### MINI-REVIEW

# Biotechnological potential of the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway

Birgit E. Alber

Received: 14 July 2010 /Revised: 22 August 2010 /Accepted: 24 August 2010 / Published online: 30 September 2010 © Springer-Verlag 2010

Abstract The ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway is central to the carbon metabolism of many α-proteobacteria, like Rhodobacter sphaeroides and Methylobacterium extorquens as well as actinomycetes, like Streptomyces spp. Its function is to convert acetyl-CoA, a central carbon intermediate, to other precursor metabolites for cell carbon biosynthesis. In contrast to the glyoxylate cycle—another widely distributed acetyl-CoA assimilation strategy—the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway contains many unique CoAester intermediates, such as  $(2R)$ - and  $(2S)$ -ethylmalonyl-CoA, (2S)-methylsuccinyl-CoA, mesaconyl-(C1)-CoA, and (2R, 3S)-methylmalyl-CoA. With this come novel catalysts that interconvert these compounds. Among these unique enzymes is a novel carboxylase that reductively carboxylates crotonyl-CoA, crotonyl-CoA carboxylase/reductase, and (3S)-malyl-CoA thioesterase. The latter represents the first example of a non-Claisen condensation enzyme of the malate synthase superfamily and defines a new class of thioesterases apart from the hotdog-fold and  $\alpha$ / β-fold thioesterases. The biotechnological implications of the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway are tremendous as one looks to tap into the potential of using these new intermediates and catalysts to produce value-added products.

Keywords Ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway. Glyoxylate cycle . Claisen condensation . Thioesterase . Crotonyl-CoA carboxylase/reductase . 2-Methylfumaryl-CoA

B. E. Alber  $(\boxtimes)$ 

The Department of Microbiology, Ohio State University, 484 West 12th Ave, Room 417, Columbus, OH, USA e-mail: alber.8@osu.edu

# The ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway and its role in cell carbon biosynthesis

The biosynthesis of cell constituents in all living cell starts from a few so-called precursor metabolites that include the  $C_2$  compound acetyl-CoA, the  $C_3$  compound pyruvate (or phosphoenolpyruvate), the  $C_4$  compound oxaloacetate, and the C<sub>5</sub> compound α-ketoglutarate (Neidhardt et al. [1990;](#page-8-0) Fuchs [1999\)](#page-7-0). In bacterial cells, most cell carbon (about 50%) is derived from pyruvate/phosphoenolpyruvate as it is the gluconeogenic substrate leading to cell wall components and nucleotides. This is followed by acetyl-CoA (about 30%), oxaloacetate (about 13%), and alphaketoglutarate (about 7%). Different carbon sources enter the central part of metabolism at one or more of these precursor metabolites through peripheral and intermediary pathways.  $C_1$  and  $C_2$  compounds (e.g., methanol and acetate), fatty acids, waxes, (poly)hydroxyalkanoates, or alkenes enter central carbon metabolism on the level of acetyl-CoA The conversion of acetyl-CoA to cell carbon constituents is referred to as acetyl-CoA assimilation. How acetyl-CoA is converted to pyruvate/phosphoenolpyruvate, oxaloacetate, and alpha-ketoglutarate is sufficient to understand this anabolic process. Two different strategies for acetyl-CoA assimilation are known: the glyoxylate cycle (Kornberg and Krebs [1957;](#page-7-0) Kornberg et al. [1958](#page-7-0)) and the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway (Erb et al. [2007](#page-7-0)). Both acetyl-CoA assimilation pathways convert acetyl-CoA to the citric acid cycle intermediate malate, and from there pyruvate, oxaloacetate, and alpha-ketoglutarate are made by established steps in carbon metabolism. However, the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway is distinct from the glyoxylate cycle as one molecule of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  and one molecule  $HCO<sub>3</sub>$ <sup>-</sup> per three molecules of acetyl-CoA are co-assimilated to

form two malate molecules. The path for malate synthesis during acetyl-CoA assimilation for either pathway is given below.

Glyoxylate cycle:

 $4 \text{ acetyl}-\text{CoA} + 2 \text{ NAD}^+ + 6 \text{ H}_2\text{O}$  $\rightarrow$  2 malate<sup>2-</sup> + 4 HSCoA + 4 [H] + 2 NADH + 6 H<sup>+</sup>

(reducing equivalents generated at the succinate dehydrogenase step are most likely transferred to ubiquinone).

Ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway:

 $3 \text{ acetyl}-\text{CoA} + \text{CO}_2 + \text{HCO}_3 + 2 \text{NADPH} + \text{H}_2\text{O} + \text{OH}^ \rightarrow$  2 malate<sup>2-</sup> + 3 HSCoA + 2 NADP<sup>+</sup> + 4 [H]

(reducing equivalents generated at the succinate dehydrogenase and methylsuccinyl-CoA dehydrogenase steps are most likely transferred to ubiquinone; it is assumed that NTP generated by the succinyl-CoA synthetase is used for propionyl-CoA carboxylation).

The different path of malate synthesis may be one reason for the difference in distribution of these pathways in nature. A survey of all complete bacterial genomes for the presence of genes encoding the key enzymes for either pathway revealed the following: about one third of the 413 genera represented have the genes for the glyoxylate cycle enzymes (isocitrate lyase and malate synthase), about 7% for the ethylmalonyl-CoA enzymes (crotonyl-CoA carboxylase/reductase, ethylmalonyl-CoA mutase, methylsuccinyl-CoA dehydrogenase), and 1% appear to be able to use both acetyl-CoA assimilation strategies (Erb [2009a\)](#page-7-0). The remaining 60% either do not require an acetyl-CoA assimilation pathway due to their substrate spectrum, utilize a so far unknown strategy, or are anaerobic bacteria. For anaerobic bacteria, acetyl-CoA can be directly converted to pyruvate by reductive carboxylation (and from there further to oxaloacetate and alphaketoglutarate). The enzyme pyruvate:acceptor oxidoreductase that catalyzes the reductive carboxylation step uses a lowpotential electron acceptor, such as ferredoxin, that can be generated and maintained under low oxygen conditions.

