ORIGINAL PAPER

Glyphosate-degrading isolates from environmental samples: occurrence and pathways of degradation

Received: 6 July 1994/Received revision: 19 October 1994/Accepted: 24 October 1994

Abstract The metabolism of the organophosphonate herbicide glyphosate was investigated in 163 environmental bacterial strains, obtained by a variety of isolation strategies from sites with or without prior exposure to the compound. Isolates able to use glyphosate as sole phosphorus source were more common at a treated site, but much less abundant than those capable of using the glyphosate metabolite aminomethylphosphonic acid (AMPA). Nevertheless, all 26 strains found to metabolise the herbicide did so via an initial cleavage of its carbon-phosphorus bond to yield sarcosine; no evidence for its metabolism or co-metabolism to AMPA was obtained.

Introduction

The metabolism of the phosphonate herbicide glyphosate [N-(phosphonomethyl)-glycine] has been extensively investigated both in the environment and under laboratory conditions. Microbial action is responsible for the degradation of the herbicide in the soil (Sprankle et al. 1975) and aminomethylphosphonic acid (AMPA) is the major metabolite detected (Rueppel et al. 1977). AMPA has also been reported to accumulate in industrial reactors degrading glyphosate-containing wastes (Murthy et al. 1989). Here glyphosate is rapidly degraded by a variety of microbial groups in the mixed substrate environment. Microorganisms isolated from such sources were able to transform

R. E. Dick¹ (\boxtimes) • J. P. Quinn

Present address:

glyphosate to AMPA with phosphate present in the growth medium but did not mineralize the compound further in the presence of phosphate (Balthazor and Hallas 1986; Hallas et al. 1988; Jacob et al. 1988; McAuliffe et al. 1990).

Only two organisms in which AMPA has been demonstrated as an intermediate of glyphosate degradation have been isolated from sources other than industrial glyphosate-degrading effluents (Pipke and Amrhein 1988; Lerbs et al. 1990). In contrast, direct cleavage of the $C-P$ bond has been reported as the primary step in glyphosate degradation in diverse environmental and laboratory strains (Kishore and Jacob 1987; Pipke et al. 1987; Weidhase et al. 1990; Liu et al. 1991; Dick 1991). In these microorganisms, and in contrast to those isolated from industrial wastes, phosphate was inhibitory to glyphosate breakdown.

The metabolism of glyphosate has been investigated in few environmental bacteria isolated under non-selective conditions. This study aimed to investigate the occurrence of glyphosate-degrading activity in environmental isolates from populations that had or had not been exposed previously to glyphosate or to other phosphonates. It was anticipated that the strategies used would result in the isolation of representative strains responsible for glyphosate degradation in the environment.

Materials and methods

Source of inocula

Glyphosate-treated and untreated soils were fresh samples from a site described previously (Quinn et al. 1988). Extracts were prepared by shaking 1 g soil in 10 ml 0.85% NaC1 for i h followed by brief centrifugation to remove suspended particles. A sample from the river Rhine was taken at Boppard, Germany, and was stored at 4°C prior to use.

Division of Molecular Biology, School of Biology and Biochemistry, The Queen's University of Belfast, Belfast BT7 INN, N. Ireland

School of Biological Sciences, University of Birmingham, Edgbaston, Birmingham B15 2TT, UK

Media and growth conditions

Phosphate was removed from glassware by soaking in Decon 90 (Decon Laboratories, Hove, England) followed by rinsing in doubledistilled water.

The mineral salts medium was buffered with 50 mM TRIS/HC1 (pH 7.0) and consisted of (l^{-1}) NH₄Cl 5.0 g, MgSO₄ · 7H₂O 0.16 g, $CaCl₂$ 2H₂O 0.08 g, trace elements solution (Krieg 1981) 1.0 ml, ethylenediaminetetraacetic acid ferric sodium salt 0.001 g. The following were added as filter-sterilised solutions after the basal medium had been autoclaved: potassium gluconate 5.0g, sodium pyruvate 5.0 g, vitamin solution (Difco manual, 9th edition, p 251) 1.0 ml, phosphate, glyphosate or AMPA (adjusted to pH 7.0), to the final concentration stated in individual experiments. All incubations were done in a rotary shaker (100 rpm) at 29°C.

Enrichment procedures

Non-enriched microbial populations were obtained by serial dilution of extracts from each soil, subsequently cultured on casein/peptone/starch (CPS) agar (Collins and Willoughby 1962) with a reduced glycerol concentration $(0.2 \text{ ml} 1^{-1})$. Enriched populations resulted from culture in mineral salts medium with either glyphosate (2 mM) or phosphate (2 mM) as the phosphorus source: 50 ml medium in a 250-ml conical flask was inoculated with 0.5 ml extract from either glyphosate-treated or untreated soil. After 5 days incubation, cultures were plated on CPS agar.

