REPORT



# Oceanic patterns of thermal stress and coral community degradation on the island of Mauritius

T. R. McClanahan<sup>1</sup> [•](http://orcid.org/0000-0001-5821-3584) Nyawira A. Muthiga<sup>1,2</sup>

Received: 24 March 2020 / Accepted: 14 October 2020 / Published online: 31 October 2020 - Springer-Verlag GmbH Germany, part of Springer Nature 2020

Abstract Knowing the responses of high-latitude corals to thermal impacts will be critical to predicting the possibility for range expansion of reefs provoked by climate change. We, therefore, tested how oceanographic and island geography variation and subsequent interactions between chronic and acute environmental stresses would influence the temperate corals of Mauritius ( $\sim 20^{\circ}$ S). Specifically, we predicted higher impacts of thermal stress due to rare events on ocean-impacted windward than leeward reefs. To test this prediction, surveys of benthic cover and corals in the shallow lagoon's perimeter reefs were repeated between 2004 and 2019—an interval with frequent warm thermal anomalies. Hard and soft coral cover declined 40% and 83%, respectively, and erect algae increased 78% over the 15-yr interval. Coral taxa were distributed along a Montipora-community axis dominant on the island's leeward reefs and an Acropora-axis dominant on the windward reefs. Nine of the 30 originally encountered subgenera were not observed in the second sampling, of which most losses were on the windward reefs and among taxa that were initially uncommon during the initial 2004 sampling. The largest declines occurred in the southeast

Topic Editor Mark Vermeij

Electronic supplementary material The online version of this article [\(https://doi.org/10.1007/s00338-020-02015-4](https://doi.org/10.1007/s00338-020-02015-4)) contains supplementary material, which is available to authorized users.

where rare acute stress was higher and open-ocean conditions interacted strongly with the island. The north and western corals experienced less acute stress and greater persistence of taxa. Searching an additional 15 sites in 2019 found six of the missing coral taxa, often in deeper reef edges. Screening of potential environmental variables indicated that that skewness of the degree heating weeks and thermal stress anomalies were the strongest predictor of the changes. A chronic stress metric was more difficult to identify but water flow variability and chlorophyll-a concentrations were part of the oceanographic conditions associated with attenuated responses to acute stress. Frequent acute stress was associated with lower thermal acclimation rates over the 15-yr interval and more evident for the dominant than subdominant taxa. The extra-equatorial location of Mauritius will not ensure latitudinal sanctuary, apart from the leeward reefs.

Keywords Biogeography · Climate change · Coral bleaching - Land–sea interactions - Extinction - Indian Ocean

## Introduction

Predictions of the demise of coral reefs due to climate change are dire (van Hooidonk et al. [2016](#page-21-0)). While largescale thermal stress and associated changes in coral communities are evident (Ateweberhan et al. [2011](#page-19-0); Donner et al. [2017;](#page-19-0) Hughes et al. [2018;](#page-19-0) Sully et al. [2019](#page-20-0)), the spatial scale and heterogeneity of these observations are complex and less understood (McClanahan et al. [2011](#page-20-0), [2015;](#page-20-0) Heron et al. [2016](#page-19-0)). Thermal stress and its effects on specific taxa are also complicated and possibly changing as the climate warms (McClanahan et al.

 $\boxtimes$  T. R. McClanahan tmcclanahan@wcs.org

Wildlife Conservation Society, Global Marine Programs, Bronx, NY 10460, USA

<sup>2</sup> Wildlife Conservation Society, Kenya Marine Program, Mombasa 80107, Kenya

[2019a](#page-20-0), [2020a](#page-20-0), [b\)](#page-20-0). Moreover, making accurate predictions for an increasingly warm and stressful climate is challenged by variable resistance, mortality, acclimation, recovery, and genetic adaptation responses among taxa (Palumbi et al. [2014](#page-20-0)). Consequently, the spatial, temporal, and biological complexity of responses needs to be better understood to establish the priorities required for improved management (Darling et al. [2019](#page-19-0)).

Islands provide unique geomorphologies that are an opportunity to better understand climate impacts. For example, the circular nature of many volcanic islands and subsequent interaction with ocean currents provide a natural experiment for evaluating ocean currents and reef interactions. Ocean–land interactions are expected to create distinct thermal and stress environments and variable acclimation and resistance of corals (Golbuu et al. [2007](#page-19-0); Couch et al. [2017](#page-19-0)). For example, ocean exposed or windward reefs generally experience stable oceanic and lowlevel chronic temperature variability. Low thermal variability is expected to reduce acclimation and promote lower tolerance to rare thermal anomalies (McClanahan et al. [2005](#page-20-0); Safaie et al. [2018\)](#page-20-0). Leeward reefs, in contrast, are expected to experience more variable water flow and temperature variability that may acclimate corals to acute stress created by episodic thermal anomalies (Baker et al. [2013;](#page-19-0) Cunning et al. [2015;](#page-19-0) Gove et al. [2016\)](#page-19-0). The island of Mauritius is ringed by coral reefs and variable oceanographic conditions that provide an opportunity to better understand coral responses to the interactions between chronic background and acute stress conditions (Fig. [1](#page-2-0)). Mauritius is most influenced by strong ocean currents that directly impact the southeast side due to the interaction between the Indian Ocean South Equatorial Current, Mascarene Plateau, and Mascarene Islands of La Reunion and Mauritius (Pous et al. [2014\)](#page-20-0).

Unusually warm thermal anomalies have been observed in Mauritius and affected corals via bleaching and subsequent mortality (Fig. [2\)](#page-3-0) (Pillay et al. [2002a](#page-20-0), [b;](#page-20-0) Elliot et al. [2018\)](#page-19-0). Analyses of coral cover data collected between 1998 and 2010, for example, indicated that coral mortality began around 2005, was geographically variable, and subsequently followed by periods of mortality and recovery (Elliot et al. [2018](#page-19-0)). Therefore, the conditions of repeated thermal stress and the circular island geomorphology create an opportunity to test the role of the proposed ocean–land interactions on coral resilience. Field surveys of coral taxa response to bleaching conducted during a moderate thermal stress event in 2004 found that bleaching was highest in reefs with faster water flow and low background temperature variation. These conditions were located on the eastern and southern reefs of the island where ocean currents directly impact the island (McClanahan et al. [2005](#page-20-0); Pous et al. [2014](#page-20-0)). Consequently, it was hypothesized that corals, usually accustomed to high water flow and stable temperatures, bleached and potentially died when these conditions changed rapidly during the 2004 summer. Therefore, doldrum conditions that reduce wind speeds, water flow, and spike water temperatures should be particularly deadly for corals on windward island locations where environmental conditions are often stable and good for coral health. The frequency of rare conditions is expected to be critical to identify environments where corals are at risk due to increasing and often extreme variability promoted by climate change.

Water flow improves coral health, growth and can reduce responses to thermal stress, such as bleaching (Nakamura and van Woesik [2001\)](#page-20-0). However, when these benign conditions change rapidly, corals acclimated to high water flow and stable temperatures are expected to bleach and die more frequently (McClanahan and Maina [2003](#page-20-0)). Thus, there can be large differences in chronic and acute stress and subsequent bleaching responses when either tides or winds are the primarily drivers of water flow. An interruption in wind-driven currents will create acute stress. In contrast, tidal currents are more predictable, chronic, and able to buffer episodic acute interruptions. Coral acclimation and bleaching responses should, therefore, differ when unusual inter-annual thermal stress occurs between tidal and wind-driven water flow environments. Circular islands provide natural experimental conditions to test the role of wind-driven water flow because their convex shorelines create different windward and leeward current patterns. When circular islands are also oceanic and have steep coasts, such as Mauritius, then the small and uniform tides make them ideal locations to study oceanland interactions.

We asked how the shallow coral taxa and communities in Mauritius changed across a 15-yr interval between 2 yrs experiencing warm thermal anomalies, specifically 2004 and 2019. First, would the most severe and acute temperature extremes impact the ocean-dominated windward more than the leeward environments due to higher and more stable current speeds and low variation in background or chronic temperatures on windward locations (McClanahan et al.  $2007$ ; Côté and Darling  $2010$ ; Safaie et al. [2018](#page-20-0))? And, second, could these patterns in land-sea interactions, predict the changes in coral cover, number of taxa, and the composition of the coral communities? The conditions of low to moderate background but larger aperiodic and rare current flow and thermal variation were predicted to be more evident on the island's south and eastern than the north and western reefs. In contrast, the island's ocean current-protected sides of the north and western were predicted to experience moderate to high background variation and less frequent extreme aperiodic thermal stress. Sea surface temperature's (SST)

<span id="page-2-0"></span>

Fig. 1 Map of Mauritius, marine managed area locations, and the study sites. Site points indicate the percent changes in number of observed coral genera between 2004 and 2019. Taxa observed in 2004

metrics of skewness, kurtosis, and degree heating weeks (DHWs) were expected to reflect these ocean-land interactions. Further, we predicted that taxa should respond to these different environments by displaying differential bleaching, mortality, and acclimation over time. Finally, taxa that were uncommon, most susceptible to thermal stress, and acclimating the least to heat stress were predicted to be most susceptible to population declines. Assessment of these hypotheses and descriptions of change were made possible by repeating coral surveys on reefs surrounding the Mauritian island during the 2004 and 2019 warm seasons over a 15-yr period when a number of thermal anomalies and bleaching events were reported.

# Materials and methods

## Field methods

The primary sites we selected were shallow  $( $3$ -m deep at$ low tide) coral dominated hard-bottom environments

but not 2019 are shown in red letters for the specific sampled sites. Colored inset shows current speeds based on the study by Pous et al. ([2014\)](#page-20-0)

within fringing reef lagoons protected from direct impacts of ocean currents and waves. Sites were located around the circular coastlines of the island and included some fisheries managed areas (Fig. 1). These sites were marked by GPS in the summer (January to March) of 2004 and revisited in 2019. One site marked in 2004 could not be found, and this resulted in a total of 12 repeated sites. In order to determine if taxa missing between sampling intervals were present in fore reefs and deeper water, an additional 15 sites were sampled in 2019, in variable water depths water (ranging between 0.7 and 20 m) and across the lagoon to the fore reef.

