MINI-REVIEW

Hairy root culture technology: applications, constraints and prospect

Saikat Gantait¹ \bullet · Eashan Mukherjee

Received: 6 October 2020 / Revised: 4 November 2020 /Accepted: 9 November 2020 / Published online: 23 November 2020 \odot Springer-Verlag GmbH Germany, part of Springer Nature 2020

Abstract

Hairy root (HR) culture, a successful biotechnology combining in vitro tissue culture with recombinant DNA machinery, is intended for the genetic improvement of plants. This technology has been put to use since the last three decades for genetic advancement of medicinal and aromatic plants and also to harvest the economical products in the form of secondary metabolites that are significantly important for their ethnobotanical and pharmacological properties. It also provides an efficient way out for the quicker extraction and quantification of the valuable phytochemicals. The current review provides an account of the in vitro HR culture technology and its wide-scale applications in the field of research as well as in pharmaceutical industries. Different facets of HR with respect to the culture establishment, phytochemical production as well as research investigations concerning the areas of gene manipulation, biotransformation of the secondary metabolites, phytoremediation, their industrial utilisations and different problems encountered during the application of this technology have been covered in this appraisal. Eventually, an idea has been provided on HR about the recent trends on the progress of this technology that may open up newer prospects in near future and calls for further research and explorations in this field.

Key points

- Genetic engineering–based HR culture aims towards enhanced secondary metabolite production.
- This review explores an insight in the HR technology and its multi-faceted approaches.
- Up-to-date ground-breaking research applications and constraints of HR culture are discussed.

Keywords Biotransformation . Genetic engineering . In vitro regeneration . Phytoremediation . Secondary metabolites

Introduction

Hairy root (HR) culture technology is a novel biotechnological approach that aims towards the genetic and biochemical improvement of various important medicinal plants (Gantait et al. [2020](#page-14-0)). An array of secondary metabolites is found in different plants with medicinal value. Alkaloids, tannins, flavonoids, phenolics and other aromatic amino acid derivatives constitute the major bulk of these phytobiochemicals. Naturally, these biochemicals are biosynthesised through

Saikat Gantait and Eashan Mukherjee contributed equally to this work.

 \boxtimes Saikat Gantait saikatgantait@yahoo.com different metabolic pathways in plants involving different enzymes or their complexes. These secondary metabolites are found in multiple plant parts such as floral buds, leaves, barks, seeds and, most importantly, in the roots. Extraction of these useful biochemicals (that have remarkable pharmacological, medicinal and ethnobotanical uses) through conventional field-grown methods would involve large-scale uprooting of the plants and, hence, inevitable destruction of their habitat, ecosystem and biodiversity. Such approach has pushed these plants towards endangered category. To mitigate this problem, in vitro culture technology could effectively be applied for the large-scale propagation, conservation as well as production of secondary metabolites from these plants (Gantait et al. [2011;](#page-14-0) Gangopadhyay et al. [2016;](#page-14-0) Panigrahi et al. [2018](#page-16-0); Verma et al. [2018;](#page-18-0) Mukherjee et al. [2020](#page-16-0)). In this scenario, HR culture technology also presents itself as a potential solution to the above-mentioned problem via production and enhancement of secondary metabolite content of these plants (Mitra et al. [2020](#page-16-0); Das et al. [2020](#page-13-0)). These HR cultures could be then

¹ Crop Research Unit (Genetics and Plant Breeding), Bidhan Chandra Krishi Viswavidyalaya, Mohanpur, Nadia, West Bengal 741252, India

further employed in pharmaceutical research and product development.

The early 1980s marks the inception of the in vitro culture studies of this technology (Willmitzer et al. [1982\)](#page-18-0). HR culture technology mainly involves the use of the soilinhabiting gram-negative bacteria Agrobacterium rhizogenes (Fig. 1). Bacterial cells contain a typical plasmid, called 'Ri-plasmid' (root-inducing plasmid). During the bacterial infection at the wounded parts of plants, the host plant cells are transformed upon integration of the transfer DNA (T-DNA) segments from the bacteria into its genome (Fig. [2\)](#page-2-0) (Chilton et al. [1982](#page-13-0)). This transformation is effected owing to the presence of different genes (rol genes, i.e. rol A, rol B and rol C) in the plasmid of the bacteria. Upon incorporation, the different genes present in the T-DNA are encoded, and as a result, auxin and cytokinins are produced (Fig. [2\)](#page-2-0) that stimulate the production of HR-like outgrowths from the wounded regions (Shanks and Morgan [1999;](#page-17-0) Sevon and Oksman-Caldentey [2002](#page-17-0); Guillon et al. [2006](#page-14-0)). On the basis of opine production, A. rhizogenes strains are of five types: octopine, mannopine, cucumopine, agropine and nopaline (Zhou et al. [1998\)](#page-18-0), of which agropine strains serve as the preferred choice due to their greater root induction ability. Opine synthesising genes are located in the right border of T-

DNA. In homology to the $tms1$ and $tms2$ of Ti plasmid, the TR-DNA contains genes for auxin production, viz. Tms1 and Tms2 (Rawat et al. [2019\)](#page-16-0). Resultant HR typifies quick proliferative phytohormone-independent growth, increased biomass and stable genetic performance with respect to secondary metabolite production. This bacterium, i.e. A. rhizogenes, also employs binary vector systems where the genes could be carried on another plasmid inside the cell (Tepfer [1984](#page-17-0); Christey [1997\)](#page-13-0). Further investigations in this field over years have led to diversified applications such as phytoremediation and biotransformation, which are further elaborated in this review.

Techniques involved

For efficient development of HR cultures, various factors like explant type and growth stage, culture conditions, bacterial strains, suitable media for co-cultivations, pH of the medium and carbon source must be mulled over as these factors influence the secondary metabolite biosynthesis. In general, a range of explants like protoplast, leaf, cotyledons, hypocotyls, shoot tips, stem, stalk, storage root and tubers could be employed (Mugnier [1988](#page-16-0); Han et al. [1993;](#page-14-0) Drewes and Staden [1995;](#page-13-0) Giri et al. [2001b;](#page-14-0) Krolicka et al.

Ri-plasmid brings about the transformation of plant cells leading to hairy root phenotype

Fig. 1 Diagrammatic representation of Agrobacterium rhizogenes–mediated hairy root induction in plants under natural conditions (in vivo) (Source: unpublished diagram of Saikat Gantait)

Fig. 2 Diagrammatic representation of the cellular mechanism of Agrobacterium rhizogenes–mediated transformation of the host cell (Source: unpublished diagram of Saikat Gantait)

[2001](#page-15-0); Azlan et al. [2002\)](#page-12-0). In most cases, young and juvenile explants are preferred though, in some cases, it is species dependent (Hu and Du [2006](#page-14-0)). The explants were initially wounded using a sterile scalpel or needle and then inoculated with bacterial solutions (Fig. [3\)](#page-3-0). Then, explants are co-cultivated in a semisolid medium supplemented with suitable antibiotics such as carbenicillin disodium, cefotaxime sodium, streptomycin sulphate, ampicillin sodium or tetracycline with doses ranging from 100 to 500 μg/ml. This is performed to remove the excess bacteria present on explant surface (Spano et al. [1988;](#page-17-0) Drewes and Staden [1995](#page-13-0); Giri et al. [2001b](#page-14-0); Krolicka et al. [2001\)](#page-15-0). Root induction from the wounded places occures within 7 to 30 days. Subsequent subculturing is done in plant growth regulator (PGR)-free medium (Fig. [3\)](#page-3-0). The media supplemented with heavy metal ions of nitrate, ammonia, phosphate and other elicitors (Payne et al. [1987](#page-16-0); Toivonen et al. [1991](#page-17-0); Christen et al. [1992;](#page-13-0) Sevon et al. [1992](#page-17-0)) promote secondary metabolism in the cultures. Culture conditions like light, temperature, pH and different PGR concentrations added to the basal media chiefly influence secondary metabolite production (Christen et al. [1992](#page-13-0); Toivonen et al. [1992](#page-17-0); Rhodes et al. [1994](#page-17-0); Arroo et al. [1995](#page-12-0); Bhadra and Shanks [1995;](#page-12-0) Vanhala et al. [1998;](#page-18-0) Morgan et al. [2000](#page-16-0)).

Reporter genes such as GUS gene (β-glucuronidase) (Hosoki and Kigo [1994\)](#page-14-0), kanamycin-resistant enzyme encoded by NPT-II gene (neomycin phosphotransferase II) (Han et al. [1993;](#page-14-0) Qin et al. [1994\)](#page-16-0) and green fluorescent protein (GFP) encoding gene (in Catharanthus roseus L. experiments by Hughes et al. [2002](#page-14-0)) are the most commonly used ones.

In several published reports, it was mentioned that the improvement in the secondary metabolite production could be effected by a range of different approaches such as precursor feeding, cell permeabilisation and elicitation through the use of different agents like detergents, sonication, calcium chelators, temperature and oxygen stress. The usage of the abovementioned techniques are found in the reports of Thimmaraju et al. ([2003a,](#page-17-0) [b](#page-17-0)) and Moreno-Valenzuela et al. [\(2003\)](#page-16-0) describing the production of betalaine from beet root and serpentine from Catharanthus roseus HR cultures, respectively. Notably, the usage of chitosan, methyl jasmonate (MeJa) and vanadyl sulphate elicitors in case of *Panax ginseng* stimulated ginsenoside production (Palazon et al. [2003a](#page-16-0)), whereas Phytophthora cinnamoni elicitors stimulated harmine and harmaline in case of Oxalis tuberose (Bais et al. [2003](#page-12-0)). The use of trapping agents such alumina and silica (1:1) in beet root HR cultures in order to enhance betalaine production was reported by Thimmaraju et al. [\(2004\)](#page-17-0). Cross-species co-culturing method for podophyllotoxin from Podophyllum hexandrum using coniferin from Linum flavum as precursor was mentioned in the reports of Lin et al. ([2003b](#page-15-0)). Usage of elicitors like CuSO4, MeJa in Pharbitis nil for umbelliferone and scopoletin production (Yaoya et al. [2004\)](#page-18-0), Rhizoctonia bataticola, β-cyclodextrin and MeJa elicitors in Solanum tuberosum for sesquiterpene production was also reported

Fig. 3 Diagrammatic representation of the in vitro protocol for hairy root culture establishment using Agrobacterium rhizogenes and regeneration of transformed plantlet (Source: unpublished diagram of Saikat Gantait)

(Komaraiah et al. [2003](#page-15-0)). Similarly, reports of Furze et al. [\(1991\)](#page-14-0) mention the use of metal ion elicitation by Cu^{2+} and Cd^{2+} in case of *Datura stramonium* for sesquiterpenoid phytoalexin production. Later on, Hu and Du [\(2006](#page-14-0)) reported the importance of selection of genetically true high metabolite yielding HR lines. This is due to the ambiguity in proper integration of T-DNA into the plant genome which may lead to variations in the secondary metabolite production.

Applications

Wide-scale research and investigation in this field have facilitated the advancement of varied applications of HR culture technology. Some of the different prospects as explored in the available reports on HR culture technology are mentioned as follows.

