### REPORT

# Nitrogen fixation rates in algal turf communities of a degraded versus less degraded coral reef

Joost den Haan • Petra M. Visser • Anjani E. Ganase • Elfi E. Gooren • Lucas J. Stal • Fleur C. van Duyl • Mark J. A. Vermeij • Jef Huisman

Received: 9 January 2014 / Accepted: 1 September 2014 / Published online: 10 September 2014 - Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg 2014

Abstract Algal turf communities are ubiquitous on coral reefs in the Caribbean and are often dominated by  $N_2$ fixing cyanobacteria. However, it is largely unknown (1) how much  $N_2$  is actually fixed by turf communities and (2) which factors affect their  $N_2$  fixation rates. Therefore, we compared  $N_2$  fixation activity by turf communities at different depths and during day and night-time on a degraded versus a less degraded coral reef site on the island of Curação. N<sub>2</sub> fixation rates measured with the acetylene reduction assay were slightly higher in shallow (5–10-m depth) than in deep turf communities (30-m depth), and  $N_2$ fixation rates during the daytime significantly exceeded those during the night.  $N_2$  fixation rates by the turf communities did not differ between the degraded and less degraded reef. Both our study and a literature survey of earlier studies indicated that turf communities tend to have

Communicated by Ecology Editor Dr. Stuart Sandin

Electronic supplementary material The online version of this article (doi:[10.1007/s00338-014-1207-5\)](http://dx.doi.org/10.1007/s00338-014-1207-5) contains supplementary material, which is available to authorized users.

J. den Haan · P. M. Visser  $(\boxtimes)$  · A. E. Ganase · L. J. Stal - M. J. A. Vermeij - J. Huisman Department of Aquatic Microbiology, Institute for Biodiversity and Ecosystem Dynamics, University of Amsterdam, PO Box 94248, 1090 GE Amsterdam, The Netherlands e-mail: p.m.visser@uva.nl

Present Address:

A. E. Ganase

Coral Reef Ecosystems Lab, School of Biological Sciences, The University of Queensland, St Lucia, QLD 4072, Australia

E. E. Gooren

Department of Microbiology, Radboud University, Heyendaalseweg 135, 6525 AJ Nijmegen, The Netherlands lower  $N_2$  fixation rates than cyanobacterial mats. However, at least in our study area, turf communities were more abundant than cyanobacterial mats. Our results therefore suggest that turf communities play an important role in the nitrogen cycle of coral reefs.  $N_2$  fixation by turfs may contribute to an undesirable positive feedback that promotes the proliferation of algal turf communities while accelerating coral reef degradation.

Keywords Algal turf · Benthic cyanobacteria · Coral reefs  $\cdot$  Nitrogen cycle  $\cdot$  N<sub>2</sub> fixation

# Introduction

During recent decades, many coral reefs have shifted from coral to algal dominance (Done [1992;](#page-10-0) McManus and Polsenberg [2004](#page-11-0); Hughes et al. [2007;](#page-11-0) Cheal et al. [2010\)](#page-10-0). The algal-dominated state often consists of macroalgae, but small turf algae have also increased (Barott et al. [2009](#page-10-0); Vermeij et al. [2010\)](#page-12-0). Algal turf communities (henceforth called 'turfs') are heterogeneous assemblages of

L. J. Stal

F. C. van Duyl Department of Biological Oceanography, Royal Netherlands Institute for Sea Research (NIOZ), PO Box 59, 1790 AB Den Burg, The Netherlands

M. J. A. Vermeij Carmabi Foundation, Piscaderabaai z/n, PO Box 2090, Willemstad, Curaçao

Department of Marine Microbiology, Royal Netherlands Institute for Sea Research (NIOZ), PO Box 140, 4400 AC Yerseke, The Netherlands

Chlorophyta, Phaeophyta, Rhodophyta, and filamentous Cyanobacteria (Steneck and Dethier [1994](#page-12-0); Diaz-Pulido and McCook [2002;](#page-10-0) Fricke et al. [2011\)](#page-10-0). Turfs are important primary producers on reefs that are intensively grazed (Adey and Goertemiller [1987;](#page-10-0) Carpenter and Williams [2007\)](#page-10-0), compete for space against corals (Barott et al. [2009](#page-10-0); Vermeij et al. [2010](#page-12-0)), provide shelter for various meiofauna (Zeller [1988;](#page-12-0) Logan et al. [2008\)](#page-11-0), and may play a key role in the recycling of nutrients (Charpy-Roubaud et al. [2001](#page-10-0); Charpy et al. [2007;](#page-10-0) Fricke et al. [2011;](#page-10-0) Charpy et al. [2012](#page-10-0)). Turfs currently represent the single most dominant benthic component on many coral reefs in the Caribbean (Kramer [2003;](#page-11-0) Vermeij et al. [2010](#page-12-0)), Central Pacific (Barott et al. [2009,](#page-10-0) [2012\)](#page-10-0), Red Sea (Haas et al. [2010](#page-11-0)), and Indonesia (Wangpraseurt et al. [2012](#page-12-0)).

Many of the cyanobacteria in turfs are capable of nitrogen  $(N_2)$  fixation (Charpy et al. [2012\)](#page-10-0). Nitrogen is one of the key elements often limiting primary productivity on coral reefs (Littler et al. [1991](#page-11-0); Delgado and Lapointe [1994](#page-10-0); Larned [1998;](#page-11-0) Den Haan et al.  $2013$ ), and hence, N<sub>2</sub> fixation provides access to an important additional N source.  $N_2$ fixation is very sensitive to oxygen, and diazotrophic cyanobacteria evolved various strategies to accommodate the incompatible processes of oxygenic photosynthesis and N2 fixation (e.g., Bergman et al. [1997](#page-10-0); Zehr [2011\)](#page-12-0). Some cyanobacteria developed specialized cells known as heterocysts to separate  $N_2$  fixation from oxygen production, and these heterocystous species often show higher  $N_2$  fixation activity during daytime than at night (Mullineaux et al. [1981](#page-11-0); Staal et al. [2002\)](#page-12-0). In contrast, many non-heterocystous diazotrophic cyanobacteria fix  $N_2$  during the night, fuelled by respiration of the carbohydrates built up by photosynthesis during the preceding daytime (Schneegurt et al. [1994](#page-11-0); Dron et al. [2012;](#page-10-0) Brauer et al. [2013\)](#page-10-0). The  $N_2$  fixed by cyanobacteria may be released as dissolved inorganic and organic N through leakage from the cells, cell death, or lysis (Berman and Bronk [2003](#page-10-0); Benavides et al. [2013](#page-10-0)) and thereby becomes available for other organisms in the community (Mulholland et al. [2006](#page-11-0); Agawin et al. [2007\)](#page-10-0).

Eutrophication of coastal waters is a major problem in many densely populated (sub)tropical regions (Nyström et al. [2000\)](#page-11-0) and is often associated with a phase shift from coral to algal dominance (Done [1992](#page-10-0); Hughes [1994](#page-11-0); Cheal et al. [2010\)](#page-10-0). To what extent eutrophication may affect the relative importance of  $N_2$  fixation on coral reefs is still an open question. Generally speaking, N enrichment may alleviate ecosystems from N limitation, which would diminish the need for  $N_2$  fixation, and hence decrease the abundance of  $N_2$ -fixing cyanobacteria (Smith [1983;](#page-12-0) Conley et al. [2009](#page-10-0)). However, if N continues to be limiting (e.g., if externally supplied N is utilized as quickly as it is supplied), then  $N_2$  fixation will not be suppressed and  $N_2$ - fixing organisms may still prevail. Indeed, lake studies have shown that  $N_2$  fixation rates can be high in eutrophic waters, especially during episodes with a relative shortage of N (Howarth et al. [1988;](#page-11-0) Scott et al. [2009](#page-11-0); Paerl [2009](#page-11-0)).