During each survey, an observer assessed coral bleaching across a series of haphazardly placed replicate (15 to 20) quadrats ( $\sim 1.5$  m<sup>2</sup>) during a 40- to 60-min swim. Within each quadrat, hard coral colonies  $(> 5 \text{ cm})$  were identified to the genus (Moothien-Pillay et al. [2002a](#page-20-0), [b](#page-20-0)) and scored for bleaching severity. Severity was scored using seven categories:  $c0$ —normal;  $c1$ —pale;  $c2$ —0–20% bleached; c3—21–50% bleached; c4—51–80% bleached,  $c5$ —81–100% bleached;  $c6$ —recently dead and using a

<span id="page-3-0"></span>

Fig. 2 Long-term time series of a temperature and b current flow data time series for the main studies sites with trend lines in black connecting averages. Sites in the legend organized from north (top) to south (bottom). Data are the quarterly values for each year

weighted formula (McClanahan et al. [2007\)](#page-20-0). Within each quadrat, observers also estimated the average percent cover of live hard coral, live soft coral, and erect macroalgae to the nearest 5% (e.g., fleshy or calcareous algae in all three phyla that were taller than filamentous turf such as Sargassum, Padina, Amphiroa,, and Halimeda). Samples of numbers of colonies per taxa were standardized to 40-min to make comparison sites by the same sampling effort. To evaluate coral community composition, we estimated the relative abundance of taxa from each survey as the number of observed colonies divided by the total number of colonies.

## Environmental data

The National Oceanographic and Atmospheric Administration (NOAA) satellite-derived temperature data were used for our environmental analyses. Data included two related sources, namely the Coral Reef Watch Database (CRW) database Version 3.1 ([https://coralreefwatch.noaa.](https://coralreefwatch.noaa.gov/product/5km/) [gov/product/5km/\)](https://coralreefwatch.noaa.gov/product/5km/) and the Coral Reef Temperature Anomaly Database (CoRTAD). The NOAA-CRW products use daily 5-km resolution readings and, at the time of our downloading (July 18, 2019), included the 1985–2018 sampling interval. At the same time, CoRTAD [\(https://](https://www.nodc.noaa.gov/SatelliteData/Cortad) [www.nodc.noaa.gov/SatelliteData/Cortad](https://www.nodc.noaa.gov/SatelliteData/Cortad)) uses a daily 4-km resolution and presents thermal stress anomaly (TSA) and thermal stress anomaly-degree heating week (TSA\_DHW) data for the 1982–2012 sampling interval at the time of downloading. Thus, due to a lack of the full time series, it is used as a proxy for conditions at these sites. TSA is the difference between the temperature on a given day and the maximum weekly mean climatological SST based on 52 climatological weeks averaged over 30 yr (Zinke et al. [2018\)](#page-21-0). TSA\_DHW is a derivative of TSA computed as the sum of temperatures  $> = 1 - \degree C$  above the climatological mean over the 12-week summer period. These metrics were summarized for each site as the mean, median, minimum, maximum, standard deviation, skewness, and kurtosis. Testing the two data sets for similarity between the overlapping years found they were strongly but not precisely correlated ( $r^2 = 0.76$ ). The CoRTAD data used here are considered a proxy for rare anomalies at each geographic location, which was hypothesized to impact coral heat tolerance, rather than the specific cause of the changes reported here. The bleaching threshold for Mauritius has been calculated from SST satellite data from NOAA as 27.5  $\degree$ C as per the 1  $\degree$ C above the local summer baseline methods of Glynn and D'Croz ([1990\)](#page-19-0). **Example 19**<br>
<br> **Example 19**<br>
<br> **Allenger Agency's GlobColor Agency Color Agency<br>
<br>
<b>Allenger Agency**<br>
<br> **Allenger Agency**<br>
<br> **Allenger Agency Color Agency Color Agency CSA)<br>
<br>
<b>Allenger Agency CSA**<br>
<br> **Allenger Agency CS** 

Chlorophyll-a  $(mg \ m^{-3})$  was obtained from the COASTCOLOUR project [\(www.coastcolour.org/](http://www.coastcolour.org/)). The than MODIS, SeaWIFS, or MERIS because it uses multiple sensors that average out errors from individual sensors. Therefore, it reduces the overall data variability and

$$
BI = \frac{((0 \times c0) + (1 \times c1) + (2 \times c2) + (3 \times c3) + (4 \times c5) + (5 \times c5) + (6 \times c6))}{7}
$$

uncertainties, such as those caused by bottom reflectance. These data have limited temporal and time series resolution and we, therefore, limited evaluations to the mean and median metrics as course-level indicators of water quality for each study sites.

Current data were extracted from Ocean Surface Current Analysis Real-time (OSCAR) [\(https://podaac.jpl.nasa.gov/](https://podaac.jpl.nasa.gov/dataset/OSCAR_L4_OC_third-deg) [dataset/OSCAR\\_L4\\_OC\\_third-deg\)](https://podaac.jpl.nasa.gov/dataset/OSCAR_L4_OC_third-deg) at a 1/3-degree grid with a five-day resolution for the period 2003 to 2019 for the 12 sites where coral data were collected. OSCAR contains near-surface ocean current estimates, derived using quasilinear and steady flow momentum equations. The horizontal velocity is directly estimated from sea surface height, surface vector wind, and SSTs. These data were collected from the various satellites and in situ instruments. The model formulation combines geostrophic, Ekman and Stommel shear dynamics, and a complementary term from the surface buoyancy gradient (Bonjean and Lagerloef [2002](#page-19-0)). Ocean Surface Zonal and Meridional Maximum Mask currents were extracted. The two current directions were averaged for the same locations and time and the mean, median, standard deviation, skewness, and kurtosis were calculated for each site. An additional source of water flow data used in the analysis was clod card dissolution rates. Clod cards were placed next to corals in the site, and the change in weight over a 24 hrs period was used to estimate the current speed (McClanahan et al. [2005](#page-20-0)). Temperature and current data were plotted over time (Fig. [2](#page-3-0)).

## Data analyses

#### Dependent variables

The study focused on the changes in benthic cover, coral bleaching, numbers of coral taxa, the coral community, and lost taxa across the 2004 and 2019 period. Change in benthic cover and the bleaching index were evaluated as ratios of the  $log_{10}$  abundance and bleaching in 2019/2004. The bleaching index (BI) was evaluated at site level having weighted bleaching by the abundance of the individual genera bleaching for the two time periods using the following formula, (McClanahan et al. [2007\)](#page-20-0), where

Changes in number of taxa were evaluated as square root of absolute difference in numbers of taxa in 2019–2004. The log of the ratio and square root of the absolute difference improved the data distributions to better fit statistical model assumptions (Crawley [2012\)](#page-19-0).

Changes in the coral community were evaluated as changes in multivariate community axes for each site. The coral community comprised the number of individuals observed in 30 taxa (mostly genera). The communities at each site were evaluated via distance-based redundancy analysis (dbRDA) using the R package version 2.5-5 <https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=vegan>. The sitespecific values along the first and second axes in each year were used in subsequent evaluations of changes in community structure over time. The sign of the data was changed to present increases in relative abundance as positive values. Due to the high number of taxa, the dbRDA plot presented in the results includes only the 14 dominant genera, which accounts for 96% of coral cover.

Disappearance rates of taxa were evaluated at the coral genus level. For each genus, a relative cover, commonness, BI, and the change in bleaching between 2004 and 2019 responses were calculated. Relative cover is based on line transects undertaken in each of these sites in 2004 (McClanahan et al. [2005\)](#page-20-0). Commonness is the frequency of observations at a site in 2004 and relativized, such that a genus seen in only one site would have a value of 0 and all sites a value of 1. The taxa's BI was also based on 2004 as a baseline, which would reduce the possible influence of changes in responses over time. Therefore, the rate of change in bleaching was the ratio of the BI in 2019/2004. Corals not observed in either year were not evaluated. An index of relative loss was calculated as 1—average of these normalized metrics. This index was compared to actual losses as coral taxa observed in 2004 but not in 2019. The number of species of each genus was summarized from a country-level compilation (Moothien-Pillay et al. [2002a](#page-20-0), [b](#page-20-0)).

#### Independent variables

Variables were selected for possible associations with the changes in coral communities over time. First, the 22 environmental variables described above were evaluated for their ability to be good proxies for chronic and acute stress. Then, we chose variable with low redundancy in having low variance inflation factors (VIF) but high statistical significance in the GLM models. This process reduced the 22 to 10 environmental variables for subsequent analyses (Supporting Information, Table S1). This process removed many of the standard mean and variance variables used in evaluating climate impacts, which are often highly correlated but weak indicators or proxies of chronic or acute stress (Sully et al. [2019\)](#page-20-0). As an example, the GLM process found that mean TSA and DHW both had high VIF (TSA VIF = 22.4, DHW VIF = 98.0). This was due to high correlations with the standard deviations of TSA and SST, while mean DHW was highly correlated with TSA kurtosis. TSA and DHW skewness, however, lacked high correlations and positive skewness and therefore good indicators of rare or acute thermal stress, the focus of our impact hypotheses.

The final 10 variables were local clod-based current speed (cm  $s^{-1}$ ), ocean current speed skewness (m  $s^{-1}$ ), TSA\_DHW skewness  $(^{\circ}C)$ , TSA skewness  $(^{\circ}C)$ , chlorophyll (mg m<sup>3</sup>), TSA minimum (°C), SST kurtosis (°C), SST maximum ( $^{\circ}$ C), mean wave energy mean (kW m<sup>-1</sup>), and TSA mean  $(^{\circ}C)$ . In separate evaluations and because we were testing the effect of geographical location, latitude and longitude were included. The final twelve variables were normalized between 0–1 prior to analysis to improve the accuracy of the predictions. The final set of variables were evaluated by general linear model (GLM), stepwise regression, and boosted regression tree (BRT) analyses.

For GLM procedures, we evaluated those variables that had low  $VIF < 3$  and model combinations of the variables selected as having  $\langle 2AIC$  values of the 127 possible model combinations (Burnham and Anderson [1998](#page-19-0)). In the case of numbers of taxa, 3 of the 10 variables were removed because of VIF considerations, leaving 7 variables that were evaluated with the follow basic model structure:

Changes in number of coral taxa  $\sim$  Ocean.cur $rent. speed. skewness + Chlorophyll + Local col current$  $speed + TSA_DHW$ .skewness  $+ TSA$ .mini-

 $mum + TSA.$ skewness  $+$  Wave\_mean energy.

Additionally, forward stepwise regressions present variables selected as significant at  $p \lt 0.05$ . Finally, the BRT regression results of the sites dbRDA Axes 1 and 2 partial plots of the 2019/2004 ratios are presented.