Source of important secondary metabolites

Different secondary phytobiochemicals have been isolated using HR culture technology. Some of the notable examples are artemisinin from Artemisia, indole alkaloids from Catharanthus and Cinchona, forskolin from Coleus, withanolides from Withania, shikonin from Lithospermum, diosgenin from Trigonella, etc. (Table [1](#page-4-0)). Likewise, careful maintenance and regular subculturing of Nicotiana rustica HR lines stabilised the yield of nicotine at 300 mg/g fresh weight. Similarly, the different published reports regarding the quantification of products of secondary metabolism from

 \mathbf{r}

40 Appl Microbiol Biotechnol (2021) 105:35–53

ELISA enzyme-linked immunosorbent assay, HPLC high-performance liquid chromatography, HPTLC high-performance thin-layer chromatography, LC-APCI-MS liquid chromatography–atmospheric pressure chemical ionisation-mass spectrometry, *LC/MS* liquid chromatography/mass spectroscopy, *NM* not mentioned, *PCR* polymerase chain reaction, *RT-PCR* reverse transcriptase polymerase chain pressure chemical ionisation–mass spectrometry, LC/MS liquid chromatography/mass spectroscopy, NM not mentioned, PCR polymerase chain reaction, RT-PCR reverse transcriptase polymerase chain reaction, UPLC-HR-MS ultra-performance liquid chromatography–high-resolution mass spectrometry, UPLC-PDA-ESI-MS ultra-performance liquid chromatography–photodiode array–electrospray reaction, UPLC-HR-MS ultra-performance liquid chromatography-high-resolution mass spectrometry, UPLC-PDA-ESI-MS ultra-performance liquid chromatography-photodiode array-electrospray ionisation-mass spectrometry, UPLC ultra-performance liquid chromatography, UHPTLC ultra high-performance thin-layer chromatography ionisation–mass spectrometry, UPLC ultra-performance liquid chromatography, UHPTLC ultra high-performance thin-layer chromatography

HR cultures mention the isolation of ajmaline, ajmalicine from Rauvolfia micrantha (Sudha et al. [2003](#page-17-0)), verbascoside from Gmelina arborea (Dhakulkar et al. [2005\)](#page-13-0), sanguinarine, codeine from Papaver somniferum (Le Flem-Bonhomme et al. [2004\)](#page-15-0) and coniferin from Linum flavum (Lin et al. [2003a\)](#page-15-0). Recent research investigations have also led to the quantification of different phytochemicals like isoflavones from Trifolium pratense (Kumar et al. [2017](#page-15-0)), crypto tanshinone and tanshinone from Perovskia abrotanoides (Ebrahimi et al. [2017](#page-13-0)), withanolide from Withania somnifera (Shahjahan et al. [2017](#page-17-0)), andrographolides from Andrographis paniculata (Mahobia and Jha [2018\)](#page-15-0), flavonoids from Prosopis farcta (Zafari et al. [2018](#page-18-0)), farnesiferol B from Ferula pseudalliacea (Khazaei et al. [2019\)](#page-15-0), verbascoside and isoverbascoside from Rehmannia elata (Piątczak et al. [2019\)](#page-16-0) and steroidal sapogenin from Trigonella foenum-graecum (Kohsari et al. [2020](#page-15-0)). All of these metabolites have various anti-cancerous, anti-arrhythmic, anti-hypertensive, anti-tumour and multiple other different medicinal properties. This enhancement in the production of different valuable secondary metabolites was accomplished by the introduction of a gene construct encoding an important protein (enzyme) required in the metabolic pathway of the chemical. In some cases, overexpression of the genes also led to the increase in metabolite production. Cultures were fastgrowing and easy to maintain and synthesised more than one phytochemical.

Study of gene function

The technique of manipulation of gene construct via which the desired transformation through A. rhizogenes is brought about could be further utilised for the studies of gene expression, gene silencing and differential promoter expression levels under different conditions. For example, a promoter induced by a glucocorticoid was utilised to produce the transformed HR cultures of Catharanthus roseus. In a glucocorticoid dexamethasone–supplemented medium, the promoter exhibited a reversible dose-regulated response (Hughes et al. [2002\)](#page-14-0). Similarly, Preiszner et al. [\(2001\)](#page-16-0) in their experimental investigations with HR cultures of soybean reported the differences in the response of the alcohol dehydrogenase promoter fused with the GUS gene to different treatments of cold temperature, abscisic acid, low oxygen stress and plant injury.

Gene transfer technology employing A. rhizogenes as a vector

The system of binary vector of A. rhizogenes can be well utilised to integrate foreign genes, develop gene constructs and transfer them into different plant species. This technique has already been applied in case of *Stylosanthes* (Manners and Way [1989\)](#page-15-0), potato (Visser et al. [1989\)](#page-18-0), cucumber (Trulson et al. [1986](#page-17-0)) and different crops of Cruciferae (Christey and

Sinclair [1992\)](#page-13-0). Co-integrated Ri plasmids with incorporated foreign genes are used for gene transfer in crops like tobacco (Comai et al. [1985\)](#page-13-0), tomato (Morgan et al. [1987\)](#page-16-0) and Solanum sp. (Davey et al. [1987\)](#page-13-0). Some of the useful genes like jellyfish protein gene, anthocyanin gene, genes for GUS assay, reporter genes and selectable marker genes like Hpt and NPT II are transferred (Christey [1997](#page-13-0)).

Encoding of proteins from related and unrelated taxa

Commercial utilisation of the HR cultures through insertion and gene expression of foreign genes and proteins has been done. Insertion of economically important genes from related or unrelated genera in the transformed root cultures has been achieved. It is noteworthy to mention that viral coat protein genes like that from grapevine mosaic virus were used to transform grapevine HR culture (Torregrosa and Bouquet [1997\)](#page-17-0). Similarly, transformed white clover HR culture was produced upon the transfer of pea Lectin genes (Diaz et al. [1995\)](#page-13-0).

Metabolic engineering

Manoeuvring the genetic construction of the Ri plasmid T-DNA of HR-inducing bacteria via incorporation of alien genes between the TL and TR of the Ri plasmid that code for the enzymes of the concerned metabolic pathway and then transform the plant cells with this gene construct is metabolic engineering. This method has been lucratively exercised to enhance alkaloid biosynthesis in Catharanthus roseus and in different HR cultures of solanaceous plants (Palazon et al. [2003b](#page-16-0); Moyano et al. [2003](#page-16-0)). Production of important biomolecules such as secreted embryonic alkaline phosphatase (SEAP) in human (Gaume et al. [2003\)](#page-14-0), GFP and ricin toxin B (RTB) fusion proteins (from tobacco HR cultures; Medina-Bolivar et al. [2003](#page-15-0)) and accumulation of poly-3-hydroxybutyrate (from HR cultures of sugar beet; Menzel et al. [2003](#page-15-0)), solanoside glycoside (from HR culture of Solanum khasianum; Putalun et al. [2003](#page-16-0)), etc., are some of the notable examples mentioned in the different available literature.

Biotransformation

Biotransformation deals with the conversion of naturally available phytochemicals to other biochemicals through structural changes in the original metabolite, employing plant biosystems in the process and thus creating novel and more useful biochemicals suited to the economic use of human beings. This leads to the production of second-generation pharmaceuticals which have enhanced pharmacokinetics, better solubility in biological systems and lesser toxicity. In this context, as per the review report of Banerjee et al. [\(2012\)](#page-12-0), HR cultures have proven as the beneficial cultures for carrying out this process. These cultures provide low cost, genetic stability and multi-

enzyme biosynthetic potential for this process. The different types of biochemical reactions involved in this process in the cultures are hydroxylation, glycosylation, oxidation, condensation, hydrolysis, hydrogenation, acetylations, methylations, esterifications and isomerisation of various exogenously applied substrates as seen in the findings of Giri et al. ([2001a](#page-14-0)) and Ishihara et al. [\(2003](#page-14-0)). The most commonly occurring biotransformation reaction is glucosylation or glycosylation. HR cultures of Coleus forskohlii effectively biotransformed the ethanol and methanol substrates into their respective β-D-ribohex-3-ulopyranosides and β-D-glucopyranosides (Li et al. [2003](#page-15-0)). Similarly, Chen et al. [\(2008](#page-13-0)) stated a region-selective glycosylation in HR cultures of Panax ginseng where glycosides along with glycosyl esters were produced from the two isomers of hydroxybenzoic acid. Reduction reactions were common in case of HR cultures of Daucus carota (Caron et al. [2005](#page-13-0)) and Brassica napus (Orden et al. [2006](#page-16-0)) with differential stoichiochemistry of their indigenous enzymes to the substrates. Apart from the above two reactions, HR cultures of four members from non-Asteraceae and six members from Asteraceae family exhibited a condensation reaction, producing the dimeric quinone, stilbequinone; though these reactions were rarer compared to the others. In this regard, Flores et al. ([1994](#page-13-0)) reported that the addition of Pythium aphanidermatum elicitors to the cultures biotransformed BHT to stilbequinone. Divergence in reaction responses depend upon the mother plant species that is used to initiate the culture. For instance, in the findings of Nunes et al. [\(2009](#page-16-0)), HR cultures of Levisticum officinale showed differential reaction responses to menthol and geraniol substrates. The HR cultures exhibit acetylation, isomerisation, reduction, cyclisation and oxidation reactions to the addition of geraniol whereas no reaction was seen to methanol addition. Substrates reduced were mainly carbonyl functional group conjugated with aromatic ring.

Apart from the various reaction types involved, other laboratory factors affect the efficiency of biotransformation process. The HR cultures comprising the plant families, viz. Solanaceae, Asteraceae, Campanulaceae and Araliaceae, were more responsive to biotransformation. It was mentioned in the reports that responsiveness to biotransformation was more pronounced at species level than at family level (reviewed in reports of Banerjee et al. [2012](#page-12-0)). Interestingly, it was pointed out by Nunes et al. [\(2009\)](#page-16-0) and Faria et al. [\(2009\)](#page-13-0) that the HR cultures of Levisticum officinale and Anethum graveolens, having the same taxonomic origin (same family), show differential responses of biotransformation to the same substrate. Considering the strain of the bacterium A. rhizogenes, the strains A4, ATCC 15834 and LBA 9402 proved to be more effective than others. Regarding the basal media for biotransformation studies, Murashige and Skoog [\(1962\)](#page-16-0) medium is the preferred choice. Sucrose was used as a carbon source. In case of *Datura tabula*, favourable results in biotransforming p-hydroxybenzyl alcohol into gastrodin were

obtained with supplementation of media with salicylic acid (Peng et al. [2008\)](#page-16-0). Flores et al. [\(1994](#page-13-0)) reported 20 h as the time taken for the reactions to complete; though in the findings of Peng et al. [\(2008\)](#page-16-0), the duration of up to 25 days was reported. It was reported that in most of the cases, the desired products were obtained from the media as well as the roots.

Phytoremediation

The utilisation of plants to tackle environmental pollution by the accumulation and absorption of different heavy metal ions or the polluting contaminants from the substratum and to alter those into nontoxic compounds is called phytoremediation (Suresh and Ravishankar [2004](#page-17-0)). Through recent research, it has been found that apart from the different in vivo available phytoremediator plants, the transgenically developed HR cultures are also efficient in this detoxification process. In some earlier reports (Agostini et al. [2003;](#page-12-0) Gujarathi et al. [2005\)](#page-14-0), it is mentioned that different crops like Helianthus annuus, Brassica juncea and Cichorium intybus and their respective HR cultures are efficient in cleansing up pesticides like dichlorodiphenyltrichloroethane (DDT), 2,4-dichlorophenol (2,4- DPC) and other industrial wastes.

There are different reports providing accounts of the phytoremediation technology using HR cultures. The HR is regarded as a model system since this technology allows to study the cellular responses, cell signalling, gene physiological studies and cellular abilities during countering the toxins. Not only this, HR cultures could be utilised in phytomining operations to obtain metal-enriched product from the plant biomass (Boominathan et al. [2004](#page-12-0)). Under this system, translocation of pollutants to upper parts of the plants do not take place. Quicker proliferation rates and stable genotypic and phenotypic performance of these cultures further make them favourable choices over other cell cultures. Previously mentioned, plant species like Brassica, Helianthus annuus and Alyssum are good bioaccumulators that provide valuable information regarding heavy metal ion accumulation in the rhizosphere and their subsequent management (Eapen et al. [2003;](#page-13-0) Nedelkoska and Doran [2001](#page-16-0); Soudek et al. [2006\)](#page-17-0). To deal with the inorganic and organic pollutants, the genetic architecture of the plants with respect to their ability is altered. This genetic change could be brought about by enhancing the intrinsic proteins that affect the ion accumulation and translocation. This is brought by fortification in the gene expression or by incorporation of related novel genes through biotechnology. This transformation is brought about using suitable gene constructs with plasmids that are easy to manipulate.

