

# **Chronic Toxicity of Surface Water from a Canadian Oil Sands End Pit Lake to the Freshwater Invertebrates** *Chironomus dilutus* **and** *Ceriodaphnia dubia*

**Kevin B. White<sup>1</sup> · Karsten Liber1,2**

Received: 26 September 2019 / Accepted: 7 February 2020 / Published online: 20 February 2020 © Springer Science+Business Media, LLC, part of Springer Nature 2020

# **Abstract**

Permanent reclamation of tailings generated by surface mining in the Canadian oil sands may be achieved through the creation of end pit lakes (EPLs) in which tailings are stored in mined-out pits and capped with water. However, these tailings contain high concentrations of dissolved organics, metals, and salts, and thus surface water quality of EPLs is a signifcant concern. This is the frst study to investigate the chronic toxicity of surface water from Base Mine Lake (BML), the Canadian oil sands frst large-scale EPL, to aquatic invertebrates that play a vital role in the early development of aquatic ecosystems (*Chironomus dilutus* and *Ceriodaphnia dubia*). After exposure of *C. dilutus* larvae for 23 days and *C. dubia* neonates for 8 days, no mortality was observed in any treatment with whole BML surface water. However, the emergence of *C. dilutus* adults was delayed by nearly 1 week, and their survival was signifcantly reduced (36%) compared with the controls. Reproduction (fecundity) of *C. dubia* was reduced by 20% after exposure to 2014 BML surface water; however, the efect was not observed after exposure to BML surface water collected a year later in 2015. Despite some adverse efects, the results of this study indicate that BML surface water quality is improving over time and is able to support certain salt-tolerant aquatic organisms. Because salinity within BML will persist for decades without manual intervention, the ecological development of the lake will likely resemble that of a brackish or estuarine ecosystem with reduced diversity.

The extraction and separation of bitumen from surfacemined ore in the Athabasca region of Canada's Alberta oil sands results in the generation of vast quantities of oil sands process-affected water (OSPW) and fluid fine tailings (FFT). These waste products contain high concentrations of dissolved organic acids, metals, and salts that adversely afect a range of physiological endpoints in aquatic organ-isms, such as fish and invertebrates (Alharbi et al. [2016a](#page-9-0); Anderson et al. [2012a](#page-9-1); Bartlett et al. [2017;](#page-9-2) Bauer et al. [2017,](#page-9-3) [2019;](#page-9-4) Kavanagh et al. [2011;](#page-10-0) Lari et al. [2017](#page-10-1), [2018](#page-10-2), [2019](#page-10-3);

**Electronic supplementary material** The online version of this article [\(https://doi.org/10.1007/s00244-020-00720-3\)](https://doi.org/10.1007/s00244-020-00720-3) contains supplementary material, which is available to authorized users. Leclair et al. [2013](#page-10-4); MacDonald et al. [2013;](#page-10-5) McNeill et al. [2012](#page-10-6); van den Heuvel et al. [2012;](#page-11-0) Wiseman et al. [2013a\)](#page-11-1). In many cases, the aquatic toxicity of whole OSPW has been mitigated or eliminated following the reduction or removal of the dissolved organic fraction via physical and chemical treatments, such as ozonation and activated charcoal (Anderson et al. [2012b;](#page-9-5) He et al. [2010](#page-10-7), [2011](#page-10-8), [2012a](#page-10-9), [b](#page-10-10); Lyons et al. [2018](#page-10-11); McQueen et al. [2017;](#page-10-12) Wiseman et al. [2013b\)](#page-11-2). Thus, the dissolved organic fraction of OSPW is now generally accepted as being the primary driver of aquatic toxicity. Historically, this has been attributed to the high concentrations of naphthenic acids (NAs) found in OSPW. However, more recent studies have shown that NAs  $(O<sup>2−</sup> compounds)$ comprise only a portion of the total organic fraction and that other compounds, such as the  $O^{2+}$ , NO<sup>+</sup>, and SO<sup>+</sup> classes, also contribute to the toxicity of OSPW (Alharbi et al. [2016b](#page-9-6); Morandi et al. [2015,](#page-10-13) [2016](#page-10-14); Sun et al. [2017\)](#page-11-3).

Due to a lack of effective and economical large-scale treatment methods, surface mine operators have accumulated nearly 1 trillion L of fuid tailings (AEP [2015a](#page-9-7)) stored in ponds covering more than  $88 \text{ km}^2$  of land (AEP [2015b](#page-9-8)). One of the proposed methods for permanent reclamation is

 $\boxtimes$  Karsten Liber karsten.liber@usask.ca

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Toxicology Centre, University of Saskatchewan, 44 Campus Dr., Saskatoon, SK S7N 5B3, Canada

School of Environment and Sustainability, University of Saskatchewan, 117 Science Place, Saskatoon, SK S7N 5C8, Canada

the establishment of end pit lakes (EPLs) in which FFT is stored in mined-out ore pits and capped with a mixture of OSPW and fresh water. In doing so, oil sands mine operators can use these readily available waste products as backfll materials to solve the issues of accumulation and storage, while relying on natural aging processes as well as manual intervention to improve surface water quality over time. In order to test the large-scale efectiveness of EPLs within the Canadian oil sands, Syncrude established Base Mine Lake (BML) in December 2012—an  $8 \text{ km}^2$  EPL containing 186 billion L of FFT capped with 58 billion L of fresh water and OSPW (Dompierre et al. [2016,](#page-9-9) [2017](#page-9-10)). Detailed geochemical and hydrological characterization of BML is ongoing and described elsewhere (Arriaga et al. [2019;](#page-9-11) Dompierre et al. [2016](#page-9-9), [2017;](#page-9-10) Risacher et al. [2018](#page-10-15); Tedford et al. [2019;](#page-11-4) White and Liber [2018](#page-11-5)). Once acceptable surface water quality has been achieved within BML, the lake may be incorporated into the surrounding watershed for permanent reclamation or discharged into another regional water body, such as the Athabasca River. However, while the toxicity of OSPW may be reduced from aging due to natural degradation and transformation of organic acids, some toxicity is still observed in OSPW samples taken from smaller-scale tailings ponds that have been aging for over a decade (Anderson et al. [2012b](#page-9-5); Wiseman et al. [2013a](#page-11-1)). Thus, the time required for BML to reach acceptable surface water quality remains a signifcant concern.

In a year-long wetland microcosm study, Toor et al. ([2013a](#page-11-6)) showed that although NA concentrations naturally decreased over time leading to reduced acute toxicity, some residual fraction of NAs were recalcitrant and associated with persistent chronic toxicity. It was discovered that natural in situ degradation was dependent upon structure, with small and slightly unsaturated NAs degrading signifcantly faster than large and highly unsaturated NAs (Toor et al. [2013b](#page-11-7)). Thus, the use of natural biodegradation processes within small-scale tailings ponds or large-scale EPLs will likely be insufficient to completely remove dissolved organic-associated toxicity from OSPW in a timely manner (Anderson et al. [2012a](#page-9-1); Toor et al. [2013b\)](#page-11-7). Nonetheless, in extremely long reclamation strategies in which OSPW will age for decades (such as EPLs), the contribution of the organic fraction to toxicity is expected to slowly diminish over time. However, most inorganic constituents, such as major ions, will likely persist in systems such as BML indefnitely (Dompierre et al. [2016,](#page-9-9) [2017;](#page-9-10) White and Liber, [2018](#page-11-5)). Many OSPW toxicity studies acknowledge elevated concentrations of major ions, such as sodium  $(Na<sup>+</sup>)$ , chloride (Cl<sup>−</sup>), sulfate (SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2−</sup>), and bicarbonate (HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>−</sup>), but rarely discuss their infuence on the observed toxicity. Results for the specifc toxicity of OSPW-associated metals are even more limited. However, recent studies have begun to highlight the toxicity of inorganic constituents in aged OSPW,

especially to sensitive aquatic invertebrates, and the potential signifcance this may have for long-term oil sands reclamation (Bauer et al. [2019](#page-9-4); McQueen et al. [2017](#page-10-12); White and Liber [2018\)](#page-11-5).