## Possible biotechnologically relevant products derived from the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway

The reactions and intermediates of the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway are shown in Figs. [1](#page-2-0) and [2.](#page-2-0) The ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway is a non-cyclic pathway and there is no requirement to metabolically regenerate an acceptor molecule. Instead, the starting molecule acetyl-CoA and inorganic carbon may be derived from a variety of renewable carbon substrates that converge at this point of metabolism. It

follows that any unique intermediate of the pathway can in principle be used as a starting point to construct a "dream pathway" leading to a value-added product. In the context of an organism, though, the requirement for energy and reducing equivalents has to be taken into account. Other considerations include secretion of products, possible toxicity, yields, and downstream processing of the desired product. In the following paragraphs, a few examples are envisioned (and remain untested) how the introduction of just a few additional enzymes may facilitate the production of interesting products. However, depending on the type and oxidation state of the starting carbon source(s), the metabolic network as a whole has to be considered to enable the withdrawal of a given intermediate from the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway.

The initial steps of the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway overlap with the synthesis of polyhydroxybutyrate (Korotkova and Lidstrom [2001](#page-7-0); Alber et al. [2006;](#page-6-0) Fig. [1\)](#page-2-0). Two molecules of acetyl-CoA are condensed by β-ketothiolase to form acetoacetyl-CoA that is subsequently reduced to 3 hydroxybutyryl-CoA. Acetoacetyl-CoA reductase uses NADPH as the hydride donor and specifically forms  $(R)$ -3-hydroxybutyryl-CoA, the substrate for polyhydroxybutyrate synthase. For assimilation purposes, however, an  $(R)$ specific hydratase is proposed to catalyze the subsequent dehydration of 3-hydroxybutyryl-CoA to crotonyl-CoA (Korotkova et al. [2002](#page-7-0); Erb [2009a](#page-7-0)). The partitioning of carbon leading to polyhydroxybutyrate versus cell carbon is determined by the competing activities of polyhydroxybutyrate synthase that polymerizes (R)-3-hydroxybutyryl-CoA units and reactions of the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway. Controlling the flow through the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway, favoring the formation of polyhydroxybutyrate synthesis, would be a desirable approach to channel different substrates that enter the central carbon metabolism at the level of acetyl-CoA to a chemically defined product. This is attractive because advances have been made in the last years to lower the cost of downstream processing for this polymer (de Koning et al. [1997;](#page-7-0) Kapritchkoff et al. [2006\)](#page-7-0).

The unique reductive carboxylation of crotonyl-CoA by the enzyme crotonyl-CoA carboxylase/reductase can be considered the committed step for acetyl-CoA assimilation by the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway. Although the reaction is reversible, the activity of crotonyl-CoA carboxylase/reductase is up-regulated at least 60-fold for Rhodobacter sphaeroides during growth with acetate versus succinate (Erb et al. [2007](#page-7-0)). The molecular basis for the observed regulation, however, is so far unknown. The reductive carboxylation of crotonyl-CoA is the entry point into the  $C_5$ portion of the pathway (Fig. [1\)](#page-2-0). This central part of the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway involves  $C_5$  intermediates very rarely seen in metabolism: (2S)-ethylmalonyl-CoA, (2R) ethylmalonyl-CoA, (2S)-methylsuccinyl-CoA, mesaconyl<span id="page-2-0"></span>Fig. 1 Ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway for acetyl-CoA assimilation. The ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway and the participating enzymes are shown in detail. An  $(R)$ -specific crotonyl-CoA hydratase is probably involved in the conversion of 3-hydroxybutyryl-CoA to crotonyl-CoA. (R)-3-Hydroxybutyryl-CoA is also the precursor for polyhydroxybutyrate (PHB) synthesis. The electron acceptor for (2S)-methylsuccinyl-CoA dehydrogenase has so far not been determined. The conversion of propionyl-CoA to succinyl-CoA includes the carboxylation of propionyl-CoA by an ATPand bicarbonate-dependent propionyl-CoA carboxylase, conversion of the product (2S)-methylmalonyl-CoA to (2R) methylmalonyl-CoA by the promiscuous enzyme methylmalonyl-CoA/ethylmalonyl-CoA epimerase, and a carbon skeleton rearrangement catalyzed by a specific methylmalonyl-CoA mutase that is distinct from ethylmalonyl-CoA mutase. The structures of the intermediates are shown in Fig. 2



Fig. 2 Unusual intermediates of the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway



(C1)-CoA, and (2R, 3S)-methylmalyl-CoA (for the structures of these compounds, see Fig. [2](#page-2-0)).

Removal of the CoA moiety by the introduction of a specific thioesterase could lead to the production of stereochemically defined acids, most of which are currently commercially unavailable: (2S)-ethylmalonate, (2R)-ethylmalonate, (2S) methylsuccinate, mesaconate, and (2R, 3S)-methylmalate.