Citing an interesting example, Rodríguez-Llorente et al. [\(2012](#page-17-0)) reported the utilisation of transgenic HR culture in Arabidopsis thaliana to phytoremediate inorganic pollutants through the expression of Cu-binding periplasmic protein (CopC). The organic pollutants were countered via in vitro HR culture of Atropa belladonna showing the expression of a rabbit P4502E1 enzyme (Banerjee et al. [2002\)](#page-12-0). Similar investigations were reported in experimental results of Wevar Oller et al. [\(2005\)](#page-18-0) as well as Sosa Alderete et al. ([2009](#page-17-0)) wherein tobacco and tomato HR cultures expressed a basic peroxidase enzyme to detoxify phenolic compounds more efficiently than natural-type HR. Thus, the concept 'supertransgenic plants through multi-transgene strategy' was put forward (Macek et al. [2008\)](#page-15-0). Hence, the potential of HR culture for further biotechnological interventions is explored.

Production of novel compounds or proteins

An accrual of conjugates of flavonoid glucoside in the HR cultures of Scutellaria baicalensis Georgi. was detected when compared to the normally occurring conjugates of glucose as observed in the normal root cultures (Nishikawa and Ishimaru [1997\)](#page-16-0).

Bringing out structural changes in the metabolite

Incorporation and subsequent expression of Antirrhinum dihydroflavonol genes in the HR cultures of Lotus corniculatus led to changes in the structure of condensed tannin and their increased accumulation in the HR (Bavage et al. [1997](#page-12-0)). Similar instances of improved metabolite production through genetic changes in the metabolism were mentioned in the reports of Berlin et al. ([1993](#page-12-0)) wherein the TDC gene segment from periwinkle (Catharanthus roseus) was overexpressed in the HR cultures of Peganum harmala that resulted in increased TDC activity. Hashimoto et al. [\(1993\)](#page-14-0) testified that the constitutive expression of the H6H gene transferred from Hyoscyamus niger to Atropa belladonna led to the conversion of hyoscyamine to scopolamine in the root tissues.

Whole plant regeneration

It has been reviewed by Hu and Du [\(2006\)](#page-14-0) that through the addition of appropriate PGRs like 2,4-dichlorophenoxyacetic acid $(2,4-D)$, α -naphthaleneacetic acid (NAA) and 6benzylaminopurine (BAP) in the medium, the HR could be induced to produce shoots and somatic embryos. For instance, it was reported that the addition of 7.5–10 mg 2,4-D into the media led to the generation of somatic embryos in the HR cultures of Astragalus sinicus (Cho and Wildholm [2002\)](#page-13-0).

Promoting root formation in vegetative propagation

For the successful perpetuation through vegetative propagation, rooting is an important aspect. So, HR culture technology could be utilised to promote rooting in many of the recalcitrant crops like apple, peaches, olive, Pinus spp. and Larix spp. (McAfee et al. [1993;](#page-15-0) Bosselut et al. [2011\)](#page-12-0). This is brought about by the introduction of the Ri plasmid 'rol' genes of A. rhizogenes into the host plant genome (Rugini and Mariotti [1991\)](#page-17-0).

Study of the rhizosphere and culturing of beneficial obligate parasites

By developing an efficient root system in different plants, the study of root morphology, functions and rhizosphere effects as well as plant–microorganism interactions can be performed. Functions and the role of some secondary phytochemicals in influencing the soil bacteria could also be studied. HR cultures can be utilised for the culturing of beneficial fungi like the mycorrhiza. Some of the examples mentioned are Glomus mosseae and Gigaspora margarita fungi on the HR of Convolvulus sepium L. (Mugnier and Musse [1987](#page-16-0)). These root cultures can also be used for host–pathogen interaction especially the soil-borne pathogens. Cai et al. [\(1997](#page-12-0)) were successful in their experiments on developing resistance in sugar beet to beet cyst nematode (Heterodera schachtii Schmidt) by transforming susceptible sugar beet HR cultures with the Hs_1^{prod} gene. Further investigations regarding the outcomes of different other pesticides and chemical on roots and root-interacting microorganisms (both beneficial and harmful) can be done (reviewed by Eapen and Mitra [2001\)](#page-13-0).

Scaling-up process

For up-scaled commercialisation of HR cultures for pharmaceutical implementations, a scaling-up process is important. There has been significant progress in the field of scaling-up process of the HR biosystems with respect to their economic uplift and industry-based research and development. A varied number of bioreactors have surfaced with proficient management facilities and with improved scientific outlook. The exclusive aim of these commercial exploitations is to maximise the benefits derived from the economically invaluable phytochemicals which possess immense ethnobotanical and therapeutic uses. Conventional fermentors are rather unsuitable. There are certain important factors to be kept in mind regarding the setting up of HR bioreactor systems. It has to be borne in mind that prolonged sustenance of cultures in reactor units is vital to the profitable harvest of biochemicals. Various results from different workers show that proper aeration of the culture medium (in case of liquid cultures) is crucial for better circulation, uptake of nutrients and effectual economic product biosynthesis as it optimises oxygen–carbon dioxide balance (Bhojwani and Razdan [1996\)](#page-12-0). HR cultures thrive better in suitable support systems. Varied resources put into use are polyurethane foam (Steingroewer et al. [2013\)](#page-17-0), nylon mesh (Gangopadhyay et al. [2011\)](#page-14-0) and stainless steel base (Srivastava and Srivastava [2012\)](#page-17-0). Angelini et al. [\(2011\)](#page-12-0)

mention the use of nylon mesh in HR bioreactors for phytoremediation studies.

Hence, the following must be kept in mind: distinctive morphological structure of HR, oxygen requirements, etc.; different bioreactors like air-sparged reactors (Taya et al. [1989;](#page-17-0) Rodriguez-Mendiola et al. [1991\)](#page-17-0); nutrient sprinkle bioreactor (Kuźma et al. [2009\)](#page-15-0); stirred tank reactors (Davioud et al. [1989;](#page-13-0) Kondo et al. [1989](#page-15-0); Hilton and Rhodes [1990;](#page-14-0) Cardillo et al. [2010;](#page-13-0) Rahimi et al. [2012](#page-16-0)); mechanically driven bioreactors, viz. rotary drum reactors and turbine blade reactors (Kondo et al. [1989;](#page-15-0) Mitchell et al. [2006](#page-16-0)); immobilised bioreactors like trickle-bed reactors (Flores and Curtis [1992](#page-13-0)); nutrient mist bioreactor (Huang et al. [2004\)](#page-14-0); pneumatically driven bioreactors, viz. airlift balloon bioreactors (Ali et al. [2007](#page-12-0)); bubble column reactors (Hilton and Rhodes [1990;](#page-14-0) Rodriguez-Mendiola et al. [1991;](#page-17-0) Kwok and Doran [1995;](#page-15-0) Ludwig-Müller et al. [2008;](#page-15-0) Georgiev et al. [2012\)](#page-14-0); etc. However, the response to these bioreactors is species specific. For instance, HR cultures of Artemisia annua exhibit sustenance for longer period in inner-loop airlift bioreactor (Liu et al. [1998](#page-15-0)). Apart from this, airlift reactors (in case of Solanum chrysotrichum) and mist reactors are also used (Caspeta et al. [2005](#page-13-0)). In the experimental investigations of Ramakrishnan and Curtis [\(2004\)](#page-16-0) and Suresh et al. ([2005](#page-17-0)), it was stated that in mist reactors, HR cultures were hung to a mesh support, thereby reducing the amount of culture media and also obtaining the desired phytochemical in concentrated form. The latter method is widely used by the ROOTec Company. As a cost-effective approach, 'rhizosecretion' of the phytochemicals could be achieved by integration of the plant-based hydroponic system with the HR culture system (Gaume et al. [2003](#page-14-0)).

Computer graphics–based mathematical simulation modelling tactics are deployed to address the various culture-related issues of HR in bioreactors. Srivastava and Srivastava [\(2006](#page-17-0)) opined that this mathematical calculative strategy can greatly help researchers in finding the best possible combination of micronutrients and macronutrients for HR growth in bioreactors, leading to time economy and averting resource wastage. Under practical conditions in general due to the dynamicity of the plant cellular organs, exact estimation of the growth kinetics is not possible. Hence to maximise precision, different workers have put forward different models, viz. Patra and Srivastava ([2015](#page-16-0)) in Artemisia annua and Thakore et al. [\(2015](#page-17-0)) in Catharanthus roseus. Mairet et al. [\(2010\)](#page-15-0) in their investigative reports have recommended different models to characterise HR culture, viz. branching model (based on root differentiation), metabolic model (based on differential metabolic processes) and oxygen-limited growth kinetic model (based on oxygen concentration in the culture).

Of late, bioreactors with novel prototypes have been put into use to improvise the pharmaceutical applications of HR culture as secondary biochemical resources. Some of the reactor systems worth mentioning are hydraulically driven bioreactors—wave-mixed bioreactors (Huang and McDonald [2012](#page-14-0)), temporary immersion bioreactors (Ducos et al. [2009\)](#page-13-0), microbioreactors (Diao et al. [2008\)](#page-13-0), ebb-andflow regime bioreactors (Cuello and Yue [2008\)](#page-13-0) and slug bubble bioreactors (Kantarci et al. [2005\)](#page-15-0).

Constraints encountered

Despite many lucrative advantages, HR culture technology is fraught with many problems and hindrances (Ibañez et al. [2016\)](#page-14-0). General problems encountered during the culturing are as follows.

Probable chromosomal aberrations

Progressive reduction in the chromosome numbers in cultures of Onobrychis viciifolia Scop. was noticed over a subculturing period ranging from 4 to 8 months. The chromosome number of normal somatic cells $(2n = 28)$ was found in 4.1% of cells (Hu and Du [2006\)](#page-14-0).

Genetic changes leading to gene suppression

Silencing of gene expression at later stages of subculturing in tryptophan decarboxylase (TDC) and strictosidine synthase (STR) transformed Cinchona officinalis L. cultures despite earlier prolific expression levels (Greerlings et al. [1999](#page-14-0)). An increase in the copy number of transgenes also may lead to poor gene expression levels, leading to less harvest of a desired metabolite as noticed in HR induction experiments of Catharanthus roseus transformed with hamster HMGR cDNA producing higher campesterol and serpentine but altered levels of ajmaline and catharanthine amongst the clones (Ayora-Talavera et al. [2002\)](#page-12-0).

Regenerants showing morphological alterations

As per the available literature, the transgenic regenerants exhibit changes like wrinkled and variegated leaves, plagiotrophic rooting, altered apical dominance and poor plant stature (Tepfer [1984](#page-17-0); Tayler et al. [1985](#page-17-0); Cardarelli et al. [1987](#page-13-0); Spano et al. [1988;](#page-17-0) Hamamoto et al. [1990](#page-14-0)). Also, leaf asymmetry and shortened shoot length have also been reported. These changes may be genetically occurring due to inaccuracy in transgene insertion and somaclonal variations (Han et al. [1993\)](#page-14-0).

Overexpression of gene might not always give the expected exponential biochemical production

This condition was noticed in the experimental findings of Koehle et al. [\(2002\)](#page-15-0) in case of HR cultures of Lithospermum erythrorhizon Sieb. showing no further increment in shikonin production.

Related species exhibit differential production of secondary metabolite

HR cultures of two related genera (Datura metel and Hyoscyamus muticus) produce differential tropane alkaloids (Moyano et al. [2003](#page-16-0)). Also, the background genotypic constitution of the plants may impinge on the transgene expression, as seen in the HR cultures of L. corniculatus (Carron et al. [1994\)](#page-13-0).

Problems faced during phytoremediation

Problems of the HR cultures to tackle the fluctuating environmental changes in view of the quantity, volume and form of pollutants were generated out into the environment (Khandare and Govindwar [2015](#page-15-0)). Also, the results of this technique in field level differ significantly compared to the laboratory conditions (Angelini et al. [2011](#page-12-0)). Lack of appropriate infrastructure and skilled personnel is also a problem for large-scale operation.