 $N_2$  fixation on coral reefs has been studied for almost 40 yrs (Webb et al. [1975](#page-12-0); Wiebe et al. [1975](#page-12-0)). Most studies have focused on  $N_2$  fixed by solitary or mat-forming benthic cyanobacteria (e.g., O'Neil and Capone [1989](#page-11-0); Charpy-Roubaud et al. [2001;](#page-10-0) Charpy et al. [2007](#page-10-0), [2010\)](#page-10-0), whereas only a few studies have investigated  $N_2$  fixation in turfs (Wilkinson and Sammarco [1983;](#page-12-0) Wilkinson et al. [1984](#page-12-0); Larkum et al. [1988](#page-11-0); Williams and Carpenter [1997](#page-12-0), [1998](#page-12-0); Davey et al. [2008\)](#page-10-0). Little is known about the major environmental determinants of  $N_2$  fixation by turfs. For instance, it is not known to what extent depth-dependent variation in cyanobacterial composition and light conditions affect the  $N_2$  fixation activity of the turfs. Furthermore, it is not known whether turfs fix  $N_2$  mainly during the day or night, or whether  $N_2$  fixation by turfs is affected by the degradation of coral reefs associated with coastal eutrophication. The main goals of this study were therefore (1) to quantify  $N_2$  fixation by turfs in relation to water depth and the day–night cycle and (2) to compare  $N_2$  fixation by turfs on a degraded reef near a densely inhabited area versus a less degraded coral reef at a more remote site. We compared our results with published data from solitary cyanobacteria, mat-forming cyanobacteria, and turfs on reefs elsewhere in the world.

#### Materials and methods

#### Research sites and composition of turfs

This study was conducted on the leeward side of the island of Curação, Southern Caribbean, during June–August of 2011. We investigated two sites: 'Buoy 0'  $(12^{\circ}7'29.07''N,$ 68°58′22.92″W) and 'Playa Kalki'  $(12^{\circ}22'30.9''N,$  $69^{\circ}9'31.49''$ W; Fig. [1\)](#page-2-0). Buoy 0 is a degraded reef only a few kilometres downstream of the capital Willemstad with its industrial harbour and near the outlet of the eutrophied Piscadera Bay. Over the past 40 yr, coral cover of the shallow reefs at Buoy 0 has decreased dramatically (Bak et al. [2005\)](#page-10-0). Playa Kalki is located  $\sim$  35 km from the major population centre of Willemstad. It is a less degraded reef with higher hard coral cover, and lower algal and cyanobacterial cover, and lower dissolved nutrient concentrations than at Buoy 0 (see Results).

Turfs on the reefs at Buoy 0 consist of a mixed community of algae belonging to the Chlorophyta, Rhodophyta, Phaeophyta, and Cyanobacteria (Fricke et al. [2011](#page-10-0)). This study found that at 5-m depth, the turf community at Buoy 0 was dominated by Cyanobacteria, notably the heterocystous species Dichothrix utahensis (Fricke et al.

<span id="page-2-0"></span>

Fig. 1 Map indicating research sites Buoy 0 and Playa Kalki on Curaçao, Southern Caribbean (12°10'N, 68°58'W). Dark grey zones are urbanized areas, including the capital Willemstad and its industrial harbour (hatched area)

[2011\)](#page-10-0). At 15-m depth, the relative abundances of Cyanobacteria, Chlorophyta, Rhodophyta, and Phaeophyta were more evenly distributed (Fricke et al. [2011\)](#page-10-0). At 25-m depth, Cyanobacteria represented  $\sim$  40 % of the turf community, dominated by the non-heterocystous cyanobacteria Lyngbya spp. and Oscillatoria spp., whereas the heterocystous species D. utahensis was rare (Fricke et al.  $2011$ ). At Playa Kalki, we observed the same N<sub>2</sub>-fixing cyanobacteria as at Buoy 0 (i.e., with Dichothrix spp. near the surface, and Lyngbya spp. and Oscillatoria spp. in deeper parts of the reef).

#### Reef characteristics

Surveys comparing the dominant benthic communities at both Buoy 0 and Playa Kalki were conducted along 100-m transects, placed alongside the 5, 10, 20, and 30-m isobath. Benthic cover of hard corals, macroalgae, turfs, and cyanobacterial mats was determined from photographs of 60 quadrats  $(1.5 \text{ m}^2)$  randomly placed along both sides of the transects. The photographs were analysed using the program Coral Point Count with Excel Extensions (CPCe; Kohler and Gill [2006\)](#page-11-0).

Light profiles were measured with a Hydrolab DS5 Sonde (OTT Messtechnik GmbH & Co., Kempten, Germany;  $n = 5$  at both Buoy 0 and Playa Kalki). Furthermore, water samples for nutrient analysis were taken along each horizontal transect at 10 cm above the reef using a 50-ml Terumo syringe (Terumo Europe, Leuven, Belgium;  $n = 9$  at both Buoy 0 and Playa Kalki). Water samples were immediately filtered at the diving site using  $0.22$ - $\mu$ m Acrodisc filters and stored in 6-ml polyethylene vials (PerkinElmer, MA, USA) at  $-20$  °C until further analysis. Concentrations of  $NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  (Grasshoff et al. [1983](#page-10-0)),  $NH<sub>4</sub><sup>+</sup>$ 

(Helder and De Vries [1979](#page-11-0)), and  $PO_4^{3-}$  (Murphy and Riley [1962](#page-11-0)) were analysed at the Royal Netherlands Institute for Sea Research (NIOZ), Texel, the Netherlands, using continuous flow analysis via a Quatro auto-analyzer (Seal Analytical, UK).

#### Sampling and incubation of turfs

The  $N_2$  fixation measurements required controlled incubation of turf samples. For this purpose, turfs were not collected directly off the reef, because scraping turfs off the rocks would damage the algal tissue and the rock underneath. Instead, turfs were grown on the exterior of 1.5-L square plastic bottles (FIJI Water Company, CA, USA), which were placed inside  $1-m<sup>3</sup>$  chicken-wired cages (mesh  $(22.5 \text{ cm})$ . Growing turfs on plastic bottles ensured that the turfs were of approximately similar size and age and resulted in minimal damage to the live tissue of the turfs. Encaging prevented grazing by large herbivores (i.e.,  $>2.5$  cm in diameter) to ensure sufficient turf growth on the bottles. In May 2011, the encaged bottles were positioned at depths of 5, 10, 20, and 30 m using SCUBA diving. The bottles were placed 0.5 m above the reef to avoid overgrowth by benthic cyanobacterial mats or macroalgae and remained on the reefs of Buoy 0 and Playa Kalki for 63–79 d and 49–77 d, respectively. This growth period provided ample time for the establishment of turf communities with benthic cyanobacteria.

Plastic bottles were retrieved from each depth (5, 10, 20, and 30 m) between 23 June and 3 August 2011. Small strips  $(1.5 \times 2.0 \text{ cm})$ ; six strips per depth) containing turfs were cut out of the plastic bottles using scissors. In the laboratory, each strip was placed inside a 10-ml headspace crimp vial (VWR, the Netherlands) containing  $7 \text{ ml of } 0.22 \text{ µm filtered}$ ambient seawater (Whatman cellulose acetate membrane filters,  $\emptyset$ 25 mm). Vials were then sealed with a gastight liner and an aluminium cap (Agilent Technologies, Santa Clara, CA, USA) using a vial crimper and stored in a flow-through aquarium to keep the turfs at the same temperature as on the reef  $(27-29 \degree C)$ . The average light intensity inside the aquarium, measured with a Hydrolab DS5 Sonde (OTT Messtechnik GmbH & Co., Kempten, Germany), was  $\sim$  100 µmol photons m<sup>-2</sup> s<sup>-1</sup> during the daytime. This light level is comparable to light intensities measured on the reefs at 20–30-m depth during sunny days. However, it is below the saturation light intensity of 200 µmol photons  $m^{-2}$  s<sup>-1</sup> of the in situ photosynthetic activity of the turfs, measured according to Ralph and Gademann [\(2005](#page-11-0)) with a Diving-PAM/B Underwater Fluorometer (Walz Mess- und Regeltechnik, Effeltrich, Germany; J. Den Haan, unpublished results). The vials were acclimated inside the flowthrough aquarium until the acetylene reduction assay (ARA, see below) commenced at 1900 hrs on the day of collection.

We incubated six strips per depth and per research site. each in a separate vial. In addition, we used one clean strip (without turfs) per depth and per research site as a negative control. Furthermore, the mat-forming cyanobacterium Oscillatoria spp.  $(n = 6)$  was collected off sandy sediments at Buoy 0 and solitary tufts of Symploca spp.  $(n = 6)$ were collected from rocks at Playa Kalki, both at 5-m depth. Oscillatoria and Symploca spp. are known to be active  $N_2$  fixers (Charpy et al. [2010\)](#page-10-0), and their  $N_2$  fixation rates were compared to the turfs.