The general reaction scheme for thioesterases hydrolyzing thioester bonds of CoA esters is shown below:

 $R - COSCoA + H<sub>2</sub>O \rightarrow R - COO^{-} + HSCoA + H^{+}.$ 

The prospect for identifying specific thioesterases that would act on these intermediates seems favorable as many thioesterases have been characterized. Thioesterases are either domains of protein complexes such as non-ribosomal peptide transferases, polyketide synthases, and fatty acid synthases or constitute separate enzymes (Barnes and Wakil [1968;](#page-6-0) Lin and Smith [1978](#page-7-0); Cho and Cronan [1993](#page-7-0); Benning et al. [1998](#page-6-0); Li et al. [2000](#page-7-0); Kim et al. [2002;](#page-7-0) Schwarzer et al. [2002;](#page-8-0) Koglin et al. [2008\)](#page-7-0). Most characterized thioesterases belong to the class of alpha/beta-fold hydrolases or the hotdog-fold protein family and both classes contain thioesterases that act on CoA esters (Table 1). Therefore, there may be numerous candidates for mutagenesis to altered substrate range. Apart from these two major families, a new class of thioesterases has been discovered as part of the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway. The characterized member of this new class of thioesterases specifically hydrolyzes (3S)-malyl-CoA and the enzyme belongs to the superfamily of malate synthases (Erb et al. [2010](#page-7-0)). Members of this superfamily adopt a  $\beta_8/\alpha_8$  barrel-fold and up to now were only known to catalyze Claisen condensation reactions (Howard et al. [2000;](#page-7-0) Goulding et al. [2007](#page-7-0)). So far, it is not possible to identify members of this large family specifically as thioesterases based on primary amino acid sequence analyses. Eventually, however, it may be possible to extend the number of enzymes as starting points for mutagenesis studies to include members of this family.

Another possibility to release free acids from CoA intermediates would be the use of CoA transferases that transfer the CoA residue directly from the intermediate to the substrate, which is used in the process to produce a specific acid. At least three different classes of CoA transferases have been described (Pickart and Jencks [1979](#page-8-0); Buckel et al. [1981](#page-6-0); Heider [2001;](#page-7-0) Berthold et al. [2008](#page-6-0); Fleck and Brock [2008](#page-7-0)).

Specific thioesterases that exclusively hydrolyze (2S) ethylmalonyl-CoA, (2R)-ethylmalonyl-CoA, (2S)-methylsuccinyl-CoA, mesaconyl-(C1)-CoA, and (2R, 3S)-methylmalyl-CoA or specific CoA transferases that transfer the CoA moiety from these compounds to other carboxylic acids have, to my knowledge, not been described. Characterized CoA thioesterase and CoA transferases, however, provide a solid basis for protein engineering with the goal in mind of altering substrate specificities of these enzymes. Success for this approach requires not only an increase in specificity for the desired substrate but also at the same time a decrease of unspecific activities possibly targeting other metabolic CoA intermediates.

Another possibility to synthesize value-added chemicals starting from intermediates of the central part of the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway is the two-step reduction of ethylmalonyl-CoA to 2-ethyl-3-hydroxypropionate. A similar reaction sequence has been proposed for the formation of 3-hydroxyisobutyrate from methylmalonyl-CoA (Marx et al. [2007\)](#page-8-0), which is an intermediate later in the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway. Both 3-hydroxyalkonates, 2-ethyl-3-hydroxypropionate, and 3-hydroxyisobutyrate could be extremely interesting platform chemicals, as has been recently reviewed for 3-hydroxyisobutyrate (Rohwerder and Müller [2010](#page-8-0)).

The prospect of engineering organisms to take advantages of these approaches is good as at least two organisms already considered for biotechnological applications contain the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway: R. sphaeroides and Methylobacterium extorquens.

Table 1 Three recognized classes of thioesterases based on their three-dimensional structure

Class	Enzyme superfamily	Prototype	References
Hotdog-fold thioesterase	Hotdog-fold superfamily	4-Hydroxybenzoyl-CoA thioesterase from <i>Pseudomonas</i> sp. strain CBS-3	Benning et al. (1998)
		4-Hydroxybenzoyl-CoA thioesterase from Arthrobacter sp. strain SU <sup>a</sup>	Thoden et al. $(2003)$ ; Zhuang et al. $(2003)$
$\alpha/\beta$ -Hydrolase-fold thioesterase	Esterase/lipase superfamily	acyl-CoA thioesterase I (TseA) from <i>Escherichia coli</i>	Barnes and Wakil (1968); Cho and Cronan (1993) Lo et al. (2003)
$\beta_{8}/\alpha_{8}$ Barrel-fold thioesterase	Malate synthase superfamily	(3S)-Malyl-CoA thioesterase	Erb et al. $(2010)$

<sup>a</sup> The two 4-hydroxybenzoyl-CoA thioesterases form distinct clades within the class of hotdog-fold thioesterase and the alignment of their amino acid sequences is not straightforward (Thoden et al. [2002\)](#page-8-0). They also differ in their arrangement of subunits (Cao et al. [2009](#page-6-0))

# <span id="page-4-0"></span>The ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway is central to the carbon metabolism of at least two biotechnologically relevant organisms, R. sphaeroides and M. extorquens

The ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway is used as the acetyl-CoA assimilation strategy in the metabolically versatile purple non-sulfur bacterium R. sphaeroides (Fig. 3a). R. sphaeroides has many desirable features for use in biotechnological applications. It can grow phototrophically in the light under anaerobic conditions, but can easily transition to chemoheterotrophic growth (aerobically in the dark). The clear advantage is that it can "turn itself anaerobic," a fact that has been used by many researcher working with the organism in the past: Aerobic medium is inoculated and then the culture vessel is sealed and placed in the dark. After several hours, the culture (now anaerobic because the oxygen has been used up through respiration) is placed in the light and growth continues. During phototrophic growth, R. sphaeroides uses a wide variety of carbon sources exclusively for synthesis of cell mass, and it does so with amazing efficiency. The reductant that is generated during assimilation of a substrate that is more reduced than cell carbon is transferred to exogenous  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  and converted to additional cell mass through the Calvin–Benson–Bassham cycle (Wang et al. [1993](#page-8-0)).  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  fixation through the Calvin– Benson–Bassham cycle can also occur with substrates that are more oxidized than cell mass, for example malate, because more  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  and reductant are transiently generated during the initial assimilation-steps than is released at the end (Laguna et al., submitted). This extra carbon is therefore not lost but can be converted to additional cell mass by the Calvin–Benson–Bassham cycle; at the same time, this allows the cell to maintain redox balance. In the case of growth with substrates that enter the central carbon metabolism on the level of acetyl-CoA,  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  generated from decarboxylation of the product of the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway malate (to form  $C_3$  precursor metabolites) is directly re-assimilated by the ethylmalonyl-CoA obviating the requirement of the Calvin–Benson–Bassham cycle (Laguna et al., submitted). The ability of R. *sphaeroides* to make total use of the carbon source for cell mass biosynthesis (of course,  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  will still be generated during growth on an oxidized substrate) may be exploited by channeling a given substrate to a desired product with maximum yield. Also, the withdrawal of intermediates of the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway in order to produce specific products may be possible without effecting growth of the organism. For R. sphaeroides, a mutational block in the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway still allows the growth on substrates not requiring the pathway, such as succinate (Erb et al. [2008](#page-7-0), [2009b](#page-7-0), [2010](#page-7-0)). Because R. sphaeroides utilizes many carbon substrates, a possibility would also be to streamline various substrates toward the desired product by manipulating central carbon metabolism, eliminating the



Fig. 3 Central role of the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway in carbon metabolism. a Acetyl-CoA assimilation by R. sphaeroides. The assimilation of acetyl-CoA leads to the production of precursor metabolites (acetyl-CoA, pyruvate, oxaloacetate, and α-ketoglutarate) that are used for the biosynthesis of cell constituents. The estimated relative amounts withdrawn in each case are indicated by the thickness of the arrow bar. **b** Methanol assimilation by M. extorquens.  $C_1$  units are assimilated by the serine cycle (Large et al. [1961](#page-7-0)). Precursor metabolites are taken out of the serine cycle for cell carbon biosynthesis and glyoxylate is being replenished by the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway

need to start with a pure carbon source. Apart from the ability to fix  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ , R. sphaeroides can also fix molecular nitrogen, a fact advantageous for biotechnological considerations. The genomes of four different strains of R. sphaeroides are fully sequenced (Choudhary et al. [2007](#page-7-0); Lim et al. [2009\)](#page-7-0).

<span id="page-5-0"></span>for R. sphaeroides (Roh et al. [2004;](#page-8-0) Arai et al. [2008\)](#page-6-0), and several global regulators in carbon metabolism, such as CbbR (Gibson and Tabita [1993\)](#page-7-0), RegAB, or PrrAB (Sganga and Bauer [1992;](#page-8-0) Bauer and Bird [1996;](#page-6-0) Eraso and Kaplan [1994](#page-7-0); Joshi and Tabita [1996](#page-7-0)), have been identified. Genetic tools to alter the metabolism of R. sphaeroides are available (Kovach et al. [1995;](#page-7-0) Schäfer et al. [1994;](#page-8-0) Quandt and Hynes [1993](#page-8-0)) and random mutagenesis is also possible (Larsen et al. [2002\)](#page-7-0). An expression vector for high-level protein production was also recently developed for R. sphaeroides (Ind et al. [2009\)](#page-7-0).

Methylotrophic bacteria that use the serine cycle for the assimilation of methylated compound require a pathway to regenerate glyoxylate from acetyl-CoA (Large et al. [1961](#page-7-0); Anthony [1982](#page-6-0)). Glyoxylate yields glycine, the primary acceptor molecule for  $C_1$  units, forming serine. Depending on the species, either reactions of the glyoxylate cycle or the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway are used. Even before the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway was biochemically characterized in R. sphaeroides, the genes involved in the regeneration of glyoxylate from acetyl-CoA during methanol assimilation by the isocitrate lyase-negative bacterium M. extorquens were already identified (Chistoserdova and Lidstrom [1996](#page-7-0); Smith et al. [1996;](#page-8-0) Korotkova and Lidstrom [2001](#page-7-0), [2004](#page-7-0); Korotkova et al. [2002](#page-7-0), [2005;](#page-7-0) Chistoserdova et al. [2003](#page-7-0)). The operation of the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway was directly demonstrated in *M. extorquens* by short-term  $^{13}$ C-labeling experiments and time-dependent appearance of all predicted CoA ester intermediates (Peyraud et al. [2009](#page-8-0); Fig. [3b](#page-4-0)). M. extorquens is probably the best-studied methylotroph (Large et al. [1961](#page-7-0); Anthony [1982](#page-6-0); Chistoserdova et al. [2003](#page-7-0); Chisterodova et al. [2009\)](#page-6-0) and is being considered for methanol-based biotechnology, as recently reviewed by Schrader et al. ([2008](#page-8-0)). In

Fig. 4 Unprecedented reactions catalyzed by enzymes related to crotonyl-CoA carboxylase/ reductase. a Reaction catalyzed by crotonyl-CoA carboxylase/ reductase from R. sphaeroides, M. extorquens, and Streptomyces coelicolor (Erb et al. [2007](#page-7-0), [2009a\)](#page-7-0). b One reaction catalyzed by (chloro)crotonyl-CoA/ 2-pentenyl-CoA carboxylase/ reductase (Sal G) from Salinospora tropica (Liu et al. [2009;](#page-8-0) Eustáquio et al. [2009](#page-7-0)). c Reaction catalyzed by the enoyl-CoA reductase domain of CurF from Lyngbya majuscula (Gu et al. [2009\)](#page-7-0)

comparison to methylotrophic bacteria that use the glyoxylate cycle, M. extorquens has a higher efficiency of carbon recovery due to the increased  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  fixation ability of the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway (Peyraud et al. [2009](#page-8-0)). The elucidation of the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway not only completes the picture for carbon utilization in this biotechnological relevant organism but also opens up possibilities to explore the unique intermediates for the production of crude and fine chemicals.

