 7.5803 9.6231 8.9258 9.1461 9.8068 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 HSDBT [18] 6.8991 7.5800 9.6228 8.9258 9.1460 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 ESDBT [18] 6.9002 7.5812 9.6242 8.9261 9.1463 9.8071 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595 ASDBT [18] 6.9002 7.5812 9.6242 8.9261 9.1463 9.8071 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595		TSDBT [18]	6.8991	7.5800	9.6228	8.9258	9.1460	9.8067	9.7062	9.7445	9,8595
HSDBT [18] 6.8991 7.5800 9.6228 8.9258 9.1460 9.8067 9.7062 9.7445 9.8595 ESDBT [18] 6.9002 7.5812 9.6242 8.9261 9.1463 9.8071 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595 ASDBT [18] 6.9002 7.5812 9.6242 8.9261 9.1463 9.8071 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595		SSDBT [18]	6.8994	7.5803	9.6231	8.9258	9,1461	9.8068	9,7062	9.7445	9,8595
ESDBT [18] 6.9002 7.5812 9.6242 8.9261 9.1463 9.8071 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595 ASDBT [18] 6.9002 7.5812 9.6242 8.9261 9.1463 9.8071 9.7063 9.7446 9.8595		HSDBT [18]	6.8991	7.5800	9.6228	8.9258	9,1460	9.8067	9.7062	9.7445	9.8595
ASDBT [18] 6 9002 7 5812 9 6242 8 9261 9 1463 9 8071 9 7063 9 7446 9 8595		ESDBT [18]	6,9002	7.5812	9.6242	8,9261	9,1463	9.8071	9,7063	9,7446	9,8595
		ASDBT [18]	6.9002	7.5812	9.6242	8.9261	9,1463	9.8071	9.7063	9,7446	9,8595

Table 3 Comparison of dimensionless fundamental frequency of simply supported nanobeam

ea (nm)	Beam theory	L/h = 10			L/h = 50		
		l = 0 nm	l = 0.5 nm	l = 1 nm	l = 0 nm	l = 0.5 nm	$l = 1 \mathrm{nm}$
0	Present (FEM)						
	No of elements						
	2	9.7082	9.8272	10.1760	9.8630	9.8678	9.8824
	4	9.7082	9.8272	10.1760	9.8630	9.8678	9.8824
	8	9.7082	9.8272	10.1760	9.8630	9.8678	9.8824
	16	9.7082	9.8272	10.1760	9.8630	9.8678	9.8824
	32	9.7082	9.8272	10.1760	9.8630	9.8678	9.8824
	Present (Navier)	9.7082	9.8272	10.1760	9.8630	9.8678	9.8824
	EBT [17]	9.8293	9.9498	10.3029	9.8680	9.8728	9.8874
	TBT [17]	9.7075	9.8265	10.1753	9.8629	9.8678	9.8824
	SBT [17]	9.7077	9.8267	10.1755	9.8629	9.8678	9.8824
1	Present (FEM)						
	No of elements						
	2	9.2619	9.3754	9.7082	9.8435	9.8484	9.8630
	4	9.2618	9.3754	9.7082	9.8435	9.8484	9.8630
	8	9.2618	9.3754	9.7082	9.8435	9.8484	9.8630
	16	9.2618	9.3754	9.7082	9.8435	9.8484	9.8630
	32	9.2618	9.3754	9.7082	9.8435	9.8484	9.8630
	Present (Navier)	9.2618	9.3754	9.7082	9.8435	9.8484	9.8630
	EBT [17]	9.3774	9.4924	9.8293	9.8486	9.8534	9.8680
	TBT [17]	9.2612	9.3748	9.7075	9.8435	9.8484	9.8629
	SBT [17]	9.2614	9.3750	9.7077	9.8435	9.8484	9.8629
0	Present (FEM)						
	No of elements						
	2	8.2202	8.3210	8.6164	9.7860	9.7908	9.8053
	4	8.2202	8.3210	8.6163	9.7860	9.7908	9.8053
	8	8.2202	8.3210	8.6163	9.7860	9.7908	9.8053
	16	8.2202	8.3210	8.6163	9.7860	9.7908	9.8053
	32	8.2202	8.3210	8.6163	9.7860	9.7908	9.8053
	Present (Navier)	8.2202	8.3210	8.6163	9.7860	9.7908	9.8053
	EBT [17]	8.3228	8.4248	8.7238	9.7910	9.7958	9.8103
	TBT [17]	8.2196	8.3204	8.6157	9.7860	9.7908	9.8053
	SBT [17]	8.2198	8.3206	8.6159	9.7860	9.7908	9.8053