"Analogue enrichment": inocula from glyphosate-treated soil or from the river Rhine were added to carbon-free medium $(l^{-1}:NH₄Cl)$ 5.0 g, MgSO₄ $7H_2O$ 0.16 g, CaCl₂ $2H_2O$ 0.08 g, trace elements solution 1.0 ml) or nitrogen-free medium (as carbon-free medium with the omission of $NH₄Cl$ and with the addition of 5.0 g potassium gluconate as carbon source. Five carbon-limited and four nitrogen-limited cultures were set up for each source of inoculum-the following analogues or putative glyphosate-degradation products were added to individual cultures as either C or N sources: acetate, glycolate and glyoxalate, sarcosine and glycine, dimethylglycine, betaine, and glyphosine (N,N-diphosphonomethylglycinc). Each culture contained a total of 5 g1^{-1} analogue(s) in equimolar ratios. Cultures were incubated for 2 weeks prior to the isolation of individual colonies on CPS agar. In each case isolates were chosen as representative of each population from plates that contained 50-100 colonies. Isolated colonies were purified and maintained on CPS agar.

Chemicals

Glyphosate, technical grade, was a gift from ICI Agrochemicals Division, Bracknell, UK, and was purified by recrystallisation from water. Methylphosphonate was supplied by Ventron GmBH, Karlsruhe, Germany. [3-14C] Glyphosate, specific activity 52mCi mmol⁻¹, was purchased from Amersham International PLC., Bucks., UK; $\lceil {}^{14}C \rceil$ methylamine, specific activity 8 mCi mmol⁻¹ was obtained from Sigma Chemical Co., Poole, UK. Other biochemicals were supplied by Sigma. All chemicals were analytical-grade (Analar) reagents and were from BDH, Poole, UK.

Chromatography

Separation of glyphosate and its degradation products was achieved using Sigmacell type 100 cellulose $(250 \,\mu m)$ thickness) thin-layer chromatography plates with the following solvent: ethanol/ water/ammonium hydroxide (17 M)/trichloroacetic acid/acetic acid (15 M) (55:35:2.5:3.5:2, v/v/v/w/v) (Shinabarger and Braymer 1986).

Amine-containing products were visualised with ninhydrin; Amplify (Amersham) was used to enhance the autoradiographic detection of ¹⁴C-labelled compounds. For HPLC analysis, amine residues were derivatised with 9-fluorenylmethoxycarbonyl chloride and were detected at 280 nm using a Hewlett Packard 1090 Chemistation liquid chromatograph.

Autoradiographic detection of bacterial colonies that accumulate radiolahelled glyphosate

Solidifed medium was prepared by the addition of 1.5% Bactoagar (Difco Laboratories Inc., Detroit, Mich., USA) to the mineral-salts base. Filter-sterilised carbon and vitamin sources were added, prewarmed, once the molten agar had cooled to 55°C. The solidified agar was partially dried by incubation of the inverted petri dishes at 45° C for 2-3 h. A 0.5-ml sample of a solution of 0.6 μ Ciml⁻¹ [3-¹⁴C]glyphosate with added unlabelled glyphosate was spread over the surface of the agar and adsorbed giving an approximate total glyphosate concentration of 0.4 mM. The agar was overlaid with sterile nitrocellulose before being streaked with individual bacterial isolates. After colony development, the filter was removed, oven-dried and coated in plastic foil for autoradiography.

Metabolic studies with radiolahelled glyphosate

To confirm the pathway(s) of degradation, cultures growing in mineral salts medium with 2 mM glyphosate as sole source of phosphorus were incubated overnight (18 h) and harvested in early log phase. The cells were washed in fresh phosphate-free mineral salts medium and were resuspended to a cell density of (A_{550}) 1.0 in aliquots of medium containing $1.0 \mu \text{Cim}^{-1}$ ($\approx 18 \mu \text{M}$) [3- $\binom{14}{12}$ glyphosate along with one of the following putative intermediates of glyphosate degradation: sarcosine (0.5 mM), phosphate (0.2 mM), methylamine (0.5 mM), methylphosphonate (0.2 mM) or AMPA (0.2 mM) . Cultures were incubated for 4 h after which time the supernatants were analysed by TLC/autoradiography.