Although the aquatic toxicity of whole OSPW has already been well characterized, historically most of these studies have examined the effects of raw untreated water on fish and focused on short exposures for release scenarios. In the case of BML, it is more appropriate to examine the potential long-term efects of the more dilute surface water on lower trophic level organisms that will play a role in the colonization and ecological development of aquatic EPL ecosystems. In this study, we investigated the chronic toxicity of whole BML surface water as well as reconstituted BML saltwater to *Chironomus dilutus* and *Ceriodaphnia dubia,* two species of freshwater invertebrates ubiquitous throughout Canadian aquatic ecosystems. Along with other common aquatic invertebrates, such as *Daphnia* and *Hyalella*, these organisms fulfll a vital role in aquatic ecosystems by converting primary producers (phytoplankton and bacteria) into animal protein. Thus, they form an important link in aquatic food chains and comprise a signifcant portion of the diet of higher trophic level organisms, such as juvenile fsh and waterfowl (Environment Canada [1997](#page-9-12), [2007](#page-9-13)). We examined apical endpoints, such as survival, growth, and reproduction, to assess the early surface water quality of BML and to predict potential population-level effects as the lake develops over time.

# **Materials and Methods**

## **Test Organisms**

All tests were conducted using organisms from in-house cultures at the University of Saskatchewan Toxicology Centre (Saskatoon, SK, Canada) maintained according to Environment Canada Biological Test Method guidelines ([1997,](#page-9-12) [2007\)](#page-9-13). *Chironomus dilutus* mass cultures were raised in 15-L aquaria containing aerated, carbon- and bio-fltered municipal water from the City of Saskatoon, and a thin layer of silica sand (particle size 200–400 μm). Cultures were fed 15 mL of Nutrafn fsh fake slurry (Rolf C. Hagen Inc., Montreal, QC) three times per week, and water was changed at least once per week. *Ceriodaphnia dubia* mass cultures were raised in 2-L glass jars containing moderately hard reconstituted water (MHRW) and fed 15 mL of algae (*Raphidocelis subcapitata*,  $3.0 - 3.5 \times 10^7$  cells/mL) and  $4 \text{ mL}$ of YCT (yeast, cerophyll, and trout chow) daily; water was changed at least three times per week. Both *C. dilutus* and *C. dubia* cultures were kept in an environmental chamber maintained at  $23 \pm 1$  °C with a 16:8 h light:dark photoperiod (<600 lx for *C. dubia*).

#### **Exposure Waters**

Surface water samples were collected from BML in October 2014 and used as exposure water in the *C. dilutus* toxicity test. Additional samples were obtained in August 2015, and as a result, both 2014 and 2015 BML surface waters were used in the subsequent *C. dubia* toxicity test. Detailed information on the sampling and chemical composition of these BML surface water samples is reported by White and Liber ([2018](#page-11-5)). Based on the lack of observed effects on survival and growth in diluted 25% and 50% 2014 BML surface water treatments in a *C. dilutus* pilot study (not shown), only the fully concentrated (100%) 2014 BML surface water was used in the partial lifecycle test. Conversely, the *C. dubia* toxicity tests were performed with additional 25% and 50% BML dilution treatments due to the higher sensitivity expected of *C. dubia* from the results of a preliminary NaCl salinity toxicity test (refer to Supplementary Material). Culture water for each test organism was used as the freshwater control and dilution water in each of the respective toxicity tests to remove the need for acclimation. As a result, the water chemistry of the freshwater control in the *C. dilutus* test varied slightly from that of the *C. dubia* test. To account for the potential effects of the elevated salinity found within BML surface water, reconstituted saltwater treatments were also prepared and tested to mimic the major ion composition of each BML surface water treatment (100% saltwater for the 2014 BML surface water in the *C. dilutus* test, and 25%, 50%, and 100% saltwaters in the *C. dubia* test for both 2014 and 2015 BML surface waters). Recipes, water quality parameters, and major ion concentrations for culture freshwaters and reconstituted saltwaters are listed in Tables S1 and S2. All chemical salts were obtained from Fisher Scientifc (Ottawa, ON, Canada). Conventional water quality parameters (temperature, conductivity, pH, hardness, alkalinity, ammonia, and dissolved oxygen) were measured in the Water Quality Laboratory at the University of Saskatchewan Toxicology Centre. Major ion concentrations were analyzed by Maxxam Analytics (Calgary, AB, Canada). More detailed information on chemical analyses is described by White and Liber ([2018\)](#page-11-5).

#### *Chironomus dilutus* **Partial Lifecycle Assessment**

Although *C. dilutus* egg masses have been found to be very resistant to contaminants, frst-instar larvae are the most sensitive life stage, with tolerance progressively increasing with age and instar (Gauss et al. [1985](#page-10-16)). To be as environmentally relevant as possible, the partial lifecycle test was initiated (Day 0) with an egg mass placed directly into each of three 15-L aquaria containing silica sand and one of the exposure waters (culture freshwater, 100% reconstituted 2014 BML saltwater and 100% 2014 BML surface water). The three egg masses were all<24 h old, approximately the same size, and isolated from adults from a single in-house culture and breeding jar. The aquaria were fed 15 mL of Nutrafn slurry approximately every other day, following normal culturing procedures, and daily observations were made on the appearance of each egg mass. After 11 days of exposure, the second phase of the exposure was initiated with 100 larvae randomly isolated from each aquarium. An additional fve groups of ten larvae were randomly selected and isolated from each aquarium and then oven dried at 60 °C for 72 h to determine average 11-day larval dry weights for each treatment (Supplementary Material).

The second phase of the exposure period was conducted in accordance with standard Environment Canada Biological Test guidelines ([1997\)](#page-9-12) with 100 second-instar larvae randomly isolated from each exposure aquarium and transferred in groups of 10 into 300-mL lidded tall form glass beakers containing 50 mL of silica sand and 200 mL of exposure water. Since the organisms had already been exposed for 11 days at this point in the test, they were transferred from the exposure aquaria into the glass test vessels with their larval cases intact. To investigate both larval and adult endpoints, ten replicates of ten organisms (100 organisms per treatment) were used so that half of the test vessels could be terminated before pupation (Day 23), whereas the remaining fve test vessels in each treatment continued the exposure through to adult emergence (until Day 39). Each beaker of ten organisms was continuously aerated and fed 60 µL of Nutrafn slurry daily; water changes (80–90% of volume, approximately 175 mL) and water chemistry (temperature, dissolved oxygen, pH, conductivity, total hardness, alkalinity, and total ammonia) were performed every other day. All test vessels were maintained under the same environmental conditions as previously described for the culture aquaria. Observations on survival as well as larval activity and behavior were recorded daily. Once the frst pupation was observed (Day 23), half of the test vessels in each treatment were terminated and fnal observations of larval survival were recorded. These larvae were then removed from their sediment cases and oven dried. The remaining fve test vessels in each treatment continued with the exposure unchanged, and daily observations were expanded to take note of the timing of larval pupation and adult emergence. Subsets of individual organisms from each treatment, as well as larval cases, were collected from test vessels at test termination and stored in 70% ethanol for morphological and structural characterization.

# *Ceriodaphnia dubia* **Survival and Reproduction Assessment**

The *C. dubia* toxicity test was conducted in accordance with standard Environment Canada Biological Test guidelines [\(2007\)](#page-9-13) using 25-mL borosilicate glass test tubes containing 15 mL of exposure water, 250 µL of algae (*R. subcapitata*), 25 µL of YCT, 1.2 µg of sodium selenate (Na<sub>2</sub>SeO<sub>4</sub>), and 0.5 µg of vitamin B12. Each test tube contained a single<24-h-old *C. dubia* neonate obtained from in-house cultures that had produced a minimum of three healthy broods prior to test initiation. All exposure waters were aerated for at least 48 h before setup and were continuously aerated throughout the entire test before each daily renewal. Each treatment contained ten replicates (10 organisms total) held in test tube racks maintained under the same environmental conditions as the mass cultures (experimental design is depicted in Fig. S1). Test organisms were transferred to clean test tubes containing fresh exposure water, food, and nutrient solutions daily using transfer pipettes. During this process, the orientation and order of treatment groups were randomized to minimize the potential effects of small variations in chamber light intensity. Observations on mortality, brood counts, and general appearance were recorded daily before water changes. Water-quality parameters (temperature, dissolved oxygen, pH, conductivity, total hardness, and alkalinity) were measured daily during water changes: new test solutions on Days 0, 2, 4, and 6; old test solutions on Days 1, 3, 5, and 7. Due to the small volume of water contained within each test tube, water quality for "old" water was measured as a composite of all ten replicates per treatment. Test endpoints were survival (8 days) and the total number of neonates produced in the frst three broods  $(\leq 8$  days).