Application with cutting-edge technologies

Over recent years, transcriptome sequencing has surfaced as an innovative biotechnological advancement in improvising the field of HR culture technology with respect to the illumination of the complex internal biosynthetic processes of phytometabolite production in the HR cultures, thereby facilitating their establishment, biofortification and enhanced secondary metabolite extraction. Bolger et al. [\(2014\)](#page-12-0) and Chaudhary and Sharma [\(2016\)](#page-13-0) in their reports mention about the boom in the scientific technology due to the advent of these next-generation technologies of polynucleotide sequencing. HR cultures of different plants of medicinal value have been analysed using this technology such as *Panax* ginseng (Cao et al. [2015](#page-13-0)), Astragalus membranaceus (Tuan et al. [2015](#page-17-0)), Salvia miltiorrhiza (Gao et al. [2014](#page-14-0); Xu et al. [2015\)](#page-18-0) and Rehmannia glutinosa (Wang et al. [2017\)](#page-18-0). The generally used NGS methods were Illumina/Solexa and Roche 454. From the investigations of Yamazaki et al. ([2013\)](#page-18-0) in Ophiorrhiza pumila HR culture, the information generated from the sequencing of the cellular transcripts using Illumina/Solexa revealed the metabolic mechanism of camptothecin production. Similarly, Illumina techniques

coupled with RT-qPCR were employed in Catharanthus roseus to expound the effects of overexpression of anthranilate synthase in the HR culture (Sun et al. [2016](#page-17-0)). In Centella asiatica, it was found that cytochrome P450 hydroxylase and carboxylase are involved in the production of metabolic intermediates which ultimately yield the products asiaticosides and madecassosides (in reports of Kim et al. [2014](#page-15-0)). In view of this, transcriptome sequencing provides itself as an innovative way out for studying the various metabolism pathways of phytometabolite production in the HR cultures in view of its high-throughput data generation and effective and quicker characterisation of transcriptomic information.

The scaling-up process of the laboratory-based HR cultures requires efficient and meticulous monitoring and supervision of the cultures in the bioreactors so as to harness the invaluable secondary phytobiometabolites. Effective utilisation of the HR cultures under traditional methods are arduous, time consuming and prone to mismanagement. Hence, in sight of this, modern methods based on in silico simulation modelling are developed to speed up and ease out the pharmaceutical utilisations of the HR cultures. Amongst the various recently published works, different models utilised for HR culture are Box–Behnken design (BBD) in Isatis tinctoria for secondary metabolite studies (Gai et al. [2015a,](#page-14-0) [b\)](#page-14-0), artificial neural network systems in Rauwolfia serpentina (Mehrotra et al. [2013\)](#page-15-0) for biosystem productivity studies and in Artemisia annua (Osama et al. [2013\)](#page-16-0) for evaluation studies on the influences of different bioreactors on HR growth and agent-based modelling in Beta vulgaris to study the root morphological parameters (Lenk et al. [2014](#page-15-0)). Most of the modelling studies aim at evaluation of various growth factors and subsequent setting up of an optimised protocol for HR cultures in bioreactors. In Catharanthus roseus, statistical design was used to study media condition effects on HR development (Bhadra and Shanks [1995\)](#page-12-0). Similar mathematical modelling method was practised in Azadirachta indica HR to infer about the biomass growth of HR culture affected by differential oxygen and mass transfer rates (Palavalli et al. [2012](#page-16-0)). Morphological assessments centred on root branching (Kim et al. [1995](#page-15-0)) and root elongation (Bastian et al. [2008\)](#page-12-0) studies were also done. Regulation of mist in the mist reactors is a crucial factor. Both longer and shorter durations of mist lead to nutrient choking. Ranjan et al. [\(2009](#page-16-0)), in their investigations, formulated a mathematical way-out model to optimise the mist bioreactor specifications. An up-to-date response surface methodology (RSM) technology combining statistical and mathematical method has been developed. In the published reports of Amdoun et al. [\(2009,](#page-12-0) [2010](#page-12-0)), this modelling tool finds its application in Datura stramonium HR culture for estimating the influences of media composition and metal ion media additives for hyoscyamine enhancement. Another dependable and noteworthy technique is the genetic algorithm technology. Arab et al. [\(2016\)](#page-12-0) attested in their reports that this computer science–based methodology

utilises the principle of survival of the fittest and natural selection which is experimentally achieved through stochastic sampling. Using population parameters, this heuristic technique finds remedies to problems of HR biosystem growth limitations such as media optimisation and root biomass– affecting factors. In silico image analysis tool facilitates researchers to develop a two-dimensional image diagram of HR. In this context, a number of software are available such as WinRHIZO, ROOTEDGE and PetriCam. Findings of Flavel et al. [\(2017\)](#page-13-0) demonstrate an improvement in the precision of their experiments upon using this tool. Lenk et al. [\(2012\)](#page-15-0) have testified that by using this technology, the secondary phytobiometabolite production can be determined through root morphology surveillance. Thus, it is seen that these computer-defined approaches help researchers in studying the growth patterns and morpho-physiological responses of the HR systems.

Genome editing has become more lucrative in recent times with the discovery of CRISPR/Cas9 (clustered regularly interspaced short palindromic repeats/CRISPR-associated nuclease 9) technology. This biotechnological tool along with metabolic engineering has found profitable utilisations in HR cultures, enabling researchers to study the gene functions and related biometabolite production pathways. Published results of Ron et al. ([2014](#page-17-0)) mentioned that genetic architecture of HR cultures of tomato was amended, employing this technique, wherein varied deletion and insertion mutations were observed in the SHR (SHORTROOT) gene which led to phenotypic changes in the HR. Similar gene-editing exploits were carried out in soybean SHR and FE12 genes present in situ along with foreign bar gene segment (Cai et al. [2015](#page-13-0)). Jacobs et al. ([2015](#page-14-0)) in their findings in soybean state that this genetic engineering tool can also be applied to make amends in the genes in homeologous chromosomes in polyploids. The target gene CPS1 in Salvia miltiorrhiza was metabolically engineered through CRISPR/ Cas9 using AtU6-26SK, 35S-Cas9-SK and pCambia1300 vectors (Li et al. [2017](#page-15-0)).

Conclusion and prospects

HR culture technology has been developed into an exciting biotechnological tool for researchers. Despite the occurrence of problems like chromosomal changes and fluctuating harvest of desired biochemical, the cultures are easily manageable, genetically stable than the cell suspension cultures and fast proliferating and provide a lot of pharmaceutical exploration. It also provides for the protection of the plants of medicinal value with respect to their demand for the biosynthesis of invaluable medicinal products by acting as an effectual way out for the secondary metabolite production. Regarding the commercial approaches, a more scientific outlook for cost-

effectiveness and sustained production is required. A lot of research and investigation have already undergone in this concerned sector of biotechnology spanning over the past 25 years. Various aspects like the metabolic engineering, largescale secondary metabolite production and their enhancement through elicitation studies, studies on host–microorganism interactions through roots, genetic transformation, applying techniques of phytoremediation and biotransformation to produce novel biomolecules, utilising novel biotechnological tools like transcriptome sequencing studies, in silico simulation modelling technologies, mathematical modelling for HR biosystem studies and CRISPR-Cas9 technology for enhanced phytometabolite synthesis were dealt with. Despite extensive research, a lot still requires to be explored to extract the wholesome prospects of HR cultures for crop improvement.

Acknowledgements The authors acknowledge the e-library assistance from the Bidhan Chandra Krishi Viswavidyalaya, West Bengal, India, and are further thankful to the anonymous reviewer(s) and the editor of this article for their critical comments and suggestions on the manuscript.

Authors' contribution SG conceived the idea of the review. SG and EM surveyed the literature and drafted the initial manuscript. SG scrutinised and corrected the manuscript to its final version. Both the authors read and approved the final version of the manuscript prior to its submission.

Compliance with ethical standards

Conflict of interest The authors declare that they have no conflict of interest.

Ethical approval This article does not contain any studies with human participants or animals performed by any of the authors.

References

- Abdelkader MAS, Lockwood GB (2011) Volatile oils from the plant and hairy root cultures of Ageratum conyzoides L. Nat Prod Res 25:909–917
- Agostini E, Coniglio MS, Milrad SR, Tigier HA, Giulietti AM (2003) Phytoremediation of 2,4-dichlorophenol by Brassica napus hairy root cultures. Biotechnol Appl Biochem 37:139–144
- Ahlawat S, Saxena P, Ram M, Alam P, Nafis T, Mohd A, Abdin MZ (2012) Influence of Agrobacterium rhizogenes on induction of hairy roots for enhanced production of artemisinin in Artemisia annua L. plants. Afr J Biotechnol 11:8684–8691
- Ali MB, Hahn EJ, Paek KY (2007) Methyl jasmonate and salicylic acid induced oxidative stress and accumulation of phenolics in Panax ginseng bioreactor root suspension cultures. Molecules 12:607–621
- Amdoun R, Khelifi L, Khelifi-Slaoui M, Amroune S, Asch M, Assaf-Ducrocq C, Gontier E (2010) Optimization of the culture medium composition to improve the production of hyoscyamine in elicited Datura stramonium L. hairy roots using the response surface methodology (RSM). Int J Mol Sci 11:4726–4740
- Amdoun R, Khelifi L, Khelifi-Slaoui M, Amroune S, Benyoussef EH, Thi DV, Assaf-Ducrocq C, Gontier E (2009) Influence of minerals and elicitation on Datura stramonium L. tropane alkaloid

production: modelization of the in vitro biochemical response. Plant Sci 177:81–87