Fig. 2 Simply supported nanobeam: effect of slenderness ratio (L/h) on the deflections, **a** for different values of nonlocal parameter with $l^2 = 2$, **b** for different values of strain gradient parameter with $ea^2 = 2$





for different values of nonlocal parameter with $l^2 = 2$, **b** for different values of strain gradient parameter with $ea^2 = 2$

Table 4 Clamped-simply nanobeam: dimensionless maximum deflections

ea (nm)	L/h = 10			L/h = 20			L/h = 50			
	l = 0 nm	$l = 1 \mathrm{nm}$	l = 2 nm	l = 0 nm	$l = 1 \mathrm{nm}$	l = 2 nm	l = 0 nm	$l = 1 \mathrm{nm}$	l = 2 nm	
0	0.5478	0.3195	0.1706	0.5240	0.4098	0.3018	0.5174	0.4747	0.4272	
1	0.5801	0.3411	0.1831	0.5319	0.4164	0.3070	0.5186	0.4759	0.4283	
2	0.6771	0.4060	0.2203	0.5554	0.4362	0.3226	0.5223	0.4794	0.4316	

tendency to decrease the dimensionless deflection and also to increase the buckling load and the frequency.

The influence of slenderness ratio, the nonlocal parameter and strain gradient parameter is brought in Figs. 5, 6 and 7. According to the figures, it can be observed that the effects of the nonlocal and strain gradient parameters are qualitatively similar to that of simply supported nanobeam. However, with the increasing of slenderness ratio, the dimensionless deflection increases when l > ea or when l < ea. Also, contrary to the simply supported case, the differences between the dimensionless deflection predicted by classical theory and nonlocal strain gradient are weak for lower values of slenderness ratio, and they are diminishing as the increase of slenderness ratio.

The third analysis is performed assuming clamped-clamped straight nanobeams under a uniform load for the bending analysis. The dimensionless maximum deflection, dimensionless buckling loads and dimensionless fundamental frequency are highlighted in Tables 7, 8 and 9 assuming different nonlocal parameter and strain gradient parameter. It can be noted that the dimensionless maximum deflection are not affected by the nonlocal parameter, and the dimensionless maximum deflection decreases with the increase of strain gradient parameter λ . The results are qualitatively similar to that of clamped-simply supported beam with no effect of nonlocal parameter. The influence of slenderness ratio, the nonlocal parameter and strain gradient parameter are brought in Figs. 8, 9 and 10.

L/h	ea (nm)	First buckli	ing load		Second buc	ckling load		Third buckling load		
		l = 0 nm	l = 1 nm	l = 2 nm	l = 0 nm	l = 1 nm	l = 2 nm	l = 0 nm	l = 1 nm	l = 2 nm
5	0	2.4155	3.8287	5.8249	18.1308	39.3600	87.7649	37.9108	136.5981	404.3530
	1	2.1977	3.4132	5.0733	9.5836	18.3065	39.9924	10.9021	52.7773	180.7486
	2	1.7298	2.5469	3.5993	3.4750	11.7276	15.4692	3.9696	15.4980	53.2982
10	0	2.4616	3.0773	3.9339	21.0819	29.9254	46.5778	53.4035	94.7720	195.4781
	1	2.4021	2.9959	3.8182	17.2383	23.9431	36.2702	32.9784	55.5343	112.3988
	2	2.2397	2.7748	3.5059	11.1435	14.7124	21.3196	15.3574	23.9315	49.8174
20	0	2.4734	2.7442	3.0953	21.9796	25.4217	31.3975	59.5513	74.4738	106.6443
	1	2.4582	2.7265	3.0744	20.8192	24.0194	29.5614	51.5669	64.0462	90.7834
	2	2.4136	2.6749	3.0134	17.9724	20.5975	25.1076	36.7749	44.9262	62.2120
50	0	2.4768	2.5709	2.6863	22.2451	23.2645	24.8194	61.5403	65.3204	72.4764
	1	2.4743	2.5683	2.6835	22.0485	23.0556	24.5922	60.0525	63.7166	70.6604
	2	2.4670	2.5606	2.6753	21.4789	22.4507	23.9344	55.9917	59.3429	65.7140