Results

Comparison of soil samples from the glyphosatetreated and untreated sites revealed both qualitative and quantitative differences between the soil microbial populations. The treated soil contained an approximately ten-fold higher population (cfu ml^{-1}) compared with the soil from the untreated site. However, the treated soil had a lower diversity of colony types apparent at the highest dilutions. A total of 32 and 15 distinct colony types were isolated from approximately 100 colonies each from untreated and treated soil respectively (Table 1).

A strategy to screen isolates for the ability to degrade glyphosate initially relied on the autoradiographic detection (Fig. 1) of colonies grown on phosphorus-free mineral-salts/agar containing the radiolabelled herbicide (0.4 mM). However, many strains that accumulated the radiolabel were subsequently unable to use glyphosate in liquid culture, suggesting that these strains transported the herbicide but were unable to degrade it; conversely, a few glyphosate-utilising strains did not accumulate the label. The addition of 0.2 mM

Two isolates able to utilise glyphosate were unable to use AMPA (CPS casein/peptone/starch)

Fig. 1 Autoradiogram of bacterial colonies cultured on phosphatefree mineral-salts/agar in the presence of [3-14C]glyphosate

phosphate to the agar resulted in the failure of all 27 organisms tested to accumulate the radiolabel.

Further investigation of the phosphonate-degrading properties of the isolates required culture in liquid mineral salts medium. Not all isolates grew in this medium with phosphate as P source; those that did were tested for growth with glyphosate or AMPA as sole source of phosphorus (Table 1). Of the 32 isolates from untreated soil, 24 grew readily in mineral salts medium replete with phosphate; of these, none subsequently grew with glyphosate as sole phosphorus source but 6 were able to use AMPA as sole phosphorus source. Of the 15 distinctive strains isolated from glyphosate-treated soil, 14 grew in phosphatereplete medium, and 3 and 6 respectively with glyphosate and AMPA as sources of phosphorus.

Enrichments with glyphosate as the sole source of phosphorus were readily established from both soil types, confirming the presence of herbicide-degrading bacteria in untreated soil. Organisms able to degrade AMPA were readily isolated from untreated soil without prior exposure to glyphosate; however, only enrichment with glyphosate as sole phosphorus source resulted in the isolation of individual strains able to degrade the herbicide. In contrast, glyphosate-degrading strains were amongst those isolated directly from glyphosatetreated soil (without enrichment) and following enrichment in phosphate-replete medium.

Each population resulting from analogue enrichment was dominated by up to 7 colony types. No growth was observed in enrichments with glyphosine as the sole source of carbon. There was no correlation between the analogue(s) used and the number of phosphonate-degrading strains subsequently isolated. Again, strains able to use AMPA as sole source of phosphorus were more frequent among isolates from both glyphosate-treated soil and Rhine water than strains able to grow with glyphosate as phosphorus source (Table 1).

548

Overall, the ability to cleave the $C-P$ bond of AMPA and to use it as a phosphorus source was more widespread than the ability to use glyphosate: of 133 environmental isolates (Table 1) selected under a variety of conditions but all able to grow in mineral-salts medium containing P_i as sole phosphorus source, 31 were able to use only AMPA as the sole source of phosphorus, 24 used both AMPA and glyphosate and 2 used glyphosate as a phosphorus source but were unable to degrade AMPA.

The degradation pathways used by the glyphosatedegrading strains isolated were investigated. HPLC analysis of the supernatants of cultures growing with glyphosate as sole phosphorus source showed no metabolites attributable to glyphosate degradation. No degradation or modification of the herbicide was observed in the presence of phosphate. A parallel study (Dick 1991) with the previously isolated *Pseudomonas* sp. 4ASW (Quinn et al. 1989) and *Arthrobacter atrocyaneus* (Pipke and Amrhein 1988) showed that sarcosine and AMPA, their respective intermediates of glyphosate degradation, could be visualised by the incubation of glyphosate-grown log-phase cells with [3- ¹⁴C]glyphosate and an excess of the degradation product to "trap" the radiolabelled intermediates. This approach resulted here in the trapping of only $\lceil {}^{14}C \rceil$ sarcosine from cultures of all 26 isolates able to use glyphosate as sole P source. Typical results are shown in Fig. 2A. The identity of the degradation product as sarcosine was confirmed by digestion with sarcosine oxidase (Fig. 2B). Thus all 26 environmental isolates were capable of direct cleavage of the $C-P$ bond of glyphosate.

Organisms unable to use glyphosate as sole P source were investigated for metabolism of glyphosate in complete medium in the presence of a limiting concentration of phosphate (0.2 mM). Neither potential intermediates, nor a reduction in the quantity of glyphosate present in the cultures was observed when the culture supernatants were subjected to HPLC analysis. In cultures containing $\lceil {^{14}C} \rceil$ glyphosate, there was no evidence of degradation products or of changes in the intensity or R_F of the $[$ ¹⁴C]-glyphosate spot.