- Angelini VA, Orejas J, Medina MI, Agostini E (2011) Scale up of 2,4 dichlorophenol removal from aqueous solutions using Brassica napus hairy roots. J Hazard Mater 185:269–274
- Ansari MA, Chung IM, Rajakumar G, Alzohairy MA, Almatroudi A, Khanna VG, Thiruvengadam M (2019) Evaluation of polyphenolic compounds and pharmacological activities in hairy root cultures of Ligularia fischeri Turcz. f. spiciformis (Nakai). Molecules 24:1586
- Arab MM, Yadollahi A, Shojaeiyan A, Ahmadi H (2016) Artificial neural network genetic algorithm as powerful tool to predict and optimize in vitro proliferation mineral medium for $G \times N15$ rootstock. Front Plant Sci 7:1526
- Arroo RRJ, Develi A, Meijers H, Van de Westerlo E, Kemp AK, Croes AF (1995) Effect of exogenous auxin on root morphology and secondary metabolism in Tagetes patula hairy root cultures. Physiol Plant 93:233–240
- Ayora-Talavera T, Chappell J, Lozoya-Gloria E, Loyola-Vargas VM (2002) Overexpression in Catharanthus roseus hairy roots of a truncated hamster 3-hydroxy-3-methylglutaryl-CoA reductase gene. Appl Biochem Biotechnol 97:135–145
- Azlan GJ, Marziah M, Radzali M, Johari R (2002) Establishment of Physalis minima hairy roots culture for the production of physalins. Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult 69:271–278
- Bais HP, Vepachedu R, Vivanco JM (2003) Root specific elicitation and exudation of fluorescent [beta]-carbolines in transformed root cultures of Oxalis tuberosa. Plant Physiol Biochem 41:345–353
- Banerjee S, Shang TQ, Wilson AM, Moore AL, Strand SE, Gordon MP, Doty SL (2002) Expression of functional mammalian P450 2E1 in hairy root cultures. Biotechnol Bioeng 77:462–466
- Banerjee S, Singh S, Rahman LU (2012) Biotransformation studies using hairy root cultures – a review. Biotechnol Adv 30:461–468
- Bastian P, Chavarría-Krauser A, Engwer C, Jäger W, Marnach S, Ptashnyk M (2008) Modelling in vitro growth of dense root networks. J Theor Biol 254:99–109
- Bavage AD, Davies IG, Robbins MP, Morris P (1997) Expression of an Antirrhinum dihydroflavonol reductase gene results in changes in condensed tannin structure and accumulation in root cultures of Lotus corniculatus (bird's foot trefoil). Plant Mol Biol 35:443–458
- Berlin J, Ruegenhagen NC, Dietze P, Fecker LF, Goddijn OJM, Hoge JHC (1993) Increased production of serotonin by suspension and root cultures of Peganum harmala transformed with a tryptophan decarboxylase cDNA clone from Catharanthus roseus. Transgenic Res 2:336–344
- Bhadra R, Shanks JV (1995) Statistical design of the effect of inoculum conditions on growth of hairy root cultures of Catharanthus roseus. Biotechnol Tech 9:681–686
- Bhojwani SS, Razdan MK (1996) Tissue culture media. In: Bhojwani SS, Razdan MK (eds) Plant tissue culture: theory and practice. Elsevier, Amsterdam, pp 39–62
- Bolger ME, Weisshaar B, Scholz U, Stein N, Usadel B, Mayer KFX (2014) Plant genome sequencing – applications for crop improvement. Curr Opin Biotechnol 26:31–37
- Boominathan R, Saha-Chaudhury NM, Sahajwalla V, Doran PM (2004) Production of nickel bio-ore from hyperaccumulator plant biomass: applications in phytomining. Biotechnol Bioeng 86:243–250
- Bosselut N, Van Ghelder C, Claverie M, Voisin R, Onesto JP, Rosso MN, Esmenjaud D (2011) Agrobacterium rhizogenes-mediated transformation of Prunus as an alternative for gene functional analysis in hairy-roots and composite plants. Plant Cell Rep 30:1313
- Cai D, Kleine M, Kifle S, Harloff HJ, Sandal NN, Marcker KA, Klein-Lankhorst RM, Salentijn EMJ, Lange W, Steikema WJ, Wyss U, Grundler FMW, Jung C (1997) Positional cloning of a gene for nematode resistance in sugar-beet. Science 275:832–834
- Cai Y, Chen L, Liu X, Sun S, Wu C, Jiang B, Han T, Hou W (2015) CRISPR/Cas9-mediated genome editing in soybean hairy roots. PLoS One 10:e0136064
- Cao H, Nuruzzaman M, Xiu H, Huang J, Wu K, Chen X, Li J, Jeong JH, Park SJ, Yang F, Luo J, Luo Z (2015) Transcriptome analysis of methyl jasmonate elicited Panax ginseng adventitious roots to discover putative ginsenoside biosynthesis and transport genes. Int J Mol Sci 16:3035–3057
- Cardarelli M, Spano L, Mariotti D, Mauro ML, Van-Slyus MA, Costantino P (1987) The role of auxin in hairy root induction. Mol Gen Genet 208:457–463
- Cardillo AB, Otálvaro AÁM, Busto VD, Talou JR, Velásquez LME, Giulietti AM (2010) Scopolamine, anisodamine and hyoscyamine production by Brugmansia candida hairy root cultures in bioreactors. Process Biochem 45:1577–1581
- Caron D, Coughlan AP, Simard M, Bernier J, Piche Y, Chenevert R (2005) Stereoselective reduction of ketones by Daucus carota hairy root cultures. Biotechnol Lett 27:713–716
- Carron TR, Robbins MP, Morris P (1994) Genetic modification of condensed tannin biosynthesis in Lotus corniculatus. 1. Heterologous antisense dihydroflavonol reductase down-regulates tannin accumulation in hairy root cultures. Theor Appl Genet 87:1006–1015
- Caspeta L, Quintero R, Villarreal ML (2005) Novel airlift reactor fitting for hairy root cultures: developmental and performance studies. Biotechnol Prog 21:735–740
- Chang CK, Chang KS, Lin YC, Liu SY, Chen CY (2005) Hairy root cultures of Gynostemma pentaphyllum (Thunb.) Makino: a promising approach for the production of gypenosides as an alternative of ginseng saponins. Biotechnol Lett 27:1165–1169
- Chaudhary S, Sharma PC (2016) Next generation sequencing-based exploration of genomes and transcriptomes of medicinal plants. Indian J Plant Physiol 21:489–503
- Chen X, Zhang J, Liu JH, Yu BY (2008) Biotransformation of p-, m-, and o-hydroxybenzoic acids by Panax ginseng hairy root cultures. J Mol Catal B Enzym 54:72–75
- Cheruvathur MK, Jose B, Thomas TD (2015) Rhinacanthin production from hairy root cultures of Rhinacanthus nasutus (L.) Kurz. In Vitro Cell Dev Biol—Plant 51:420–427
- Chilton MD, Tepfer DA, Petit A, David C, Casse-Delbart F, Tempe J (1982) Agrobacterium rhizogenes inserts T-DNA into the genomes of the host plant root cells. Nature 295:432–434
- Cho HJ, Wildholm JM (2002) Improved shoot regeneration protocol for hairy roots of the legume Astragalus sinicus. Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult 69:259–269
- Christen P, Aoki T, Shimomura K (1992) Characteristics of growth and tropane alkaloid production in Hyoscyamus albus hairy roots transformed with Agrobacterium rhizogenes A4. Plant Cell Rep 11:597–600
- Christey MC (1997) Transgenic crop plants using Agrobacterium rhizogenes mediated transformation. In: Doran PM (ed) Hairy roots culture and applications. Hardwood Acad Pub, Australis, pp 99–111
- Christey MC, Sinclair BK (1992) Regeneration of transgenic kale (Brassica oleracea var. acephala), rape (B. napus) and turnip (B. campestris var. rapifera) plants via Agrobacterium rhizogenes mediated transformation. Plant Sci 87:161–169
- Comai L, Facciotti D, Hiatt WR, Thompson G, Rose RE, Stalker DM (1985) Expression in plants of a mutant aroA gene from Salmonella typhimurium confers tolerance to glyphosate. Nature 317:741–744
- Cuello JL, Yue LC (2008) Ebb-and-flow bioreactor regime and electrical elicitation: novel strategies for hairy root biochemical production. Electron J Integr Biosci 3:45–56
- Das A, Sarkar S, Bhattacharyya S, Gantait S (2020) Biotechnological advancements in Catharanthus roseus (L.) G. Don. Appl Microbiol Biotechnol 104:4811–4835
- Davey MR, Mulligan BJ, Gartland KMA, Peel E, Sargent AW, Morgan AJ (1987) Transformation of Solanum and Nicotiana species using an R_1 plasmid vector. J Exp Bot 38:1507-1516
- Davioud E, Kan C, Hamon J, Tempe J, Husson JP (1989) Production of indole alkaloids by in vitro root cultures of Catharanthus trichophyllus. Phytochemistry 28:2675–2680
- Dehghan E, Häkkinen ST, Oksman-Caldentey KM, Ahmadi FS (2012) Production of tropane alkaloids in diploid and tetraploid plants and in vitro hairy root cultures of Egyptian henbane (Hyoscyamus muticus L.). Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult 110:35–44
- Dhakulkar S, Ganapathi TR, Bhargava S, Bapat VA (2005) Induction of hairy roots in Gmelina arborea Roxb. and production of verbascoside in hairy roots. Plant Sci 169:812–818
- Diao J, Young L, Zhou P, Shuler ML (2008) An actively mixed minibioreactor for protein production from suspended animal cells. Biotechnol Bioeng 100:72–81
- Diaz CL, Logman TJJ, Stam HC, Kijne JW (1995) Sugar-binding activity of pea lectin expressed in white clover hairy roots. Plant Physiol 109:1167–1177
- Drewes FE, Staden JV (1995) Initiation of and solasodine production in hairy root cultures of Solanum mauritianum Scop. Plant Growth Regul 17:27–31
- Drobot KO, Matvieieva NA, Ostapchuk AM, Kharkhota MA (2017) Study of artemisinin and sugars accumulation in Artemisia vulgaris and Artemisia dracunculus "hairy" root cultures. Prep Biochem Biotechnol 47:776–781
- Ducos JP, Terrier B, Courtois D (2009) Disposable bioreactors for plant micropropagation and mass plant cell culture. In: Eibl R, Eibl D (eds) Disposable bioreactors, Advances in biochemical engineering/biotechnology, vol 115. Springer, Berlin/Heidelberg, pp 89–115
- Eapen S, Mitra R (2001) Plant hairy root cultures: prospects and limitations. Proc Indian Natl Sci Acad 67:107–120
- Eapen S, Suseelan KN, Tivarekar S, Kotwal SA, Mitra R (2003) Potential for rhizofiltration of uranium using hairy root cultures of Brassica juncea and Chenopodium amaranticolor. Environ Res 91:127–133
- Ebrahimi S, Zaker A, Abrishamchi P, Bahrami AR, Ganjeali A, Sodagar N (2017) Hairy root induction and secondary metabolite production in Perovskia abrotanoides Karel. J Plant Process Funct 6:17–26
- Erst AA, Zibareva LN, Filonenko ES, Zheleznichenko TV (2019) Influence of methyl jasmonate on production of ecdysteroids from hairy roots of Silene linicola CC Gmelin. Russ J Bioorg Chem 45: 920–926
- Farag S, Kayser O (2015) Cannabinoids production by hairy root cultures of Cannabis sativa L. Am J Plant Sci 6:1–10
- Faria JMS, Nunes IS, Figueiredo AC, Pedro LG, Trindade H, Barroso JG (2009) Biotransformation of menthol and geraniol by hairy root cultures of Anethum graveolens: effect on growth and volatile components. Biotechnol Lett 31:897–903
- Fattahi M, Nazeri V, Torras-Claveria L, Sefidkon F, Cusido RM, Zamani Z, Palazon J (2013) A new biotechnological source of rosmarinic acid and surface flavonoids: hairy root cultures of Dracocephalum kotschyi Boiss. Ind Crop Prod 50:256–263
- Figlan S, Makunga NP (2017) Genetic transformation of the medicinal plant Salvia runcinata L. f. using Agrobacterium rhizogenes. S Afr J Bot 112:193–202
- Flavel RJ, Guppy CN, Rabbi SMR, Young IM (2017) An image processing and analysis tool for identifying and analysing complex plant root systems in 3D soil using non-destructive analysis: Root1. PLoS One 12:e0176433
- Flores HE, Curtis WR (1992) Approaches to understanding and manipulating the biosynthetic potential of plant roots. Ann N Y Acad Sci 665:188–209
- Flores HE, Dai YR, Freyer AJ, Michaels PJ (1994) Biotransformation of menthol and geraniol by hairy root cultures. Plant Physiol Biochem 32:511–519
- Fu X, Yin ZP, Chen JG, Shangguan XC, Wang X, Zhang QF, Peng DY (2015) Production of chlorogenic acid and its derivatives in hairy root cultures of Stevia rebaudiana. J Agric Food Chem 63:262–268
- Furze JM, Rhodes MJC, Parr AJ, Robins RJ, Withehead IM, Threlfall DR (1991) Abiotic factors elicit sesquiterpenoid phytoalexin production but not alkaloid production in transformed root cultures of Datura stramonium. Plant Cell Rep 10:111–114
- Gai QY, Jiao J, Luo M, Wang W, Ma W, Zu YG, Fu YJ (2015a) Establishment of high-productive Isatis tinctoria L. hairy root cultures: a promising approach for efficient production of bioactive alkaloids. Biochem Eng J 95:37–47
- Gai QY, Jiao J, Luo M, Wei ZF, Zu YG, Ma W, Fu YJ (2015b) Establishment of hairy root cultures by Agrobacterium rhizogenes mediated transformation of Isatis tinctoria L. for the efficient production of flavonoids and evaluation of antioxidant activities. PLoS One 10:e0119022
- Gangopadhyay M, Dewanjee S, Bhattacharya S (2011) Enhanced plumbagin production in elicited Plumbago indica hairy root cultures. J Biosci Bioeng 111:706–710
- Gangopadhyay M, Gantait S, Palchoudhury S, Ali MN, Mondal C, Pal AK (2016) UVC-priming mediated modulation of forskolin biosynthesis key genes against Macrophomina root rot of Coleus forskohlii- a tissue culture based sustainable approach. Phytochem Lett 17:36–44
- Gantait S, Mandal N, Das PK (2011) In vitro accelerated mass propagation and ex vitro evaluation of Aloe vera L. with aloin content and superoxide dismutase activity. Nat Prod Res 25:1370–1378
- Gantait S, Mitra M, Chen J-T (2020) Biotechnological interventions for ginsenosides production. Biomolecules 10:538
- Gao W, Sun HX, Xiao H, Cui G, Hillwig ML, Jackson A, Wang X, Shen Y, Zhao N, Zhang L, Wang XJ, Peters RJ, Huang L (2014) Combining metabolomics and transcriptomics to characterize tanshinone biosynthesis in Salvia miltiorrhiza. BMC Genomics 15:73
- Gaume A, Komarnytsky S, Borisjuk N, Raskin I (2003) Rhizosecretion of recombinant proteins from plant hairy roots. Plant Cell Rep 21: 1188–1193
- Georgiev MI, Ludwig-Miller J, Alipieva K, Lippert A (2011) Sonicationassisted Agrobacterium rhizogenes-mediated transformation of Verbascum xanthophoeniceum Griseb. for bioactive metabolite accumulation. Plant Cell Rep 30:859–866
- Georgiev VG, Bley T, Pavlov AI (2012) Bioreactors for the cultivation of red beet hairy roots. In: Neelwarne B (ed) Red beet biotechnology. Springer, Boston, pp 251–281
- Giri A, Dhingra V, Giri CC, Singh A, Ward OP, Narasu ML (2001a) Biotransformations using plant cells, organ cultures and enzyme systems: current trends and future prospects. Biotechnol Adv 19: 175–199
- Giri A, Ravindra ST, Dhingra V, Narasu ML (2001b) Influence of different strains of Agrobacterium rhizogenes on induction of hairy roots and artemisinin production in Artemisia annua. Curr Sci 81: 378–382
- Goel MK, Goel S, Banerjee S, Shanker K, Kukreja AK (2010) Agrobacterium rhizogenes mediated transformed roots of Rauwolfia serpentina for reserpine biosynthesis. Med Arom Plant Sci Biotechnol 4:8–14
- Greerlings A, Hallard D, Martinez CA, Lopes CI, Heijden RV, Verpoorte R (1999) Alkaloid production by a Cinchona officinalis 'Ledgeriana' hairy root culture containing constitutive expression constructs of tryptophan decarboxylase and strictosidine synthase cDNAs from Catharanthus roseus. Plant Cell Rep 18:191–196
- Grzegorczyk-Karolak I, Kuźma Ł, Skała E, Kiss A (2018) Hairy root cultures of Salvia viridis L. for production of polyphenolic compounds. Ind Crop Prod 117:235–244
- Guillon S, Trémouillaux-Guiller J, Pati PK, Rideau M, Gantet P (2006) Hairy root research: recent scenario and exciting prospects. Curr Opin Plant Biol 9:341–346
- Gujarathi NP, Haney BJ, Park HJ, Wickramasinghe SR, Linden JC (2005) Hairy roots of Helianthus annuus: a model system to study phytoremediation of tetracycline and oxytetracycline. Biotechnol Prog 21:775–780
- Gupta R, Pandey P, Singh S, Singh DK, Saxena A, Luqman S, Bawankule DU, Banerjee S (2016) Advances in Boerhaavia diffusa hairy root technology: a valuable pursuit for identifying strain sensitivity and up-scaling factors to refine metabolite yield and bioactivity potentials. Protoplasma 253:1145–1158
- Hamamoto H, Boulter ME, Shirsat AH, Croy EJ, Ellis JR (1990) Recovery of morphogenetically normal transgenic tobacco from hairy roots co-transformed with Agrobacterium rhizogenes and a binary vector plasmid. Plant Cell Rep 9:88–92
- Han KH, Keathley DE, Davis JM, Gordon MP (1993) Regeneration of a transgenic woody legume (Robinia pseudoacacia L. black locust) and morphological alterations induced by Agrobacterium rhizogenes-mediated transformation. Plant Sci 88:149–157
- Hashimoto T, Yun DJ, Yamada Y (1993) Production of tropane alkaloids in genetically engineering root cultures. Phytochemistry 32:712–718
- Hayta S, Gurel A, Akgun IH, Altan F, Ganzera M, Tanyolac B, Bedir E (2011) Induction of Gentiana cruciata hairy roots and their secondary metabolites. Biologia 66:618–625
- Hilton MG, Rhodes MJC (1990) Growth and hyoscyamine production of hairy root cultures of Datura stramonium in a modified stirred tank reactor. Appl Microbiol Biotechnol 33:132–138
- Hosoki T, Kigo T (1994) Transformation of Brussels sprouts (Brassica oleracea var. gemmifera Zenk.) by Agrobacterium rhizogenes harbouring a reporter, beta-glucuronidase gene. J Jpn Soc Hort Sci 63:589–592 (in Japanese with an English abstract)
- Hossieni SM, Bahramnejad B, Baneh HD, Emamifar A, Goodwin PH (2017) Hairy root culture optimization and resveratrol production from Vitis vinifera subsp. sylvesteris. World J Microbiol Biotechnol 33:67
- Hu ZB, Du M (2006) Hairy root and its application in plant genetic engineering. J Integr Plant Biol 48:121–127
- Huang SH, Viswakarma RK, Lee TT, Chan HS, Tsay HS (2014) Establishment of hairy root lines and analysis of iridoids and secoiridoids in the medicinal plant Gentiana scabra. Bot Stud 55:17
- Huang SY, Hung CH, Chou SN (2004) Innovative strategies for operation of mist trickling reactors for enhanced hairy root proliferation and secondary metabolite productivity. Enzym Microb Technol 35: 22–32
- Huang TK, McDonald KA (2012) Bioreactor systems for in vitro production of foreign proteins using plant cell cultures. Biotechnol Adv 30:398–409
- Hughes EH, Hong SB, Shanks JV, San KY, Gibson SI (2002) Characterization of an inducible promoter system in Catharanthus roseus hairy roots. Biotechnol Prog 18:1183–1186
- Ibañez S, Talano M, Ontañon O, Suman J, Medina MI, Macek T, Agostini E (2016) Transgenic plants and hairy roots: exploiting the potential of plant species to remediate contaminants. New Biotechnol 33:625–635
- Ishihara K, Hamada H, Hirata T, Nakajima N (2003) Biotransformation using plant cultured cells. J Mol Catal B Enzym 23:145–170
- Jacobs TB, LaFayette PR, Schmitz RJ, Parrott WA (2015) Targeted genome modifications in soybean with CRISPR/Cas9. BMC Biotechnol 15:16
- Jiao J, Gai QY, Fu YJ, Ma W, Peng X, Tan SN, Efferth T (2014) Efficient production of isoflavonoids by Astragalus membranaceus hairy root cultures and evaluation of antioxidant activities of extracts. J Agric Food Chem 62:12649–12658
- Jose B, Silja PK, Pillai DB, Satheeshkumar K (2016) In vitro cultivation of hairy roots of Plumbago rosea L. in a customized Reaction kettle

