

# Breeding approaches and genomics technologies to increase crop yield under low-temperature stress

Uday Chand Jha<sup>1</sup> · Abhishek Bohra<sup>1</sup> · Rintu Jha<sup>1</sup>

Received: 12 September 2016 / Accepted: 4 November 2016 / Published online: 22 November 2016  
© Springer-Verlag Berlin Heidelberg 2016

## Abstract

**Key message** Improved knowledge about plant cold stress tolerance offered by modern omics technologies will greatly inform future crop improvement strategies that aim to breed cultivars yielding substantially high under low-temperature conditions.

**Abstract** Alarming rising temperature extremities present a substantial impediment to the projected target of 70% more food production by 2050. Low-temperature (LT) stress severely constrains crop production worldwide, thereby demanding an urgent yet sustainable solution. Considerable research progress has been achieved on this front. Here, we review the crucial cellular and metabolic alterations in plants that follow LT stress along with the signal transduction and the regulatory network describing the plant cold tolerance. The significance of plant genetic resources to expand the genetic base of breeding programmes with regard to cold tolerance is highlighted. Also, the genetic architecture of cold tolerance trait as elucidated by conventional QTL mapping and genome-wide association mapping is described. Further, global expression profiling techniques including RNA-Seq along with diverse omics platforms are briefly discussed to better understand the underlying mechanism and prioritize the candidate gene (s) for downstream applications. These latest additions to breeders' toolbox hold immense potential to

support plant breeding schemes that seek development of LT-tolerant cultivars. High-yielding cultivars endowed with greater cold tolerance are urgently required to sustain the crop yield under conditions severely challenged by low-temperature.

**Keywords** Cold tolerance · Genomics · QTL · Genetic resource

## Introduction

In view of the rising temperature extremities, LT stress remains one of the major abiotic factors that severely impact the normal growth and development of the plant. LT stress poses serious threat to crop production worldwide, especially in temperate and high-elevated regions (Sthapit and Witcombe 1998). For instance, the enormity of the risk becomes apparent from the area (15 mha) that is constrained annually by LT stress across the globe (IRRI 1979). Similarly, almost 7 mha of rice-growing area in South and Southeast Asia was constrained (Sthapit and Witcombe 1998). Given the tropical and subtropical origin, rice is rendered vulnerable to LT stress below 15–20 °C causing considerable yield loss (Yoshida et al. 1996; Nakagahra et al. 1997). In recent years, significant yield loss in rice due to LT stress was noted in Japan (Shimono et al. 2007), Korea (Lee 2001), and Australia (Farrell et al. 2001; Singh et al. 2005). In China, Li and Guo (1993) reported annual loss of 3–5 million tonnes of rice due to LT. Likewise, Crimp et al. (2016) concluded that 30% of the wheat-growing area in Australia is subject to frost-related events. Events of 'Post-head-emergence frosts (PHEF)' witnessed in wheat in subtropical, Mediterranean and temperate regions are considered to be devastating (Boer et al. 1993; Fuller et al. 2007),

---

Communicated by N Stewart.

✉ Uday Chand Jha  
uday\_gene@yahoo.co.in

✉ Abhishek Bohra  
abhi.omics@gmail.com

<sup>1</sup> Indian Institute of Pulses Research, Kanpur 208024, India

leading to severe yield penalty such as the instance of 85% crop loss in Australia (Boer et al. 1993). Further, Zheng et al. (2015a, b) assessed the yield loss in wheat in Australia due to frost via simulation and crop modeling study. LT stress covers injuries in plants caused by chilling (<20 °C) and freezing (<0 °C) (Thomashow 1999), hampering key metabolic processes (Pomeroy et al. 1985). For example, nonfunctioning of chloroplast (Allen and Ort 2001) impairs photosynthesis and, ultimately, causes cell death (Gomez et al. 2004). The negative impacts of LT stress on different growth stages include poor germination, seedling stunting, and reduced tillering (Kaneda and Beachell 1974). Importantly, reproductive phase, especially male reproduction processes (De Storme and Geelen 2014), remains most sensitive to LT, adversely affecting stages from gamete formation to fertilization stage (Thakur et al. 2010). In rice, spikelet sterility has been reported owing to inhibition or disruption in pollen development or reduced pollen grains in anther (Satake 1969, 1976; Mackill and Lei 1997; Shimono et al. 2007; Sakata et al. 2014). Similarly, inhibition in sporogenesis, pollen germination (Clarke and Siddique 2004), abortion of flower and pod were reported in chickpea due to LT (Nayyar et al. 2005; Kumar et al. 2011). Instances

of seedling growth inhibition and low yield were also seen under LT stress in maize (Rymen et al. 2007). The negative impacts of LT at different growth stages in plants are discussed elsewhere (Croser et al. 2003; Thakur et al. 2010; Yadav 2010). Critical low temperatures causing damage in different crops are listed in Table 1.

Given the above description, cold acclimation remains a key mechanism adapted by plants to cope with LT stress (Thomashow 1999). To cope with the LT stress, plant increasingly activates “defense-related antioxidative” mechanism and induces genes producing molecular chaperones and cryoprotectants (Gill and Tuteja 2010; Guy and Li 1998).

Improved breeding techniques delivering genotypes that are able to sustain yield under LT are urgently required. Recent progress in genomics has provided a plethora of new-generation molecular tools to strengthen crop improvement schemes. Crop improvement schemes informed by the modern genomics hold great potential to sustain crop production under frequently witnessed temperature extremities, especially the LT stress. Here, we offer an overview on the molecular mechanism describing LT tolerance in plants, and discuss the role of candidate genes/QTLs vis-a-vis LT stress. The significance of plant

**Table 1** Critical low temperatures causing damage in major crops

Crop	Critical temperature	Stages affected	References
Rice	<10 °C	Germination and vegetative	Yoshida (1981)
Rice (subtropical region in northern Laos)	< 15 °C	Germination affected	Sihathep et al. (2001)
Rice	15 to 20 °C	Growth rate and metabolism	Kabaki et al. (1982), Takanashi et al. (1987)
Rice	13 to 15 °C (night)	–	Farrell et al. (2006)
Rice	15 ± 5 °C	Reproductive stages viz., spikelet sterility	Nishiyama et al. (1969)
Rice	20 °C (sensitive genotypes) 15 °C (tolerant genotype)	Reproductive stage	Satake (1976)
Wheat (Australian winter cultivar)	–5 to –2 °C	–	Single (1985)
Winter wheat (non-acclimated)	–4 to –2 °C	Leaf injury	Drozdoz et al. (1984)
Wheat (acclimated)	–13 °C	–	Drozdoz et al. (1984), Porter and Gawith (1999)
Wheat seedling (acclimated winter)	Between –6 and –8 °C	–	Fuller et al. (2007)
Wheat seedling (non-acclimated winter)	–5 °C for non-acclimated	–	Fuller et al. (2007)
Winter wheat	<–5 °C	Ear emergence to anthesis	Spink et al. (2000)
Barley	–5 C to –4 °C	–	Frederiks et al. (2011)
Chickpea	15 °C in Indian subcontinent	Flower and pod abortion	Srinivasan et al. (1998)
Maize	10 °C	Seedling growth ceases	Miedema and Sinnaeve (1980)
Maize for temperate, subtropical, and lowland tropical	<9 to 10 °C	Tassel initiation affected	Ellis et al. (1992)
Sorghum	<10 to 15 °C	Chilling injury	Peacock (1982)

genetic resources to develop LT-tolerant cultivars in various crops is highlighted. We also examine the literature dealing with modern QTL mapping methods such as GWAS to genetically dissect plant LT stress tolerance. The relevance of emerging omics platforms including transcriptomics and proteomics is also discussed.

### Cold tolerance in plants: underlying mechanism and key players

Plants respond to LT stress through perceiving stress stimuli subsequently subjected to precisely regulated signaling pathways (reviewed by Hughes and Dunn 1996; Thomashow 1999; Xin and Browse 2000; Chinnusamy et al. 2007, 2010; Zhou et al. 2011; Knight and Knight 2012; Miura and Furumoto 2013; Shi et al. 2015; Zhao et al. 2015a). As reviewed by various researchers (Chinnusamy et al. 2010; Shi et al. 2015), transmission of signals pertaining to cold stress in plants occurs via pathways regulated in C-repeat binding factor (CBF)-dependent or CBF-independent manner. The perception of LT shock in plants is followed by changes in physico-chemical properties in cell membrane involving membrane fluidity (described as “rigidification effect”) and proteins (Orvar et al. 2000; Chinnusamy et al. 2007, 2010). Subsequently to it occurs a transient influx of cytosolic  $Ca^{2+}$  causing regulation of cold-responsive (*COR*) genes (Knight 2000). This  $Ca^{2+}$  signal is transduced to nucleus via activation of  $Ca^{2+}$  sensors viz., CaM (calmodulin) (Miura and Furumoto 2013; Yang et al. 2010),  $Ca^{2+}$ -dependent protein kinase (CDPKs), and CaM-binding transcription activators (CAMTA) embedded in nuclear membrane (Knight et al. 1996). In turn, kinase cascades are switched on to activate inducer of CBF expression1 (ICE1), which activates transcription of *CBF* genes (Stockinger et al. 1997; Liu et al. 1998; Novillo et al. 2004, 2007). Ultimately, these CBFs induce CRT/DRE-regulated downstream target *COR* genes (Gilmour et al. 1992; Kurkela and Franck 1990; Lin and Thomashow 1992; Jaglo-Ottosen et al. 1998; Kizis et al. 2001), thereby conditioning cold tolerance in plant (for details see Xiong et al. 2002; Chinnusamy et al. 2007, 2010; Zhou et al. 2011; Miura and Furumoto 2013; Shi et al. 2015; Zhao et al. 2015a, b). However, the complete mechanism of LT stress signaling pathways and tolerance still remains elusive and needs intensive future study.

To date, the “ICE1-CBF-COR transcriptional cascade” pathway is the best characterized with regard to LT acclimation (Shi et al. 2015). Upon sensing LT stress in plant, various kinds of CBF/DREB1 transcription factors (TFs) belonging to ethylene-responsive element binding factor/APETALA2 (ERF/AP2)-type TF (Mizoi et al. 2012)

bind to CRT/DRE *cis* elements and CBF regulons genes. This in turn induces *COR* genes such as *COR15a* in *Arabidopsis* (Artus et al. 1996) and *WCS120* in wheat (Houde et al. 1992), which encode proteins akin to “cryoprotective proteins” to rescue plant from cold shock (Thomashow 1999). Mostly, three types of CBFs (CBF1, CBF2 and CBF3) (Liu et al. 1998; Thomashow 1998; Stockinger et al. 1997; Medina et al. 1999, 2011) are reported to control expression of *COR* genes in *Arabidopsis* (Gilmour et al. 2000, 2004). Importantly, this CBF cold response network has been found to be highly conserved across the flowering plant species (Jaglo-Ottosen et al. 2001; Chinnusamy et al. 2010). Recently, Park et al. (2015) have reported induction of nearly 1200 *COR* genes under LT stress, 170 of which are associated with CBF regulons. The authors also investigated 17 out of 174 *COR* genes regulating TF genes, that are early cold-induced TF genes bearing homology with the CBF-regulon TFs. Importantly, regulation of CBF3 is controlled by ICE1 master regulator (Chinnusamy et al. 2003), an MYC-type TF controlling 40% of *COR* genes and 46% of TF genes participating in LT stress regulation (Lee et al. 2005; Miura and Furumoto 2013). *TaICE141* and *TaICE187* homologs of ICE1-induced CBF group IV provided cold tolerance in wheat (Badawi et al. 2008). Similarly, calmodulin-binding transcription activator (CAMTA), a TF, controls the expression of *CBF2* in *Arabidopsis* under LT stress tolerance (Doherty et al. 2009). Involvement of CAMTA1, CAMTA2 and CAMTA3 in inducing transcription of CBF1, CBF2 and CBF3 to impart LT tolerance was demonstrated in *Arabidopsis* (Kim et al. 2013). By contrast, ICE1 negatively regulates expression of MYB15 TFs involved in negative regulation of *CBF* genes (Agarwal et al. 2006). Likewise, *ZAT12*, a TF serves as negative regulator of CBF1, CBF2 and CBF3 under LT stress (Novillo et al. 2007). To explore the contribution of non-coding regulatory RNA towards LT tolerance, Chan et al. (2016) reported that overexpression of ‘*RNA-DIRECTED DNA METHYLATION 4*) *RDM4*’ plays important regulatory role in LT stress tolerance via enhancing the expression of CBF regulons. More recently, genome editing technology CRISPR/Cas9 system was applied in *Arabidopsis* to precisely discern the role of CBF genes in cold acclimation (Jia et al. 2016; Zhao et al. 2016) and CBF2 was reported to be more important in conferring LT tolerance than CBF1 and CBF3 (Zhao et al. 2016). Several researcher groups have conducted overexpression studies of *CBF* gene with regard to LT tolerance across various plant species (Jaglo-Ottosen et al. 2001; Hsieh et al. 2002a, b; Ito et al. 2006; Pino et al. 2007). Towards this end, the role of OST1 kinase in enhancing cold tolerance in *Arabidopsis* through increasing transcriptional activity and stability of ICE1 is worth mentioning (Ding et al. 2015; Lang and Zhu 2015; Zhan et al. 2015). Given

that the expression of *CBF* genes is also regulated by circadian clocks (Fowler et al. 2005; Dong et al. 2011; Lee and Thomashow 2012), “*CIRCADIAN CLOCK ASSOCIATED 1 (CCA1)*” and “*LATE ELONGATED HYPOCOTYL (LHY)*” were found to positively regulate *CBF* genes under LT (Dong et al. 2011). By contrast, “*PSEUDO RESPONSE REGULATORs (PRRs)*” circadian clock negatively regulates *CBF* genes (Nakamichi et al. 2009). Significance of light in regulation of *CBF* gene expression has also been described (Fowler et al. 2005; Franklin and Whitelam 2007; Lee and Thomashow 2012; Novák et al. 2016). *CBF* regulons responsible for *COR* expression were involved in LT stress tolerance (Fowler and Thomashow 2002); however, freezing tolerance of *Arabidopsis eskimo1 (esk1)* mutant was found to be independent of *CBF* regulon (Xin and Browse 1998). Role of *HOS 9* and *HOS10* TFs in cold tolerance in *Arabidopsis* was reported (Zhu et al. 2004, 2005). Tolerance to LT was investigated in soybean and *Arabidopsis* via overexpression of *GmWRKY21* (Zhou et al. 2008) and *TaERF1* TF (Yi et al. 2004), respectively. Binding of AtHAP5A TF to CCAAT motif of AtXTH21 promoter causing freezing tolerance is also a noteworthy example of *CBF*-independent cold tolerance (Shi et al. 2014; Shi and Chan 2014). Further, activation of heterochromatic tandem-repeat sequence regions plays important role in cold acclimation under LT stress in *Arabidopsis* (To et al. 2011), maize (Hu et al. 2012) and rice (Roy et al. 2014). Importantly, wheat low-temperature-induced protein 19 (WLIP19) assists activating *COR* genes under LT stress (Kobayashi et al. 2008). In this context, Ji et al. (2015) reported TCF1 protein regulating LT tolerance in *Arabidopsis* via modification of histones in *BCB* gene, thus leading to reduced lignin synthesis.

Equally important gene regulation occurs in response to LT stress at post-transcriptional level viz., at pre-mRNA splicing, and at the level of export of mRNA from nucleus (Chinnusamy et al. 2007, 2010; Miura and Furumoto 2013). Mastrangelo et al. (2005) reported regulation of two early *COR* genes containing introns in their mature mRNA under LT stress in durum wheat. Likewise, existence of *STABILIZED 1 (STAI)*, a nuclear pre-mRNA splicing factor which serves as regulator of pre-mRNA splicing, has been reported under LT stress in *Arabidopsis* (Lee et al. 2006). Recently, significant role of *RCF1* gene encoding DEAD-box RNA helicase, assisting in proper pre-mRNA splicing of *COR* genes in *Arabidopsis* has been examined (Guan et al. 2013a). Equally important, contributory role of DEAD-box RNA helicase, AtRH7/PRH75 in cold tolerance has also been registered (Huang et al. 2015). Additionally, considering the role of nucleoporins (NUPs) found in nuclear pore complexes (NCPs) (Tamura and Hara-Nishimura 2014 and references therein) allowing RNA,

nuclear proteins transport from nucleus into cytoplasm in response to various stress signals. Dong et al. (2006) reported involvement of *AtNUP160* in LT stress tolerance in *Arabidopsis*.

At post-translational level, the stabilization and regulation of ICE1 is controlled by ubiquitination [initiated by “*HIGH EXPRESSION OF OSMOTICALLY RESPONSIVE GENE 1*” (*HOS1*)] (Dong et al. 2006; Chinnusamy et al. 2007; Zhu et al. 2007) and sumoylation (mediated by *SIZ1*) (Chinnusamy et al. 2007; Miura et al. 2007) (for details see Lissarre et al. 2010; Miura and Furumoto 2013). Thus, positive regulation of ICE1 via sumoylation and negative regulation of ICE1 via ubiquitination influence the expression of *COR* gene during LT stress (Dong et al. 2006; Miura et al. 2007).

In addition, participation of epigenetic reprogramming or modification encompassing histone modification covering histone methylation and histone acetylation dynamics has received serious attention for its underlying significant role in regulating transcriptional outcome of cold-responsive genes (Hu et al. 2011; Ji et al. 2015; Kim et al. 2015). Instances of histone acetylation in *COR* genes viz., *ZmDREB1* and *ZmCOR413* in maize (Hu et al. 2011) and *OsDREB1b* in rice (Roy et al. 2014) causing LT adaptation are remarkable, while reduction of H3K27me3 in *COR15A* and *ATGOLS3* genes were noted under LT in *Arabidopsis* (Kwon et al. 2009). Further, activation of heterochromatic tandem-repeat sequence regions in association with increase in H3K9ac acetylation plays important role in cold acclimation under LT stress in *Arabidopsis* (To et al. 2011), maize (Hu et al. 2012) and in rice (Roy et al. 2014). In this context, Ji et al. (2015) reported that TCF1 protein regulates LT tolerance in *Arabidopsis* via modification of histones in *BCB* gene resulting in lower lignin synthesis and, thus, causing LT tolerance.

## Crop genetic resources and breeding for cold tolerance

Genetic resources are crucial to plant breeding as these allow access to the allelic diversity for improving the desired traits. According to Mickelbart et al. (2015), these serve as the valuable reservoir of ‘stress adaptation loci’ including LT stress. For instance, important sources of LT tolerance viz., Silewah (Satake and Toriyama 1979), Koshihikari (Sasaki 1981), Chhomrang (Sthapit 1987) and Jumli Marshi (Lindlöf et al. 2015) were reported in japonica rice. In general, japonica rice grown in temperate regions shows higher LT tolerance than the indica types (Glaszmann et al. 1990; Mackill and Lei 1997). However, few indica-type rice also show tolerance to LT viz., BR-IRGA 410 and IRGA 416 (da Cruz and Milach 2004).

Jeong et al. (2000) reported lower cold tolerance in Korean Tongil rice than the japonica-type rice.

Selection using different parameters led to the discovery of LT-tolerant genotypes such as HSC55, M103 and Jyoudaki in rice based on low spikelet sterility under LT stress (Farrell et al. 2006; Ye et al. 2009), cultivar 996 based on better pollination and pollen germination (Deng et al. 2011), NERICA rice genotypes based on higher filled-grain ratio (FGR) (51.9–57.9%) at reproductive stage (Wainaina et al. 2015) and 12 USDA minicore genotypes based on root and shoot length reduction under LT stress (Moraes de Freitas et al. 2016). The genotype Norin PL 8 containing an introgressed gene from Silewah showed tolerance to LT stress at booting stage. The LT stress tolerance of *Oryza rufipogon* Griff. at both flowering and booting stages highlights the importance of the crop wild relative in addressing the stress problem (Liu et al. 2003). Also, the introgression lines (ILs) derived from *O. rufipogon* are considered to be important sources of LT tolerance in rice (Tian et al. 2006). Likewise, a rice landrace KMXBG possesses LT stress tolerance for all vital growth stages vulnerable to LT (Cheng 1993). Chinese rice varieties B55, Bangjiemang, Lijiangheigu and one Hungarian rice variety HSC55 were recorded to be LT-tolerant in all key growth stages under field condition (Ye et al. 2009). Similarly, LT tolerance at reproductive stage was evident in field condition screening of rice cultivars HSC55, M103 and Jyoudaki (Farrell et al. 2006).

Considering better photosynthetic activity under LT stress, semi-winter wheat genotype Yannong 19 was reported to be having higher photosynthetic activity under LT stress (Guan et al. 2013a, b). Significant variation for thousand kernel weight and yield was recorded across more than 600 durum wheat cultivars under LT stress (Mohammadi et al. 2015). Importantly, winter wheat cultivar Norstar was reported to carry combination of frost-tolerant genes (*Vrn-A1w* + *Fr-A2T* + *Fr-B2WT* alleles), thus offering LT tolerance at vegetative stage in wheat (Eagles et al. 2016).

Kolar et al. (1991) recorded higher cold tolerance in winter barley than the facultative cultivars from a panel comprising eight winter and two facultative barley cultivars, while Franklin, Amagi Nijo and Haruna Nijo genotypes were found to be frost-tolerant at post-head-emergence stage in southern region of Australia (Frederiks et al. 2011).

In case of maize, cold tolerance of Swiss landraces was evident from examination of early vigor under LT stress (Peter et al. 2006, 2009). Therefore, utilization of genetic resources will allow plant breeders to siphon the hitherto unexploited genetic variation into breeding programmes from diverse gene pools.

Conventional breeding has been instrumental in developing LT-tolerant cultivars in various crops. For example, EP80 × Puenteareas population in maize was reported to

be important source of LT tolerance based on both field and controlled conditions (Rodriguez et al. 2007). In wheat, Tiber (Kisha et al. 1992) derived from Redwin had good winter hardiness. OAC Elmira in barley was obtained as an outcome of conventional breeding (Falk et al. 1997). Attempts were made to introduce LT tolerance traits from landraces and crop wild relative into high-yielding yet sensitive rice varieties such as Guichao 2 (Liu et al. 2003), Towada (Xu et al. 2008; Zhou et al. 2012), Hitomebore (Shirasawa et al. 2012), HJX74 (Zhang et al. 2004), Norin-PL11 (Kuroki et al. 2007), Norin-PL8 (Saito et al. 1995; Dai et al. 2004), Milyang 23 (Oh et al. 2004), Plaisant in barley (Casao et al. 2011) and in tomato (Vallejos and Tanksley 1983) through back-cross breeding procedure. Nevertheless, genomics approaches have emerged in recent years to enhance the efficacy of traditional breeding protocols.

## Understanding the genetic architecture of cold tolerance in crop plants

Enabling access to the precisely delineated chromosomal segments in genome that contain gene (s)/QTL (s) controlling important traits is a prerequisite for undertaking molecular breeding to accelerate trait improvement. Genotypic and phenotypic records of mapping populations or diversified panel are combined to establish significant marker–trait associations (MTAs), referred to as linkage-map-based QTL mapping and association analysis, respectively. In this section, we briefly describe about the QTLs for LT stress tolerance discovered across different crops using both conventional QTL mapping and association mapping approaches.

### Linkage-map-based QTL analysis

DNA marker technology has been effectively exploited to map the QTLs that are associated with the traits contributing towards cold tolerance in plants (Table 2).