 Table 5
 Clamped-simply nanobeam: dimensionless buckling loads

 Table 6
 Clamped-simply nanobeam: dimensionless fundamental frequencies

L/h	ea (nm)	First mode			Second mo	de		Third mode			
		l = 0 nm	l = 1 nm	l = 2 nm	l = 0 nm	l = 1 nm	l = 2 nm	l = 0 nm	l = 1 nm	l = 2 nm	
5	0	3.4254	5.0103	6.7106	18.5342	29.4441	43.0438	27.2417	84.0706	43.0438	
	1	3.1515	4.4874	5.8972	12.7079	18.7541	26.9064	23.6772	42.9708	71.6460	
10	0	3.5028	4.2674	5.1639	21.0100	26.7584	34.4589	55.3320	76.9570	108.9553	
	1	3.4244	4.1545	5.0079	18.3362	22.8261	28.7976	42.2444	56.7013	78.8647	
	2	3.2153	3.8596	4.6080	14.0481	17.0436	21.1093	28.6743	37.9554	53.0279	
20	0	3.5233	3.8819	4.2973	21.8264	24.4156	27.9957	60.0283	69.4160	84.5772	
	1	3.5030	3.8574	4.2678	20.9969	23.4030	26.7284	55.0325	63.1483	76.2705	
	2	3.4438	3.7863	4.1825	18.9742	20.9782	23.7531	45.3876	51.4739	61.4571	
50	0	3.5292	3.6591	3.8106	22.0758	22.9504	24.0898	61.6279	64.4705	68.8419	
	1	3.5259	3.6556	3.8067	21.9337	22.7974	23.9228	60.6962	63.4614	67.7211	
	2	3.5161	3.6450	3.7953	21.5227	22.3554	23.4414	58.1370	60.6985	64.6637	

Fig. 5 Clamped-simply supported nanobeam: effect of slenderness ratio (*L/h*) on the deflections, **a** for different values of nonlocal parameter with $l^2 = 2$, **b** for different values of strain gradient parameter with $ea^2 = 2$



Fig. 7 Clamped-simply supported nanobeam: effect of slenderness ratio (*L/h*) on the free vibration, **a** for different values of nonlocal parameter with $l^2 = 2$, **b** for different values of strain gradient parameter with $ea^2 = 2$



Table 7 Clamped–clamped nanobeam: dimensionless	ea (nm)	L/h = 10			L/h = 20			L/h = 50		
maximum deflections		l = 0 nm	$l = 1 \mathrm{nm}$	l = 2 nm	l = 0 nm	$l = 1 \mathrm{nm}$	l = 2 nm	l = 0 nm	$l = 1 \mathrm{nm}$	l = 2 nm
	0	0.2873	0.1217	0.0521	0.2641	0.1742	0.1076	0.2575	0.2217	0.1854
	1	0.2873	0.1217	0.0521	0.2641	0.1742	0.1076	0.2575	0.2217	0.1854
	2	0.2873	0.1217	0.0521	0.2641	0.1742	0.1076	0.2575	0.2217	0.1854

 Table 8
 Clamped-clamped nanobeam: dimensionless buckling loads

L/h	ea (nm)	First buckli	ing load		Second buc	kling load		Third buckling load			
		l = 0 nm	l = 1 nm	l = 2 nm	l = 0 nm	l = 1 nm	l = 2 nm	l = 0 nm	l = 1 nm	l = 2 nm	
5	0	2.4155	3.8287	5.8249	18.1308	39.3600	87.7649	37.9108	136.5981	404.3530	
	1	2.1977	3.4132	5.0733	9.5836	18.3065	39.9924	10.9021	52.7773	180.7486	
	2	1.7298	2.5469	3.5993	3.4750	11.7276	15.4692	3.9696	15.4980	53.2982	
10	0	2.4616	3.0773	3.9339	21.0819	29.9254	46.5778	53.4035	94.7720	195.4781	
	1	2.4021	2.9959	3.8182	17.2383	23.9431	36.2702	32.9784	55.5343	112.3988	
	2	2.2397	2.7748	3.5059	11.1435	14.7124	21.3196	15.3574	23.9315	49.8174	
20	0	2.4734	2.7442	3.0953	21.9796	25.4217	31.3975	59.5513	74.4738	106.6443	
	1	2.4582	2.7265	3.0744	20.8192	24.0194	29.5614	51.5669	64.0462	90.7834	
	2	2.4136	2.6749	3.0134	17.9724	20.5975	25.1076	36.7749	44.9262	62.2120	
50	0	2.4768	2.5709	2.6863	22.2451	23.2645	24.8194	61.5403	65.3204	72.4764	
	1	2.4743	2.5683	2.6835	22.0485	23.0556	24.5922	60.0525	63.7166	70.6604	
	2	2.4670	2.5606	2.6753	21.4789	22.4507	23.9344	55.9917	59.3429	65.7140	