for the production of plumbagin—an anticancer compound. Ind Crop Prod 87:89–95

- Kantarci N, Borak F, Ulgen KO (2005) Bubble column reactors. Process Biochem 40:2263–2283
- Khandare RV, Govindwar SP (2015) Phytoremediation of textile dyes and effluents: current scenario and future prospects. Biotechnol Adv 33:1697–1714
- Khazaei A, Bahramnejad B, Mozafari AA, Dastan D, Mohammadi S (2019) Hairy root induction and farnesiferol B production of endemic medicinal plant Ferula pseudalliacea. 3. Biotech 9:407
- Kim OT, Um Y, Jin ML, Chang YK, Bang KH, Hyun DY, Lee HS, Lee Y (2014) Analysis of expressed sequence tags from Centella asiatica (L.) urban hairy roots elicited by methyl jasmonate to discover genes related to cytochrome P450s and glucosyltransferases. Plant Biotechnol Rep 8:211–220
- Kim S, Hopper E, Hjortso M (1995) Hairy root growth models: effect of different branching patterns. Biotechnol Prog 11:178–186
- Kochan E, Wasiela M, Seinkiewicz M (2013) The production of ginsenosides in hairy root cultures of American Ginseng, Panax quinquefolium L. and their antimicrobial activity. In Vitro Cell Dev Biol—Plant 49:24–29
- Koehle A, Sommer S, Yazaki K, Ferrer A, Boronat A, Li SM, Heide L (2002) High level expression of chorismate pyruvate-lyase (UbiC) and HMG-CoA reductase in hairy root cultures of Lithospermum erythrorhizon. Plant Cell Physiol 43:894–902
- Kohsari S, Rezayain M, Niknam V, Mirmasoumi M (2020) Antioxidative enzymes activities and accumulation of steroids in hairy roots of Trigonella. Physiol Mol Biol Plants 26:281–288
- Komaraiah P, Reddy GV, Reddy PS, Raghavendra AS, Ramakrishna SV, Reddanna P (2003) Enhanced production of antimicrobial sesquiterpenes and lipoxygenase metabolites in elicitor-treated hairy root cultures of Solanum tuberosum. Biotechnol Lett 25:593–597
- Kondo O, Honda H, Taya M, Kobayashi T (1989) Comparison of growth properties of carrot hairy root in various bioreactors. Appl Microbiol Biotechnol 32:291–294
- Krolicka A, Staniszewska I, Bielawski K, Malinski E, Szafranek J, Lojkowska E (2001) Establishment of hairy root cultures of Ammi majus. Plant Sci 160:259–264
- Kumar MA, Pammi SS, Sukanya MS, Giri A (2017) Enhanced production of pharmaceutically important isoflavones from hairy root rhizoclones of Trifolium pratense L. In Vitro Cell Dev Biol— Plant 54:94–103
- Kundu S, Salma U, Ali MN, Hazra AK, Mandal N (2018) Development of transgenic hairy roots and augmentation of secondary metabolites by precursor feeding in Sphagneticola calendulacea (L.) Pruski. Ind Crop Prod 121:206–215
- Kuźma Ł, Bruchajzer E, Wysokińska H (2009) Methyl jasmonate effect on diterpenoid accumulation in Salvia sclarea hairy root culture in shake flasks and sprinkle bioreactor. Enzym Microb Technol 44: 406–410
- Kwok KH, Doran PM (1995) Kinetic and stoichiometric analysis of hairy roots in a segmented bubble column reactor. Biotechnol Prog 11: 429–435
- Le Flem-Bonhomme V, Laurain-Mattar D, Fliniaux MA (2004) Hairy root induction of Papaver somniferum var. album, a difficult-totransform plant, by A. rhizogenes LBA 9402. Planta 218:890–893
- Lee SW, Kim YS, Uddin MR, Kwon DY, Kim YB, Lee MY, Kim SJ, Par SU (2013) Resveratrol production from hairy root cultures of Scutellaria baicalensis. Nat Prod Commun 8:609–611
- Lenk F, Sürmann A, Oberthür P, Schneider M, Steingroewer J, Bley T (2014) Modeling hairy root tissue growth in in vitro environments using an agent-based, structured growth model. Bioprocess Biosyst Eng 37:1173–1184
- Lenk F, Vogel M, Bley T, Steingroewer J (2012) Automatic image recognition to determine morphological development and secondary