### Rice

Several reports on QTLs controlling cold tolerance at germination stage were published in rice (Fujino et al. 2004; Hou et al. 2004; Han et al. 2006; Long-Zhai et al. 2006; Fujino et al. 2008; Ji et al. 2009; Fujino and Matsuda 2010; Iwata and Fujino 2010; Fujino and Iwata 2011; Fujino and Sekiguchi 2011; Li et al. 2013; Ranawake et al. 2014). Initially, Miura et al. (2001) reported five QTLs conferring LT tolerance at germination stage. In the same

**Table 2** List of QTLs contributing in LT stress tolerance in plants

Crop	Mapping population	Type and size	Locus/QTL	Type of marker	Chromosome/LG group	Major QTL and important linked marker and their map position	PV%	References
Arabidopsis	Ler × Cvi	RIL (132)	7 QTLs, <i>FTQ1</i> to <i>FTQ7</i>	AFLP	1, 4, 5	–	3–19.5	Alonso-Blanco et al. (2005)
Arabidopsis	Bay-0 × Shahdara	RIL	<i>CDG1</i> , <i>CDG2</i> , <i>CDG3</i>	SSR	1, 2, 4	MSAT1-10, MSAT2-36, MSAT4-15	17–25	Meng et al. (2008)
Arabidopsis	C24 × Tenela,	RIL (250)	<i>QTLc2</i> , <i>QTLc4</i> and <i>QTLc5</i>	SNP	2, 4, 5	snp142, snp306, snp307, snp350	6.8–9.2	Meissner et al. (2013)
Barley	Dicktoo × Morex	DH (100)	<i>HvCcb3</i>	–	5H	WG364b and saf1p58	–	Choi et al. (2002)
Barley	Franklin × Arapiles, Galleon × Haruna Nijo, Amagi × WI2585	DH (225), DH (112), DH (139)	QTLs for frost tolerance	SSR	2HL, 5HL	Hv635P2.4f, Hv635P2.4f	–	Reinheimer et al. (2004)
Barley	DH, 'Nure' × 'Tremois'	–	2 Loci	–	5H	–	–	Francia et al. (2004)
Barley	Dicktoo × Morex (DxM)	–	3 QTLs	–	1H-L, 4H-S, and 4H-L	saf1p164, saf1p176, Bmy1	–	Skinner et al. (2006)
Barley	'Nure' × 'Tremois', 'Proctor' × 'Nudinka', 'Steptoe' × 'Morex'	DH (136), DH (113), DH (150)	6 HvCBF genes, ICE1 and FRY1, <i>Fr-H2</i> QTL	STS, SNP, SSCP	5H, 7H	ABC154B, ABG380	–	Tondelli et al. (2006)
Barley	Nure' × 'Tremois	–	<i>VRN-H1/Fr-H1</i> and <i>Fr-H2</i>	–	–	–	–	Stockinger et al. (2007)
Barley	'Nure' × 'Tremois''	F <sub>2</sub> (1849), F <sub>3</sub>	<i>Fr-H1</i> and <i>Fr-H2</i> , CAPS	RFLP, CAPS	5H	Bmag0223, MWG583, HvCBF4B (4.6 cM), HvMYB1	–	Francia et al. (2007)
Barley	Amagi Nijo × WI2585 and Haruna Nijo × Galleon	–	LTR tolerance QTL	–	2HL, 5HL	–	–	Chen et al. (2009)
Barley	NB3437f × OR71, NB713 × OR71	DH	<i>VRN-H3</i> , FR-H3	SNP	1H	–	48	Fisk et al. (2013)
Brassica	<i>Brassica rapa</i> × <i>Brassica napus</i> ,	F <sub>2</sub> , DH	2 QTLs	RFLP	–	–	–	Teutonico et al. (1995)
Brassica	SLMO46 × Quantum,	F <sub>2,3</sub> (200)	8 putative QTLs	RAPD, SSR	4, 7, 9	–	6–23	Asghari et al. (2007)
Faba bean	Côte d'Or 1 × BeanPureLine 4628	RIL (106)	5 Putative QTLs	RAPD	10	U09_1499/B20_803 F15_476/110_661 O18_715/O18_737 P77M76_92 (10.9 cM), Xtz141b	21.8–40.7	Arbaoui et al. (2008)
<i>Festuca pratensis</i>	B14/16 × HF2/7	F1 (138)	<i>QF5F-1</i> , <i>QF5F-2</i> and <i>QF6F</i> <i>QF7F</i> , 6 QTLs for winter survival	–	1, 4, 5, 6, 7	(26.5 cM), Xcd678b (46 cM)	–	Alim et al. (2011)

Table 2 continued

Crop	Mapping population	Type and size	Locus/QTL	Type of marker	Chromosome/LG group	Major QTL and important linked marker and their map position	PV%	References
Lentil	WA8649090 × Precoz,	RIL (106)	7QTLs	RAPD, ISSR, AFLP	LG4	ubc808-12 ubc840-3	22.9–42.7	Kahraman et al. (2004)
<i>Medicago truncatula</i>	–	–	4 QTLs	–	LG1, LG4 and LG6	–	40	Avia et al. (2013)
<i>M. truncatula</i>	F83005-5 × DZA045-5,	RIL (F <sub>7</sub> , F <sub>8</sub> )	<i>Mt-FTQTL6</i>	–	LG6	–	–	Tayeh et al. (2013)
Maize	Ac7643 × Ac7729	RIL (233)	8QTLs	RFLP	1, 2, 3, 9	bnl3.06 (62 cM), umc10 (70 cM)	28	Fracheboud et al. (2002)
Maize	–	F <sub>2:3</sub>	4QTLs	–	2, 6	–	37.6	Fracheboud et al. (2004)
Maize	Lo964 × Lo1016,	F <sub>2:4</sub> (168)	20QTLs	–	1, 3, 4, 5, 6, 8, 10	–	10–37.1	Hund et al. (2004)
Maize	ETH-DH7 × ETH-DL3	F <sub>2:3</sub>	–	SSR	1, 2, 3, 4, 6, 8, 9, 10	–	–	Jompuk et al. (2005)
Maize	–	F <sub>2:3</sub> (214)	<i>QTL 3.096</i> , <i>QTL 8.025</i> , <i>QTL 4.136</i>	RFLP	3, 4, 8	–	10	Pimental et al. (2005)
Maize	–	DH (720)	7 QTLs	SSR	–	–	–	Presterl et al. (2007)
Maize	EP42 × A661	F <sub>2:3</sub> (210)	10 QTLs	SSR	2, 4, 8	umc1823, umc1185 (69-104 cM) umc2150, bnlgl318 (8-41 cM) bnlgl318, umc1963 (45-87 cM)	5.5–19	Rodriguez et al. (2014)
Maize	B73 × Mo17	243 IBM Syn4 lines	6 QTLs	–	4, 5, 6, 7, 9	–	3.9–8.4	Hu et al. (2016)
Oat	Kanota' × 'Ogle'	RIL (135)	7 QTLs	–	7, 17	waaccac273, UMN433	56	Wooten et al. (2008)
Oat	–	138 accessions	3 robust QTLs	SNP	5C, 1C	GMI_ES01_c1416_473 (101 cM) GMI_ES01_c30278_396 (8.8 cM) GMI_ES05_c13603_259 (9.8 cM)	–	Tumino et al. (2016)
<i>Pisum sativum</i>	Champagne × Terese,	RIL (164)	<i>Hr</i> locus, 6 QTLs	–	–	–	–	Lejeune-Henaut et al. (2008)
<i>Pisum sativum</i>	Champagne × Terese	–	Two raffinose QTL one RuBisCO activity	–	5 and 6	–	6.5–46.5	Dumont et al. (2009)

Table 2 continued

Crop	Mapping population	Type and size	Locus/QTL	Type of marker	Chromosome/LG group	Major QTL and important linked marker and their map position	PV%	References
<i>Pisum sativum</i>	Champagne × Terese	RIL (164)	3 QTLs and 5 candidate genes	SSCP	3, 6, 7	AD60 and AD59 D24 and AB136	–	Legrand et al. (2013)
<i>Pisum sativum</i>	J11491 × Cameor	RIL(129)	161 putative QTLs	–SNP, SSR	LGIII and VI		9–71	Klein et al. (2014)
Rice	Norin-PL8 × Silewah	BC (92)	Chromosomal segment 3, 4	RFLP	3, 4	XNpb379	–	Saito et al. (1995)
Rice	Hokuriku 142 × Hyogo-Kitanishiki,	F <sub>2</sub> (69) and F <sub>3</sub>	13 QTLs	RFLP	1, 3, 9, 11		–	Misawa et al. (2000)
Rice	Akihikari × Koshihikari,	DH (212)	<i>qCT-7, qCT-1</i> and <i>qCT-11</i>	RFLP, RAPD	1, 7, 11	R1545, S778, C83	5–22.1	Takeuchi et al. (2001)
Rice	Nipponbare × Kasalath	BIL (98)	<i>qLTG-2, qLTG-4-1, qLTG-4-2</i>	RFLP	2, 4, 5, 11	G1327, C946 and C513, R830	40.7	Miura et al. (2001)
Rice	Guichao 2 × Dongxiang	BC	<i>qLTG-5</i> and <i>qLTG-11</i> 3QTLs	–	1, 6, 11		–	Liu et al. (2003)
Rice	M-202 × IR50	RIL (191)	<i>qCTS12a</i> +6 minor QTLs	SSR	1, 3, 4, 6, 8, 10, 11, 12	RM101-RM292, 3.8 cM	8.7–46	Andaya and Mackill (2003b)
Rice	M-202 × IR50	RIL (1954)	<i>qCTS12</i>	SSR	12	RM5746-RM7003, 1.5 cM	41	Andaya and Mackill (2003a)
Rice	Kunmingxiaobaigu × Towada	F <sub>2</sub> (250)	9 QTLs	SSR	1, 3, 4, 6, 7, 10, 12	S1563 and R1789, 16.9 cM	–	Dai et al. (2004)
Rice	Milyang 23 × Jileng 1	F <sub>2:3</sub> (200)	12 QTLs	SSR	1, 2, 3, 5, 7, 9, 11, 12	RM265-RM104 (22.9 cM)	5.6–42.9	Long-zhi et al. (2004)
Rice	Italica Livorno × Hayamasari	BIL (122)	<i>qLTG-3-1, qLTG-3-2, qLTG-4</i>	RFLP, SSR	3, 4	GBR3001-GBR3002 (3, 7 cM) RM3436, R1854	35	Fujino et al. (2004)
Rice	Kimmaze × DV85	RIL (81)	<i>qLTG-2, qLTG-6, qLTG-7</i> <i>qLTG-LTG-11</i> and <i>qLTG-12</i>	–	2, 6, 7, 11 and 12		–	Hou et al. (2004)
Rice	Milyang23 × Hapcheonaengmi3,	RIL (80)	14 QTLs	SSR	1, 3, 5, 6, 7, 8, 9, 11	RM128, RM85, RM552	5.8–32.8	Oh et al. (2004)
Rice	Lemont × Teqing,	RIL (269)	3 main effect QTLs, <i>qSCT-11</i>	SSR	3, 7, 11	RM156-RM16 RM336-RM10 RZ53-RM202	30	Zhang et al. (2005)



Table 2 continued

Crop	Mapping population	Type and size	Locus/QTL	Type of marker	Chromosome/LG group	Major QTL and important linked marker and their map position	PV%	References
Rice	Milyang 23 × Jileng 1	F <sub>2,3</sub> (200)	<i>qLVG2</i> , <i>qLVG7-2</i> and <i>qCIVG7-2</i> <i>qCIVG2</i>	SSR	2, 7	RM29-RM262, RM336-RM118	–	Han et al. (2006)
Rice	M202 × IR50	RIL, F <sub>5</sub> -F <sub>10</sub> (1954)	<i>qCTS12</i>	SSR	12	RM7003	40	Andaya and Tai (2006)
Rice	Milyang 23 × Jileng 1	F <sub>2,3</sub> (200)	12 QTLs	SSR	1, 2, 7, 8, and 12	RM262-RM263, RM270-RM17 RM19-RM270, RM129-RM9	5.2–17.9	Han et al. (2007)
Rice	AAV002863 × Zhenshan97B	DH (193)	One major effect and 5 minor effect QTLs	SSR	1, 2, 8	RM561-RM341	27.4	Lou et al. (2007)
Rice	Hokkai-PL9 × Hokkai287	F <sub>2</sub> , F <sub>3</sub> , and F <sub>7</sub>	<i>qCTB8</i>	SSR	8	RM5647 and PLA61 (1.7 cM)	26.6	Kuroki et al. (2007)
Rice	Kunningxiaobaigu × Towada	BC <sub>3</sub> F <sub>2</sub> (1557)	8 QTLs <i>qCTB-1-1</i> , <i>qCTB-4-1</i> , <i>qCTB-4-2</i> , <i>qCTB-5-1</i> , <i>qCTB-5-2</i> , <i>qCTB-10-1</i> , <i>qCTB-10-2</i> and <i>qCTB-11-1</i>	SSR	1, 4, 5, 10, 11	RM335, RM518, RM1282 RM31, RM7217	0.90–14.9	Xu et al. (2008)
Rice	Italica Livorno × Hayamasari	–	<i>qLTG3-1</i>	FNP	3	SSR118673–13.1, STS73–28	–	Fujino et al. (2008), Ji et al. (2009)
Rice	Asominori' × IR 24	CSSL	<i>qGR-2</i> and <i>qGR-11</i>	–	2, 11	–	–	Koseki et al. (2010)
Rice	W1943 × Guang-lu-ai 4	F <sub>2</sub> , (184)	<i>qCass11</i>	SNP	3, 10, 11	AK24 and GP0030	40	Ji et al. (2010)
Rice	TN1 × Chunjiang 06	DH, (120)	5QTLs	SSR	1, 2, 4, 8, 9, 10, 11	RM286–RM1812	14.1–21.5	Ji et al. (2010)
Rice	Reiziq × Lijiangheigu	BC (84), F <sub>2</sub> (282)	<i>qLTSPKST10.1</i>	SSR, STS	10	S10010.9 and S10014.4 (3.5 cM)	20.5	Ye et al. (2010)
Rice	Silewah × Hokkai241	BC	<i>Ctb1</i>	SSLP	4	PNK5, PNK7, and PNK10	–	Saito et al. (2010)
Rice	ZL1929-4 × Towada	F <sub>2</sub> , F <sub>3</sub>	<i>qCTB7</i> and 12 candidate genes	SSR	7	RI02905 and RM21862	9–21	Zhou et al. (2010)
Rice	Kasalath × Hoshinoyume	BC	<i>qLTG3-1</i> and <i>qLTG11</i>	–	3, 11	–	–	Iwata and Fujino (2010)
Rice	Kasalath × Hayamasari	BC	–	–	–	–	–	Fujino (2010)
Rice	Kasalath × Koshihikari	BC	–	–	–	–	–	Mori et al. (2011)
Rice	J502 × Hoshimaru	F <sub>2</sub> (150)	<i>qCTB3</i>	SSR	3	RM6974	–	Mori et al. (2011)

Table 2 continued

Crop	Mapping population	Type and size	Locus/QTL	Type of marker	Chromosome/LG group	Major QTL and important linked marker and their map position	PV%	References
Rice	Dasanbyeo × TR22183	RIL (152)	56QTLs and 76 E-QTLs	SSR	1,–12	QTL 8.1 near centromeric region (52–55 cM)	13.2–29.1 and 10.6–29	Jiang et al. (2011)
Rice	–	–	<i>qLTG3-1</i>		3		–	Fujino and Iwata (2011)
Rice	Italica Livorno × Hayamasari		<i>qLTG3-1</i>	FNP, InDel	3	–	–	Fujino and Sekiguchi (2011)
Rice	Ukei 840' × 'Hitomebore'	F <sub>2</sub> , BC	1.2-Mb genomic region on chrom3 <i>qCTS4a</i> and <i>qCTS4b</i>	SSR	3	RM3719 and RM7000	–	Shirasawa et al. (2012)
Rice	Geumbyeoc × IR66160-121-4-4-2	RIL (153)	<i>qCST1-1, qCST1-2, qCST2, qCST5</i> <i>qCST6, qCST7, qCST10</i>	SSR		RM3648-RM2799 RM3375a-RM558	7.8–8.3	Suh et al. (2012)
Rice	GC2 × IL112	F <sub>2,3</sub> (394)	<i>qLTG-7, qLTG-9</i> and <i>qLTG-12</i>	SSR	1, 2, 5, 6, 7, 10		8–20	Liu et al. (2013)
Rice	USSR5 × N22	RIL, BC	<i>qCTSS-1, qCTSS-2a, qCTSS-2b</i> <i>qCTSS-5, qCTSS-8, qCTSS-10</i>	–	7, 9, 12	L9-25D and ID-1	7.08–12.12	Li et al. (2013)
Rice	Nipponbare × LPBG,	F <sub>3</sub> (10,800)	<i>qCTF7, qCTF12</i> and <i>qCTF8</i>	SNP	1, 2, 5, 8, 10		–	Yang et al. (2013a, b)
Rice	Eikei88223 × Suisei,	BC <sub>1</sub> F <sub>5</sub> (77)	<i>qCTF7, qCTF12</i> and <i>qCTF8</i>	SSR	7, 8, 12	RM28661, RM22613	7.9–19.2	Shimada et al. (2013, 2014)
Rice	Lijiangxintuanheigu × Sanhuangzhan-2	RIL	9 QTLs and <i>qCTS-9</i> and <i>qCTS-12 QTLs</i>	–	1, 6, 7, 8, 9, 10, 11, 12		–	Zhang et al. (2014a)
Rice	<i>Oryza rufipogon</i> Griff., Dongxiang × Nanjing 11,	BC (151)	<i>qRC10-1</i> and <i>qRC10-2</i>	SSR, InDel	10	RM171-RM1108, (148.3 cM) RM25570-RM304, (163.3 cM)	9.4–32.1	Xiao et al. (2014)
Rice	Jinbu × BR29	RIL (123)	<i>qSCT1a, qSCT2, qSCT10</i> <i>qSCT11, qSCT1b, qSCT4</i>	SSR	1, 2, 4, 10, 11	RM3602-RM8236, (3.7 cM) RM3602-RM5310, (11.3 cM)	6.1–16.5	Kim et al. (2014)
Rice		F <sub>2,3</sub>		SSR		RM22034, RM6547 RM14978, RM1144	–	Bonniecarrère et al. (2014)
Rice	HGKN × HOK	RIL (162)	5QTLs + 9QTLs	SSR	2, 5, 6, 7, 8, 11	RM125, RM214, RM21, RM206	5.7–35.6	Ranawake et al. (2014)
Rice	(Xiang 743 × Katy), (Xiang 743 × Dular)	F <sub>2,3</sub>	7QTLs	SSR	–		47.26	Liu et al. (2015a)

Table 2 continued

Crop	Mapping population	Type and size	Locus/QTL	Type of marker	Chromosome/LG group	Major QTL and important linked marker and their map position	PV%	References
Rice	<i>Oryza rufipogon</i> Griff × <i>O. indica</i>	RIL	2 QTLs <i>qLOP2</i> and <i>qPSR2-1</i> gene <i>Oso2g0677300</i>	SSR	2	RM221 and RS8	10.1–12.3	Xiao et al. (2015)
Rice	DXXWR	–	13 QTLs	InDel	–	–	–	Mao et al. (2015)
Rice	NIP 3 × 93-11	F <sub>2</sub> , RIL, BC	<i>COLD1</i>	SNP	4	AL60683-2 (1.8 cM) and RM5503 (0.8 cM)	–	Ma et al. (2015)
Rice	–	174 diverse accessions	51 QTLs	SSR	1–12.	RM528, RM160, RM4B, RM235	–	Pan et al. (2015)
Rice	Huanghuazhan × Eight donor parents	BC,	6 QTLs	SNP	3, 4, 12	–	4.2–9.5	Zhu et al. (2015)
Rice	Maratteli × Akitakomachi	F <sub>2</sub> (120), NIL	<i>qLTG1-1</i> , <i>qLTG3-1</i> , <i>qLTG3-2</i> , <i>qLIG11-1</i>	SSR	1, 3, 11	RM5914 (6 cM), RM338792 cM)	5.8–22.1	Satoh et al. (2016)
Rice	–	420 accessions	11 loci	SNP	1, 7	RM3436 (6 cM) AC104484	–	Eizenga et al. (2015)
Rice	Hitomebore × Kuchum	BC	<i>qCT-4</i>	SSR, InDel	4	(RM3658, S72D21-1)	–	Endo et al. (2016)
Rice	Hitomebore × Lijianxintuanheigu	BC	One QTL	SSR, SNP	3	NLSNP3-12 and RM7000	–	Ulzibat et al. (2016)
Rice	Junam × IR72,	Advanced backcross inbred (132)	<i>qCT11</i>	InDel	11	RM224	–	Hur et al. (2016)
Rice	Nan-yang-zhan × Hua-jing-xian <sup>74</sup>	SSSL (32)	<i>qCTBB-5</i> and <i>qCTBB-6</i> <i>qCTS-6</i> and <i>qCTS-12</i>	SSR	5, 6, 12	RM6015, RM170, RM589 RM28828	–	Yang et al. (2016)
Rye	Annual × perennial ryegrass (152)	–	39 QTL	–	LG4, and 5	–	10.4–22.1	Xiong et al. (2007)
Sorghum	Shan Qui Red × SRN39	RIL (153)	2 QTLs	–	SBI-03a, SBI-07b	–	–	Knoll et al. (2008)
Sorghum	RTx430 × PI610727	RIL (171)	14 QTLs	SSR	1, 7, 9	0–16 cM	3.1–20	Burow et al. (2010)
Sorghum	<i>S. bicolor</i> × <i>S. prostratum</i>	F <sub>3,4</sub> (130)	2QTLs	SSR	SBI-01	SBL1B5H (4 cM) SB050A (4.5 cM)	11.53–25.32	Washburn et al. (2013)
Soybean	Hayahikari × Toyomusume	RIL (104)	<i>qCTTSW1</i> and <i>qCTTSW2</i> <i>qCTTSW3</i>	–	–	–	–	Funatsuki et al. (2005)
Soybean	Toyomusume × Toyoharuka	RIL (192)	a large effect QTL	SSR	A2	Sat_162	–	Ikeda et al. (2009)

Table 2 continued

Crop	Mapping population	Type and size	Locus/QTL	Type of marker	Chromosome/LG group	Major QTL and important linked marker and their map position	PV%	References
Tomato	NC84173 × LA722	BC (119)	3–5 putative QTLs	RFLP	1 and 4		11.9–33.4	Foolad et al. (1998)
Tomato	<i>Lycopersicon esculentum</i> Mill. cv T5 × <i>Lycopersicon hirsutum</i> f. <i>typicum</i> accession LA1778,	BC (196)	8 QTLs	RFLP	5, 6, 7, 9, 12		–	Truco et al. (2000)
Tomato	<i>L. esculentum</i> × <i>L. hirsutum</i> , BC	NIL	<i>stm9</i>	–	9	–	–	Goodstal et al. (2005)
Tomato	–	–	<i>stm9</i>	–	9	–	–	Arms et al. (2015)
Triticale	DH06, DH07, EAW74, EAW78 families	DH, 647	9 main effect QTLs	DArT	5A, 1B and 5R	52.5 (cM), 54.1 (cM), 55.6 (cM)	–	Liu et al. (2014)
Wheat	–	–	<i>Fr1</i>	–	5A	Xwg644 (2 cM)	–	Sutka (1994), Galiba et al. (1995)
Wheat	–	–	<i>Fr1</i>	–	5A	–	–	Sutka and Snape (1989)
Wheat	–	–	( <i>Wrab19</i> and <i>Wrab17</i> ) <i>Cor</i> gene family	–	5A, 4B or 4D	–	–	Tsuda et al. (2000)
Wheat	–	–	<i>wcor14</i>	–	–	–	–	Tsvetanov et al. (2000)
Wheat	<i>Triticum spelta</i> 5A × Cheyenne 5A	–	2 loci	RFLP	5A and 2Am	Fr-A1 (35 cM), Xpsr911	–	Vágúfalvi et al. (2000)
Wheat	–	–	<i>Fr1</i>	RFLP, AFLP	5A	Xpsr426 and Xwg644	–	Sutka (2001)
Wheat	Vm-A1 × Norstar, NIL	–	<i>Vrn-A1</i>	–	–	–	–	Limin and Fowler (2002)
Wheat	Cheyenne' 5B × 'Chinese Spring'	RIL	<i>Fr-B1</i>	SSR	5B	From Vm-B1 (40 cM)	–	Toth et al. (2003)
Wheat	DV92 × G3116	RIL (74)	<i>Fr-A2</i> locus and <i>Cbf3</i> gene	RFLP	5A	VRN-1 (30 cM)	–	Vágúfalvi et al. (2000)
Wheat	Triple Dirk	NIL	<i>Fr-A1</i> , <i>Cor/Lea</i> gene	–	5	–	–	Kobayashi et al. (2005)
Wheat	–	–	<i>Fr-A (m)2</i>	–	5A	–	–	Miller et al. (2006)
Wheat	Norstar × Winter Manitou	DH (107)	One major QTL	AFLP, SSR	5A, 1D	46 cM from <i>vrn-A1</i> locus	40	Bága et al. (2007)

