Patterns of resistance of Israeli wild emmer wheat to pathogens I. Predictive method by ecology and allozyme genotypes for powdery mildew and leaf rust

E. Nevo¹, J. G. Moseman², A. Beiles¹ & D. Zohary³

Institute of Evolution, University of Haifa, Mount Carmel, Haifa, Israel 2plant Genetics and Germplasm Institute, Beltsville Agricultural Research Center, U.S. Department o/" Agriculture, Beltsville, MD 20705, USA

³ Department of Genetics, Life Science Institute, The Hebrew University of Jerusalem, Jerusalem, Israel

Abstract

The association of ecological factors and allozyme markers with genotypes of tetraploid wild emmer wheat, *Triticum dicoccoides,* varying in resistance to four cultures of the pathogen *Ervsiphe graminis tritici,* and to one culture of *Puccinia recondita tritici,* which incite the diseases powdery mildew and leaf rust respectively, were explored theoretically and practically. The study involved 233 accessions comprising 10 populations representing the ecological range of *7". diococcoides* in Israel. Our results indicate that genetic polymorphism for resistance to both pathogens is structured geographically, and is predictable by climatic as well as allozymic markers. Three variable combinations of water factors and temperature differentials significantly explain 0.27 and 0.14 of the spatial variance for resistance to powdery mildew and leaf rust, respectively, suggesting the involvement of natural selection. Several allozyme genotypes, singly, or in combination, are significantly associated with disease resistance. We conclude that *T. dicoccoides* populations in Israel, which grow in the center of diversity of the species, contain large amounts of unexploited disease resistant genotypes. The populations could be effectively screened and utilized for producing resistant cultivars by means of ecological factors and allozyme markers as predictive guidelines.

Introduction

The wild relatives of wheat include significant genetic variability displaying local and regional adaptive differentiation to different climates, soils and pathogens (Nevo *et al.,* 1982). Wild wheats are genetic resources that should be exploited in breeding programmes to introduce resistance to a broad range of diseases, pests, and for tolerance to poor soils and climatic extremes, so that yields will be more stable and agriculture can be extended to marginal environments. Furthermore, gains are likely to be more durable if more than one gene for resistance or tolerance is transferred to a cultivar (Plucknett *et al.,* 1983). Recently, we studied the genetic structure of wild barley (Nevo *et al.,* 1979) and of wild emmer wheat (Nevo *et al.,* 1982), to identify the potential useful genetic resources in the

wild relatives of barley and wheat for breeding cultivars with agronomically important characteristics (Nevo *et al.,* 1984c), including disease resistance *(Mosemanetal.,* 1983, 1984a, b; *Nevoetal.,* 1984a).

Wild emmer wheat, *Triticum dicoccoides* (gehome AABB), is distributed in the Near East Fertile Crescent, and northern Israel appears to be its center of distribution. *T. dicoccoides* is the progenitor of all cultivated forms oftetraploid wheat, *T. turgidum,* and hexaploid wheat, *T. aestivurn* (Feldman, 1976; Feldman & Sears, 198 l). It is conspecific, and cytogenetically close to cultivated tetraploid wheats with which it is fully interfertile, and is partly fertile with hexaploid wheat. Thus, genes can be transferred from the wild to the cultivated gene pool. T . *dicoccoides* is therefore a convenient source of wild germplasm for improving cultivated wheats. Examples of the agronomically important characters 210

already found in *T. dicoccoides*, and partly transferred to cultivated wheat, are large grain size and high protein content (Gerechter-Amitai & Grama, 1974: Avivi, 1979a, b; Grama *et al.,* 1984), and resistance to stripe rust (Gerechter-Amitai & Stubbs, 1970; Gerechter-Amitai & Grama, 1974; Grama & Gerechter-Amitai, 1974). Wild emmet has been also studied as a potential source of powdery mildew and leaf rust resistance (Moseman *et al.,* 1984a, b; and El-Morshidy *et al.,* 1983).

The extensive allozymic diversity found in 12 populations of *7-. dicoccoides* in Israel (Nevo *et al.,* 1982) involving 1 I0 allozyme alleles in 50 gene loci, some of which are adaptively associated with the environment, indicates that significant genetic resources for wheat improvement exist in the wild gene pool. Therefore, we explored 10 of the 12 populations studied earlier for allozymic diversity, for potential genetic sources of resistance to wheat powdery mildew, *Erysiphe graminis tritici,* and to leaf rust, *Puccinia recondita tritici.* Our results indicated that the number of sources of resistance to *E. graminis tritici* which can be obtained from wild *T. dicoccoides* in Israel is almost unlimited (Moseman *et al.,* 1984a). Almost 50% of the accessions tested were resistant to infection with 4 cultures of *E. graminis tritici* which possess the virulence genes corresponding to most of the identified resistance genes in wheat. A distinctly lower proportion of the accessions tested (about 15%) were resistant or moderately resistant to leaf rust. The proportion of resistant *T. dicoccoides* plants varied geographically. Most plants resistant to powdery mildew were found in northern Israel, whereas the single accession resistant to leaf rust was found in the western marginal population of Bat Shelomo, near the Coastal Plain. Moreover, disease resistance, at least in powdery mildew, appears as a polymorphism (resistant and susceptible phenotypes with rare intermediates occur *within* populations: Moseman *et al.,* 1984a; E1-Morshidy *et al.,* 1983).

Evaluation of genetic resources through isozyme studies provide an important aid in efficient collection, storage and use (Brown & Clegg, 1983). Moreover, it should be of prime importance to locate, through allozyme markers, multiple optimal genotypes in natural populations which combine associations to various disease resistances with elite agronomic traits (Nevo *et al.,* 1984c) in order to minimize yield depression in breeding.

The objectives of this study were: (a) to analyze the correlations of climatic factors to resistance in *T. dicoccoides* to the two pathogens, *E. graminis tritici* and *P. recondita tritici,* in order to identify potential populations and genotypes with maximal resistance to both pathogens, and (b) to explore correlations of allozymic proteins to resistance to powdery mildew and leaf rust, in order to identify allozyme markers which are associated, singly or in combination, with disease resistance.