Other bacteria, including many marine α-proteobacteria, are expected to use the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway (Erb et al. [2009b](#page-7-0)), but have been less well studied in regard to their carbon metabolism. Actinomycetes, like Streptomyces and Salinospora species, also utilize the pathway—or part of it to supply precursors for the synthesis of secondary metabolites, including antibiotics (reviewed in Chan et al. [2009](#page-6-0)).

## Novel catalysts involved in the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway and their biotechnological potential

With the emergence of unusual metabolic intermediates as part of the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway come novel enzymes that catalyze their interconversion. Although these enzymes will function best in the context of an organism due to their requirements of complex cofactors, such as coenzyme A, coenzyme B12, and NADPH, they may also be considered as catalysts in vitro after alteration.

(2R)-Ethylmalonyl-CoA mutase, (2S)-methylsuccinyl-CoA dehydrogenase, and mesaconyl-CoA hydratase define distinct clades within large enzyme families based on their substrate specificities (Alber et al. [2006](#page-6-0); Erb et al. [2008,](#page-7-0) [2009b](#page-7-0); Zarzycki et al. [2008\)](#page-8-0). The  $B_{12}$ -dependent (2R)-



<span id="page-6-0"></span>ethylmalonyl-CoA mutase in particular requires very specific binding of its substrate in order to avoid unwanted side reactions due to its radical-based mechanism (Rétey [1990;](#page-8-0) Vlasie and Banerjee [2004](#page-8-0); Buckel et al. 2006); therefore, ethylmalonyl-CoA mutases can be easily distinguished from other  $B_{12}$ -dependent acyl-CoA mutases as they form a very deep branch in a neighbor-joining tree for representatives of this family (Erb et al. [2008](#page-7-0)). The characterization of new members of  $B_{12}$ -dependent acyl-CoA mutases  $((2R)$ -ethylmalonyl-CoA mutase), flavindependent acyl-dehydrogenases ((2S)-methylsuccinyl-CoA dehydrogenase) and R-specific hydratases (mesaconyl-CoA hydratase) will allow for a better understanding of substrate recognition by these enzymes. A clear assessment of structure/function relationship will facilitate the discovery of similar enzymes with different traits, such as increased thermostability, also through the analyses of candidate genes in the continuously growing environmental databases. At the same time, it provides a basis for design or discovery of enzymes with novel substrate and cofactor specificities.

Crotonyl-CoA carboxylase/reductase and (3S)-malyl-CoA thioesterase on the other hand catalyze unprecedented reactions as members of enzyme superfamilies (Erb et al. [2007,](#page-7-0) [2009b,](#page-7-0) [2010](#page-7-0)). As mentioned above, (3S)-malyl-CoA thioesterase belongs to the superfamily of malate synthases that catalyze the Claisen condensation between acetyl-CoA and glyoxylate (Erb et al. [2010\)](#page-7-0). Also part of this family are malyl-CoA lyases and the subunit of citrate lyase that catalyzes the cleavage of an enzyme-bound citryl moiety into oxaloacetate and an enzyme-bound acetyl group (Meister et al. [2005\)](#page-8-0); however, (3S)-malyl-CoA thioesterase represents the first described thioesterase of this family (Erb et al. [2010](#page-7-0)).

Crotonyl-CoA carboxylase/reductase belongs to the superfamily of medium-chain alcohol dehydrogenases and related dehydrogenases/reductases. Members of this family either reduce C=O or C=C bonds. Very surprisingly, crotonyl-CoA carboxylase/reductase was found to catalyze the reductive carboxylation of crotonyl-CoA to (2S)-ethylmalonyl-CoA (Erb et al. [2007](#page-7-0)). The enzyme also catalyzes the reduction of crotonyl-CoA to butyryl-CoA in the absence of  $CO<sub>2</sub>$ , but with only about one tenth of the maximum rate (Erb et al. [2009b](#page-7-0)). The complete stereochemical course of both the carboxylation reaction and the reduction reaction catalyzed by the enzyme was elucidated and a reaction mechanism has been proposed (Erb et al. [2009b\)](#page-7-0). A catalyst for the stereoselective carboxylation of an enoyl thioester may even find an application in organic synthesis. Crotonyl-CoA carboxylase/reductase also accepts acrylyl-CoA as a substrate and therefore is able to produce two extender units for modular and iterative polyketide synthases responsible for the synthesis of chemotherapeutic

chemicals: (2S)-ethylmalonyl-CoA and (2S)-methylmalonyl-CoA (Chan et al. 2009). Enzymes related to crotonyl-CoA carboxylase/reductase have been recently shown to also use substrates derivatives, such as chlorocrotonyl-CoA and 2-pentenyl-CoA, or even catalyze an unprecedented dehalogenating cyclopropanation of an enzyme-bound 3-methyl-4-chlorocrotonyl-substrate (Fig. [4;](#page-5-0) Eustáquio et al. [2009](#page-7-0); Liu et al. [2009](#page-8-0); Gu et al. [2009\)](#page-7-0). Therefore, the enzyme superfamily of medium-chain alcohol dehydrogenases and related dehydrogenases/reductases can now be extended to include members that catalyze a α-carbon–carbon bond formation coupled to the reduction of an α,β-double bond. Among others, this finding has major implication for broadening the type of elongation units available for polyketide synthases, either by discovery or design.