Table 2 continued

Crop	Mapping population	Type and size	Locus/QTL	Type of marker	Chromosome/LG group	Major QTL and important linked marker and their map position	PV%	References
Wheat	G3116 × DV92	F <sub>2</sub> (374)	<i>Fr-Am2</i> , 2QTLs	CAPS	5	–	–	Knox et al. (2008)
Wheat	Norstar × Zagros	F <sub>2</sub> (280)	–	SSR	2B, 5A	–	27	Sofalian et al. (2008)
Wheat	Durelle × Kronos	BC	<i>Frost Resistance-B2 (Fr-B2)</i>	SNP	5B	–	–	Pearce et al. (2013)
Wheat	–	1064 hybrids and 135 parental lines	One major locus	SNP	5B	41 SNPs	–	Zhao et al. (2013)
Wheat	M808 × CS	RILs (210)	<i>WCBF2</i> , <i>TaCBF12</i> , <i>Wlt10</i> , <i>Wdhn13</i> <i>Wcor14</i>	SSR	1D, 2A, 4B and 5A	Xbarc330 (49.8 cM) Xhbg406 (48.8 cM)	–	Motomura et al. (2013)
Wheat	Brundage × Coda	RIL	6 QTLs	SSR, DArT, SNP	5AL, 2A, 3A, 5B, and 6D	–	–	Case et al. (2013)
Wheat	Eltan × ORFW	F <sub>4,5</sub> , spring panel (81) winter panel (65)	<i>FR2 (FR-A2-S, FR-A2-T)</i>	InDel, SNP	–	2InDels ( <i>FR-A2-S</i> and <i>FR-A2-T</i> ) 10 SNPs ( <i>CBF-A12</i> , <i>CBF-A15</i> )	–	Zhu et al. (2014)
Wheat	–	170 winter and 14 spring wheatgenotypes	One QTL, <i>Fr-A2</i> locus	SNP	5A	–	–	Sieber et al. (2016)

BC back cross, RIL recombinant inbred line, FNP functional nucleotide polymorphism, DArT Diversity Arrays Technology

genomic region on chromosome 4, the QTL *qLTG-4* was later discovered (Fujino et al. 2004). The QTL *qCTBB-6/qCTS-6* reported by Yang et al. (2016) coincided with the QTL *qCTG6* (Ranawake et al. 2014) controlling LT tolerance at germination stage. Using a map-based cloning approach, Fujino et al. (2008) elucidated the candidate gene “*Os03g0103300*” underlying the QTL (*qLTG3-1*) that imparts cold tolerance at germination stage. Concerning LT tolerance at seedling stage, a range of QTLs were detected in rice exerting substantial impact on the tolerance level (Qingcai et al. 2004; Han et al. 2007; Lou et al. 2007; Koseki et al. 2010; Suh et al. 2012; Liu et al. 2013; Yang et al. 2016). Five QTLs discovered by Ji et al. (2010) conferring LT tolerance at plumule stage explained phenotypic variation (PV) up to 21%. Regarding seedling-stage tolerance, chromosomal region harboring the QTL *qCTS1* was reported to be in the close proximity of the QTLs *qCTS1* (Andaya and MacKill 2003b), *qCTS-1-c* (Han et al. 2007) and *qCSH1* (Lou et al. 2007). Zhang et al. (2005) reported three QTLs with a major one (*qSCT-11*) explaining 30% PV for cold tolerance at seedling stage. This chromosomal region corresponded with the chromosomal region containing QTLs *qSCT11* (Kim et al. 2014), *qCTS11-2* (Andaya and MacKill 2003b) and *qCtss11* (Koseki et al. 2010). Subsequently, fine-mapping of *qCtss11*QTL unfolded the two important candidate genes “*Os11g0615600*” and “*Os11g0615900*” (Koseki et al. 2010). In a similar way, sets of candidate genes *LOC\_Os01g69910*, *LOC\_Os01g69290*, *LOC\_Os01g69900* and *LOC\_Os11g37730*, *LOC\_Os11g37720* were obtained for the respective QTLs *qSCT1* and *qSCT11* through fine-mapping (Kim et al. 2014). The QTL *q14d-11* (Ji et al. 2010) flanked by RM286–RM1812 marker was found to be different from the QTL reported by Zhang et al. (2005) on chromosome 11. One major QTL *qCTS12a* on chromosome 12 explaining 41% PV (Andaya and MacKill 2003b) corresponded to the chromosomal region harboring *qCTS12* reported by Andaya and Tai (2006) for vegetative LT tolerance. Candidate gene (s) *OsGSTZ1* and *OsGSTZ2* were suggested to be lying under the QTL *qCTS12* (Andaya and Tai 2006). Interestingly, QTL *qCTB-4-1* contributing to LT tolerance at booting stage overlapped with the chromosomal region harboring QTL *qCTS4* for vegetative LT tolerance (Andaya and Tai 2007) on chromosome 4. Two QTLs *qRC10-1* and *qRC10-2* reported recently by Xiao et al. (2014) coincided with the chromosomal region containing *qCST10* (Liu et al. 2013) and *qCTSS-10* (Yang et al. 2013a, b). Fine-mapping of *qCST10* revealed *LOC\_Os07g22494* as the causative locus for LT tolerance (Liu et al. 2013). Similarly, fine-mapping of *qRC10-2* by Xiao et al. (2014) led them to advocate gene (s) *Os10g0489500* and *Os10g0490100* as the prime candidates for the given QTL. Similarly, QTL *qCTS7* (2)

(Ranawake et al. 2014) controlling LT tolerance at seedling stage coincided with earlier known QTLs *qSES7-1* and *qSES7-2* (Iwata et al. 2010). Notably, the QTLs *qCTS11* (1)-2 and *qCTS11* (2)-2 (Ranawake et al. 2014) were mapped in the same genomic region reported by Misawa et al. (2000). Likewise, QTL *qCTS8* (2) (Ranawake et al. 2014) overlapped with the QTL *qCTS8.1* reported previously by Wang et al. (2011). Five QTLs for leaf rolling and seedling survival under two different LT conditions were discovered in a recent work (Zhang et al. 2014a). Combining bulk segregation analysis (BSA) with next-generation sequencing (NGS) technique has enabled the identification of six QTLs contributing to LT tolerance at seedling stage in rice (Yang et al. 2013a).

Concerning LT tolerance at booting stage, Saito et al. (1995) discovered two genomic regions on chromosomes 3 and 4 that were associated with LT tolerance at booting stage. Later, two QTLs were reported on chromosome 4 governing LT stress tolerance at booting stage (Saito et al. 2001) and three QTLs viz. *qCT-7*, *qCT-1* and *qCT-11* were detected using RFLP and RAPD markers (Takeuchi et al. 2001). Subsequently, several QTLs were reported for LT tolerance at booting stage (Andaya and Mackill 2003a; Liu et al. 2003; Xu et al. 2008; Mori et al. 2011; Shirasawa et al. 2012; Xiao et al. 2014; Zhu et al. 2015). The QTLs *qCTB-4-1* and *qCTB-4-2* on chromosome 4 (Xu et al. 2008) did not coincide with the QTL region suggested by Saito et al. (2001) on chromosome 4. The QTL region containing *qCTB-11-1* (Xu et al. 2008) on chromosome 11 was different from the QTL obtained by Liu et al. (2003). Likewise, the markers reported by Dai et al. (2003) for LT tolerance at booting stage did not map in the same position on chromosomes 4, 5 and 11 as reported by Xu et al. (2008). Difference was also observed in the mapping position of *QTL 8.1* for spikelet fertility under LT (Jiang et al. 2011) on chromosome 8 with previous QTLs *qCTB8* (Kuroki et al. 2007) and *qCTF8* (Shinada et al. 2013) detected on the same chromosome. However, the QTL *qLTSPKST10.1* reported by Ye et al. (2010) on chromosome 10 harbored within the same region that harbours *QTL 10.1* (Jiang et al. 2011) and *qCTB-10-2* (Xu et al. 2008) (Tables 3, 4).

The QTL *qCTF7* (Shinada et al. 2013) explaining 33.5% PV was different from the QTL region reported by Zhou et al. (2010) and Takeuchi et al. (2001). But the QTL *qRCT7* (Dai et al. 2004)-containing region remained close to the QTL *qCT-7* on chromosome 7 reported by Takeuchi et al. (2001). The QTL *qCTB-11-1* (Xu et al. 2008) shared the genomic region harboring the QTL *qCT11* as reported by Takeuchi et al. (2001). Similarly, *fer11* QTL offering spikelet fertility tolerance at LT (Oh et al. 2004) was located in the same region on chromosome 11 as *qCT11* (Takeuchi et al. 2001). Though the QTL *qRCT6b* reported

**Table 3** List of fine-mapped QTLs contributing in cold tolerance in various crop plants

Crop	Type of population	Marker	Fine-mapped QTL	Chromosome	Candidate gene	Putative function	References
<i>Arabidopsis</i>	RIL (132)	AFLP	<i>FTQ4</i>	4	<i>CBF2</i>	Encode transcriptional activators for cold acclimation response	Alonso-Blanco et al. (2005)
<i>Arabidopsis</i>	RIL (250)	SNP	<i>QTLc2</i> , <i>QTLc4</i> and <i>QTLc5</i>	5	<i>REVEILLE1 (At5g17300)</i>	Hormonal control	Meissner et al. (2013)
<i>Hordeum vulgare</i>	F <sub>2</sub> (1849)	Bmag0223, MWG583, HvCBF4B, HvMYB1	<i>Fr-H1</i> and <i>Fr-H2</i>	5	CBF transcription factor	–	Francia et al. (2007)
<i>Festuca pratensis</i>	F <sub>1</sub> (138)	P77M76_92	<i>QFr5F-1</i>	5	<i>FpIR11</i>	–	Alm et al. (2011)
<i>Zea mays</i>	RIL (243)	umc1	<i>qOTGR5-1</i> , <i>qLTCR5-1</i>	5, 4, 6, 9	<i>GRMZM2G325653</i>	Mildew resistance locus (MLO)-like protein, C2H2 zinc-finger family protein, cortical cell-delineating protein, non-phototropic hypocoyl 3 family protein	Humd et al. (2016)
		umc1303	<i>qLTPRLS-1</i>		<i>GRMZM2G377165</i>		
		umc1303, umc62	<i>qLTCR4-1</i> , <i>qLTPRL4-1</i>		<i>GRMZM2G398807</i>		
		bn114.28a	<i>qLTCR6-1</i> , <i>qLTPRL6-2</i>		<i>GRMZM2G154595</i>		
		–	<i>qLTPRL9-1</i> , <i>qLTCR9-1</i>		<i>GRMZM2G154149</i>		
<i>Oryza sativa</i>	F <sub>2</sub> (2008)	–	<i>Ctb1</i>	4	–	Ubiquitin–proteasome pathway	Saito et al. (2004)
	F <sub>3</sub> and F <sub>7</sub> substitution line	RM5647 and RM6670	<i>qCTB8</i>	8	Monodehydroascorbate reductase	–	Kuroki et al. (2007)
	NIL, 12-195-1 and 27-355-3	PNK5, PNK7, and PNK10	<i>Ctb1</i>		Two genes encoding	Contributing in cold tolerance	Saito et al. (2010)
	NILs 18-170-2, 29-279-6	–	–		F-box protein ser/thr protein kinase	ubiquitin–proteasome pathway	
	BC <sub>1</sub> F <sub>2</sub> (3200)	SSR118673–13.1	<i>qLTG3-1</i>	3	“ <i>Os03g0103300</i> ”	Protein of unknown function	Fujino et al. (2008)
	F (5) and F (10)1954	ST573–28	–		–	–	
		RM7003	<i>qCTS12</i>	12	<i>OsGSTZ1</i> and <i>OsGSTZ2</i>	Encode zeta class glutathione S-transferases	Andaya and Tai (2006)
	–	–	<i>qCTS4</i>	4	–	–	Andaya and Tai (2007)
	F <sub>2</sub> (2810)	R102905 and RM21862	<i>qCTB7</i>	7	12 putative candidate genes	–	Zhou et al. (2010)
	F <sub>2</sub> (184)	AK24 and GP0030	<i>qCiss11</i>	11	<i>Os11g0615600</i> and/or <i>Os11g0615900</i>	–	Koseki et al. (2010)
	F <sub>2:3</sub> population 394	–	–		<i>LOC_Os07g22494</i>	Involved in DREB/CBF pathway	Liu et al. (2013)
	RIL, (123)	In1-c3, In11-d1	<i>qSCT1</i> and <i>qSCT11</i>	1, 11	<i>LOC_Os01g69910</i>	Calmodulin-binding transcription activator	Kim et al. (2014)
	11,326 BC <sub>4</sub> F <sub>2</sub>	RM221 and RSS	<i>qLOP2</i> and <i>qPSR2-1</i>	2	<i>LOC_Os11g37720</i>	–	Xiao et al. (2015)
	8642 BC <sub>4</sub> F <sub>3</sub>	–	–		<i>Os02g0677300</i>	–	
	BC <sub>3</sub> F <sub>2</sub> (13,324)	RM171-RM1108	<i>qRC10-1</i> and <i>qRC10-2</i>	10	<i>Os10g0489500</i> and <i>Os10g0490100</i>	–	Xiao et al. (2014)
	F <sub>2</sub> (8368)	RM25570-RM304	–		–	–	
		AL606683-2 and RM5503	<i>COLD1</i>	4	–	Regulator of G-protein signaling on plasma membrane and endoplasmic reticulum	Ma et al. (2015)

Table 3 continued

Crop	Type of population	Marker	Fine-mapped QTL	Chromosome	Candidate gene	Putative function	References
<i>Oryza sativa</i>	BC	NLSNP3-12 and RM7000	QTL remaining in 35 kb region	3	<i>Ox03g0789800</i>	-	Ulzibat et al. (2016)
					<i>Ox03g0790700</i>		
					<i>Ox03g0793500</i>		
					<i>Ox03g0793700</i>		
<i>Oryza sativa</i>	F <sub>2</sub>	SNP 5-5 and SNP 3-8	sy-2	1	<i>ORF10</i> and <i>ORF20</i>	Encode F-box proteins	Liu et al. (2016)
					3 candidate genes		
<i>Triticum aestivum</i>	DH (150)	<i>wmc156</i> and <i>P3346-183</i>	<i>ToSttRK2.3</i>	1B			Tian et al. (2013b)

by Dai et al. (2004) remained in close proximity with the QTL *qCTB6* (Andaya and Mackill 2003a), this QTL was not related with LT tolerance at booting stage. Mori et al. (2011) established a novel QTL *qCTB3-Silewah* on chromosome 3 that differed from the QTL reported by Saito et al. (1995) on the same chromosome. Concerning LT tolerance at booting stage, physical mapping of the QTL *Ctb1* by Saito et al. (2004) was followed by the successful cloning of this QTL (Saito et al. 2010). Notably, the authors recorded two genes encoding F-box protein and a Ser/Thr protein kinase, thereby suggesting the possible role of ubiquitin–proteasome pathway in LT tolerance in rice. More recently, fine-mapping of one QTL (*qCT-3-2*) using SNP markers precisely delineated a 192.9-kb region on the reference genome sequence (Zhu et al. 2015). The readers are referred to the recently published reviews for greater details on QTLs for LT stress tolerance in rice (da Cruz et al. 2013; Zhang et al. 2014c).

## Wheat

A regulated expression of *VRN1* and *CBF* genes is reported to allow temperate cereal crops, especially wheat and barley, to withstand LT stress (Francia et al. 2004, 2007; Stockinger et al. 2007; Dhillon et al. 2010; Knox et al. 2010; Pearce et al. 2013; Zhu et al. 2014; Mickelbart et al. 2015). Importantly, chromosomal synteny/colinearity of LT tolerance loci/QTL (s) belonging to the Triticeae family has been discussed (Cattivelli et al. 2002). Adaptive mechanism of winter wheat to acclimatize with freezing tolerance via higher expression of *CBF* genes and limiting *VRN1* transcripts till vernalization (Dhillon and Stockinger 2013; Pearce et al. 2013; Zhu et al. 2014; Mickelbart et al. 2015) remains in sheer contrast to spring wheat which shows freezing tolerance due to deletion or lower expression of *CBF* genes (at *FR2* locus) and enhanced expression of *VRN1* transcript (at *FR1* locus) (Pearce et al. 2013; Zhu et al. 2014; Mickelbart et al. 2015).

While working out the genetics of frost-tolerance gene (*Fr1*), Sutka and Snape (1989) established its linkage with *Vrn1* gene on chromosome 5A. Two loci with additive effect orchestrating the expression of *cor14b* gene describing LT tolerance were reported (Vágújfalvi et al. 2000). Three genes viz. *Fr-A1*, *Fr-B1* and *Fr-D1* accounting for LT stress tolerance were mapped on chromosomes 5A, 5B and 5D, respectively (Galiba et al. 1995; Snape et al. 1997; Toth et al. 2003). Later, the *XCbf3* was identified as a causative gene underlying *Fr-A2* locus on 5A chromosome and this contributes to frost tolerance in diploid wheat (*Triticum monococcum*) (Vágújfalvi et al. 2003). It is important to note that the LT-related genomic region on 5A chromosome reported by Båga et al. (2007)



**Table 4** LT stress tolerance in plants obtained through transcriptome sequencing

Crop	Genotype name	Stage	Platform used	Candidate gene/ differentially expressed gene(DEG)/miRNA	Function	References
Alfalfa	Zhaodong	Seedling	Illumina GAI	35 cold-responsive miRNA recovered	–	Shu et al. (2016)
Alfalfa	Zhaodong	Crown buds	–	5605 differentially expressed genes	–	Song et al. (2016)
<i>Anthurium andraeanum</i>	Alabama	Stem and leave	Illumina HiSeq™ 2000	39 cold-inducible TFs, 4363 DEGs	LT tolerance	Tian et al. (2013a)
Apple	–	Leaves	Illumina sequencing	Upregulated gene MDP0000198054	LT stress response	Du et al. (2015)
<i>Brassica juncea</i>	Varuna	Sliqua	Illumina HiSeq 2000	283 commonly cold induced transcripts	LT stress signaling	Sinha et al. (2015)
Banana	Musa spp. Dajiao Musa spp. Cavendish	Seedling	Illumina TruSeq™	Twelve early responsive genes and <i>ICE1</i> and <i>MYBS3</i> , 10 and 68 DEGs	LT tolerance	Yang et al. (2015)
<i>Lotus japonicus</i>	Gifu B-129	Seedling	Illumina HiSeq 1500	1077 DEG, 41 cold-inducible TFs	Cell wall, phenylpropanoid proline regulation, and affecting photosynthetic process	Calzadilla et al. (2016)
Potato	10908-06, ED25	Tuber	Illumina HiSeq 2000	11 cold-responsive miRNA	Adaptive response to LT stress	Ou et al. (2015)
<i>Prunus persica</i>	Lovell	Buds and young leave	SOLID Platform	miR5021, miR2919, and miR414	–	Barakat et al. (2012)
Rice	IRGA959-1-2-2F-4-1-4-A and IRGA959-1-2-2F-4-1-4-D-1-CA-1	Seedling 7 days after germination at 13 °C	Illumina HiSeq 2000 technology	1361 DEGs	Fatty acid desaturase, Antioxidant activity, Cell wall structural proteins, Cold signaling	Dametto et al. (2015)
Rice	3 genotypes	–	–	2242 DEGs and 318 common DEGs	Involved in chilling stress adaptation	Shen et al. (2014)
Rice	Y58S and P64S	–	Illumina HiSeq™ 2000 platform	1497 and 5652 DEGs	LT stress signaling	Bai et al. (2015)
Soybean	Williams 82	Mature nodules	Illumina-Solexa 1 Genetic Analyzer	11 cold-responsive miRNAs including gma- miR166u, gma- miR171p, miR2111f and miR169c	Protection of nodule from cold stress	Zhang et al. (2015)
	PC17-109	Leaf tissues			–	

**Table 4** continued

Crop	Genotype name	Stage	Platform used	Candidate gene/ differentially expressed gene(DEG)/miRNA	Function	References
<i>Spartina pectinata</i> Link			Illumina HiSeq 2500	Cold-responsive DEGs		Nah et al. (2016)
Tea	Yingshuang, Baiye 1	–	Illumina sequencing	77 upregulated and 88 downregulated cold-responsive miRNA	LT stress tolerance	Zhang et al. (2014b)
Tea	Longjing 43	Leaves	Illumina HiSeq 2000	DREB1b/CBF1 TFs and cold-responsive miRNAs	Cold tolerance	Zheng et al. (2015b)
Tomato	LA1777	–	–	161 conserved miRNA and 236 novel miRNA recovered	Involved in chilling response	Cao et al. (2014)
Tomato	<i>Solanum lycopersicum</i> and <i>Solanum habrochaites</i>	–		89 miRNA miR159, miR319, and miR6022	LT response	Chen et al. (2015b)
<i>Tripsacum dactyloides</i>	Pete	–	–	Sequence variation in known cold tolerance gene		Gault et al. (2016)
<i>Tripsacum floridanum</i>	–	–	–		–	
Wheat	Winter Norstar and winter Manitou	Crown stage		–	LT acclimation	Laudencia- Chingcuano and Fowler (2015)

coincided with *Fr-A2* locus in diploid wheat (Vágújfalvi et al. 2000, 2003, 2005). Furthermore, the sequences pertaining to two CBF genes identified by Båga et al. (2007) showed similarity with the genes *Cbf14* and *Cbf15* underlying the *Fr-2* locus, which was reported by Miller et al. (2006) in *T. monococcum*. In winter durum wheat, genotyping by sequencing (GBS) has recently allowed researchers to locate one major QTL (for frost tolerance) on chromosome 5 in close proximity of *Fr-A2* locus (Sieber et al. 2016). Importantly, the *Fr-A*<sup>(m)</sup>2 (harboring clusters of CBF genes) loci orthologous to barley *HvCBF* gene were mapped on chromosome 5 in *T. monococcum* (Miller et al. 2006). Later, the candidate gene underlying *Fr-A*<sup>m</sup>2 locus was reported to be a *CBF* gene in *T. monococcum* (Knox et al. 2008). Two important SSR markers on chromosomes 2B and 5A were found to be linked with cold tolerance through improved heading time under LT stressed conditions (Sofalian et al. 2008). In a recent study, significance of the loci *VRN1* and *FR2* (harboring *CBF* copies) with respect to cold tolerance was demonstrated (Zhu et al. 2014). Importantly, the authors identified two haplotypes of *FR-A2* viz. ‘FR-A2-S’ and ‘FR-A2-T’ associated with cold tolerance in wheat. Earlier, Pearce

et al. (2013) reported deletion of *CBF* gene clusters in ‘*Fr-B2*’ locus leading to a marked reduction in LT tolerance in both tetraploid and hexaploid wheat.

### Barley

At least 20 *HvCBF* genes are known to reside in barley genome, which can be phylogenetically classified into three subgroups, i.e., *HvCBF1*, *HvCBF3*, and *HvCBF4* (Skinner et al. 2005). Barley *CBFs* viz. *HvCBF3*, *HvCBF4* and *HvCBF8* were assigned to chromosome 5H (Choi et al. 2002; Francia et al. 2004). On chromosome 5H, Francia et al. (2004) reported two QTLs *Fr-H1* and *Fr-H2* for frost tolerance (harboring *HvCBF4* gene). The *11HvCBF* genes discovered later (Skinner et al. 2006) overlapped with the genomic region harboring QTL *Fr-H2* reported earlier by Francia et al. (2004). Co-localization of QTLs associated with cold tolerance and vernalization was also reported on chromosome 5H (Francia et al. 2004). In addition, QTLs were detected on chromosomes 2HL and 5HL to elucidate frost tolerance at vegetative and reproductive stages in barley (Reinheimer et al. 2004). Notably, three LT-tolerance-related QTLs in barley were reported to manifest

homology with *CBFs*, *ICE1*, and *ZAT12* genes involved in regulation of cold tolerance in *Arabidopsis* (Skinner et al. 2006). Recently, a novel QTL *FR-H3* governing 48% PV for LT tolerance was reported in barley mapping populations (NB3437f × OR71 and NB713 × OR71) (Fisk et al. 2013). Stockinger et al. (2007) reported the regulatory role of *VRN-H1/Fr-H1* locus on chromosome 5, controlling *Cbf* gene expression localizing with *Fr-2* locus in barley under cold stress. High-resolution mapping of *Fr-H2* locus in barley revealed seven CBF sub-clusters involved in frost tolerance (Francia et al. 2007). Cluster of six *HvCBF* genes was reported to co-localize with *Fr-H2* QTL on 5H (Tondelli et al. 2006). Role of CBF copies localizing with *FR-1* and *FR-2* loci in cold tolerance and acclimatization in cereals and in barley has been recorded (Knox et al. 2010; Tondelli et al. 2006). Subsequently, alleles of *Vrn-H1* locus on 5H chromosome were identified to be linked with early-flowering trait, providing low-temperature tolerance at reproductive stage, whereas frost-tolerance loci on 2HL were associated with late-flowering alleles governed by *Flt-2L* gene in barley (Chen et al. 2009). It is important to note that higher copy number of *HvCBF4* and *HvCBF2* delivered greater frost tolerance (Francia et al. 2016) and the authors also developed cleaved amplified polymorphic sequence (CAPS) assay to distinguish between *CBF2A* and *CBF2B* genes. Based on comparative analysis, it was inferred that the position of CBF clusters underlying *Fr-H2* locus in Morex × Dicktoo barley population (Skinner et al. 2006) had synteny with the genomic region containing *Fr-A<sup>m</sup>2* locus (on chromosome 5A) in winter × spring *T. monococcum* diploid wheat mapping population (Vágúfalvi et al. 2000). Equally important, in *Festuca pratensis* belonging to the Triticeae family, two QTLs *QWs5F-2* corresponding to wheat *Fr-A1/Fr-H1* and the *QFt5F-2/QWs5F-1* QTL corresponding to *Fr-H2/Fr-A<sup>m</sup>2* locus have been reported (Alm et al. 2011). The synteny of *FR-H2* locus harboring CBF genes in barley (Francia et al. 2007) with *Fr-A2<sup>m</sup>2* locus in diploid wheat *T. monococcum* (Knox et al. 2008; Tondelli et al. 2006; Miller et al. 2006) has been thoroughly discussed by Galiba et al. (2009).