We report here the ecological correlations and allozymic associations in *T. dicoccoides* in Israel which can be utilized for identifying the best sites and genotypes of wild wheat for breeding cultivars resistant to powdery mildew and leaf rust.

Material and methods

The study involved 233 accessions of *T. dicoccoides* consisting of population samples collected at 10 sites in Israel. All populations were described geographically, ecologically, and allozymically by Nevo *et al.* (1982); for their reactions to infection with *E. grarninis tritici* by Moseman *et al.* (1984a), and to infection with *P. recondita tritici* by Moseman *et al.* (1984b). The above description is summarized in Table 1. The four cultures of E. graminis *tritici,* Quincy, Mol0, 127 and ABK, possess virulence genes corresponding to known resistance genes to that pathogen in wheat. At least one of the four cultures, Quincy, Mol0, 127, and ABK, in the two composites of cultures of *E. graminis tritici,* was virulent on 9 of the 10 identified resistance genes, which confer resistance to *E. graminis tritici,* in wheat. The cultures were virulent on resistance genes *Pro1, Pro2, Pm3a, Pm3b, Pm3c, Pro4, Pro5, Pro6,* and *Pro7,* and avirulent on gene *Pro8* in Kavkaz. The culture PRTUS #6 of *P. recondita tritici* had the virulence characteristics of cultures most frequently isolated in the Eastern United States. The avirulent/virulent formula for culture PRTUS #6 was 2a, 9, 16, 18, 19, 24/1,2c, 3d, 3, I0, 11, 17. The procedures and methods of inoculation and reading reactions and the variation in the reactions within and between *T. dicoccoides* accessions in the populations at the 10 sites are described in detail by Moseman *et al.,* 1984a and Moseman *et al.,* 1984b.

We determined the associations of ecological factors and allozymic genotypes with resistance to E.

Climatic values were taken from the Atlas of Israel (1970) and from multiple-year records of the Meteorological Service of Israel.

Symbols of variables:

of tropical days; Sh = Mean number of Sharav days, i.e., hot and dry days; Ev = Mean annual evapoaration; (iii) Water availability: Dw = Mean number of dew nights in (i) Geographical var.: Lon. = Longitude, in decimals; Lat. = Latitude, in decimals; Alt. = Altitude, in meters; (ii) Temperature var.: Tm = Mean annual temperature; Ta = Mean August temperature; Tj = Mean January temperature; Td = Mean seasonal temperature difference; Tid = Mean day-night temperature difference; Trd = Mean number summer; $Rn = Mean$ annual rainfall, in mm; $Rd = Mean$ number of rainy days; Hu 14 = Mean humidity at 14:00; Hu an = Mean annual humidity; Th = Thornthwaite's moisture index; (iv) Edaphic variables; $S_0 = S_0$ il type: 1 = Terra Rosa; 2 = Rendzina; 5 = Basalt.

No. = Number of accessions; IT = The infection types produced by the reactions were read on a 0 to 9 scale from immune to very susceptible: $1-3$ = resistant, $4-6$ = moderately resistant, $7-9$ = susceptible (see details in Moseman et al., 1984a). IT-1 = mean infection type by compound 1 of powdery mildew (E. graminis tritici); IT-2 = mean infection type by compound 2 of powdery mildew (*E. graminis tritici*; IT-av = mean of both infection types by powdery mildew (*E. graminis tritici*); IT-LR = mean infection type against leaf rust (P. recondita trittci).

graminis tritici. The statistical analysis involves uni-and multivariate computer programs described by Hull and Nie (1981). All climatic variables and the levels of immunity are defined at the bottom of Table 1. Notably, various analyses depend on different sample sizes due to two reasons: (i) For leaf rust only 233 plants were analysed corresponding to those tested for powdery mildew, and (ii) Only 232 plants were electrophoresed and in this sample some genetic systems were unscorable in some plants ($n = 190-231$).

Results

The results are described in the tables and figures. The climatic matrix of the 10 populations analyzed for disease resistance and their average infection types against powdery mildew and leaf rust are given in Table I.

Correlations with ecological factors

1. Univariate analysis (Table 2)

(a) *Erysiphe grarninis tritici.* Resistance to

powdery mildew is significantly correlated with aridity (low humidity), and both seasonal and daity temperature differentials. Resistance also increases eastwards and northwards. The highest Spearman rank correlations are positive with daily temperature differentials ($r_s = 0.363***$), and negative with annual humidity ($r_s = -0.354***$).

(b) *Puccinia recondita tritici.* The geographic patterns of resistance to leaf rust contrast with those of powdery mildew. Only few accessions (15%) proved resistant or moderately resistant (Moseman *et al.,* 1984b), in contrast to the abundance of resistance (50%) against powdery mildew (Moseman *et al.,* 1984a). Nevertheless, moderate leaf rust resistance shows a correlation with ecological factors. Moderate leaf rust resistance is significantly and positively correlated with annual humidity ($r_s = 0.233***$), and negatively with seasonal temperature difference $(r_s = -0.243***)$. Note that the direction of correlations in these parameters is opposite to that in powdery mildew. The above correlations derive primarily from the presence of moderate resistance to leaf rust in two populations: Bet Meir and Qazrin.

Table 2. Spearman rank correlations (r₅) of geographic and climatic variables with disease resistance to 4 cultures of wheat powdery mildew and I culture of leaf rust pathogens in *T. dicoccoides* in Israel.

Levels of significance: * = p < 0.05; ** = p < 0.01; *** = p < 0.001; @ = p < 0.10; n.s. = p > 0.10. N = 171 accessions for Thornthwaite's moisture index and $N = 233$ for all other correlations.

Table 3. Coefficients of multiple determination (R²) with dependent variables of resistance to powdery mildew (IT-1, IT-2, and IT-av) and to leaf rust (IT-LR), and as independent climatic variables in 10 populations of wild wheat. *Triticum dicoccoides,* in Israel (for abbreviations see Table 1).