## **Results**

#### Environmental variation

Study sites were located around the island and experienced different environmental and oceanographic forces (Fig. 1, Supporting Information). Mean temperatures display seasonal fluctuations with small differences between sites (Fig. [2a](#page-3-0)). There were, however, inter-annual differences in the maximum and minimum temperatures with many years exceeding the standard  $27.5 \degree C$  threshold for bleaching. Years above the bleaching threshold included the 2003 to 2005 period and most years between 2008 and 2019. The years with the highest summer temperatures over the study period were 2004, 2008, 2009, and 2016. The metrics of warm-temperatures rarity, DHW-skewness and TSAskewness, were not highly correlated, had variance inflation factors (VIFs) of  $\lt$  3 with other temperature metric and variable between sites. The skewness in the DHW metric was generally higher in the north, while TSA skewness was generally higher in the east and lowest in the north and west for the 1985–2018 period. Blue Bay and sites in the east had notably higher TSA\_DHW among the most extreme anomalies when presenting the rare anomalies as cumulative frequencies (Fig. [3\)](#page-6-0).

Physical energy of current speeds and wave energy had more variation in some metrics between sites than SSTs (Table S1). Intra- and inter-annual variation in current speed was complex with no clearly repeatable seasonal or inter-annual patterns (Fig. [2b](#page-3-0)). Mean offshore ocean current speeds were similar between sites but clod dissolution, which were restricted to a single sampling time, suggests that the local conditions varied more between sites than reflected in ocean current speeds. Variation in some metrics around the island reflected the island's east to southward current oceanography with stronger wave energy in the southern sites of Bel Ombre and Le Morne and Balaclava. Wave energy was low in the north and in the GRSE and Blue Bay lagoons but more variable in other locations. Ocean current speed skewness, a measure of frequency of pulses of high current speeds, was not strongly correlated with other metrics and, therefore, good for distinguishing sites and was highest in the north and northwest sites of Anse le Raie and Balaclava.

#### Changes in coral taxa and communities

Coral taxa and benthic communities changed in these 12 study sites over this 15-yr period with losses in hard, soft coral cover and changes in numbers of taxa and coral community structure (Table [1\)](#page-7-0). The overall mean site-level loss of hard and soft coral cover was 40% and 83%,

<span id="page-6-0"></span>Fig. 3 Cumulative frequencies of the rare thermal stress anomalies in the degree heating weeks (TSA\_DHW) for Mauritian study sites for the years 1985 to 2018. Sites in the legend organized from north (top) to south (bottom)



respectively. Erect algae increased by an average of 78% but was unchanged and low in the two sites in the Blue Bay marine reserve. Coral cover and numbers of coral taxa were weakly negatively correlated in 2004 ( $r^2 = 0.28$ ,  $p < 0.075$ ) but not significantly correlated in 2019  $(r^2 = 0.10, p = 0.80).$ 

Many changes in benthic and coral cover variables were site-specific suggesting both local and larger-scale environmental influences. Losses in coral taxa were common for most sites despite more moderate changes in coral cover (Fig. [1](#page-2-0)). The Blue Bay Park site nearest the open ocean lost 22 of the original 24 taxa found in 2004. Some sites, such as GRSE 3, lost almost all coral cover and taxa and the remaining rubble was colonized by erect algae. A nearby site, GRSE 2, was the only site to gain coral cover but also lost five hard coral taxa. In contrast, a low diversity patch reef, Anse le Raie, in the north lost little coral cover and no taxa.

The dbRDA coral community axes 1 and 2 displayed some consistent patterns over time and space for the colonies found per sampling time (Table [1](#page-7-0), Fig. [4](#page-8-0)). The taxonomic composition of Axis 1 was largely driven by Acropora, massive Porites, Favites, Stylophora and P. rus (Synaraea) whereas Axis 2 was driven by Montipora, Millepora, Fungia, branching Porites, and Galaxea numbers. The number of colonies associated with Axis 1 declined over time for most sites with the most pronounced losses in the east and southern sites of Blue Bay, Le Morne,

and Bel Ombre (Table [1\)](#page-7-0). The Anse le Raie sites in the north and GRSE 3 had some gains in Axis 1 coral colonies. Numbers of colonies of the Axis 2 corals also declined in most sites particularly in the south but also in the Anse le Raie and Flic and Flac sites. There were some small increases in Axis 2 corals in Balaclava and GRSE 2.

# Environmental and oceanographic associations with coral change

Declines in coral cover were moderately associated with the skewness of the TSA\_DHW metric, or number of rare acute thermal stresses, for both the GLM ( $r^2 = 0.55$ ) and stepwise procedures ( $r^2 = 0.43$ ). There was no evidence for significant influence of other variables or geographic location (Table 2, Supporting Information). Declines in the number of coral taxa also increased with the skewness of TSA in the top GLM model  $(r^2 = 0.61)$  and stepwise regression ( $r^2 = 0.40$ ) (Table [3](#page-11-0)). However, skewness in ocean current speed, or the frequency of rare and fast current pulses, was associated with fewer losses in coral taxa ( $r^2 = 0.55$ ) in the second top model. When including geographic variables, latitude was picked in the top two GLM models and produced the highest fits  $(r^2 = 0.69)$ , especially when including the clod card current speed  $(r^2 = 0.79)$ . Losses of coral taxa were, therefore, higher in the south and associated with higher TSA skewness, or rare warm temperatures, and higher local current speeds.

<span id="page-7-0"></span>

Table 1 Benthic and coral community variables summarized for the 12 study sites organized from north to south

Table 1 Benthic and coral community variables summarized for the 12 study sites organized from north to south

<span id="page-8-0"></span>

Fig. 4 Distance-based redundancy analysis (dbRDA) of 14 dominant coral communities in 2004 versus 2019 and the significant vectors (Table [2\)](#page-10-0). Environmental influences of changes in sites by boosted

regression tree analysis for the two axes are presented in Fig. [5](#page-9-0). Ellipses represent 95% Confidence Intervals

The dbRDA analyses indicates that the time period and the TSA skewness were the strongest associations with community change ( $r^2 = 0.69$ ) in the absence of geographic location (Table [4\)](#page-12-0). When geographic location was included, the latitude, local current speed, TSA skewness and TSA\_DHW skewness were significant. The BRT regression evaluating changes in coral communities over the 15-yr time periods, indicate the strongest response (Relative Importance  $(RI) = 57\%)$  was with water-column chlorophyll with the largest change in coral community Axis 1 associated with low chlorophyll conditions (Fig. [5](#page-9-0)a). Most of the change was associated with losses of  $Acropora$  (RI = 34%) with lesser effects of temperature and ocean current skewness. Most of change in Axis 2 corals over time  $(RI = 94.3\%)$  was associated with declines of these corals at sites with the highest ocean current speeds with lesser effects of taxa and other environmental conditions (Fig. [5](#page-9-0)b).

The overall community-level bleaching was less in 2019 than 2004 (Table [1\)](#page-7-0). Moreover, taxa-specific bleaching responses indicate that taxa responses changed between 2004 and 2019 (Fig. [6\)](#page-12-0). Many taxa had lower bleaching intensity in 2019 than predicted by their responses in 2004. Goniopora and Millepora were the two exceptions in having higher than expected responses in 2019 than 2004

while *Alveopora* had similar responses between years. The single significant variable for the change in bleaching intensity was the frequency of warm acute temperature pulses (TSA\_DHW skewness). While weak, this observation indicates less change in the resistance of corals to bleaching where the rare high temperature pulses were more frequent (Table [5](#page-13-0)).

## Losses of taxa

Plots of the commonness of the taxa and their bleaching responses in the 2 yr indicate a number of losses of taxa as well as declines in bleaching intensity (Table [6\)](#page-14-0). The most common taxa, such as Acropora, Montipora, Pocillopora, Pavona, and massive Porites, were lost from one or two sites each. In contrast, eight uncommon taxa, found at only one or two sites in 2004, were subsequently not seen in 2019 (Table [7](#page-15-0)). Echinopora was the most unusual taxa in that it was found in half the sites in 2004 but not seen again in any of the same sites in 2019. Goniastrea, Leptoria, Favites, Cyphastrea, and Astreopora were also moderately abundant taxa in 2004 but their numbers were reduced to one or two sites in 2019. Overall, less abundant, rare, and non-acclimating taxa were most likely to be lost from the

<span id="page-9-0"></span>

Fig. 5 Partial plots based on BRT analyses of the environmental influences on the redundancy analysis of the  $a$  first  $(x)$  and  $b$  second (y) axis for the top genera. Top genera on the first axis are Acropora,

massive Porites, Favites, Stylophora and Porites rus and on the second axis Montipora, Millepora, Fungia, and Galaxea

sites. Three taxa were unusual in that they were rare but still present in 2019, these were Echinophyllia, Plesiastrea, and Lobophora.

Surveys of an additional 15 reef sites of more variable depth in 2019 found that seven sites contained one or more of the nine coral taxa not observed in the 12 lagoon sites (Table [8](#page-16-0)). Six taxa were observed in at least one reef site. Three taxa, Herpolitha, Plerogyra, and Psammocora, were not observed in any of the reef sites and therefore any of the 27 sites sampled in 2019. The two sites with the most, or six of the nine lagoons missing corals, were Balaclava and Belle Mare in the north-west and north-east of the island, respectively. Consequently, three taxa may have been lost from the island while six were uncommon and mostly found in deeper water sites. Three taxa rare in 2004, namely Plesiastrea, Lobophora, and Stylophora, were not seen in the additional 15 sites while three were seen, namely Platygyra, Lobophyllia, and Echinophyllia. Platygyra, and Echinophyllia were moderately abundant in the two northern sites of Belle Mare and Balaclava.