### Maize

In maize, QTLs for various traits such as early seedling vigor, root, leaf and shoot traits were registered under LT stress condition (Hund et al. 2004; Presterl et al. 2007). One major QTL contributing to photo-inhibition tolerance under LT was disclosed residing on chromosome 6 (Fracheboud et al. 2004). Notably, three genomic regions located on 2, 4 and 8 chromosomal regions, contributing to seedling LT tolerance have been registered (Rodriguez et al. 2014).

### Sorghum

In sorghum, two QTLs conferring LT tolerance at germination stage were detected each on LGs SBI-03a and SBI-07b using a mapping population derived from the cross Shan Qui Red × SRN39 (Knoll et al. 2008), whereas considering LT tolerance at emergence stage, QTL-containing regions were identified on different LGs viz. SBI-01, SBI-03, SBI-04, SBI-06, SBI-08 and SBI-09 (Fiedler et al. 2012).

### Pea

Based on data recorded over multiple years and multiple locations, three promising frost-tolerance-related QTLs were reported, which also exhibited co-localization with *Hr* flowering locus (Lejeune-Henaut et al. 2008). Similarly, Klein et al. (2014) discovered a QTL cluster LG IV which could be accounted for 70% PV for frost tolerance damage in pea. On the other hand, the QTL clusters on LGIII were associated with *Hr* and *Le* loci. Two consistent QTLs for cold tolerance were reported on LG V and LG VI. Interestingly, these QTLs coincided with the genomic segments related to raffinose and RuBisCO activity (Dumont et al. 2009).

### Other crops

In Triticale, nine main-effect QTLs accountable for both winter hardiness and LT tolerance were recovered from more than 600 double haploid (DH) lines (Liu et al. 2014). In case of soybean, three QTLs (*qCTTSW1*, *qCTTSW2*, and *qCTTSW3*) were detected that controlled LT tolerance at reproductive stage (Funatsuki et al. 2005), while a major QTL discovered by Ikeda et al. (2009) maintained seed development under LT stress. In *Medicago truncatula*, QTLs that define leaf shoot and root orientation under LT stress conditions were discovered (Avia et al. 2013). The entire trait QTLs viz, number of leaves, leaf area, electrolyte leakage, and other shoot and root QTLs were assigned on chromosomes LG1, LG4 and LG6 (Avia et al. 2013). In *B. napus*, a total of six significant QTLs conferring LT tolerance were reported under more than one winter season (Kole et al. 2002). In tomato, wide cross involving NC84173 (*Lycopersicon esculentum*) and LA722 (wild *L. pimpinellifolium* accession) served for the delivery of QTLs that impart tolerance to LT stress during germination stage (Foolad et al. 1998). Similarly, Truco et al. (2000) reported three QTLs derived from *L. esculentum* × *L. hirsutum*, that were found to be controlling wilting and root ammonium uptake under chilling stress. One QTL for shoot turgor maintenance (designated by *stm9*) was introgressed into *L. esculentum* from wild

*L. hirsutum*, which eventually conditioned chilling tolerance in tomato (Goodstal et al. 2005).

### Incorporating LT tolerance into susceptible genetic backgrounds using molecular breeding techniques

The robust QTLs/markers described in the preceding section hold great potential to accelerate the progress of traditional breeding. These DNA markers permit precise selection of the desirable genotypes in a time-saving and environment-independent manner. As suggested by Cui et al. (2013), the marker-assisted selection (MAS) becomes crucial in a situation that demands accumulation of favourable alleles to enhance the intensity of tolerance level. Besides favourable allele, the allele that exerts strong negative impact on the performance should also be taken into account while breeding for cold tolerance. Marker genotypes that exert negative impact on cold tolerance were discovered in both indica and japonica rice by Pan et al. (2015).

Marker-assisted back-crossing (MABC) is the simplest form of marker-assisted selection (MAS) that seeks targeted transfer/incorporation of QTL/gene-containing genomic segments to elite yet susceptible genetic bases. This approach has been found particularly suitable for introgressing QTL having large effect on the phenotype of interest (Varshney et al. 2012). More importantly, MABC remains the most efficient way to pyramid different gene (s)/QTL (s) into a single genotype (Collard and Mackill 2008). MABC has been successfully implemented to introgress as well as pyramid different LT-tolerance-related QTL (s) into sensitive genetic backgrounds. Two QTLs (*qCTBB-5* and *qCTBB-6*) and two QTLs (*qCTS-6* and *qCTS-12*) conferring tolerance at bud bursting and seedling stages, respectively, were pyramided into SC1-1, a single-segment substitution line (SSSL) were derived from the cross between Nan-yang-zhan and Hua-jing-xian 74 (Yang et al. 2016). Pyramiding of the QTLs (*qCTF7*, *qCTF8* and *qCTF12*) was attempted using SSR markers to enhance cold tolerance at fertilization stage in rice (Shinada et al. 2014). Co-segregating markers viz. In1-c3 and In11-d1 could be exploited in MABC scheme to transfer LT tolerance to high-yielding yet cold-sensitive rice cultivars (Kim et al. 2014). Likewise, MABC also permitted the transfer of QTLs *qRC10-2* (Xiao et al. 2014) and *qCTB3-Silewah* (Mori et al. 2011) controlling LT tolerance at seedling and booting stages, respectively, from Dongxiang wild rice and J501 to susceptible genotypes. Two near-isogenic lines (NILs) were recovered in the background of Towada, which contained QTL-containing region (LT tolerance genes) from Kunmingxiaobaigu

(Zhou et al. 2012). As evident from the successful examples reported in rice, MABC holds great potential in enhancing the LT tolerance level of high-yielding yet susceptible cultivars, thus emerging as a promising breeding tool for food security in the face of increasing LT stress worldwide.

### Association mapping/genome-wide association studies (GWAS)

Relying on a panel of unrelated individuals, the GWAS technique is quick-to-implement as it does not demand artificially created experimental populations and offers a high-resolution genetic dissection of the complex traits (Mitchell-Olds 2010; Ogura and Busch 2015). Moreover, the wide complementarity of GWAS with the linkage-map-based QTL analysis has been well accentuated by various researchers (Mitchell-Olds 2010; Korte and Farlow 2013; Huang and Han 2014). To illuminate the genetic landscape of LT tolerance at booting stage in rice, association analysis of 347 rice accessions using 148 SSR markers unearthed a set of 24 SSR markers that showed significant association with cold tolerance (Cui et al. 2013). The SSR markers corresponded with the QTL regions reported in earlier studies; for instance, RM252 was adjacent to *Ctb 2*, RM220 and RM 1 with *Ctb1* (Saito et al. 2001, 2004, 2010), and RM566 with *qCTB9* (Andaya and Mackill 2003a, b). Similarly, the DNA markers RM528, RM160, RM4B and RM 235 corresponded with *qLTSSvR6-1*, *qCTSSR9-1*, *qCTSSR11-1* and *qCTSSR12-1*, respectively, as reported more recently by Pan et al. (2015) based on GWAS of 174 rice accessions with 273 SSR markers. Of the 52 QTLs reported by Pan et al. (2015) for cold tolerance, 27 QTLs were mapped in the vicinity of known QTLs. An interconnected breeding (IB) population involving eight indica varieties as donors facilitated the identification of six QTLs on three chromosomes in rice (Zhu et al. 2015). One stable QTL *qCT-3-2* was detected in all four environments accounting  $R^2$  up to 9.5%, and fine-mapping using NIL (derived from this IB) assigned *qCT-3-2* to a 193-kb genomic segment. This QTL (*qCT-3-2*) on chromosome 3 was also detected earlier in an RIL population and explained 7.1% PV (Suh et al. 2010). In a recent GWA study, a total of 132 loci were identified from 529 accessions to explain the genetic basis of natural chilling and cold shock in rice (Lv et al. 2016). Interestingly, 68 loci were previously registered for cold tolerance in rice, implying towards some overlap between cold tolerance at different growth stages. GWAS on panels of japonica and indica rice reconfirmed greater cold tolerance of japonica than the indica rice (Pan et al. 2015; Lv et al. 2016).

The QTL overlaps suggested by Lv et al. (2016) in rice remained in contrast with the observation in maize where 43 MTAs based on GWAS for cold tolerance did not show

any overlap between seedling and booting stages (Huang et al. 2013). Huang et al. (2013) established correspondence of SNP11 and SNP19 with the QTL regions discovered earlier by Jompuk et al. (2005) for chilling tolerance in maize F<sub>2:3</sub>. Based on GWAS of 306 dent and 292 flint inbreds with 49,585 SNPs, a recent study revealed the highest number of QTLs (275 SNPs) for cold tolerance in maize (Revilla et al. 2016). The candidate genes underlying these QTLs coincided with the genomic regions found by Strigens et al. (2013) including QTLs for SPAD and early vigor in dent and flint panels, respectively. Strigens and colleagues detected 19 QTLs for cold tolerance from 375 inbred lines belonging to three breeding groups (NA-D, EU-D and EU-F); majority of these QTLs (*QTL1\_RGR* to *QTL10\_RGR* with  $R^2$  up to 52.49%) were associated with relative growth rate, and the authors proposed pleiotropy as the major reason to explain the overlapping of QTLs controlling multiple traits. In oat, GWAS of 138 accessions from 27 European countries using Infinium 6K Oat array led to the identification of three robust QTLs for frost tolerance (Tumino et al. 2016). Attempts to link these newly discovered QTLs with the known ones led the authors to propose *Mrg 11* as a new QTL, whereas two QTLs viz. *Mrg 20* and *Mrg 21* found resemblance with genomic regions harboring *Vrn1* locus (KO linkage group 24\_26\_34) and its second copy (KO linkage group 22\_44\_18). Similarly, in wheat, a major-effect locus different from *Fr-B1/Vrn-B1* and *Fr-B2* was detected on 5B through 9 K SNP array-based analysis of 1739 genotypes (Zhao et al. 2013). Given the 60% higher prediction accuracy of genomic selection (GS) over GWAS, the authors advocated embracing GS technique to offer an improved understanding of frost tolerance in wheat via capturing QTLs having small effect sizes. In sorghum, 194 breeding lines and two F<sub>2:3</sub> populations comprising 80 and 90 individuals were genotyped with 2620 SNPs. Association analysis uncovered 109 SMTAs, whereas 32 and 37 QTLs were detected from the two populations. The robust MTAs/QTLs were located on SBI-01, 02, 03, 04, 06 and 09 with the underlying candidate genes associated with SbCBF4, CSDP1, ICE1, and cytochrome P45. (Fiedler et al. 2016). A similar approach combining bi-parental population (BPP) and GWAS (Gottingen Winter Bean population: GWBP) was used recently in faba bean (Sallam et al. 2016a). This study yielded 17 QTLs and 25 MTAs in BPP and GWBP, respectively, with corresponding PVs lying in the range of 2.74–29.41 and 2.66–11.89%, and notably, a subset of five significant SNPs was found common to both methods. The SNP loci validated in this study viz VF\_Mt5g026780, VF\_Mt3g086600 and VF\_Mt4g127690 showed association with winter hardiness and yield traits based on association mapping of GWBP (Sallam et al. 2016b).

## New-generation omics technologies to illustrate plant LT stress response

### Genome-wide expression profiling

Recent advances in functional genomics have deepened our knowledge about the key candidate gene (s), and regulatory network underlying LT stress signaling and tolerance mechanism (Winfield et al. 2010; Zhang et al. 2012b; Bai et al. 2015; Zhao et al. 2015a, b). In this regard, NGS-enabled digital gene expression (DGE) profiling has emerged as a sensitive and high-throughput approach to examine the gene expression that alters during physiological, morphological and molecular response under LT stress in plants (Herman et al. 2006; Fowler and Thomashow 2002). Expression analysis of *Cbf* gene transcripts in barley suggested that higher LT tolerance in recombinants derived from Nure × Tremois cross was due to higher accumulation of *Cbf2* and *Cbf4* gene transcript expression (Stockinger et al. 2007). In wheat, gene expression analysis in Triple Dark (without dominant *Vrn-1* alleles) and nearly isogenic lines (NILs) of Triple Dark (with *Vrn-A1* allele) suggested that the NILs without *Vrn-1* alleles had higher expression of *Wcbf2* and *Cor/Lea* genes eventually reflected as lower freezing damage than the NILs carrying *Vrn-1* allele (Kobayashi et al. 2005). A comparative expression analysis of rye *Cbf* genes (*ScCbfs*) and *Cor* gene with orthologous CBF and *Cor* genes of wheat *Wcor14b* and *Hvcor14b* genes from barley suggested their “temperature-dependent and light-regulated diurnal response” (Campoli et al. 2009). To elucidate the gene expression under LT stress conditions, expression profiling has witnessed a shift from conventional microarray analysis (Monroy et al. 2007; Cho et al. 2012; Zhang et al. 2012b) to DGE (Fowler and Thomashow 2002; Tian et al. 2013a; Shen et al. 2014; Yang et al. 2015). Microarray analysis revealed changes in the transcripts of 300 genes in spring and winter wheat under LT stress and the encoded proteins from most of the genes suggested their involvement in key metabolic process in wheat (Gulik et al. 2005). Similarly, transcript levels of 450 genes altered in response to cold treatment in contrasting wheat cultivars, thus implying towards the possible participation of 130 candidate genes in signaling and regulatory mechanism viz., TFs and protein kinases (Monroy et al. 2007). Under field and controlled conditions, transcriptome analysis of two cold-acclimated winter wheat lines differing in freeze survival suggested an increase in the expression of *Cbf-2*, *-A22* and *B-22* genes, while *Cbf* genes (*Cbf-3*, *5*, *6*, *12*, *14* and *19*) were differentially expressed in cold-acclimated higher-freeze-survival and lower-freeze-survival lines in comparison to non-acclimated controls (Sutton et al. 2009). Importantly, *Tal-*

*FFT* and *Ta6-SF* fructan biosynthesis gene and *Cor/Lea* genes point to their relevance in cold acclimation in wheat (Yokota et al. 2015). To this end, changes in *COR* gene expression and CBF regulon under LT stress recruiting transcriptome study in wheat have been critically reviewed elsewhere (Winfield et al. 2010). In rice, mechanistic complexity of LT tolerance was reported to be higher in indica type than the japonica type given the fact that the former withstands LT stress by activating both CBF-dependent and CBF-independent pathways through recruiting various TFs (Bevilacqua et al. 2015). Comparative transcriptional profiling of two chilling-tolerant (LTH, JM) and two chilling-sensitive (IR29 and PB1) rice cultivars revealed differential expression of 182 genes by twofold, and the set of genes was referred to as Common Cold Induced (CCI). On the other hand, 511 genes termed as Cold Induced in Tolerant (CIT) were expressed in chilling-tolerant cultivars, whereas 2101 genes were expressed differentially only in the cultivar JM (Chawade et al. 2013). Participation of various regulatory genes involving antioxidant enzyme genes, genes associated with signal transduction of abscisic acid (ABA), salicylic acid (SA) regulatory phytohormones and *OsDREB2A* gene became evident by genome-wide expression profiling under LT stress (Zhao et al. 2015b). Differential expression of lipid transfer protein (LTP) genes was also reported in LT-tolerant and LT-sensitive genotypes in rice (Morales de Freitas et al. 2016). Based on mRNA expression profiling, higher expression of plasma membrane intrinsic proteins (PIPs) in LT-tolerant rice in comparison to sensitive cultivar under LT stress highlighted their importance in LT stress, and it has been recorded through mRNA expression profiling (Yu et al. 2006). Analysis of rice genotypes IL112 and GC2 using Affymetrix GeneChip provided one candidate gene *LOC\_Os07g22494* responsible for seedling LT tolerance (Liu et al. 2013). Employing Agilent Rice Gene Expression Microarray 4 × 44 K in two chilling-tolerant rice varieties, i.e., Sijung and Jumli Marshi led the authors to propose that genes confer chilling tolerance in Sijung largely through enabling protection of the cell wall and plasma membrane. On the other hand, Jumli Marshi exploits detoxification mechanism to withstand chilling stress through ROS scavenging and safeguarding chloroplast translation (Lindlöf et al. 2015). Based on a microarray analysis in barley, the role of *VRN1* was reconfirmed by Greenup et al. (2011) as the contig corresponding to *HvVRN1* remained upregulated in prolonged cold and vernalized plants. Authors also observed increased transcript levels for two genes *HvCOR14B* and *WSC19* in both short-term and prolonged cold treatments and in vernalized plants. By contrast, *HvCBF9* showed upregulation in response to short-term LT stress. Some genes reported to be significant for cold tolerance in wheat (associated gibberellin biosynthesis

pathway) did not register any response in this study. Expression level of 102 genes was showing up to eightfold difference under freeze stress at  $-5\text{ }^{\circ}\text{C}$  based on Affymetrix Wheat GeneChip microarray in wheat genotype Yumai 34 (Kang et al. 2013); the authors obtained a set of genes viz., *WCOR413*, *LEA*, aquaporin 2 showing expression levels similar to those recorded previously in wheat and barley for spring freeze stress. By employing GeneChip Wheat Genome Array, Skinner (2015) recorded more than twofold upregulation of 2000 genes in Tiber wheat cultivar under freezing ( $-3\text{ }^{\circ}\text{C}$  for 24 h) and thawing ( $+3\text{ }^{\circ}\text{C}$  for 24 or 48 h) treatment, suggesting the involvement of genes participating in cell signaling, and activating stress responsive mechanism. Likewise, Arabidopsis NimbleGen ATH6 Microarrays analysis of 10 *Arabidopsis* ecotypes collected from different geographical regions revealed ecotype-specific regulatory TFs that respond to LT stress (Barah et al. 2013). Based on a microarray analysis in *Festuca pratensis*, Rudi et al. (2011) found two candidate genes *FpQM* and *FpTPT* contributing to LT tolerance. Genome-wide transcriptome analysis in tolerant and wild lines of rice delivered a set of 78 genes related to chilling stress (Cho et al. 2012). In another study, differentially expressed genes involved in *OsDREB1* and *OsMyb4* regulons were found to be contributing to LT stress tolerance in rice (Zhang et al. 2012a). The study established genes encoding membrane fluidity and defensive proteins as instrumental in conferring LT tolerance in the line K354. Notably, Zhang et al. (2012b) found a common set of genes associated with cold signaling and transcription regulation, which showed upregulation in contrasting rice genotypes LTH and IR29 under early chilling response. Whereas, the given genotypes differed in regulatory gene expression, thus offering adaptation ability to the chilling-tolerant genotype under late phase of chilling stress. Considerable transcriptional variation was observed between *Solanum commersonii* and *S. tuberosum* concerning genes involved in CBF regulons, and importantly, putative orthologous LT regulatory genes common to *S. commersonii*, *S. tuberosum* and *A. thaliana* were recovered (Carvalho et al. 2011). Transcriptome analysis in contrasting lines Champagne (freezing tolerant) and Terese (freezing sensitive) in pea suggested that the chilling tolerance was induced comparatively early in Champagne than in Terese via expressing *CBF*, *COR* and *LEA* genes; however, freezing tolerance of Champagne was due to orchestrating safeguard mechanism of antioxidant production, and cell wall modification (Lucas-Danila et al. 2012). While molecular markers developed from the differentially expressed genes obtained from quantitative polymerase chain reaction (qPCR) led to the detection of five candidate genes conferring LT tolerance existing in previously reported three LT-tolerant QTLs (Legrand et al. 2013).

RNA-seq has shed light on a variety of genes showing differential expression in response to LT stress tolerance (Bai et al. 2015; Chen et al. 2015b). For example, more than 300 differentially expressed genes under LT stress were discovered in rice using RNA-seq analysis of three LT-tolerant and one LT-sensitive genotypes (Shen et al. 2014). In another study, RNA-seq analysis of *indica* rice at germination stage under LT stress indicated marked changes in cellular response encompassing cell division,  $Ca^{2+}$  signaling, sucrose synthesis and antioxidant activity (Dametto et al. 2015). Anther transcriptome analysis in rice revealed 1497 and 5652 differentially expressed genes, thus suggesting their role in signal transduction and transcription regulation of cold tolerance, respectively (Bai et al. 2015). RNA-seq driven by Illumina sequencing aided in disclosing 39 TFs viz., AP2/ERF, zinc finger, NAC, MYB involved in LT stress in *Anthurium andraeanum* (Tian et al. 2013a). A recent RNA-seq based comparative transcriptome analysis in banana and plantain elucidated significant difference in expression levels of several genes including ICE1 and MYBS3 under different LT stress treatments (Yang et al. 2015). Similarly, RNA-seq analysis of LT-treated leaf tissue of *Spartina pectinata* revealed active involvement of genes ranging from transcription regulators, anti-freezing proteins to epigenetic regulatory genes providing freezing stress tolerance (Nah et al. 2016). The recent transcriptomic studies provide valuable insights on genome-scale expression profiling of various genes including regulatory genes involved in key metabolisms and development pathways under LT.

### Non-coding RNAs, their targets and LT stress

The NGS technology has offered unprecedented opportunity to capture non-coding RNA (ncRNA) molecules including miRNA, siRNA and lncRNA that make significant contribution to abiotic stress tolerance in plants (Khraiwesh et al. 2012; Matsui et al. 2013). Recent studies have facilitated discovery and functional characterization of cold-responsive ncRNAs and their possible targets (Chen et al. 2012; Thiebaut et al. 2012; Niu et al. 2016). In this context, the role of miR-167 and miR-319 in response to cold stress in rice is worth mentioning (Lv et al. 2010). Examination of Osa-miR319b (a family of miRNA319 in rice) to find the contribution towards LT tolerance unearthed targeting of TFs like *OsPCF6* and *OsTCP21* (Wang et al. 2014). Moreover, overexpression of Osa-miRNA319 targeting *OsPCF5* and *OsPCF8* genes conferring LT in transgenic rice could be potentially harnessed to develop LT-tolerant rice cultivar (Yang et al. 2013b). NGS analysis of small RNA libraries in poplar (*Populus tomentosa*) provided set of cold-responsive miRNAs showing down- (21) and up-regulation (9) (Chen et al.