Fig. 8 Clamped–clamped nanobeam: effect of slenderness ratio (*L/h*) on the deflections, **a** for different values of nonlocal parameter with $l^2 = 2$, **b** for different values of strain gradient parameter with $ea^2 = 2$

Fig. 9 Clamped–clamped nanobeam: effect of slenderness ratio (*L/h*) on the buckling, **a** for different values of nonlocal parameter with $l^2 = 2$, **b** for different values of strain gradient parameter with $ea^2 = 2$





The last analysis is about cantilevered nano-beams under uniform load and the results are presented in Tables 10, 11 and 12. From these tables, unlike in the case of simply supported or clamped-simply supported beam, the deflection decreases with the increase of the nonlocal parameter *ea* or strain gradient *l*values. However, the decrease in deflection is high compared to those of clamped case. The effect of slenderness ratio on the response of cantilever nanobeams is plotted in Figs. 11, 12 and 13 for different values of nonlocal parameter and strain gradient parameter. The results are qualitatively similar to that of clamped–clamped supported beam.

From the results presented in Tables 4 and 12, we can find an interesting phenomenon is that for clamped–clamped,



Fig. 12 Cantilever nanobeam: effect of slenderness ratio (*L/h*) on the buckling, **a** for different values of nonlocal parameter with $l^2 = 2$, **b** for different values of strain gradient parameter with $ea^2 = 2$

 Table 9
 Clamped-clamped nanobeam: dimensionless fundamental frequencies

L/h	ea (nm)	First mode			Second mo	de		Third mode			
		l = 0 nm	l = 1 nm	l = 2 nm	l = 0 nm	l = 1 nm	l = 2 nm	l = 0 nm	l = 1 nm	l = 2 nm	
5	0	3.4254	5.0103	6.7106	18.5342	29.4441	43.0438	27.2417	84.0706	43.0438	
	1	3.1515	4.4874	5.8972	12.7079	18.7541	26.9064	23.6772	42.9708	71.6460	
	2	2.5946	3.5313	4.5155	8.1506	11.8915	17.2785	13.6783	25.1129	42.3937	
10	0	3.5028	4.2674	5.1639	21.0100	26.7584	34.4589	55.3320	76.9570	108.9553	
	1	3.4244	4.1545	5.0079	18.3362	22.8261	28.7976	42.2444	56.7013	78.8647	
	2	3.2153	3.8596	4.6080	14.0481	17.0436	21.1093	28.6743	37.9554	53.0279	
20	0	3.5233	3.8819	4.2973	21.8264	24.4156	27.9957	60.0283	69.4160	84.5772	
	1	3.5030	3.8574	4.2678	20.9969	23.4030	26.7284	55.0325	63.1483	76.2705	
	2	3.4438	3.7863	4.1825	18.9742	20.9782	23.7531	45.3876	51.4739	61.4571	
50	0	3.5292	3.6591	3.8106	22.0758	22.9504	24.0898	61.6279	64.4705	68.8419	
	1	3.5259	3.6556	3.8067	21.9337	22.7974	23.9228	60.6962	63.4614	67.7211	
	2	3.5161	3.6450	3.7953	21.5227	22.3554	23.4414	58.1370	60.6985	64.6637	

Table 10 Cantilever nanobeam: dimensionless maximum deflections

ea (nm)	L/h = 10			L/h = 20			L/h = 50			
	l = 0 nm	$l = 1 \mathrm{nm}$	l = 2 nm	l = 0 nm	$l = 1 \mathrm{nm}$	l = 2 nm	l = 0 nm	$l = 1 \mathrm{nm}$	l = 2 nm	
0	4.4712	2.5784	1.5580	4.4005	3.3485	2.5263	4.3805	3.9553	3.5276	
1	4.3472	2.4934	1.4961	4.3695	3.3229	2.5050	4.3755	3.9507	3.5233	
2	3.9752	2.2386	1.3105	4.2765	3.2460	2.4413	4.3606	3.9369	3.5105	