## **Discussion**

#### Changes in coral communities over time

Mauritian coral taxa and communities changed by a number of metrics over the 15-yr interval. Large changes were observed in benthic cover with a 40% and 83% decline in total hard and soft coral, respectively, and 78% increases in erect fleshy algal cover. Community structure changed with losses of numbers of colonies in the two dominant

<span id="page-10-0"></span>Table 2 Ratio of coral cover  $[log_{10}(2019/2004)]$  modeled with environmental variables and (a) without latitude and longitude and (b) with latitude and longitude using (i) generalized linear models (GLM) and (ii) stepwise regression



Bold  $p$  values indicate statistical significance

The top GLM models of  $\lt 2$  AICs presented. Estimates and standard errors of the means ( $\pm$  SE), significance of models, and variance inflation factor (VIF) presented

communities Acropora/Favites/massive Porites and the Montipora/Fungia/Galaxea. The biggest biodiversity change, however, was the disappearance or loss of nine of the 30 coral taxa that were recorded among the 12 sites in 2004. Moreover, their distributions were very limited and numbers sparse throughout all 27 sites sampled in 2019. Therefore, reef biodiversity and possibly function were compromised over this 15-yr study period (Benkwitt et al. [2020\)](#page-19-0). Many changes observed here were poorly reflected in previous coarsely-sampled studies of Mauritian reefs (Obura et al. [2017](#page-20-0); Elliot et al. [2018\)](#page-19-0). Consequently, restricting measurements to total hard coral and dominant taxa, such as Acropora, failed to detect many of the changes observed among subdominant and rarer taxa.

Only a few of the many examined environmental factors were not redundant, differentiated sites, and associated with considerable changes in coral cover, numbers of taxa, and bleaching responses. Environmental variables responded as expected from the land-sea interactions that arise from the east to southerly ocean current system around

Mauritius (Fig. [1](#page-2-0); Pous et al. [2014\)](#page-20-0). The main environmental metrics associated with changes in the coral communities were the thermal stress metrics but mostly notably the frequency of warm thermal acute stress periods reflected by skewness in DHWs and TSA metrics. These metrics had the strongest associations with coral cover and number of taxa changes, respectively. Metrics of acute stress, such as skewness, are found to be highly influential in reflecting the environmental conditions that allow corals to acclimate or not to thermal stress events and the subsequent state of coral communities (Zinke et al. [2018](#page-21-0); McClanahan [2020a](#page-20-0)).

The eastern region and specifically the Blue Bay Marine Park had the highest frequency of rare DHWs (Fig. [3](#page-6-0)). Large declines in coral cover were reported between 2008 and 2009 in Blue Bay and other reefs that did not have such frequent warm temperature anomalies (Elliot et al. [2018](#page-19-0)). Water temperatures in 2008 rose above the bleaching threshold after 3 yr of cooler summer temperatures (Fig. [2\)](#page-3-0). This rise was not associated with large-scale

<span id="page-11-0"></span>Table 3 Absolute difference of the numbers of coral taxa [sqrt(absolute difference (2019–2004)] modeled with environmental variables and (a) without latitude and longitude and (b) with latitude and longitude using (i) generalized linear models-GLM and (ii) stepwise regression

$(i)$ GLM Predictors		Top model 1		Top model 2			<b>VIF</b>
		Estimates $\pm$ SE	$p$ value	Estimates $\pm$ SE	$p$ value		
	(a) Absolute difference of numbers of coral taxa modeled with environmental variables without latitude and longitude						
Intercept		$1.6 \pm 0.51$	0.011	$3.45 \pm 0.49$	< 0.001		
TSA skewness (°C)		$2.6 \pm 1.00$	0.026				2.8
Ocean current speed skewness (m $s^{-1}$ )				$-1.87 \pm 0.81$	0.04		4.56
Observations	12			12			
$R^2$ Nagelkerke	0.61			0.55			
<b>AIC</b>		40.42		41.49			
Term	Estimates $\pm$ SE	$t$ Ratio	Prob > [t]	<b>VIF</b>	$R^2$		Whole model $P$
(ii) Stepwise regression							
Intercept	$2.63 \pm 0.32$	1.77	Ns		0.40	0.03	
TSA skewness (°C)	$1.30 \pm 0.50$	2.6	0.03	2.94			
$(i)$ GLM	Top model 1		Top model 2		Model 3		<b>VIF</b>
Predictors	Estimates $\pm$ SE	$\boldsymbol{p}$	Estimates $\pm$ SE	$p$ value	Estimates $\pm$ SE	$p$ value	
	(b) Absolute difference of numbers of coral taxa modeled with environmental variables and latitude and longitude						
Intercept	$3.84 \pm 0.50$	${}< 0.001$	$3.1 \pm 0.63$	0.001	$1.6 \pm 0.51$	0.01	
Latitude	$-2.66 \pm 0.87$	0.012	$-2.83 \pm 0.81$	0.007			9.07
Local (clods) current speed (cm $s^{-1}$ )			$1.67 \pm 1.00$	ns			2.87
TSA skewness $(^{\circ}C)$					$2.6 \pm 1.00$	0.03	6.79
Observations	12		12		12		
$R^2$ Nagelkerke	0.69		0.79		0.61		
<b>AIC</b>	38.74		37.50		40.42		
Term	Estimates $\pm$ SE	$t$ Ratio	Prob > [t]	<b>VIF</b>	$R^2$		Whole model P
(ii) Stepwise regression							
Intercept	$2.63 \pm 0.32$	$-2.97$	0.01		0.48	0.01	
TSA skewness (°C)	$-1.33 \pm 0.44$	$-3.05$	0.01	8.3			

Bold  $p$  values indicate statistical significance

The top GLM models of less than 2 AICs presented. Estimates and standard errors of the means (± SE), significance of models, and VIFs presented

oceanographic variation in the El Niño Southern Oscillation (ENSO) or Indian Ocean Dipole (IOD). Rather, the Southwest Indian Ocean (SWIO) SST Index was positive during the 2006–2008 period and more likely to be associated with the large-scale but patchy warming in the southern Indian Ocean [\(https://stateoftheocean.osmc.noaa.](https://stateoftheocean.osmc.noaa.gov/sur/ind/swio.php) [gov/sur/ind/swio.php\)](https://stateoftheocean.osmc.noaa.gov/sur/ind/swio.php). The SWIO index is frequently used to evaluate SST fluctuations from southern Madagascar and South Africa, which influence South African rainfall (Walker [1989](#page-21-0)).

Losses in coral taxa were most influenced by the geographic position with the highest losses in the east and south where open-ocean currents impinge on the coastline, such that corals experience strong and constant currents and low chlorophyll concentrations in some lagoons. This southern region was also where the Acroporal Favites/massive Porites communities were common, dominant, and also the most disturbed across the study period. High water flow is expected to create good conditions for Acropora growth and possibly give them a competitive advantage over sub-canopy taxa like Galaxea and Fungia (Tanner [1995](#page-20-0)). If these currents are constant, such as those driven by tides, their periodic constancy may reduce warm-water acute thermal stress and subsequent coral bleaching (Nakamura and van Woesik [2001](#page-20-0)). Nevertheless, the findings suggest that warm acute thermal stresses propagated by inter-annual variation in ocean current heating is likely to have caused the high Acropora

<span id="page-12-0"></span>Table 4 Selected variables from multivariate dbRDA analysis of coral community (numbers of coral colonies per 40 min) with environmental variables; (i) without geographic variables and (ii) with geographic variables. Significance of the models and proportion of inertia explained presented



Bold  $p$  values indicate statistical significance

Data based on based on number of colonies per sample

Fig. 6 Scatterplots of the bleaching responses over the 15-yr study period as a taxaspecific responses in normalized to a 40-min search. Stylophora was uncommon but observed in line transects but not bleaching surveys. Dashed line is the 1:1 line expected for no change in bleaching responses over time



mortality and the loss of subdominant and rare taxa. Interestingly, a higher frequency of rare episodic fast currents in the north was associated with fewer losses of coral taxa, which suggests that extreme variation in thermal stress rather than variation in fast current drove the coral losses. Leeward but current-influenced sides of the island

<span id="page-13-0"></span>Table 5 Ratio of bleaching index  $[\log_{10}(2019/2004)]$ modeled with environmental variables and (a) latitude and longitude and (b) without latitude and longitude using (i) generalized linear models-GLM and (ii) stepwise regression



Bold  $p$  values indicate statistical significance

The top GLM models of  $\langle 2 \text{ AICs} \rangle$  presented. Estimates and standard errors of the means ( $\pm$  SE), significance of models and VIFs presented

\*No variables were significant with stepwise regression

(i.e., the north) are expected to have slower but more variable currents that appeared to promote coral acclimation over the study period. Leeward ocean gyres will be generated by this land–sea interaction and result in episodic current speed variability that is reflected in the current skewness metric.

The intensity of the bleaching response appeared to decline over the 15-yr study period, which might be expected from previous studies that measured bleaching over recent time (Guest et al. [2016;](#page-19-0) Couch et al. [2017](#page-19-0); McClanahan [2017;](#page-20-0) Hughes et al. [2019](#page-19-0)). Increased resistance can be attributable to changes in taxa-specific acclimation, genotypic change due to differential survival, and changes in the taxonomic composition of the corals. A global summary compilation of thermal responses found evidence for acclimation or community change as the threshold for bleaching increased by  $0.5 \degree C$  between 1998 and 2007 (Sully et al. [2019\)](#page-20-0). Changes in Mauritius over 15 yr were, however, not large and there were differences in the timing of stress, sampling, taxonomic composition, and types of thermal stress that make direct between-year comparisons problematic. Nevertheless, the change in community-level bleaching index declined as the frequency of acute stress of the rare thermal anomalies (TSA\_DHW skewness) increased. This would be expected if constant and moderate but not rare and extreme variation provokes acclimation (Ateweberhan and McClanahan [2010\)](#page-19-0). Consequently, high SST skewness reflects atypical acute stresses that may prevent acclimation whereas predictable or chronic variability should promote acclimation (Safaie et al. [2018\)](#page-20-0).

The 2004 versus 2019 taxa comparison further support observations in the Indian Ocean that most, but not all taxa, have reduced their sensitivity to warm thermal stress since first measured (McClanahan and Muthiga [2014](#page-20-0); McClanahan [2017\)](#page-20-0). Moreover, the taxa that show low acclimation or even increased sensitivity appeared to vary with location, suggesting some local environment–taxa interactions. We expected that exposed and windward reefs or reefs directly exposed to more frequently stable openocean conditions would be least capable of resisting rare and acute SST anomalies (McClanahan et al. [2005](#page-20-0); Louis et al. [2016\)](#page-19-0). Given that the frequency of strong inter-annual SST variation is increasing with climate warming (Nakamura et al. [2011;](#page-20-0) Wang et al. [2019](#page-21-0); Abram et al. [2020](#page-18-0)), corals in ocean-exposed sites are expected to lose more coral colonies and taxa than ocean-sheltered locations (Golbuu et al. [2007;](#page-19-0) McClanahan et al. [2007](#page-20-0)). Compilations of coral cover in near and off-shore environments support this prediction, finding lower coral cover in more offshore and ocean-exposed environments (Bruno and Valdivia [2016;](#page-19-0) McClanahan et al. [2019b](#page-20-0)).

