Factors Affecting Resistance of Low Density Lipoproteins to Oxidation

O. Ziouzenkova, S.P. Gieseg, P. Ramos, and H. Esterbauer*

Institute of Biochemistry, University of Graz, Graz, Austria

ABSTRACT: Oxidation resistance (OR) of low density lipoproteins (LDL) is frequently determined by the conjugated diene (CD) assay, in which isolated LDL is exposed to Cu^{2+} as prooxidant in the range of $1-10 \mu M$. A brief review on major findings obtained with this assay will be given. A consistent observation is that vitamin E supplements or oleic acid-rich diets increase OR. Oxidation indices measured by the CD assay and effects of antioxidants very significantly depend on the Cu^{2+} concentration used for LDL oxidation. For medium and high $Cu²⁺$ concentrations, the relationship between lag time and propagation rate can be described by a simple hyperbolic saturation function, which has the same mathematical form as the Michaelis-Menten equation. At medium and high Cu²⁺ concentrations (0.5 to 5 μ M), vitamin E increases lag time in a dose-dependent manner. The increase is higher for 0.5 μ M Cu²⁺ as compared to 5 μ M. At low $Cu²⁺$ concentrations (0.5 μ M or less), the mechanism of LDL oxidation changes. Significant oxidation occurs in a preoxidation phase, which commences shortly after addition of Cu^{2+} . Preoxidation is not inhibited by vitamin E. It is concluded that much additional work is needed to validate the importance of oxidation indices derived from CD and similar assays. *Lipids 31,* S-71-S-76 (1996).

Oxidative modification of low density lipoproteins (LDL) most likely plays an important role in the development of atherosclerosis (1,2), but many questions on factors determining oxidation resistance (OR) of LDL and how reliable indices characteristic for OR can be measured remain unanswered (3). At present, we have very limited knowledge on how and where oxidation of LDL is initiated *in vivo, the* knowledge of which would be crucial in identifying important factors for protection of LDL against oxidative modification *in vivo.* At present, it is generally believed that lipid peroxidation is the process most relevant for producing LDL with high atherogenic potential. Therefore numerous studies have aimed to evaluate the role of antioxidants and other factors for protecting LDL against lipid peroxidation. Examination of recent literature clearly shows that most laboratories working on this subject expose isolated LDL to prooxidants (e.g., copper ions, azo-initiators, ultraviolet light, cells) and measure progress and/or extent of lipid peroxidation. One such model to measure kinetic parameters that has become very popular is copper ion (Cu^{2+}) -promoted oxidation in conjunction with continuous measurement of the conjugated diene absorption at 234 nm (CD assay). It should be emphasized that we have developed this CD assay primarily as a time marker (4) useful for basic kinetic studies, but we did not intend to propose the assay for routine clinical-chemical analyses of OR of LDL. It was perhaps the report by Regnström and colleagues (5) on the inverse relationship between OR of LDL (measured by lag time of Cu2+-dependent oxidation) and severity of myocardial infarction that led to the assumption that the CD assay is a biologically relevant model and gives indices (e.g., lag time) of clinical importance. In the meantime, many studies were published in which this assay was used to explore the importance of antioxidants and dietary fats for OR of LDL and to evaluate relationships between OR and severity and progression of atherosclerosis in humans and animals. A selected list of studies

FIG. 1. Oxidation of LDL with medium to high Cu^{2+} concentrations. LDL (0.1 μ M) in phosphate-buffered saline was oxidized at 30°C with the indicated concentrations (0.5 to 5.0 μ M) of Cu²⁺, and conjugated dione (CD)-curves were recorded. Also shown is CD increase without added $Cu²⁺$ (0).

^{*}To whom correspondence should be addressed at Institute of Biochemistry, University of Graz, Schubertstrage 1, A-8010 Graz, Austria.

Abbreviations: CD, conjugated diene; LDL, low density lipoprotein; OR, oxidation resistance.

	STATISTICS	

Selected Studies (1994/1995) on Oxidation Resistance of Low Density Lipoproteins (LDL) Measured by the Conjugated Diene Assay

 $\mathrm{^cOR} = \mathrm{Ox}$ idation resistance.