## **Data and Statistical Analysis**

Due to the percentage-based concentrations of the treatments in both tests (0–100%) no dose–response curves were calculated. Instead, to compare the efects among the freshwater control, saltwater, and BML surface water exposures (as well as diferences between 2014 and 2015), endpoints from each treatment of the *C. dilutus* (survival, larval, and adult dry weights) and *C. dubia* (survival, brood counts) toxicity tests were analyzed using one-way analysis of variance (ANOVA) followed by Tukey's post hoc tests. If results did not pass the Shapiro–Wilk normality test, signifcant diferences among treatments were instead determined using Kruskal–Wallis oneway ANOVA on Ranks followed by Dunn's post hoc tests. All data and statistical analyses were performed and plotted with Sigmaplot version 12.0 software (Systat Software Inc., San Jose, CA) and conducted with  $\alpha$  = 0.05.

### **Results and Discussion**

# *Chironomus dilutus* **Partial Lifecycle Assessment**

Chironomids were exposed to the treatment waters directly as egg masses to mimic potential introduction to BML via surface water oviposition and to capture efects on the earliest life stage and initial case building activity. Even with the longer and more environmentally relevant exposure scenario, no signifcant efects on larval survival were observed in any treatment. Furthermore, exposure to the reconstituted saltwater control had no statistically signifcant efect on any endpoint, which was consistent with the lack of efects observed in the saltwater controls of Anderson et al. [\(2012a,](#page-9-1) [b](#page-9-5)). This apparent lack of effect of salinity was expected, as chironomids are generally much more tolerant of elevated major ion concentrations than other organisms (*C. dilutus* 20-day IC<sub>10</sub> of 2316 mg Cl<sup>−</sup>/L compared to *C. dubia* 7-day IC<sub>25</sub> of 454 mg Cl<sup>−</sup>/L; Elphick et al. [2011](#page-9-14)). Complete survival in the BML treatment was also consistent with exposures of chironomids to aged OSPW from similar reclamation ponds (Anderson et al. [2012b\)](#page-9-5) but in contrast to the signifcant 45% larval mortality observed in exposure to fresh OSPW (Anderson et al. [2012a,](#page-9-1) [b\)](#page-9-5).

Although there were no efects on survival, hatching of the egg masses in the BML surface water treatment appeared delayed and corresponded with a small but signifcant 27% reduction in larval biomass after 23 days of exposure compared with the freshwater and saltwater controls (Fig. S2). This was also similar to the reductions observed in other oil sands reclamation ponds (approximately 20%; Anderson et al. [2012b](#page-9-5)), but signifcantly less than the 64% reduction in larval biomass observed after 10 days of exposure to fresh OSPW (Anderson et al. [2012a](#page-9-1), b). Slight decreases in larval activity, biomass, and structural integrity of sediment cases in the BML surface water treatment were also consistent with observations by Anderson et al. ([2012b](#page-9-5)) for other reclamation ponds. Despite these reductions, no statistically signifcant differences were observed in the fnal biomass of successfully emerged adults after accounting for sex (females are approximately  $2.5 \times$  larger than males due to morphological diferences; Fig. S3). However, it is important to note that the time required to reach fnal biomass varied depending on when adult emergence occurred. It is also worth noting that exposure to environmental stressors often leads to greater proportions of males in chironomid populations (Liber et al. [1996\)](#page-10-17); however, no efects on sex ratio were observed in either this study (Fig. S4) or that of Anderson et al. ([2012b\)](#page-9-5).

#### **Adult Emergence**

Adult emergence in the saltwater control was delayed by 2 days compared with the freshwater control, but still followed the same pattern and rate, and resulted in a similar number of successfully emerged adults (Fig. [1](#page-4-0)). Conversely, adult emergence in the BML surface water treatment was reduced by 40% and delayed by up to 5 days compared with the controls. Thus, even though the adult chironomids in the BML surface water treatment were the same size as those in the freshwater and saltwater controls, they required nearly an additional week of growth to achieve it. A similar effect was observed in organisms exposed to fresh OSPW, although the delay in emergence was signifcantly longer (approximately 11 days), while no signifcant delay was observed in organisms exposed to other oil sands reclamation pond waters (Anderson et al. [2012a,](#page-9-1) [b\)](#page-9-5).

To more accurately identify effects on the survival and emergence of *C. dilutus* adults, organisms were grouped categorically at test termination based on those that: (A) emerged completely from their exuvia and were able to leave the water's surface (survival, successful emergence); (B) emerged completely from their exuvia but were unable to leave the water's surface and drowned (mortality, successful emergence); (C) were unable to completely emerge from their exuvia (mortality, failed emergence); (D) died as pupae (mortality, failed emergence); and (E) died as larvae (mortality, failed pupation). Average percentages of organisms observed within each category of each treatment are shown in Fig. [2](#page-5-0). Average successful emergence (survival A) in the freshwater control, saltwater control, and BML surface water were 60%, 64%, and 36%, respectively. This successful emergence rate in BML surface water was almost identical to that of chironomids exposed to the other reclamation pond waters (approximately 35%; Anderson et al. [2012b](#page-9-5)), and signifcantly higher than those exposed to fresh OSPW (13%; Anderson et al. [2012a](#page-9-1)). It should be noted that the successful emergence rate of the freshwater control in this study was lower than desired at only 60%, which may have been due to overcrowding of test vessels during later stages of the exposure. The studies by Anderson et al. ([2012a](#page-9-1), [b\)](#page-9-5) purposely deviated from standard testing procedure by using larger 1-L beakers containing 500 mL of test solution and observed control emergence rates of approximately 80%. This suggests that improvements to test design may lead to an increase in the emergence success of organisms exposed to BML surface water. This is further supported by the fact that the successful pupation rate in BML surface water (90%;  $A + B + C + D$ ) was approximately 15–20% higher than the rates observed in the other reclamation pond waters (approximately 70–75%; Anderson et al. [2012b\)](#page-9-5).

#### **Organic Acids**

Based on the results of a previous study by Liber et al. [\(1996](#page-10-17)), Anderson et al. [\(2012b](#page-9-5)) suggested that reductions in pupation and adult emergence were a result of reduced larval biomass caused by NA-induced stress or alterations in bioenergetics. Reductions in larval activity and integrity of cases were also attributed to stress and decreased energy stores (Anderson et al. [2012a\)](#page-9-1). A later study by Wiseman et al. [\(2013a](#page-11-1)) found increased abundances of the oxidative stressrelated transcripts *gst*, *cat*, *gpx*, increased abundances of the endocrine disruption-related transcripts *usp, esr, err*, and increased lipid peroxidation in *C. dilutus* exposed to fresh OSPW. As a result, oxidative stress-induced apoptosis was

<span id="page-4-0"></span>**Fig. 1** Cumulative successful emergence of *Chironomus dilutus* adults after exposure to a freshwater control, saltwater control (100% reconstituted 2014 BML saltwater), and 100% 2014 BML surface water. Emergence counts were conducted daily. Exposure duration ranged from 23 to 39 days depending on the day of emergence



