COMPARATIVE STUDY BY ELECTROPHYSIOLOGY OF OLFACTORY RESPONSES IN BUMBLEBEES *(Bombus hypnorum* **and** *Bombus terrestris)*

CAROLINE FONTA and CLAUDINE MASSON

Laboratoire de Neurobiologie Sensorielle de l'lnsecte INRA-CNRS (ERA 740) Station de Recherches sur l'Abeille et les Insectes Sociaux F-91440 Bures sur Yvette, France

(Received August 12, 1983; revised November 30, 1983)

Abstract--Electrophysiological data (EAG) were recorded on adult bumblebees stimulated with floral and/or pheromonal pure odorants at different concentrations. The responses of queen, worker, and male bees are compared and the sensitivities of these insects to the pure odorants tested are discussed.

Key words--Apoidea, *Bombus hypnorum, Bombus terrestris,* Hymenoptera, sex, caste, floral odorants, pheromones, electroantennography, olfactory equipment.

INTRODUCTION

Bumblebees (Apoidea, Hymenoptera) that live in groups grow up in a complex chemical environment, whether inside or outside their nests. Intraspecific relations seem to be determined, to a great extent, by chemical cues: brood pheromone (Heinrich, 1974), queen pheromone (Röseler and RSseler, 1974; R5seler, 1975, 1977; Plowright and Pendrel, 1977; Van Honk et al., 1980; Röseler et al., 1981), sexual pheromones (Kullenberg et al., 1970, 1973; Svensson and Bergström, 1977; Van Honk et al., 1978; Ågren et al., 1979; Svensson, 1979), trail pheromone (Cederberg, 1977b), and alarm pheromone (Cederberg, 1977a). Chemical volatiles cooperate with other mechanisms (spatial, temporal, mechanical) as premating isolating mechanisms and so prevent inbreeding (Svensson, 1980; Bergström et al., 1981).

On the other hand, these insects, which are active foragers, learn to

recognize the visual, chemical, and morphological signals of nectariferous plants. For the honeybee *(Apis mellifica),* another pollinator, chemical signals are the most effective signals (von Frisch, 1923; Kriston, 1973; Koltermann, 1973). Comparative behavioral experiments, applied to whole colonies of honeybees and bumblebees, have shown that conditioning to pure odorants (geraniol, limonene) is similar for both Hymenoptera (Pham-Delegue et al., 1983). Therefore it appears that volatile pheromones and plant aromas are essential sensory criteria for bumblebees to ensure the survival of the species.

It was then interesting to analyze, at different levels (perception, identification, and message integration), the nervous mechanisms which represent the key to the behavioral responses induced by chemical stimuli. We first studied the antennal olfactory equipment of *Bombus hypnorum* (Fonta and Masson, 1982) and quantified, by means of scanning electronic microscopy, sensilla placodea distribution on adult insect antennae. As has been well demonstrated in honeybees, plate organs are sensory structures whose nervous cells are specially adapted to detect volatile compounds (Lacher and Schneider, 1963; Kaissling and Renner, 1968; Esslen and Kaissling, 1976). For each antennal segment, the average density of the sensilla placodea is similar for male, worker, and queen bumblebees, yet the male antenna flagellum is one segment longer and the s. placodea population is denser on the distal segment (Fonta and Masson, 1982). However, differences in the number of sensory neurons, as has been found between male and worker of *Apis* (Esslen and Kaissling, 1976), or in the function of the placodea neuroreceptors (discrimination ranges and sensitivities) might exist between sexes and/or castes at this peripheral level.

The present work aims to conduct further studies on the electrophysiological recordings from single cells to analyze the insect olfactory detection level and perception characteristics. The antennal electric activity was measured by electroantennography recordings (EAG). Neurophysiological studies on bumblebees which have been published previously deal only with the visual system (Meyer-Rochow, 1980).

METHODS AND MATERIALS

Biological Materials. Two species *(Bombus hypnorum* L. and *Bombus terrestris* L.) of adult bees of diverse ages were studied. The experimental animals belonged to different colonies that were reared in the laboratory. The individual size variation inside each caste was kept narrow. The worker bees are foragers; the males have reached their sexual maturity whereas the queens are potential foundresses which have not yet hibernated.

