L. C. Emebiri · M. E. Devey A. C. Matheson · M. U. Slee

Linkage of RAPD markers to NESTUR, a stem growth index in radiata pine seedlings

Received: 18 December 1996 / Accepted: 24 January 1997

Abstract Needle-to-stem unit rate (NESTUR) is a stem growth index of conifer seedlings that measures the efficiency of stemwood production per unit of foliage growth. The random amplified polymorphic DNA (RAPD) technique was applied to haploid DNA from the megagametophytes of a full-sib radiata pine cross to find markers linked to factors controlling the NES-TUR trait. Using the bulked segregant analysis approach, 23 of 933 primers displayed putative linkage to factors controlling NESTUR. Based on the genotypic analysis of 174 individuals, two quantitative trait loci (QTLs) controlling NESTUR were identified at ANOVA *P*-levels of 0.01*—*0.001. The QTLs were identified by RAPD markers OPE-06₄₅₀ and OPA-10₁₂₀₀, which were linked to each other $(r = 7\%)$, and UBC- 333_{550} , which was not linked to the other two. Linkage to components of NESTUR (increments in stem diameter and stem volume) was demonstrated for UBC- 333_{550} , while the others were not linked to NESTUR components.

Key words Bulked segregant analysis \cdot Quantitative trait locus · Epistasis · Stem growth efficiency

Introduction

Needle-to-stem unit rate (NESTUR) is a stem growth index of conifer seedlings that measures the efficiency of stemwood production per unit of needle growth

M. U. Slee

L. C. Emebiri $(\boxtimes) \cdot M$. E. Devey $\cdot A$. C. Matheson CSIRO Forestry and Forest Products, P. O. Box 4008, Kingston, ACT 2604, Australia

(Matheson et al., unpublished). This index, which is derived as a unit rate of growth in stem volume and needle volume, takes into account the influence of both photosynthetic capacity and carbon allocation on stemwood production. Its potential usefulness as an early selection trait in radiata pine (*Pinus radiata* D. Don) was suggested by Matheson et al. (1995), who observed correlations as high as 0.97 between stem:needle ratio measured on seedlings in the nursery and the family performance of 11-year-old trees growing on several sites in Australia. Although NESTUR shows high heritability between families of radiata pine (Matheson et al., unpublished data), the steps involved in its determination are too tedious and time-consuming to permit its use in practical selection programs, where thousands of individuals need to be assessed in a very short period of time.

Random amplified polymorphic DNA (RAPD) markers (Williams et al. 1990) linked to factors controlling NESTUR could be used as indirect selection criteria. RAPDs are dominant markers and are therefore less informative at a locus than some other marker types. Heterozygous loci cannot be distinguished from homozygous dominant loci in diploid individuals. However, in conifers, this problem can be avoided by using DNA from haploid megagametophyte tissue. RAPD analysis of DNA from megagametophytes derived from a single tree show 1:1 segregation and are equivalent to a test-cross (Bucci and Menozzi 1993; Lu et al. 1995).

The identification of RAPD markers linked to quantitative trait loci requires a large number of individuals for statistical power (Darvasi et al. 1993), with a consequent relatively high cost for marker genotyping. An approach that has been proposed for reducing costs and time to identify linked markers is variously referred to as the *trait*-*based analysis* (Lebowitz et al. 1987), *selective DNA pooling* (Darvasi and Soller 1994) or *bulked segregant analysis* (Michelmore et al. 1991). The method is based on the principle of marker-allele

Communicated by G. E. Hart

Department of Forestry, The Australian National University, Canberra ACT 0200, Australia

frequency changes in the tails of a normally distributed phenotype as a result of linkage to the trait. In this procedure, two DNA pools are screened for markerallele frequency changes, one pool representing individuals with a high phenotypic value for the trait of interest, and the other individuals with a low phenotypic value. Screening of the entire population is only required when polymorphisms for marker loci between the two bulks are detected, in which case there is a considerable saving in time and resources, particularly when used with RAPDs. This method is particularly useful when the analysis is aimed primarily at a single trait, and has been more widely applied to annual crops than to trees. In trees, the method has been used to detect markers linked to genes such as disease-resistance in sugar pine, apples and Chinese elm (Yuang and Kruger 1994; Benet et al. 1995; Devey et al. 1995), sex determination in *Pistacia* (Hormaza et al. 1994), the *pendula* gene in Norway spruce [*Picea abies* (L.) Karst. F. Pendula] (Lehner et al. 1995), and genes controlling agriculturally important traits in *Persea americana* (Mhameed et al. 1995).