# Acetylene reduction assay

The ARA was used to measure the nitrogenase activity of the N2-fixing organisms residing in the turfs (Stewart et al. [1967](#page-12-0); Charpy et al. [2007\)](#page-10-0). Briefly, 2.5 ml of acetylene gas was injected into the vials using a 2.5 MR-GT gastight syringe (SGE Analytical Science, UK) giving an acetylene concentration in the headspace of 33 % (Stal [1988](#page-12-0); Zuckermann et al. [1997\)](#page-12-0). Directly after injecting the acetylene, which was always at 1900 hrs (sunset), a 1-ml gas sample was taken from the vial using the same syringe to correct for background ethylene. Subsequent samples were taken after 12 h (at 0700 hrs; sunrise) and after 24 h (at 1900 hrs the next day) to quantify  $N_2$  fixation during night-time and the full 24-h period, respectively. Daytime  $N_2$  fixation was calculated by subtracting the night-time  $N_2$  fixation from the total  $N<sub>2</sub>$  fixation after 24 h. Once a gas sample was taken from a vial, the sample was immediately transferred into a 6-ml Vacuette (Greiner Bio-One, The Netherlands), which was completely filled with a saturated salt (NaCl) solution, to properly conserve the gas samples until further analysis.

The ethylene content of the gas samples was analysed with a gas chromatograph (GC-14B, Shimadzu, Kyoto, Japan), using acetylene as an internal standard (Stal [1988](#page-12-0)). The gas chromatograph was equipped with a flame ionization detector and a 3-m Porapak R column (2 mm inner diameter; Chrompack). The temperatures of the injector and detector were set to 70 and 90  $\degree$ C, respectively. From the headspace of each Vacuette, 0.1 ml was injected into the gas chromatograph using a gastight disposable syringe. The retention time for ethylene  $(C_2H_4)$  and acetylene  $(C_2H_2)$  were 1.9 and 2.7 min, respectively. Ethylene production was converted to  $N_2$  fixation using a conversion factor of four (Stal [1988;](#page-12-0) Mulholland et al. [2004](#page-11-0)).

#### Chlorophyll  $a$  analysis

After 24 h of incubation, the plastic strips were removed from the vials to determine the amount of chlorophyll  $a$  as a measure of turf biomass. Chlorophyll  $a$  was extracted by grinding the samples in 10 ml of 100 % methanol using a mortar and pestle in an ice bath and under dim light.

Extraction was continued for 24 h in a refrigerator  $(4 \degree C)$ inside test tubes covered with aluminium foil. Subsequently, the extracts were centrifuged for 15 min at 3,500 rpm to separate the plastic particles from the extraction solvent. The chlorophyll a concentration of the extracts was measured on a T60 UV/Vis spectrophotometer (PG Instruments Ltd, Wibtoft, UK) according to Porra et al. [\(1989](#page-11-0)).

## Statistical analysis

We used a two-way analysis of variance to test whether the measured nutrient concentrations, turf cover and turf biomass varied significantly with depth (5, 10, 20, 30 m) and research site (Buoy 0, Playa Kalki). A three-way analysis of variance was applied to test whether  $N_2$  fixation rates varied significantly with depth, research site, and time of day (day vs. night). We used type III sum of squares to account for unbalanced data, because some strips were damaged or lost during the  $N_2$  fixation analysis. The dependent variables were log-transformed if this improved the homogeneity of variance, as tested by Levene's test. Post hoc comparisons of the means were based on Tukey's HSD test using a significance level  $(\alpha)$  of 0.05.

# Results

## Reef characteristics

The coral reef ecosystem at Buoy 0 had a significantly lower cover of corals and the macroalga *Dictyota* spp. than Playa Kalki and a significantly higher cover of the macroalga Lobophora variegata and cyanobacterial mats (Table [1\)](#page-4-0). The water at Buoy 0 was slightly but significantly more turbid than at Playa Kalki, as revealed by comparison of the slopes of the log-transformed light profiles (ANCOVA,  $F_{1,59} = 20.176$ ,  $p < 0.001$ ; Fig. [2a](#page-4-0)).  $NO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  concentrations were significantly higher at Buoy 0 than at Playa Kalki at 5- and 10-m depth, but not at 20- and 30-m depth (Figs. [2b](#page-4-0), d; Table [2](#page-5-0)).  $PO<sub>4</sub><sup>3-</sup>$  concentrations were significantly higher at Buoy 0 than at Playa Kalki at 5-m depth only (Fig. [2](#page-4-0)d; Table [2\)](#page-5-0).  $NH_4^+$  concentrations were similar at both sites (Fig. [2](#page-4-0)c; Table [2](#page-5-0)). The ambient N/P ratio of  $21.2 \pm 1.7$  (mean  $\pm$  SE) at Buoy 0 was significantly higher than the N/P ratio of  $15.3 \pm 1.0$  at Playa Kalki (Table [2](#page-5-0)).

# Algal turfs

Turf cover on the reef decreased significantly with depth at both Buoy 0 and Playa Kalki (Fig. [3a](#page-5-0); Table [3](#page-6-0)). We did not find systematic differences in turf cover between the two research sites. Turf cover at 5-m and 30-m depth was

<span id="page-4-0"></span>



Differences between the two research sites are tested with two-way analysis of variance, with depth and research site (location) as the independent variables. Significant  $p$  values ( $p < 0.05$ ) are indicated in bold





Fig. 2 Light and nutrient conditions. a Light profiles at Buoy 0 (open diamonds with dashed trend line) and Playa Kalki (circles with solid trend line). **b** Nitrate, **c** ammonium, and **d** phosphate concentrations in water samples from different depths at Buoy 0 (dark grey bars) and

Playa Kalki (light grey bars). Error bars represent SE of the means. Bars that do not share the same letter are significantly different, as tested by two-way analysis of variance followed by post hoc comparison of the means (Table [2](#page-5-0); ESM Tables 1 and 2)

significantly higher at Buoy 0, whereas turf cover at 10 m was significantly higher at Playa Kalki. A similar pattern was found for turfs collected from the plastic bottles incubated on the reef, which showed a significant decrease in turf biomass (expressed as mg Chl  $a$  m<sup>-2</sup>) with depth that was comparable at both research sites (Fig. [3](#page-5-0)b; Table [3\)](#page-6-0).

<span id="page-5-0"></span>



Columns indicate the main and interaction effects, the degrees of freedom  $(df1$  and  $df2$ ), the *F*-statistic (*Fdf1*,  $df2$ ) and the corresponding probability (p). Significant results ( $p < 0.05$ ) are indicated in bold

## $N_2$  fixation by turfs

 $N_2$  fixation by turfs did not differ significantly between Buoy 0 and Playa Kalki (Fig. [4;](#page-6-0) Table [4](#page-6-0)). However, we found significant main effects of depth and time (day vs. night) on  $N_2$ fixation by turfs (Table [4\)](#page-6-0). More specifically, post hoc comparison of the means showed that daytime  $N_2$  fixation was significantly higher than night-time  $N_2$  fixation at each of the four depths (Fig. [4](#page-6-0)). Furthermore, during daytime, the post hoc comparison showed a tendency for higher  $N<sub>2</sub>$  fixation activity at 5- and 10-m depth than at 30-m depth at a significance level of  $p < 0.10$ , but did not reveal significant differences at  $p < 0.05$  between depths (Fig. [4;](#page-6-0) for details of the post hoc comparison, see Electronic Supplementary Material, ESM, Table 5). Averaged across all four depths and both research sites, the mean  $N_2$  fixation by turfs was  $17.4 \pm 2.8$ (mean  $\pm$  SE) mg  $N_2$  m<sup>-2</sup> 12 h<sup>-1</sup> during daytime and  $2.9 \pm 0.4$  mg N<sub>2</sub> m<sup>-2</sup> 12 h<sup>-1</sup> at night. Combined, this resulted in a total daily N<sub>2</sub> fixation of 20.3  $\pm$  2.9 mg N<sub>2</sub> m<sup>-2</sup> d<sup>-1</sup>.