<span id="page-5-0"></span>**Fig. 2** Average percentage of *Chironomus dilutus* organisms observed within fve defned categories of survival (A) and mortality (B, C, D, E) after exposure to a freshwater control, saltwater control (100% reconstituted 2014 BML saltwater), and 100% 2014 BML surface water. Exposure duration ranged from 23 to 39 days depending on the day of emergence (A, B, C). Error bars represent one standard deviation of the mean. Signifcant diferences among treatments within each category were determined using one-way ANOVA followed by Tukey's post hoc test and are denoted by lowercase letters



proposed as the cause for decreased survival and growth via metabolism of organic compounds (NAs) in larvae resulting in the production of reactive oxygen species (Wiseman et al. [2013a](#page-11-1)). Additionally, effects on development (reduced pupation and emergence) were attributed to disruption of endocrine function, likely due to smaller organic acids with estrogen-like properties (Wiseman et al. [2013a\)](#page-11-1). These efects were not observed in *C. dilutus* larvae exposed to reclamation pond water, which supports the conclusion that aging reduces concentrations of NAs and their associated toxicity (Wiseman et al. [2013a\)](#page-11-1). The results of this study support the organic acid fraction as being the primary driver of OSPW toxicity to *C. dilutus* as similar efects between surface water from BML and the other water-capped oil sands reclamation ponds corresponded with similar concentrations of NAs (13–25 mg/L; Anderson et al. [2012b](#page-9-5); White and Liber [2018](#page-11-5)). It is important to note that even though the toxicity of aged reclamation pond water was signifcantly reduced compared with fresh OSPW, it still contained an appreciable concentration of NAs and caused a signifcant reduction in the success of *C. dilutus* adult emergence (Wiseman et al. [2013a](#page-11-1)). Anderson et al. ([2012a](#page-9-1)) also found that ozonation of fresh OSPW signifcantly reduced the concentration of NAs and their associated toxicity, but a small concentration and some effects remained. This suggests that some recalcitrant fraction of NAs will likely persist within BML surface water and continue to afect the growth and development of sensitive invertebrate species for some time.

# **Surface Tension**

The most interesting result from this study was that the reduction in emergence success of organisms exposed to BML surface water appeared to be due to a signifcant increase in the proportion of fully emerged adults that were unable to leave the surface of the water and drowned (mortality B). The average mortality values for these organisms within the freshwater control, saltwater control, and BML surface water treatments were 6%, 10%, and 32%, respectively. Unfortunately, Anderson et al. ([2012a,](#page-9-1) [b](#page-9-5)) did not qualitatively assess adult emergence and therefore it is unknown whether a similar phenomenon occurred in their studies. Based on qualitative observations of water samples throughout the duration of this test, the surface tension of BML surface water was noticeably lower than that of the freshwater and saltwater controls, which may have been at least partly responsible for the observed efects on emergence. Studies characterizing OSPW and its dissolved organic fraction have frequently made note of the surfactant-like properties and structure of NAs (Alharbi et al. [2016a;](#page-9-0) Clemente and Fedorak [2005](#page-9-15); Frank et al. [2008](#page-9-16); Pourrezai et al. [2011;](#page-10-18) Schramm and Smith [1985](#page-11-8)). However, this surfactant effect in reducing surface water tension of OSPW and its impact on aquatic organisms has not been previously demonstrated. This is unsurprising, as this efect would have the most impact on insects, especially those that require surface tension to transition from an aquatic pupal stage to a terrestrial adult stage (such as *C. dilutus*), which have only been briefy examined in the context of OSPW toxicity. This apparent inability to escape the surface of BML water may also be a result of decreased energy, as previously discussed, or a combination of this efect with reduced surface tension.

#### *Ceriodaphnia dubia* **Survival and Reproduction**

Aside from 90% survival in the freshwater control, 100% survival was observed in all *C. dubia* test treatments after 8 days of exposure (Fig. S5). Furthermore, no statistically signifcant diferences were observed in reproduction among any of the treatments, or between the two years, at the 25% and 50% dilution levels, except for 2015 BML surface water which caused a small but statistically significant increase in reproduction. Conversely, statistically signifcant rates of reproduction inhibition were observed in both the 2014 and 2015 100% BML saltwater controls (53% and 52% inhibition, respectively). Some inhibition of reproduction (19%) was observed in the 100% 2014 BML surface water treatment; however, the 100% 2015 BML surface water did not cause any statistically signifcant inhibition of reproduction (Fig. [3\)](#page-6-0).

#### **Salinity**

We have previously identified that Na<sup>+</sup>, Cl<sup>−</sup>, and  $HCO<sub>3</sub><sup>-</sup>$  are the major ions that comprise the vast majority of the salinity within BML surface water (92% of total osmolarity) and also pose the highest potential toxicological risk to sensitive freshwater aquatic organisms such as *C. dubia* (White and Liber [2018\)](#page-11-5). Studies of chronic toxicity of major ions and salinity on the growth and

reproduction of cladocerans, such as *C. dubia*, generally attribute efects to altered energy allocation due to impairment of osmoregulation (Erickson et al. [2017](#page-9-17); Freitas and Rocha [2011;](#page-10-19) Lasier and Hardin [2010;](#page-10-20) Mount et al. [2016](#page-10-21); Simmons [2012;](#page-11-9) Soucek and Dickinson [2016\)](#page-11-10). The hemolymph of freshwater cladocerans, such as *Ceriodaphnia,* is hyperosmotic relative to the external environment; thus, osmoregulation is largely dependent on the active uptake and concentration of major ions against a concentration gradient, such as  $Cl^-$  exchange for  $HCO_3^-$  via active Na<sup>+</sup>/ K+ ATP transport pumps (Aladin [1991](#page-9-18); Aladin and Potts [1995](#page-9-19); Hoke et al. [1992](#page-10-22)). Because the body wall of cladocerans has very low permeability to water and ions, these transport processes occur via specialized, highly permeable membranes containing mitochondria-rich ion-transporting cells (also known as chloride cells or ionocytes) localized at the epipodites—gill-like structures attached to the base of the legs (Aladin [1991\)](#page-9-18). In environments with increased salinity, such as BML, concentration gradients across these membranes are altered, resulting in greater energy required to maintain homeostasis and leading to stress. Several other related mechanisms of efect also have been identifed, including direct damage to embryos (Freitas and Rocha [2011\)](#page-10-19), altered membrane permeability (Baker et al. [2017](#page-9-20)), competition at uptake sites (Simmons [2012;](#page-11-9) Soucek and Dickinson [2016](#page-11-10)), and decreased flterfeeding rates (Soucek [2007](#page-11-11)).



<span id="page-6-0"></span>**Fig. 3** Average number of neonates produced per *Ceriodaphnia dubia* adult in the frst three broods (**A**), and calculated reproduction inhibition (**B**), after exposure to a freshwater control (moderately hard reconstituted water, MHRW), saltwater control (reconstituted 2014 and 2015 BML saltwater), and 2014 and 2015 BML surface water. The BML surface water treatments were tested at 25%, 50%, and

100% strength (dilution in MHRW) with paired saltwater controls at the same concentrations. Error bars represent 1 standard deviation of the mean. Signifcant diferences among treatments were determined using one-way ANOVA followed by Tukey's post hoc test  $(n=6-10,$  $\alpha$ =0.05) and are denoted by letters