Bleaching and patterns of community change observed at the gross community level may be less powerful when evaluating specific communities or taxa. For example, the Acropora/Favites/massive Porites community declined the most where oceanographic conditions promoted low chlorophyll concentrations. Consequently, some combination of light penetration or, perhaps the availability of

<span id="page-14-0"></span>Table 6 Percentage means and standard errors from the mean (mean  $\pm$  SE) of bleaching index and sites containing genera in 2004 and 2019

Genera	Bleaching index $2004$ (%)	Sites $2004$ (%)	Bleaching index $2019$ (%)	Sites 2019 (%)
<b>Seriatopora</b>	$66.67\pm0.00$	$8.33 \pm 3.18$	$0 \pm 0$	$0 \pm 0$
Alveopora	$59.18 \pm 7.84$	$66.67 \pm 1.15$	$48.03 \pm 15.07$	$16.67 \pm 2.89$
Porites rus (Synaraea)	$45.99 \pm 0.33$	$16.67 \pm 2.89$	$8.33 \pm 0.00$	$8.33 \pm 3.18$
Plerogyra	$43.33 \pm 0.00$	$8.33 \pm 3.18$	$0\pm 0$	$0\pm 0$
Montipora	$35.09 \pm 4.89$	$100 \pm 0.00$	$17.46 \pm 5.03$	$75.00 \pm 0.87$
Acropora	$34.10 \pm 3.55$	$100 \pm 0.00$	$13.42 \pm 3.75$	$91.67 \pm 0.29$
Goniastrea	$25.85 \pm 3.95$	$50.00 \pm 1.73$	$4.17 \pm 0$	$8.33 \pm 3.18$
Echinopora	$25.00 \pm 8.35$	$50.00 \pm 1.73$	$6.25 \pm 0.85$	$16.67 \pm 2.89$
Leptoria	$24.41 \pm 6.66$	$75.00 \pm 0.87$	$2.08 \pm 0$	$8.33 \pm 3.18$
Favia	$24.32 \pm 3.32$	$66.67 \pm 1.15$	$12.78 \pm 4.18$	$33.33 \pm 2.31$
Lobopyllia	$21.97 \pm 4.88$	$41.67 \pm 2.02$	$14.98 \pm 3.05$	$75.00 \pm 0.87$
Cyphastrea	$20.37 \pm 3.34$	$25.00 \pm 2.60$	$18.06 \pm 3.97$	$16.67 \pm 2.89$
Goniopora	$19.44 \pm 3.67$	$25.00 \pm 2.60$	$14.92 \pm 3.85$	$33.33 \pm 2.31$
Acanthastrea	$16.67 \pm 0.00$	$8.33 \pm 3.18$	$4.17\,\pm\,0.00$	$8.33 \pm 3.18$
<b>Oxypora</b>	$16.67 \pm 0.00$	$8.33 \pm 3.18$	$0\pm 0$	$0\pm 0$
<b>Turbinaria</b>	$16.67 \pm 0.00$	$16.67 \pm 2.89$	$0 \pm 0$	$0 \pm 0$
Psammacora	$16.67 \pm 0.00$	$8.33 \pm 3.18$	$0 \pm 0$	$0 \pm 0$
Porites branching	$16.57 \pm 3.55$	$58.33 \pm 1.44$	$7.61 \pm 1.75$	$25.00 \pm 2.60$
Favites	$15.97 \pm 3.04$	$66.67 \pm 1.15$	$17.1 \pm 1.62$	$66.67 \pm 1.15$
Herpolitha	$14.46 \pm 4.93$	$16.67 \pm 2.89$	$0 \pm 0$	$0 \pm 0$
Platygyra	$13.95 \pm 1.59$	$75.00 \pm 0.87$	$37.96 \pm 8.69$	$16.67 \pm 2.89$
Pocillopora	$13.76 \pm 3.69$	$100 \pm 0.00$	$0 \pm 0$	$0 \pm 0$
Galaxea	$13.56 \pm 3.40$	$75.00 \pm 0.87$	$9.13 \pm 2.38$	$33.33 \pm 2.31$
Millepora	$13.55 \pm 3.83$	$58.33 \pm 1.44$	$4.11 \pm 1.11$	$41.67 \pm 2.02$
Hydnophora	$12.50 \pm 1.70$	$16.67 \pm 2.89$	$3.21 \pm 1.16$	$50.00 \pm 1.73$
Porites massive	$11.36 \pm 2.73$	$83.33 \pm 0.58$	$43.33 \pm 0.00$	$8.33 \pm 3.18$
Astreopora	$11.30 \pm 1.48$	$41.67 \pm 2.02$	$3.95 \pm 0.48$	$16.67 \pm 2.89$
Symphyllia	$11.11 \pm 0.00$	$8.33 \pm 3.18$	$0 \pm 0$	$0 \pm 0$
Fungia	$5.53 \pm 1.39$	$91.67 \pm 0.29$	$0 \pm 0$	$0\pm 0$
Pavona	$4.73 \pm 1.13$	$66.67 \pm 1.15$	$12.5 \pm 0.00$	$8.33 \pm 3.18$

Genera arranged from most to least bleached in 2004. The 9 lost genera in 2019 are in bold italics

planktonic food for corals that rely on heterotrophy, interact with thermal stress (Anthony et al. [2009;](#page-18-0) Mollica et al. [2019](#page-20-0)). There is considerable debate about the potential roles of nutrients, their concentrations, thresholds, ratios of nitrogen and phosphorus, plankton, and light penetration that make it difficult to conclude about the mechanisms producing these observations (DeAngelo and Wiedenmann [2014](#page-19-0)). In contrast, the more diverse Montipora/Fungia/Galaxea community changed the least in low current environments common to the north and west of the island. Thus, changes in communities to thermal responses are likely to be modified by interactions between taxa and their responses to currents and associated light and nutrient conditions.

We found that the Acropora/Favites/massive Porites community dominant in the high-water flow conditions was the most susceptible to acute thermal stress. Nevertheless, Acropora in Mauritius has some species or genotypes that are resistant to thermal stress in some habitats. For example, a study of one of the most common corals on the windward side, Acropora muricatum, found differences in susceptibilities to thermal stress between colonies living near and further from shore (Louis et al. [2016](#page-19-0)). This study found that colonies living near the coast in the northeast site of Belle Mar exhibited enhanced photo-physiological responses, antioxidant activities, and increased total phenolic contents compared to offshore colonies. These conditions appeared to provide greater resistance to thermal stress. Up-regulating of stress-response genes has been

Genera	Number of species	Relative coral cover	Relative commonness, site frequency	Relative bleaching index	Bleaching adaptation	Relative disappearance rate	Disappeared in 2019
Echinophylia	$\overline{2}$	0.0001	0.00	$\rm Nd$	$\rm Nd$	0.99	No
Plesiastrea	$\overline{2}$	0.02	0.00	$\rm Nd$	$\rm Nd$	0.99	$\rm No$
Lobophora	<b>ND</b>	0.01	$0.00\,$	$\rm Nd$	$\rm Nd$	0.99	$\rm No$
Symphyllia	$\mathbf{1}$	0.0000	0.00	0.12	Nd	0.96	Yes
Hydnophora	$\boldsymbol{2}$	0.001	$\boldsymbol{0.00}$	0.14	$\rm Nd$	0.95	Yes
Herpolitha	$\mathbf{1}$	0.01	$\boldsymbol{0.00}$	0.18	Nd	0.94	Yes
<b>Acanthastrea</b>	$\mathbf{3}$	0.004	0.00	0.22	Nd	0.93	Yes
<b>Oxypora</b>	?	0.0000	$\boldsymbol{0.00}$	0.22	$\rm Nd$	0.93	Yes
Psammocora	$\mathbf{1}$	0.0000	0.00	0.22	Nd	0.93	Yes
Stylophora	$\overline{\mathcal{L}}$	0.04	0.09	$\rm Nd$	$\rm Nd$	0.93	$\rm No$
Turbinaria	3	0.0000	0.09	0.22	$\rm Nd$	0.90	Yes
Lobophyllia	3	0.01	0.00	0.32	0.05	0.90	$\rm No$
Platygyra	$\overline{4}$	0.004	0.27	0.17	0.05	0.88	$\rm No$
Echinopora	$\boldsymbol{2}$	0.04	$\boldsymbol{0.00}$	0.37	$\rm Nd$	0.86	Yes
Millepora	$\mathbf{1}$	0.04	0.09	0.16	0.40	0.83	$\rm No$
Cyphastrea	3	0.0000	0.00	0.29	0.46	0.81	$\rm No$
Galaxea	$\mathbf{1}$	0.07	0.45	0.16	0.13	0.80	$\rm No$
Fungia	5	0.06	0.64	0.01	0.09	0.80	$\rm No$
Favites	$\tau$	0.03	0.09	0.21	0.55	0.78	$\rm No$
Plerogyra	$\mathbf{1}$	0.0000	0.00	0.71	$\rm ND$	0.76	Yes
Porites branching	$\overline{7}$	0.07	0.36	0.22	0.29	0.76	No
Pocillopora	$\overline{4}$	0.04	0.73	0.17	0.00	0.76	No
Favia	$\tau$	0.01	0.36	0.36	0.24	0.76	$\rm No$
Goniastrea	5	0.04	$0.00\,$	0.39	0.73	0.71	$\rm No$
Alveopora	$\mathfrak{Z}$	0.14	0.09	1.00	0.05	0.68	No
Porites massive	5	0.13	0.55	0.12	0.50	0.67	No
Pavona	$\,$ 8 $\,$	0.13	0.82	0.00	0.45	0.65	No
Leptoria	$\mathbf{1}$	$0.01\,$	0.18	0.36	1.00	0.61	No
Porites rus <i>(Synaraea)</i>	Nd	0.05	0.09	0.76	0.68	0.60	$\rm No$
Montipora	18	0.30	0.91	0.56	0.26	0.49	No
Acropora	31	1.00	1.00	0.54	0.36	0.27	No

<span id="page-15-0"></span>Table 7 Metrics used to evaluate coral genera probabilities of disappearance where genera are arranged from highest to lowest disappearance rate