For comparison, we also measured  $N_2$  fixation by two benthic non-heterocystous cyanobacteria collected at 5 m. Mat-forming Oscillatoria spp. collected off sandy sediments at Buoy 0 fixed substantially more  $N_2$  than the turfs, with a N<sub>2</sub> fixation of  $153.0 \pm 60.3$  mg N<sub>2</sub> m<sup>-2</sup> 12 h<sup>-1</sup>



Fig. 3 a Percentage cover by algal turfs on the reefs (based on  $n = 60$  quadrates per depth and research site). **b** Biomass of algal turfs growing on incubated plastic bottles ( $n = 6$  bottles per depth and research site). Data are from the research sites Buoy 0 (dark grey bars) and Playa Kalki (light grey bars). Error bars represent SE of the means. Bars that do not share the same letter are significantly different, as tested by two-way analysis of variance followed by post hoc comparison of the means (Table [3;](#page-6-0) ESM Tables 3 and 4)

during daytime and  $13.7 \pm 2.8$  mg N<sub>2</sub> m<sup>-2</sup> 12 h<sup>-1</sup> at night. Solitary-growing Symploca spp. collected from rocks at Playa Kalki also showed high  $N_2$  fixation activity, of 66.9  $\pm$  45.7 mg N<sub>2</sub> m<sup>-2</sup> 12 h<sup>-1</sup> during daytime and 4.9  $\pm$  2.7 mg N<sub>2</sub> m<sup>-2</sup> 12 h<sup>-1</sup> at night.

We calculated the total  $N_2$  fixation of turfs on a reef-wide scale as the product of their daily  $N_2$  fixation and the cover of turfs on the coral reef. This revealed that total  $N_2$  fixation at the reef scale was higher in the top 10 m than at greater depths, but did not differ between the degraded reef at Buoy 0 and the less degraded reef at Playa Kalki (Fig. [5](#page-6-0)).

# Discussion

 $N_2$  fixation in algal turf communities

Our results show substantial  $N_2$ -fixation activity in algal turf communities on the reefs of Curaçao, extending to a depth of at least 30 m. At the reef scale, the highest  $N_2$ fixation activity by turfs was in the upper 10 m, which was mainly due to the higher cover of turfs in these shallow

<span id="page-6-0"></span>Table 3 Two-way analysis of variance of the turf cover on the reef and turf biomass on the plastic bottles, with depth and location as independent variables

Effect	$df_1, df_2$	F	p
Turf cover on the reef			
Location	1, 463	6.035	0.014
Depth	3, 463	110.064	< 0.001
Location $\times$ Depth	3, 463	18.606	< 0.001
Turf biomass on the plastic bottles			
Location	1, 38	3.417	0.072
Depth	3, 38	29.227	< 0.001
Location $\times$ Depth	3, 38	5.580	0.003

Columns indicate the investigated effects, degrees of freedom (df1 and  $df2$ ), the *F*-statistic (*Fdf1,df2*) and the corresponding probability (p). Significant results ( $p < 0.05$ ) are indicated in bold



Fig. 4  $N_2$  fixation by turfs at Buoy 0 (dark grey bars) and Playa Kalki (light grey bars) as function of depth. a Daytime  $N_2$  fixation (0700–1900 hrs); **b** night-time  $N_2$  fixation (1900–0700 hrs). Error bars represent SE of the means. Bars that do not share the same letter are significantly different, as tested by three-way analysis of variance followed by post hoc comparison of the means (Table 4; ESM Table 5). Because the rate of  $N_2$  fixation was not significantly different between Buoy 0 and Playa Kalki, both research sites are aggregated in the post hoc comparison as indicated by the braces

parts of the reef. The strong proliferation of turfs in shallow waters was confirmed by the high turf biomass that developed on the plastic bottles incubated within the upper 10 m of the water column. The incubated bottles were

**Table 4** Three-way analysis of variance of the  $N_2$  fixation rate by turfs (mg  $N_2$  m<sup>-2</sup> turf 12 h<sup>-1</sup>), with depth, location (Buoy 0 vs. Playa Kalki) and time of day (day vs. night) as independent variables

Effect	$df_1, df_2$	F	p
Location	1,68	0.006	0.940
Depth	3, 68	5.979	0.001
Time (day vs. night)	1,68	66.089	< 0.001
Location $\times$ Depth	3,68	1.527	0.215
Location $\times$ Time	1,68	0.659	0.420
Depth $\times$ Time	3,68	0.678	0.568
Location $\times$ Depth $\times$ Time	3,68	0.972	0.411

Columns indicate the investigated effects, degrees of freedom (df1 and  $df2$ ), the *F*-statistic (*Fdf1,df2*) and the corresponding probability (p). Significant results ( $p < 0.05$ ) are indicated in bold



Fig. 5 Total daily N<sub>2</sub> fixation on 100 m<sup>2</sup> of reef at Buoy 0 (dark grey bars) and Playa Kalki (light grey bars). Error bars represent SE of the means

protected from grazing by herbivores larger than 2.5 cm, and therefore, the prevalence of turfs in shallow waters was probably not due to depth-dependent variation in grazing rates of mid- and large-sized herbivores. Several studies have pointed out that turfs have high light requirements (e.g., Carpenter [1985;](#page-10-0) Klumpp et al. [1987](#page-11-0)), and therefore at greater depth, they have difficulty competing with other algae (Steneck and Dethier [1994](#page-12-0)). This would offer a plausible explanation for the observed depth distribution of turfs and is also consistent with the higher abundances of turfs in the shallower parts of other reefs (Van den Hoek et al. [1975;](#page-12-0) Adey and Goertemiller [1987;](#page-10-0) Steneck and Dethier [1994](#page-12-0)).

We observed a much higher  $N_2$  fixation activity during the day than at night. This contrasts with several studies of microbial mats in the temperate zone, which typically show higher night-time  $N_2$  fixation activity (Villbrandt et al. [1990](#page-12-0); Severin and Stal [2008](#page-11-0)). However, cyanobacterial mats dominated by heterocystous species showed higher levels of  $N_2$  fixation during daytime on coral reefs in St. Croix and New Caledonia (Williams and Carpenter [1997](#page-12-0); Charpy-Roubaud et al. [2001](#page-10-0); Charpy et al. [2007](#page-10-0)).

<span id="page-7-0"></span>Table 5 Nitrogen fixation rates by turfs and benthic (cyano-) bacteria from other coral reefs around the world