Engineering with Computers (2022) 38 (Suppl 1):S647-S665

Table 11 Cantilever nanobeam: dimensionless buckling loads

L/h	ea (nm)	First buckli	ing load		Second bud	kling load		Third buckling load			
		l = 0 nm	l = 1 nm	l = 2 nm	l = 0 nm	l = 1 nm	l = 2 nm	l = 0 nm	l = 1 nm	l = 2 nm	
5	0	2.4155	3.8287	5.8249	18.1308	39.3600	87.7649	37.9108	136.5981	404.3530	
	1	2.1977	3.4132	5.0733	9.5836	18.3065	39.9924	10.9021	52.7773	180.7486	
	2	1.7298	2.5469	3.5993	3.4750	11.7276	15.4692	3.9696	15.4980	53.2982	
10	0	2.4616	3.0773	3.9339	21.0819	29.9254	46.5778	53.4035	94.7720	195.4781	
	1	2.4021	2.9959	3.8182	17.2383	23.9431	36.2702	32.9784	55.5343	112.3988	
	2	2.2397	2.7748	3.5059	11.1435	14.7124	21.3196	15.3574	23.9315	49.8174	
20	0	2.4734	2.7442	3.0953	21.9796	25.4217	31.3975	59.5513	74.4738	106.6443	
	1	2.4582	2.7265	3.0744	20.8192	24.0194	29.5614	51.5669	64.0462	90.7834	
	2	2.4136	2.6749	3.0134	17.9724	20.5975	25.1076	36.7749	44.9262	62.2120	
50	0	2.4768	2.5709	2.6863	22.2451	23.2645	24.8194	61.5403	65.3204	72.4764	
	1	2.4743	2.5683	2.6835	22.0485	23.0556	24.5922	60.0525	63.7166	70.6604	
	2	2.4670	2.5606	2.6753	21.4789	22.4507	23.9344	55.9917	59.3429	65.7140	

Table 12 Cantilever nanobeam: dimensionless fundamental frequencies

L/h	ea (nm)	First mode			Second mo	de		Third mode			
		l = 0 nm	l = 1 nm	l = 2 nm	l = 0 nm	l = 1 nm	l = 2 nm	l = 0 nm	l = 1 nm	l = 2 nm	
5	0	3.4254	5.0103	6.7106	18.5342	29.4441	43.0438	27.2417	84.0706	43.0438	
	1	3.1515	4.4874	5.8972	12.7079	18.7541	26.9064	23.6772	42.9708	71.6460	
	2	2.5946	3.5313	4.5155	8.1506	11.8915	17.2785	13.6783	25.1129	42.3937	
10	0	3.5028	4.2674	5.1639	21.0100	26.7584	34.4589	55.3320	76.9570	108.9553	
	1	3.4244	4.1545	5.0079	18.3362	22.8261	28.7976	42.2444	56.7013	78.8647	
	2	3.2153	3.8596	4.6080	14.0481	17.0436	21.1093	28.6743	37.9554	53.0279	
20	0	3.5233	3.8819	4.2973	21.8264	24.4156	27.9957	60.0283	69.4160	84.5772	
	1	3.5030	3.8574	4.2678	20.9969	23.4030	26.7284	55.0325	63.1483	76.2705	
	2	3.4438	3.7863	4.1825	18.9742	20.9782	23.7531	45.3876	51.4739	61.4571	
50	0	3.5292	3.6591	3.8106	22.0758	22.9504	24.0898	61.6279	64.4705	68.8419	
	1	3.5259	3.6556	3.8067	21.9337	22.7974	23.9228	60.6962	63.4614	67.7211	
	2	3.5161	3.6450	3.7953	21.5227	22.3554	23.4414	58.1370	60.6985	64.6637	

clamped-simply supported and cantilever boundary conditions, when the nonlocal parameter is equal to the material length scale parameter, the buckling loads and natural frequencies predicted by nonlocal strain gradient theory are higher than those obtained by classical continuum theory (ea = l = 0), contrary for the case of maximum deflection. This indicates that the combined effects of nonlocal and strain gradient depend not only on the relative magnitude of the two scale parameters but also on the boundary conditions.



7 Conclusion

The size-dependent bending, vibration and buckling analysis of nanobeams is investigated using finite element approach and based on nonlocal strain gradient theory using a novel two variable trigonometric shear deformation beams theory. The size effects are evaluated by introducing a nonlocal parameter and strain gradient parameter. The robustness and the reliability of the developed finite element model are tested using analytical solutions. Navier's method is employed to get the analytical solutions for bending, vibration and buckling responses of a simply supported nanobeam. A parametric study is conducted to bring out the influence of various parameters such as nonlocal parameter, strain gradient parameter and slenderness ratio considering different boundary conditions. The following main points can be drawn from the present study:

- 1. The present formulation is in good agreement with those of analytical results and with those of the literature.
- 2. The response of the nanobeam depends largely on the nonlocal parameter, strain gradient parameter and slenderness ratio and it can be even qualitatively different.
- With increasing the nonlocal parameter value, the dimensionless deflection value increases, the dimensionless critical buckling load and the frequency value decrease.
- 4. The nanobeam could exhibit either stiffness-softening effect or stiffness-hardening effect, which depends on the relative magnitude of the nonlocal parameter and the material length scale parameter.