Odorants. Eight pure substances (purity $= 99.9\%$) were tested: butanol (BUT), the usual reference compound for functional studies in olfaction, limonene (LIM), geraniol (GER), nerol (NER), citral (CIT), eugenol (EUG), vanillin (VAN), and isoamylacetate (ISO), floral aroma constituents (Loper, 1972; Lawrence, 1978; Etievant et al., 1984) and/or pheromonal elements of various Hymenoptera (e.g.: *Apis:* Boch and Shearer, 1962; Pickett et al., 1980, 1981; *Bombus:* Kullenberg et al., 1970; Svensson and Bergström, 1977; Bergström et al., 1981; *Andrena: Bergström and Tengö*, 1974; Tengö and Bergström, 1976, 1977; Francke et al., 1981; Bergström et al., 1982; *Anthophoridea:* Vinson et al., 1982).

Methods. Experiments were carried out on live insects, immobilized in a special restraining device.

The recording electrode (a drawn out glass microcapillary, 1 mm inner diameter) was set up on the left antenna tip when the distal part of the last segment had been removed. The reference electrode (inner diameter: 0.5 mm) covered the right antenna. The two electrodes were filled with 2 M NaCl solution (116.88 g/liter). They were connected to an impedance adapter, which was itself connected to a storage cathodic oscilloscope.

The stimulation device was an olfactometer with dynamic and controlled gas dilution (Masson and Friggi, 1974; Masson et al., in preparation). The head of the insect was swept by pure nitrogen between the stimulations or by odoriferous nitrogen during the stimulations. The carrier air was scented when passed through the enclosed spaces containing the odorants and delivered at about 4 mm from the longitudinal axis of the left antenna. This flow is associated with a constant nitrogen flow (7.3 liter/hr) which is necessary for the antennal mechanoreceptors to be habituated and which cleans the circuits, followed by the scented air flows. The carrier air pressure and thus the concentration of the stimulating odorous molecules were controlled by a water manometer.

The following equation gives the number of molecules in each milliliter of carrier air (Masson, 1973; Masson and Friggi, 1974):

$$
ni = \frac{(6 \times 10^{23}) \times 273 \text{ } Pi}{22400 \text{ } T \times 760} \sim 0.96 \times 10^{19} \frac{\text{ }Pi}{T}
$$

where $ni =$ number of molecules/ml of carrier gas; $Pi =$ vapor pressure in mm Hg at 20 $^{\circ}$ C; and T = temperature in degrees Kelvin.

Protocol. Stimulation with pure odorants used alone lasted 2 sec, which is the time required for the stimulus to reach the neighborhood of the antenna. Between two successive stimulations, a 2-min interval ensured desorption of the membrane neuroreceptors.

Each of the eight odorants was tested at three concentrations (Table 1) which were linked to the three nitrogen flows: $D_1 = 1.2$ liter/hr, $D_2 = 3.6$

Odorants	Stimulus Quantity					
	$D_1 = 1.2$ liter/hr		$D_2 = 3.6$ liter/hr		$D_1 = 6.05$ liter/hr	
	Ni	log Ni	Ni	log Ni	Ni	log Ni
Butanol (BUT)	1.40×10^{17}	17.146	4.22×10^{17}	17.625	7.10×10^{17}	17.851
Geraniol (GER)	4.45×10^{14}	14.648	1.34×10^{15}	15.127	2.26×10^{15}	15.354
Nerol (NER)	1.53×10^{15}	15.185	4.62×10^{15}	15.664	7.77×10^{15}	15.890
Citral (CIT)	1.26×10^{15}	15.100	3.80×10^{15}	15.580	6.39×10^{15}	15.806
Isoamylacetate (ISO)	1.21×10^{17}	17.083	3.66×10^{17}	17.563	6.16×10^{17}	17.790
Limonene (LIM)	3.04×10^{16}	16.483	9.17×10^{16}	16.962	1.54×10^{17}	17.188
Eugenol (EUG)	3.00×10^{14}	14.477	9.05×10^{14}	14.957	1.52×10^{15}	15.182
Vanillin (VAN)	3.69×10^{12}	12.567	1.11×10^{13}	13.045	1.87×10^{13}	13.272

TABLE 1. NUMBER OF MOLECULES *(Ni)* OF A 2-SEC STIMULATION^a

 ${}^{\circ}D_1$, D_2 , D_3 : the three flow rates of the carrier air.

liter/hr, $D^3 = 6.05$ liter/hr. For each flow rate, stimulations were randomized. The maximal amplitude of depolarization induced by the stimulation was recorded.