Benthic community	Region	Location	Depth (m)	Substrate	Total N <sub>2</sub> fixation $\text{(mg N}_2 \text{ m}^{-2} \text{ d}^{-1})$	Reference
Turf	Caribbean	Buoy 0, Curaçao	$\mathfrak{S}$	Plastic discs	$24.8 \pm 6.9$	This study
Turf	Caribbean	Buoy 0, Curaçao	10	Plastic discs	$34.8 \pm 12.4$	This study
Turf	Caribbean	Buoy 0, Curaçao	20	Plastic discs	$9.7 \pm 2.1$	This study
Turf	Caribbean	Buoy 0, Curaçao	30	Plastic discs	$8.7 \pm 1.9$	This study
Turf	Caribbean	Playa Kalki, Curaçao	$\mathfrak{S}$	Plastic discs	$23.4 \pm 5.2$	This study
Turf	Caribbean	Playa Kalki, Curaçao	10	Plastic discs	$33.8 \pm 15.3$	This study
Turf	Caribbean	Playa Kalki, Curaçao	20	Plastic discs	$18.4 \pm 5.3$	This study
Turf	Caribbean	Playa Kalki, Curaçao	30	Plastic discs	$10.5 \pm 3.4$	This study
Turf	Caribbean	Tague Bay, US Virgin Islands	3	Dead coral	$6.6 \pm 1.1$	Williams and Carpenter (1997)
Turf	Caribbean	Smithsonian Institute		Microcosm	$5.6 - 80.6*$	Carpenter et al. (1991)
Turf	<b>Great Barrier</b> Reef	Heron Island-exp. tanks		Dead coral	$1.0 - 19.2*$	Davey et al. $(2008)$
Turf	Great Barrier Reef	<b>Britomart</b>	10	Dead coral	$13.9 - 61.7*$	Wilkinson and Sammarco (1983)
Turf	Great Barrier Reef	Myrmidon & Dip Reef	$1 - 9$	Rock	$2.7 - 3.2*$	Wilkinson et al. (1984)
Turf	Great Barrier Reef	One Tree Island	$0 - 5$	Dead coral	$8.3*$	Larkum et al. $(1988)$
Turf	Hawaiian Islands	Kaneohe Bay, Oahu	$\leq$ 2	Dead coral	$22.7 \pm 9.2*$	Williams and Carpenter (1998)
Oscillatoria spp.	Caribbean	Buoy 0, Curaçao	5	Sand	$166.8 \pm 60.3$	This study
Symploca spp.	Caribbean	Playa Kalki, Curaçao	5	Rock	$71.8 \pm 47.9$	This study
(cyano)bacteria	Red Sea	Gulf of Eilat	$0.5 - 10$	Sand	$32.8 \pm 29.4$	Shashar et al. (1994)
(cyano)bacteria	Red Sea	Gulf of Eilat	$4 - 6$	Dead coral	$93.2 \pm 47.9$	Shashar et al. (1994)
(cyano)bacteria	SW Indian Ocean	La Saline, La Réunion	$0 - 2$	Dead coral	$2.1 \pm 1.2$	Casareto et al. (2008)
Cyanobacteria	SW Indian Ocean	La Saline, La Réunion	$0 - 2$	Mats	$97.0 \pm 2.3$	Casareto et al. $(2008)$
Cyanobacteria	Great Barrier Reef	One Tree Island	$0 - 5$	Sand	$0.2 - 0.5$	Larkum et al. $(1988)$
(cyano)bacteria	French Polynesia	Tikehau (58 sites)	$0 - 4$	Sand	$0.4 - 3.9$	Charpy-Roubaud et al. (2001)
(cyano)bacteria	French Polynesia	Tikehau (58 sites)	$0 - 4$	Sock	2.1	Charpy-Roubaud et al. (2001)
Cyanobacteria	Marshall Islands	Enewetak Atoll	intertidal	Mats	42.9– 71.7	Wiebe et al. $(1975)$
Cyanobacteria	Marshall Islands	Enewetak Atoll	$3-6$	Algae	$5.7*$	Wiebe et al. $(1975)$
Calothrix spp.	Marshall Islands	Enewetak Atoll	9	Dead coral	$5.4*$	Mague and Holm-Hansen (1975)
Nostoc spp.	Marshall Islands	Enewetak Atoll	9	Mats	$100.8*$	Mague and Holm-Hansen (1975)
Cyanobacteria	SW Pacific	New Caledonia	21	Mats	$16.4 \pm 5.4$	Charpy et al. (2007)

Table 5 continued





All data (mean  $\pm$  SE) in this table are based on acetylene reduction assays; we used a conversion factor of 4 to convert acetylene reduction to N2 fixation

\* Based on daytime N2 fixation measurements only

Heterocystous cyanobacteria were also the main diazotrophs at our sites, especially in turfs growing in the upper 10 m of the reef, where *Dichothrix utahensis* dominated the turf communities (Fricke et al. [2011](#page-10-0)). Although most heterocystous cyanobacteria can fix  $N_2$  in the dark, they usually exhibit higher  $N_2$  fixation activity during daytime (Mullineaux et al. [1981;](#page-11-0) Staal et al. [2002\)](#page-12-0). Hence, the dominance of heterocystous cyanobacteria in the turfs likely explains the observed higher daytime  $N_2$  fixation.

The data were obtained by growing turf algae on artificial substrates incubated at different depths. Main advantages of this approach are (1) that the plastic bottles offered controlled and replicated conditions, as the turfs were grown on an identical substrate and were of similar size and age, (2) damage to algal tissues during sampling was minimal, and (3) the plastic strips could be easily handled during subsequent laboratory analyses. However, the use of an artificial substrate might have selected turf communities different from those found on the surrounding reef. We observed a similar composition of algae and cyanobacteria on the bottles as described by Fricke et al. [\(2011](#page-10-0)) for colonized turf algae on ceramic tiles in the same study area and after similar incubation times. The bottles were incubated for more than 7 weeks prior to sampling, which ensured the establishment of turf communities comprising all major taxa that were also observed in natural turfs, including Chlorophyta, Rhodophyta, Phaeophyceae, and Cyanobacteria (J. den Haan, pers. obs.). Hence, although future studies may consider a more detailed taxonomic analysis, the turf communities that developed on the bottles seemed representative of the natural turf assemblages on the reefs.

Non-heterocystous diazotrophic cyanobacteria, including Lyngbya spp. and Oscillatoria spp., prevailed in the turfs at 20–30-m depth (Fricke et al. [2011\)](#page-10-0). Most nonheterocystous cyanobacteria avoid the problem of oxygen inhibition of nitrogenase by fixing nitrogen during the night (Gallon [1992](#page-10-0); Bergman et al. [1997\)](#page-10-0). Interestingly, however, in our study, the non-heterocystous cyanobacteria Oscillatoria spp. and Symploca spp. showed highest rates of  $N_2$  fixation during the day. In a laboratory study, Fredriksson et al. ([1998\)](#page-10-0) demonstrated that the nitrogenase activity of Symploca PCC 8002 was indeed highest during daytime, consistent with our field observations.

In addition to cyanobacteria, many other Bacteria and Archaea are also capable of  $N_2$  fixation and diazotrophic microbial communities are known to be highly diverse (Zehr et al. [1995](#page-12-0); Olson et al. [1999;](#page-11-0) Severin and Stal [2010](#page-11-0)). Hence, it is possible that not only cyanobacteria but also other bacterial groups contributed to the  $N_2$  fixation activity that we observed in algal turfs at Curaçao. However, the observation that the  $N_2$  fixation activity was much higher during daytime than at night suggests that phototrophic organisms played a major role. Given the high abundance of diazotrophic cyanobacteria, it is therefore likely that most  $N_2$  fixation activity in the turfs can be attributed to cyanobacteria.

Comparison with coral reefs around the world

The rates of  $N_2$  fixation in the benthic cyanobacterial mats of Oscillatoria spp. and the solitary tufts of Symploca spp. on the reefs of Curaçao were higher than those of the turfs

and are also high compared to those of turfs, cyanobacteria, and bacteria on coral reefs in other parts of the world (Table [5](#page-7-0)). Similarly high  $N_2$  fixation rates by tropical benthic cyanobacteria have been reported from the Marshall Islands (Wiebe et al. [1975](#page-12-0)), the Red Sea (Shashar et al. [1994\)](#page-11-0), La Réunion (Casareto et al. [2008](#page-10-0)), and the Ryukyu Islands (Casareto et al. [2008](#page-10-0)). These findings are consistent with a recent review of benthic  $N_2$  fixation on coral reefs, which revealed that microbial (cyanobacterial) mats tend to have higher rates of  $N_2$  fixation than other benthic reef components (Cardini et al. [2014\)](#page-10-0).

Algal turf communities comprise a mixture of diazotrophic and non-diazotrophic organisms, and it is therefore not surprising that their rates of  $N_2$  fixation were lower than those of the cyanobacteria Oscillatoria spp. and Symploca spp. (Table [5\)](#page-7-0). The  $N_2$  fixation rates of the turfs in our study are in a similar range as those reported for other algal turf communities (Table [5](#page-7-0)). We note that the high  $N_2$  fixation rates of turfs reported by Carpenter et al. [\(1991](#page-10-0)) and Williams and Carpenter ([1998\)](#page-12-0) were associated with high flow rates, which tend to enhance  $N_2$ fixation activity, whereas our study was performed under stagnant conditions. Although turfs tend to have lower  $N_2$ fixation rates than cyanobacterial mats, algal turfs are likely to play an important role in the nitrogen budget of coral reefs. In particular, cyanobacterial mats and tufts are of a relatively ephemeral nature (Nagle and Paul [1998](#page-11-0); Kuffner and Paul [2001](#page-11-0); Albert et al. [2005](#page-10-0); Paul et al. [2005\)](#page-11-0), whereas algal turfs are present throughout the year. Moreover, at least in our study area, algal turfs cover a much larger area of the reef than cyanobacterial mats (Table [1](#page-4-0)).