 $d18:2$ = Linoleic acid.

 e_V = Propagation rate. $fCD_{\text{max}} =$ Extent of oxidation.

FIG. 2. Relationship between lag time and the Cu^{2+} concentration. Data derived from Figure 1. Lag time is the intercept of the tangent to the slow and fast increase of conjugated diene (4).

published recently (1994 to March 1995) can be found in Table 1.

Interpretation of such studies is usually confused by the fact that quite different assay conditions are used. In retrospect, we feel that it would have been important to emphasize that oxidation indices derived from a CD curve strongly depend on concentration of Cu^{2+} , LDL, temperature, pH value and other extrinsic factors. We have shown (25) that the temperature dependence of lag time and propagation rate can fully be described by the Arrhenius law; core melting of LDL has no or only a minor effect on OR.

In this study, we performed a systematic investigation to elucidate the effect of Cu^{2+} concentration on OR of LDL. We show for the first time that the copper concentration has not only a pronounced effect on the mechanism of LDL oxidation but also on the antioxidant action of vitamin E.

MATERIAL AND METHODS

Human LDL was prepared by ultracentrifugation using a single-step discontinuous gradient in a Beckman (Palo Alto, CA) NVT 65 rotor (26). LDL oxidation was carried out as previously described (27) with 0.1 μ M LDL (equal to 0.25 mg total LDL mass/mL) in phosphate-buffered saline pH 7.4 and $CuSO₄$ as prooxidant. $Cu²⁺$ concentrations are given in the text. CD curves were recorded in a Beckman DU-640 spectrometer equipped with an auto-cellholder with six cuvettes and a Peltier-element temperature control. In all experiments, the temperature was 30° C (27). LDL antioxidants were determined in principle as described in (2) . Loading of LDL with α -tocopherol was performed as described previously (28).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Oxidation of LDL with medium and high Cu²⁺ concentrations. The original protocol for measurement of CD curves recommended 0.1 μ M LDL (equal to 0.25 mg LDL mass/mL) and $1.6 \mu M$ Cu²⁺ (4). This gives lag times of about 30 to 180 min depending on the donor (2). Figure 1 clearly shows that increasing $Cu²⁺$ reduces lag time and increases rate of propagation, whereas lowering Cu^{2+} from 1.6 to 0.5 μ M results in increase in lag time and decrease in propagation rate. The extent of oxidation, characterized by the CD_{max} value prior to onset of decomposition, is virtually independent of $Cu²⁺$ concentration. Figure 2 shows that for $Cu²⁺$ concentrations ≥ 0.5 µM the relationship between lag time and Cu²⁺ can be described by Equation 1, where lag is the lag time in minutes obtained with a certain concentration (μM) of added [Cu²⁺]; lag_{min} is the minimum value for the lag time; and K is the Cu²⁺ concentration for $\log = 2 \log_{min}$:

$$
\frac{1}{\log} = \frac{1}{\log_{\min}} \cdot \frac{[C u^{2+}]}{K + [C u^{2+}]}
$$

Figure 3 shows that propagation rate ν approaches a maximum with increasing Cu^{2+} concentration. This relationship can be described by Equation 2 (25), where ν is the propagation rate in ΔA_{234} /min or µM dienes/min obtained from the first derivatives of the CD curve; v_{max} is the maximum value for the propagation rate; and K' is the Cu²⁺ concentration for $v = v_{\text{max}}/2$:

$$
v = v_{max} \cdot \frac{[Cu^{2+}]}{K' + [Cu^{2+}]}
$$

Note that both Equations 1 and 2 represent hyperbolic saturation functions, with the same mathematical form as the

FIG. 3. Relationship between rate of propagation (v) and Cu^{2+} concentration. Data derived from Figure 1, v was determined from the first *derivative* of the conjugated diene curves (27).

FIG. 4. Oxidation of low density lipoprotein (LDL) with low Cu^{2+} concentration. The same LDL sample as was used in Figure 1 was oxidized with 0.2, 0.1, 0.05, and 0.03 μ M Cu²⁺, and the conjugated diene increase was measured. Also shown for comparison is oxidation with 5 μ M Cu²⁺ and oxidation without added $Cu²⁺$.

