

Origin of gynodioecy in *Limnanthes:* **evidence from ecogeographic patterns of variation**

R. Kesseli and S. Jain

Department of Agronomy and Range Science, University of California, Davis, CA 95616, USA

Received January 2, 1987; Accepted March 20, 1987 Communicated by P. M. A. Tigerstedt

Summary. Evidence for hybrid origin of gene-cytoplasmic gynodioecy in *Limnanthes douglasii* is presented in terms of the parapatric distributions of putative parental taxa and the increased levels of genetic variation in gynodioecious populations. Attempts to produce gynodioecy through artificial hybridization between different accessions apparently failed due to the limited number of parental combinations used in making hybrids. Further studies are proposed on the hybrid origin model and on selective forces determining the fate of gynodioecy with its contributions to higher levels of hybridity and genetic variation.

Key words: Gynodioecy - Natural hybridization - Gene-cytoplasmic control - Genetic variation - Anther color polymorphism

Introduction

Studies in numerous crop species have shown genecytoplasmic male-sterility to arise frequently from intervarietal or inter-specific hybridization (e.g. *Nicotiana,* Chaplin 1964; *Gossypium,* Meyer and Meyer 1961; *Brassica,* Pearson 1972). These hybridizations presumably introduce foreign nuclear alleles into different plasma types. Despite many useful agricultural examples and evidence suggesting that the gene-cytoplasmic mode may be the most common form of male sterility (Edwardson 1970; Ross 1978; Kheyr-Pour 1981; Van Damme and Van Delden 1982; Kesseli and Jain 1984a), most workers have neither discussed the origin of gynodioecy specifically in natural populations nor tested the predicted outcomes from the postulated hybrid mode of origin. Gynodioecy has also been reported in *Limnanthes* (Baker 1966) and investigated for its genetic control and maintenance (Kesseli and Jain 1984a). Several biosystematic studies in this genus have identified nearly 20 operational taxonomic units (Mason 1952; Ornduff and Crovello 1968; McNeill and Jain 1983; Kesseli and Jain 1984b) which commonly occur as partially subdivided and discrete populations in vernal pools or streams; additionally, surveys of genetic variability of all known taxa have shown high levels of intra- and inter-population diversity.

The purpose of this study is to report the distribution of gynodioecy in *Limnanthes* spp. in relation to the evidence for its hybrid origin. Specifically, we test the hybrid origin hypothesis using (a) the patterns of geographic distribution of closely related taxa, (b) data on allozyme and morphological variability between the neighboring hermaphroditic and gynodioecious populations, and (c) certain parental combinations to recreate and transfer male sterility through hybridizations.

Materials and methods

Variation surveys of 113 populations of *Limnanthes* taxa (McNeill and Jain 1983; Kesseli and Jain 1984b) reported until 1983, showed only two populations (UCL529 from Solano county and UCL435 from Mendocino county) to be gynodioecious. Additional populations in the vicinity of the original gynodioecious populations in these two regions and in a third recently discovered area (Butte region) (Fig. 1) which also has gynodioecy, were surveyed for male-steriles by scoring individuals along several linear transects through each of the populations.

In each of the Solano and Mendocino regions, five populations (one gynodioecious and four neighboring hermaphroditic) were sampled and 10 to 12 plants per population were grown in greenhouses. We scored these plants for 12 morphological characters namely; petal length, petal width,

style length at anthesis, stamen length, anther color, sepal pubescence, length of leaf subtending the first flower; and leaf form in terms of the number of leaflets, basal leaflet length, and the number and width of lobes on the leaflets as well as the depth of sinus indentation.

Allozyme variation data from our earlier studies were used in conjunction with data from five populations of the Butte region, including the newly discovered gynodioecious population (UCL531). For all populations, we scored a minimum of 40 plants. Electrophoretic techniques and statistical analyses were identical to those of Kesseli and Jain (1984 b).

Crosses between the postulated progenitor taxa of gynodioecious populations as well as other parental combinations were made in the greenhouse. Transfers of male strility from the two original gynodioecious populations, *L. douglasii* var. *rosea* (UCL529) and *L. douglasii* var. *nivea* (UCL435) only used male strile plants as the maternal parent.