## Relationship with coastal eutrophication

Several decades ago turfs were already recognized as important primary producers and potential  $N_2$  fixers on coral reefs of the Caribbean (e.g., Adey and Goertemiller [1987\)](#page-10-0). Since then, many Caribbean reefs have shown a decrease in coral cover (Gardner et al. [2003](#page-10-0); Burke et al. [2011\)](#page-10-0) and are now often dominated by turfs (Kramer [2003](#page-11-0); Vermeij et al. [2010\)](#page-12-0). Our results show that the coastal waters of Buoy 0 are more eutrophic than those of Playa Kalki. This conclusion is based on the fact that Buoy 0 shows significantly higher concentrations of nitrate and phosphate in the upper layers of the water column, a significantly higher N/P ratio, and its water is significantly more turbid in comparison with the more remote site of Playa Kalki. Moreover, Buoy 0 has a lower cover of hard corals and higher cover of the macroalga L. variegata and cyanobacterial mats than Playa Kalki. Over the past 40 yr, the live coral cover of shallow reefs in the vicinity of Buoy 0 has decreased by more than 50 % (Bak et al. [2005\)](#page-10-0).

One might hypothesize that eutrophication would result in lower rates of  $N_2$  fixation. High N availability (especially in the form of ammonium) usually decreases  $N_2$ fixation, because the assimilation of combined N is energetically cheaper than acquiring N via the energy-costly  $N_2$ fixation process (Zevenboom et al. [1981;](#page-12-0) Holl and Montoya [2005;](#page-11-0) Brauer et al. [2013](#page-10-0)). N enrichment indeed decreased  $N_2$  fixation of benthic cyanobacteria in a field study on One Tree Island, Great Barrier Reef (Koop et al. [2001](#page-11-0)). Yet, in our study, we did not find differences in the rate of  $N_2$  fixation between the turfs of Buoy 0 and Playa Kalki, despite the different trophic status of the two reef systems. Similarly, no relationship was found between  $N_2$ fixation by benthic cyanobacteria and N enrichment from sewage discharge in the Kaneohe Bay, Hawaii (Hanson and Gundersen [1976\)](#page-11-0). An explanation for the high  $N_2$  fixation activity in these degraded reefs is that the utilization of N might be close to its supply rate, thus maintaining low concentrations of dissolved inorganic N in the overlying water column. The dense cover by turfs, macroalgae, and cyanobacterial mats may enable effective removal of externally supplied N. In addition, phytoplankton above the reefs may also rapidly assimilate N (Van Duyl et al. [2002](#page-12-0); Furnas et al. [2005](#page-10-0)), and denitrification may contribute to N losses from the system (Gruber and Sarmiento [1997](#page-11-0); Deutsch et al. [2007](#page-10-0)). Even at Buoy 0, near the city of Willemstad and its industrial harbour, the concentrations of ammonium and nitrate remained below 1 µmol  $L^{-1}$ , which is sufficiently low for continued  $N_2$  fixation by marine diazotrophic cyanobacteria (Mulholland et al. [2001;](#page-11-0) Agawin et al. [2007\)](#page-10-0). These results mirror observations in eutrophic lakes, which also show high  $N_2$  fixation rates by cyanobacteria during periods of low N availability, despite the high nutrient loads to these systems (Howarth et al. [1988](#page-11-0); Scott et al. [2009\)](#page-11-0).

Previously, we showed that the photosynthetic activity of the macroalga L. variegata is co-limited by N and P at both Buoy 0 and Playa Kalki (Den Haan et al. [2013\)](#page-10-0), which is in agreement with the low concentrations of dissolved inorganic N and P at a N/P ratio close to the Redfield ratio of 16:1. Co-limitation by N and P has also been reported for primary producers in other marine ecosystems (Elser et al. [2007\)](#page-10-0), including macroalgae on the Great Barrier Reef (Schaffelke and Klumpp [1998](#page-11-0); Schaffelke [1999](#page-11-0)). The high  $N_2$  fixation activity in combination with low ambient N and P concentrations and co-limitation by N and P indicates that, even at Buoy 0, the N input from  $N_2$  fixation and land-derived sources does not yet meet ecosystem N demands. Hence, enhanced inputs of N and P will most likely lead to further expansion of cyanobacterial and algal communities. Dual reduction in both N and P loads from terrestrial sources may offer a valuable management strategy (Paerl [2009](#page-11-0); Lewis et al. [2011\)](#page-11-0) that may help to

<span id="page-10-0"></span>curtail further degradation of these valuable reef ecosystems.

Acknowledgments We thank the reviewers for their helpful comments on the manuscript. We are most grateful to Hannah Brocke of the Max Planck Institute for Marine Microbiology for her help with the field incubations, Verena Brauer and Pieter Slot of the University of Amsterdam for their help with the gas chromatographic analyses, and Jan van Ooijen of the Royal Netherlands Institute for Sea Research (NIOZ) for the nutrient analyses. This research was funded by the European Union Seventh Framework Programme (P7/ 2007–2013) under Grant Agreement No. 244161 (Future of Reefs in a Changing Environment), and the Schure-Beijerinck-Popping Fund (SBK/JK 2011-31 KNAW, the Netherlands).