Stepwise model

Level of significance: ** = $p < 0.01$; *** = $p < 0.001$; N = 233.

2. Multivariate analysis

(a) *Multiple regression anah'sis (MR).* We conducted a stepwise multiple regression analysis (Hull & Nie, 1981) employing resistance values as dependent variables and climatic variables as independent variables (Table 3), to explain the variance in powdery mildew resistance by a combination of ecological factors. While single variables significantly explain only 0.12-0.18 of the variance in disease resistance, 2-variable combinations explain 0.17-0.22, and 3-variable combinations account for 0.26-0.27. All values are highly significant (p < 0.001). The explanation involves primarily a combination of humidity, evaporation, and temperature differences. Essentially, the same 3-variable combination that explained one fourth of the variance in resistance to powdery mildew explained 14% of the variance in resistance to leaf rust.

(b) *Smallest Space Analysis (SSA).* The multivariate pattern was analyzed by means of SSA, which is a nonmetric technique designed to plot intercorrelations of multivariate data in a space of minimal dimensionality (Guttman, 1968; Levy, 1981). The SSA treats each variable as a point in a Euclidean Space so that the higher the correlations between two variables, the closer they are in the space. The space of smallest dimensionality represents an inverse relationship between the observed correlations and the geometric distances. The results of the SSA are shown graphically in Figure 1, based on ecological and disease resistance variables discussed earlier. The following patterns are notable: (1) The climatic factors generated two poles,

one involving contiguous factors of water availability *(Rn, Rd, Hu, Th,* see abbreviations in Table 1) on the right hand side, and a.second, involving contiguous temperature variables (*Tm, Ta, Tj, Td, Tdd, Trd, Ev)* on the left hand side; (2) The three infection type variables of Wheat powdery mildew (IT-I, IT-2, IT-av) are located in proximity to the humidity variables; (3) The three resistant variables (Res-l, Res-2 and Res-av, which are inverse to the infection types) are located in high contiguity at the opposite pole; (4) The axis of leaf rust resistance (Res-LR) is perpendicular to the axis of powdery mildew. This result indicates a correlation of leaf rust resistance with factors of water availability, as mentioned earlier, and low correlation between the resistances to two diseases.

Correlation with allozymes

1. Single allozymes

We used the breakdown programme by Hull and Nie (198 I) to assess the association of resistance to *E. graminis tritici* and *P. recondita tritici* with allozymes (for all allozymic data and specifications see Nevo *et al.,* 1982). The mean infection Type (IT) of each allozyme genotype across populations (i.e. regarding all 232 genotypes as one megapopulation) is presented in Table 4. Allozyme genotypes are classified into 'resistant' (IT below average) and 'susceptible' (IT above average), respectively in the table, thereby partioning our data into genotypes displaying association and/or linkage with *tendencies* of resistance and susceptibility. The intra-locus

IT-LR

Sharav

Aititude

Fig. 1. Smallest Space Analysis (SSA) plotting Spearman correlations among powdery mildew and leaf rust and ecogeographic variables of Triticum dicoccoides in Israel. Coefficient of alienation = 0.224. $#$ = Climatic and geographical variables; ω = Disease resistance variables; IT-av = Average infection type by powdery mildew; IT-1 = Mean infection type by cultures Quincy and Mo10 of powdery mildew; IT-2 = Mean infection type by cultures 127 and ABK of powdery mildew; IT-LR = Mean infection type by culture 6 of leaf rust; Res-av = Average resistance to powdery mildew: Res-1 = Mean resistance to cultures Quincy and Mo10 of powdery mildew (9 - 1T1); Res-2 = Mean resistance to cultures 127 and ABK of powdery mildew $(9 - 172)$; Res-LR = Mean resistance to culture 6 of leaf rust $(9 - 172)$; $ITLR$).

January temperature

differential among genotypes was tested by ANO-VA and the significance is given in the last column of Table 4. For purposes of standardization, we have presented in addition to each individual mean also the average deviation of this genotype from the corresponding mean of its own population, designated 'Standardized IT' and appearing in parentheses. The resistance or susceptibility of the genotype is substantiated if its mean value is in accordance with the standardized IT. For example, a resistant genotype is substantiated if its mean IT is below the overall mean and its standardized IT is negative. This procedure differentiates between genotypes that are associated within the population with more resistance (or more susceptibility) and

genotypes that appear in high frequencies in generally resistant (or susceptible) populations. As is obvious from Table 4, some allozyme genotypes are associated with resistance to E. graminis tritici (e.g., Est-2 Baa; Acph-1 Baa; 6 Pgd-2bb; Pgi-Aaa, cc) and others are associated with susceptibility (e.g., Ipol-Add; Adh-2Bbb; Est-1Bbb). The search for resistance to leaf rust was less successful. However, some allozyme genotypes showed an association with relative resistance (e.g., Est-2 Baa; Est-1 Abb; Est-2Aaa; Ipol-Acc, dd).

Powdery mildew

 $\ddot{\bullet}$ it.

 $1T-2$ \bullet $\frac{M}{T}$

E
R

FACTORS

2. Multivariate analysis

(a) Multiple Regression Analysis (MR). We con-

FACTOR

ä

Evaporation

August temperature #

Annual temperature *

Table 4. Classification of allozymes of Triticum dioccoides into 'resistant' (IT below average), and 'susceptible' (IT above average) genotypes.¹
A. Powdery mildew