Michaelis-Menten equation. In analogy to Line-Weaver-Burk plots, strict linear relationships for the lag time or propagation rate can be obtained by plotting lag vs. the reciprocal value of $[Cu^{2+}](Fig. 2$ inset) or by plotting $1/v$ vs. the reciprocal value of Cu^{2+} (Fig. 3 inset).

 Ox *idations with low* Cu^{2+} *concentrations.* In previous LDL oxidation studies performed and published by us (2,29) and other authors (Table 1) Cu^{2+} concentrations of 0.5 μ M or higher were used. As shown in Figure 1, such concentrations are capable to fully oxidize LDL within a period of 10 h or less. The reason for using $Cu^{2+} > 0.5$ μ M was simply a logistic one: such conditions allow us to oxidize LDL within several h, a reasonable time to complete experiments within a working day or during an overnight run. Moreover, CD curves measured under such conditions show the classical profile with a lag phase, propagation phase, and decomposition phase. We had no rational reason to presume that this trend to longer lag times and lower propagation rates would not continue if Cu^{2+} is further decreased. When the same LDL sample used for the experiments shown in Figure 1 was oxidized with Cu^{2+} of 0.2 µM or less, however, the shapes of the CD curves unexpectedly changed completely (Fig. 4).

In the experiment with 0.2 μ M Cu²⁺, oxidation occurred in several consecutive steps. The first steps, denoted by "preoxidations," commenced a few min after addition of Cu^{2+} , lasted about 10 h, and caused heavy oxidation of LDL with about 50% of CD_{max} . Then followed an inhibited interval with slow increase of \overline{CD} and a second rapid oxidation leading to CD_{max} . The inhibited interval and the second rapid rise of CD most likely represent the classical lag phase and propagation phase characteristic for oxidation with medium or high Cu^{2+} concentrations. With Cu^{2+} concentrations of 0.1, 0.05, and 0.03 μ M, CD curves exhibited the preoxidation stage and the inhibited interval, but no propagation phase. Preoxidation rate decreased with decreasing Cu^{2+} concentration (0.5 to 0.03

FIG. 5. Temporal relationship between loss of vitamin E and oxidation (conjugated diene-increase) of low density lipoprotein (LDL) with 1.6 μ M Cu²⁺. Initial concentrations were 0.609 μ M α -tocopherol, 0.038 μ M γ-tocopherol, and 0.1 µM LDL.

 μ M), but was in all instances higher than the rate during the lag phase in oxidations with 0.5 to 5.5 μ M Cu²⁺. Figure 4 also shows that the LDL sample without added $Cu²⁺$ was heavily oxidized after 45 h.

Antioxidants delay onset of propagation. It has previously been shown (2,29) that onset of propagation is preceded by the lag phase during which the LDL becomes progressively depleted of its antioxidants, with α -tocopherol as the first and β -carotene as the last to be depleted. This chronology was observed in LDL oxidations with medium and high $Cu²⁺$ concentrations in the range of about 1 to 10 μ M. We have repeated these experiments, and results were in full agreement with our previous observations. A representative example for loss of vitamin E is shown in Figure 5. It has also been reported by us (2,29) and other authors (Table 1) that loading LDL with α -tocopherol either *in vitro* or by vitamin E supplements increases the length of the lag phase and therefore delays onset of propagation. As shown in Figure 6, the effect of α -tocopherol on lag time strongly depends on the concentration of Cu^{2+} used for oxidation. The effect is much more pronounced in oxidations with 0.5 μ M Cu²⁺, as compared to 5 μ M Cu²⁺. This may explain why some authors using high $Cu²⁺$ concentrations found no effect of vitamin E on lag time.