The effects of salinity within BML surface water on *C. dubia* can be predicted as a function of total osmolarity and  $Ca<sup>2+</sup>$  concentration using the acute 'general ion toxicity submodel' developed by Erickson et al. [\(2018](#page-9-21); Eq. 16), as previously demonstrated (White and Liber [2018\)](#page-11-5). Based on the water chemistry reported in Table S2, the model provided *C. dubia* 48-h osmolarity  $LC_{50}$  values of 74 mM for the 100% BML surface water and 78 mM for the 100% saltwater controls. These values were approximately 30% higher than the measured osmolarity in the 2014 and 2015 100% BML surface water and saltwater treatments (51–55 mM), which seemed to support the lack of mortality observed in the saltwater treatments. A subsequent model for the chronic toxicity of major ions to *C. dubia* was recently published by the same group (Mount et al. [2019;](#page-10-23) Eq. 6). The chronic toxicity model is based on the same "general ion toxicity submodel" parameters (total osmolarity and  $Ca^{2+}$  concentration) described by Erickson et al. [\(2018\)](#page-9-21), but instead estimates a 7-day  $IC_{50}$  for *C. dubia* reproduction. Based on the water chemistry reported in Table S2, the model provided *C. dubia* 7-day osmolarity  $IC_{50}$  values of 36–37 mM for the 100% BML surface waters and 100% saltwater controls. These values were consistent with the results of Mount et al. [\(2019](#page-10-23)), which indicate that the acute-to-chronic ratio for the toxicity of Na salts is approximately 2 (1.9, 1.8, and 2.3 for NaCl,  $Na<sub>2</sub>SO<sub>4</sub>$ , and NaHCO<sub>3</sub>, respectively). Compared with the acute toxicity model, the predicted chronic toxicity IC<sub>50</sub> values were approximately 30% lower than the measured osmolarity in the 100% BML surface water and saltwater controls, indicating > 50% inhibition of reproduction. However, the results of the preliminary NaCl toxicity test yielded a somewhat higher 7-day *C. dubia* osmolarity  $IC_{50}$  of 52 mM, which indicated approximately 50% inhibition of reproduction in the 100% BML surface waters and 100% saltwater controls (refer to Supplementary Material for the full discussion of the NaCl toxicity test results; Figs. S6 and S7). Overall, these predictions were relatively consistent with the 52–53% inhibition observed in the 100% saltwater controls but signifcantly higher than the 0–19% inhibition observed in the 100% BML surface water treatments.

#### **Water Hardness and Trace Elements**

These discrepancies may be at least partially explained by diferences in water hardness among the diferent treatments and tests. Water hardness has been shown to have a signifcant efect on mitigating the toxicity of salinity to sensitive freshwater organisms, such as *C. dubia* (Elphick et al. [2011](#page-9-14); Erickson et al. [2017](#page-9-17); Lasier and Hardin [2010](#page-10-20); Mount et al. [2019,](#page-10-23) 2016). The NaCl toxicity test was performed using a stock solution spiked directly into the 60 mg  $CaCO<sub>3</sub>/L$ MHRW *C. dubia* culture and dilution water, whereas the reconstituted BML saltwater was prepared to have a water hardness as close to natural BML surface water as possible (100 mg  $CaCO<sub>3</sub>/L$ ). However, due to the high pH and  $HCO_3^-/CO_3^2$  concentration within the reconstituted saltwaters, it was difficult to maintain the desired water hardness of 100 mg  $CaCO<sub>3</sub>/L$ , because the Ca and Mg visibly precipitated out of solution over time as carbonates. The same phenomenon was observed in the reconstituted saltwater prepared in the *C. dilutus* test, although it had no efect on the results due to the higher tolerance of *C. dilutus* to salinity. In an attempt to correct for this decrease, the 100% saltwater solutions used in the *C. dubia* toxicity test were prepared at a higher initial water hardness (120 mg  $CaCO<sub>3</sub>/L$ ), but still dropped to 70–80 mg  $CaCO<sub>3</sub>/L$  after a few days of aeration. Substantial precipitation and settling of  $CaCO<sub>3</sub>$  also occurred in *C. dubia* tests at high pH by Mount et al. ([2016](#page-10-21)), with a 92% reduction observed in the concentration of dissolved  $CaCO<sub>3</sub>$  after only 48 h (1500 mg/L to 120 mg/L).

It also is worth noting that Mount et al. [\(2016](#page-10-21)) used amended saltwaters instead of reconstituted saltwaters in their toxicity tests (chemical salts were added to natural feld-collected water instead of laboratory water). Natural feld-collected water contains background alkalinity without the need for the excessive addition of chemical NaHCO<sub>3</sub> salt used in this study, while also containing trace nutrients which provide beneficial effects and a more realistic exposure scenario (Mount et al. [2016\)](#page-10-21). This is supported by the hormesis-like effects observed in the 25% and 50% dilution 2015 BML surface water treatments, which were likely due to the very low concentrations of trace elements measured within BML surface water (White and Liber [2018\)](#page-11-5), many of which are essential micronutrients for *C. dubia* (Naddy et al. [1995](#page-10-24)). It is therefore reasonable to assume that improving the saltwater formulation to more adequately mimic the chemical composition of BML surface water would further reduce the observed inhibition of *C. dubia* reproduction. However, only increasing the water hardness by 20 mg CaCO<sub>3</sub>/L and adding some trace nutrients to the  $100\%$ saltwater controls seems insufficient to achieve the substantial amelioration of reproduction success observed in the 100% BML surface water treatments.

#### **Dissolved Organic Carbon**

The only other difference in the chemical composition between the reconstituted saltwaters and BML surface waters was the absence of dissolved organic carbon (DOC). It was therefore hypothesized that the presence of DOC within BML surface water (23–24 mg/L) may have had an attenuating efect on the toxicity of the major ions. This apparent antagonism between major ion toxicity and dissolved organic acids (NAs) has previously been observed in pilot studies of OSPW exposure to both *C. dubia* and chironomids (Kennedy [2012;](#page-10-25) Turcotte et al. [2009](#page-11-12)), as well as in a recent study by Bauer et al. [\(2019\)](#page-9-4). Attenuating saltorganic acid interactions also have been observed in toxicity tests of major ions to *C. dubia* (Lasier and Hardin [2010](#page-10-20)) and NAs to fathead minnows (Kavanagh et al. [2012](#page-10-26)). In both cases, the effect was only observed in tests with  $HCO<sub>3</sub>$  salts, but not Cl or  $SO_4$  salts. The conservation of this bicarbonate-organic acid interaction between diferent species and research groups (and the apparent lack of similar interactions with Cl and  $SO_4$ ) suggests a specific mechanism of action and supports the conclusions of both groups that the efect may be due to altered uptake (Kavanagh et al. [2012;](#page-10-26) Lasier and Hardin [2010\)](#page-10-20). More recent studies of  $HCO_3^-$  toxicity (Harper et al. [2014;](#page-10-27) Vera et al. [2014\)](#page-11-13) attribute effects to the disruption of active  $Cl^-/HCO_3^-$  exchange and regulation resulting in the inhibition of Cl− uptake by cladocerans based on the mechanism proposed by Hoke et al. ([1992](#page-10-22)). High concentrations of  $HCO_3^-$  also have been observed to cause significant reductions in  $Na^{+}/K^{+}$  ATP pump activity in fathead minnows (Farag and Harper [2014\)](#page-9-22). However, the infuence of dissolved organic compounds on this mechanism and its potential efect within BML surface water remain unknown.

## **Ecological Development of Base Mine Lake**

Although salinity within BML surface water likely poses the highest concern for freshwater organisms with rapid development and reproduction, our results suggest that BML surface water quality has reached an acceptable level to support populations of certain salt-tolerant invertebrates. Furthermore, the reduction in reproduction inhibition observed in the *C. dubia* test (19% in 2014, 0% in 2015) suggests that BML surface water quality continues to improve over time. This is supported by the discovery of wild *Daphnia pulex* in a sample of BML surface water collected in August 2016 (White and Liber [2018](#page-11-5)). Recent studies also have discovered a relatively dynamic and diverse microbial community within the surface water of BML (Mori et al. [2019](#page-10-28); Richardson et al. [2020\)](#page-10-29), particularly in the upper oxygenated zone where they may serve as a potential food source for higher trophic level organisms such as daphnids. However, Richardson et al. [\(2020](#page-10-29)) also detected a low relative abundance of photosynthesizers, attributed to the high turbidity measured within BML surface water (Tedford et al. [2019](#page-11-4)), which may ultimately limit the potential for robust ecological development within BML.