The objective of the present research was to use bulked segregant analysis and haploid megagametophyte DNA to identify linkage between RAPD markers and QTLs influencing NESTUR in radiata pine.

Materials and methods

Plant material

P. radiata seeds from the full-sib cross 12038×10946 were obtained from CSIRO Forestry and Forest Products. The cross was selected based on parental variance for NESTUR values from previous evaluations. Open-pollinated (OP) seeds from the maternal parent (12038) had a high variance in NESTUR, while OP seeds from the paternal parent (10946) had a low variance. Approximately 300 seeds of the F_1 full-sibs were placed in a Petri dish lined with three layers of filter paper and stratified for 30 days at 4*°*C. Only 176 seeds germinated, and these were picked out on to 150 mm-diameter pots filled with a porous medium (3 parts by volume of river sand, 2 parts of medium-size vermiculite, and 1 part of perlite). Megagametophytes were collected following seedling germination and stored at -80° C for subsequent DNA extraction.

Seedling trees were initially grown in a glasshouse under ambient temperature and light conditions for 2 weeks, and then transferred to a controlled environment (Phytotron). The growth chamber was maintained at temperatures of 25*°*C (maximum or day) and 18*°*C (minimum or night), and a relative humidity of 65%. Nutrients were provided in the irrigation water through drippers at 12-h intervals.

Measurements and determination of NESTUR

Seedlings were assessed for NESTUR at 4 months of age. Four separate measurements were made on each of two dates: (1) total height, measured from the pot rim to the growing point, (2) trunk height, from pot rim to the cotyledonary scar, (3) stem diameter, gauged with a dendrometer (0.001-mm resolution), and (4) needle volume. Needle volume was measured by a water-displacement

method. First, the pots were clamped down firmly on a stand, and then carefully inverted. The seedling crowns were then positioned squarely above a cylinder of water resting on a top-loading balance (0.01-g resolution). Finally, the crowns were carefully lowered into the water to a known point (the cotyledonary scar) with caution taken to avoid contact of the foliage with the walls of the cylinder. To prevent trapping of air bubbles, a wetting agent was added to the water as a surfactant at a rate of 3 ml per 151. The measurements were repeated 2 weeks later. A detailed description of the measurements and calculation of NESTUR will be presented in a subsequent publication (Matheson et al., in preparation).

DNA extraction and RAPD assays

Total genomic DNA was extracted according to Dellaporta et al. (1983) giving an average yield of 2.5μ g of DNA per megagametophyte. Reaction mixtures for RAPD assays consisted of 3 ng of DNA from each bulk, 2.0 mM of MgCl_2 , $200 \mu \text{M of each dNTP}$, 1 U of *Taq* polymerase, and 0.33μ M of primer in a reaction buffer containing 10 mM Tris-HCL (pH 8.3 at 25*°*C) and 50 mM KCL, and for a total reaction mixture of 15 µl. Amplifications were carried out in a Perkin Elmer Cetus 9600 DNA Thermal Cycler at three cycles of 94*°*C for 2 min, 37*°*C for 2 min, and 72*°*C for 2 min, followed by 40 cycles of 94*°*C for 45 s, 42*°*C for 45 s and 72*°*C for 120 s. Amplification products were separated by horizontal-gel electrophoresis in 1.5% agarose with $0.5 \times$ TBE buffer, and detected by ethidium bromide staining.