#### References

- Adey WH, Goertemiller T (1987) Coral reef algal turfs: master producers in nutrient poor seas. Phycologia 26:374–386
- Agawin NSR, Rabouille S, Veldhuis MJW, Servatius L, Hol S, van Overzee HMJ, Huisman J (2007) Competition and facilitation between unicellular nitrogen-fixing cyanobacteria and non-nitrogen-fixing phytoplankton species. Limnol Oceanogr 52:2233–2248
- Albert S, O'Neil JM, Udy JW, Ahern KS, O'Sullivan CM, Dennison WC (2005) Blooms of the cyanobacterium Lyngbya majuscula in coastal Queensland, Australia: disparate sites, common factors. Mar Pollut Bull 51:428–437
- Bak RPM, Nieuwland G, Meesters EH (2005) Coral reef crisis in deep and shallow reefs: 30 years of constancy and change in reefs of Curaçao and Bonaire. Coral Reefs 24:475-479
- Barott K, Smith J, Dinsdale E, Hatay M, Sandin S, Rohwer F (2009) Hyperspectral and physiological analyses of coral-algal interactions. PLoS ONE 4:e8043
- Barott KL, Williams GJ, Vermeij MJA, Harris J, Smith JE, Rohwer FL, Sandin SA (2012) Natural history of coral-algae competition across a gradient of human activity in the Line Islands. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 460:1–12
- Benavides M, Bronk DA, Agawin NSR, Pérez-Hernández MD, Hernández-Guerra A, Arístegui J (2013) Longitudinal variability of size-fractionated  $N_2$  fixation and DON release rates along 24.5<sup>o</sup>N in the subtropical North Atlantic. J Geophys Res Oceans 118:3406–3415
- Bergman B, Gallon JR, Rai AN, Stal LJ (1997) N<sub>2</sub> fixation by nonheterocystous cyanobacteria. FEMS Microbiol Rev 19:139–185
- Berman T, Bronk DA (2003) Dissolved organic nitrogen: a dynamic participant in aquatic ecosystems. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 31:279–305
- Brauer VS, Stomp M, Rosso C, van Beusekom SAM, Emmerich B, Stal LJ, Huisman J (2013) Low temperature delays timing and enhances the cost of nitrogen fixation in the unicellular cyanobacterium Cyanothece. ISME J 7:2105–2115
- Burke L, Reytar K, Spalding M, Perry A (2011) Reefs at risk revisited. World Resources Institute, Washington, D.C. 130 pp
- Cardini U, Bednarz VN, Foster RA, Wild C (2014) Benthic N2 fixation in coral reefs and the potential effects of human-induced environmental change. Ecol Evol 4:1706–1727
- Carpenter RC (1985) Relationships between primary production and irradiance in coral reef algal communities. Limnol Oceanogr 30:784–793
- Carpenter RC, Williams SL (2007) Mass transfer limitation of photosynthesis of coral reef algal turfs. Mar Biol 151:435–450
- Carpenter RC, Hackney JM, Adey WH (1991) Measurements of primary productivity and nitrogenase activity of coral reef algae in a chamber incorporating oscillatory flow. Limnol Oceanogr 36:40–49
- Casareto BE, Charpy L, Langlade MJ, Suzuki T, Ohba H, Niraula M, Suzuki Y (2008) Nitrogen fixation in coral reef environments. Proc 11<sup>th</sup> Int Coral Reef Symp 2:890-894
- Charpy L, Alliod R, Rodier M, Golubic S (2007) Benthic nitrogen fixation in the SW New Caledonia lagoon. Aquat Microb Ecol 47:73–81
- Charpy L, Casareto BE, Langlade MJ, Suzuki Y (2012) Cyanobacteria in coral reef ecosystems: a review. J Mar Biol 2012:1–9
- Charpy L, Palinska KA, Casareto B, Langlade MJ, Suzuki Y, Abed RMM, Golubic S (2010) Dinitrogen-fixing cyanobacteria in microbial mats of two shallow coral reef ecosystems. Microb Ecol 59:174–186
- Charpy-Roubaud C, Charpy L, Larkum A (2001) Atmospheric dinitrogen fixation by benthic communities of Tikehau Lagoon (Tuamotu Archipelago, French Polynesia) and its contribution to benthic primary production. Mar Biol 139:991–998
- Cheal AJ, MacNeil MA, Cripps E, Emslie MJ, Jonker M, Schaffelke B, Sweatman H (2010) Coral macroalgal phase shifts or reef resilience: links with diversity and functional roles of herbivorous fishes on the Great Barrier Reef. Coral Reefs 29:1005–1015
- Conley DJ, Paerl HW, Howarth RW, Boesch DF, Seitzinger SP, Havens KE, Lancelot C, Likens GE (2009) Controlling eutrophication: nitrogen and phosphorus. Science 323:1014–1015
- Davey M, Holmes G, Johnstone R (2008) High rates of nitrogen fixation (acetylene reduction) on coral skeletons following bleaching mortality. Coral Reefs 27:227–236
- Delgado O, Lapointe BE (1994) Nutrient-limited productivity of calcareous versus fleshy macroalgae in a eutrophic, carbonaterich tropical marine environment. Coral Reefs 13:151–159
- Den Haan J, Huisman J, Dekker F, ten Brinke JL, Ford AK, van Ooijen J, van Duyl FC, Vermeij MJA, Visser PM (2013) Fast detection of nutrient limitation in macroalgae and seagrass with nutrient-induced fluorescence. PLoS ONE 8(7):e68834
- Deutsch C, Sarmiento JL, Sigman DM, Gruber N, Dunne JP (2007) Spatial coupling of nitrogen inputs and losses in the ocean. Nature 445:163–167
- Diaz-Pulido G, McCook LJ (2002) The fate of bleached corals: patterns and dynamics of algal recruitment. Mar Ecol-Prog Ser 232:115–128
- Done TJ (1992) Phase shifts in coral reef communities and their ecological significance. Hydrobiologia 247:121–132
- Dron A, Rabouille S, Claquin P, Le Roy B, Talec A, Sciandra A (2012) Light–dark (12:12) cycle of carbon and nitrogen metabolism in Crocosphaera watsonii WH8501: relation to the cell cycle. Environ Microbiol 14:967–981
- Elser JJ, Bracken MES, Cleland EE, Gruner DS, Harpole WS, Hillebrand H, Ngai JT, Seabloom EW, Shurin JB, Smith JE (2007) Global analysis of nitrogen and phosphorus limitation of primary producers in freshwater, marine and terrestrial ecosystems. Ecol Lett 10:1135–1142
- Fredriksson C, Malin G, Siddiqui PJ, Bergman B (1998) Aerobic nitrogen fixation is confined to a subset of cells in the nonheterocystous cyanobacterium Symploca PCC 8002. New Phytol 140:531–538
- Fricke A, Teichberg M, Beilfuss S, Bischof K (2011) Succession patterns in algal turf vegetation on a Caribbean coral reef. Botanica Marina 54:111–126
- Furnas M, Mitchell A, Skuza M, Brodie J (2005) In the other 90%: phytoplankton responses to enhanced nutrient availability in the Great Barrier Reef Lagoon. Mar Pollut Bull 51:253–265
- Gallon JR (1992) Reconciling the incompatible:  $N_2$  fixation and  $O_2$ . New Phytol 122:571–609
- Gardner T, Côté I, Gill J, Grant A, Watkinson A (2003) Long term region-wide declines in Caribbean corals. Science 301:958–960
- Grasshoff K, Ehrhardt M, Kremling K (1983) Methods of seawater analysis. Verslag Chemie pp 1:419 pp
- <span id="page-11-0"></span>Gruber N, Sarmiento JL (1997) Global patterns of marine nitrogen fixation and denitrification. Global Biogeochem Cycles 11:235–266
- Haas A, El-Zibdah M, Wild C (2010) Seasonal monitoring of coral– algae interactions in fringing reefs of the Gulf of Aqaba, Northern Red Sea. Coral Reefs 29:93–103
- Hanson RB, Gundersen KR (1976) Bacterial nitrogen fixation in a polluted coral reef flat ecosystem, Kaneohe Bay, Oahu, Hawaiian Islands. Pac Sci 30:385–393
- Helder W, De Vries RTP (1979) An automatic phenol-hypochlorite method for the determination of ammonia in sea- and brackish waters. Neth J Sea Res 13:154–160
- Holl CM, Montoya JP (2005) Interactions between nitrate uptake and nitrogen fixation in continuous cultures of the marine diazotroph Trichodesmium (Cyanobacteria). J Phycol 41:1178–1183
- Howarth RW, Marino R, Cole JJ (1988) Nitrogen fixation in freshwater, estuarine, and marine ecosystems. 2. Biogeochemical controls. Limnol Oceanogr 33:688–701
- Hughes TP (1994) Catastrophes, phase shifts, and large-scale degradation of a Caribbean coral reef. Science 265:1547–1551
- Hughes TP, Rodrigues MJ, Bellwood DR, Ceccarelli D, Hoegh-Guldberg O, McCook L, Moltschaniwskyj N, Pratchett MS, Steneck RS, Willis B (2007) Phase shifts, herbivory, and the resilience of coral reefs to climate change. Curr Biol 17:360–365
- King GM, Carlton RG, Sawyer TE (1990) Anaerobic metabolism and oxygen distribution in the carbonate sediments of a submarine canyon. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 58:275–285
- Klumpp DW, McKinnon D, Daniel P (1987) Damselfish territories: zones of high productivity on coral reefs. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 40:41–51
- Kohler KE, Gill SM (2006) Coral Point Count with Excel extensions (CPCe): a Visual Basic program for the determination of coral and substrate coverage using random point count methodology. Comput Geosci 32:1259–1269
- Koop K, Booth D, Broadbent A, Brodie J, Bucher D, Capone D, Coll J, Dennison W, Erdmann M, Harrison P, Hoegh-Guldberg O, Hutchings P, Jones GB, Larkum AWD, O'Neil J, Steven A, Tentori E, Ward S, Williamson J, Yellowlees D (2001) ENCORE: the effect of nutrient enrichment on coral reefs. Synthesis of results and conclusions. Mar Pollut Bull 42:91–120