2012). Likewise, role of miR475b in freezing tolerance has been unfolded via cloning *MIR475b* gene in *Populus suaveolens* (Niu et al. 2016). Likewise, in tea, RNA-seq analysis using Solexa sequencing led to the identification of 31 upregulated and 43 downregulated miRNAs in Yingshuang genotype and 46 upregulated and 45 downregulated miRNAs in Baiye 1 genotype, respectively, under LT stress (Zhang et al. 2014b). Interestingly, from this study, a total of 763 related target genes were recovered via degradome sequencing. In tomato, cold-responsive miRNAs were obtained under LT stress such as miR159, miR319, and miR6022 from *Solanum lycopersicum* and *S. habrochaites* (Chen et al. 2015b) and miR167, miR169, miR172, miR 393 and miR397 (Koc et al. 2015). Interestingly, conservative role of these non-coding molecules in conferring LT stress tolerance across different plant species has been supported by various studies. The recent examples include miR319 and its putative targets *GAMYb*, and *PCF6* in sugarcane (Thiebaut et al. 2012) and miR156, miR159, miR167, miRNA172, miRNA396 and miRNA398 in alfalfa (Shu et al. 2016). Further exploration of non-coding RNA world will assist in unraveling novel ncRNAs and their targets that participate in LT signaling and crosstalk in plants. Recently, microRNA (miRNA) and small interfering RNA (siRNA) functioning at post-transcriptional level are receiving attention owing to their significant contribution in both biotic and abiotic stress tolerance (Ariel et al. 2015; Liu et al. 2015b). Evidences of miRNA contributing in LT stress in *Arabidopsis* (Zhou et al. 2008), rice (Wang et al. 2014), *Populus* (Chen et al. 2012), *Brachypodium* (Zhang et al. 2009), tea (Zhang et al. 2014b), and tomato (Chen et al. 2015b) have been recorded.

### Analyzing proteomes to describe plant LT stress tolerance

As a complement to transcriptomics, proteomics allows characterization of the gene product at both translational and post-translational levels, thus revealing the complete landscape of the proteins involved in LT acclimatization in plant (Janmohammadi et al. 2015). In this section, we summarize the role of proteomics in understanding LT stress in crop plants. Role of proteomics in deciphering LT stress tolerance lies at various levels ranging from cellular metabolism and energy production, oxidative stress damage, cold acclimation to cellular signaling (Cui et al. 2005; Hashimoto and Komatsu 2007; Neilson et al. 2011; Dumont et al. 2011; Sandve et al. 2011; Kosová et al. 2013). Proteins participating in energy metabolism might play crucial roles in providing LT stress tolerance. For example, alteration in proteins involved in photosynthesis, transport and energy

metabolism was recorded in LT-treated rice at seedling stage by iTRAQ assay (Neilson et al. 2011). Proteins contributing to sugar synthesis, regulating transcription and translation activity in chloroplast might cause LT acclimation in pea (Grimaud et al. 2013). Likewise, to elucidate the role of proteins contributing in LT tolerance at germination stage, expression of 85 and 196 proteins was examined, respectively, in tolerant and sensitive rice cultivars with shotgun proteomics analysis under LT stress (Lee et al. 2015). The expressed proteins obtained in tolerant cultivars suggested their participation in gibberellin and ABA-mediated signaling in LT tolerance. In addition, various proteins involved in protection mechanism from oxidative stress under LT stress were found. The LT imposed on winter and spring wheat cultivars caused an increase in stress and development proteins in winter wheat line, and an increase in proteins contributing in cell division re-establishment in spring wheat line (Kosová et al. 2013). Proteomics study in LT-treated cold-tolerant and cold-sensitive wheat cultivars suggested an increase in antioxidant-related proteins in LT-tolerant cultivar and an abundance in proteins involved in carbohydrate metabolism in LT-sensitive cultivar (Xu et al. 2013). While investigating proteins contributing to LT acclimation in alfalfa, proteomic study revealed greater insight into the changes of key proteins involved in cellular metabolism ranging from photosynthesis to stress-alleviating proteins. In this context, ‘autologous metabolism and biosynthesis’ halted in freezing-tolerant ZD cultivar, while W5 freezing-sensitive cultivar activated the proteins associated with protection mechanism against cold stress (Chen et al. 2015a). In pea, higher adaptation of Champagne genotype for chilling stress was elucidated owing to the presence of higher proteins involved in photosynthesis and protection mechanism (Dumont et al. 2011). In addition, dehydrins and late embryogenesis abundant proteins participate in conferring chilling tolerance in plant (Hanin et al. 2011). Greater accumulation of dehydrin 5 (DHN5) protein in winter barley lines in comparison to spring lines adequately explained the enhanced LT acclimation of winter barley (Kosová et al. 2010). The dynamics of dehydrin especially Wcs120 and Dhn5 in cold acclimation in barley and wheat, respectively, has been reviewed elsewhere (Vítámvás and Prásil 2008; Kosová et al. 2011). Furthermore, the role of proteins associated with “cell signaling, cellular transport and cell membrane” in response to LT stress in perennial grasses has been reviewed (see Sandve et al. 2011). Therefore, efforts are needed to combine proteomic and transcriptome data to gain deeper insight into the ‘gene regulatory network’ associated with LT stress tolerance in plants.

## Conclusion and future prospects

Given the current trajectory of population growth worldwide that projects 9 billion people by 2050 (Godfray et al. 2010), LT stress can further aggravate the growing problem of food insecurity. To meet this challenge, plant breeding requires to efficiently tap the rich gene/allelic diversity contained in crop germplasm resources. This in turn paves the way for introducing unexploited genetic resources including wild crop relatives, landraces and advanced breeding lines into existing crop improvement schemes. Recent advancements in genomics can significantly underpin crop improvement to develop LT stress-tolerant crops. The QTLs controlling LT tolerance-related traits could be immediately deployed in breeding schemes through MAS or MABC. Alternatively, the QTL-containing segment may be targeted for fine-mapping or map-based cloning. Emerging QTL discovery methods such as GWAS make best use of the available phenotypic records and high-density DNA marker systems. As QTLs with small effect sizes substantially contribute to cold tolerance, genomic selection that adequately captures these minor QTLs holds greater relevance. In parallel, consolidating the information emanating from multiple omics platforms viz. transcriptomics, and proteomics would allow researchers to pinpoint the causative gene (s) involved in LT signaling and cold acclimation in plants. To this end, the reference genome sequences established in major crops open up opportunities for identification of specific DNA sequences that are involved in plant LT tolerance. We envisage that the modern omics technologies can significantly support conventional breeding to ensure sustainable crop production under LT stress.

**Author contribution statement** All authors wrote and approved the final manuscript.

**Acknowledgements** The authors acknowledge the support from the Indian Council of Agricultural Research (ICAR), New Delhi, India. We also apologize that other LT related references could not be cited due to space constraints.

**Compliance with ethical standards**

**Conflict of interest** The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest. No financial help is taken for writing this manuscript.

## References

- Abe N, Kotaka S, Toriyama K, Kobayashi M (1989) Development of the “Rice Norin PL 8” with high tolerance to cool temperature at the booting stage. *Res Bull Hokkaido Natl Agric Exp Stn* 152:9–17
- Agarwal M, Hao Y, Kapoor A, Dong CH, Fujii H, Zheng X, Zhu JK (2006) A R2R3 type MYB transcription factor is involved in the



- cold regulation of *CBF* genes and in acquired freezing tolerance. *J Biol Chem* 281:37636–37645
- Allen DJ, Ort DR (2001) Impacts of chilling temperatures on photosynthesis in warm-climate plants. *Trends Plant Sci* 6:36–42
- Alm V, Busso CS, Ergon A, Rudi H, Larsen A, Humphreys MW, Rognli OA (2011) QTL analyses and comparative genetic mapping of frost tolerance, winter survival and drought tolerance in meadow fescue (*Festuca pratensis* Huds.). *Theor Appl Genet* 123:369–382
- Alonso-Blanco C, Gomez-Mena C, Llorente F, Koornneef M, Salinas J, Martínez-Zapater JM (2005) Genetic and molecular analyses of natural variation indicate CBF2 as a candidate gene for underlying a freezing tolerance quantitative trait locus in Arabidopsis. *Plant Physiol* 139:1304–1312
- Andaya VC, Mackill DJ (2003a) QTLs conferring cold tolerance at the booting stage of rice using recombinant inbred lines from a japonica/indica cross. *Theor Appl Genet* 106:1084–1090
- Andaya VC, Mackill DJ (2003b) Mapping of QTLs associated with cold tolerance during the vegetative stage in rice. *J Exp Bot* 54:2579–2585
- Andaya VC, Tai TH (2006) Fine mapping of the *qCTS12* locus, a major QTL for seedling cold tolerance in rice. *Theor Appl Genet* 113:467–475
- Andaya VC, Tai TH (2007) Fine mapping of the *qCTS4* locus associated with seedling cold tolerance in rice (*Oryza sativa* L.). *Mol Breed* 20:349–358
- Arbaoui M, Link W, Satovic Z, Torres AM (2008) Quantitative trait loci of frost tolerance and physiologically related trait in faba bean (*Vicia faba* L.). *Euphytica* 164:93–104
- Ariel F, Romero-Barrios N, Jégu T, Benhamed M, Crespi M (2015) Battles and hijacks: noncoding transcription in plants. *Trends Plant Sci* 20:362–371
- Arms EM, Bloom AJ, St Clair DA (2015) High-resolution mapping of a major effect QTL from wild tomato *Solanum habrochaites* that influences water relations under root chilling. *Theor Appl Genet* 128:1713–1724
- Artus NN, Uemura M, Steponkus PL, Gilmour SJ, Lin CT, Thomashow MF (1996) Constitutive expression of the cold regulated *Arabidopsis thaliana* COR 15a gene affects both chloroplast and protoplast freezing tolerance. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 93:13404–13409
- Asghari A, Mohammadi SA, Moghaddam M, Mohammaddust H (2007) Identification of QTLs controlling cold resistance-related traits in *Brassica napus* L. using RAPD markers. *J Food Agric Environ* 3&4:188–192
- Avia K, Pilet-Nayel ML, Bahrman N, Baranger A, Delbreil B, Fontaine V, Hamon C, Hanocq E, Niarquin M, Sellier H, Vuylsteker C, Prosperi JM, Lejeune-Hénaut I (2013) Genetic variability and QTL mapping of freezing tolerance and related traits in *Medicago truncatula*. *Theor Appl Genet* 126:2353–2366
- Badawi M, Reddy YV, Agharbaoui Z, Tominaga Y, Danyluk J, Sarhan F, Houde M (2008) Structure and functional analysis of wheat ICE (Inducer of CBF Expression) genes. *Plant Cell Physiol* 49:1237–1249
- Båga M, Chodaparambil SV, Limin AE, Pecar M, Fowler DB, Chibbar RN (2007) Identification of quantitative trait loci and associated candidate genes for low-temperature tolerance in cold-hardy winter wheat. *Funct Integr Genom* 7:53–68
- Bai B, Wu J, Sheng WT, Zhou B, Zhou LJ, Zhuang W, Yao DP, Deng QY (2015) Comparative analysis of anther transcriptome profiles of two different rice male sterile lines genotypes under cold stress. *Int J Mol Sci* 16:11398–11416
- Barah P, Jayavelu ND, Rasmussen S, Nielsen HB, Mundy J, Bones AM (2013) Genome-scale cold stress response regulatory networks in ten Arabidopsis thaliana ecotypes. *BMC Genom* 14:722
- Barakat A, Sriram A, Park J, Zhebentyayeva T, Main D, Abbott A (2012) Genome wide identification of chilling responsive microRNAs in *Prunus persica*. *BMC Genom* 13:481
- Bevilacqua CB, Basu S, Pereira A, Tseng TM, Zimmer PD, Burgos NR (2015) Analysis of stress-responsive gene expression in cultivated and weedy rice differing in cold stress tolerance. *PLoS One* 10:e0132100
- Boer R, Campbell LC, Fletcher DJ (1993) Characteristics of frost in a major wheat-growing region of Australia. *Aust J Agric Res* 44:1731–1743
- Bonnecarrère V, Quero G, Monteverde E, Rosas J, de Vida FP, Cruz M, Corredor E, Garaycochea S, Monza J (2014) Candidate gene markers associated with cold tolerance in vegetative stage of rice (*Oryza sativa* L.). *Euphytica* 203:385–398
- Burow G, Burke JJ, Xin Z, Franks CD (2010) Genetic dissection of early-season cold tolerance in sorghum (*Sorghum bicolor* (L.) Moench). *Mol Breed* 28:391–402
- Calzadilla PI, Maiale SJ, Ruiz OA, Escaray FJ (2016) Transcriptome response mediated by cold stress in *Lotus japonicas*. *Front Plant Sci* 7:374
- Campoli C, Matus-Cádiz MA, Pozniak CJ, Cattivelli L, Fowler DB (2009) Comparative expression of *Cbf* genes in the *Triticaceae* under different acclimation induction temperatures. *Mol Genet Genom* 282:141–152
- Cao X, Wu Z, Jiang F, Zhou R, Yang Z (2014) Identification of chilling stress-responsive tomato microRNAs and their target genes by high-throughput sequencing and degradome analysis. *BMC Genom* 15:1130
- Carvalho MA, Pino MT, Jeknic Z, Zou C, Doherty CJ, Shiu SH, Chen TH, Thomashow MF (2011) A comparison of the low temperature transcriptomes and CBF regulons of three plant species that differ in freezing tolerance: *Solanum commersonii*, *Solanum tuberosum*, and *Arabidopsis thaliana*. *J Exp Bot* 62:3807–3819
- Casao MC, Igartua E, Karsai I, Bhat PR, Cuadrado N, Gracia MP, Lasa JM, Casas AM (2011) Introgression of an intermediate *VRNH1* allele in barley (*Hordeum vulgare* L.) leads to reduced vernalization requirement without affecting freezing tolerance. *Mol Breed* 28:475–484
- Case AJ, Skinner DZ, Garland-Campbell KA, Carter AH (2013) Freezing tolerance-associated quantitative trait loci in the Brundage × Coda wheat recombinant inbred line population. *Crop Sci* 54:982–992
- Cattivelli L, Baldi P, Crosatti C, Di Fonzo N, Faccioli P, Grossi M, Mastrangelo AM, Pecchioni N, Stanca AM (2002) Chromosome regions and stress-related sequences involved in resistance to abiotic stress in *Triticaceae*. *Plant Mol Biol* 48:649–665
- Chan Z, Wang Y, Cao M, Gong Y, Mu Z, Wang H, Hu Y, Deng X, He XJ, Zhu JK (2016) RDM4 modulates cold stress resistance in Arabidopsis partially through the CBF-mediated pathway. *New Phytol* 209:1527–1539
- Chawade A, Lindlof A, Olsson B, Olsson O (2013) Global expression profiling of Low Temperature Induced Genes in the Chilling Tolerant Japonica Rice Jumli Marshi. *PLoS One* 8:e81729
- Chen A, Reinheimer J, Brülé-Babel A, Baumann U, Pallotta M, Fincher GB, Collins NC (2009) Genes and traits associated with chromosome 2H and 5H regions controlling sensitivity of reproductive tissues to frost in barley. *Theor Appl Genet* 118:1465–1476
- Chen L, Zhang Y, Ren Y, Xu J, Zhang Z, Wang Y (2012) Genome-wide identification of cold-responsive and new microRNAs in *Populus tomentosa* by high-throughput sequencing. *Biochem Biophys Res Commun* 417:892–896
- Chen J, Han G, Shang C, Li J, Zhang H, Liu F, Wang J, Liu H, Zhang Y (2015a) Proteomic analyses reveal differences in cold acclimation mechanisms in freezing-tolerant and freezing-sensitive cultivars of alfalfa. *Front Plant Sci* 6:105

- Chen H, Chen X, Chen D, Li J, Zhang Y, Wang A (2015b) A comparison of the low temperature transcriptomes of two tomato genotypes that differ in freezing tolerance: *Solanum lycopersicum* and *Solanum habrochaites*. *BMC Plant Biol* 15:132
- Cheng KS (1993) Rice genetic resources in Yunnan. *Wu Zhengyi Symposium on Biodiversity in Yunnan*. Yunnan Presshouse of Science and Technology, Kunming, pp 90–94
- Chinnusamy V, Ohta M, Kanrar S, Lee B-h, Hong X, Agarwal M, Zhu JK (2003) ICE1, a regulator of cold induced transcriptome and freezing tolerance in *Arabidopsis*. *Genes Dev* 17:1043–1054
- Chinnusamy V, Zhu J, Zhu JK (2007) Cold stress regulation of gene expression plants. *Trends Plant Sci* 12:444–451
- Chinnusamy V, Zhu JK, Sunkar R (2010) Gene regulation during cold stress acclimation in plants. *Methods Mol Biol* 639:39–55
- Cho HY, Hwang SG, Kim DS, Jang CS (2012) Genome-wide transcriptome analysis of rice genes responsive to chilling stress. *Can J Plant Sci* 92:447–460
- Choi DW, Rodriguez EM, Close TJ (2002) Barley Cbf3 gene identification, expression pattern, and map location. *Plant Physiol* 129:1781–1787
- Clarke HJ, Siddique KHM (2004) Response of chickpea genotypes to low temperature stress during reproductive development. *Field Crops Res* 90:323–334
- Collard BCY, Mackill DJ (2008) Marker-assisted selection: an approach for precision plant breeding in the twenty-first century. *Philos Trans R Soc Lond B Biol Sci* 363:557–572
- Crimp SJ, Zheng B, Khimashia N, Gobbett DL, Chapman S, Howden M, Nicholls Neville (2016) Recent changes in southern Australian frost occurrence: implications for wheat production risk. *Crop Pasture Sci* 67:801–811
- Croser JS, Clarke HJ, Siddique KHM, Khan TN (2003) Low-temperature stress: implications for chickpea (*Cicer arietinum* L.) improvement. *Crit Rev Plant Sci* 22:185–219
- Cui S, Huang F, Wang J, Ma X, Cheng Y, Liu J (2005) A proteomic analysis of cold stress responses in rice seedlings. *Proteomics* 5:3162–3172
- Cui D, Xu C, Tang C, Yang C, Yu T, Xin-xiang A, Cao G, Xu F, Zhang J, Hang L (2013) Genetic structure and association mapping of cold tolerance in improved *japonica* rice germplasm at booting stage. *Euphytica* 193:369–382
- da Cruz RP, Milach SCK (2004) Cold tolerance at the germination stage of rice: methods of evaluation and characterization of genotypes. *Sci Agric* 61:1–8
- da Cruz RP, Sperotto RA, Di Cargnelutt, Adamski JM, de FreitasTerra T, Fett JP (2013) Avoiding damage and achieving cold tolerance in rice plants. *Food Energy Secur* 2:96–119
- Dai LY, Lin XH, Ye CR, Kato A, Saito K, Yu TQ, Xu FR, Zhang DP (2003) Studies on cold tolerance of rice, *Oryza sativa* L. III. Molecular basis for special fertility percentage as evaluation criterion of cold tolerance. *Acta Agron Sin* 29:708–714
- Dai L, Lin X, Ye C, Ise K, Saito K, Kato A, Xu F, Yu T, Zhang D (2004) Identification of quantitative trait loci controlling cold tolerance at the reproductive stage in Yunnan landrace of rice, Kunmingxiaobaigu. *Breed Sci* 54:253–258
- Dametto A, Sperotto RA, Adamski JM, Blasi ÉA, Cargnelutti D, de Oliveira LF, Ricachenevsky FK, Fregonezi JN, Mariath JE, da Cruz RP, Margis R, Fett JP (2015) Cold tolerance in rice germinating seeds revealed by deep RNAseq analysis of contrasting indica genotypes. *Plant Sci* 238:1–12
- De Storme N, Geelen D (2014) The impact of environmental stress on 569 male reproductive development in plants: biological processes 570 and molecular mechanisms. *Plant Cell Environ* 37:1–18
- Deng HB, Che FL, Xiao YH, Tang WB, Pan Y, Liu ZX, Chen LY (2011) Effects of low temperature stress during flowering period on pollen characters and flag leaf physiological and biochemical characteristics of rice. *Ying Yong Sheng Tai Xue Bao* 22:66–72
- Dhillon T, Stockinger EJ (2013) Cbf14 copy number variation in the A, B, and D genomes of diploid and polyploid wheat. *Theor Appl Genet* 126:2777–2789
- Dhillon T, Pearce SP, Stockinger EJ, Distelfeld A, Li C, Knox AK, Vashegyi I, Vágújfalvi A, Galiba G, Dubcovsky J (2010) Regulation of freezing tolerance and flowering in temperate cereals: the *VRN-1* connection. *Plant Physiol* 153:1846–1858
- Ding Y, Li H, Zhang X, Xie Q, Gong Z, Yang S (2015) OST1 kinase modulates freezing tolerance by enhancing ICE1 stability in *Arabidopsis*. *Dev Cell* 32:278–289
- Doherty CJ, Van Buskirk HA, Myers SJ, Thomashow MF (2009) Roles for *Arabidopsis* CAMTA transcription factors in cold-regulated gene expression and freezing tolerance. *Plant Cell* 21:972–984
- Dong CH, Hu X, Tang W, Zheng X, Kim YS, Lee BH, Zhu JK (2006) A putative *Arabidopsis* nucleoporin AtNUP160 is critical for RNA export and required for plant tolerance to cold stress. *Mol Cell Biol* 26:9533–9543
- Dong MA, Farre EM, Thomashow MF (2011) Circadian clock associated 1 and late elongated hypocotyl regulate expression of the C-repeat binding factor (CBF) pathway in *Arabidopsis*. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 108:7241–7246
- Drozdzov SN, Titov AF, Balagurova NI, Kritenko SP (1984) The effect of temperature on cold and heat resistance of growing plants. II. Cold resistant species. *J Exp Bot* 35:1603–1608
- Du F, Xu JN, Li D, Wang XY (2015) The identification of novel and differentially expressed apple-tree genes under low-temperature stress using high-throughput Illumina sequencing. *Mol Biol Rep* 42:569–580
- Dumont E, Fontaine V, Vuylsteker C, Sellier H, Bodèle S, Voedts N, Devaux R, Frise M, Avia K, Hilbert JL, Bahrman N, Hanocq E, Lejeune-Hénaut I, Delbreil B (2009) Association of sugar content QTL and PQL with physiological traits relevant to frost damage resistance in pea under field and controlled conditions. *Theor Appl Genet* 118:1561–1571
- Dumont E, Bahrman N, Goulas E, Valot B, Sellier H, Hilbert JL, Vuylsteker C, Lejeune-Hénaut I, Delbreil B (2011) A proteomic approach to decipher chilling response from cold acclimation in pea (*Pisum sativum* L.). *Plant Sci* 180:86–98
- Eagles HA, Wilson J, Cane K, Vallance N, Eastwood RF, Kuchel H, Martin PJ, Trevaskis B (2016) Frost-tolerance genes Fr-A2 and Fr-B2 in Australian wheat and their effects on days to heading and grain yield in lower rainfall environments in southern Australia. *Crop Pasture Sci* 67:119–127
- Eizenga GC, Shakiba E, Jodari F, Duke S, Korniviel P, Jackson A, Mezey J, McCouch S (2015) The secrets of cold tolerance at seedling stage and heading in rice as revealed by association mapping. *PAG*, 2015, San Diego, CA
- Ellis RH, Summerfield RJ, Edmeades GO, Roberts EH (1992) Photoperiod, temperature and the interval from sowing to tassel initiation in diverse cultivars of maize. *Crop Sci* 32:1225–1232
- Endo T, Chiba B, Wagatsuma K, Saeki K, Ando T, Shomura A, Mizubayashi T, Ueda T, Yamamoto T, Nishio T (2016) Detection of QTLs for cold tolerance of rice cultivar ‘Kuchum’ and effect of QTL pyramiding. *Theor Appl Genet* 129:631–640
- Falk DE, Reinbergs E, Meatherall G (1997) OAC Elmira winter barley. *Can J Plant Sci* 77:639–640
- Farrell TC, Fox KM, Williams RL, Fukai S, Lewin LG (2006) Minimising cold damage during reproductive development among temperate rice genotypes. II. Genotypic variation and flowering traits related to cold tolerance screening. *Aust J Agric Res* 57:89–100
- Farrell TC, Williams RL, Fukai S (2001) The cost of low temperature to the NSW rice industry. *Proc 10th Aust Agron Conf* 1:1300–1430
- Fiedler K, Bekele WA, Matschegewski C, Snowdon R, Wieckhorst S, Zacharias A, Uptmoor R (2016) Cold tolerance during juvenile