Bulked segregant analysis

The present study was based on haploid segregation analyses of the maternal parent of the full-sib family 12038×10946 , although the phenotype was measured on the diploid offspring. Bulked samples consisted of 250 ng of DNA from the corresponding megagametophytes of nine High-NESTUR and nine Low-NESTUR individuals, representing 5% of the high and low tails of the normal distribution. The bulks were screened with a total of 933 random 10-mer oligonucleotide primers. We used 800 Operon primers supplied by Operon Technologies, Alameda, Calif., and 133 primers from the ''conifers RAPD set'' obtained from Dr. John Carlson, University of British Columbia. The presence of a RAPD band in one bulk and absence in the other provided evidence for a putatively linked marker. To exclude false positives, the RAPD assay was repeated for each polymorphism detected. Then, the 18 individuals that were used to construct the bulks of DNA were each tested for the putatively linked marker. Reliable markers were tested further in a two-stage approach to identify loci co-segregating with NESTUR QTLs. The markers were first tested on an additional 60 individuals divergently selected for extreme NESTUR values. Analysis of variance (ANOVA) was used to determine which loci appeared to be linked to the QTLs, using a Type-1 (false positives) error probability of $\leq 10\%$. In the second stage, all the remaining 174 progeny were genotyped for loci showing differences ($P \leq 0.10$). Linkage was considered significant when the probability levels associated with *F*values were \leq 0.01.

Linkage analysis

Goodness-of-fit to the expected 1:1 segregation for marker loci was tested by a chi-square analysis. Linkage among significant markers was calculated as $r = R/N$, where R equals the number of recombinants and N equals the total number of progeny. Epistatic interaction among significant loci was assessed by a factorial ANOVA model, using SPSS for Windows (SPSS, Inc.) computer software. Interaction terms were extracted from the following statistical

model: $Y_{ijk} = \mu + M_i + M_j + MM_{ij} + E_{ijk}$, where Y_{ijk} is the observed phenotype, μ is the overall mean, M_i and M_j are the main effects of the i_{th} and j_{th} RAPD markers, and E_{ijk} is the residual effect.

Relationship of NESTUR to stem growth

Coincidence of QTLs for a complex trait with one or more of the trait's components can be interpreted as indirect biological validation for these QTLs. For two traits that are causally related, coincidence of at least some QTLs is likely (Lebreton et al. 1995). The relationship between NESTUR and growth in seedling height, stem diameter, stem volume and needle volume was assessed by standard Spearman correlations.

Results

The two groups of nine extreme phenotypes had NES-TUR values as low as 4.2 and as high as 20.4, with a mean of 8.6. The values ranged from -1.8 standarddeviation units below, and 4.9 units above, the mean,

Fig. 1 Frequency distribution of log10-transformed NESTUR values in 174 individuals of the full-sib cross of radiata pine (12038×10946)

Table 1 Summary of RAPD loci in linkage with factors influencing NESTUR in radiata pine full-sib cross 12038×10946 . Results are presented for log- transformed (Trans.) and untransformed (Untrans.) NESTUR values. R^2 values were calculated as the ratio of

The frequency distribution of phenotypes showed a skewness of 1.16, and a log_{10} transformation was applied to reduce skewness to 0.05. Analyses of variance (ANOVA) were carried out on the transformed data since ANOVA assumes the underlying variable to be normally distributed. However, results are presented for both transformed and untransformed data (Table 1).

Identification and genetics of marker-linked QTLs

Of the 933 primers screened, 23 produced fragments that were polymorphic in the two bulks of DNA. However, only seven were found to be reliable when tested on the 18 individuals that were used to constitute the two bulks of DNA. These primers were then used to amplify DNA derived from an additional 60 individuals divergently selected from the family. All marker loci showed the expected 1:1 ratio of segregation (Table 1). Four RAPD markers were found to show differences ($P \leq 0.10$) among marker-genotype classes for NESTUR (Table 1). The three markers that did not show sufficient evidence of association with NESTUR QTLs were excluded from further analysis.

In the second stage of marker-trait analysis, RAPD genotypes were determined for the remaining 174 progeny using the four markers that showed differences in genotype class-means at $P \leq 0.10$. The full progeny data were then re-analysed for significant associations, using a threshold of $P \leq 0.01$ to declare linkage. Across the two stages of sampling, three RAPD markers were found to be linked significantly to NESTUR (Table 1). The differences among genotypic classes for these

sum of squares (markers: total). Markers not considered further after the first stage of sampling are shown by (a), and after the second stage by (b)

^a Primer name/fragment length in base pairs

markers were confirmed when all individuals in the family (174 individuals) were tested. An absence of RAPD-fragment markers generated by primers OPE-06 and OPA-10 was associated with low NESTUR values, while primer UBC-333 generated a 550 bp band that was associated with high NESTUR values.