Results

Among the 123 populations which have now been assayed for genetic variation, the hundreds of specimens from herbaria at the Davis and Berkeley campuses of the University of California and the field observations of all taxa in the genus, only eight populations were gynodioecious. These cluster into three disjunct regions; five populations in two regions (Solano, Butte) are *L. douglasii* var. *rosea (L.d.* var. *rosea)* and three population in the Mendocino region are L. d. var. *nivea* (Fig. 1). There are still areas where the occurrence of male sterility may be likely but so far undetected. Herbert Baker (personal communication) did note male sterility in a fourth Central California region, San Joaquin County, but we have been unable to relocate this site, possibly because of extensive habitat losses due to agricultural development in this region.

Distribution patterns of several *Limnanthesspp*. showed a close association between gynodioecy and sympatry of different taxa or evidence of introgression. In all three gynodioecious L. d. var. *nivea* populations in the Mendocino region, a second species, the narrowly distributed *L. bakeri,* was also found. Pure stands of L. d. var. *nivea* or *L. bakeri* had no male sterile individuals (Fig. 1 c). In Butte region, a mapping of morphological variants at a locus controlling anther color showed that male sterility occurred at the interface

Table 1. A comparison of morphological variation in hermaphroditic and gynodioecious populations opulations J ् .
۳ ्
न ś مہ
مطابق $\frac{1}{2}$ $\frac{1}{2}$ \sim نۍ ٠, $\overline{}$

Anther color: $R = red$, $Y = yellow$

c A sign test comparing the C.V.s for all characters of the gynodioecious with those of each hermaphroditic population showed the gynodioecious to be higher in 32 of 40 • Anther color: R = red, Y = yellow
• A sign test comparing the C.V.s for all characters of the gynodioecious with those of each hermaphroditic population showed the gynodioecious to be higher in 32 of 40
comparisons in comparisons in L. d. var. *rosea* (P< 0.01) and 28 of 40 comparison in L. d. var. *nivea* (P < 0.05)

Population		Loci and alleles										
(UC accession no. in parentheses)	Adh-1		$Pgm-1$			$Pgm-2$				Pgi-1		
	100	98	100	102	99	100	96	94	102	100	102	98
Lenninger (543)	0.93	0.07	0.82	0.07	0.11	0.53	0.45	0.02		1.0		
V ina (516)	1.0		1.0			0.88	0.08		0.04	0.95		0.05
Broyles (531) G	0.86	0.14	0.78	0.17	0.05	0.63	0.37			0.99	0.01	
Shippee (512)	1.0		1.0			0.71	0.29			0.90	0.05	0.05
Skillen (540)	1.0		0.88	0.12		0.56	0.44			0.96		0.04
<i>L. d. rosea</i> (13 popn.)	0.99	0.01	0.82	0.16	0.01	0.78	0.21		0.01	0.80	0.15	0.05
Jepson (529) G	1.0		0.80	0.20		0.81	0.19		0.01	0.77	0.18	0.04
L. d. nivea (14 popn.)	0.99	0.01	0.77	0.11	0.09	0.18	0.79	0.01	0.02	0.93	0.02	0.04
Adams (435) G	0.99	0.01	0.63	0.33	0.04	0.19	0.81			0.87	0.12	0.01
L. bakeri (3 popn.)	1.0		1.0			1.0				0.81	0.19	

Table 2. A comparison of allozyme variation in hermaphroditic and gynodioecious populations. G, gynodioecy present

of a northwestern yellow anther race and a southeastern red anther race of L. d. var. rosea (Fig. 1b). Pure stands of red or yellow anther forms of L. d. var. *rosea* had no male sterility while polymorphic stands have male sterility. The most polymorphic stands (e.g. UCL531, 542) had the highest frequency of malesteriles. We have not thoroughly explored the regions north of this interface, but to the south all populations in the northern Central Valley are generally monomorphic for the red anther allele.

In the Solano region we found no geographical evidence for the extant sympatry of species or races. All hermaphroditic populations are nearly monomorphic for red anthers. However, as in the case of Butte region, all gynodioecious populations are highly polymorphic for anther color. The yellow anther taxon, L. d. var. *nivea,* does inhabit the same drainage systems but at higher elevations of the coastal range.