For salt-tolerant organisms with longer and more complex lifecycles, such as *C. dilutus*, long-term exposure to BML surface water may adversely affect development due to the presence of persistent dissolved organic acids. Unfortunately, neither the exposure duration used in this study, nor those of Anderson et al. ([2012a,](#page-9-1) [b\)](#page-9-5), extended for the full lifecycle of *C. dilutus.* Without knowledge of the efects of BML surface water exposure on adult reproduction and the development of subsequent progeny, it is difficult to predict population-level efects in the feld. It has previously been shown that a reduction in larval growth can be associated with a decline in the reproductive output of female chironomids (Sibley et al. [1997](#page-11-14)), although the ovipositing success of females and their second-generation ofspring may be unafected (Liber et al. [1996\)](#page-10-17). Despite observed delays and reductions in larval growth, the similar biomass of all successfully emerged adults in this study suggests that exposure to BML surface water may not signifcantly afect reproductive success. It has been proposed that delays in the time to emergence of *C. dilutus* adults, as well as altered behavior and case structure, may increase the susceptibility of larvae and pupae to predators (Anderson et al. [2012b;](#page-9-5) Sibley et al. [1997](#page-11-14)). However, this will only be of concern once BML surface water is able to support higher trophic level organisms, such as fsh, at which point the toxicity of BML surface water and prevalence of these efects will likely be even further reduced. Delays in adult emergence may also afect mating success if they are sex-specifc, such as those observed by Anderson et al. ([2012a\)](#page-9-1), although the lack of efect on sex ratio in successfully emerged adults in BML surface water suggests otherwise. Of all test endpoints, the reduced emergence success (36%) of adults exposed to BML surface water is therefore the most concerning with respect to long-term ecosystem health. Despite this reduction, adults who did successfully emerge appeared normal and healthy, which may indicate that reproduction and population growth will still occur in BML, albeit at lower rates compared with natural aquatic ecosystems. This prediction is supported by the results of previous surveys of aquatic insect populations and colonization in OSPW-afected constructed wetlands of the Canadian oil sands region. Whelly ([2000\)](#page-11-15) observed similar reductions in the growth and survival of OSPW-exposed *Chironomus* larvae in these systems but no significant effects on the rates of oviposition or total adults. However, both Whelly ([2000\)](#page-11-15) and Leonhardt ([2003\)](#page-10-30) observed a general trend of decreased species abundance and richness that indicated functional, but low-diversity ecosystems.

# **Conclusions**

This is the frst study to examine the toxicity of BML surface water to freshwater invertebrates involved in the colonization and early development of aquatic ecosystems. Due to the more dilute nature of BML surface water compared with raw OSPW, no statistically signifcant mortality was observed after chronic exposure of *C. dilutus* larvae and *C. dubia* neonates to either whole BML surface water or reconstituted BML saltwater. However, a signifcant delay in the growth and time to emergence, as well as a reduction in emergence success, was observed in adult *C. dilutus* over the course of the partial lifecycle test (approximately 25–40 days). These efects were attributed to the dissolved organic compounds within BML surface water, because no similar efects were observed in the saltwater controls. As a result, these efects are expected to diminish over time as BML continues to age and will likely only infuence the total number of organisms within the ecosystem, because adults who did emerge successfully appeared to be healthy and were of the same size, shape, and sex ratio as those in the controls. In the *C. dubia* tests, a 20% reduction in reproductive output (fecundity) was observed in organisms exposed for 8 days to whole BML surface water collected in 2014 but was not observed in organisms exposed to BML surface water collected the following year (2015). These results, in addition to the discovery of wild *Daphnia pulex* adults and neonates in a BML surface water sample collected in 2016 (White and Liber [2018](#page-11-5)), indicate that the surface water quality of BML continues to improve over time and has reached an acceptable level to support populations of certain salt-tolerant aquatic organisms. However, salinity within BML will continue to be a persistent concern for decades, and thus the ecological development of the lake will likely resemble that of a brackish or estuarine ecosystem with reduced diversity and possibly reduced abundance.

**Acknowledgements** This research was funded by the University of Saskatchewan Toxicology Centre and the Toxicology Graduate Program. The authors thank Stephanie Schifer, Katherine Raes, and Erin Maloney for their assistance in the culturing and care of test organisms used in this study.

# **References**

- <span id="page-9-7"></span>AEP (2015a) Mineable oil sands fuid tailings volume by facility as of the end of 2013. Oil Sands Information Portal, Alberta Environment and Parks, Edmonton, AB. Dataset no. 540. [http://osip.alber](http://osip.alberta.ca/library/Dataset/Details/540) [ta.ca/library/Dataset/Details/540.](http://osip.alberta.ca/library/Dataset/Details/540) Accessed 27 Feb 2015
- <span id="page-9-8"></span>AEP (2015b) Total area of the oil sands tailings ponds over time. Oil Sands Information Portal, Alberta Environment and Parks, Edmonton, AB. Dataset no. 542. [http://osip.alberta.ca/library/](http://osip.alberta.ca/library/Dataset/Details/542) [Dataset/Details/542.](http://osip.alberta.ca/library/Dataset/Details/542) Accessed 4 Mar 2015
- <span id="page-9-18"></span>Aladin NV (1991) Salinity tolerance and morphology of the osmoregulation organs in Cladocera with special reference to Cladocera from the Aral Sea. Hydrobiologia 225:291–299
- <span id="page-9-19"></span>Aladin NV, Potts WTW (1995) Osmoregulatory capacity of the Cladocera. J Comp Physiol B 164:671–683
- <span id="page-9-0"></span>Alharbi HA, Morandi G, Giesy JP, Wiseman SB (2016a) Efect of oil sands process-afected water on toxicity of retene to early life-stages of Japanese medaka (*Oryzias latipes*). Aquat Toxicol 176:1–9
- <span id="page-9-6"></span>Alharbi HA, Saunders DVM, Al-Mousa A, Alcorn J, Pereira AS, Martin JW, Giesy JP, Wiseman SB (2016b) Inhibition of ABC transport proteins by oil sands process afected water. Aquat Toxicol 170:81–88
- <span id="page-9-1"></span>Anderson JC, Wiseman SB, Wang N, Moustafa A, Perez-Estrada L, Gamal El-Din M, Martin JW, Liber K, Giesy JP (2012a)

Efectiveness of ozonation treatment in eliminating toxicity of oil sands process-afected water to *Chironomus dilutus*. Environ Sci Technol 46:486–493