B. Leaf Rust

Locus	Resistant genotypes			Susceptible genotyp.			Significance
	Gt	N	ITLR (stITLR)	Gt	N	ITLR (stITLR)	
$Aat-2$				aa	15	7.7(0.15)	n.s.
A c ph -1 A				bb	18	$7.8(-0.14)$	@
Acph-1B				aa	$\overline{\mathbf{4}}$	$7.5 (+0.12)$	n.s.
A c $ph-2$				bb	3	$8.0 (+0.72)$	n.s.
Acph-3				aa	40	7.9(0.02)	$***$
				cc	Ħ	$7.8 (+0.52)$	
A c $ph - X$	aa	18	$7.4 (+0.05)$				n.S.
$Adh-IA$				bb	18	$7.9 (+0.23)$	٠
$Adh-IB$	aa	27	7.4(0.01)				n.s.
$Adh-2A$				bb	3	8.0(0.00)	n.S.
$Adh-2B$	bb	12	$6.8 (+0.42)$				$***$
$Est-1.4$	bb	\mathbf{I}	5.0(1.38)	aa	8	$7.8 (+0.10)$	٠
	ſſ	21	7.1(0.58)	dd	34	$7.7 (+0.03)$	
$Est-B$	bb	15	$7.0(-0.29)$	dd	\mathbf{I}	8.0(0.00)	n, s.
				$\mathbf{c}\mathbf{c}$	\overline{c}	$7.5 (+0.12)$	
$Ex-2A$	aa	15	$6.6(-0.48)$	ſf	4	7.5(0.12)	۰
				bb	$\overline{}$	7.4 (-0.03)	
$Ex1-2B$	aa	$\overline{\mathbf{4}}$	5.5(0.83)	bb	51	7.7(0.05)	***
	dd	94	$7.2 (+0.07)$	$\mathop{\rm cc}\nolimits$	79	$7.6(-0.03)$	
Est-4.4				bb	3	$8.0 (+0.21)$	n.s.
$Es-4B$	aa	138	7.2(0.04)	bb	\mathbf{I}	$8.0 (+0.11)$	***
				$_{\rm cc}$	74	$7.8 (+0.04)$	
				dd	\mathfrak{Z}	$7.7 (+0.28)$	
$Est-5A$	bb	43	7.0(0.00)				**
$Ex-5B$	$\rm ee$	18	$6.8 (+0.17)$	gg	\mathbf{I}	$8.0 (+0.43)$	***
	dd	\mathbf{I}	7.0(0.89)	aa	123	7.7(0.03)	
	cc	43	$7.0 (+0.05)$	bb	20	7.5(0.01)	
$Gdh - B$				bb	6	$7.8 (+0.45)$	n.S.
Gluc	bb	127	7.3(0.03)	cc	52	$7.8 (+0.01)$	$\ddot{}$
				aa	6	$7.7 (+0.22)$	
Нk	aa	171	$7.3 (+0.01)$	bb	42	8.0(0.00)	***
$Ipol-A$	$_{\rm cc}$	25	$6.8(-0.09)$				$***$
	dd	10	6.9(0.45)				
$Ipor-B$				bb	15	$7.5(-0.06)$	n.s.
Lap	$\mathbf{c}\mathbf{c}$	$\overline{}$	7.3(0.35)	bb	5	$8.0 (+0.43)$	n.s.
$Mdh-1.4$	bb	164	7.3(0.01)	aa	42	$8.0 (+0.03)$	$***$
$Nadh-1A$	cc	49	$7.3 (+0.09)$	aa	$\overline{7}$	7.9 (-0.04)	n.s.
Nadh-1B				bb	10	7.8 (-0.09)	n.s.
Nadh-2	bb	3	7.3(0.22)				n.s.
$Pepi - IB$	bb	180	$7.3(-0.02)$	aa	46	$7.8 (+0.04)$	\pm \pm
$Pepi-2$	cc	29	7.3(0.06)				n.s.
	aa	8	7.4(0.20)				
$Pgi-A$	cc	21	7.3(0.11)	aa	25	$7.9 (+0.08)$	٠
$Pgm-A$	aa	\mathbf{i}	$7.0 (+0.11)$				n.s.
6 <i>Pgd-1B</i>	bb	$\overline{2}$	7.0(0.57)				n.s.
6 <i>Pgd</i> -2				$_{\rm cc}$	-33	7.9(0.04)	\clubsuit
				bb	6	7.8(0.06)	

t The body of the table does not include all major genotypes, which do not deviate from the mean because of their high frequency.

² Significance is calculated by ANOVA, based on the differences between genotypes within a locus. Symbols: $@ = p \lt 0.10$; $* = p \lt 0.05$; ** = p < 0.01; *** = p < 0.001; n.s. = p > 0.10;

 3 Abbreviations: Gt = Genotypes; ITav = Average infection type by powdery mildew; stlTav = Standardized average infection type (mean deviation from local mean); IT I = Mean infection type by cultures Quincy, Mo l0 of powdery mildew, stlTI = Standardized ITI (mean deviation from local mean); IT2 = Mean infection type by cultures 127, ABK of powdery mildew; stIT2 = Standardized IT2 (mean deviation from local mean); ITLR = Mean infection type by culture 6 of leaf rust; stITLR = Standardized ITLR (mean deviation from local mean); *Aat* = Aspartate amino transferase; *Acph* = Acid phosphate; *Adh* = Alochol dehydrogenase; *Est* = Esterase; *Gdh =* Glutamate dehydrogenase; *Gp* = General protein; *Gluc* = Glucosidase; *Hk* = Hexokinase, *Ipol* = Indophenol oxidase in leaf; *Ipor* = lndophenol oxidase in root; Lap = Leucine amino peptidase; *Mdh* = Malate dehydrogenase; *Nadh* = Lipoamide diaphorase; *Pept* = Peptidase; *Pgi* = Phosphoglucose isomerase; *Pgm* = Phosphogluco mutase; *6 Pgd* = 6-Phospho gluconate dehydrogenase.