Acknowledgments This research has been supported by the Deutsche Forschungsgemeinschaft (AL677/1-1) and by Evonik-Degussa GmbH in the past and is currently generously funded by the National Science Foundation (MCB0842892). I would like to thank Chuck Daniels for very helpful comments on the manuscript.

### References

- Alber BE, Spanheimer R, Ebenau-Jehle C, Fuchs G (2006) Study of an alternate glyoxylate cycle for acetate assimilation by Rhodobacter sphaeroides. Mol Microbiol 61:297–309
- Anthony C (1982) The biochemistry of methylotrophs. Academic, London
- Arai H, Roh JH, Kaplan S (2008) Transriptome dynamics during the transition from anaerobic photosynthesis to aerobic respiration in Rhodobacter sphaeroides 2.4.1. J Bacteriol 190:286–299
- Barnes EM, Wakil SJ (1968) Studies of the mechanism of fatty acid synthesis. XIX. Preparation and general properties of palmityl thioesterase. J Biol Chem 243:2955–2962
- Bauer CE, Bird TH (1996) Regulatory circuits controlling photosynthesis gene expression. Cell 85:5–8
- Benning MM, Wesenberg G, Liu R, Taylor KL, Dunaway-Mariano D, Holden HM (1998) The three-dimensional structure of 4 hydroxybenzoyl-CoA thioesterase from Pseudomonas sp. strain CBS-3. J Biol Chem 273:33572–33579
- Berthold CL, Toyota CG, Richards NGJ, Lindqvist Y (2008) Reinvestigation of the catalytic mechanism of formyl-CoA transferase, a class III CoA-transferase. J Biol Chem 283:6519–6529
- Buckel W, Dorn U, Semmler R (1981) Glutaconate CoA-transferase from Acidaminococcus fermentas. Eur J Biochem 118:315–321
- Buckel W, Kratky C, Golding BT (2006) Stabilization of methylene radicals by cobalamin in coenzyme  $B_{12}$  dependent mutases. Chem Eur J 12:352–362
- Cao J, Hang X, Zhao H, Gong W, Dunaway-Mariano D (2009) The mechanism of human hotdog-fold thioesterase 2 (hTHEM2) substarte recognition and catalysis illuminated by a structure and function based analysis. Biochemistry 48:1293–1304
- Chan YA, Podevels AM, Kevany BM, Thomas MG (2009) Biosynthesis of polyketide synthase extender units. Nat Prod Rep 26:10–114
- Chisterodova L, Kalyuzhnaya MG, Lidstrom ME (2009) The expanding world of methylotrophic metabolism. Annu Rev Microbiol 63:477–499
- <span id="page-7-0"></span>Chistoserdova L, Chen S-W, Lapidus A, Lidstrom ME (2003) Methylotrophy in *Methylobacterium extorquens* AM1 from a genomic point of view. J Bacteriol 185:2980–2987
- Cho H, Cronan JE (1993) Escherichia coli thioesterase I, molecular cloning and sequencing of the structural gene and identification as a periplasmic enzyme. J Biol Chem 268:9238–9245
- Choudhary M, Zabhua X, Fu YX, Kaplan S (2007) Genome analyses of three strains of Rhodobacter sphaeroides: evidence of rapid evolution of chromosome II. J Bacteriol 189:1914–1921
- de Koning GJM, Kellerhals M, van Meurs C, Witholt B (1997) A process for the recovery of poly(hydroxyalkanoates) from Pseudomnas. Part 2: process, development and economic evaluation. Bioprocess Eng 17:15–21
- Eraso JM, Kaplan S (1994) prrA, a putative response regulator involved in oxygen regulation of photosynthesis gene expression in Rhodobacetr sphaeroides. J Bacteriol 176:32–43
- Erb TJ (2009) The ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway: a novel acetyl-CoA assimilation strategy. Doctoral thesis, Albert-Ludwigs-Universität Freiburg
- Erb TJ, Berg IA, Brecht V, Müller M, Fuchs G, Alber BE (2007) Synthesis of  $C_5$ -dicarboxylic acids from  $C_2$ -units involving crotonyl-CoA carboxylase/reductase: the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 104:10631–10636
- Erb TJ, Rétey J, Fuchs G, Alber BE (2008) Ethylmalonyl-CoA mutase from Rhodobacter sphaeroides defines a new subclass of coenzyme B12-dependent acyl-CoA mutases. J Biol Chem 283:32283–32293
- Erb TJ, Brecht V, Fuchs G, Müller M, Alber BE (2009a) Carboxylation mechanism and stereochemistry of crotonyl-CoA carboxylase/ reductase, a carboxylating enoyl-thioester reductase. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 106:8871–8876
- Erb TJ, Fuchs G, Alber BE (2009b) (2S)-Methylsuccinyl-CoA dehydrogenase closes the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway for acetyl-CoA assimilation. Mol Microbiol 73:992–1008
- Erb TJ, Frerichs-Revermann L, Fuchs G, Alber BE (2010) The apparent malate synthase activity of Rhodobacter sphaeroides is due to two paralogous enzymes, (3S)-malyl-coenzyme A (CoA)/ β-methylmalyl-CoA lyase and (3S)-malyl-CoA thioesterase. J Bacteriol 192:1249–1258
- Eustáquio AS, McGlinchey RP, Liu Y, Hazzard C, Beer LL, Florova G, Alhamadsheh MM, Lechner A, Kale AJ, Kobayashi Y, Reynolds KA, Moore BS (2009) Biosynthesis of the salinosporamide A polyketide synthase substrate chloroethylmalonyl-coenzyme A from S-adenosyl-L-methionine. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 106:12295– 12300
- Fleck CB, Brock M (2008) Characterization of an acyl-CoA: carboxylate CoA-transferase from Aspergillus nidulans involved in propionyl-CoA detoxification. Mol Microbiol 68:642–656
- Fuchs G (1999) Biosynthesis of building blocks, chapter 7. In: Lengeler JW, Drews G, Schlegel HG (eds) Biology of the prokaryotes. Thieme, Stuttgart, pp 114–116
- Gibson JL, Tabita FR (1993) Nucleotide sequence and functional analysis of CbbR, a positive regulator of the Calvin cycle operons of Rhodobacter sphaeroides. J Bacteriol 175:5778–5784
- Goulding CW, Bowers PM, Segelke B, Lekin T, Kim C-Y, Terwilliger TC, Eisenberg D (2007) The structure and computational analysis of Mycobacterium tuberculosis protein CitE suggest a novel enzymatic function. J Mol Biol 365:275–283
- Gu L, Wang B, Kulkarni A, Geders TW, Gri RV, Gerwick L, Håkansson K, Wipf P, Smith JL, Gerwick WH, Sherman DH (2009) Metamorphic enzyme assembly in polyketide diversification. Nature 459:731–735