- development in sorghum: a comparative analysis by genome wide association and linkage mapping. *Plant Breed*. doi:10.1111/pbr.12394
- Fiedler K, Bekele WA, Friedt W, Snowdon R, Stützel H, Zacharias A, Uptmoor R (2012) Genetic dissection of the temperature dependent emergence processes in sorghum using a cumulative emergence model and stability parameters. *Theor Appl Genet* 125(8):1647–1661
- Fisk SP, Cuesta-Marcos A, Cistue L, Russell J, Smith KP, Baenziger S, Bedo Z, Corey A, Filichkin T (2013) FR-H3: a new QTL to assist in the development of fall-sown barley with superior low temperature tolerance. *Theor Appl Genet* 126:335–347
- Foolad MR, Chen FQ, Lin GY (1998) RFLP mapping of QTLs conferring cold tolerance during seed germination in an interspecific cross of tomato. *Mol Breed* 4:519–529
- Fowler S, Thomashow MF (2002) Arabidopsis transcriptome profiling indicates that multiple regulatory pathways are activated during cold-acclimation in addition to the CBF cold response pathway. *Plant Cell* 14:1675–1690
- Fowler SG, Cook D, Thomashow MF (2005) Low temperature induction of Arabidopsis CBF1, 2, and 3 is gated by the circadian clock. *Plant Physiol* 137:961–968
- Fracheboud Y, Ribaut JM, Vargas M, Messmer R, Stamp P (2002) Identification of quantitative trait loci for cold-tolerance of photosynthesis in maize (*Zea mays* L.). *J Exp Bot* 53:1967–1977
- Fracheboud Y, Jompuk C, Ribaut J-M, Stamp P, Leipner J (2004) Genetic analysis of cold-tolerance of photosynthesis in maize. *Plant Mol Biol* 56:241–253
- Francia E, Rizza F, Cattivelli L, Stanca AM, Galiba G, Toth B, Hayes PM, Skinner JS, Pecchioni N (2004) Two loci on chromosome 5H determine low-temperature tolerance in a ‘Nure’ (winter)–‘Tremoisi’ (spring) barley map. *Theor Appl Genet* 108:670–680
- Francia E, Barabaschi D, Tondelli A, Laidò G, Rizza F, Stanca AM, Busconi M, Fogher C, Stockinger EJ, Pecchioni N (2007) Fine mapping of a HvCBF gene cluster at the frost resistance locus Fr-H2 in barley. *Theor Appl Genet* 115:1083–1091
- Francia E, Morcia C, Pasquariello M, Mazzamurro V, Milc JA, Rizza F, Terzi V, Pecchioni N (2016) Copy number variation at the *HvCBF4–HvCBF2* genomic segment is a major component of frost resistance in barley. *Plant Mol Biol* 92:161–175
- Franklin KA, Whitelam GC (2007) Light-quality regulation of freezing tolerance in *Arabidopsis thaliana*. *Nat Genet* 39:1410–1413
- Frederiks TM, Christopher JT, Fletcher SHE, Borrell AK (2011) Post head-emergence frost resistance of barley genotypes in the northern grain region of Australia. *Crop Pasture Sci* 62:736–745
- Fujino K, Iwata N (2011) Selection for low-temperature germinability on the short arm of chromosome 3 in rice cultivars adapted to Hokkaido, Japan. *Theor Appl Genet* 123:1089–1097
- Fujino K, Matsuda Y (2010) Genome-wide analysis of genes targeted by qLTG3-1 controlling low-temperature germinability in rice. *Plant Mol Biol* 72:137–152
- Fujino K, Sekiguchi H (2011) Origins of functional nucleotide polymorphisms in a major quantitative trait locus, qLTG3-1, controlling low-temperature germinability in rice. *Plant Mol Biol* 75:1–10
- Fujino K, Sekiguchi H, Sato T, Kiuchi H, Nonoue Y, Takeuchi Y, Ando T, Lin SY, Yano M (2004) Mapping of quantitative trait loci controlling low-temperature germinability in rice (*Oryza sativa* L.). *Theor Appl Genet* 108:794–799
- Fujino K, Sekigushi H, Matsuda Y, Sugimoto K, Ono K, Yano M (2008) Molecular identification of a major quantitative trait locus, qLTG3-1, controlling low-temperature germinability in rice. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 105:12623–12628
- Fuller MP, Fuller AM, Kaniouras S, Christophers J, Fredericks T (2007) The freezing characteristics of wheat at ear emergence. *Eur J Agron* 26:435–441
- Funatsuki H, Kawaguchi K, Matsuba S, Sato Y, Ishimoto M (2005) Mapping of QTL associated with chilling tolerance during reproductive growth in soybean. *Theor Appl Genet* 111:851–861
- Galiba G, Quarrie SA, Sutka J, Morgounov A, Snape JW (1995) RFLP mapping of the vernalization (*Vrn1*) and frost resistance (*Fr1*) genes on chromosome 5A of wheat. *Theor Appl Genet* 90:1174–1179
- Galiba G, Vágújfalvi A, Li C, Soltész A, Dubcovsky J (2009) Regulatory genes involved in the determination of frost tolerance in temperate cereals. *Plant Sci* 176:12–19
- Gault CM, Budka JS, Lepak NK, Cotich D, Rodger-Melnick E, Buckler ES (2016) Cellular processes and regulatory networks searching for the genetic basis of cold tolerance in Maize’s Sister Genus *Tripsacum*. PAG, San Diego
- Gill SS, Tuteja N (2010) Reactive oxygen species and antioxidant machinery in abiotic stress tolerance in crop plants. *Plant Physiol Biochem* 48:909–930
- Gilmour SJ, Artus NN, Thomashow MF (1992) cDNA sequence analysis and expression of two cold-regulated genes of *Arabidopsis thaliana*. *Plant Mol Biol* 18:13–21
- Gilmour SJ, Sebolt AM, Salazar MP, Everard JD, Thomashow MF (2000) Over expression of the Arabidopsis *CBF3* transcriptional activator mimics multiple biochemical changes associated with cold acclimation. *Plant Physiol* 124:1854–1865
- Gilmour SJ, Fowler SG, Thomashow MF (2004) *Arabidopsis* transcriptional activators CBF1, CBF2, and CBF3 have matching functional activities. *Plant Mol Biol* 54:767–781
- Glaszmann JC, Kaw RN, Khush GS (1990) Genetic divergence among cold tolerant rices (*Oryza sativa* L.). *Euphytica* 45:95–104
- Godfray HC, Beddington JR, Crute IR, Haddad L, Lawrence D, Muir JF, Pretty J, Robinson S, Thomas SM, Toulmin C (2010) Food security: the challenge of feeding 9 billion people. *Science* 327:812–818
- Gomez LD, Vanacker H, Buchner P, Noctor G, Foyer CH (2004) Intercellular distribution of glutathione synthesis in maize leaves and its response to short-term chilling. *Plant Physiol* 134:1662–1671
- Goodstal FJ, Kohler GR, Randall LB, Bloom AJ, Clair DAS (2005) A major QTL introgressed from wild *Lycopersicon hirsutum* confers chilling tolerance to cultivated tomato (*Lycopersicon esculentum*). *Theor Appl Genet* 111:898–905
- Greenup AG, Sasani S, Oliver SN, Walford SA, Millar AA, Trevaskis B (2011) Transcriptome analysis of the vernalization response in Barley (*Hordeum vulgare*) seedlings. *PLoS One* 6:e17900
- Grimaud F, Renaut J, Dumont E, Sergeant K, Lucau-Danila A, Blervacq AS, Sellier H, Bahrman N, Lejeune-Hénaut I, Delbreil B, Goulas E (2013) Exploring chloroplastic changes related to chilling and freezing tolerance during cold acclimation of pea (*Pisum sativum* L.). *J Proteom* 80:145–159
- Guan Q, Wu J, Zhang Y, Jiang C, Chai C, Zhu J (2013a) A DEAD box RNA helicase is critical for pre-mRNA splicing, cold-responsive gene regulation, and cold tolerance in *Arabidopsis*. *Plant Cell* 25:342–356
- Guan YN, Huang ZL, Zhang WJ, Shi XD, Zhang PP (2013b) Effects of low temperature stress on photosynthetic performance of different genotypes wheat cultivars. *Ying Yong Sheng Tai Xue Bao* 24:1895–1899
- Gulik PJ, Drouin S, Yu Z, Danyluk J, Poisson G, Monroy AF, Sarhan F (2005) Transcriptome comparison of winter and spring wheat responding to low temperature. *Genome* 48:913–923

- Guy CL, Li QB (1998) The organization and evolution of the spinach stress 70 molecular chaperone gene family. *Plant Cell* 10:539–556
- Han LZ, Zhang YY, Qiao YL, Cao GL, Zhang SY, Kim JH, Koh HJ (2006) Genetic and QTL analysis for low-temperature vigor of germination in rice. *Yi Chuan Xue Bao* 33:998–1006
- Han L, Qiao Y, Zhang S, Zhang Y, Cao G, Kim J, Lee K, Koh H (2007) Identification of quantitative trait loci for cold response of seedling vigor traits in rice. *J Genet Genome* 34:239–246
- Hanin M, Brini F, Ebel C, Toda Y, Takeda S, Masmoudi K (2011) Plant dehydrins and stress tolerance Versatile proteins for complex mechanisms. *Plant Signal Behav* 6:1503–1509
- Hashimoto M, Komatsu S (2007) Proteomic analysis of rice seedlings during cold stress. *Proteomics* 7:1293–1302
- Herman EM, Rotter K, Premakumar R, Elwinger G, Bae H, Ehler-King L, Chen S, Livingston DP 3rd (2006) Additional freeze hardiness in wheat acquired by exposure to 23 8C is associated with extensive physiological, morphological, and molecular changes. *J Exp Bot* 57:3601–3618
- Hou MY, Wang CM, Jiang L, Wan JM, Yasui H, Yoshimura A (2004) Inheritance and QTL mapping of low temperature germinability in rice (*Oryza sativa* L.). *Yi Chuan Xue Bao* 31:701–706
- Houde M, Dhindsa RS, Sarhan F (1992) A molecular marker to select for freezing tolerance in Gramineae. *Mol Gen Genet* 234:43–48
- Hsieh TH, Lee JT, Charng YY, Chan MT (2002a) Tomato plants ectopically expressing *Arabidopsis* CBF1 show enhanced resistance to water deficit stress. *Plant Physiol* 130:618–626
- Hsieh TH, Lee JT, Yang PT, Chiu LH, Charng YY, Wang YC, Chan MT (2002b) Heterology expression of the *Arabidopsis* C-repeat/dehydration response element binding factor 1 gene confers elevated tolerance to chilling and oxidative stresses in transgenic tomato. *Plant Physiol* 129:1086–1094
- Hu Y, Zhang L, Zhao L, Li J, He S, Zhou K, Yang F, Huang M, Jiang L, Li L (2011) Trichostatin A selectively suppresses the cold-induced transcription of the *ZmDREB1* gene in maize. *PLoS One* 6:e22132
- Hu Y, Zhang L, He S, Huang M, Tan J, Zhao L, Yan S, Li H, Zhou K, Liang Y, Li L (2012) Cold stress selectively unsilences tandem repeats in heterochromatin associated with accumulation of H3K9ac. *Plant Cell Environ* 35:2130–2142
- Hu S, Lübberstedt T, Zhao G, Lee M (2016) QTL mapping of low-temperature germination ability in the maize IBM Syn4 RIL population. *PLoS One* 11:e0152795
- Huang X, Han B (2014) Natural variations and genome-wide association studies in crop plants. *Annu Rev Plant Biol* 65:531–551
- Huang J, Zhang J, Li W, Hu W, Duan L, Feng Y, Qiu F, Yue B (2013) Genome-wide association analysis of ten chilling tolerance indices at the germination and seedling stages in maize. *J Integr Plant Biol* 55:735–744
- Huang CK, Shen YL, Huang LF, Wu SJ, Yeh CH, Lu CA (2015) The DEAD-Box RNA helicase AtRH7/PRH75 participates in pre-rRNA processing, plant development and cold tolerance in *Arabidopsis*. *Plant Cell Physiol* 57:174–191
- Hughes MA, Dunn MA (1996) The molecular biology of plant acclimation to low temperature. *J Exp Bot* 47:291–305
- Hund A, Fracheboud Y, Soldati A, Frascaroli E, Salvi S, Stamp P (2004) QTL controlling root and shoot traits of maize seedlings under cold stress. *Theor Appl Genet* 109:618–629
- Hur YJ, Cho JH, Park HS, Noh TH, Park DS, Lee JY, Sohn YB, Shin D, Song YC, Kwon YU, Lee JH (2016) Pyramiding of two rice bacterial blight resistance genes, *Xa3* and *Xa4*, and a closely linked cold-tolerance QTL on chromosome 11. *Theor Appl Genet* 129:1861–1871
- Ikeda T, Ohnishi S, Senda M, Miyoshi T, Ishimoto M, Kitamura K, Funatsuki H (2009) A novel major quantitative trait locus controlling seed development at low temperature in soybean (*Glycine max*). *Theor Appl Genet* 118:1477–1488
- IRRI (1979) Report of a rice cold tolerance workshop. In: IRRI Proceedings of rice cold tolerance workshop, Office of Rural Development, Suweon, Korea, p 139
- Ito Y, Katsura K, Maruyama K, Taji T, Kobayashi M, Seki M, Shinozaki K, Yamaguchi-Shinozaki K (2006) Functional analysis of rice DREB1/CBF-type transcription factors involved in cold-responsive gene expression in transgenic rice. *Plant Cell Physiol* 47:141–153
- Iwata N, Fujino K (2010) Genetic effects of major QTLs controlling low-temperature germinability in different genetic backgrounds in rice (*Oryza sativa* L.). *Genome* 53:763–768
- Iwata N, Shinada H, Kiuchi H, Sato T, Fujino K (2010) Mapping QTLs controlling seedling establishment using a direct seeding method in rice. *Breed Sci* 60:353–360
- Jaglo-Ottosen KR, Gilmour SJ, Zarka DG, Schabenberger O, Thomashow MF (1998) *Arabidopsis* CBF1 overexpression induces COR genes and enhances freezing tolerance. *Science* 280:104–106
- Jaglo-Ottosen KR, Kleff S, Amundsen KL, Zhang X, Haake V, Zhang JZ, Deits T, Thomashow MF (2001) Components of the *Arabidopsis* C-repeat/dehydration-responsive element binding factor cold-response pathway are conserved in *Brassica napus* and other plant species. *Plant Physiol* 127:910–917
- Janmohammadi M, Zolla L, Rinalducci S (2015) Low temperature tolerance in plants: changes at the protein level. *Phytochemistry* 117:76–89
- Jeong EG, Yea JD, Baek MK, Moon HP, Choi HC, Yoon KM, Ahn SN (2000) Estimation of critical temperature for traits related to cold tolerance in rice. *Korean J Breed* 32:363–368
- Ji SL, Jiang L, Wang YH, Zhang WW, Liu X, Liu SJ, Chen LM, Zhai HQ, Wan JM (2009) Quantitative trait loci mapping and stability for low temperature germination ability of rice. *Plant Breed* 128:387–392
- Ji Z, Zeng Y, Zeng D, Ma L, Li X, Liu B, Yang C (2010) Identification of QTLs for rice cold tolerance at plumule and 3-leaf-seedling stages by using QTLNetwork software. *Rice Sci* 17 (4)
- Ji H, Wang Y, Cloix C, Li K, Jenkins GI, Wang S, Shang Z, Shi Y, Yang S, Li X (2015) The *Arabidopsis* RCC1 family protein TCF1 regulates freezing tolerance and cold acclimation through modulating lignin biosynthesis. *PLoS Genet* 11:e1005471
- Jia Y, Ding Y, Shi Y, Zhang X, Gong Z, Yang S (2016) The cbfs triple mutants reveal the essential functions of CBFs in cold acclimation and allow the definition of CBF regulons in *Arabidopsis*. *New Phytol* 212:345–353
- Jiang W, Jin YM, Lee J, Lee KL, Piao R, Han L, Shin JC, Jin RD, Cao T, Pan HY, Du X, Ko HJ (2011) Quantitative trait loci for cold tolerance of rice recombinant inbred lines in low temperature environments. *Mol Cell* 32:579–587
- Jompuk C, Fracheboud Y, Stamp P, Leipner J (2005) Mapping of quantitative trait loci associated with chilling tolerance in maize (*Zea mays* L.) seedlings grown under field conditions. *J Exp Bot* 56:1153–1163
- Kabaki N, Yoneyama T, Tajima K (1982) Physiological mechanism of growth retardation in rice seedlings as affected by low temperature. *Jpn J Crop Sci* 51:82–88
- Kahraman A, Kusmenoglu I, Aydin N, Aydogan A, Erskine W, Muehlbauer FJ (2004) QTL mapping of winter hardiness genes in lentil. *Crop Sci* 44:13–22
- Kaneda C, Beachell HM (1974) Response of *indica-japonica* rice hybrids to low temperatures. *SABRAO J* 6:17–32
- Kang G, Li G, Yang W, Han Q, Ma H, Wang Y, Ren J, Zhu Y, Guo T (2013) Transcriptional profile of the spring freeze response in the leaves of bread wheat (*Triticum aestivum* L.). *Acta Physiol Plant* 35:575–587

- Khraiwesh B, Zhu JK, Zhu J (2012) Role of miRNAs and siRNAs in biotic and abiotic stress responses of plants. *Biochim Biophys Acta* 1819:137–148
- Kim Y et al (2013) Roles of CAMTA transcription factors and salicylic acid in configuring the low-temperature transcriptome and freezing tolerance of *Arabidopsis*. *Plant J* 75:364–376
- Kim SM, Suh JP, Lee CK, Lee JH, Kim YG, Jena KK (2014) QTL mapping and development of candidate gene-derived DNA markers associated with seedling cold tolerance in rice (*Oryza sativa* L.). *Mol Genet Genom* 289:333–343
- Kim YS, Lee M, Lee JH, Lee HJ, Park CM (2015) The unified ICE-CBF pathway provides a transcriptional feedback control of freezing tolerance during cold acclimation in *Arabidopsis*. *Plant Mol Biol* 89:187–201
- Kisha TJ, Taylor GA, Bowman HF, Wiesner LE, Jackson GD, Carlson GR, Bergman JW, Kushnak JD, Stallknecht GF, Stewart VR (1992) Registration of Tiber hard red winter wheat. *Crop Sci* 32:1292–1293
- Kizis D, Lumberas V, Pages M (2001) Role of AP2/EREBP transcription factors in gene regulation during abiotic stress. *FEBS Lett* 498:187–189
- Klein A, Houtin H, Rond C, Marget P, Jacquin f, Boucherot K, Huart m, Riviere n, Boutet G, Lejeune-Henaut I (2014) QTL analysis of frost damage in pea suggests different mechanisms involved in frost tolerance. *Theor Appl Genet*:1319–1330
- Kole C, Thormann CE, Karlsson BH, Palta JP, Gaffney P, Yandell B, Osborn TC (2002) Comparative mapping of loci controlling winter survival and related traits in oilseed Brassica rapa and B. napus. *Mol Breeding* 9:201–210
- Knight H (2000) Calcium signaling during abiotic stress in plants. *Int Rev Cytol* 195:269–325
- Knight MR, Knight H (2012) Low-temperature perception leading to gene expression and cold tolerance in higher plants. *New Phytol* 195:737–751
- Knight H, Trewavas AJ, Knight MR (1996) Cold calcium signaling in *Arabidopsis* involves two cellular pools and a change in calcium signature after acclimation. *Plant Cell* 8:489–503
- Knoll J, Gunaratna N, Ejeta G (2008) QTL analysis of early season cold tolerance in Sorghum. *Theor Appl Genet* 116:577–587
- Knox AK, Li C, Vágújfalvi A, Galiba G, Stockinger EJ, Dubcovsky J (2008) Identification of candidate CBF genes for the frost tolerance locus Fr-Am 2 in *Triticum monococcum*. *Plant Mol Biol* 67:257–270
- Knox AK, Dhillon T, Cheng H, Tondelli A, Pecchioni N, Stockinger EJ (2010) CBF gene copy number variation at Frost Resistance-2 is associated with levels of freezing tolerance in temperate-climate cereals. *Theor Appl Genet* 121:21–35
- Kobayashi F, Takumi S, Kume S, Ishibashi M, Ohno R, Murai K, Nakamura C (2005) Regulation by Vrn-1/Fr-1 chromosomal intervals of CBF-mediated Cor/Lea gene expression and freezing tolerance in common wheat. *J Exp Bot* 56:887–895
- Kobayashi F, Maeta E, Terashima A, Kawaura K, Ogihara Y, Takumi S (2008) Development of abiotic stress tolerance via bZIP-type transcription factor LIP19 in common wheat. *J Exp Bot* 59:891–905
- Koc I, Filiz E, Tombuloglu H (2015) Assessment of miRNA expression profile and differential expression pattern of target genes in cold-tolerant and cold-sensitive tomato cultivars. *Biotech Biotechnol Equip* 29:851–860
- Kolar SC, Hayes PM, Chen THH, Lindernan RG (1991) Genotypic variation for cold tolerance in winter and facultative barley. *Crop Sci* 31:1149–1152
- Korte A, Farlow A (2013) The advantages and limitations of trait analysis with GWAS: a review. *Plant Methods* 9:29
- Koseki M, Kitazawa N, Yonebayashi S, Maehara Y, Wang ZX, Minobe Y (2010) Identification and fine mapping of a major quantitative trait locus originating from wild rice, controlling cold tolerance at the seedling stage. *Mol Genet Genom* 284:45–54
- Kosová K, Tom Prášil I, Prášilová P, Vítámvás P, Chrpová J (2010) The development of frost tolerance and DHN5 protein accumulation in barley (*Hordeum vulgare*) doubled haploid lines derived from Atlas 68 × Igri cross during cold acclimation. *J Plant Physiol* 167:343–350
- Kosová K, Vítámvás P, Prášil IT (2011) Expression of dehydrins in wheat and barley under different temperatures. *Plant Sci* 180:46–52
- Kosová K, Vítámvás P, Planchon S, Renaut J, Vanková R, Prášil IT (2013) Proteome analysis of cold response in spring and winter wheat (*Triticum aestivum*) crowns reveals similarities in stress adaptation and differences in regulatory processes between the growth habits. *J Proteome Res* 12:4830–4845
- Kumar S, Malik J, Thakur P, Kaistha S, Sharma KD, Upadhyaya HD, Berger JD, Nayyar H (2011) Growth and metabolic responses of contrasting chickpea (*Cicer arietinum* L.) genotypes to chilling stress at reproductive phase. *Acta Physiol Plant* 33:779–787
- Kurkela S, Franck M (1990) Cloning and characterization of a cold- and ABA-inducible *Arabidopsis* gene. *Plant Mol Biol* 15:137–144
- Kuroki M, Saito K, Matsuba S, Yokogami N, Shimizu H, Ando I, Sato Y (2007) A quantitative trait locus for cold tolerance at the booting stage on rice chromosome 8. *Theor Appl Genet* 115:593–600
- Kwon CS, Lee D, Choi G, Chung WI (2009) Histone occupancy-dependent and-independent removal of H3K27 trimethylation at cold-responsive genes in *Arabidopsis*. *Plant J* 60:112–121
- Lang Z, Zhu J (2015) OST1 phosphorylates ICE1 to enhance plant cold tolerance. *Sci China Life Sci* 58:317–318
- Laudencia-Chingcuano D, Fowler DB (2015) Deep sequencing of cold acclimated wheat crown transcriptome. PAG San Diego, CA 10–14 January
- Lee MH (2001) Low temperature tolerance in rice: the Korean experience. Pp. 109–117 in S. Fukai and J. Basnayake, eds. Increased lowland rice production in the Mekong Region. In: Proceedings of an international workshop, Vientiane, Laos, 30 October to 2 November 2000. Australian Center for International Agricultural Research, Canberra, Australia
- Lee CM, Thomashow MF (2012) Photoperiodic regulation of the C repeat binding factor (CBF) cold acclimation pathway and freezing tolerance in *Arabidopsis thaliana*. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 109:15054–15059
- Lee BH, Henderson DA, Zhu JK (2005) The *Arabidopsis* cold-responsive transcriptome and its regulation by ICE1. *Plant Cell* 17:3155–3175
- Lee BH, Kapoor A, Zhu J, Zhu JK (2006) STABILIZED1, a stress-upregulated nuclear protein, is required for pre-mRNA splicing, mRNA turnover, and stress tolerance in *Arabidopsis*. *Plant Cell* 18:1736–1749
- Lee J, Lee W, Kwon S-W (2015) A quantitative shotgun proteomics analysis of germinated rice embryos and coleoptiles under low-temperature conditions. *Proteome Sci* 13:27
- Legrand G, Marque G, Blassiau C, Bluteau A, Canoy AS, Fontaine V, Jaminon O, Bahrman N, Mautord J, Morin J, Petit A, Baranger A, Rivière N, Wilmer J, Delbreil B, Lejeune-Hénaut I (2013) Combining gene expression and genetic analyses to identify candidate genes involved in cold responses in pea. *J Plant Physiol* 170:1148–1157
- Lejeune-Henaut I, Hanocq E, Bethenourt L, Fontaine V, Delbreil B, Morin J, Petit A, Devaux R, Boilleau M, Stempniak JJ (2008) The flowering locus *Hr* colocalizes with a major QTL affecting winter frost tolerance in *Pisum sativum* L. *Theor Appl Genet* 116:1105–1116