Stepwise model A. Powdery mildew $(N = 126)$									
$(1T-av)$	0.09 ***	$0.17***$	0.26 ***	0.32 ***					
Resistance to comp. 1	Ipol. Acc	$+$ Pgi-Acc	$+ A$ cph-1.4bb	$+$ Gluc-bb					
$(1T-1)$	0.08 **	0.17 ***	0.25 ***	0.29 ***					
Resistance to comp. 2	Ipol-Acc	$+$ Pgi-Acc	$+ A$ cph-1.4bb	$+$ Gluc-bb					
$(1T-2)$	0.09 ***	$0.14***$	$0.22***$	0.29 ***					
B. Leaf rust $(N = 210)$									
Resistance to cult. 6	Est-2 Baa	$+$ Ipol-Acc	$+ Es1-1$	$+ Es1-Bhh$					
$(IT-LR)$	$0.10***$	0.12 ***	$0.14***$	0.15 ***					

Table 5. Coefficients of multiple determination (R²) with dependent variables of resistance to powdery mildew (IT-1, IT-2 and IT-av) and to leaf rust (IT-LR) and as independent variables allozyme genotypes* of wild wheat, Triticum dicoccoides, in Israel.

Level of significance: ** = $p < 0.01$; *** = $p < 0.001$;

* Genotypes included in the analysis: Aspartate amino transferase: Aat-2aa; Acid phosphatase: Acph-1Abb, Acph-1Baa, Acph-3bb; Esterases: Est-1 Aaa, ff. Est-1 Bbb, Est-2 Aaa, ff. Est-2 Baa, Est-4 Bcc, dd; Glucosidase: Gluc-bb; Glutamate dehydrogenase: Gdh-Bbb; Indophenol oxidase in leaf: Ipol-Acc, dd; Lipamide diaphorase: Nadh-2bb; Phosphoglucose isomerase: Pgi-Aaa, cc; 6-Phospho gluco dehydrogenase: 6 Pgd-2bb.

ducted a stepwise multiple regression analysis (Hull & Nie, 1981) employing resistance values as dependent variables and allozyme genotypes as independent variables (Table 5), in an attempt to predict multilocus genotypes resistant to powdery mildew and leaf rust by a combination of allozyme variants.

A multilocus genotype consisting of 3 genotypes (Ipol-Acc, Pgi-Acc, Acph-1Abb) best predicts resistance to powdery mildew, and another multilocus genotype (Est-2Baa, Ipol-Acc, Est-1Aff) best predicts resistance to leaf rust.

(b) Smallest Space Analysis (SSA). The multivariate association between allozyme markers and resistance to powdery mildew and leaf rust is displayed by two SSA diagrams (Figs. 2 and 3, respectively). Fifteen allozyme genotypes that proved highly resistant to powdery mildew in the previous analysis appear in the 'resistant region' of the SSA diagram near the resistant variables. These genotypes include the following: Aat-2aa; Acph-1Abb; Acph-1 Baa; Est-1 Aaa; Est-2 Aff; Est-2 Baa; Est-4 Bdd; Est-5 Baa; Gdh-Bbb; Gluc-bb; Ipol-Acc; Nadh-2bb; Pgi-Aaa, cc; 6-Pgd-2bb. By contrast, the following genotypes appear in the 'susceptible region' (Near the IT variables): Est-1Bbb; Est-5 Bbb; Ipol-Add; Lap-cc. The five allozyme genotypes that showed in the previous analysis (Table 4) lower susceptibility to leaf rust appear in the SSA diagram (Fig. 3) in the 'resistant region': Est-1 Bbb; Est-2Aaa; Est-2Baa; Ipol-Acc, dd. Contrariwise, three genotypes appear in the 'susceptible region':

Adh-1Abb; Est-1Add; Est-4Bcc. The associations displayed in the two SSA diagrams between allozyme markers and resistance represent Spearman rank correlations. The larger the distance between variables on the SSA diagram, the lower the correlation. Very large distances represent negative Spearman correlations, whereas high proximity between variables indicates positive and high correlation. Thus, allozyme markers individually, or in combination, may be useful guidelines for identifying disease resistant genotypes.

Discussion

Our results suggest that resistance of tetraploid wild wheat. T. dicoccoides, in Israel, to powdery mildew and leaf rust displays (a) ecogeographic variation, and (b) association with allozyme markers. Both results provide guidelines for better sampling these resources for use in wheat breeding programmes and explain the maintenance of genetic polymorphism. We will discuss these aspects and underline the practical application.

1. Ecogeographic variation of resistance to powdery mildew and leaf rust of wild wheat in Israel

Our results indicate that the resistance to E . graminis tritici and to P. recondita tritici is geographically structured and ecologically correlated. Resist-

coefficient of allenation = 0.285

Fig. 2. Smallest Space Analysis (SSA) plotting Spearman correlations among disease resistance variables to powdery mildew and 20 allozyme markers of Triticum dicoccoides in Israel. * = Allozyme genotypes, @ = Disease resistance variables; IT-av = Average infection type by powdery mildew; IT-1 = Mean infection type by cultures Quincy and Mo10 of powdery mildew; IT-2 = Mean infection type by cultures 127 and ABK of powdery mildew; Res-av = Average resistance to powdery mildew; Res-1 = Mean resistance to cultures Quincy and Mo10 of powdery mildew $(9 - IT1)$; Res-2 = Mean resistance to cultures 127 and ABK of powdery mildew $(9 - IT2)$.

Fig. 3. Smallest Space Analysis (SSA) plotting Spearman correlations among disease resistance variables to leaf rust and 8 allozyme markers of Triticum dicoccoides in Israel. Coefficient of alienation = 0.125. * = Allozyme genotypes; @ = Disease resistance variables; IT-LR6 = Mean infection type by culture 6 of leaf rust; Res-RS6 = Mean resistance to culture 6 of leaf rust $(9 - ITLR)$.