Antioxidants cannot prevent "preoxidation." Figure 7 shows an oxidation of LDL with $0.2 \mu M$ Cu²⁺. The CD curve clearly exhibits a step wise oxidation with a preoxidation phase lasting about 10 h. During this stage, CD reached about 50% of CD_{max} , indicating that LDL becomes heavily oxidized prior to the onset of the propagation phase, which occurred at about 24 h. The average rate of diene formation during the first 10 h was 21 nM/min. We also measured the consumption of antioxidants and found that their concentration only slow-

ly decreased during the preoxidation phase. After 10 h, a time-point when LDL was already heavily oxidized, only 38 and 12% of α - and γ -tocopherol were consumed (Fig. 7). Consumption of β -carotene and lycopene was 55 and 75%, respectively (data not shown). Average consumption rate of α tocopherol (initial content 3.2 mol/mol LDL) was 0.2 nM/min, 100 times less than the CD production rate. From these experiments and others performed under comparable conditions, it is evident that LDL antioxidants do not prevent preoxidation promoted by low $Cu²⁺$ concentrations. In one experiment (data not shown), LDL was loaded *in vitro* with α -tocopherol and then subjected to oxidation with a low Cu²⁺ concentration. α -Tocopherol had no effect on the rate of CD increase during the preoxidation phase, but the length of this phase was prolonged. At present, it is not clear whether the preoxidation reflects perhaps tocopherol-mediated propagation (30) or is due to other, specific elementary reactions characteristic for low rate of initiation.

At present, we have very limited knowledge on how and where LDL oxidation is initiated *in vivo* and how quickly oxidation proceeds (1,2). This information is, however, crucial to intelligent design of assays, which give biologically relevant answers on factors determining OR of LDL *in vivo.* Many studies based on the classical CD assay (2, 29, and references in Table 1) revealed that vitamin E supplements or an oleic acid-rich diet significantly increase OR of LDL. Case-control studies and intervention trials with antioxidants (Table 1) also suggest some relationships between OR (measured by the lag time in CD assay) and progression and severity of atherosclerosis. It cannot be denied, however, that the oxidation indices and conclusions, which can be derived from CD assays, strongly depend on assay conditions (Figs. $1-4$). For example, vitamin E can be ineffective

FIG. 6. Effect of α -tocopherol in the length of lag time measured with different Cu^{2+} concentrations. Low density lipoprotein (LDL) samples with different α -tocopherol contents (7.2, 8.7, 11.1, and 14.1 mol/mol LDL) were prepared and oxidized at 30° C with Cu²⁺ concentrations ranging from 0.5 to 5 μ M. The graph shows that increase of lag time depends on both α -tocopherol content and Cu²⁺ concentration.

FIG. *7. Temporal* relationship between loss of vitamin E and oxidation (conjugated diene increase) of low density lipoprotein (LDL) with $0.2 \mu M$ Cu²⁺. Initial concentrations were 0.325 μ M α -tocopherol, 0.016 μ M γ tocopherol, and 0.1 µM LDL.

(Fig. 7) or significantly increase lag time (Fig. 6), depending on the concentration of Cu^{2+} used as prooxidant. Much further work is needed to clarify whether oxidation indices measured *in vitro* are really suitable and important for predicting a risk.

ACKNOWLEDGMENTS

This study was supported by the Austrian Science Foundation (Project SO-7102MED), the Association for International Cancer Research (AICR), UK, and a grant from the European Community PL 931790.