metabolite accumulation in hairy root networks. Eng Life Sci 12: 588–594

- Li B, Cui G, Shen G, Zhan Z, Huang L, Chen J, Qi X (2017) Targeted mutagenesis in the medicinal plant Salvia miltiorrhiza. Sci Rep 7: 43320
- Li W, Koike K, Asada Y, Yoshikawa T, Nikaido T (2003) Biotransformation of low-molecular-weight alcohols by Coleus forskohlii hairy root cultures. Carbohydr Res 338:729–731
- Lin HW, Kwok KH, Doran PM (2003a) Development of Linum flavum hairy root cultures for production of coniferin. Biotechnol Lett 25: 521–525
- Lin HW, Kwok KH, Doran PM (2003b) Production of podophyllotoxin using cross-species co-culture of Linum flavum hairy roots and Podophyllum hexandrum cell suspensions. Biotechnol Prog 19: 1417–1426
- Liu CZ, Wang YC, Ouyang F, Ye HC, Li GF (1998) Production of artemisinin by hairy root cultures of Artemisia annua L. in bioreactor. Biotechnol Lett 20:266–268
- Ludwig-Müller J, Georgiev M, Bley T (2008) Metabolite and hormonal status of hairy root cultures of devil's claw (Harpagophytum procumbens) in flasks and in a bubble column bioreactor. Process Biochem 43:15–23
- Macek T, Kotrba P, Svatos A, Novakova M, Demnerova K, Mackova M (2008) Novel roles for genetically modified plants in environmental protection. Trends Biotechnol 26:146–152
- Mahesh A, Jeyachandran R (2011) Agrobacterium rhizogenes-mediated hairy root induction in Taraxacum officinale and analysis of sesquiterpene lactones. Plant Biosyst 145:620–626
- Mahobia A, Jha Z (2018) Root cultures: in vitro conservative method for metabolite extraction from A. paniculata. Int J Curr Microbiol App Sci 7:2442–2450
- Mairet F, Villon P, Boitel-Conti M, Shakourzadeh K (2010) Modeling and optimization of hairy root growth in fed-batch process. Biotechnol Prog 26:847–856
- Majumdar S, Garai S, Jha S (2011) Genetic transformation of Bacopa monnieri by wild type strains of Agrobacterium rhizogenes stimulates production of bacopa saponins in transformed calli and plants. Plant Cell Rep 30:941–954
- Mallol A, Cusido RM, Palazon J, Bonfill M, Morales C, Pinol MT (2001) Ginsenoside production in different phenotypes of Panax ginseng transformed roots. Phytochemistry 57:365–371
- Manners JM, Way H (1989) Efficient transformation with regeneration of the tropical pasture legume Stylosanthes humilis using Agrobacterium rhizogenes and a T_1 plasmid binary vector system. Plant Cell Rep 8:341–345
- Marwani E, Pratiwi D, Wardhani K, Esyanti R (2015) Development of hairy root culture of Andrographis paniculata for in vitro adrographollide production. J Med Bioeng 4:446–450
- McAfee BJ, White EE, Pelcher LE, Lapp MS (1993) Root induction in pine (Pinus) and Larch (Larix) spp. using Agrobacterium rhizogenes. Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult 34:53–62
- Medina-Bolivar F, Wright R, Funk V, Sentz D, Barroso L, Wilkins TD, Petri W Jr, Cramer CL (2003) A non-toxic lectin for antigen delivery of plant-based mucosal vaccines. Vaccine 21:997–1005
- Mehrotra S, Prakash O, Khan F, Kukreja AK (2013) Efficiency of neural network-based combinatorial model predicting optimal culture conditions for maximum biomass yields in hairy root cultures. Plant Cell Rep 32:309–317
- Menzel G, Harloff HJ, Jung C (2003) Expression of bacterial poly(3 hydroxybutyrate) synthesis genes in hairy roots of sugar beet (Beta vulgaris L.). Appl Microbiol Biotechnol 60:571–576
- Mishra J, Bhandari H, Singh M, Rawat S, Agnihotri RK, Mishra S, Purohit S (2011) Hairy root culture of Picrorhiza kurroa Royle ex Benth.: a promising approach for the production of picrotin and picrotoxinin. Acta Physiol Plant 33:1841–1846
- Mitchell DA, Stuart DM, Hardin MT, Krieger N (2006) Group III: rotating-drum and stirred-drum bioreactors. In: Mitchell D, Berovic M, Krieger N (eds) Solid-state fermentation bioreactors. Springer, Berlin/Heidelberg, pp 95–114
- Mitra M, Gantait S, Mandal N (2020) Coleus forskohlii: advancements and prospects of in vitro biotechnology. Appl Microbiol Biotechnol 104:2359–2371
- Mohghadam YA, Piri K, Bahramnejad B, Ghiasvand T (2014) Dopamine production in hairy root cultures of Portulaca oleracea (Purslane) using Agrobacterium rhizogenes. J Agric Sci Technol 16:409–420
- Moreno-Valenzuela OA, Minero-Garcia Y, Chan W, Mayer-Geraldo E, Carbajal E, Loyola-Vargas VM (2003) Increase in the indole alkaloid production and its excretion into the culture medium by calcium antagonists in Catharanthus roseus hairy roots. Biotechnol Lett 25: 1345–1349
- Morgan AJ, Cox PN, Turner DA, Peel E, Davey MR, Gartland KMA, Mulligan BJ (1987) Transformation of tomato using an R_1 plasmid vector. Plant Sci 49:37–49
- Morgan JA, Barney CS, Penn AH, Shanks JV (2000) Effects of buffered media upon growth and alkaloid production of Catharanthus roseus hairy roots. Appl Microbiol Biotechnol 53:262-265
- Moyano E, Jouhikainen K, Tammela P (2003) Effect of pmt gene overexpression on tropane alkaloid production in transformed root cultures of Datura metel and Hyoxcyamus muticus. J Exp Bot 54:203– 211
- Mugnier J (1988) Establishment of new axenic hairy root lines by inoculation with Agrobacterium rhizogenes. Plant Cell Rep 7:9–12
- Mugnier J, Musse B (1987) Vesicular-arbuscular mycorrhizal infection in transformed hairy root-inducing T-DNA roots grown axenically. Phytopathology 77:1045–1050
- Mukherjee E, Sarkar S, Bhattacharyya S, Gantait S (2020) Ameliorated reserpine production via in vitro direct and indirect regeneration system in Rauvolfia serpentina (L.) Benth. ex Kurz. 3Biotech 10: 294
- Murashige T, Skoog F (1962) A revised medium for rapid growth and bio assays with tobacco tissue cultures. Physiol Plant 15:473–495
- Nedelkoska TV, Doran PM (2001) Hyperaccumulation of nickel by hairy roots of alyssum species: comparison with whole regenerated plants. Biotechnol Prog 17:752–759
- Nishikawa K, Ishimaru K (1997) Flavonoids in root cultures of Scutellaria baicalensis. J Plant Physiol 151:633–636
- Nunes IS, Faria JMS, Figueriredo AC, Pedro LG, Trindade H, Barroso JG (2009) Menthol and geraniol biotransformation and glycosylation capacity of Levisticum officinale hairy roots. Planta Med 75:387– 391
- Orden AA, Bisogno FR, Cifuente DA, Giordano OS, Sanz MK (2006) Asymmetric bioreduction of natural xenobiotics by Brassica napus hairy roots. J Mol Catal B Enzym 42:71–77
- Osama K, Pallavi S, Pandey AK, Mishra BN (2013) Modelling of nutrient mist reactor for hairy root growth using artificial neural network. Eur J Sci Res 97:516–526
- Palavalli RR, Srivastava S, Srivastava AK (2012) Development of a mathematical model for growth and oxygen transfer in in vitro plant hairy root cultivations. Appl Biochem Biotechnol 167:1831–1844
- Palazon J, Cusido RM, Bonfill M, Mallol A, Moyano E, Morales C, Pinol MT (2003a) Elicitation of different Panax ginseng transformed root phenotypes for an improved ginsenoside production. Plant Physiol Biochem 41:1019–1025
- Palazon J, Moyano E, Cusido RM, Bonfill M, Oksman-Caldentey K-M, Pinol MT (2003b) Alkaloid production in Duboisia hybrid hairy roots and plants overexpressing the h6h gene. Plant Sci 165:1289– 1295
- Pandey P, Kaur R, Singh S, Chattopadhyay SK, Srivastava SK, Banerjee S (2014) Long-term stability in biomass and production of terpene indole alkaloids by hairy root culture of Rauvolfia serpentina and