The results reported and discussed here represent the mean of the responses of 10 insects; the substances were tested on each animal and 1-3 trials were conducted with each experimental insect.

Average amplitude of responses is figured by a function of decimal logarithm of the odorant molecules concentration.

RESULTS

The odorous chemicals used in this work stimulate the neuronal activity of the insect peripheral olfactory system.

The EAG responses, which are functions of the stimulating molecuie concentrations, are represented by linear functions in the range of chosen concentrations.

In *Bombus hypnorurn* (Figure 1), the EAG responses of workers and males were similar for each stimulus, response amplitudes increasing in the same way for both. The future foundresses of this species gave, in general, slightly higher responses. The largest difference was shown to be between queens and workers and males for the highest concentrations of butanol used in our experimental situation $(2:1$ quotient). The responses of queens and workers increased in parallel, except for butanol and eugenol. In comparing males and workers, a more irregular evolution was found in the response amplitude ratios.

In *Bombus terrestris* (Figure 2), the responses of workers and males varied in an analogous way with the stimulus quantity. The depolarization amplitudes were higher for males than for females; this difference was emphasized with the upper concentration of limonene. Generally, the curves of stimulus concentration-response are not parallel for the two sexes for each odorant; amplitude ratio variation is different for substances tested in comparable concentration ranges (for example, limonene and butanol).

A linear regression $(y = mx + b)$ has been calculated with three coordinates for each function derived experimentally. Correlation coefficient values range from 0.92 to 0.99. Consequently, the stimulus concentration values (x) obtained from the linear regressions can be relied on for a response amplitude (y) of 0.5 mV.

The results can be analyzed for the two species together. The eight pure odorants tested can be classified in five groups if the stimulus intensity required to obtain a 0.5-mV amplitude detection response (Table 2) is used as the classification criterion: (1) VAN ($\sim 10^{13}$ molecules), (2) GER-EUG $\sim 10^{15}$ molecules), (3) CIT-NER ($\sim 3 \times 10^{15}$ to 10¹⁶ molecules), (4) LIM-ISO (\sim 3-6 \times 10¹⁶ molecules), and (5) BUT (\sim 3 \times 10¹⁷ to 10¹⁸ molecules).

There is a 10^4 factor between groups 1 and 5, the first compound (VAN) being clearly distinct from the second class of compounds (GER-EUG). This hierarchy in sensitivity and detection method for the eight substances is similar within each species, each caste and each sex.

DISCUSSION

All the EAG responses obtained in these experiments are expressed as depolarizations. The results, by quantitative analysis, do not show strong differences in the responses of the three kinds of individuals except for butanol; this odorant molecule induces an antennal electrical activity higher for the young queens than for workers and males of *Bombus hypnorum.*

As demonstrated here all the responses of the queens are more pronounced, and the response amplitudes of males are superior to those of the workers. Two alternative explanations could account for these observations: (1) A first-order sensory fibers equipment difference for the three types: various numbers of neuroreceptors in the sensilla placodea and/or a different s. placodea population, in absolute value (on the one hand the body size and therefore the antennal area of queens is bigger than workers and males; on the other hand, the antennal flagellum of the male has one additional segment). (2) Sensitivity and discrimination power of the peripheral sensory neurons may show characteristics for each caste and/or each sex. Until now, no study has been undertaken at the unitary level with bumblebees.

The term x determined by linear regression $y = mx + b$; $x = \log N$.

TABLE 2. NUMBER OF ODOR MOLECULES (N) INDUCING A 0.5-mV EAG AMPLITUDE (y)"

FzG. 3. An attempt to classify the stimuli tested according to the biological responses of bumblebees. MOL WT: molecular weight.