- Kramer PA (2003) Synthesis of coral reef health indicators for the western Atlantic: results of the AGRRA program (1997-2000). Atoll Res Bull 496:1–55
- Kuffner IB, Paul VJ (2001) Effects of nitrate, phosphate and iron on the growth of macroalgae and benthic cyanobacteria from Cocos Lagoon, Guam. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 222:63–72
- Larkum AWD, Kennedy IR, Muller WJ (1988) Nitrogen fixation on a coral reef. Mar Biol 98:143–155
- Larned ST (1998) Nitrogen- versus phosphorus-limited growth and sources of nutrients for coral reef macroalgae. Mar Biol 132:409–421
- Lewis WM Jr, Wurtsbaugh WA, Paerl HW (2011) Rationale for control of anthropogenic nitrogen and phosphorus to reduce eutrophication of inland waters. Environ Sci Technol 45:10300–10305
- Littler MM, Littler DS, Titlyanov EA (1991) Comparisons of N- and P-limited productivity between high granitic islands versus low carbonate atolls in the Seychelles Archipelago: a test of the relative-dominance paradigm. Coral Reefs 10:199–209
- Logan D, Townsend KA, Townsend K, Tibbetts IR (2008) Meiofauna sediment relations in leeward slope turf algae of Heron Island reef. Hydrobiologia 610:269–276
- Mague TH, Holm-Hansen O (1975) Nitrogen fixation on a coral reef. Phycologia 14:87–92
- McManus JW, Polsenberg JF (2004) Coral-algal phase shifts on coral reefs: ecological and environmental aspects. Prog Oceanogr 60:263–279
- Mulholland MR, Ohki K, Capone DG (2001) Nutrient controls on nitrogen uptake and metabolism by natural populations and cultures of Trichodesmium (Cyanobacteria). J Phycol 37:1001–1009
- Mulholland MR, Bronk DA, Capone DG (2004) Dinitrogen fixation and release of ammonium and dissolved organic nitrogen by Trichodesmium IMS101. Aquat Microb Ecol 37:85–94
- Mulholland MR, Bernhardt PW, Heil CA, Bronk DA, O'Neil JM (2006) Nitrogen fixation and release of fixed nitrogen by Trichodesmium spp. in the Gulf of Mexico. Limnol Oceanogr 51:1762–1776
- Mullineaux PM, Gallon JR, Chaplin AE (1981) Acetylene reduction (nitrogen fixation) by cyanobacteria grown under alternating light-dark cycles. FEMS Microbiol Lett 10:245–247
- Murphy J, Riley JP (1962) A modified single solution method for the determination of phosphate in natural waters. Anal Chim Acta 27:31–36
- Nagle DG, Paul VJ (1998) Chemical defense of a marine cyanobacterial bloom. J Exp Mar Bio Ecol 225:29–38
- Nyström M, Folke C, Moberg F (2000) Coral reef disturbance and resilience in a human-dominated environment. Trends Ecol Evol 15:413–417
- Olson JB, Litaker RW, Paerl HW (1999) Ubiquity of heterotrophic diazotrophs in marine microbial mats. Aquat Microb Ecol 19:29–36
- O'Neil JM, Capone DG (1989) Nitrogenase activity in tropical carbonate marine sediments. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 56:145–156
- Paerl HW (2009) Controlling eutrophication along the freshwater– marine continuum: dual nutrient (N and P) reductions are essential. Estuaries Coasts 32:593–601
- Paul VJ, Thacker RW, Banks K, Golubic S (2005) Benthic cyanobacterial bloom impacts the reefs of South Florida (Broward County, USA). Coral Reefs 24:693–697
- Porra RJ, Thompson WA, Kriedemann PE (1989) Determination of accurate extinction coefficients and simultaneous equations for assaying chlorophylls  $a$  and  $b$  extracted with four different solvents: verification of the concentration of chlorophyll standards by atomic absorption spectroscopy. Biochim Biophys Acta 975:384–394
- Ralph PJ, Gademann R (2005) Rapid light curves: a powerful tool to assess photosynthetic activity. Aquat Bot 82:222–237
- Schaffelke B (1999) Short-term nutrient pulses as tools to assess responses of coral reef macroalgae to enhanced nutrient availability. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 182:305–310
- Schaffelke B, Klumpp DW (1998) Nutrient-limited growth of the coral reef macroalga Sargassum baccularia and experimental growth enhancement by nutrient addition in continuous flow culture. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 164:199–211
- Schneegurt MA, Sherman DM, Nayar S, Sherman LA (1994) Oscillating behavior of carbohydrate granule formation and dinitrogen fixation in the cyanobacterium Cyanothece sp. strain ATCC 51142. J Bacteriol 176:1586–1597
- Scott JT, Stanley JK, Doyle RD, Forbes MG, Brooks BW (2009) River-reservoir transition zones are nitrogen fixation hot spots regardless of ecosystem trophic state. Hydrobiologia 625:61–68
- Severin I, Stal LJ (2008) Light dependency of nitrogen fixation in a coastal cyanobacterial mat. ISME J 2:1077–1088
- Severin I, Stal LJ (2010) Spatial and temporal variability in nitrogenase activity and diazotrophic community composition in coastal microbial mats. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 417:13–25
- Shashar N, Feldstein T, Cohen Y, Loya Y (1994) Nitrogen fixation (acetylene reduction) on a coral reef. Coral Reefs 13:171–174
- <span id="page-12-0"></span>Smith VH (1983) Low nitrogen to phosphorus ratios favor dominance by blue-green algae in lake phytoplankton. Science 221:669–671
- Staal M, Hekkert STL, Herman P, Stal LJ (2002) Comparison of models describing light dependence of  $N<sub>2</sub>$  fixation in heterocystous cyanobacteria. Appl Environ Microb 68:4679–4683
- Stal LJ (1988) Nitrogen fixation in cyanobacterial mats. Methods Enzymol 167:474–484
- Steneck RS, Dethier MN (1994) A functional group approach to the structure of algal-dominated communities. Oikos 69:476–498
- Stewart WD, Fitzgerald GP, Burris RH (1967) In situ studies on  $N_2$ fixation using the acetylene reduction technique. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 58:2071–2078
- Van den Hoek C, Cortel-Breeman A, Wanders J (1975) Algal zonation in the fringing coral reef of Curaçao, Netherlands Antilles, in relation to zonation of corals and gorgonians. Aquat Bot 1:269–308
- Van Duyl F, Gast G, Steinhoff W, Kloff S, Veldhuis M, Bak R (2002) Factors influencing the short-term variation in phytoplankton composition and biomass in coral reef waters. Coral Reefs 21:293–306
- Vermeij MJA, van Moorselaar I, Engelhard S, Hörnlein C, Vonk SM, Visser PM (2010) The effects of nutrient enrichment and herbivore abundance on the ability of turf algae to overgrow coral in the Caribbean. PLoS One 5:e14312
- Villbrandt M, Stal LJ, Krumbein WE (1990) Interactions between nitrogen fixation and oxegenic photosynthesis in a marine cyanobacterial mat. FEMS Microbiol Lett 74:59–71
- Wangpraseurt D, Weber M, Røy H, Polerecky L, de Beer D, Nugues MM (2012) In situ oxygen dynamics in coral-algal interactions. PLoS One 7:e31192
- Webb KL, DuPaul WD, Wiebe W, Sottile W, Johannes RE (1975) Enewetak (Eniwetok) Atoll: aspects of the nitrogen cycle on a coral reef. Limnol Oceanogr 20:198–210
- Wiebe WJ, Johannes RE, Webb KL (1975) Nitrogen fixation in a coral reef community. Science 188:257–259
- Wilkinson CR, Sammarco PW (1983) Effects of fish grazing and damselfish territoriality on coral reef algae. II. nitrogen fixation. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 13:15–19
- Wilkinson CR, Williams DMB, Sammarco PW, Hogg RW, Trott LA (1984) Rates of nitrogen fixation on coral reefs across the continental shelf of the central Great Barrier Reef. Mar Biol 80:255–262
- Williams SL, Carpenter RC (1997) Grazing effects on nitrogen fixation in coral reef algal turfs. Mar Biol 130:223–231
- Williams SL, Carpenter RC (1998) Effects of unidirectional and oscillatory water flow on nitrogen fixation (acetylene reduction) in coral reef algal turfs, Kaneohe Bay. Hawaii. J Exp Mar Bio Ecol 226:293–316
- Zehr JP (2011) Nitrogen fixation by marine cyanobacteria. Trends Microbiol 19:162–173
- Zehr JP, Mellon M, Braun S, Litaker W, Steppe T, Paerl HW (1995) Diversity of heterotrophic nitrogen fixation genes in a marine cyanobacterial mat. Appl Environ Microbiol 61:2527–2532
- Zeller DC (1988) Short-term effects of territoriality of a tropical damselfish and experimental exclusion of large fishes on invertebrates in algal turfs. Mar Ecol Prog Ser 44:85–93
- Zevenboom WJ, Van der Does J, Bruning K, Mur LR (1981) A nonheterocystous mutant of Aphanizomenon flos-aquae, selected by competition in light-limited continuous culture. FEMS Microbiol Lett 10:11–16
- Zuckermann H, Staal M, Stal LJ, Reuss J, Te Lintel HS, Harren F, Parker D (1997) On-line monitoring of nitrogenase activity in cyanobacteria by sensitive laser photoacoustic detection of ethylene. Appl Environ Microb 63:4243–4251