Levels of variation were higher in the gynodioecious populations than the average population of the taxa. In addition to anther color, the gynodioecious L. d. var. *rosea* and L. d. var. *nivea* populations showed greater amounts of variation for other floral and vegetative morphological characters as well (Table 1). The coefficients of variation (C.V.) in a pairwise comparison of gynodioecious with each of four hermaphroditic populations for 10 characters showed that populations UCL 529 and UCL 435 were significantly more variable than the hermaphroditic populations of their respective taxa (sign test, $P < 0.01$ and $P < 0.05$, respectively).

The allozyme data also showed greater levels of variability in gynodioecious populations than the mean of other populations within each respective taxon (Table 2). For all three regions, the average number of alleles per locus was consistently higher in the gynodioecious populations. Also, estimates of intra-popula-

Table 2 (continued)

Pgi-2			Got-1					Got-2			Got-3			$Est-1$			Est-2			
100	104	96	100	98		102	88	100	95	105	100	93	107	100	96		100	96	103	
0.97	0.03		1.0					0.94	0.06		0.94	0.06		1.0			0.67	0.33		
0.97		0.03	0.97		0.03	0.01		0.99	0.01		0.99	0.01		1.0				0.98	0.02	
0.95	0.01	0.04	0.88		0.12			0.79	0.15	0.06	0.98	0.02		0.94	0.05	0.01	0.66	0.29	0.05	
0.98		0.02	0.98			0.02		0.99	0.01		0.97	0.03		0.98	0.02		0.60	0.40		
1.0			0.96		0.04			0.92	0.08		1.0			0.92	0.04	0.04	0.46	0.54		
0.96	0.02	0.01	0.97		0.02	0.01		0.98	0.02		0.90	0.04	0.06	0.98	0.02		0.58	0.35	0.02	0.06
0.97	0.01	0.02	0.97			0.03		0.89	0.11		0.97	0.01	0.02	1.0			0.75	0.25		
0.94	0.05	0.01	0.93		0.04	0.02		0.99	0.01	0.01	0.83	0.11	0.05	0.97	0.03		0.74	0.23	0.02	
1.0			0.87		0.10	0.02		1.0			0.93	0.01	0.06	0.98	0.02		0.70	0.30		
1.0							1.0	0.93		0.07	1.0			1.0			0.49	0.51		
Mdh-1			Mdh-2					Acp-2					No. of plants		Frequency of ms in population		H _S		No. of alleles/ locus/	
100	103		100	85	95	97		100	95	90	104								population	
0.97	0.03		0.06	0.94				0.91	0.09				31	$\mathbf{0}$			0.20		1.9	
1.0			0.23	0.74		0.03		0.97	0.02	0.01			38	$\mathbf 0$			0.11		2.1	
0.95	0.05		0.10	0.89	0.01			0.86	0.12	0.02			40		0.20		0.25		2.5	
1.0			0.19	0.81				0.89	0.11				38	0			0.12		1.9	
1.0			0.14	0.86				0.96			0.04		39	0			0.16		1.8	
			0.15	0.80	0.05			0.92	0.06		0.01		455	0			0.14 ± 0.02		1.9	
			0.17	0.74	0.06	0.04		0.90	0.08		0.01		111		0.15		0.020		2.5	
			0.85		0.13	0.02		0.86	0.06				490	0			0.17 ± 0.01		2.2	
			0.99		0.01			0.94	0.06				67		0.12		0.23		2.3	
		1.0						1.0					44	0			0.07 ± 0.02		1.2	

tion diversity (H_s) of the gynodioecious populations were significantly higher than the respective taxon means ($P < 0.05$, t-test). In the Butte region, allozyme markers did not provide diagnostic identification of the potential ancestral races, so the verification of introgression is not yet possible. In the Mendocino region, several loci showed allelic differences between the sympatric species L. d. var. *nivea* and *L. bakeri.* At three of these loci (Pgi-1, Got-3, and Acp-2), the allelic frequencies of the gynodioecious L. d. var. *nivea* populations were intermediate or more similar to those of *L. bakeri.* One locus, Got-l, has alternate alleles present in the sympatric species but the *L. bakeri* allele Got-188 was not detected in the gynodioecious populations. These allozyme data did not provide a rigorous test but appeared consistent with the hybrid origin hypothesis.