These explanations are necessary to account for the range of olfactory sensitivities expressed by the bumblebees for the tested odorants. The classification in five groups that was hypothesized is now considered to be temporary and arbitrary; the substances studied in this work may be representative of molecular groups whose diverse structural parameters should be decisive in the release (potential receptor) and transmission (generator potential) of the nervous influx along the sensory fiber. We emphasize here that the stereoisomers geraniol and nerol tested at the same concentration induce different EAG responses.

Although fine relationships between the structure and function of **odorants cannot be studied with EAG recordings, this work shows that butanol, with the lowest molecular weight (74) and the poorest "responseinducing structure" in terms of chemical functions (one alcohol function only), is not as well perceived as the other stimuli tested (Figure 3). The sensitivity of the receptor cells is more or less linked to the molecular weight (Figure 3); as the number of carbon atoms does not seem to be directly concerned, our results agree with the general hypothesis that molecular** structure and chemical functions are determining factors in the interactions between odorant molecules and neuronal membrane receptors of generalist cells.

Moreover, studies of discriminatory abilities of vertebrate olfactory neuroreceptors (Sicard, 1980) have shown that d -limonene is representative of a "terpene group" which does not include isoamylacetate, and butanol appears to be independent of the other odor molecules tested in this work.

The data described suggest that the method used in this work is suitable for the study of the EAG recordings of bumblebees stimulated with odorants belonging to their floral and pheromonal language. These studies have two principal aims. The first is to help, by biological assay, with the chemical identification (by gas chromatography and mass spectrometry) of gland and cuticle extractions, generators of odor substances which are thought to have intra- or interspecific actions (chemical analysis of such odors is now in progress and the results will soon be published). The second is to study the peripheral olfactory nervous system function of a "generalist insect" (Masson and Brossut, 1981) and its part in the identification processing of a pheromonal blend which produces (after the integration of messages in the central nervous system) behavioral or physiological responses from the insect stimulated. Further development of this work requires the measurement of recording at the cellular level.

In *Apis,* wide-spectrum neuroreceptors (Lacher, 1964) and cells responsible for the detection of pheromones (Kaissling and Renner, 1968) have been demonstrated. Are the same features present in bumblebees? In addition, is the sensory olfactory equipment of bumblebees organized in specific cell groups as has been demonstrated in *Apis* (Vareschi, 1971)?

If the inherent potentialities of the olfactory sense of bumblebees were known, then one can determine the complexity and elaboration level of chemical communication and elucidate the actual importance of olfaction to the sensory spectrum of these insects.

Acknowledgments--The authors thank Dr. Michael Lindley for reviewing the English manuscript.