- <span id="page-9-5"></span>Anderson JC, Wiseman SB, Moustafa A, Gamal El-Din M, Liber K, Giesy JP (2012b) Effects of exposure to oil sands processafected water from experimental reclamation ponds on *Chironomus dilutus*. Water Res 46:1662–1672
- <span id="page-9-11"></span>Arriaga D, Nelson TC, Risacher FF, Morris PK, Goad C, Slater GF, Warren LA (2019) The co-importance of physical mixing and biogeochemical consumption in controlling water cap oxygen levels in Base Mine Lake. Appl Geochem 111:104442
- <span id="page-9-20"></span>Baker JA, Gilron G, Chalmers BA, Elphick JR (2017) Evaluation of the efect of water type on the toxicity of nitrate to aquatic organisms. Chemosphere 168:435–440
- <span id="page-9-2"></span>Bartlett AJ, Frank RA, Gillis PL, Parrott JL, Marentette JR, Brown LR, Hooey T, Vanderveen R, McInnis R, Brunswick P, Shang D, Headley JV, Peru KM, Hewitt LM (2017) Toxicity of naphthenic acids to invertebrates: extracts from oil sands processafected water versus commercial mixtures. Environ Pollut 227:271–279
- <span id="page-9-3"></span>Bauer AE, Frank RA, Headley JV, Peru KM, Farwell AJ, Dixon DG (2017) Toxicity of oil sands acid-extractable organic fractions to freshwater fsh: *Pimephales promelas* (fathead minnow) and *Oryzias latipes* (Japanese medaka). Chemosphere 171:168–176
- <span id="page-9-4"></span>Bauer AE, Hewitt LM, Parrott JL, Bartlett AJ, Gillis PL, Deeth LE, Rudy MD, Vanderveen R, Brown L, Campbell SD, Rodrigues MR, Farwell AJ, Dixon DG, Frank RA (2019) The toxicity of organic fractions from aged oil sands process-afected water to aquatic species. Sci Total Environ 669:702–710
- <span id="page-9-12"></span>Environment Canada (1997) Biological test method: test for survival and growth in sediment using the larvae of freshwater midges (*Chironomus tentans* or *Chironomus riparius*). Method Development and Applications Section, Environment Canada, Ottawa, ON
- <span id="page-9-13"></span>Environment Canada (2007) Biological test method: test of reproduction and survival using the cladoceran *Ceriodaphnia dubia*. Method Development and Applications Section, Environment Canada, Ottawa, ON
- <span id="page-9-15"></span>Clemente JS, Fedorak PM (2005) A review of the occurrence, analyses, toxicity, and biodegradation of naphthenic acids. Chemosphere 60:585–600
- <span id="page-9-9"></span>Dompierre KA, Lindsay MBJ, Cruz-Hernandez P, Halferdahl GM (2016) Initial geochemical characteristics of fuid fne tailings in an oil sands end pit lake. Sci Total Environ 556:196–206
- <span id="page-9-10"></span>Dompierre KA, Barbour SL, North RL, Carey SK, Lindsay MBJ (2017) Chemical mass transport between fuid fne tailings and the overlying water cover of an oil sands end pit lake. Water Resour Res 53:4725–4740
- <span id="page-9-14"></span>Elphick JRF, Bergh KD, Bailey HC (2011) Chronic toxicity of chloride to freshwater species: efects of hardness and implications of water quality guidelines. Environ Toxicol Chem 30:239–246
- <span id="page-9-17"></span>Erickson RJ, Mount DR, Highland TL, Hockett JR, Hoff DJ, Jenson CT, Norberg-King TJ, Peterson KN (2017) The acute toxicity of major ion salts to *Ceriodaphnia dubia*. II. Empirical relationships in binary salt mixtures. Environ Toxicol Chem 36:1525–1537
- <span id="page-9-21"></span>Erickson RJ, Mount DR, Highland TL, Hockett JR, Hoff DJ, Jenson CT, Norberg-King TJ, Peterson KN (2018) The acute toxicity of major ion salts to *Ceriodaphnia dubia.* III. Mathematical models for mixture toxicity. Environ Toxicol Chem 37:247–259
- <span id="page-9-22"></span>Farag AM, Harper DD (2014) The chronic toxicity of sodium bicarbonate, a major component of coal bed natural gas produced waters. Environ Toxicol Chem 33:532–540
- <span id="page-9-16"></span>Frank RA, Kavanagh R, Burnison BK, Arsenault G, Headley JV, Peru KM, Solomon KR (2008) Toxicity assessment of collected fractions from an extracted naphthenic acid mixture. Chemosphere 72:1309–1314
- <span id="page-10-19"></span>Freitas EC, Rocha O (2011) Acute and chronic efects of sodium and potassium on the tropical freshwater cladoceran *Pseudosida ramosa*. Ecotox 20:88–96
- <span id="page-10-16"></span>Gauss JD, Woods PE, Winner RW, Skillings JH (1985) Acute toxicity of copper to three life stages of *Chironomus tentans* as afected by water hardness/alkalinity. Environ Pollut 37:149–157
- <span id="page-10-27"></span>Harper DD, Farag AM, Skaar D (2014) Acute toxicity of sodium bicarbonate, a major component of coal bed natural gas produced waters, to 13 aquatic species as defned in the laboratory. Environ Toxicol Chem 33:525–531
- <span id="page-10-7"></span>He Y, Wiseman SB, Zhang X, Hecker M, Jones PD, Gamal El-Din M, Martin JW, Giesy JP (2010) Ozonation attenuates the steroidogenic disruptive efects of sediment free oil sands process water in the H295R cell line. Chemosphere 80:578–584
- <span id="page-10-8"></span>He Y, Wiseman SB, Hecker M, Zhang X, Wang N, Perez LA, Jones PD, Gamal El-Din M, Martin JW, Giesy JP (2011) Efect of ozonation on the estrogenicity and androgenicity of oil sands processafected water. Environ Sci Technol 45:6268–6274
- <span id="page-10-9"></span>He Y, Patterson S, Wang N, Hecker M, Martin JW, Gamal El-Din M, Giesy JP, Wiseman SB (2012a) Toxicity of untreated and ozone-treated oil sands process-afected water (OSPW) to early life stages of the fathead minnow (*Pimephales promelas*). Water Res 46:6359–6368
- <span id="page-10-10"></span>He Y, Wiseman SB, Wang N, Perez-Estrada LA, Gamal El-Din M, Martin JW, Giesy JP (2012b) Transcriptional responses of the brain-gonad-liver axis of fathead minnows exposed to untreated and ozone-treated oil sands process-afected water. Environ Sci Technol 46:9701–9708
- <span id="page-10-22"></span>Hoke RA, Gala WR, Drake JB, Giesy JP (1992) Bicarbonate as a potential confounding factor in Cladoceran toxicity assessments of pore water from contaminated sediments. Can J Fish Aquat Sci 49:1633–1640
- <span id="page-10-0"></span>Kavanagh RJ, Frank RA, Oakes KD, Servos MR, Young RF, Fedorak PM, MacKinnon MD, Solomon KR, Dixon DG, van der Kraak G (2011) Fathead minnow (*Pimephales promelas*) reproduction is impaired in aged oil sands process-afected waters. Aquat Toxicol 101:214–220
- <span id="page-10-26"></span>Kavanagh RJ, Frank RA, Burnison BK, Young RF, Fedorak PM, Solomon KR, Van Der Kraak G (2012) Fathead minnow (*Pimephales promelas*) reproduction is impaired when exposed to a naphthenic acid extract. Aquat Toxicol 116–117:34–42
- <span id="page-10-25"></span>Kennedy KD (2012) Growth, survival, and community composition of Chironomidae (Diptera) larvae in selected Athabasca oil sands process-afected wetlands waters of north-eastern Alberta. M.Sc. Dissertation, Department of Biological Sciences, University of Windsor, Windsor, ON, Canada. [https://scholar.uwindsor.ca/](https://scholar.uwindsor.ca/etd/4820/) [etd/4820/](https://scholar.uwindsor.ca/etd/4820/). Accessed 21 Apr 2017
- <span id="page-10-1"></span>Lari E, Steinkey D, Mohaddes E, Pyle GG (2017) Investigating the chronic efects of oil sands process-afected water on growth and ftness of *Daphnia magna* Straus 1820. Sci Total Environ 595:594–600
- <span id="page-10-2"></span>Lari E, Steinkey D, Pyle GG (2018) Efects of seasonal changes on the toxic impacts of oil sands process-afected water on *Daphnia magna*. Arch Environ Contam Toxicol 74:408–413
- <span id="page-10-3"></span>Lari E, Steinkey D, Razmara P, Mohaddes E, Pyle GG (2019) Oil sands process-afected water impairs the olfactory system of rainbow trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*). Ecotox Environ Saf 170:62–67
- <span id="page-10-20"></span>Lasier PJ, Hardin IR (2010) Observed and predicted reproduction of *Ceriodaphnia dubia* exposed to chloride, sulfate, and bicarbonate. Environ Toxicol Chem 29:347–358
- <span id="page-10-4"></span>Leclair LA, MacDonald GZ, Phalen LJ, Kollner B, Hogan NS, van den Heuvel MR (2013) The immunological effects of oil sands surface waters and naphthenic acids on rainbow trout (*Oncorhynchus mykiss*). Aquat Toxicol 142–143:185–194
- <span id="page-10-30"></span>Leonhardt CL (2003) Zoobenthic succession in constructed wetlands of the Fort McMurray oil sands region: developing a measure

of zoobenthic recovery. M.Sc. dissertation. University of Windsor, Windsor, ON, Canada. <https://scholar.uwindsor.ca/etd/4612>. Accessed 21 Apr 2017