218

ance to powdery mildew appears to have coevolved with the pathogen. Resistance to powdery mildew appears higher in largely drier environments, both northward and eastward, characterized by high seasonal and daily temperature differentials. The most resistant populations to powdery mildew are Qazrin and Rosh Pinna, where *7". dicoccoides* appears to be at its ecological climax, as indicated by the highly dense and productive populations. While marginal populations of *T. dicoccoides* are sparse and isolated, these central populations are continuous and extensive in distribution. Similar, but not identical results, were obtained for the resistance of wild barley, *Hordeum spontaneum,* to powdery mildew (Moseman *et al.,* 1983; Nevo *et al.,* 1984a). For both cereal species the highest resistance to the pathogen was found in ecologically optimal regimes of the species range. This pattern suggests the ecogeographical regions that are most suited for sampling wild germplasm for improving resistance to the powdery mildew pathogens. Furthermore, since even resistant populations proved polymorphic to pathogen resistance (M ose man *et al.,* 1984a), not only sites, but also within sites, specific genotypes must be screened through their allozymic markers. To date 10 genes of resistance against powdery mildew are known (see Moseman *et al.,* 1984a). However, to increase the number of resistant genes, as well as, the range of new alleles in the already known loci, additional wild emmer wheat populations and additional allozyme markers should be used.

The search for resistance to leaf rust is more difficult because most populations and genotypes tested were susceptible to the pathogen. Nevertheless, ecological correlates and allozyme markers may, in principle, provide effective guidelines. While one peripheral population (Bet Meir) contained moderate resistant genotypes, the second central population (Qazrin) was also the population displaying the highest resistance to powdery mildew.

2. A Ilozyme markers for pathogen resistance and its application

Linkage of genetic factors controlling or associated with quantitative variation was reviewed by Thompson and Thoday (1979) following the technique by Thoday (1961). As suggested by Tanksley *et al. (1982)* in their use of naturally occurring enzyme variations to detect and map genes controlling quantitative traits in tomato, it would be desirable to have a large number of marker genes distributed throughout the genome with codominant alleles. The alleles of these marker genes should be clearly identifiable and produce little or no effect on the morphology of the organism. Enzyme marker genes are ideal candidates for such a study as was shown in *Cyprinus carpio* (Brody *et al.,* 1976). *L.vcopersicon* (Tanksley *et al.,* 1982), and in *Hordeum spontaneum* (Nevo *et al.,* 1984a).

We have shown that both resistant and susceptible wild emmer wheat genotypes are associated with single allozymes or combinations of allozyme variants, and that the genetic polymorphism of disease resistance is partly associated with some allozyme polymorphism. Guided by the previous knowledge of the geographic variation in allozyme frequency (Nevo *et al.,* 1982), such associations may be utilized in quick screening of numerous wild wheat plants to choose the promising candidates for disease resistance tests. Furthermore, a multilocus profile of allozyme markers could be searched covering a maximally broad resistance to many diseases, combining them with elite agronomic traits to avoid yield depression in breeding(Nevo *et al.,* 1984c).

Since Israel is the center of diversity of *Hordeum spontaneum* and of *Triticum dicoccoides,* the genotypic arrays discovered in this region are optimal for searching multilocus genotypes with the broadest possible spectrum of disease resistance (Nevo *et al.,* 1984a). If these ideal genotypes are not identified from natural populations, they could be produced by specific crossing programmes, and later tested under multiple pathogen infections, first in the laboratory and then in the field. Finally, the rich allozymic diversity of wild emmer wheat (Nevo *et al.,* 1982) can be applied successfully in breeding highly resistant cultivars that maintain their economic status without yield depression.

As concluded by Brown and Clegg (1983). 'The genetic resources of cultivated plants consist of the genetic diversity present among developed cultivars, in the land races of primitive stocks, and in wild populations of their evolutionary relatives. Genetic evaluation of these resources through isozyme studies provides an important aid in efficient collection, storage, and use'. It is obvious that 'There are definite limits to the numbers of samples which can be handled effectively in programmes for the conservation and utilization of crop genetic resources. Consequently, there is a need for the coordinated and systematic planning of conservation programmes to ensure the preservation of the maximum amount of useful genetic variability while keeping the total number of samples within these limits'. (Marshall & Brown, 1975). Following the above mentioned arguments, we strongly believe that (i) a predictive method is required for screening disease resistant genotypes in nature, and (ii) that the method suggested here is more efficient than the empirical methods currently used in sampling as well as in testing for resistance. The main reason is that if our method is indeed effective, it might contribute both to optimize sampling, and in identifying (and/or producing by crossings) multilocus genotypes that are resistant to *multiple* diseases and are also *agronomically superb*. Finally, (iii) association of allozyme markers with disease resistance may help us to discover *new genes and/or alleles* of resistance.

3. The maintenance of allozyme and disease resistante polymorphism

Parasites were first suggested by Haldane (1949) to be an evolutionary force which could maintain polymorphism in their hosts. The host-parasite evolutionary interactions can actively maintain genetic polymorphism in both parasite and host (Clarke, 1976). Furthermore, the large amounts of genetic diversity within natural populations at the protein and DNA levels may be explained by various forces including frequency and density dependent selection by parasites(Clarke, 1976, 1979), and by spatiotemporal heterogeneity (Nevo, 1983; Nevo *et al.,* 1984b). The theory of host-parasite coevolution (Dietel, 1974) has been extended by many workers (i.e., Anikster & Wahl, 1979). Moseman (1959) has shown that for each gene conditioning the resistance of the barley host there is a corresponding gene conditioning the virulence of the pathogen E. *graminis hordei.* Therefore, the evolutionary dynamics of the disease resistance polymorphism may be directly related to pathogen polymorphism. Indirectly, both allozyme and disease resistance polymorphisms appear to be selected by the physical (climatic) and biotic environment. Unfortunately, the direct correlation between disease occurrence and resistance can not be evaluated at the present time due to lack of pertinent information, and the sporadic nature of epidemics.

The polymorphisms of allozymes (Nevo *et al.,* 1982) and disease resistance (Moseman *et al.,* 1983a, b, 1984) in Israel are both widespread and are significantly correlated with the climatic environment. Both polymorphisms are ecologically predictable by a combination of humidity and temperature variables. Thus, the coefficient of multiple determination $(R²)$ of two variable combinations (of humidity and rainfall) significantly explains 0.60 of the variance in allozyme polymorphism, and a 4-variable combination including evaporation, soil, latitude, and temperature significantly explains 0.75 of the variance in expected allozyme heterozygosity, *He,* (Nevo *et al.,* 1982). In parallel, a 3-variable combination of humidity, evaporation and temperature differences explains about a fourth of the variance in resistance to powdery mildew. Both polymorphisms are highest in mild, ecologically more heterogeneous climates, rather than in marginal extreme climates, in accord with the niche-width variation hypothesis (Van Valen, 1965) and with the theoretical prediction of the multilocus theory (Karlin, 1981).