REFERENCES

- AGREN, L., CEDERBERG, B., and SVENSSON, B.G. 1979. Changes with age in ultrastructure and pheromone content of male labial glands in some bumblebee species (Hymenoptera, Apidae). *Zoon* 7:1-14.
- BERGSTRÖM, G., and TENGÖ, J. 1974. Studies on natural odoriferous compounds. IX. Farnesyl and geranyl esters as main volatile constituents of the secretion from Dufour's gland in 6 species of *Andrena* (Hymenoptera, Apidae). *Chem. Scr.* 5:28-38,
- BERGSTROM, G., SVENSSON, B.G., APPELGREN, M., and GROTH, I. 1981. Complexity of bumblebee marking pheromones: Biochemical, ecological and systematical interpretations, pp. 175-183, *in* P.E. Howse and J.L. Clement (eds.). Biosystematics of Social Insects, Systematics Association special volume No. 19. Academic Press, London.
- BERGSTRÖM, G., TENGÖ, J., REITH, W., and FRANCKE, W. 1982. Multicomponent mandibular gland secretions in three species of *Andrena* Bees (Hym., Apoidea). *Z. Naturforsch.* 37c:1124-1129.
- BOCH, R., and SHEARER, D.A. 1962. Identification of geraniol as the active component in Nassanoff pheromone of the honeybee. *Nature* 194:704-706.
- CEDERBERG, B. 1977a. Chemical basis for defense in bumblebees. *Proc. 8th Int. Congr. IUSSI* 1977:77.
- CEDERBERG, B,, 1977b. Evidence for trail marking in *Bombus terrestris* workers (Hymenoptera, Apidae). *Zoon* 5:143-146.
- ESSrEN, J., and KAISSLING, K.E. 1976. Zahl und Verteilung antennaler Sensillen bei der Honigbiene *(Apis mellifera* L). *Zoomorphologie* 83:227-251.
- ET1EVANT, P., PHAM-DELEGUE, M.H., and MASSON, C. 1984. Isolation and identification of volatile constituents of sunflower *(Helianthus annuus* L.). J. *Agric. Food Chem.* in press.
- FONTA, C., and MASSON C. 1982. Analyse de l'equipement sensoriel antennaire du bourdon *Bombus hypnorum L. Apidologie* 13(3):247-263.
- FRANCKE, W., REITH, W., BERGSTRÖM, G., and TENGÖ, J. 1981. Pheromone bouquet of the mandibular glands in *Andrena haemorrhoa* F. (Hym., Apoidea). *Z. Naturforsch.* 36c:928- 932.
- F RISCH, K. von. 1923. Über die "Sprache" der Bienen, eine tier-psychologische Untersuchung. *ZooL Jahrb. (PhysioL)* 40:1-186.
- HEJNRICH, B. 1974. Pheromone induced brooding behavior in *Bombus vosnesenskii* and B. *edwardsii* (Hymenoptera: Bombidae). J. Kans. entomol. Soc. 47(3):396-404.
- KAISSLING, K.E., and RENNER, M. 1968. Antennal receptors for queen substance and scent gland odour in honeybees. *Z. Vergl. Physiol.* 59:357-361.
- KOLTERMANN, R. 1973. Rassen-bzw. artspezifische Duftbewertung bei der Honigbiene und 5kologische Adaptation. J. *Comp. Physiol.* 85:327-360.
- KRISTON, I. 1973. Die Bewertnng yon Duft- und Farbsignalen als Orientierungshilfen an der Futterquelle durch *Apis mellifera L. J. Comp. Physiol.* 84:77-94.
- KULLENBERG, B., BERGSTROM, G., and STALLBERG-STENHAGEN, S. 1970. Volatile components of the cephalic marking secretion of male bumblebees. *Acta Chem. Scand.* 24:1481-1483.
- KULLENBERG, G., BERGSTRÖM, G., BRINGER, B., CARLBERG, and B., CEDERBERG, B. 1973. Observations on scent marking by *Bombus* Latr. and *Psithyrus* Lep. males (Hym. Apidae) and localization of site of production of the secretion. *Zoon* 1 (Suppl.): 23-29.
- LACHER, V. 1964. Elektrophysiologische Untersuchungen an einzelnen Rezeptoren für Geruch, Kohlendioxyd, Luftfeuchtigkeit und Temperatur auf den Antennen der Arbeitsbiene und der Drohne *(Apis mellifica* L.) Z. *VergL Physiol.* 48:587-623.
- LACHER, V., and SCHNEIDER, D. 1963. Elektrophysiologischer Nachweis der Riechfunktion von Porenplatten (sensilla placodea) auf den Antennen der Drohne und der Arbeitsbiene *(,4pis mellifica). Z. Vergl. Physiol.* 47:274-278.
- LAWRENCE, B.M. 1978. Progress in essential oils. No. 16 *Perfum. Flavorist* 3:54-58.
- LOPER, G.M. 1972. *Medicago sativa* and *Citrus depressa* flower volatiles. *Phytochemistry* **11(5):1865.**
- MASSON, C. 1973. Contribution à l'étude du système antennaire chez les fourmis. Approche morphologique, ultrastruturale et électrophysiologique du système sensoriel. Thesis. Fac. Sci. Nat. Univ. Provence. Marseille. 332 pp.
- MASSON, C., and FRIGGI, A. 1974. Coding of information by the olfactory receptor cells of the antenna in *Camponotus vagus* (Hym. Formieidae). J. *Insect PhysioL* 20(5):763-782.
- MASSON, C., and BROSSUT, R. 1981. La communication chimique chez les insectes. La *Recherche* 121:406-416.
- MEVER-RocHow, V.B. 1980. Eleetrophysiologically determined spectral efflciencies of the

compound eye and median ocellus in the bumblebee *Bombus hortorum tarhakimalainen* (Hymenoptera, Insecta). *J. Comp. Physiol.* 139:261-266.