Standardised allele-substitution effects of markerlinked QTLs were estimated as the b-value from simple linear regression. The marker loci OPA-101200 and OPE-06450 had decreasing effects respectively, of 0.50 and -0.41 standard deviation units (SDU) from the family mean (Table 1), while the UBC-333550 locus had an increasing effect of 0.46 SDU. The amount of variation attributable to the effects of these markers ranged from 6.2 to 10.6%, while a two-QTL model explained 20% of the phenotypic variation.

Pairwise comparisons among significant marker loci showed that the loci revealed by the Operon primers (OPE-06450 and OPA-101200) were linked to each other at a recombination frequency of 7% (SE_r = 0.02). The locus UBC-333550 was not linked to either OPE-06₄₅₀ or OPA-10₁₂₀₀.

QTL coincidence

The relationship of NESTUR with stem growth traits is shown by the correlation coefficients (Table 2). The most significant of the relationships were those with increments in stem diameter $(r = 0.82)$ and stem volume $(r = 0.66)$. The two linked RAPD markers (OPE-06450 and OPA-101200) showed no significant (*P* \leq 0.05) linkage to any of these components, suggesting that this QTL is specific to NESTUR, and independent of its components (Table 2). However, the RAPD marker generated by the primer UBC-333 was associated with increments in stem diameter and stem volume, with effects similar to those observed for

NESTUR (Table 2); that is, a 0.46 standard-deviationunits (SDU) increase in NESTUR was associated with an increase of 0.46 and 0.38 SDU in stem volume and diameter growths, respectively.

Epistatic interactions

We sought to determine whether the action of one putative QTL might be dependent upon the allelic state at another locus. Using markers as treatments, we found that the OTL near markers $OPA-10_{1200}$ and OPE-06450 appeared to influence phenotypic variation at the QTL linked to UBC-333550 (Table 3). This is illustrated for NESTUR using all four possible twolocus marker genotypic class means for UBC-333550 and OPA-101200 (Fig. 2). The presence of the UBC-333550 marker is associated with increased values of NESTUR. However, this was found to be dependent on

Fig. 2 Illustration of epistasis between marker-linked QTLs influencing NESTUR, using four possible genotypic class means of markers UBC-333 $_{550}$ and OPA-10₁₂₀₀

Table 3 *P*-values from two-way analyses of digenic epistasis between putative QTLs, using markers as treatments. *P*-values are shown relative to NESTUR and stem growth traits Two-locus interaction NESTUR Stem Stem Height Needle diameter volume growth volume growth growth growth $\begin{array}{cccc} \text{OPA-10}_{1200} \times \text{OPE-06}_{450} & 0.43 & 0.52 & 0.60 & 0.40 & 0.95 \\ \text{OPA-10}_{1200} \times \text{UBC-333}_{550} & 0.0001 & 0.005 & 0.001 & 0.08 & 0.68 \end{array}$ $OPA-10₁₂₀₀ \times UBC-333₅₅₀$ 0.0001 0.005 0.001 0.08 0.68
OPE-06₄₅₀ \times UBC-333₅₅₀ 0.0001 0.002 0.001 0.12 0.70 Table 2 Summaries of Spearman rank correlations of NESTUR with stem growth traits, and associations of NESTUR-linked RAPDs with stem growth traits Item Associations Associations with RAPD locus with NESTUR (*r*) OPA-10¹²⁰⁰ OPE-06⁴⁵⁰ UBC-333⁵⁵⁰ (*P*-value) (*P*-value) (*P*-value) Stem diameter growth 0.819 0.12 0.43 0.01 Stem volume growth 0.662 0.09 0.34 0.004 Height growth 0.294 0.18 0.25 0.31
 $\text{Needle volume growth}$ -0.122 0.99 0.38 0.18 Needle volume growth -0.122 0.99 0.38 0.18

 $OPE-06_{450} \times UBC-333_{550}$

the genotype at the OPA- 10_{1200} locus. The presence of the marker OPA-101200 appeared to influence phenotypic variation at the QTL linked to UBC-333550 in an individual.