- Li TG, Guo WM (1993) Identification and study on tolerance in main stresses of China cultivated rice germplasm resource. In: Ying CS (ed) Rice germplasm resources in China. China Agricultural Science and Technology Press, Beijing, pp 71–75
- Li L, Liu X, Xie K, Wang Y, Liu F, Lin Q, Wang W, Yang C, Lu B, Liu S, Chen L, Jiang L, Wan J (2013) qLTG-9, a stable quantitative trait locus for low-temperature germination in rice (*Oryza sativa* L.). *Theor Appl Genet* 126:2313–2322
- Limin AE, Fowler DB (2002) Developmental traits affecting low-temperature tolerance response in near-isogenic lines for the Vernalization locus *Vrn-A1* in wheat (*Triticum aestivum* L. em Thell). *Ann Bot* 89:579–585
- Lin C, Thomashow MF (1992) A cold-regulated Arabidopsis gene encodes a polypeptide having potent cryoprotective activity. *Biochem Biophys Res Commun* 183:1103–1108
- Lindl f A, Chawade A, Sikora P, Olsson O (2015) Comparative transcriptomics of Sijung and Jumli Marshi rice during early chilling stress imply multiple protective mechanisms. *PLoS One* 10:e0125385
- Lissarre M, Ohta M, Sato A, Miura K (2010) Cold-responsive gene regulation during cold acclimation in plants. *Plant Signal Behav* 5:948–952
- Liu Q, Kasuga M, Sakuma Y, Abe H, Miura S, Yamaguchi-Shinozaki K, Shinozaki K (1998) Two transcription factors, DREB1 and DREB2, with an EREBP/AP2 DNA binding domain, separate two cellular signal transduction pathways in drought- and low temperature-responsive gene expression, respectively, in Arabidopsis. *Plant Cell* 10:1391–1406
- Liu F, Sun C, Tan L, Fu Y, Li D, Wang X (2003) Identification and mapping of quantitative trait loci controlling cold-tolerance of Chinese common wild rice (*O. rufipogon* Griff.) at booting to flowering stages. *Chinese Sci Bull* 48:2068–2071
- Liu F, Xu W, Qa Song, Tan L, Liu J, Zhu Z, Fu Y, Su Z, Sun C (2013) Microarray-assisted fine-mapping of quantitative trait loci for cold tolerance in rice. *Mol Plant* 6:757–767
- Liu W, Maurer HP, Li G, Tucker MR, Gowda M et al (2014) Genetic architecture of winter hardiness and frost tolerance in triticale. *PLoS One* 9:e99848
- Liu W, Lu T, Li Y, Pan X, Duan Y, Min J, Fu X, Sheng X, Xiao J, Liu S, Tan J, Yao Y, Li X (2015a) Mapping of quantitative trait loci for cold tolerance at the early seedling stage in landrace rice Xiang 743. *Euphytica* 201:401–409
- Liu X, Hao L, Li D, Zhu L, Hu S (2015b) Long non-coding RNAs and their biological roles in plants. *Genom Proteom Bioinf* 13:137–147
- Liu L, Venkatesh J, Jo YD, Koeda S, Hosokawa M, Kang JH, Goritschnig S, Kang BC (2016) Fine mapping and identification of candidate genes for the *sy-2* locus in a temperature-sensitive chili pepper (*Capsicum chinense*). *Theor Appl Genet* 129:1541–1556
- Long-Zhai H, Yuan-Yuan Z, Yong-Li Q, Gui-Lan C, San-Yuan Z, Jong-Hwan K, Hee-Jong K (2006) Genetic and QTL analysis for low-temperature vigor of germination in rice. *Acta Genet Sinica* 33:998–1006
- Long-zhi H, Yong-li Q, Gui-lan C, Yuan-yuan Z, Yong-ping A, Jong-doo Y, Hee-jong K (2004) QTLs analysis of cold tolerance during early growth period for rice. *Rice Sci* 11:245–250
- Lou Q, Chen L, Sun Z, Xing Y, Li J, Xu X, Mei H, Luo L (2007) A major QTL associated with cold tolerance at seedling stage in rice (*Oryza sativa* L.). *Euphytica* 158:87–94
- Lucau-Danila A, Toitot C, Goulas E, Blervacq AS, Hot D, Bahrman N, Sellier H, Lejeune-Henaut Delbreil B (2012) Transcriptome analysis in pea allows to distinguish chilling and acclimation mechanisms. *Plant Physiol Biochem* 58:236–244
- Lv DK, Bai X, Li Y, Ding XD, Ge Y, Cai H, Ji W, Wu N, Zhu YM (2010) Profiling of cold-stress-responsive miRNAs in rice by microarrays. *Gene* 459:39–47
- Lv Y, Guo Z, Li X, Ye H, Li X, Xiong L (2016) New insights into the genetic basis of natural chilling and cold shock tolerance in rice by genome-wide association analysis. *Plant Cell Environ* 39:556–570
- Ma Y, Dai X, Xu Y, Luo W, Zheng X, Zeng D, Pan Y, Lin X, Liu H, Zhang D, Xiao J, Guo X, Xu S, Niu Y, Jin J, Zhang H, Xu X, Li L, Wang W, Qian Q, Ge S, Chong K (2015) *COLD1* confers chilling tolerance in rice. *Cell* 160:1209–1221
- Mackill DJ, Lei XM (1997) Genetic variation for traits related to temperate adaptation of rice cultivars. *Crop Sci* 37:1340–1346
- Mao D, Yu L, Chen D, Li L, Zhu Y, Xiao Y, Zhang D, Chen C (2015) Multiple cold resistance loci confer the high cold tolerance adaptation of Dongxiang wild rice (*Oryza rufipogon*) to its high-latitude habitat. *Theor Appl Genet* 128:1359–1371
- Mastrangelo AM, Belloni S, Barilli S, Ruperti B, Fonzo ND, Stanca AM, Cattivelli L (2005) Low temperature promotes intron retention in two *e-cor* genes of durum wheat. *Planta* 221:705–715
- Matsui A, Nguyen AH, Nakaminami K, Seki M (2013) *Arabidopsis* non-coding RNA regulation in abiotic stress responses. *Int J Mol Sci* 14:22642–22654
- Medina J, Bargues M, Terol J, Perez-Alonso Salinas J (1999) The Arabidopsis *CBF* gene family is composed of three genes encoding AP2 domain-containing proteins whose expression is regulated by low temperature but not by abscisic acid or dehydration. *Plant Physiol* 119:463–470
- Medina J, Catal  R, Salinas J (2011) The CBFs: three arabidopsis transcription factors to cold acclimate. *Plant Sci* 180:3–11
- Meissner M, Orsini E, Ruschhaupt M, Melchinger AE, Hincha DK, Heyer AG (2013) Mapping quantitative trait loci for freezing tolerance in a recombinant inbred line population of *Arabidopsis thaliana* accessions Tenela and C24 reveals REVEILLE1 as negative regulator of cold acclimation. *Plant Cell Environ* 36:1256–1267
- Meng PH, Macquet A, Loudet O, Marion-Poll A, North HM (2008) Analysis of natural allelic variation controlling Arabidopsis thaliana seed germinability in response to cold and dark: identification of three major quantitative trait loci. *Mol Plant* 1:145–154
- Mickelbart MV, Hasegawa PM, Bailey-Serres J (2015) Genetic mechanisms of abiotic stress tolerance that translate to crop yield stability. *Nat Rev Genet* 4:237–251
- Miedema P, Sinnaeve J (1980) Photosynthesis and respiration of maize seedlings at suboptimal temperatures. *J Exp Bot* 31:813–819
- Miller AK, Galiba G, Dubcovsky J (2006) A cluster of 11 CBF transcription factors is located at the frost tolerance locus Fr-Am 2 in *Triticum monococcum*. *Mol Genet Genom* 275:193–203
- Misawa S, Mori N, Takumi S, Yoshida S, Nakamura C (2000) Mapping of QTLs for low temperature response in seedlings of rice (*Oryza sativa* L.). *Cereal Res Commun* 28:33–40
- Mitchell-Olds T (2010) Complex-trait analysis in plants. *Genome Biol* 11:113
- Miura K, Furumoto T (2013) Cold signaling and cold response in plants. *Int J Mol Sci* 14:5312–5337
- Miura K, Lin SY, Yano M, Nagamine T (2001) Mapping quantitative trait loci controlling low-temperature germinability in rice (*Oryza sativa* L.). *Breed Sci* 51:293–299
- Miura K, Jin JB, Lee J, Yoo CY, Stirn V, Miura T, Ashworth EN, Bressan RA, Yun DJ, Hasegawa PM (2007) SIZ1-mediated sumoylation of ICE1 controls *CBF3/DREB1A* expression and freezing tolerance in *Arabidopsis*. *Plant Cell* 19:1403–1414

- Mizoi J, Shinozaki K, Yamaguchi-Shinozaki K (2012) AP2/ERF family transcription factors in plant abiotic stress responses. *Biochim Biophys Acta (BBA) Gene Regul Mech* 1819:86–96
- Mohammadi R, Amri A, Ahmadi H, Jafarzadeh (2015) Characterization of tetraploid wheat landraces for cold tolerance and agronomic traits under rainfed conditions of Iran. *J Agric Sci* 153:631–645
- Monroy AF, Dryanova A, Malette B, Oren DH, Ridha Farajalla M, Liu W, Danyluk J, Ubayasena LW, Kane K, Scoles GJ, Sarhan F, Gulick PJ (2007) Regulatory gene candidates and gene expression analysis of cold acclimation in winter and spring wheat. *Plant Mol Biol* 64:409–423
- Moraes de Freitas GP, Basu S, Ramegowda V, Braga EB, Pereira A (2016) Comparative analysis of gene expression in response to cold stress in diverse rice genotypes. *Biochem Biophys Res Commun* 471:253–259
- Mori M, Onishi K, Tokizono Y, Shinada H, Yoshimura T, Numao Y, Miura H, Sato T (2011) Detection of novel quantitative trait locus for cold tolerance at the booting stage derived from a tropical japonica rice variety Silewah. *Breed Sci* 61:61–68
- Motomura Y, Kobayashi F, Iehisa JCM, Takumi S (2013) A major quantitative trait locus for cold-responsive gene expression is linked to frost-resistance gene Fr-A2 in common wheat. *Breed Sci* 63:58–67
- Nah G, Lee M, Kim DS, Rayburn AL, Voigt T, Lee DK (2016) Transcriptome analysis of spartina pectinata in response to freezing stress. *PLoS One* 11:e0152294
- Nakagahra M, Okuno K, Vaughan D (1997) Rice genetic resources: history, conservation, investigative characterization and use in Japan. *Plant Mol Biol* 35:69–77
- Nakamichi N, Kusano M, Fukushima A, Kita M, Ito S, Yamashino T, Saito K, Sakakibara H, Mizuno T (2009) Transcript profiling of an Arabidopsis PSEUDO RESPONSE REGULATOR arrhythmic triple mutant reveals a role for the circadian clock in cold stress response. *Plant Cell Physiol* 50:447–462
- Nayyar H, Bains T, Kumar S (2005) Low temperature induced floral abortion in chickpea: relationship to abscisic acid and cryoprotectants in reproductive organs. *Environ Exp Bot* 53:39–47
- Neilson KA, Mariani M, Haynes PA (2011) Quantitative proteomic analysis of cold-responsive proteins in rice. *Proteomics* 11:1696–1706
- Nishiyama Ito IN, Hayase H, Satake T (1969) Protecting effect of temperature and depth of irrigation water from sterile injury caused by cooling treatment at the meiotic stage of rice plants (in Japanese quoted by Satake, T., 1916). *Proc Crop Sci Soc Jpn* 3g:554–555
- Niu J, Wang J, Hu H, Chen Y, An J, Cai J, Sun R, Sheng Z, Liu X, Lin S (2016) Crosstalk between freezing response and signaling for regulatory transcriptions of MIR475b and its targets by miR475b promoter in *Populus suaveolens*. *Sci Rep* 6:20648
- Novák A, Boldizsár Á, Ádám É, Kozma-Bognár L, Majláth I, Bába M, Tóth B, Chibbar R, Galiba G (2016) Light-quality and temperature-dependent *CBF14* gene expression modulates freezing tolerance in cereals. *J Exp Bot* 67:1285–1295
- Novillo F, Alonso JM, Ecker JR, Salinas J (2004) CBF2/DREB1C is a negative regulator of CBF1/DREB1B and CBF3/DREB1A expression and plays a central role in stress tolerance in Arabidopsis. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 101:3985–3990
- Novillo F, Medina J, Salinas J (2007) Arabidopsis CBF1 and CBF3 have a different function than CBF2 in cold acclimation and define different gene classes in the CBF regulon. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 104:21002–21007
- Ogura T, Busch W (2015) From phenotypes to causal sequences: using genome wide association studies to dissect the sequence basis for variation of plant development. *Curr Opin Plant Biol* 23:98–108
- Oh CS, Choi YH, Lee SJ, Yoon DB, Moon HP, Ahn SN (2004) Mapping of quantitative trait loci for cold tolerance in weedy rice. *Breed Sci* 54:373–380
- Orvar BL, Sangwan V, Omann F, Dhindsa R (2000) Early steps in cold sensing by plant cells: the role of actin cytoskeleton and membrane fluidity. *Plant J* 23:785–794
- Ou Y, Liu X, Xie C, Zhang H, Lin Y, Li M, Song B, Liu J (2015) Genome-wide identification of microRNAs and their targets in cold-stored potato tubers by deep sequencing and degradome analysis. *Plant Mol Biol Rep* 33:584–597
- Pan Y, Zhang H, Zhang D, Li J, Xiong H, Yu J, Li J, Rashid MAR, Li G, Ma X, Cao G, Han L, Zichao Li Z (2015) Genetic analysis of cold tolerance at the germination and booting stages in rice by association mapping. *PLoS One* 10:e0120590
- Park S, Lee CM, Doherty CJ, Gilmour SJ, Kim Y, Thomashow MF (2015) Regulation of the Arabidopsis CBF regulon by a complex low temperature regulatory network. *Plant J* 82:193–207
- Peacock JM (1982) Response and tolerance of sorghum to temperature stress. In: House LR, et al. (Eds.), *Sorghum in the Eighties*. In: Proceedings of the international symposium on Sorghum, Patancheru, India, November 2–7, 1981. International Crops Research Institute for the Semi-Arid Tropics (ICRISAT), Hyderabad, India, pp 143–159
- Pearce S, Zhu J, Boldizsár Á, Vágújfalvi A, Burke A, Garland-Campbell K, Galiba G, Dubcovsky J (2013) Large deletions in the CBF gene cluster at the Fr-B2 locus are associated with reduced frost tolerance in wheat. *Theor Appl Genet* 126:2683–2697
- Peter R, Eschholz TW, Stamp P, Liedgens M (2006) Swiss maize landraces—early vigour adaptation to cool conditions. *Acta Agron Hung* 54:329–336
- Peter R, Eschholz TW, Stamp P, Liedgens M (2009) Swiss Flint maize landraces—a rich pool of variability for early vigour in cool environments. *Field Crops Res* 110:157–166
- Pimental C, Davey PA, Juvik JA, Long SP (2005) Gene loci in maize influencing susceptibility to chilling dependent photoinhibition of photosynthesis. *Photosyn Res* 85:319–326
- Pino MT, Skinner JS, Park EJ, Jeknic Z, Hayes PM, Thomashow MF, Chen THH (2007) Use of a stress inducible promoter to drive ectopic *AtCBF* expression improves potato freezing tolerance while minimizing negative effects on tuber yield. *Plant Biotech J* 5:591–604
- Pomeroy MK, Andrews CJ, Stanley KP, Gao JY (1985) Physiological and metabolic responses of winter wheat to prolonged freezing stress. *Plant Physiol* 78(207–2):10
- Porter JR, Gawith M (1999) Temperatures and the growth and development of wheat: a review. *Eur J Agron* 10:23–36
- Presterl T, Ouzunova M, Schmidt W, Moller EM, Rober FK, Knaak C, Emst K, Westhoff P, Geiger HH (2007) Quantitative trait loci for early plant vigour of maize grown in chilly environments. *Theor Appl Genet* 114:1059–1070
- Qingcai Z, Keyong Z, Zuwu C, Shuzhen Z (2004) Mapping QTLs controlling seedling cold tolerance in rice using F<sub>2</sub> population. *J Hum Agric Univ* 30:303–306
- Ranawake AL, Manangkil OE, Yoshida S, Ishii T, Mori N, Nakamura C (2014) Mapping QTLs for cold tolerance at germination and the early seedling stage in rice (*Oryza sativa* L.). *Biotechnol Biotechnol Equip* 28:989–998
- Reinheimer JL, Barr AR, Eglinton JK (2004) QTL mapping of chromosomal regions conferring reproductive frost tolerance in barley (*Hordeum vulgare* L.). *Theor Appl Genet* 109:1267–1274
- Revilla P, Rodríguez VM, Ordás A, Rincón R, Charcosset A, Giauffret C, Melchinger AE, Schön CC, Bauer Eva, Altmann T, Brunel D, Moreno-González J, Campo L, Ouzunova M, Álvarez A, de Galarreta JIR, Laborde J, Malvar RA (2016) Association

- mapping for cold tolerance in two large maize inbred panels. *BMC Plant Biol* 16:127
- Rodriguez VM, Malvar RA, Butron A, Ordas A, Revilla P (2007) Maize populations as sources of favorable alleles to improve cold-tolerant hybrids. *Crop Sci* 47:1779–1786
- Rodriguez VM, Burton A, Rady MOA, Soengas P, Revilla P (2014) Identification of quantitative trait loci involved in the response to cold stress in maize (*Zea mays* L.). *Mol Breed*:363–371
- Roy D, Paul A, Roy A, Ghosh R, Ganguly P, Chaudhuri S (2014) Differential acetylation of histone H3 at the regulatory region of OsDREB1b facilitates chromatin remodeling and transcription activation during cold stress. *PLoS One* 9:e100343
- Rudi H, Sandve SR, Opseth LM, Larsen A, Rognli OA (2011) Identification of candidate genes important for frost tolerance in *Festuca pratensis* Huds. by transcriptional profiling. *Plant Sci* 180:78–85
- Rymen B, Fiorani F, Kartal F, Vandepoele K, Inzé D, Beemster GTS (2007) Cold nights impair leaf growth and cell cycle progression in maize through transcriptional changes of cell cycle genes. *Plant Physiol* 143:1429–1438
- Saito K, Miura K, Nagano K, Hayano-Saito Y, Saito A, Araki H, Kato K (1995) Chromosomal location of quantitative trait loci for cool tolerance at the booting stage in rice variety ‘Norin-PL8’. *Breed Sci* 45:337–340
- Saito K, Miura K, Nagano K, Hayano-saito Y, Araki H, Kato A (2001) Identification of two closely linked quantitative trait loci for cold tolerance on chromosome 4 of rice and their association with anther length. *Theor Appl Genet* 103:862–868
- Saito K, Hayano-Saito Y, Maruyama-Funatsuki W, Sato Y, Kato A (2004) Physical mapping and putative candidate gene identification of a quantitative trait locus Ctb1 for cold tolerance at the booting stage of rice. *Theor Appl Genet* 109:512–522
- Saito K, Hayano-Saito Y, Kuroki M, Sato Y (2010) Map-based cloning of the rice cold tolerance gene Ctb1. *Plant Sci* 179:97–102
- Sakata T, Oda S, Tsunaga Y, Shomura H, Kawagishi-Kobayashi M, Aya K, Saeki K, Endo T, Nagano K, Kojima M, Sakakibara H, Watanabe M, Matsuoka M, Higashitani A (2014) Reduction of gibberellin by low temperature disrupts pollen development in rice. *Plant Physiol* 164:2011–2019
- Sallam A, Arbaoui M, El-Esawi M, Abshire N, Martsch R (2016a) Identification and verification of QTL associated with frost tolerance using linkage mapping and GWAS in winter faba bean. *Front Plant Sci* 7:1098
- Sallam A, Dhanapal AP, Liu S (2016b) Association mapping of winter hardiness and yield traits in faba bean (*Vicia faba* L.). *Crop Pasture Sci* 67:55–68
- Sandve SR, Kosmala A, Rudi H, Fjellheim S, Rapacz M, Yamada T, Rognli OA (2011) Molecular mechanisms underlying frost tolerance in perennial grasses adapted to cold climates. *Plant Sci* 180:69–77
- Sasaki T (1981) Experimental studies on the parental potentiality for breeding cold tolerant rice varieties in Hokkaido, with special reference to tolerance at the booting stage. *Bull Hokkaido Perfect Agric Exp Stn* 46:51–60
- Satake T (1969) Research on cold injury of paddy rice plants in Japan. *Jpn Agric Res Q* 4:5–10
- Satake T (1976) Sterility-type cold injury in paddy rice plants. *Proceedings of the symposium on climate and rice*. IRRI, Los Baños, pp 281–300
- Satake T, Toriyama K (1979) Two extremely cool tolerant varieties. *Intl Rice Res Newsl* 4:9–10
- Satoh T, Tezuka K, Kawamoto T, Matsumoto S, Satoh-Nagasawa N, Ueda K, Sakurai K, Watanabe A, Takahashi H, Akagi H (2016) Identification of QTLs controlling low-temperature germination of the East European rice (*Oryza sativa* L.) variety Maratteli. *Euphytica* 207:245–254
- Shen C, Li D, He R, Fang Z, Xia Y, Gao J, Shen H, Cao M (2014) Comparative transcriptome analysis of RNA-seq data for cold-tolerant and cold-sensitive rice genotypes under cold stress. *J Plant Biol* 57:337–348
- Shi H, Chan ZL (2014) AtHAP5A modulates freezing stress resistance in Arabidopsis independent of the CBF pathway. *Plant Signal Behav* 9:e29109
- Shi H, Ye T, Zhong B, Liu X, Jin R, Chan Z (2014) AtHAP5A modulates freezing stress resistance in Arabidopsis through binding to CCAAT motif of AtXTH21. *New Phytol* 203:554–567
- Shi Y, Ding Y, Yang S (2015) Cold signal transduction and its interplay with phytohormones during cold acclimation. *Plant Cell Physiol* 56:7–15
- Shimono H, Okada M, Kanada E, Arakawa I (2007) Low temperature-induced sterility in rice: evidence for the effects of temperature before panicle initiation. *Field Crops Res* 101:221–231
- Shinada H, Iwata N, Sato T, Fujino K (2013) Genetical and morphological characterization of cold tolerance at fertilization stage in rice. *Breed Sci* 63:197–204
- Shinada H, Iwata N, Sato T, Fujino K (2014) QTL pyramiding for improving of cold tolerance at fertilization stage in rice. *Breed Sci* 63:483–488
- Shirasawa S, Endo T, Nakagomi K, Yamaguchi M, Nishio T (2012) Delimitation of a QTL region controlling cold tolerance at booting stage of a cultivar, ‘Lijiangxintuanheigu’, in rice, *Oryza sativa* L. *Theor Appl Genet* 124:937–946
- Shu Y, Liu Y, Li W, Song L, Zhang J, Guo C (2016) Genome-wide investigation of microRNAs and their targets in response to freezing stress in *Medicago sativa* L. based on high-throughput sequencing. *GGG* 6:755–765
- Sieber AN, Longin CFH, Leiser WL, Wurschum T (2016) Copy number variation of *CBF-A14* at the *Fr-A2* locus determines frost tolerance in winter durum wheat. *Theor Appl Genet* 129:1087–1097
- Sihathep V, Sipaseuth, Phothisane C, Thammavong A, Sengkeo, Phamixay S, Senthonghae M, Chanphengsay M, Linquist B, Fukai S (2001) Response of dry-season irrigated rice to sowing time at four sites in Laos. *ACIAR Proc* 101:138–146
- Singh RP, Brennan JP, Farrell T, Williams R, Reinke R, Lewin L et al (2005) Economic analysis of breeding for improved cold tolerance in rice in Australia. *Aust Agribus Rev* 13:1–9
- Single WV (1985) Frost injury and the physiology of the wheat plant. *J Aust Inst Agric Sci* 51:128–134
- Sinha S, Raxwal VK, Joshi B, Jagannath A, Katiyar-Agarwal S, Goel S, Kumar A, Agarwal M (2015) De novo transcriptome profiling of cold-stressed siliques during pod filling stages in Indian mustard (*Brassica juncea* L.). *Front. Plant Sci* 6:932
- Skinner DZ (2015) Genes upregulated in winter wheat (*Triticum aestivum* L.) during mild freezing and subsequent thawing suggest sequential activation of multiple response mechanisms. *PLoS One* 10:e0133166
- Skinner JS, von Zitzewitz J, Szucs P, Marquez-Cedillo L, Filichkin T, Amundsen K, Stockinger EJ, Thomashow MF, Chen TH, Hayes PM (2005) Structural, functional, and phylogenetic characterization of a large CBF gene family in barley. *Plant Mol Biol* 59:533–551
- Skinner JS, Szucs P, von Zitzewitz J, Marquez-Cedillo L, Filichkin T, Stockinger EJ, Thomashow MF, Chen TH, Hayes PM (2006) Mapping of barley homologs to genes that regulate low temperature tolerance in Arabidopsis. *Theor Appl Genet* 112:832–842
- Snape JW, Semikhodskii A, Fish L, Sarma RN, Quarrie SA, Galiba G, Sutka J (1997) Mapping frost resistance loci in wheat and