The present novel two-variable theory is not only accurate but also simple in predicting the size-dependent bending, vibration and buckling analysis of nanobeams.

References

- Lau KT, Gu C, Hui D (2006) A critical review on nanotube and nanotube/nanoclay related polymer composite materials. Compos Part B Eng 37(6):425–436
- Malekzadeh P, Setoodeh A, Beni AA (2011) Small scale effect on the free vibration of orthotropic arbitrary straight-sided quadrilateral nanoplates. Compos Struct 93(7):1631–1639
- Bouazza M, Becheri T, Boucheta A, Benseddiq N (2016) Thermal buckling analysis of nanoplates based on nonlocal elasticity theory with four-unknown shear deformation theory resting on Winkler–Pasternak elastic foundation. Int J Comput Methods Eng Sci Mech 17(5–6):362–373
- 4. Motezaker M, Jamali M, Kolahchi R (2020) Application of differential cubature method for nonlocal vibration, buckling and bending response of annular nanoplates integrated by piezoelectric layers based on surface-higher order nonlocal-piezoelasticity theory. J Comput Appl Math 369:112625
- Motezaker M, Kolahchi R (2017) Seismic response of concrete columns with nanofiber reinforced polymer layer. Comput Concrete 20(3):361–368
- Qian Z, Hui Y, Rinaldi M, Liu F, Kar S (2013) Single transistor oscillator based on a graphene-aluminum nitride nano plate resonator. In: 2013 joint European frequency and time forum international frequency control symposium (EFTF/IFC), pp 559–561
- Tong X, DiLabio GA, Clarkin OJ, Wolkow RA (2004) Ringopening radical clock reactions for hybrid organic silicon surface nanostructures: a new self-directed growth mechanism and kinetic insights. Nano Lett 4(2):357–360
- Reddy B, Dorvel BR, Go J et al (2011) High-k dielectric Al2O3 nanowire and nanoplate field effect sensors for improved PH sensing. Biomed Microdev 13(2):335–44
- 9. Zhang Y, Chang G, Liu S, Lu W, Tian J, Sun X (2011) A new preparation of au nanoplates and their application for glucose sensing. Biosens Bioelectron 28(1):344–348
- Ding J, Zhang K, Wei G, Su Z (2015) Fabrication of polypyrrole nanoplates decorated with silver and gold nanoparticles for sensor applications. RSC Adv 5:69745–69752
- Tang X, Lai KWC (2014) Quantitative study of AFM-based nanopatterning of graphene nanoplate. In: 14th IEEE International Conference on Nanotechnology, pp 54–57
- Jeong W, Lee M, Lee H, Ken B, Park JY (2016) Ultraflat au nanoplates as a new building block for molecular electronics. Nanotechnology 27(21):215601