- <span id="page-10-17"></span>Liber K, Call DJ, Dawson TD, Whiteman FW, Dillon TM (1996) Efects of *Chironomus tentans* larval growth retardation on adult emergence and ovipositing success: implications for interpreting freshwater sediment bioassays. Hydrobiologia 323:155–167
- <span id="page-10-11"></span>Lyons DD, Philibert DA, Zablocki T, Qin R, Huang R, Gamal El-Din M, Tierney KB (2018) Assessment of raw and ozonated oil sands process-affected water exposure in developing zebrafish: associating morphological changes with gene expression. Environ Pollut 241:959–968
- <span id="page-10-5"></span>MacDonald GZ, Hogan NS, Kollner B, Thorpe KL, Phalen LJ, Wagner BD, van den Heuvel MR (2013) Immunotoxic efects of oil sands-derived naphthenic acids to rainbow trout. Aquat Toxicol 126:95–103
- <span id="page-10-6"></span>McNeill SA, Arens CJ, Hogan NS, Kollner B, van den Heuvel MR (2012) Immunological impacts of oil sands-afected waters on rainbow trout evaluated using an in situ exposure. Ecotoxicol Environ Saf 84:254–261
- <span id="page-10-12"></span>McQueen AD, Kinley CM, Hendrikse M, Gaspari DP, Calomeni AJ, Iwinski KJ, Castle JW, Haakensen MC, Peru KM, Headley JV, Rodgers JH (2017) A risk-based approach for identifying constituents of concern in oil sands process-afected water from the Athabasca Oil Sands region. Chemosphere 173:340–350
- <span id="page-10-13"></span>Morandi GD, Wiseman SB, Pereira A, Mankidy R, Gault IGM, Martin JW, Giesy JP (2015) Efects-directed analysis of dissolved organic compounds in oil sands process-afected water. Envrion Sci Technol 49:12395–12404
- <span id="page-10-14"></span>Morandi GD, Zhang K, Wiseman SB, Pereira A, Martin JW, Giesy JP (2016) Effect of lipid partitioning on predictions of acute toxicity of oil sands process afected water to embryos of fathead minnow (*Pimephales promelas*). Environ Sci Technol 50:8858–8866
- <span id="page-10-28"></span>Mori JF, Chen LX, Jessen GL, Rudderham SB, McBeth JM, Lindsay MBJ, Slater GF, Banfeld JF, Warren LA (2019) Putative mixotrophic nitrifying-denitrifying gammaproteobacteria implicated in nitrogen cycling within the ammonia/oxygen transition zone of an oil sands pit lake. Front Microbiol 10:1–15
- <span id="page-10-21"></span>Mount DR, Erickson RJ, Highland TL, Hockett JR, Hoff DJ, Jenson CT, Norberg-King TJ, Peterson KN, Polaske ZM (2016) The acute toxicity of major ion salts to *Ceriodaphnia dubia*: I. infuence of background water chemistry. Environ Toxicol Chem 35:3039–3057
- <span id="page-10-23"></span>Mount DR, Erickson RJ, Forsman BB, Highland TL, Hockett JR, Hof DL, Jenson CT, Norberg-King TJ (2019) Chronic toxicity of major ion salts and their mixtures to *Ceriodaphnia dubia*. Environ Toxicol Chem 38:769–783
- <span id="page-10-24"></span>Naddy RB, La Point TW, Klaine SJ (1995) Toxicity of arsenic, molybdenum and selenium combinations to *Ceriodaphnia dubia*. Environ Toxicol Chem 14:329–336
- <span id="page-10-18"></span>Pourrezai P, Drzewicz P, Wang Y, Gamal El-Din M, Perez-Estrada LA, Martin JW, Anderson J, Wiseman S, Liber K, Giesy JP (2011) The impact of metallic coagulants on the removal of organic compounds from oil sands process-afect water. Environ Sci Technol 45:8452–8459
- <span id="page-10-29"></span>Richardson E, Bass D, Smirnova A, Paoli L, Dunfeld P, Dacks JB (2020) Phylogenetic estimation of community composition and novel eukaryotic lineages in base mine lake: an oil sands tailings reclamation site in Northern Alberta. J Eukaryot Microbiol 67:86–99. <https://doi.org/10.1111/jeu.12757>
- <span id="page-10-15"></span>Risacher FF, Morris PK, Arriaga D, Goad C, Nelson TC, Slater GF, Warren LA (2018) The interplay of methane and ammonia as key oxygen consuming constituents in early stage development of Base Mine Lake, the frst demonstration oil sands pit lake. Appl Geochem 93:49–59
- <span id="page-11-8"></span>Schramm LL, Smith RG (1985) The infuence of natural surfactants on interfacial charges in the hot-water process for recovering bitumen from the Athabasca oil sands. Colloid Surf 14:61–85
- <span id="page-11-14"></span>Sibley PK, Benoit DA, Ankley GT (1997) The signifcance of growth in *Chironomus tentans* sediment toxicity tests: relationship to reproduction and demographic endpoints. Environ Toxicol Chem 16:336–345
- <span id="page-11-9"></span>Simmons JA (2012) Toxicity of major cations and anions ( $Na<sup>+</sup>$ ,  $K<sup>+</sup>$ ,  $Ca^{2+}$ , Mg<sup>2+</sup>, Cl<sup>−</sup> and SO<sub>4</sub><sup>2−</sup>) to a macrophyte and an alga. Environ Toxicol Chem 31:1370–1374
- <span id="page-11-11"></span>Soucek DJ (2007) Bioenergetic effects of sodium sulfate on the freshwater crustacean, *Ceriodaphnia dubia*. Ecotox 16:317–325
- <span id="page-11-10"></span>Soucek DJ, Dickinson A (2016) Infuence of chloride on the chronic toxicity of sodium nitrate to *Ceriodaphnia dubia* and *Hyalella azteca*. Ecotox 25:1406–1416
- <span id="page-11-3"></span>Sun J, Peng H, Alharbi HA, Jones PD, Giesy JP (2017) Identifcation of chemicals that cause oxidative stress in oil sands process-afected water. Environ Sci Technol 51:8773–8781
- <span id="page-11-4"></span>Tedford E, Halferdahl G, Pieters R, Lawrence GA (2019) Temporal variations in turbidity in an oil sands pit lake. Environ Fluid Mech 19:457–473
- <span id="page-11-6"></span>Toor NS, Franz ED, Fedorak PM, MacKinnon MD, Liber K (2013a) Degradation and aquatic toxicity of naphthenic acids in oil sands process-afected waters using simulated wetlands. Chemosphere 90:449–458
- <span id="page-11-7"></span>Toor NS, Han X, Franz E, MacKinnon MD, Martin JW, Liber K (2013b) Selective biodegradation of naphthenic acids and a probable link between mixture profles and aquatic toxicity. Environ Toxicol Chem 32:2207–2216
- <span id="page-11-12"></span>Turcotte D, Kautzman M, Peru K, Headley J, Liber K (2009) Characterizing salt and naphthenic acids interaction in the toxicity of oil sands process water to freshwater invertebrates. Conference presentation, University of Saskatchewan, unpublished pilot study
- <span id="page-11-0"></span>van den Heuvel MR, Hogan NS, Roloson SD, van der Kraak GJ (2012) Reproductive development of yellow perch (*Perca favescens*) exposed to oil sands-afected waters. Environ Toxicol Chem 31:654–662
- <span id="page-11-13"></span>Vera CL, Hyne RV, Patra R, Ramasamy S, Pablo F, Julli M, Kefford BJ (2014) Bicarbonate toxicity to *Ceriodaphnia dubia* and the freshwater shrimp *Paratya australiensis* and its infuence on zinc toxicity. Environ Toxicol Chem 33:1179–1186
- <span id="page-11-15"></span>Whelly MP (2000) Aquatic invertebrates in wetlands of the oil sands region of northeast Alberta, Canada, with emphasis on Chironomidae (Diptera). M.Sc. Dissertation. University of Windsor, Windsor, ON, Canada. <https://scholar.uwindsor.ca/etd/1207>. Accessed 21 Apr 2017
- <span id="page-11-5"></span>White KB, Liber K (2018) Early chemical and toxicological risk characterization of inorganic constituents in surface water from the Canadian oil sands frst large-scale end pit lake. Chemosphere 211:745–757
- <span id="page-11-1"></span>Wiseman SB, Anderson JC, Liber K, Giesy JP (2013a) Endocrine disruption and oxidative stress in larvae of *Chironomus dilutus* following short-term exposure to fresh or aged oil sands processafected water. Aquat Toxicol 142–143:414–421
- <span id="page-11-2"></span>Wiseman SB, He Y, Gamal-El Din M, Martin JW, Jones PD, Hecker M, Giesy JP (2013b) Transcriptional responses of male fathead minnows exposed to oil sands process-afected water. Comp Biochem Physiol C 157:227–235