Male sterility has been successfully transferred to L. *striata* and all the *L. douglasii* varieties including L. d. var. *sulphurea* and /. d. var. *douglasii* in which no gynodioecious populations are known (Table 3). Backcrosses have been attempted to stabilize the gynodioecy trait in some other varietal backgrounds. The de novo derivation of male sterility through artificial hybridization has not yet been successful as preliminary attempts to hybridize the sympatric species L. d. var. *nivea* and *L. bakeri* did not yield viable progeny, and crosses between different *L. douglasii* varieties produced only hermaphoroditic progeny.

Discussion

We have suggested that gynodioecy in *Limnanthes douglasii* has arisen via hybridization events involving different progenitor taxa. Clearly, all hybridization events do not necessarily result in the production of

Female parent	No. of plants used as female parent ^a	Male parent	No. of viable plants phenotype ^b		
Male sterile					
rosea (529)	5	sulphurea, nivea, douglasii (400, 406, 441)	35 ms		
nivea (435)	3	sulphurea, nivea douglasii striata (400, 406, 404, 441, 117)	57 ms 1H		
F_1 (435 ms \times 400)	$12 \overline{ }$	sulphurea, nivea, rosea (440, 406, 405, 435, 516, 512, 511)	56 ms $1Hc$		
nivea (435)	2	alba, grandiflora (312, 224)	$\mathbf 0$		
Hermaphrodite [®]					
nivea (435)	4	bakeri (144)	Ω		
bakeri (144)	4	nivea (435)	Ω		
nivea (416, 431, 435)	10	nivea, rosea, sulphurea douglasii (406, 435, 529, 441)	52 H		
rosea (529, 511)	24	rosea, nivea, sulphurea douglasii (511, 512, 516, 406, 431, 400, 441)	84 H		

Table 3. Hybridization attempts for (a) the transfer of male-sterility trait among taxa and (b) the production of male-sterility de novo in crosses with hermaphrodites as female parent

Between five and ten flowers per plant were emasculated and used for each cross

Phenotype: ms indicates male sterile plant; H indicates hermaphroditic plant

c Morphological characters indicate that this hermaphroditic individual may be a contaminant

male sterility. There are a minimum of 16 areas where species or varieties have overlapping distribution patterns and congeners lie within a few kilometers of each other. Field observations show that sympatry occurs for five pairs of diagnostically distinct taxa. *Limnanthes d.* var. *nivea* is sympatric with L. d. vat. *douglasii, L. bakeri* and *L. vinculans* in three separate areas and *L. alba* is sympatric with *L. striata* and *L. floccosa,* ssp. *floccosa* in two separate areas. Thus, even with the possible discovery of additional zones of hybridization, only rarely would this yield gynodioecy. Many workers have reported in situ hybridizations, the outcomes of which can be loosely grouped into five categories (some of which may be transitory stages of others). These are: (1) a "swamping out" or loss of immigrant variation via genetic drift or selection causing no long-term evolutionary change in the native population or species (Lewis 1961; Levin 1983); (2) the production of a narrow hybrid zone presumably maintained by continuous hybridization with no introgression (Antonovics etal. 1971; Leslie and Dingle 1983; Millar 1983); (3) maintenance of increased and novel genetic variation (Stebbins and Daly 1961; Baetcke and Alston 1968; Anderson and Gage 1952; Grant 1971); (4) introgression and the development of clines (Mason 1949; Heiser 1949; Endler 1977); and (5) one of several routes toward speciation (Grant 1971; Lewis and Epling 1959; Turner etal. 1980; Goldman etal. 1983). We

have shown evidence in *Lirnnanthes* for outcome (3) in this paper. Other outcomes have also been noted in this genus (Kesseli 1984).