Discussion

Differences observed in the microbial populations isolated from soils sampled at glyphosate-treated and untreated sites were consistent with a proliferation of some microbial groups as a result of the repeated herbicidal treatment. Such differences were also observed by Quinn et al. (1988).

The enrichment of glyphosate-degrading isolates from both soil types confirmed the presence of glyphosate-degrading bacteria in untreated soil, although such strains appeared to be more frequent in

Fig. 2 A Typical TLC/autoradiogram showing the trapping of sarcosine resulting from glyphosate degradation by an environmental bacterial isolate. *Lanes 1-5* contained, as well as [3-14C]glyphosate (18 μ M), respectively no addition, methylamine (0.5 mM), sarcosine (0.5mM), aminomethylphosphonic acid (0.2mM), methylphosphonate (0.2 mM). O origin, G glyphosate, S sarcosine, F solvent front. B Confirmation of the identity of sarcosine by digestion with sarcosine oxidase. *Lane 1* typical culture supernatant treated with sarcosine oxidase. *Lane 2* untreated control. O origin, G glyphosate, S sarcosine, F solvent front

glyphosate-treated soil. The higher frequency of AMPA-degrading isolates in both soil types suggests that the reported transient accumulation of AMPA in glyphosate-treated soils (Torstensson 1985) is unlikely to be due to the absence of a microflora able to degrade the compound.

The failure of some glyphosate-degrading strains to accumulate the radiolabelled herbicide when cultured on agar containing $[3^{-14}C]$ glyphosate is consistent with the observed loss of a high proportion of the phosphonomethyl carbon as $CO₂$ following the cleavage of the C-P bond in *Pseudomonas* sp. PG 2982 (Kishore and Jacob 1987). Also, the failure of all 27 organisms tested to accumulate the radiolabel from agar in the presence of 0.2 mM phosphate highlights the phenomenon of the inhibition of phosphonate transport by inorganic phosphate in environmental isolates in contrast to those from industrial wastes.

Many studies have suggested co-metabolism as a mechanism for the relatively slow rate of microbial degradation of glyphosate observed in the soil (Malik et al. 1989). Any investigation of co-metabolism precludes enrichment for the participating species as, by definition, there is no energetic or nutritional gain from the process (Horvath 1972). The use of structurally related analogues as an alternative enrichment strategy has been termed analogue enrichment and was tried following failure to obtain enrichments with glyphosate as sole carbon or carbon, nitrogen and phosphorus source (Quinn et al. 1988). The analogues used either were possible cleavage products of glyphosate provided as a carbon source, or provided a $C-N$ bond similar to that in the herbicide molecule; organisms isolated on the basis of their ability to utilize such analogues might also be expected to utilize glyphosate.

In addition to the soils tested, a sample of the river Rhine was chosen for the likely exposure of its microflora to agricultural and industrial phosphonate detected as methylphosphonate in samples (Verweij et al. 1979). Despite attempts to enrich for organisms from both soils and Rhine water under conditions of analogue enrichment, where cleavage of the C-P bond was not a factor in the selection, no organisms were able to modify glyphosate in any way, at least under the conditions tested, that might contribute to the co-metabolism of the Compound.

Glyphosate degradation in environmental organisms has been shown in this, and in many previous studies, to be inhibited by phosphate, yet in soil degradation must take place in the presence of phosphate. In axenic culture, this inhibition may be mediated by direct effects of phosphate on glyphosate transport or degradation and/or by the repression of these processes at the level of gene expression. Recent studies on phosphonate metabolism in *Escherichia coli* and *Enterobacter aerogenes* have shown that genes encoding both the transport and degradatory functions in phosphonate metabolism are subject to repression by inorganic phosphate as part of the PHO regulon (Wanner and Metcalf 1992; Lee et al. 1992). In the soil, microbial metabolism in the presence of phosphate but under conditions of nutritional stress may permit a low level of expression and operation of the phosphonate transport and degradatory proteins.

This study, to our knowledge, constitutes the largest investigation to date of glyphosate-degrading bacteria isolated from environmental sources, and underlines the differences in glyphosate degradation between environmental organisms and those from glyphosate-degrading industrial reactors.

Acknowledgements We thank Richard Watkins for HPLC analysis and Dr. David Harper, and Drs. Sarah Rees and Wolfgang Schuch

of ICI Seeds for useful discussions. The financial assistance of ICI Seeds is acknowledged. R.E.D. was in receipt of a CASE studentship from ICI and the Department of Education, N. Ireland.