- comparative mapping with other cereals. *Acta Agron Hung* 45:265–270
- Sofalian O, Mohammadi SA, Aharizad S, Moghaddam M, Shakiba MR (2008) Mapping of QTLs for frost tolerance and heading time using SSR markers in bread wheat. *Afr J Biotechnol* 920:5260–5264
- Song L, Jiang L, Chen Y, Shu Y, Bai Y, Guo C (2016) Deep-sequencing transcriptome analysis of field-grown *Medicago sativa* L. crown buds acclimated to freezing stress. *Funct Integr Genom* 16:495–511
- Spink JH, Kirby EJM, Frost DL, Sylvester-Bradley R, Scott RK, Foulkes MJ, Clare RW, Evans EJ (2000) Agronomic implications of variation in wheat development due to variety, sowing date, site and season. *Plant Var Seeds* 13:91–108
- Srinivasan A, Johansen C, Saxena NP (1998) Cold tolerance during early reproductive growth of chickpea (*Cicer arietinum* L.): characterization of stress and genetic variation in pod set. *Field Crops Res* 57:181–193
- Sthapit BR (1987) Chhomrong a promising cold tolerant traditional rice variety for rainfed wetlands in western hills of Nepal. *IRRN* 12:4
- Sthapit BR, Witcombe JR (1998) Inheritance of tolerance to chilling stress in rice during germination and plumule greening. *Crop Sci* 38:660–665
- Stockinger EJ, Gilmour SJ, Thomashow MF (1997) Arabidopsis thaliana CBF1 encodes an AP2 domain-containing transcription activator that binds to the C repeat/DRE, a cis-acting DNA regulatory element that stimulates transcription in response to low temperature and water deficit. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 94:1035–1040
- Stockinger EJ, Skinner JS, Gardner KG, Francia E, Pecchioni N (2007) Expression levels of barley Cbf genes at the Frost resistance-H2 locus are dependent upon alleles at Fr-H1 and Fr-H2. *Plant J* 51:308–321
- Strigens A, Freitag NM, Gilbert X, Grieder C, Riedelsheimer C, Schrag TA, Messmer R (2013) Association mapping for chilling tolerance in elite flint and dent maize inbred lines evaluated in growth chamber and field experiments. *Plant Cell Environ* 36:1871–1887
- Suh JP, Jeung JU, Lee JI, Choi YH, Yea JD, Virk PS, Mackill DJ, Jena KK (2010) Identification and analysis of QTLs controlling cold tolerance at the reproductive stage and validation of effective QTLs in cold-tolerance genotypes of rice (*Oryza sativa* L.). *Theor Appl Genet* 120:985–995
- Suh JP, Lee CK, Lee JH, Kim JJ, Kim SM, Cho YC, Park SH, Shin JC, Kim YG, Jena KK (2012) Identification of quantitative trait loci for seedling cold tolerance using RILs derived from a cross between japonica and tropical japonica rice cultivars. *Euphytica* 184:101–108
- Sutka J (1994) Genetic control of frost tolerance in wheat (*Triticum aestivum* L.). *Euphytica* 77:277–282
- Sutka J (2001) Genes for frost resistance in wheat. *Euphytica* 119:167–172
- Sutka J, Snape JW (1989) Location of a gene for frost resistance on chromosome 5A of wheat. *Euphytica* 42:41–44
- Sutton F, Chen DG, Ge X, Kenefick D (2009) Cbf genes of the Fr-A2 allele are differentially regulated between long-term cold acclimated crown tissue of freeze-resistant and—susceptible, winter wheat mutant lines. *BMC Plant Biol* 9:34
- Takanashi J, Maruyama S, Kabaki N, Tajima K (1987) Temperature dependence of protein synthesis by cell-free system constructed with polysomes from rice radicle. *Jpn J Crop Sci* 56:44–50
- Takeuchi Y, Hayasaka H, Chiba B, Tanaka I, Shimono T, Yamagishi M, Nagano K, Sasaki T, Yano M (2001) Mapping quantitative trait loci controlling cool-temperature tolerance at booting stage in temperate japonica rice. *Breed Sci* 51:191–197
- Tamura K, Hara-Nishimura I (2014) Functional insights of nucleocytoplasmic transport in plants. *Front Plant Sci* 5:118
- Tayeh N, Bahman N, Sellier H, Bluteau A, Blassiau C, Fourment J, Bellec A, Debelle F, Lejeune- Henaut I, Delbreil B (2013) A tandem array of *CBF/DREB1* genes is located in a major freezing tolerance QTL region on *Medicago truncatula* chromosome 6. *BMC Genom* 14:814
- Teutonico RA, Yandell B, Satagopan JM, Ferreira ME, Palta JP (1995) Genetic analysis and mapping of genes controlling freezing tolerance in oilseed *Brassica*. *Mol Breed* 1:329–339
- Thakur P, Kumar S, Malik JA, Berger JD (2010) Cold stress effects on reproductive development in grain crops: an overview. *Environ Exp Bot* 67:429–443
- Thiebaut F, Rojas CA, Almeida KL, Grativol C, Domiciano GC, Lamb CRC, Engler JA, Hemery AS, Ferreira PCG (2012) Regulation of miR319 during cold stress in sugarcane. *Plant Cell Environ* 35:502–512
- Thomashow MF (1998) Role of cold-responsive genes in plant freezing tolerance. *Plant Physiol* 118:1–7
- Thomashow MF (1999) Plant cold acclimation: freezing tolerance genes and regulatory mechanisms. *Annu Rev Plant Physiol Plant Mol Biol* 50:571–599
- Tian F, Zhu ZF, Fu YC, Wang XK, Sun CQ (2006) Construction of introgression lines carrying wild rice (*Oryza rufipogon* Griff.) segments in cultivated rice (*Oryza sativa* L.) background and characterization of introgressed segments associated with yield-related traits. *Theor Appl Genet* 112:570–580
- Tian DQ, Pan XY, Yu YM, Wang WY, Zhang F, Ge YY, Shen XL, Shen FQ, Liu XJ (2013a) De novo characterization of the Anthurium transcriptome and analysis of its digital gene expression under cold stress. *BMC Genom* 14:827
- Tian S, Mao X, Zhang H, Chen S, Zhai C, Yang S, Jing R (2013b) Cloning and characterization of TaSnRK2.3, a novel SnRK2 gene in common wheat. *J Exp Bot* 64:2063–2080
- To KT, Nakaminami K, Kim JM, Morosawa T, Ishida J, Tanaka M, Yokoyama S, Shinozaki K, Seki M (2011) Arabidopsis HDA6 is required for freezing tolerance. *Biochem Biophys Res Commun* 406:414–419
- Tondelli A, Francia E, Barabaschi D, Aprile A, Skinner JS, Stockinger EJ, Stanca AM, Pecchioni N (2006) Mapping regulatory genes as candidates for cold and drought stress tolerance in barley. *Theor Appl Genet* 112:445–454
- Toth B, Galiba G, Feher E, Sutka J, Snape JW (2003) Mapping genes affecting flowering time and frost resistance on chromosome 5B of wheat. *Theor Appl Genet* 107:509–514
- Truco MJ, Randall LB, Bloom AJ, Clair DAS (2000) Detection of QTLs associated with shoot wilting and root ammonium uptake under chilling temperatures in an interspecific backcross population from *Lycopersicon esculentum* × *L. hirsutum*. *Theor Appl Genet* 101:1082–1092
- Tsuda K, Tsvetanov S, Takumi S, Mori N, Atanassov A, Nakamura C (2000) New members of a cold-responsive group-3 *Lea/Rab*-related *Cor* gene family from common wheat (*Triticum aestivum* L.). *Genes Genet Syst* 75:179–188
- Tsvetanov S, Ohno R, Tsuda K, Takumi S, Mori N, Atanassov A, Nakamura C (2000) A cold-responsive wheat (*Triticum aestivum* L.) gene wcor14 identified in a winter-hardy cultivar ‘Mironovska 808’. *Genes Genet Syst* 75:49–57
- Tumino G, Voorrips RE, Rizza F, Badeck FW, Morcia C, Ghizzoni R, Germeier CU, Paulo MJ, Terzi V, Smulders MJM (2016) Population structure and genome-wide association analysis for frost tolerance in oat using continuous SNP array signal intensity ratios. *Theor Appl Genet* 129:1711–1724
- Ulziibat B, Ohta H, Fukushima A, Shirasawa S, Kitashiba H, Nishio T (2016) Examination of candidates for the gene of cold tolerance

- at the booting stage in a delimited QTL region in rice cultivar 'Lijiangxintuanheigu'. *Euphytica* 211:331–341
- Vágújfalvi A, Crosatti C, Galiba G, Dubcovsky J, Cattivelli L (2000) Two loci on wheat chromosome 5A regulate the differential cold-dependent expression of the *cor14b* gene in frost-tolerant and frost-sensitive genotypes. *Mol Genet Genomics* 263:194–200
- Vágújfalvi A, Galiba G, Cattivelli L, Dubcovsky J (2003) The coldregulated transcriptional activator Cbf3 is linked to the frost tolerance locus Fr-A2 on wheat chromosome 5A. *Mol Genet Genomics* 269:60–67
- Vágújfalvi A, Aprile A, Miller A, Dubcovsky J, Delugu G, Galiba G, Cattivelli L (2005) The expression of several Cbf genes at the Fr-A2 locus is linked to frost resistance in wheat. *Mol Genet Genomics* 274:506–514
- Vallejos CE, Tanksley SD (1983) Segregation of isozyme markers and cold tolerance in an interspecific backcross of tomato. *Theor Appl Genet* 66:241–247
- Varshney RK, Ribaut JM, Buckler ES, Tuberosa R, Rafalski JA, Langridge P (2012) Can genomics boost productivity of orphan crops? *Nat Biotechnol* 30:1172–1176
- Vítámvás P, Prásil IT (2008) WCS120 protein family and frost tolerance during cold acclimation, deacclimation and reacclimation of winter wheat. *Plant Physiol Biochem* 46:970–976
- Wainaina CM, Inukai Y, Masinde PW, Ateka EM, Murage H, Kano-Nakata M, Nakajima Y, Terashima T, Mizukami Y, Nakamura M, Nonoyama T, Saka N, Asanuma S, Yamauchi A, Kitano H, Kimani J, Makihara D (2015) Evaluation of cold tolerance in NERICAs compared with Japanese standard rice varieties at the reproductive stage. *J Agron Crop Sci* 201:461–472
- Wang Z, Wang F, Zhou R, Wang J, Zhang H (2011) Identification of quantitative trait loci for cold tolerance during the germination and seedling stages in rice (*Oryza sativa* L.). *Euphytica* 181:405–413
- Wang ST, Sun XL, Hoshino Y, Yu Y, Jia B, Sun ZW, Duan XB, Zhu YM (2014) MicroRNA319 positively regulates cold tolerance by targeting OsPCF6 and OsTCP21 in rice (*Oryza sativa* L.). *PLoS One* 9:e91357
- Washburn JD, Murray SC, Burson BL, Klein RR, Jessup RW (2013) Targeted mapping of quantitative trait locus regions for rhizomatousness in chromosome SBI-01 and analysis of overwintering in a *Sorghum bicolor* 3 *S. propinquum* population. *Mol Breed* 31:153–162
- Winfield MO, Lu C, Wilson ID, Coghill JA, Edwards KJ (2010) Plant responses to cold: transcriptome analysis of wheat. *Plant Biotechnol J* 8:749–771
- Wooten DR, Livingston DP III, Holland JB, Marshall DS, Murphy JP (2008) Quantitative trait loci and epistasis for crown freezing tolerance in the 'Kanota' × 'Ogle' hexaploid oat mapping population. *Crop Sci* 48:149
- Xiao N, Huang WN, Zhang XX, Gao Y, Li AH, Dai Y, Yu L, Liu GQ, Pan CH, Li YH, Dai ZY, Chen JM (2014) Fine mapping of qRC10-2, a quantitative trait locus for cold tolerance of rice roots at seedling and mature stages. *PLoS One* 9:e96046
- Xiao N, Huang W, Li A, Gao Y, Li Y, Pan C, Ji H, Zhang X, Dai Y, Dai Z (2015) Fine mapping of the *qLOP2* and *qPSR2 -1* loci associated with chilling stress tolerance of wild rice seedlings. *Theor Appl Genet* 128:173–185
- Xin Z, Browse J (1998) Eskimo1 mutants of *Arabidopsis* are constitutively freezing-tolerant. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 95:7799–7804
- Xin Z, Browse J (2000) Cold comfort farm: the acclimation of plants to freezing temperatures. *Plant Cell Environ* 23:893–902
- Xiong L, Schumaker KS, Zhu JK (2002) Cell signaling during cold, drought, and salt stress. *Plant Cell* 14(Suppl):s165–s183
- Xiong Y, Fei S, Arora R, Brummer E, Barker R, Jung G, Warnke S (2007) Identification of quantitative trait loci controlling winter hardiness in an annual × perennial ryegrass interspecific hybrid population. *Mol Breed* 19:125–136
- Xu LM, Zhou L, Zeng W, Wang FM, Zhang HL, Shen SQ, Li ZC (2008) Identification and mapping of quantitative trait loci for cold tolerance at the booting stage in a japonica rice near-isogenic line. *Plant Sci* 174:340–347
- Xu J, Li Y, Sun J, Du L, Zhang Y, Yu Q, Liu X (2013) Comparative physiological and proteomic response to abrupt low temperature stress between two winter wheat cultivars differing in low temperature tolerance. *Plant Biol (Stuttg)* 15:292–303
- Yadav SK (2010) Cold stress tolerance mechanisms in plants. A review. *Agron Sustain Dev* 30:515–527
- Yang T, Chaudhuri S, Yang L, Du L, Poovaiah BW (2010) A calcium/calmodulin-regulated member of the receptor-like kinase family confers cold tolerance in plants. *J Biol Chem* 285:7119–7126
- Yang Z, Huang D, Tang W, Zheng Y, Liang K, Cutler AJ, Wu W (2013a) Mapping of quantitative trait loci underlying cold tolerance in rice seedlings via high-throughput sequencing of pooled extremes. *PLoS One* 8:e68433
- Yang C, Li D, Mao D, Liu X, Ji C, Li X, Zhao X, Cheng Z, Chen C, Zhu L (2013b) Overexpression of microRNA319 impacts leaf morphogenesis and leads to enhanced cold tolerance in rice (*Oryza sativa* L.). *Plant Cell Environ* 36:2207–2218
- Yang QS, Gao J, He WD, Dou TX, Ding LJ, Wu JH, Li CY, Wu JH, Li CY, Peng XX, Zhang S, Yi GJ (2015) Comparative transcriptomics analysis reveals difference of key gene expression between banana and plantain in response to cold stress. *BMC Genom* 16:446
- Yang T, Zhang S, Zhao Z, Liu Q, Huang Z, Mao X, Dong J, Wang X, Zhang G, Liu B (2016) Identification and pyramiding of QTLs for cold tolerance at the bud bursting and the seedling stages by use of single segment substitution lines in rice (*Oryza sativa* L.). *Mol Breed* 36:96
- Ye C, Fukai S, Godwin I, Reinke RB, Snell PB, Schiller J, Basnayake J (2009) Cold tolerance in rice varieties at different growth stages. *Crop Pasture Sci* 60:328–338
- Ye C, Fukai S, Godwin DI, Koh H, Reinke R, Zhou Y, Lambrides C, Jiang W, Snell P, Redoña E (2010) A QTL controlling low temperature induced spikelet sterility at booting stage in rice. *Euphytica* 176:291–301
- Yi SY, Kim JH, Joung YH, Lee S, Kim WT, Yu SH, Choi D (2004) The pepper transcription factor *CaPFL* confers pathogen and freezing tolerance in *Arabidopsis*. *Plant Physiol* 136:2862–2874
- Yokota H, Iehisa JCM, Shimosaka E, Takumi S (2015) Line differences in *CorLea* and fructan biosynthesis-related gene transcript accumulation are related to distinct freezing tolerance levels in synthetic wheat hexaploids. *J Plant Physiol* 176:78–88
- Yoshida S (1981) Pp. 1–63 in fundamentals of rice crop science. International Rice Research Institute, Los Baños
- Yoshida R, Kanno A, Sato T, Kameya T (1996) Cool temperature-induced chlorosis in rice plants. *Plant Physiol* 110:997–1005
- Yu X, Hui Peng Y, Hua Zhang M, Jun Shao Y, Ai SuW, Cheng Tang Z (2006) Water relations and an expression analysis of plasma membrane intrinsic proteins in sensitive and tolerant rice during chilling and recovery. *Cell Res* 16:599–608
- Zhan X, Zhu JK, Lang Z (2015) Increasing freezing tolerance: kinase regulation of ICE1. *Dev Cell* 32:257–258
- Zhang GQ, Zeng RZ, Zhang ZM, Ding XH, Li WT, Liu GF, He FH, Tulukdar A, Huang CF, Xi ZY, Qin LJ, Shi JQ, Zhao FM, Feng MJ, Shan ZL, Chen L, Guo XQ, Zhu HT, Lu YG (2004) The construction of a library of single segment substitution lines in rice (*Oryza sativa* L.). *Rice Genet Newsl* 121:85–87

- Zhang ZH, Su L, Li W, Chen W, Zhu YG (2005) A major QTL conferring cold tolerance at the early seedling stage using recombinant inbred lines of rice (*Oryza sativa* L.). *Plant Sci* 168:527–534
- Zhang J, Xu Y, Huan Q, Chong K (2009) Deep sequencing of *Brachypodium* small RNAs at the global genome level identifies microRNAs involved in cold stress response. *BMC Genom* 10:449
- Zhang F, Huang L, Wang W, Zhao X, Zhu L, Fu B, Li Z (2012a) Genome-wide gene expression profiling of introgressed indica rice alleles associated with seedling cold tolerance improvement in a japonica rice background. *BMC Genom* 13:461
- Zhang T, Zhao X, Wang W, Pan Y, Huang L, Liu X, Zong Y, Zhu L, Yang D, Fu B (2012b) Comparative transcriptome profiling of chilling stress responsiveness in two contrasting rice genotypes. *PLoS One* 7:e43274
- Zhang S, Zheng J, Liu B, Peng S, Leung H, Zhao J, Wang X, Yang T, Huang Z (2014a) Identification of QTLs for cold tolerance at seedling stage in rice (*Oryza sativa* L.) using two distinct methods of cold treatment. *Euphytica* 195:95–104
- Zhang Y, Zhu X, Chen X, Song C, Zou Z, Wang Y, Wang M, Fang W, Li X (2014b) Identification and characterization of cold-responsive microRNAs in tea plant (*Camellia sinensis*) and their targets using high-throughput sequencing and degradome analysis. *BMC Plant Biol* 14:271
- Zhang Q, Chen Q, Wang S, Hong Y, Wang Z (2014c) Rice and cold stress: methods for its evaluation and summary of cold tolerance-related quantitative trait loci. *Rice (N Y)* 7(1):24
- Zhang S, Wang Y, Li K, Zou Y, Chen L, Li X (2015) Identification of cold-responsive miRNAs and their target genes in nitrogen-fixing nodules of soybean. *Int J Mol Sci* 15:13596–13614
- Zhao Y, Gowda M, Würschum T, Longin CF, Korzun V, Kollers S, Schachschneider R, Zeng J, Fernando R, Dubcovsky J, Reif JC (2013) Dissecting the genetic architecture of frost tolerance in Central European winter wheat. *J Exp Bot* 64:4453–4460
- Zhao C, Zhaobo Lang Z, Zhu JK (2015a) Cold responsive gene transcription becomes more complex. *Trends Plant Sci* 20:466–468
- Zhao J, Zhang S, Yang T, Zeng Z, Huang Z, Liu Q, Wang X, Leach J, Leung H, Liu B (2015b) Global transcriptional profiling of a cold-tolerant rice variety under moderate cold stress reveals different cold stress response mechanisms. *Physiol Plant* 154:381–394
- Zhao C, Zhang Z, Xie S, Si T, Li Y, Zhu JK (2016) Mutational evidence for the critical role of CBF genes in cold acclimation in arabidopsis. *Plant Physiol* 171:2744–2759
- Zheng B, Chapman SC, Christopher JT, Frederiks TM, Chenu K (2015a) Frost trends and their estimated impact on yield in the Australian wheatbelt. *J Exp Bot* 66:3611–3623
- Zheng C, Zhao L, Wang Y, Shen J, Zhang Y, Jia S, Li Y, Ding Z (2015b) Integrated RNA-Seq and sRNA-Seq analysis identifies chilling and freezing responsive key molecular players and pathways in tea plant (*Camellia sinensis*). *PLoS One* 10:e0125031
- Zhou QY, Tian AG, Zou HF, Xie ZM, Lei G, Huang J, Wang CM, Wang HW, Zhang JS, Chen SY (2008) Soybean WRKY-type transcription factor genes, GmWRKY13, GmWRKY21, and GmWRKY54, confer differential tolerance to abiotic stresses in transgenic Arabidopsis plants. *Plant Biotechnol J* 6:486–503
- Zhou L, Zeng Y, Zheng W, Tang B, Yang S, Zhang H, Li J, Li Z (2010) Fine mapping a QTL qCTB7 for cold tolerance at the booting stage on rice chromosome 7 using near-isogenic line. *Theor Appl Genet* 121:895–905
- Zhou MQ, Shen C, Wu LH, Tang KX, Lin J (2011) CBF-dependent signaling pathway: a key responder to low temperature stress in plants. *Crit Rev Biotechnol* 31:186–192
- Zhou L, Zeng Y, Hu G, Pan Y, Yang S, You A, Zhang H, Li J, Li Z (2012) Characterization and identification of cold tolerant near-isogenic lines in rice. *Breed Sci* 62(2):196–201
- Zhu J, Shi H, Lee BH, Damsz B, Cheng S, Stirn V, Zhu JK, Hasegawa PM, Bressan RA (2004) An Arabidopsis homeodomain transcription factor gene, HOS9, mediates cold tolerance through a CBF-independent pathway. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 101:9873–9878
- Zhu J, Verslues PE, Zheng X, Lee BH, Zhan X, Manabe Y, Sokolchik I, Zhu Y, Dong CH, Zhu JK, Hasegawa PM, Bressan RA (2005) *HOS10* encodes an R2R3-type MYB transcription factor essential for cold acclimation in plants. *Proc Natl Acad Sci USA* 102:9966–9971
- Zhu J, Dong CH, Zhu JK (2007) Interplay between cold-responsive gene regulation, metabolism and RNA processing during plant cold acclimation. *Curr Opin Plant Biol* 10:290–295
- Zhu J, Pearce S, Burke A, See DR, Skinner DZ, Dubcovsky J, Garland-Campbell K (2014) Copy number and haplotype variation at the VRN-A1 and central FR-A2 loci are associated with frost tolerance in hexaploid wheat. *Theor Appl Genet* 127:1183–1197
- Zhu Y, Chen K, Mi X, Chen T, Ali J, Ye G, Xu J, Li Z (2015) Identification and fine mapping of a stably expressed QTL for cold tolerance at the booting stage using an interconnected breeding population in rice. *PLoS One* 10:e0145704