cost approximation to endorse commercial realism. Biotechnol Lett 36:1523–1528

- Panigrahi J, Dholu P, Shah TJ, Gantait S (2018) Silver nitrate-induced in vitro shoot multiplication and precocious flowering in Catharanthus roseus (L.) G. Don, a rich source of terpenoid indole alkaloids. Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult 132:579–584
- Parizi KJ, Rahpeyma SA, Pourseyedi S (2020) The novel paclitaxelproducing system: establishment of Corylus avellana L. hairy root culture. In Vitro Cell Dev Biol—Plant 56:290–297
- Patra N, Srivastava AK (2015) Use of model-based nutrient feeding for improved production of artemisinin by hairy roots of Artemisia annua in a modified stirred tank bioreactor. Appl Biochem Biotechnol 177:373–388
- Payne J, Hamill JD, Robins RJ, Rhodes MJC (1987) Production of hyoscyamine by "hairy root" cultures of Datura stramonium. Planta Med 53:474–478
- Peng CX, Gong JS, Zhang XF, Zhang M, Zheng SQ (2008) Production of gastrodin through biotransformation of p-hydroxybenzyl alcohol using hairy root cultures of Datura tatula L. Afr J Biotechnol 7: 211–216
- Piątczak E, Jeleńb A, Makowczyńskaa J, Zielińskac S, Kuźmaa Ł, Balcerczakb E (2019) Establishment of hairy root cultures of Rehmannia elata N.E. Brown ex Prain and production of iridoid and phenylethanoid glycosides. Ind Crop Prod 137:308–314
- Piątczak E, Królicka A, Wielanek M, Wysokinska H (2012) Hairy root cultures of Rehmannia glutinosa and production of iridoid and phenylethanoid glycosides. Acta Physiol Plant 34:2215–2224
- Preiszner J, Van Toai TT, Huynh L, Bolla RI, Yen HH (2001) Structure and activity of a soybean Adh promoter in transgenic hairy roots. Plant Cell Rep 20:763–769
- Putalun W, Taura F, Qing W, Matsushita H, Tanaka H, Shoyama Y (2003) Anti-solasodine glycoside single-chain Fv antibody stimulates biosynthesis of solasodine glycoside in plants. Plant Cell Rep 22:344–349
- Qin MB, Li GZ, Yun Y, Ye HC, Li GF (1994) Induction of hairy root from Artemisia annua with Agrobacterium rhizogenes and its culture in vitro. Acta Bot Sin 36(Suppl):165–170 (in Chinese with an English abstract)
- Rahimi S, Hasanloo T, Najafi F, Khavari-Nejad RA (2012) Methyl jasmonate influence on silymarin production and plant stress responses in *Silybum marianum* hairy root cultures in a bioreactor. Nat Prod Res 26:1662–1667
- Rajashekar J, Kumar V, Veerashree V, Poornima DV, Sannabommaji T, Gajula H, Giridhara B (2016) Hairy root cultures of Gymnema sylvestre R. Br. to produce gymnemic acid. In: Jain S (ed) Protocols for in vitro cultures and secondary metabolite analysis of aromatic and medicinal plants, Methods in Molecular Biology, vol 1391, second edn. Humana, New York
- Ramakrishnan D, Curtis WR (2004) Trickle-bed root culture bioreactor design and scale-up: growth, fluid-dynamics, and oxygen mass transfer. Biotechnol Bioeng 88:248–260
- Ranjan R, Ahmed N, Khanna R, Mishra BN (2009) Design of an ON/ OFF mist duty cycle in mist bioreactors for the growth of hairy roots. Biotechnol Bioprocess Eng 14:38–45
- Rawat JM, Bhandari A, Raturi M, Rawat B (2019) Agrobacterium rhizogenes mediated hairy root cultures: a promising approach for production of useful metabolites. In: New and future developments in microbial biotechnology and engineering: microbial secondary metabolites biochemistry and application. Elsevier B.V., pp 103–118
- Renouard S, Corbin C, Drouet S, Medvedec B, Doussot J, Colas C, Maunit B, Bhambra AS, Gontier E, Jullian N, Mesnard F, Boitel M, Abbasi BH, Arroo RRJ, Lainé E, Hano C (2018) Investigation of Linum flavum (L.) hairy root cultures for the production of anticancer aryltetralin lignans. Int J Mol Sci 19:990
- Rhodes MJC, Parr AJ, Giulietti A, Aird ELH (1994) Influence of exogenous hormones on the growth and secondary metabolite formation in transformed root cultures. Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult 38:143–151
- Rodriguez-Mendiola MA, Stafford A, Cresswell R, Aria-Castro C (1991) Bioreactors for growth of plant roots. Enzym Microb Technol 13: 697–702
- Rodríguez-Llorente ID, Lafuente A, Doukkali B, Caviedes MA, Pajuelo E (2012) Engineering copper hyperaccumulation in plants by expressing a prokaryotic copC gene. Environ Sci Technol 46:12088– 12097
- Ron M, Kajala K, Pauluzzi G, Wang D, Reynoso MA, Zumstein K, Garcha J, Winte S, Masson H, Inagaki S, Federici F, Sinha N, Deal RB, Bailey-Serres J, Brady SM (2014) Hairy root transformation using Agrobacterium rhizogenes as a tool for exploring cell type-specific gene expression and function using tomato as a model. Plant Physiol 166:455–469
- Rugini E, Mariotti D (1991) Agrobacterium rhizogenes T-DNA genes and rooting in woody species. Acta Hortic 300:301–308
- Sajjalaguddam RR, Paladugu A (2016) Quercetin production from hairy root cultures of Indian mallow (Abutilon indicum L.). World J Pharm Pharm Sci 5:956–967
- Samydurai P, Ramakrishnan R, Thangapandian V (2013) Agrobacterium rhizogenes mediated hairy root culture and genetic transformation of an endangered medicinal plant of Decalepis hamiltonii Wight & Arn. J Microbiol Biotechnol Food Sci 3:191–194
- Sevon N, Hiltunen R, Oksman-Caldentey KM (1992) Chitosan increases hyoscyamine content in hairy root cultures of Hyoscyamus muticus. Pharm Pharmacol Lett 2:96–99
- Sevon N, Oksman-Caldentey KM (2002) Agrobacterium rhizogenes-mediated transformation: root cultures as a source of alkaloids. Planta Med 68:859–868
- Shahjahan A, Thilip C, Faizal K, Mehaboob VM, Raja P, Aslam A, Kathiravan K (2017) An efficient hairy root system for withanolide production in Withania somnifera (L.) Dunal. In: Malik S (ed) Production of plant derived natural compounds through hairy root culture. Springer, Cham, pp 133–143
- Shanks JV, Morgan J (1999) Plant 'hairy root' culture. Curr Opin Biotechnol 10:151–155
- Sosa Alderete LG, Talano MA, Ibañez SG, Purro S, Agostini E, Milrad SR, Medina MI (2009) Establishment of transgenic tobacco hairy roots expressing basic peroxidases and its application for phenol removal. J Biotechnol 139:273–279
- Soudek P, Valenová S, Vavrikova Z, Vaněk T (2006) ¹³⁷Cs and ⁹⁰Sr uptake by sunflower cultivated under hydroponic conditions. J Environ Radioact 88:236–250
- Spano L, Mariotti D, Cardarelli M, Branca C, Constantino P (1988) Morphogenesis and auxin sensitivity of transgenic tobacco with different complements of Ri T-DNA. Plant Physiol 87:479–483
- Srivastava S, Srivastava AK (2006) Biological phosphate removal by model based continuous cultivation of Acinetobacter calcoaceticus. Process Biochem 41:624–630
- Srivastava S, Srivastava AK (2012) Azadirachtin production by hairy root cultivation of Azadirachta indica in a modified stirred tank reactor. Bioprocess Biosyst Eng 35:1549–1553
- Steingroewer J, Bley T, Georgiev V, Ivanov I, Lenk F, Marchev A, Pavlov A (2013) Bioprocessing of differentiated plant in vitro systems. Eng Life Sci 13:26–38
- Sudha CG, Obul Reddy B, Ravishankar GA, Seeni S (2003) Production of ajmalicine and ajmaline in hairy root cultures of Rauvolfia micrantha Hook f., a rare and endemic medicinal plant. Biotechnol Lett 25:631–636
- Sun J, Manmathan H, Sun C, Peebles CAM (2016) Examining the transcriptional response of overexpressing anthranilate synthase in the hairy roots of an important medicinal plant Catharanthus roseus by RNA-seq. BMC Plant Biol 16:108
- Suresh B, Bais HP, Raghavarao KSMS, Ravishankar GA, Ghildyal NP (2005) Comparative evaluation of bioreactor design using Tagetes patula L. hairy roots as a model system. Process Biochem 40:1509– 1515
- Suresh B, Ravishankar GA (2004) Phytoremediation—a novel and promising approach for environmental clean-up. Crit Rev Biotechnol 24: 97–124
- Swain SS, Rout KK, Chand PK (2012) Production of triterpenoid anticancer compound taraxerol in Agrobacterium-transformed root cultures of butterfly pea (Clitoria ternatea L.). Appl Biochem Biotechnol 168:487–503
- Taya M, Yoyama A, Kondo O, Kobayashi T, Mitsui C (1989) Growth characteristics of plant hairy roots and their culture in bioreactors. J Chem Eng Jpn 22:89–94
- Tayler BH, Amasino RM, White FF, Nester EW (1985) T-DNA analysis of plants regenerated from hairy root tumors. Mol Gen Genet 201: 554–557
- Tepfer D (1984) Genetic transformation of several species of higher plants by Agrobacterium rhizogenes: sexual transmission of the transformed genotype and phenotype. Cell 37:959–967
- Thakore D, Srivastava AK, Sinha AK (2015) Model based fed batch cultivation and elicitation for the overproduction of ajmalicine from hairy roots of Catharanthus roseus. Biochem Eng J 97:73–80
- Thimmaraju R, Bhagyalakshmi N, Ravishankar GA (2004) In situ and ex situ adsorption and recovery of betalains from hairy root cultures of Beta vulgaris. Biotechnol Prog 20:777–785
- Thimmaraju R, Bhagyalakshmi N, Narayan MS, Ravishankar GA (2003b) Kinetics of pigment release from hairy root cultures of Beta vulgaris under the influence of pH, sonication, temperature and oxygen stress. Process Biochem 38:1069–1076
- Thimmaraju R, Bhagyalakshmi N, Narayan MS, Ravishankar GA (2003a) Food-grade chemical and biological agents permeabilize red beet hairy roots, assisting the release of betalaines. Biotechnol Prog 19:1274–1282
- Thiruvengadam M, Praveen N, Kim EH, Kim SH, Chung IM (2014) Production of anthraquinones, phenolic compounds and biological activities from hairy root cultures of Polygonum multiflorum Thunb. Protoplasma 251:555-566
- Toivonen L, Laakso S, Rosenqvist H (1992) The effect of temperature on hairy root cultures of Catharanthus roseus: growth, indole alkaloid accumulation and membrane lipid composition. Plant Cell Rep 11: 395–399
- Toivonen L, Ojala M, Kauppinen V (1991) Studies on the optimization of growth and indole alkaloid production by hairy root cultures of Catharanthus roseus. Biotechnol Bioeng 37:673–680
- Torregrosa L, Bouquet A (1997) Agrobacterium rhizogenes and A. tumefaciens co-transformation to obtain grapevine hairy roots producing the coat protein of grapevine chrome mosaic nepovirus. Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult 49:53–62
- Trulson AJ, Simpson RB, Shahin EA (1986) Transformation of cucumber (Cucumis sativus L.) plants with Agrobacterium rhizogenes. Theor Appl Genet 73:1–15
- Tuan PA, Chung E, Thwe AA, Li X, Kim YB, Mariadhas VA, Al-Dhabi NA, Lee JH, Park SU (2015) Transcriptional profiling and molecular characterization of astragalosides, calycosin, and calycosin-7-Oβ-D-glucoside biosynthesis in the hairy roots of Astragalus membranaceus in response to methyl jasmonate. J Agric Food Chem 63:6231–6240
- Tusevski O, Stanoeva JP, Stefova M, Kungulovski D, Atanasova P, Sekulovski N, Panov S, Simic SG (2013) Hairy roots of Hypericum perforatum L.: a promising system for xanthone production. Central European J Biol 8:1010–1022
- Tusevski O, Vinterhalter B, Krstić Milošević D, Soković M, Ćirić A, Vinterhalter D, Korać SZ, Stanoeva JP, Stefova M, Simic SG (2016) Production of phenolic compounds, antioxidant and

antimicrobial activities in hairy root and shoot cultures of Hypericum perforatum L. Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult 128:589– 605

- Udomsin O, Yusakul G, Kraithong W, Udomsuk L, Kitisripanya T, Juengwatanatrakul T, Putalun W (2018) Enhanced accumulation of high-value deoxymiroestrol and isoflavonoids using hairy root as a sustainable source of Pueraria candollei var. mirifica. Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult 136:141–151
- Vanhala L, Eeva M, Lapinjoki S, Hiltunen R, Oksman-Caldentey KM (1998) Effect of growth regulators on transformed root cultures of Hyoscyamus muticus. J Plant Physiol 153:75–81
- Verma SK, Gantait S, Jeong BR, Hwang SJ (2018) Enhanced growth and cardenolides production in Digitalis purpurea under the influence of different LED exposures in the plant factory. Sci Rep 8:18009
- Vinterhalter B, Krstić-Milošević D, Janković T, Pljevljakušić D, Ninković S, Smigocki A, Vinterhalter D (2015) Gentiana dinarica Beck. hairy root cultures and evaluation of factors affecting growth and xanthone production. Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult 121:667–679
- Visser RGF, Jacobsen E, Witholt B, Feenstra WJ (1989) Efficient transformation of potato (Solanum tuberosum L.) using a binary vector in Agrobacterium rhizogenes. Theor Appl Genet 7–8:594–600
- Wang F, Zhi J, Zhang Z, Wang L, Suo Y, Xie C, Li M, Zhang B, Du J, Gu L, Sun H (2017) Transcriptome analysis of salicylic acid treatment in Rehmannia glutinosa hairy roots using RNA-seq technique for identification of genes involved in acteoside biosynthesis. Front Plant Sci 8:787
- Wetterauer B, Wildi E, Wink M (2018) Production of the anticancer compound camptothecin in root and hairy root cultures of Ophiorrhiza mungos L. In: Kumar N (ed) Biotechnological approaches for medicinal and aromatic plants. Springer, Singapore, pp 303–341
- Wevar Oller AL, Agostini E, Talano MA, Capozucca C, Milrad SR, Tigier HA, Medina MI (2005) Overexpression of a basic peroxidase in transgenic tomato (Lycopersicon esculentum Mill. cv Pera) hairy roots increases phytoremediation of phenol. Plant Sci 169:1102–1111
- Willmitzer L, Sanches Serrano J, Bushfels E, Schell J (1982) DNA from Agrobacterium rhizogenes is transferred to and expressed in hairy root plant tissues. Mol Gen Genet 186:16–22
- Xu Z, Peters RJ, Weirather J, Luo H, Liao B, Zhang X, Zhu Y, Ji A, Zhang B, Hu S, Au KF, Song J, Chen S (2015) Full-length transcriptome sequences and splice variants obtained by a combination of sequencing platforms applied to different root tissues of Salvia miltiorrhiza and tanshinone biosynthesis. Plant J 82:951–961
- Yamazaki M, Mochida K, Asano T, Nakabayashi R, Chiba M, Udomsin N, Yamazaki Y, Goodenowe DB, Sankawa U, Yoshida T, Toyoda A, Totoki Y, Sakaki Y, Castillo EG, Buell CR, Sakurai T, Kazuki S (2013) Coupling deep transcriptome analysis with untargeted metabolic profiling in Ophiorrhiza pumila to further the understanding of the biosynthesis of the anticancer alkaloid camptothecin and anthraquinones. Plant Cell Physiol 54:686–696
- Yao SC, Bai L, Lan Z, Tang M, Zhai Y, Huang H, Wei R (2016) Hairy root induction and polysaccharide production of medicinal plant Callerya speciosa Champ. Plant Cell Tissue Organ Cult 126:177–186
- Yaoya S, Kanho H, Mikami Y, Itani T, Umehara K, Kuroyanagi M (2004) Umbelliferone released from hairy root cultures of Pharbitis nil treated with copper sulfate and its subsequent glucosylation. Biosci Biotechnol Biochem 68:1837–1841
- Zafari S, Sharifi M, Chashmi NA (2018) A comparative study of biotechnological approaches for producing valuable flavonoids in Prosopis farcta. Cytotechnology 70:603–614
- Zhou L, Wang J, Yang C (1998) Progress on plant hairy root culture and its chemistry. 1. Induction and culture of plant hairy roots. Nat Prod Res Dev 10:87–95 (in Chinese with an English abstract)
- Zhu C, Miao G, Guo J, Huo Y, Zhang X, Xie J, Feng J (2014) Establishment of Tripterygium wilfordii Hook. f. hairy root culture and optimization of its culture conditions for the production of triptolide and wilforine. J Microbiol Biotechnol 24:823–834

Publisher's note Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.