- Nan T, Hui Y, Rinaldi M, Sun NX (2013) Self-Biased 215MHz Magnetoelectric NEMS Resonator for Ultra-Sensitive DC Magnetic Field Detection. Scientific Reports 3
- Hui Y, Gomez-Diaz JS, Qian Z, Alù A, Rinaldi M (2016) Plasmonic piezoelectric nanomechanical resonator for spectrally selective infrared sensing. Nat Commun 7:11249
- Ekinci KL, Roukes ML (2005) Nanoelectromechanical systems. Rev Sci Instrum 76(6):061101
- Houari MSA, Bessaim A, Bernard F, Tounsi A, Hassan S (2018) Buckling analysis of new quasi-3D FG nanobeams based on nonlocal strain gradient elasticity theory and variable length scale parameter. Steel Compos Struct 28:13–24
- Lu L, Guo X, Zhao J (2017) Size-dependent vibration analysis of nanobeams based on the nonlocal strain gradient theory. Int J Eng Sci 116:12–24
- Lu L, Guo X, Zhao J (2017) A unified nonlocal strain gradient model for nanobeams and the importance of higher order terms. Int J Eng Sci 119:265–277
- Eringen A (1972) Nonlocal polar elastic continua. Int J Eng Sci 10(1):1–16
- Eringen AC (1983) On differential equations of nonlocal elasticity and solutions of screw dislocation and surface waves. J Appl Phys 54(9):4703–4710
- Mindlin RD (1964) Micro-structure in linear elasticity. Arch Ration Mech Anal 16:51–78
- 22. Mindlin R (1965) Second gradient of strain and surface-tension in linear elasticity. Int J Solids Struct 1(4):417–438
- Papargyri-Beskou S, Tsepoura K, Polyzos D, Beskos D (2003) Bending and stability analysis of gradient elastic beams. Int J Solids Struct 40(2):385–400
- Yang F, Chong A, Lam D, Tong P (2002) Couple stress based strain gradient theory for elasticity. Int J Solids Struct 39(10):2731–2743
- 25. Askes H, Aifantis EC (2009) Gradient elasticity and flexural wave dispersion in carbon nanotubes. Phys Rev B 80:195412
- Civalek Ömer, Demir Çiğdem (2011) Bending analysis of microtubules using nonlocal Euler–Bernoulli beam theory. Appl Math Model 35(5):2053–2067
- 27. Eltaher M, Khater M, Emam SA (2016) A review on nonlocal elastic models for bending, buckling, vibrations, and wave propagation of nanoscale beams. Appl Math Model 40(5):4109–4128
- Barati MR, Zenkour AM, Shahverdi H (2016) Thermo-mechanical buckling analysis of embedded nanosize FG plates in thermal environments via an inverse cotangential theory. Compos Struct 141:203–212
- Merzouki T, Ganapathi M, Polit O (2017) A nonlocal higher-order curved beam finite model including thickness stretching effect for bending analysis of curved nanobeams. Mech Adv Mater Struct 26:1–17
- Ganapathi M, Merzouki T, Polit O (2018) Vibration study of curved nanobeams based on nonlocal higher-order shear deformation theory using finite element approach. Compos Struct 184:821–838
- Thai H-T, Vo TP, Nguyen T-K, Kim S-E (2017) A review of continuum mechanics models for size-dependent analysis of beams and plates. Compos Struct 177:196–219
- Fleck N, Hutchinson J (1993) A phenomenological theory for strain gradient effects in plasticity. J Mech Phys Solids 41(12):1825–1857
- Lam D, Yang F, Chong A, Wang J, Tong P (2003) Experiments and theory in strain gradient elasticity. J Mech Phys Solids 51(8):1477–1508
- 34. Stölken J, Evans A (1998) A microbend test method for measuring the plasticity length scale. Acta Mater 46(14):5109–5115

- Ebrahimi F, Barati MR, Dabbagh A (2016) A nonlocal strain gradient theory for wave propagation analysis in temperaturedependent inhomogeneous nanoplates. Int J Eng Sci 107:169–182
- Reddy J (2011) Microstructure-dependent couple stress theories of functionally graded beams. J Mech Phys Solids 59(11):2382–2399
- Li Y, Feng W, Cai Z (2014) Bending and free vibration of functionally graded piezoelectric beam based on modified strain gradient theory. Compos Struct 115:41–50
- Mohammadimehr M, Farahi MJ, Alimirzaei S (2016) Vibration and wave propagation analysis of twisted micro-beam using strain gradient theory. Appl Math Mech 37(10):1375–1392
- Li L, Hu Y, Ling L (2015) Flexural wave propagation in smallscaled functionally graded beams via a nonlocal strain gradient theory. Compos Struct 133:1079–1092
- Li L, Li X, Hu Y (2016) Free vibration analysis of nonlocal strain gradient beams made of functionally graded material. Int J Eng Sci 102:77–92
- Xu X-J, Wang X-C, Zheng M-L, Ma Z (2017) Bending and buckling of nonlocal strain gradient elastic beams. Compos Struct 160:366–377
- 42. Li X, Li L, Hu Y, Ding Z, Deng W (2017) Bending, buckling and vibration of axially functionally graded beams based on nonlocal strain gradient theory. Compos Struct 165:250–265
- 43. Sahmani S, Aghdam MM, Rabczuk T (2018) Nonlinear bending of functionally graded porous micro/nano-beams reinforced with graphene platelets based upon nonlocal strain gradient theory. Compos Struct 186:68–78
- 44. Allam MNM, Radwan AF (2019) Nonlocal strain gradient theory for bending, buckling, and vibration of viscoelastic functionally graded curved nanobeam embedded in an elastic medium. Adv Mech Eng 11(4):1687814019837067
- 45. Radwan AF, Sobhy M (2018) A nonlocal strain gradient model for dynamic deformation of orthotropic viscoelastic graphene sheets under time harmonic thermal load. Physica B 538:74–84
- Ghugal YM, Shimpi RP (2001) A review of refined shear deformation theories for isotropic and anisotropic laminated beams. J Reinf Plast Compos 20(3):255–272
- Motezaker M, Eyvazian A (2020) Buckling load optimization of beam reinforced by nanoparticles. Struct Eng Mech 73(5):481–486
- Castellazzi G, Krysl P, Bartoli I (2013) A displacement-based finite element formulation for the analysis of laminated composite plates. Compos Struct 95:518–527
- Reddy JN (1984) A simple higher-order theory for laminated composite plates. ASME J Appl Mech 51(4):745–752
- 50. Kolahchi R, Hosseini H, Fakhar MH, Taherifar R, Mahmoudi M (2019) A numerical method for magneto-hygro-thermal postbuckling analysis of defective quadrilateral graphene sheets using higher order nonlocal strain gradient theory with different movable boundary conditions. Comput Math Appl 78(6):2018–2034
- Daikh AA, Bensaid I, Zenmour AM (2020) Temperature dependent thermomechanical bending response of functionally graded sandwich plates. Eng Res Express 2(1):015006
- Touratier M (1991) An efficient standard plate theory. Int J Eng Sci 29(8):901–916
- Soldatos K (1992) A transverse shear deformation theory for homogeneous monoclinic plates. Acta Mech 94(3–4):195–220
- Keshtegar B, Bagheri M, Meng D, Kolahchi R, Trung N-T (2020) Fuzzy reliability analysis of nanocomposite zno beams using hybrid analytical-intelligent method. Eng Comput 1–16
- 55. Keshtegar B, Tabatabaei J, Kolahchi R, Trung N-T (2020) Dynamic stress response in the nanocomposite concrete pipes with internal fluid under the ground motion load. Adv Concrete Construct 9(3):327–335
- 56. Karama M, Afaq K, Mistou S (2003) Mechanical behaviour of laminated composite beam by the new multi-layered laminated