Presumably, disease resistance polymorphisms respond to the extensive pathogen variation in its ecologically optimal and heterogeneous environment. Since allozymes are involved in resistance, either indirectly (e.g. as markers) or even directly (although to date there is no supportive evidence), as suggested by the associations found here, then the maintenance of allozyme polymorphisms may be reinforced by the pathogen-host interaction. Therefore, natural selection must be involved in their pattern and differentiation.

Conclusions and prospects

 $\overline{2}$

Wild relatives of crops have been especially useful to breeders searching for sources of disease resistance (for examples and review see Plucknett et *al.,* 1983; for barley see Moseman et *al.,* 1983; and for wheat Moseman 1984a, b). Several disease resistance genes have already been, or are currently being transferred from *T. dicoccoides* to cultivated wheats including stripe and leaf rusts. There must be many sources of resistance to each pathogen and each source is effective against different virulent types of the pathogen. Therefore, multiple sources of disease resistance must be used in association with agronomically elite genotypes to increase and stabilize wheat productivity. We have outlined ecological and allozymic predictive strategies which could optimize the selection of disease resistant wheat germplasm by utilizing diverse, as well as highly resistant sources in natural populations oftetraploid wild wheat in Israel.

7". dicoccoides is uniquely suitable for selecting diverse sources of resistance to many disease inciting pathogens. Its coevolution with pathogens in the Fertile Crescent at large, and in Israel, which is its center of diversity, in particular, has been proceeding for millions of years. This coevolution generated many sources of resistance against powdery mildew, rusts, and other pathogens, that have not been fully exploited. The predictive value of ecological factors and allozyme markers can greatly help in maximizing the conservation, exploitation, and utilization of the rich genetic resources of *T. dicoccoides* for improving the cultivated germplasm of wheats.

Acknowledgements

We thank M. Avrahami for assistance in field collection and N. Storch for laboratory assistance. This research was supported by a grant from the United States-Israel Binational Agricultural Research and Development Fund (BARD); the Israel Discount Bank Chair of Evolutionary Biology; the Ancell Teicher Research Foundation for Genetics and Molecular Evolution, established by Florence and Theodore Baumritter of New York, and contributions from Allen Gordon, Florida, USA; Arnold Hyman, Johannesburg, South Africa; Arthur Rutenberg, Florida, USA; Michael Block, Moises Mondlak and David Askanase, Texas, USA.

References

Anikster, Y. & Wahl. I., 1979. Coevolution of the rust fungi on Graminae and Liliaceae and their host. Ann. Rev. Phytopathol. 17:367 403.