Discussion

Many studies have demonstrated the power of bulked segregant analysis for tagging specific genes or QTLs (Hormaza et al. 1994; Yuang and Kruger 1994; Benet et al. 1995; Cheng and Roose 1995; Devey et al. 1995; Lehner et al. 1995; Mhameed et al. 1995). Most of these studies, however, considered simply inherited loci altering morphology or disease reaction, where the influence of non-genetic factors can be greatly minimised by more accurate phenotyping of the individuals. Using RAPD markers in combination with bulked segregant analysis, we were able to identify two QTLs significantly linked to factors controlling needle-to-stem unit growth rate in radiata pine, despite the lack of discrete variations. The QTLs identified explained 20% of the phenotypic variation, with standardised additive effects ranging from -0.41 to 0.50 SDU. Regression analysis, used in estimating standardised effects, and the amount of explained variation assumes no recombination between the marker and the QTLs. Violation of this assumption would cause the effect of the QTLs to be underestimated.

It is pertinent to note that, in the present study, only markers segregating from the maternal parent were assayed. Therefore, only some of the total number of QTLs will be potentially detectable, i.e. those segregating on the female side of the pedigree. The methods used, however, have served to establish marker-QTL linkage for NESTUR, as a first step in a program aimed at mapping QTLs with respect to flanking markers on the chromosome. The QTL for NESTUR identified with marker UBC-333₅₅₀ showed a significant association with stem-diameter growth and stem-volume growth (Table 3). The direction of additive gene effects of the QTLs on these traits, and the magnitude of phenotypic correlations, suggest a pleiotropic gene action. However, the independent effects of tightly linked loci cannot be ruled out at this stage since our data are insufficient to distinguish between the two possibilities.

The success of any QTL study is dependent on the influence of non-genetic factors. It is known that when a phenotype is controlled by multiple genetic loci, and the heritability is low, individuals can have extreme values due to non-genetic factors. Stem growth is the cumulative result of carbon assimilation and allocation over time. Since both assimilation and allocation are influenced by many biochemical pathways, physiological processes, as well as by environmental variables, it is reasonable to expect that the integration of stem growth with these variables will be genetically complex. Cross-contamination of DNA pools due to phenotyp-

ing errors will block the detection of polymorphism between pools (Wang and Paterson 1994), and thus reduce the power of bulked segregant analysis (Chaparro et al. 1994). The replication of phenotypic evaluations, e.g. by the use of clonal propagules, mitigates the effects of non-genetic factors by increasing the heritability of the trait (Bradshaw and Foster 1992); however, clonal materials were not available for the present study.

A common problem in bulked segregant analysis is the large number of false positives detected from pooled DNA samples. Lehner et al. (1995) identified 12 putatively linked loci among the two bulks of DNA constituted for the pendula gene, but only one was confirmed to be linked to the gene. For simply inherited traits, false positives can be screened out by genotyping individuals that were used to make up the bulks. For quantitative traits, only markers tightly linked to the QTLs will be detectable with this approach. We employed a sequential sampling procedure, testing all reliable markers on an additional 60 extreme-phenotype progeny. Markers that failed to show evidence of linkage ($P \leq 0.10$) at this stage were discarded. Subsequently, all progeny of the family were tested for markers that were retained, using a more stringent error rate of \leq 0.01. Potentially some QTL-linked markers, which would have been detected had all 174 progeny been genotyped, were missed by the use of bulked segregant analysis. By selecting individuals with the highest and lowest phenotypic values to form DNA pools, QTLs with small effects on the phenotype, which collectively explain a large portion of the genetic variation in a trait, probably escaped detection. However, it is unlikely that the sequential sampling we employed reduced the power of QTL detection since all markers identified from bulked DNA samples were given consideration. The sequential sampling procedure reduced costs by allowing an early decision to discontinue scoring markers in QTL-negative chromosomal regions.

Acknowledgments This research was supported by grants from the Southern Tree Breeding Association (STBA), Australia, and the Australian National University. We appreciate helpful reviews of the manuscript by Drs. G. Moran and M. Byrne. Special thanks to Dan Gardener for technical assistance with the dendrometer, and to Dane Donaldson, Nathan Caesar and Josie Morosin for assistance during NESTUR measurements.