Bold  $p$  values indicate statistical significance

Factors included are the relative coral cover, the frequency of sites observation (commonness), relative bleaching index, and bleaching adaptation. Adaption is the ratio the bleaching in 2019 and 2004 and therefore not available for taxa not observed in 2019. The column for disappearances is based on the observations of taxa seen in 2004 but not seen in 2019. Relative commonness of 0 means taxa seen at only 1 site. ND = no observational data. Number of species is the whole country count based on surveys of Moothien-Pillay et al. ([2002a](#page-20-0), [b\)](#page-20-0)

observed for Acropora and specifically for A. muricata in Japan (Palumbi et al. [2014;](#page-20-0) Lee et al. [2018\)](#page-19-0). Thus, Acropora in Mauritius appears to have persisted over time more than recorded in other more equatorial Indian and Pacific Ocean reefs (McClanahan et al. [2014;](#page-20-0) Darling et al. [2019](#page-19-0)). Exploring the variance in these metrics within and between taxa on windward and leeward positions and other larger geographic gradients could further uncover phenotypic and physiological acclimation mechanisms. Findings here on leeward-windward differences add to observations that bleaching and mortality can be reduced in reefs adjacent deep-water lagoons, up-welling regions, and those

<span id="page-16-0"></span>



(Top) colonies of taxa that disappeared and (bottom) rare taxa based on repeated surveys in 12 lagoon sites sampled in 2004 and 2019. Seven of the 15 sites surveyed in 2019 had missing taxa while 11 of the 15 sites had rare taxa. Reef water depths (m) at time of survey presented The other 4 reefs sampled but without lost and rare taxa included: Blue Bay–Shandrani (7 m), Rivere des Galets-Station 1 (1 m), Mahebourg– Anemone (4 m) and Bel Ombre–Lagoon (1 m)

experiencing internal tidal waves (Riegl et al. [2012;](#page-20-0) Tkachenko and Song [2017;](#page-20-0) Randell et al. [2019](#page-20-0)). Thus, a variety of recent findings indicate the potential for a number of moderate-scale geographic features to provide coral sanctuary, which may be useful knowledge for prioritizing climate-adaptation planning and management.

### Potential causes of environmental stress

Evaluations and selection of the initial 22 environmental metrics indicate complexities in discovering the potential causes of environmental stress. Environmental data from satellite have coarse spatial and temporal resolution, which is expected to limit the capacity to predict patterns at the more spatially limited scale influencing corals. Coarse sampling of the ocean environment is likely to be most problematic for leeward reefs where smaller-scale environmental conditions created by aperiodic eddies and upwelling will not be well resolved by coarse-resolution satellite data. A study of the leeward islands of northern Tanzania, for example, found satellite data were notably poor at measuring temperature distribution metrics, such as kurtosis and skewness, compared to in situ data (McClanahan [2020a](#page-20-0)). Moreover, high covariation among common heat stress metrics and weak differentiation among sites challenged efforts to evaluate specific stresses. We did, however, predict that background chronic variation interacting with acute stress would be the main drivers of coral responses to stress. Variation around mean values or the standard deviations and flatness of SST distributions (i.e., kurtosis) may provide some acclimation to corals (Safaie et al. [2018](#page-20-0)). But, here we found little SST variation among sites for the frequency distributions of chronic variables using coarse-scale satellite data. Thus, with these data, we have little evidence that SST variation was the source of acclimation and differences between sites in their responses to acute thermal stresses. There was more evidence that water flow variation and light penetration were contributing to the acclimation or resistance to acute thermal stress. In contrast, the degree of right skew in thermal stress anomalies (TSA) and DHW better differentiated sites. Therefore, skewness should represent acute and rare warm temperature variation outside of acclimatable ranges.

The screening procedure may have eliminated some potential impactful variables. This seems unlikely, however, given that excluded variables had low between-site variation and were arguably theoretically poor to modest proxies of either chronic or acute stresses. For example, high correlation between mean and standard deviations of SSTs is a challenging problem for distinguishing chronic and acute stress as both can act as stresses and acclimation mechanisms. In this case, skewness was the better metric of acute stress while chronic stress was problematic—appearing more evident in the geographic outcomes or the site's position on the coastline rather than specific satellitederived environmental variables. Nevertheless, the findings suggest some combination of water flow variability and reduced light promoted increased acclimation or resistance to acute thermal stresses.

Corals may acclimate to mean conditions given moderate and predictable variation but are less likely to acclimate to extremes reflected by frequent anomalous temperature extremes. Mauritius provided a good example of this local adaptation, as it has a low bleaching threshold of 27.5 °C due to its low-latitude (20°S). Bleaching thresholds are generally  $> 30$  °C for many shallow tropical and equatorial reefs (Liu et al. [2014](#page-19-0); Heron et al. [2016](#page-19-0)) but also decline with depth (Venegas et al. [2019\)](#page-21-0). While the frequency of rare environmental events (i.e., skewness) is not commonly used to evaluate coral bleaching (Eakin et al. [2010;](#page-19-0) Sully et al. [2019\)](#page-20-0), it is theoretically robust and has been a useful predictor for various coral abundance, life history, and diversity metrics (McClanahan and Muthiga [2016](#page-20-0); Zinke et al. [2018](#page-21-0); McClanahan [2020a](#page-20-0)). Here, we see that acclimation over 15 yr was higher in the absence of rare acute thermal stress.

There are a number of possible alternative explanations for the observed patterns including severe storms, outbreaks of coral predators, and human development. To be viable hypotheses, these forces would need to be more destructive on the island's windward than leeward reefs. Human population development in watersheds, for example, is an alternative driver of changes that has been associated with losses of coral cover (Elliot et al. [2018](#page-19-0)). Human development and thermal disturbances are increasing simultaneously, which makes it difficult to separate their effects using correlation methods. Nevertheless, there may be additive and synergistic effects contributing to the observed changes, as found globally (Darling et al. [2019\)](#page-19-0). Human settlements, tourism, and agricultural developments in Mauritius and elsewhere are frequently located on leeward side of large islands. Thus, the expectation is that human impacts will be greatest on the leeward rather than the windward reefs. A study of the Micronesian Island of Kosrae, for example, lacked a history of thermal disturbances, showed the greatest impacts of overfishing were on the wave-protected leeward reefs, affecting both fish and benthic communities (McLean et al. [2017](#page-20-0)). Thus, because the greatest changes and losses of taxa in Mauritius were in the more sparsely populated windward island regions, it is more plausible that the patterns we observed arose from large-scale thermal stress. Storms and coral predator outbreaks remain as alternative drivers, but these are more frequently observed to damage corals on smaller scales than the large-scale coral demise patterns observed here.

## Conservation and management implications

One hypothesized consequence of climate change is that coral distributions will expand and find sanctuary in highlatitude locations where cooler environmental conditions are conducive to coral survival (Precht and Aronson [2004](#page-20-0)). The historical presence of reefs at high latitudes is a proxy indicator for this potential climate-driven expansion (Greenstein and Pandolfi [2008;](#page-19-0) Couce et al. [2013](#page-19-0)). This possibility has stimulated conservation and spatial planning (Maina et al. [2008;](#page-19-0) Freeman et al. [2013](#page-19-0); Makino et al. [2014](#page-20-0); Beyer et al. [2018](#page-19-0)). However, the current causes of coral mortality and resilience and the taxa-specific responses are too poorly known to be confident about the potential for large-scale latitudinal coral sanctuary and expansion (McClanahan et al. [2012](#page-20-0), [2014](#page-20-0); Madin et al. [2016](#page-19-0)).

This short 15-yr study indicates that a number of Mauritian coral taxa are threatened and some may already be locally extinct. Rarity in 2004 was the strongest correlate of taxa disappearance in the lagoons as many of the lost taxa, with the exception of Plerogyra, did not have notably high bleaching responses. Bleaching and mortality are not always well correlated (McClanahan [2004](#page-20-0); Buddemeier et al. [2004](#page-19-0)), and the losses observed here support that observation. For example, eight of the lost taxa were in one or two sites in 2004. The one exception was Echinopora, which had moderate bleaching responses and was originally found in six or half the sites. Echinopora was, however, observed in five of the additional 15 sampled sites, some in deeper water and therefore probably mostly lost in shallow water. There is no compelling reason why Echinopora would be particularly sensitive to disappearance in Mauritius. Echinopora is generally robust to various environmental disturbances, including river sediments, and also observed to colonize some reefs after bleaching disturbances (McClanahan and Obura [1997](#page-20-0); McClanahan [2014](#page-20-0)). Mauritius has two species, E. gemmacea and E. hirsutissima, and therefore knowing which of these species was most affected would require a study that evaluates

<span id="page-18-0"></span>their presence and distribution. Currently, it is unclear whether or not both species have persisted and in which habitats.

No new coral genera were observed, which suggests that these losses were not compensated for by gains, and we recorded directional net losses rather than both immigration and extinction processes that would be expected across disturbance events (McClanahan [2020b](#page-20-0)). Additionally, not all rare taxa disappeared, even those that are susceptible, such as Seriatopora, Porites rus, and Stylophora. These taxa and other rare taxa including Echinophyllia, Plesiastrea,, and Lobophora are likely to be susceptible to future losses due to their rarity and susceptibility to stress. Consequently, perhaps more than half the coral genera in Mauritius are susceptible to local extinction in the lagoons and more broadly in the coming decades.

The number of species lost and susceptible to extirpation is difficult to determine as the species per genus among the taxa is variable (Table [8\)](#page-16-0). This is particularly true for the dominant genera, Montipora, and Acropora, which are listed in Mauritius as having 18 and 31 species, respectively (Moothien-Pillay et al. [2002a](#page-20-0), [b](#page-20-0)). Another example is Porites, which has seven species of which many are branching forms that are highly susceptible to thermal stress in many locations (McClanahan et al. [2001;](#page-20-0) Cacciapaglia and van Woesik [2018\)](#page-19-0). There are also taxa identification problems that require genetic analysis to resolve. For example, Stylopohora pistillata, which was not listed in the 2002 country-level compilation of Moothein-Pillay et al. [\(2002a](#page-20-0), [b](#page-20-0)), is present and has a complex morphology. This makes it difficult to classify and the current classification may contain hidden species that have been given a single name (Bhagooli et al. [2017\)](#page-19-0).