We also postulate that gynodioecy has arisen at least 3 times (a polyphyletic origin) in *L. douglasii. A* single origin is unlikely since cytoplasmic male sterility would not generally be carried along in long distance dispersal events. The rationale somewhat follows Baker's (1967) rule explaining the disadvantage of selfincompatible species in colonizing events. Gynodioecy could not establish from a single seed or even many seeds from a single mother, since only a single plasma type would be transmitted in these situations. Nuclear male sterility could establish but the fitness requirements for this mode of male sterility are much more stringent (Charlesworth and Ganders 1979; Kesseli and Jain 1984a). Gynodioecy is not common on islands (Carlquist 1966; Godley 1979; McComb 1966) while dioecy (nuclear inheritance), which is common, presumably represents a reversion to an outcrossing system from the self-compatible colonizer. Cytoplasmic male sterility may evolve if there are multiple colonization events and hybridizations of closely related taxa leading to a de novo origin.

The geographic distributions and genetic data also show that gynodioecy may be at different stages of evolution in these populations, possibly having existed for the longest time period in the Mendocino area and

the shortest in Butte area. The recent origin in Butte area is suggested by the extant presence of potential progenitors, the very high levels of male sterility (possibly indicating continued hybridization and a nonequilibrium frequency stage) and high average numbers of alleles per locus. The relative antiquity of gynodioecy in Mendocino is primarily suggested by the absence of certain alleles representing a putative progenitor, namely *L. bakeri* (probably indicating many generations of backcrossing and drift) and low average number of alleles per locus. While high heterozygosity levels are difficult to associate with recent hybridizations since male sterility itself enhances heterozygosity levels, the average number of alleles per locus may be a good index of recency since it is less severely affected by the evolutionary changes in mating systems.

Stronger evidence for the hybrid origin of male sterility would require two additional data sets. First, the experimental re-creation of male sterility should be broadly pursued despite the probability of a low success rate. In a study of gynogenesis in hybrid derived fish *Poecilia formosa*, Turner et al. (1980) failed to reproduce gynogenesis in artificial hybrids of the well known ancestral species. They argued that in populations with large intra-population variation the choice of parents could be critical. In addition to our hybridization efforts, Mason (1952) and Ornduff (1971) both attempted with limited success to cross *L. bakeri* with other species. Mason produced no hybrids in crosses with L. d. var. *douglasii* or *L. striata* while Ornduff managed two with *L. striata*. These F₁'s had low pollen fertility (4% and 16%), indicating some male sterility but no further information was provided.

The second line of evidence requires the discovery of genetic markers which specifically distinguish progenitor populations and demonstrate polymorphism in gynodioecious populations. As yet no enzyme markers surveyed have shown this; however, techniques revealing organelle genome variation might be a more appropriate probe. To have cytoplasmic male sterility, gynodioecious populations must have at least two plasma types. Hermaphroditic populations should generally have one unless the plasma types are not incompatible or they have a nuclear fertility restorer in high frequency. This latter situation may indicate the acquisition followed by the loss of male sterility in a population. Since mitochondria are involved in cytoplasmic male sterility in maize (Levings 1983), this would be the logical choice of organelles.

This report has outlined the breadth of this very interesting evolutionary genetic problem dealing with the origin of a novel trait, a recombination product, and an experimental approach to altering breeding systems. Hybridization events in nature provide opportunities for ecological studies of genetics, recombina-

tion, and evolution of novel traits (Gottlieb 1972). The origin of novel sex forms and breeding system variants such as male sterility, autogamy, apomixis, etc. (Levin 1978, for a review) needs greater emphasis in the population dynamic context.