REFERENCES

- 1. Steinberg, D., Parthasarathy, S., Carew, T.E., Khoo, J.C., and Witztum J.L. (1989) Beyond Cholesterol. Modifications of Low-Density Lipoprotein that Increase Its Atherogenicity, *N. Engl. J. Med. 320,* 915-924.
- 2. Esterbauer, H., Gebicki, J., Puhl, H., and Jiirgens, G. (1992) The Role of Lipid Peroxidation and Antioxidants in Oxidative Modification of LDL, *Free Rad. Biol. Med. 13,* 341-390.
- 3. Halliwell, B. (1995) Oxidation of Low-Density Lipoproteins: Questions of Initiation, Propagation, and the Effect of Antioxidants, *Am. J. Clin. Nutr. 61,* 670S-677S.
- 4. Esterbauer, H., Striegl, G., Puhl, H., and Rotheneder, M. (1989) Continuous Monitoring of *in Vitro* Oxidation of Human Low Density Lipoprotein, *Free Rad. Res. Comm. 6,* 67-75.
- 5. Regnström, J., Nilsson, J., Tornvall, P., Landau, C., and Hamsten, A. (1992) Susceptibility to Low-Density Lipoprotein Oxidation and Coronary Atherosclerosis in Man, *Lancet 339,* 1183-1186.
- 6. Stalenhoef, A.EH., Defesche, J.C., Kleinveld, H.A., Demacker, P.N.M., and Kastelein, J.J.P. (1994) Decreased Resistance Against *in Vitro* Oxidation of LDL from Patients with Familial Defective Apolipoprotein [3-100, *Arterioscler. Thromb. 14,* 489-493.
- 7. Kontush, A., Hübner, C., Finckh, B., Kohlschütter, A., and Beisiegel, U. (1994) Low Density Lipoprotein Oxidizability by Copper Correlates to Its Initial Ubiquinol-10 and Polyunsaturated Fatty Acid Content, *FEBS Lett. 341,* 69-73.
- 8. Reaven, RD., Grasse, B.J., and Tribble, D.L. (1994) Effects of Linoleate-Enriched and Oleate-Enriched Diets in Combination with α -Tocopherol on the Susceptibility of LDL and LDL Subfractions to Oxidative Modification in Humans, *Arterioscler. Thromb. 14,* 557-566
- 9. Sasahara, M., Raines, E.W., Chait, A., Carew, T.E., Steinberg, D., Wahl, EW., and Ross, R. (1994) Inhibition of Hypercholesterolemia-Induced Atherosclerosis in the Nonhuman Primate by Probucol. I. Is the Extent of Atherosclerosis Related to Resistance of LDL to Oxidation? *J. Clin. Invest. 94,* 155-164.
- 10. Nenseter, M.S., Gudmundsen, O., Malterud, K.E., Berg, T., and Drevon, C.A. (1994) Effect of Cholesterol Feeding on the Susceptibility of Lipoproteins to Oxidative Stress, *Biochim. Biophys. Acta 1213,* 207-214.
- 11. Fruebis, J., Steinberg, D., Dresel, H.A., and Carew, T.E. (1994) A Comparison of the Antiatherogenic Effects of Probucol and of a Structural Analogue of Probucol in Low Density Lipoprotein Receptor-Deficient Rabbits, *J. Clin. Invest. 94,* 392-398.
- 12. Thomas, M.J., Thomburg, T., Manning, J., Hooper, K., and Rudel, L.L. (1994) Fatty Acid Composition of Low-Density Lipoprotein Influences Its Susceptibility to Autoxidation, *Biochemistry 33,* 1828-1834.
- 13. Kleinveld, H.A., Demacker, EN.M., Stalenhoef, A.EH. (1994) Comparative Study on the Effect of Low-Dose Vitamin E and Probucol on the Susceptibility of LDL to Oxidation and the Progression of Atherosclerosis in Watanabe Heritable Hyperlipidemic Rabbits, Arterioscler. Thromb. 14, 1386-1391.
- 14. Maggi, E., Bellazzi, R., Falaschi, E, Frattoni, A., Perani, G., Finardi, G., Gazo, A., Nai, M., Romanini, D., and Bellomo, G. (1994) Enhanced LDL Oxidation in Uremic Patients: An Additional Mechanism for Accelerated Atherosclerosis? *Kidney Int. 45,* 876-883.
- 15. Tribble, D.L., van der Berg, J.J., Motchnik, EA., Ames, B.N., Lewis D.M., Chait, A., and Krauss, R.M. (1994) Oxidative Susceptibility of Low Density Lipoprotein Subfractions is Related to Their Ubiquinol-10 and α-Tocopherol Content, *Proc. Natl. Acad. Sci. USA 91,* 1183-1187
- 16. Tsai, E.C., Hirsch, I.B., Brunzell, I.D., and Chait A. (1994) Reduced Plasma Peroxyl Radical Trapping Capacity and Increased Susceptibility of LDL to Oxidation in Poorly Controlled IDDM, *Diabetes 43,* 1010-1014.
- 17. Nyyssonen, K., Porkkala, E., Salonen, R., Korpela, H., and Salonen, J.T. (1994) Increase in Oxidation Resistance of Atherogenic Serum Lipoproteins Following Antioxidant Supplementation: A Randomized Double-Blind, *Eur. J. Clin. Nutr. 48,* 633-642.
- 18. Winklhofer-Roob, B.M., Puhl, H., Khoschsorur, G., van't Hof, M.A., Esterbauer, H., and Shmerling, D.H. (1995) Enhanced Resistance to Oxidation of Low Density Lipoproteins and Decreased Lipid Peroxide Formation During β -Carotene Supplementation in Cystic Fibrosis, *Free Rad. Biol. Med. 18,* 849-859
- 19. Jialal, I., Fuller, C.J., and Huet, B.A. (1995) The Effect of α -Tocopherol Supplementation on LDL Oxidation: A Dose-Response Study, Arterioscler. Thromb. Vasc. Biol. 15, 190-198.
- 20. Suzukawa, M., Ishikawa, T., Yoshida, H., and Nakamura, H. (1995) Effect of *in vivo* Supplementation with Low-Dose Vitamin E on Susceptibility of Low-Density Lipoprotein and High Density Lipoprotein to Oxidative Modification, *J. Am. Coll. Nutr. 14,* 46-52.
- 21. Livrea, M.A., Tesoriere, L., Bongiorno, A., Pintaudi, A.M., Ciaccio, M., and Riccio A. (1995) Contribution of Vitamin A to