- 57. Hajmohammad MH, Kolahchi R, Zarei MS, Nouri AH (2019) Dynamic response of auxetic honeycomb plates integrated with agglomerated CNT-reinforced face sheets subjected to blast load based on visco-sinusoidal theory. Int J Mech Sci 153:391–401
- Farokhian A, Kolahchi R (2020) Frequency and instability responses in nanocomposite plate assuming different distribution of CNTS. Struct Eng Mech 73(5):555–563
- Thai H-T (2012) A nonlocal beam theory for bending, buckling, and vibration of nanobeams. Int J Eng Sci 52:56–64
- Levy M (1877) Mémoire sur la théorie des plaques élastiques planes. Journal de mathématiques pures et appliquées 219–306
- Abualnour M, Houari MSA, Tounsi A, Mahmoud S et al (2018) A novel quasi-3D trigonometric plate theory for free vibration analysis of advanced composite plates. Compos Struct 184:688–697
- Eringen AC (1972) Nonlocal polar elastic continua. Int J Eng Sci 10:1–16
- 63. Eringen AC, Edelen DGB (1972) On nonlocal elasticity. Int J Eng Sci 10:233–248
- Eringen AC (1983) On differential equations of nonlocal elasticity and solutions of screw dislocation and surface waves. J Appl Phys 54:4703–4710

- Aifantis K, Willis J (2005) The role of interfaces in enhancing the yield strength of composites and polycrystals. J Mech Phys Solids 53(5):1047–1070
- Aifantis EC (1992) On the role of gradients in the localization of deformation and fracture. Int J Eng Sci 30(10):1279–1299
- Lim C, Zhang G, Reddy J (2015) A higher-order nonlocal elasticity and strain gradient theory and its applications in wave propagation. J Mech Phys Solids 78:298–313
- Li L, Hu Y, Ling L (2016) Wave propagation in viscoelastic single-walled carbon nanotubes with surface effect under magnetic field based on nonlocal strain gradient theory. Physica E 75:118–124
- 69. Mouffoki A, Adda Bedia E, Mohammed Sid Ahmed H, Tounsi A, Hassan S (2017) Vibration analysis of nonlocal advanced nanobeams in hygro-thermal environment using a new two-unknown trigonometric shear deformation beam theory. Smart Struct Syst 20:369–383
- Li L, Hu Y, Li X (2016) Longitudinal vibration of size-dependent rods via nonlocal strain gradient theory. Int J Mech Sci 115–116:135–144

Publisher's Note Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.