- Heider J (2001) A new family of CoA-transferases. FEBS Lett 509:345–349
- Howard BR, Endrizzi JA, Remington SJ (2000) Crystal structure of Escherichia coli malate synthase G complexed with magnesium and glyoxylate at 2.0Å resolution: mechanistic implications. Biochemistry 39:3156–3168
- Ind AC, Porter SL, Brown MT, Byles ED, de Beyer JA, Godfrey SA, Armitage JP (2009) Inducible-expression plasmid for Rhodobacter sphaeroides and Paracoccus denitrificans. Appl Environ Microbiol 75:6613–6615
- Joshi HM, Tabita FR (1996) A global two component signal transduction system that integrates the control of photosynthesis, carbon dioxide assimilation, and nitrogen fixation. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 93:14515–14520
- Kapritchkoff FM, Viotti AP, Alli RCP, Zuccolo M, Pradella JGC, Maiorano AE, Miranda EA, Bonomi A (2006) Enzymatic recovery and purification of ployhydroxybutyrate produced by Ralstonia eutropha. J Biotechnol 122:453–462
- Kim BS, Cropp TA, Beck BJ, Sherman DH, Reynolds KA (2002) Biochemical evidence for an editing role of thioesterase II in the biosynthesis of the polyketide pikromycin. J Biol Chem 277:48028–48034
- Koglin A, Löhr F, Bernhard F, Rogov VV, Frueh DP, Strieter ER, Mofid MR, Güntert P, Wagnaer G, Walsh CT, Marahiel MA, Dötsch V (2008) Structural basis for the selectivity of the external thioesterase of the surfactin synthetase. Nature 454:907–911
- Kornberg HL, Krebs HA (1957) Synthesis of cell constituents from  $C<sub>2</sub>$ -units by a modified tricarboxylic acid cycle. Nature 179:988– 991
- Kornberg HL, Phizackerley PJR, Sadler JR (1958) Synthesis of cell constituents from acetate by Escherichia coli. Biochem J 72:32P–33P
- Korotkova N, Lidstrom ME (2001) Connection between ploy-βhydroxybutyrate biosynthesis and growth on  $C_1$  and  $C_2$  compounds in the methylotroph Methylobacterium extorquens AM1. J Bacteriol 183:1038–1046
- Korotkova N, Lidstrom ME (2004) MeaB is a component of the methylmalonyl-CoA mutase complex required for protection of the enzyme from inactivation. J Biol Chem 279:13652–13658
- Korotkova N, Chistoserdova L, Kuska V, Lidstrom ME (2002) Glyoxylate regeneration pathway in the methylotroph Methylobacterium extorquens AM1. J Bacteriol 184:1750–1758
- Korotkova N, Lidstrom ME, Chistoserdova L (2005) Identification of genes involved in the glyoxylate regeneration cycle in Methylobacterium extorquens AM1, including two genes, meaC and meaD. J Bacteriol 187:1523–1526
- Kovach ME, Elzer PH, Hill DS, Robertson GT, Farris MA, Roop RM, Peterson KM (1995) Four derivatives of the braod-host range cloning vector pBBR1MCS carrying different antibiotic-resistance cassettes. Gene 166:175–176
- Large PJ, Peel D, Quayle JR (1961) Microbial growth on C1 compounds. Biochem J 81:470–480
- Larsen RA, Wilson MM, Guss AM, Metcalf WW (2002) Genetic analysis of pigmant biosynthesis in Xanthobacter autrophicus Py2 using a new, highly efficient transposon mutagenesis system that is functional in a wide variety of bacteria. Arch Microbiol 178:193–201
- Li J, Derewenda U, Dauetr Z, Smith S, Derewenda ZS (2000) Crystal structure of the Escherichia coli thioesterase II, a homolog of the human Nef binding enzyme. Nat Struct Biol 7:555-559
- Lim S-K, Kim SJ, Cha SH, Oh Y-K, Rhee H-J, Kim M-S, Lee JK (2009) Complete genome sequence of Rhodobacter sphaeroides KD131. J Bacteriol 191:1118–1119
- Lin CY, Smith S (1978) Properties of the thioesterase component obtained by limited trypsinization of the fatty acid synthetase multienzyme complex. J Biol Chem 253:1954–1962
- <span id="page-8-0"></span>Liu Y, Hazzard C, Eustáquio AS, Reynolds KA, Moore BS (2009) Biosynthesis of salinosporamides from  $\alpha$ , β-unsaturated fatty acids: implications for extending polyketide synthase diversity. J Am Chem Soc 131:10376–10377
- Lo YC, Lin SC, Shaw JF, Liaw YC (2003) Crystal structure of Escherichia coli thioesterase I/protease I/lysophospholipase L1: consensus sequence blocks constitute the catalytic center of SGNH-hydrolases through a conserved hydrogen bond network. J Mol Biol 330:539–551
- Marx A, Poetter M, Buchholz S, May A, Siegert H, Alber B, Fuchs G, Eggerling L (2007) Microbiological production of 3-hydroxybutyric acid. WO/2007/141208
- Meister M, Saum S, Alber BE, Fuchs G (2005) L-Malyl-coenzyme A/βmethylmalyl-coenzyme A lyase is involved in acetate assimilation of the isocitrate lyase-negative bacterium Rhodobacter capsulatus. J Bacteriol 187:1415–1425
- Neidhardt FC, Ingraham JL, Schaechter M (1990) In: Physiology of the bacterial cell. Chapter 5: biosynthesis and fueling. Sinauer, Sunderland, pp 133–172
- Peyraud R, Kiefer P, Christen P, Massou S, Portais JC, Vorholt JA (2009) Demonstration of the ethylmalonyl-CoA pathway by using <sup>13</sup>C metabolomics. Proc Nat Acad Sci USA 106:4846– 4851
- Pickart CM, Jencks WP (1979) Formation of stable anhydrides from CoA transferase and hydroxamic acids. J Biol Chem 254:9120–9129
- Quandt J, Hynes MF (1993) Versatile suicide vectors which allow direct selection for gene replacement in Gram-negative bacteria. Gene 127:15–21
- Rétey J (1990) Enzymatic reaction selectively by negative catalysis or how do enzymes deal with highly reactive intermediates. Angew Chem Int Ed 29:355–361
- Roh JH, Smith WE, Kaplan S (2004) Effects of oxygen and light intensity on transcriptome expression in Rhodobacter sphaeroides 2.4.1. Redox active gene epression profile. J Biol Chem 279:9146–9155
- Rohwerder T, Müller RH (2010) Biosynthesis of 2-hydroxyisobutyric acid (2-HIBA) from renewable carbon. Microb Cell Fact 25:13
- Schäfer A, Tauch A, Jager W, Kalinowski J, Thierbach G, Puhler A (1994) Small mobilizable multipurpose cloning vectors derived from the Escherichia coli plasmids pK18 and pK19: selection of