The three missing taxa, Plerogyra, Herpolitha, and Psammocora, were only listed as having one species per genus in Mauritius and therefore among the least speciesdiverse genera. Low numbers of species in a genus appear to be a proxy for susceptibility to stress and extinction (McClanahan et al. [2007](#page-20-0)). Nevertheless, it is likely that many species are susceptible, if not already gone from locations across the whole islands, possibly among the more diverse genera. More research is needed to determine if threatened taxa still persist in deeper water. The research here suggests threatened taxa may be mostly present in the west and north or leeward side of the island.

The study indicates the importance of evaluating the status of reefs at some genus to sub-genus level of taxonomic resolution, as opposed to evaluations that report cover of dominant taxa (i.e. Acropora). Here, coral cover is not a proxy for diversity but is greatly influenced by the more resilient Acropora and Montipora species, such as A. muricata (Louis et al. [2016](#page-19-0)). Thus, cover is expected to produce poor or false conclusions about the status of these reefs. Reefs may be functional, in terms of maintaining cover and reef growth, but losses of taxa are expected to reduce the long-term resilience of these reefs (Hooper et al. [2005](#page-19-0)) and possibly threaten the high species endemism found in Mauritius (Roberts et al. [2002](#page-20-0)). In order to protect Mauritian reef diversity, there is a need to determine the locations of the susceptible taxa, the threats to their populations, and reduce these threats, which are likely to include fishing, river sedimentation, and eutrophication (Elliot et al. [2018\)](#page-19-0).

The predictions of land–sea oceanographic interactions and the results here suggest that corals are likely to endure climate changes better in the leeward and more heavily human populated areas of the north and west. Thus, a major recommendation is to increase efforts to reduce the human impacts and engage people in protection of threatened taxa. Management efforts will require a mixture of watershed and water quality management as well as restricted fishing in the least thermally impacted sites. We found here that the Blue Bay Marine Park was able to reduce the possible adverse effects of increased algal abundance but not climatic impacts. Protected areas on the north and west are few and also of low compliance (McClanahan, T. personal observation). Consequently, efforts to develop and implement functional fisheries management systems are a high priority recommendation for maintaining the resilience of Mauritian reefs. Failure to engage in management and protect these species is likely to lead to losses of possibly half the Mauritian coral fauna and undermine the island's potential as a future sanctuary for corals.

Acknowledgements This work was a joint program between the Wildlife Conservation Society, the Ministry of Ocean Economy, Marine Resources, Fisheries and Shipping, Albion Fisheries Research Centre, and Mauritius Oceanography Institute. We are grateful for logistical and field assistance provided by E. Darling, Y. Heermann, J. Maina, V. Munbodhe, R. Moothien-Pillay, C. Samyan. J. Kosgei for producing the figures and tables. The work received financial support from the Tiffany & Co. and the John D. and Catherine T. MacArthur Foundations.

#### Compliance with ethical standards

Conflict of interest On behalf of all authors, the corresponding author states that there is no conflict of interest.

## References

- Abram NJ, Wright NM, Ellis B, Dixon BC, Wurtzel JB, England MH, Ummenhofer CC, Philibosian B, Cahyarini SY, Yu T-L, Shen C-C, Cheng H, Edwards L, Heslop D (2020) Coupling of Indo-Pacific climate variability over the last millennium. Nature 579:385
- Anthony KRN, Hoogenboom MO, Maynard JA, Grottoli AG, Middlebrook R (2009) Energetics approach to predicting

<span id="page-19-0"></span>mortality risk from environmental stress: A case study of coral bleaching. Funct Ecol 23:539–550