the Oxidation Resistance of Human Low Density Lipoproteins, *Free Rad. Biol. Med. 18,* 401-409.

- 22. Croft, K.D., Williams, P., Dimmitt, S., Abu-Amsha, R., and Beilin, L.J. (1995) Oxidation of Low Density Lipoproteins: Effect of Antioxidant Content, Fatty Acid Composition and Intrinsic Phospholipase Activity on Susceptibility to Metal Ion-Induced Oxidation, *Biochim. Biophys. Acta 1254,* 250-256.
- 23. Gaziano, J.M., Hatta, A., Flynn, M., Johnson, E.J., Krinsky, N.I., Ridker, P.M., Hennekens, C.H., and Frei, B. (1995) Supplementation with β-Carotene *in vivo* and *in vitro* Does Not Inhibit Low Density Lipoprotein Oxidation, *Atherosclerosis 112,* 187-195.
- 24. Mosinger, B.J. (1995) Copper-Induced and Photosensitive Oxidation of Serum Low-Density Lipoprotein: The Relation to Cholesterol Level and Inter-Species Differences, *Biochim. Biophys. Acta 1270,* 73-80.
- 25. Ramos, P., Gieseg, S.P., Schuster, B., and Esterbauer, H. (1995)

Effect of Temperature and Phase Transition on Oxidation Resistance of Low-Density Lipoprotein, J. *Lipid Res. 35,* 2113-2128.

- 26. Gieseg, S.P., and Esterbauer, H. (1994) Low Density Lipoprotein is Saturable by Pro-oxidant Copper, *FEBS Lett. 343,* 188-194.
- 27. Puhl, H., Waeg, G., and Esterbauer, H. (1994) Methods to Determine Oxidation of Low-Density Lipoproteins *Methods Enzymol. 233,* 425-441.
- 28. Esterbauer, H., Dieber-Rotheneder, M., Striegl, G., and Waeg, G. (1991) Role of Vitamin E in Preventing the Oxidation of Low Density Lipoprotein, *Am. J. Clin. Nutr. 53,* 314S-321S.
- 29. Esterbauer, H., Puhl, H., Waeg, G., Krebs, A., and Dieber-Rotheneder, M. (1992) The Role of Vitamin E in Lipoprotein Oxidation, in *Vitamin E in Health and Disease* (Packer, L., and Fuchs, J., eds.) Marcel Dekker, Inc., New York, pp. 649–671.
- 30. Bowry, V.W., and Stocker, R. (1993) The Pro-Oxidant Effect of Vitamin E on the Radical-Initiated Oxidation of Human Low-Density Lipoprotein, *J. Am. Chem. Soc. 115, 6029–6043.*