References

- Anderson E, Gage A (1952) Introgressive hybridization in *Phlox bifida.* Am J Bot 39:399-404
- Antonovics J, Bradshaw AD, Turner RG (1971) Heavy metal tolerance in plants. Adv Ecol Res 7:1-85
- Baetcke KP, Alston RE (1968) The composition of a hybridizing population of *Baptisia sphaerocarpa* and *Baptisia leucophaea.* Evolution 22:157-165
- Baker HG (1966) The evolution of floral heteromorphism and gynodioecism in *Silene maritima.* Heredity 21:689-692
- Baker HG (1967) Support for Baker's law as a rule. Evolution 21:853-856
- Carlquist S (1966) The biota of long distance dispersal. IV. Genetic systems in the floras of oceanic islands. Evolution 20:433-455
- Chaplin JF (1964) Use of male sterile tobacco in the production of hybrid seed. Tob Sci 8:105-109
- Charlesworth D, Ganders FR (1979) The population genetics of gynodioecy with cytoplasmic-genic male sterility. Heredity 43:213-218
- Edwardson JR (1970) Cytoplasmic male sterility. Bot Rev 36:341-420
- Endler JA (1977) Geographic variation, speciation and clines. Princeton University Press, Princeton
- Godley EJ (1979) Flower biology in New Zealand. NZ J Bot **17:** 441-466
- Goldman M, LoVerde P, Chrisman C (1983) Hybrid origin of polypoloidy in fresh water snails of the genus *Bulinus* (Mollusca: Planorbidae). Evolution 37: 592-600
- Gottlieb LD (1972) Levels of confidence in the analysis of hybridization in plants. Ann Mo Bot Gard 59:435-446
- Grant V (1971) Plant speciation. Columbia University Press, New York
- Heiser CB (1949) Naturalization with particular reference to introgression. Bot Rev 15:645-687
- Kesseli RV (1984) Biosystematics, evolution and breeding system analyses in *Limnanthes.* PhD Dissertation, University of California, Davis
- Kesseli RV, Jain SK (1984a) An ecological study of gynodioecy in *Limnanthes douglasii* (Limnanthaceae). Am J Bot 71: 775-786
- Kesseli RV, Jain SK (1984b) New variation and biosystematic patterns detected by allozyme and morphological comparisons in *Limnanthes* section Reflexae (Limnanthaceae). Plant Syst Evol 147:133-165
- Kheyr-Pour A (1981) Wide nucleus-cytoplasmic polymorphism for male sterility in *Origanum vulgareL.* J Hered 71: 253-260
- Leslie J, Dingle H (1983) Interspecific hybridization and genetic divergence in milkweed bugs *(Oncopeltus:* Hemiptera). Evolution 37:583-591
- Levin DA (1978) The origin of isolating mechanisms in flowering plants. Evol Biol 11:185-317
- Levin DA (1983) An immigration-hybridization episode in *Phlox.* Evolution 37:575-582
- Levings CS III (1983) Cytoplasmic male sterility. In: Kosuge T, Meredith CP, Hollaender A (eds) Genetic engineering of plants. Plenum Press, New York, pp 81-92
- Lewis H (1961) Experimental sympatic populations of *Clarkia.* Am Nat 95:155-168
- Lewis H, Epling C (1959) *Delphinium gypsophilum,* a diploid species of hybrid origin. Evolution 13:511-525
- Mason CT (1952) A systematic study of the genus *Limnanthes* R. Br. Univ Calif Publ Bot 25:455-512
- Mason HL (1949) Evidence for the genetic submergence of *Pinus remorata.* In: Jepsen GL (ed) Genetics, paleontology and evolution. Princeton University Press, Princeton
- McNeill CI, Jain SK (1983) Genetic differentiation studies and phylogenetic inference in the plant genus *Limnanthes* (Section Inflexae). Theor Appl Genet 66:257-269
- McComb JA (1966) The sex forms of species in the flora of the south west of Western Australia. Aust J Bot 14:303-316
- Meyer JR, Meyer NG (1961) Cytoplasmic male sterility in cotton. Genetics 46:883-890
- Millar C (1983) A steep cline in *Pinus muricata.* Evolution 37: 311-319
- Ornduff R (1971) Systematic studies of Limnanthaceae. Madrono 21:103-111
- Ornduff R, Crovello TJ (1968) Numerical taxonomy of Limnanthaceae. Am J Bot 55:173-182
- Pearson OH (1972) Cytoplasmically inherited male sterility characters and flavor components from the species cross *Brassica nigra* (L.) Koch *X B. oleracea* L. J Am Soc Hortic Sci 97:397-402
- Ross MD (1978) The evolution of gynodioecy and subdioecy. Evolution 32:174-188
- Stebbins GL, Daly K (1961) Changes in the pattern of a hybrid population of Helianthus over an eight-year period. Evolution 15:60-71
- Turner BJ, Brett BH, Miller RR (1980) Interspecific hybridization and the evolutionary origin of a gynogenetic fish, *Poeciliaformosa.* Evolution 34:917-922
- Van Damme JMM, Van Delden W (1982) Gynodioecy in *Plantago lanceolata* L. I. Polymorphism for plasmon type. Heredity 49:303-318