defined deletions in the chromosome of Corynebacterium glutamicum. Gene 145:69–73

- Schrader J, Schilling M, Holtmann D, Sell D, Filho MV, Marx A, Vorholt JA (2008) Methanol-based industrial biotechnology: current status and future perspectives of methylotrophic bacteria. Trends Biotechnol 27:107–115
- Schwarzer D, Mootz HD, Linne U, Marahiel MA (2002) Regeneration of misprimed nonribosomal peptide synthases by type II thioesterases. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 99:14083–14088
- Sganga MW, Bauer CE (1992) Regulatory factors controlling photosynthetic reaction center and light-harvesting gene expression in Rhodobacter capsulatus. Cell 68:945–954
- Smith LM, Meijer WG, Dijkuizen L, Goodwin PM (1996) A protein having similarity with methylmalonyl-CoA mutase is required for the assimilation of methanol and ethanol by Methylobacterium extorquens AM1. Microbiology 142:675–684
- Thoden JB, Holden HM, Zhuang Z, Dunaway-Mariano D (2002) X-ray crystallographic analyses of inhibitor and substrate complexes of wild-type and mutant 4-hydroxybenzoyl-CoA thioesterase. J Biol Chem 277:27468–27476
- Thoden JB, Zhuang Z, Dunaway-Mariano D, Holden HM (2003) The structure of 4-hydroxybenzoyl-CoA thioesterase from Arthrobacter sp. strain SU. J Biol Chem 278:43709–43716
- Vlasie MD, Banerjee R (2004) When a spectator turns killer: suicidal electron transfer from cobalamin in methylmalonyl-CoA mutase. Biochemistry 43:8410–8417
- Wang XD, Falcone L, Tabita FR (1993) Reductive pentose phosphateindependent  $CO<sub>2</sub>$  fixation in Rhodobacter sphaeroides and evidence that ribulose bisphosphate carboxylase/oxygenase activity serves to maintain the redox balance of the cell. J Bacteriol 175:3372–3379
- Zarzycki J, Schlichting A, Strychalsky N, Müller M, Alber BE, Fuchs G (2008) Mesaconyl-coenzyme A hydratase, a new enzyme of two central carbon metabolic pathways in bacteria. J Bacteriol 190:1366–1374
- Zhuang Z, Gartemann K-H, Eichnelaub R, Dunaway-Mariano (2003) Characterization of the 4-hydroxybenzoyl-coenzyme A tioesterase from Arthrobacter sp. strain SU. Appl Environ Microbiol 69:2707–2711