References

- Balthazor TM, Hallas LE (1986) Glyphosate-degrading microorganisms from industrial activated sludge. Appl Environ Microbiol 51:432-434
- Collins VG, Willoughby LG (1962) The distribution of bacteria and fungal spores in Blelham Tam with particular reference to an experimental overturn. Arch Microbiol 43:294-307
- Dick RE (1991) Microbial degradation of the herbicide glyphosate. PhD Thesis, The Queen's University of Belfast, Belfast, N. Ireland
- Hallas LE, Hahn EN, Korndorfer C (1988) Characterization of microbial traits associated with glyphosate degradation in industrial activated sludge. J Ind Microbiol 3:377-385
- Horvath RS (1972) Microbial co-metabolism and the degradation of organic compounds in nature. Bacteriol Rev 36:146-155
- Jacob GS, Garbow JR, Hallas LE, Kimak NE, Kishore GH, Schaeffer J (1988) Metabolism of glyphosate in *Pseudomonas* sp. strain LBr. Appl Env Microbiol 54:2953-2958
- Kishore GH, Jacob GS (1987) Degradation of glyphosate by *Pseudomonas* sp. PG2982 via a sarcosine intermediate. J Biol Chem 262:12164-12168
- Krieg NR (1981) Enrichment and isolation. In: Gerhardt P (ed) Manual of methods for general bacteriology. ASM, Washington, pp 112-142
- Lee K-S, Metcalf WW, Wanner BL (1992) Evidence for two phosphonate degradative pathways in *Emerobacter aerogenes.* J Bacteriol 174:2501-2510
- Lerbs W, Stock M, Parthier B (1990) Physiological aspects of glyphosate degradation in *Alcaligenes* spec. strain GL. Arch Microbiol 153:146-150
- Liu C-M, McLean PA, Sookdeo CC, Cannon FC (1991) Degradation of the herbicide glyphosate by members of the family *Rhizobiacae.* Appl Environ Microbiol 57:1799-1804
- Malik J, Barry G, Kishore G (1989) The herbicide glyphosate (minireview). Biofactors 2:17-25
- McAuliffe KS, Hallas LE, Kulpa CF (1990) Glyphosate degradation by *Agrobacterium radiobaeter* isolated from activated sludge. J Ind Microbiol 6:219-221
- Murthy DVS, Irvine RL, Hallas LE (1989) Principles of organism selection for the degradation of glyphosate in a sequencing batch reactor. In: Bell JM (ed) 43rd Annual Purdue Industrial Waste Conference. Lewis, Chelsea, Mich
- Pipke R, Amrhein N (1988) Degradation of the phosphonate herbicide glyphosate by *Arthrobacter atrocyaneus* ATCC 13752. Appl Environ Microbiol 54:1293-1296
- Pipke R, Amrhein N, Jacob GS, Schaeffer J, Kishore GM (1987) Metabolism of glyphosate in an *Arthrobacter* sp. GLP-1. Eur J Biochem 165:267-273
- Quinn JP, Peden JMM, Dick RE (1988) Glyphosate tolerance and utilization by the microflora of soils treated with the herbicide. Appl Microbiol Biotechnol 29:511-516
- Quinn JP, Peden JMM, Dick RE (1989) Carbon-phosphorus bond cleavage by gram-positive and gram-negative soil bacteria. Appl Microbiol Biotechnol 31:283-287
- Rueppel ML, Brightwell BB, Schaeffer J, Marvel JT (1977) Metabolism and degradation of glyphosate in soil and water. J Agric Food Chem 25:517-528
- Shinabarger DL, Braymer HD (1986) Glyphosate catabolism by *Pseudomonas* sp. strain PG2982. J Bacteriol 168:702-707
- Sprankle P, Meggitt WF, Penner D (1975) Adsorption, mobility, and microbial degradation of glyphosate in the soil. Weed Sci 23: 229-234
- Torstensson L (1985) Behavior of glyphosate in soils and its degradation. In: Grossbard E, Atkinson D (eds) The herbicide glyphosate. Butterworth, London, pp 137-150
- Verveij A, Boter HL, Dagenhardt CEAM (1979) Chemical warfare agents: verification of compounds containing the phosphorusmethyl linkage in waste water. Science 204:616-618
- Wanner BL, Metcalf WW (1992) Molecular genetic studies of a 10.9 kbp operon in *Escherichia coli* for phosphonate uptake and biodegradation. FEMS Microbiol Lett 100:133-140
- Weidhase R, Albrecht B, Stock M, Weidhase RA (1990) Glyphosatverwertung durch *Pseudomonas* sp. GS. Zentralbl Mikrobiol 145:433-438