- Ateweberhan M, McClanahan TR (2010) Relationship between historical sea-surface temperature variability and climate change-induced coral mortality in the western Indian Ocean. Mar Pollut Bull 60:964–970
- Ateweberhan M, McClanahan TR, Graham NAJ, Sheppard CRC (2011) Episodic heterogeneous decline and recovery of coral cover in the Indian Ocean. Coral Reefs 30:739–752
- Baker DM, Andras JP, Jordán-Garza AG, Fogel ML (2013) Nitrate competition in a coral symbiosis varies with temperature among Symbiodinium clades. The ISME Journal 7:1248–1251
- Benkwitt CE, Wilson SK, Graham NAJ (2020) Biodiversity increases ecosystem functions despite multiple stressors on coral reefs. Nature Ecology & Evolution:1–8
- Beyer HL, Kennedy EV, Beger M, Chen CA, Cinner JE, Darling ES, Eakin CM, Gates RD, Heron SF, Knowlton N, Obura DO (2018) Risk-sensitive planning for conserving coral reefs under rapid climate change. Conservation Letters 11:e12587
- Bhagooli R, Ramah S, Kaullysing D, Mattan-Moorgawa S, Taleb-Hossenkhan N, Gopeechund A, Soondur M, Flot J-F (2017) Field observation of five Stylophora pistillata-like morphotypes near Mauritius Island. Western Indian Ocean Journal of Marine Science:67–69
- Bonjean F, Lagerloef GS (2002) Diagnostic model and analysis of the surface currents in the tropical Pacific Ocean. J Phys Oceanogr 32:2938–2954
- Bruno JF, Valdivia A (2016) Coral reef degradation is not correlated with local human population density. Scientific Reports 6:29778
- Buddemeier RW, Baker AC, Fautin DG, Jacobs JR (2004) The adaptive hypothesis of bleaching. In: Rosenberg E, Loya Y (eds) Coral Health and Disease. Springer, Berlin Heidelberg, pp 427–444
- Burnham KP, Anderson DR (1998) Model Selection and Multimodel Inference: A Practical Information-theoretic Approach. Springer, New York
- Cacciapaglia C, van Woesik R (2018) Marine species distribution modelling and the effects of genetic isolation under climate change. J Biogeogr 45:154–163
- Côté IM, Darling ES (2010) Rethinking ecosystem resilience in the face of climate change. PLoS Biol 8:e1000438
- Couce E, Ridgwell A, Hendy EJ (2013) Future habitat suitability for coral reef ecosystems under global warming and ocean acidification. Glob Change Biol 19:3592–3606
- Couch CS, Burns JH, Liu G, Steward K, Gutlay TN, Kenyon J, Eakin CM, Kosaki RK (2017) Mass coral bleaching due to unprecedented marine heatwave in Papahānaumokuākea Marine National Monument (Northwestern Hawaiian Islands). PLoS ONE 12:e0185121
- Crawley MJ (2012) The R book. John Wiley & Sons, New York
- Cunning R, Gillette P, Capo T, Galvez K, Baker AC (2015) Growth tradeoffs associated with thermotolerant symbionts in the coral Pocillopora damicornis are lost in warmer oceans. Coral Reefs 34:155–160
- D'Angelo C, Wiedenmann J (2014) Impacts of nutrient enrichment on coral reefs: new perspectives and implications for coastal management and reef survival. Current Opinion in Environmental Sustainability 7:82–93
- Darling ES, McClanahan TR, Maina J, Gurney GG, Graham NA, Januchowski-Hartley F, Cinner JE, Mora C, Hicks CC, Maire E, Puotinen M (2019) Social–environmental drivers inform strategic management of coral reefs in the Anthropocene. Nature Ecology & Evolution 3:1341–1350
- Donner SD, Rickbeil GJ, Heron SF (2017) A new, high-resolution global mass coral bleaching database. PLoS ONE 12:e0175490
- Eakin CM, Morgan JA, Heron SF, Smith TB, Liu G, Alvarez-Filip L, Baca B, Bartels E, Bastidas C, Bouchon C (2010) Caribbean corals in crisis: Record thermal stress, bleaching, and mortality in 2005. PLoS ONE 5:e13969
- Elliott JA, Patterson MR, Staub CG, Koonjul M, Elliott SM (2018) Decline in coral cover and flattening of the reefs around Mauritius (1998–2010). PeerJ 6:e6014
- Freeman LA, Kleypas JA, Miller AJ (2013) Coral reef habitat response to climate change scenarios. PLoS ONE 8:e82404
- Glynn P, D'croz L (1990) Experimental evidence for high temperature stress as the cause of El Niño-coincident coral mortality. Coral Reefs 8:181–191
- Golbuu Y, Victor S, Penland L, Idip D Jr, Emaurois C, Okaji K, Yukihira H, Iwase A, Van Woesik R (2007) Palau's coral reefs show differential habitat recovery following the 1998-bleaching event. Coral Reefs 26:319–332
- Gove JM, McManus MA, Neuheimer AB, Polovina JJ, Drazen JC, Smith CR, Merrifield MA, Friedlander AM, Ehses JS, Young CW, Dillon AK (2016) Near-island biological hotspots in barren ocean basins. Nature Communications 7:10581
- Greenstein BJ, Pandolfi JM (2008) Escaping the heat: Range shifts of reef coral taxa in coastal Western Australia. Glob Change Biol 14:513–528
- Guest JR, Low J, Tun K, Wilson B, Ng C, Raingeard D, Ulstrup KE, Tanzil JTI, Todd PA, Toh TC, McDougald D, Chou LM, Steinberg PD (2016) Coral community response to bleaching on a highly disturbed reef. Scientific Reports 6:20717
- Heron SF, Maynard JA, Van Hooidonk R, Eakin CM (2016) Warming trends and bleaching stress of the world's coral reefs 1985–2012. Scientific Reports 6:38402
- Hooper DU, Chapin FS, Ewel JJ, Hector A, Inchausti P, Lavorel S, Lawton JH, Lodge DM, Loreau M, Naeem S, Schmid B (2005) Effects of biodiversity on ecosystem functioning: A consensus of current knowledge. Ecol Monogr 75:3–35
- Hughes TP, Anderson KD, Connolly SR, Heron SF, Kerry JT, Lough JM, Baird AH, Baum JK, Berumen ML, Bridge TC, Claar DC (2018) Spatial and temporal patterns of mass bleaching of corals in the Anthropocene. Science 359:80–83
- Hughes TP, Kerry JT, Connolly SR, Baird AH, Eakin CM, Heron SF, Hoey AS, Hoogenboom MO, Jacobson M, Liu G, Pratchett MS, Skirving W, Torda G (2019) Ecological memory modifies the cumulative impact of recurrent climate extremes. Nature Climate Change 9:40–43
- Lee ST, Keshavmurthy S, Fontana S, Takuma M, Chou WH, Chen CA (2018) Transcriptomic response in Acropora muricata under acute temperature stress follows preconditioned seasonal temperature fluctuations. BMC Research Notes 11:119–117
- Liu G, Heron SF, Eakin CM, Muller-Karger FE, Vega-Rodriguez M, Guild LS, De La Cour JL, Geiger EF, Skirving WJ, Burgess TFR, Strong AE, Harris A, Maturi E, Ignatove A, Sapper J, Li J, Lynds S (2014) Reef-scale thermal stress monitoring of coral ecosystems: New 5-km global products from NOAA coral reef watch. Remote Sensing 6:11579–11606
- Louis YD, Kaullysing D, Gopeechund A, Mattan-Moorgawa S, Bahorun T, Dyall SD, Bhagooli R (2016) In hospite Symbiodinium photophysiology and antioxidant responses in Acropora muricata on a coast-reef scale: implications for variable bleaching patterns. Symbiosis 68:61–72
- Madin JS, Allen AP, Baird AH, Pandolfi JM, Sommer B (2016) Scope for latitudinal extension of reef corals is species specific. Frontiers of Biogeography 8:1–4
- Maina J, Venus V, McClanahan TR, Ateweberhan M (2008) Modelling susceptibility of coral reefs to environmental stress using remote sensing data and GIS models in the western Indian Ocean. Ecol Model 212:180–199
- <span id="page-20-0"></span>Makino A, Yamano H, Beger M, Klein CJ, Yara Y, Possingham HP (2014) Spatio-temporal marine conservation planning to support high-latitude coral range expansion under climate change. Divers Distrib 20:859–871
- McClanahan TR (2004) The relationship between bleaching and mortality of common corals. Mar Biol 144:1239–1245
- McClanahan TR (2014) Decadal coral community reassembly on an African fringing reef. Coral Reefs 33:939–950
- McClanahan TR (2017) Changes in coral sensitivity to thermal anomalies. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 570:71–85
- McClanahan TR (2020a) Coral community life histories and population dynamics driven by seascape bathymetry and temperature variability. In: Reigl B (ed) Population Dynamics Of The Reef Crisis. Elsevier Science and Technology, in press.
- McClanahan TR (2020b) Decadal turnover of thermally stressed coral taxa support a risk-spreading approach to marine reserve design. Coral Reefs. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00338-020-01984-w>
- McClanahan TR, Maina J (2003) Response of coral assemblages to the interaction between natural temperature variation and rare warm-water events. Ecosystems 6:551–563
- McClanahan TR, Muthiga NA (2014) Community change and evidence for variable warm-water temperature adaptation of corals in Northern Male Atoll, Maldives. Mar Pollut Bull 80:107–113
- McClanahan TR, Muthiga NA (2016) Similar impacts of fishing and environmental stress on calcifying organisms in Indian Ocean coral reefs. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 560:87–103
- McClanahan TR, Obura D (1997) Sedimentation effects on shallow coral communities in Kenya. Journal of Experimetal Marine Biology and Ecology 209:103–122
- McClanahan TR, Muthiga NA, Mangi S (2001) Coral and algal changes after the 1998 coral bleaching: Interaction with reef management and herbivores on Kenyan reefs. Coral Reefs 19:380–391
- McClanahan TR, Maina J, Moothien-Pillay R, Baker AC (2005) Effects of geography, taxa, water flow, and temperature variation on coral bleaching intensity in Mauritius. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 298:131–142
- McClanahan TR, Ateweberhan M, Muhando CA, Maina J, Mohammed SM (2007) Effects of climate and seawater temperature variation on coral bleaching and mortality. Ecol Monogr 77:503–525
- McClanahan TR, Maina JM, Muthiga NA (2011) Associations between climate stress and coral reef diversity in the Western Indian Ocean. Glob Change Biol 17:2023–2032
- McClanahan TR, Donner SD, Maynard JA, MacNeil MA, Graham NA, Maina J, Baker AC, Beger M, Campbell SJ, Darling ES, Eakin CM (2012) Prioritizing key resilience indicators to support coral reef management in a changing climate. PLoS ONE 7:e42884
- McClanahan TR, Ateweberhan M, Darling ES, Graham NAJ, Muthiga NA (2014) Biogeography and change among regional coral communities across the Western Indian Ocean. PLoS ONE 9:e93385
- McClanahan TR, Maina J, Ateweberhan M (2015) Regional coral responses to climate disturbances and warming is predicted by multivariate stress model and not temperature threshold metrics. Climatic Change 131:607–620
- McClanahan TR, Darling ES, Maina JM, Muthiga NA, D'agata S, Arthur R, Jupiter S, Wilson SK, Mangubhai S, Leblonde J, Muttaqin E, Pardede S, Nand Y, Ussi AM, Humphries AT, Patankar VJ, Guillaume MMM, Keith SA, Shedrawi G, Pagu J, Grimsditch G (2019) Temperature patterns and mechanisms influencing coral bleaching during the 2016 El Niño. Nature Climate Change. <https://doi.org/10.1038/s41558-019-0576-8>
- McClanahan TR, Schroeder RE, Friedlander AM, Vigliola L, Wantiez L, Caselle JE, Graham NAJ, Wilson S, Edgar GJ, Stuart-Smith RD, Oddenyo RM, Cinner JC (2019) Global baselines and benchmarks for fish biomass: Comparing remote and fisheries closures. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 612:167–192
- McLean M, Cuetos-Bueno J, Nedlic O, Luckymiss M, Houk P (2017) Local stressors, resilience, and shifting baselines on coral reefs. PLoS ONE 11:e0166319
- Mollica NR, Cohen AL, Alpert AE, Barkley HC, Brainard RE, Carilli JE, DeCarlo TM, Drenkard EJ, Lohmann P, Mangubhai S, Pietro KR (2019) Skeletal records of bleaching reveal different thermal thresholds of Pacific coral reef assemblages. Coral Reefs
- Nakamura T, Van Woesik R (2001) Water-flow rates and passive diffusion partially explain differential survival of corals during the 1998 bleaching event. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 212:301–304
- Nakamura N, Kayanne H, Iijima H, McClanahan TR, Behera SK, Yamagata T (2011) Footprints of IOD and ENSO in the Kenyan coral record. Geophys Res Lett 38:L24708
- Obura D, Gudka M, Abdou Rabi F, Bacha Gian S, Bijoux J, Freed S, Maharavo J, Mwaura J, Porter S, Sola E, Wickel J (2017) Coral reef status report for the western Indian Ocean. Global coral reef monitoring network (GCRMN)/international coral reef initiative (ICRI). In: Obura D, Gudka M, Rabi FB, Gian SB, Bijoux J, Sarah Freed, Maharavo J, Mwaura J, Porter S, Sola E, Wickel J, Yahya S, Ahamada S (eds). CORDIO East Africa
- Palumbi SR, Barshis DJ, Traylor-Knowles N, Bay RA (2014) Mechanisms of reef coral resistance to future climate change. Science 344:895–898
- Pillay RM, Terashima H, Kawasaki H (2002) The extent and intensity of the 1998 mass bleaching event on the reefs of Mauritius, Indian Ocean. Galaxea 4:43–52
- Pillay RM, Terashima H, Venkatasami AA, Uchida H (2002) Field Guide to Corals of Mauritius. Albion Fisheries Research Centre, Albion, Petite Riviere, Mauritius
- Pous S, Lazure P, André G, Dumas F, Halo I, Penven P (2014) Circulation around La Réunion and Mauritius islands in the south-western Indian Ocean: A modeling perspective. Journal of Geophysical Research: Oceans 119:1957–1976
- Precht WF, Aronson RB (2004) Climate flickers and range shifts of reef corals. Frontiers in Ecology and Environment 2:307–314
- Randall CJ, Toth LT, Leichter JJ, Maté JL, Aronson RB (2019) Upwelling buffers climate change impacts on coral reefs of the eastern tropical Pacific. Ecology. [https://doi.org/10.1002/ecy.](https://doi.org/10.1002/ecy.2918) [2918](https://doi.org/10.1002/ecy.2918)
- Riegl BM, Sheppard CRC, Purkis SJ (2012) Human impact on atolls leads to coral loss and community homogenization: A modeling study. PLoS ONE 7:e36921
- Roberts CM, McClean CJ, Veron JEN, Hawkins JP, Allen GR, McAllister DE, Mittermeier CG, Schueler FW, Spalding M, Wells F, Vynne C, Werner TB (2002) Marine biodiversity hotspots and conservation priorities for tropical reefs. Science 295:1280–1284
- Safaie A, Silbiger NJ, McClanahan TR, Pawlak G, Barshis DJ, Hench JL, Rogers JS, Williams GJ, Davis KA (2018) High frequency temperature variability reduces the risk of coral bleaching. Nature Communications 9:2244
- Sully S, Burkepile DE, Donovan MK, Hodgson G, van Woesik R (2019) A global analysis of coral bleaching over the past two decades. Nature Communications 10:1–5
- Tanner JE (1995) Competition between scleractinian corals and macroalgae: An experimental investigation of coral growth, survival and reproduction. J Exp Mar Biol Ecol 190:151–168
- Tkachenko KS, Soong K (2017) Dongsha Atoll: A potential thermal refuge for reef-building corals in the South China Sea. Marine Environmental Research 127:112–125
- <span id="page-21-0"></span>Van Hooidonk R, Maynard J, Tamelander J, Gove J, Ahmadia G, Raymundo L, Williams G, Heron SF, Planes S (2016) Localscale projections of coral reef futures and implications of the Paris Agreement. Scientific Reports 6:39666
- Venegas RM, Oliver T, Liu G, Heron SF, Clark SJ, Pomeroy N, Young C, Eakin CM, Brainard RE (2019) The Rarity of Depth Refugia from Coral Bleaching Heat Stress in the Western and Central Pacific Islands. Scientific Reports 9:1–12
- Walker ND (1989) Sea surface temperature-rainfall relationships and associated ocean-atmosphere coupling mechanisms in the southern African region. University of Cape Town,
- Wang B, Luo X, Yang YM, Sun W, Cane MA, Cai W, Yeh SW, Liu J (2019) Historical change of El Niño properties sheds light on

future changes of extreme El Niño. Proc Natl Acad Sci 116:22512–22517

Zinke J, Gilmour JP, Fisher R, Puotinen M, Maina J, Darling E, Stat M, Richards ZT, McClanahan TR, Beger M, Moore C (2018) Gradients of disturbance and environmental conditions shape coral community structure for south-eastern Indian Ocean reefs. Divers Distrib 24:605–620

Publisher's Note Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.