References

- Benet H, Guries R, Boury S, Smalley EB (1995) Identification of RAPD markers linked to a black leaf spot resistance gene in Chinese elm. Theor Appl Genet 90 :1068*—*1073
- Bradshaw HD Jr, Foster GS (1992) Marker-aided selection and propagation systems in trees: advantages of cloning for studying quantitative inheritance. Can J For Res 22 :1044*—*1049
- Bucci G, Menozzi P (1993) Segregation analysis of random amplified polymorphic DNA in *Picea abies* Karst. Mol Ecol 22: 227*—*232
- Chaparro JX, Werner DJ, O'Malley D, Sederoff RR (1994) Targeted mapping and linkage analysis of morphological, isozyme, and RAPD markers in peach. Theor Appl Genet 87:805*—*815
- Cheng FSH, Roose ML (1995) Origin and inheritance of dwarfing by the citrus rootstock Poncirus trifoliata flying dragon. Journal of American Society of Horticulture 120:286*—*291
- Darvasi A, Soller M (1994) Selective DNA pooling for determination of linkage between a molecular marker and a quantitative trait locus. Genetics 138 :1365*—*1373
- Darvasi A, Weinreb A, Minke V, Weller JI, Moller M (1993) Detecting marker-QTL linkage and estimating QTL gene effect and map location using a saturated genetic map. Genetics 134:943*—*951
- Dellaporta SL, Wood J, Hicks JB (1983) A plant DNA minipreparation: Version II. Plant Mol Biol Rep 1:19*—*22
- Devey ME, Delfino-Mix A, Kinloch BB, Neale DB (1995) Random amplified polymorphic DNA markers tightly linked to a gene for resistance to white pine blister rust in sugar pine. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 92:2066*—*2070
- Hormaza JI, Dollo L, Polito VS (1994) Identification of a RAPD marker linked to sex determination in *Pistacia vera* using bulked segregant analysis. Theor Appl Genet 89: 9*—*13
- Lebowitz RJ, Soller M, Beckman JS, (1987) Trait-based analysis for the detection of linkage between marker loci and quantitative trait loci crosses between inbred lines. Theor Appl Genet 73:556*—*562
- Lebreton C, Lazic-Jancic V, Steed A, Pekic S, Quarrie SA (1995) Identification of QTL for drought responses in maize and their

use in testing causal relationships between traits. Journal of Experimental Botany 46:853*—*865

- Lehner A, Campbell MA, Wheeler NC, Poykko T, Glossl J, Kreike J, Neale DB (1995) Identification of a RAPD marker linked to the pendula gene in Norway spruce [*Picea abies* (L) Karst f pendula]. Theor Appl Genet 91:1092*—*1094
- Lu M, Szmidt AE, Xiao-Ru W (1995) Inheritance of RAPD fragments in haploid and diploid tissue of *Pinus sylvestris* (L). Heredity 74 :582*—*589
- Matheson AC, Spencer DJ, Kriedmann PE (1995) Age-age correlation and early selection in radiata pine 1. Family \times environment interactions in plantation and greenhouse. Aust. For 58:35*—*43
- Mhameed S, Hillel J, Lahav E, Sharon D, Lavi U (1995) Genetic association between DNA fingerprint fragments and loci controlling agriculturally important traits in Avocado (*Persea americana*). Euphytica 84:81*—*87
- Michelmore RW, Paran I, Kessell RV (1991) Identification of markers linked to disease resistance genes by bulked segregant analysis: a rapid method to detect markers in specific genomic regions using segregating populations. Proc Natl Acad Sci USA 88:9828*—*9832
- Wang GL, Paterson AH (1994) Assessment of DNA pooling strategies for mapping QTLs. Theor Appl Genet 88:355*—*361
- Williams JGK, Kubelik AR, Livak KJ, Rafalski JA, Tingey SV (1990) DNA polymorphisms amplified by arbitrary primers are useful as genetic markers. Nucleic Acids Res 18: 6531*—*6535
- Yang H, Kruger J (1994) Identification of a RAPD marker linked to the »*f* gene for scab resistance in apples. Euphytica 77: 83*—*87

.