- Atlas of Israel. 1970. Surveys of Israel. Jerusalem: Ministry of Labour. Elsevier Publ. Co., Amsterdam.
- Avivi, L., 1979a. High grain protein content in wild tetraploid wheat Triticum dicoceoides. Proc. 5th Int. Wheat Genet. Symp. Vol. 1. Ed. S. Rhamanogam, pp. 372-380. New Delhi.
- Avivi, L., 1979b. Utilization of T. dicoccoides for the improvement of grain protein quantity and quality of cultivated wheats. Monogr. Genet. Agr. 4:27 38.
- Brody, T., Moav, R., Hulata, G. & Wohlfarth, G., 1976. Application of electrophoretic genetic markers for fish breeding. II. Genetic variation within maternal half-sibs of carp. Aquaculture 9:351 363.
- Brown, A. H. D. & Clegg, M. T., 1983. lsozyme assessment of plant genetic resources. In: Genetic aspects of host-parasite relationships. Eds M. C, Rattazzi, J. G. Scandalios & G. S. Whit, pp. 285 295. Alan R. Liss, New York.
- Clarke, B.. 1976, The ecological genetics of host-parasite relationships. In: Isozymes: Current topics in biological and medical research. Volume 11: Medical and other applications. EdsA. E. R. Taylor& R. Muller, pp. 87 103. Blackwell, Oxford.
- Clarke, B., 1979. The evolution of genetic diversity. Proc. R. Soc. London, B 205:453 474.
- Dietel, P.. 1974. Betrachtungen tiber die Verteilung der Uridineen auf ihren Nahrpflanzen. Centralbl. Bakteriol. Gärungsphysiol. Pflanzenpathol. 12: 218-234.
- EI-Morshidy, M. A., M oseman, J, G., Nevo, E., Gerechter-Amitai, Z. K. & Zohary, D., 1983. Triticum dicoccoides a source of resistance to powdery mildew and leaf rust diseases. Agronomy Abs. 1983 Ann. Mtg Am. Soc. Agron. Washington. D.C.p. 62.
- Feldman, M.. 1976. Wheats. In: Evolution of crop plants. Ed. N. W. Simmonds. pp. I20-128, Longman, New York.
- Feldman, M., 1979, Genetic resources of wild wheats and their ,use in breeding, Monog. Genet. Agrar. 4:9 26.
- Feldman, M, & Sears, E. R., 1981. The wild gene resources of wheat. Scient. Am. 244:102-112.
- Frankel, O. H. & Bennett, E., 1970. Genetic resources in plants their exploration and conservation. Blackwell. Oxford.
- Gerechter-Amitai, Z. K. & Stubbs, R. W., 1970. A valuable source of yellow rust resistance in Israeli populations of wild emmet, Triticum dicoccoides Koern. Euphytica 19:12 21.
- Gerechter-Amitai, Z. K. & Grama, A.. 1974. Inheritance of resistance to stripe rust (Puccinia striiformis) in crosses between wild emmet (Triticum dicoccoides) and cultivated tetraploid and hexaploid wheats. 1. Triticum durum. Euphytica 23: 387-392.
- Grama. A. & Gerechter-Amitai, Z. K., 1974. Inheritance of resistance to stripe rust (Puccinia striiformis) in crosses between wild emmer {Triticum dicoccoides) and cultivated tetraploid and hexaploid wheats. 11. Triticum aestivum. Euphytica 23:393 398.
- Grama. A.. Gerechter-Amitai. Z. K.. Blum. A. & Rubenthaler *G. L.,* 1984. Breeding bread wheat cuhivars for high protein content by transfer of protein genes from Triticum dicoccoides. In: Cereal grain protein improvement, IAEA, Vienna, pp. 145 153.
- Guttman, L.. 1968. A general nonmetric technique for finding the smallest coordinate space for a configuration of points. Psychometrika 33:469 506.
- Haldane. J. B. S., 1949. Disease and evolution. Ricerca Scient. Suppl. 19: 68-76.
- Harlan. J. R, 1975. Our vanishing genetic resources. Science 188:618 621.
- Harlan, J. R., 1976. Genetic resources in wild relatives of crops. Crop Sci. 16:329 333.
- Hull, C. H. & Nie, N. H., 1981. SPSS Update 7-9. McGraw-Hill Co., New York.
- Karlin. S., 1981. Some.natural viability systems for a multiallelic locus: a theoretical study. Genetics 97:457 473.
- Levy, S., 1981, Lawful roles of facets in social theories. In: Multidimensional data representation: when and why. Ed. I. Borg, Mathesis Press, Ann Arbor.
- Marshall, D. K. & Brown, A. H. D., 1975. Optimum sampling strategies in genetic conservation. In: Crop genetic resources for today and tomorrow. EdsO. H. Frankel& J.G. Hawkes, pp. 53 70. Cambridge University Press.
- Moseman, J. G., 1959. Host-pathogen interaction of the genes for resistance in Hordeum vulgare and for pathogenicity in Erysiphegraminis f. sp. hordei. Phytopathology,49:469 472.
- Moseman, J. G.. Nero', E. & Zohary, D., 1983. Resistance of Hordeum spontaneum collected in Israel to infection with Erysiphegraminishordei. CropSci. 23:1115 1119.
- Moseman, J. G., Nevo. E.. EI-Morshidy. M. A. & Zohary. D., 1984a. Resistance of Triticum dicoccoides collected in Israel to infection with Erysiphe graminis tritici. Euphytica 33: 41 47.
- Moseman, J. G., Nero. E., Gerechter-Amitai, Z. K.. EI-Morshidy. M. A. & Zohary, D., 1984b. Resistance of Triticum dicoccoides collected in Israel to infection with Puccinia recondita tritici. Crop Sci. (in pressl.
- Nevo, E., 1983. Population genetics and ecology: The interface. In: Evolution from molecules and men. Ed. D. Bendall. pp. 287 321. Cambridge Univ. Press, Cambridge.
- Nevo, E.. 1984. Genetic resources of wild emmer wheat: structure, evolution and application in breeding. Proc. Sixth Int. Wheat Genet. Symp. Nov. 28-Dec. 3. 1983, Kyoto, Japan, pp. 421 431.
- Nero, E.. Zohary, D., Brown, A. H. D. & Haber M.. 1979. Genetic diversity and environmental associations of wild barley, Hordeum spontaneum in Israel. Evolution '33: 815 833.
- Nevo, E., Brown. A. H. D.. Zohary, D., Storch, N.& Beiles, A..

198 I. Microgeographic edaphic differentiation of allozyme polymorphisms of wild barley. PI. Syst. Evol. 183:287 292.

- Nevo, E., Golenberg, E. M., Beiles, A.. Brown, A. H. D. & Zohary, D., 1982. Genetic diversity and environmental associations of wild wheat. Triticum dicoccoides in Israel. Theor. AppI. Genet. 62:241 254.
- Nevo, E., Beiles, A., Storch, N., Doll, H. & Andersen B., 1983. Microgeographic edaphic differentiation in hordein polymorphisms of wild barley. Theor. Appl. Genet. 64: 123-132.
- Nevo, E., Moseman, J. G.. Beiles, A. & Zohary. D., 1984a. Correlation of ecological factors and allozymic variations with resistance to Erysiphe graminis hordei in Hordeum spontaneum in Israel: patterns and applications. PI. Syst. Evol. 145:79 96.
- Nevo, E., Belles, A. & Ben-Shlomo, R., 1984b. The evolutionary significance of genetic diversity: Ecological. demographic and life history correlates. In: The basis of genetic diversity. Ed. G. S. Mani, Lecture Notes in Biomathematics 53: 13 213.
- Nevo. E.. Belles, A.. Gutterman. Y., Storch. N. & Kaplan, D., 1984c. Genetic resources of wild cereals in Israel and vicinity. 1. Phenotypic variation within and between populations of wild wheat, T. dicoccoides. Euphytica 33:717 735.
- Nevo. E.. Beiles. A.. Kaplan. D.. Golenberg. E. M., Whittaker. L. & Naveh. Z., 1984d. Natural selection of allozyme polymorphisms: A microsite test revealing ecological genetic differentiation. Evolution (in press).
- Plucknett, D. L., Smith, N. J. H., Williams J. T. & Anishetty, N. M., 1983. Crop germplasm conservation and developing countries. Science 220:163 169.
- Tanksley. D., Medina-Filho. H. & Rick. C. M., 1982. Use of naturally occurring enzyme variation to detect and map genes controlling quantitative traits in an interspecific backcross of tomato. Heredity 49: 11-25.
- Thoday. J. M.. 1961. Location of polygenes. Nature 191: 368 370.
- Thompson, J. N. Jr. & Thoday, J. M. (eds), 1979. Quantitative genetic variation. Academic Press, New York.
- Van Valen, L., 1965. Morphological variation and width of ecological niche. Amer. Nat. 99:377 390.

Received 25.10.1984 Accepted 26.2.1985.