- PHAM-DELE6UE, M.H., FoN'rA, C., and MASSON, C. 1983. L'apprentissage olfactif chez l'abeille et le bourdon: Une étude comparée par conditionnement associatif. *C.R. Acad. Sci. Paris* D. 296:501-506.
- PICKETT, J.A., WILLIAMS, I.H., MARTIN, A.P., and SMITH, M.C. 1980. Nasonov pheromone of the honeybee, *Apis mellifera* L. (Hymenoptera, Apidae). Part I. Chemical characterization *J. Chem. EeoL* 6:425-434.
- PICKETT, J.A., WILLIAMS, I.H., SMITH, M.C., and MARTIN, A.P. 1981. Nasonov pheromone of the honeybee, *Apis mellifera* L. (Hymenoptera, Apidae). Part III. Regulation of pheromone composition and production. Y. *Chem. EeoL* 7:543-554.
- PLOWRICHT, R.C., and PENDREL, B.A. 1977. Larval growth in bumblebees (Hymenoptera, Apidae). *Can. EntomoL* 109:967-973.
- R6SELER, P.F. 1975. The role of juvenile hormone in regulating the fertility of the worker caste of the bumblebee, *Bombus terrestris L. Verh. Dtseh. ZooL Ges.* 00:124.
- RÖSELER, P.F. 1977. Juvenile hormone control of oögenesis in bumblebee workers, *Bombus terrestris. J. Insect Physiol.* 23:985-992.
- ROSELER, P.F., and R6SEEER, I. 1974. Morphologische und physiologische Differenzierung der Kasten bei den Hummelarten *Bombus hypnorum* (L.) und *Bombus terrestris* (L.). *Zool. ,lb. Physiol.* 78:175-198.
- RÖSELER, P.F., RÖSELER, I., and VAN HONK, C.G.I. 1981. Evidence for inhibition of corpora allata activity in workers of *Bombus terrestris* by a pheromone from the queen's mandibular glands. *Experientia* 37:348-351.
- SICARD, G. 1980. Contribution à l'étude électrophysiologique des propriétés de discrimination des neurorécepteurs olfactifs. Thesis 3è Cycle Neurophysiologie. Univ. Claude Bernard. Lyon I. 71 pp.
- SVENSSON, B.G. 1979. Patrolling behaviour of bumblebee males (Hymenoptera, Apidae) in a subalpine/alpine area, Swedish Lapland. *Zoon* 7:67-94.
- SVENSSON, B.G. 1980. Species isolating mechanisms in male bumblebees (Hymenoptera, Apidae). Abstr. Upps. Diss. Fac. Sci., 549:1-42.
- SVENSSON, B.G., and BERGSTRÖM, G. 1977. Volatile marking secretions from the labial gland of north European *Pyrobombus* D.T. males (Hymenoptera, Apoidea). *Insectes Soe.* 24(2):213-224.
- TENG6. J. and BERGSTR6M, G. 1976. Comparative analyses of lemon-smelling secretions from heads of *Andrena* F. (Hymenoptera, Apoidea) bees. *Comp. Biochem. Physiol.* 55B:179- 188.
- TENGO. J. and BERGSTROM, G. 1977. Comparative analyses of complex secretions from heads of *Andrena* bees (Hym. Apoidea) *Comp. Biochem. Physiol.* 57B: 197-202.
- VAN HONK, C., VELTHUIS, H., and RÖSELER, P.F. 1978. A sex pheromone from the mandibular glands in bumblebee queens. *Experientia* 34:838.
- VAN HONK, C., VELTHIUS, H., ROSELER, P.F., and MALOTAUX, M. 1980. The mandibular glands of *Bombus terrestris* queens as a source of queen pheromones. *Entomol. Exp. Appl.* 28:191-198.
- VARESCHI, E. 1971. Duftunterscheidung bei der Honigbiene-EinzelzeU-Ableitungen und Verhaltensreaktionen. *Z. Vergl. Physiol.* 75:143-173.
- VINSON, S.B., WILLIAMS, H.J., FRANKIE, G.W., WHEELER, J.W., BLUM, M.S., and COVILLE, R.E. 1982. Mandibular glands of male *Centris adani,* (Hymenoptera: Anthophoridae). Their morphology, chemical constituents, and function in scent marking and territorial behavior. J. *Chem. Ecol.* 8(2):319-327.