

# Chapter 4

## Rice Organelle Genomics: Approaches to Genetic Engineering and Breeding

Tomohiko Kazama, Asuka Nishimura, and Shin-ichi Arimura

**Abstract** Although organelle (mitochondria and plastid) genomes have less than 1% of the genes in the nucleus, they encode essential genes, such as those involved in energy production, respiration, and photosynthesis, and genes that control agronomically important characteristics such as cytoplasmic male sterility. Organelle genomes have high copy numbers in each cell (one to two orders of magnitude greater than in the nucleus) and are characterized by maternal inheritance. To know functions of genes encoded in the organelle genomes or to develop new plants adapted to various severe environments, genetic engineering of organelle genomes is one of the promising approaches. However, modifying the mitochondrial or plastid genomes in rice is presently impossible or difficult. Here, we discuss the characteristic features of these genomes and recent attempts at plastid transformation.

**Keywords** Mitochondria · Plastid · Chloroplast · Organelle genome

### 4.1 Mitochondrial Genomics in Rice

The common function of mitochondria in plants and animals is to act as an energy center to create ATP by oxidative phosphorylation. Despite this similarity, the genome sizes and structures of the mitochondrial genome in plants are quite different from those in animals. The size of the mitochondrial genome ranges

---

Tomohiko Kazama and Asuka Nishimura contributed equally to this work.

T. Kazama

Laboratory of Environmental Plant Biotechnology, Graduate School of Agricultural Science, Tohoku University, Sendai, Japan

e-mail: [tomohiko.kazama.d5@tohoku.ac.jp](mailto:tomohiko.kazama.d5@tohoku.ac.jp)

A. Nishimura · S.-i. Arimura (✉)

Laboratory of Plant Molecular Genetics, Graduate School of Agricultural & Life Science, The University of Tokyo, Tokyo, Japan

e-mail: [asukayn@mail.ecc.u-tokyo.ac.jp](mailto:asukayn@mail.ecc.u-tokyo.ac.jp); [arimura@mail.ecc.u-tokyo.ac.jp](mailto:arimura@mail.ecc.u-tokyo.ac.jp)

from 200 to 11,300 kb in plants, while it is only about 17 kb in mammals, apparently as a result of the loss of many fragments. The large size of plant mitochondrial genome is mostly due to the presences of repeated sequences, noncoding regions, and introns rather than the increased number of genes.

#### **4.1.1 Rice Mitochondrial Genome Sequencing**

In flowering plants, the mitochondrial genome was first sequenced in *Arabidopsis thaliana* (Unsold et al. 1997) and subsequently in the rice *japonica* cultivar Nipponbare (Notsu et al. 2002). The genomes were sequenced by preparing phage clone libraries and restriction maps, followed by sequencing each clone. The rice mitochondrial genome was initially proposed to consist of five basic circular DNAs, with each circle sharing one or two fragments identical to those in other circles (Iwahashi et al. 1992). A master circle was hypothesized to form by homologous recombination between those identical fragments in the five circular DNAs (Iwahashi et al. 1992; Notsu et al. 2002).

So far, the mitochondrial genomes of 14 rice strains including wild rice have been reported (Table 4.1). The sizes of the genomes range from 402 kb (WA-type cytoplasmic male sterility, WA-type CMS) to 638 kb (IR 6888B, a maintainer line of WA-type CMS). The G + C contents of each genome are very similar. Except BT-type CMS, the genomes are hypothesized to have a single master-circle structure. Although the BT-type CMS mitochondrial genome is possible to have the same structure, a Southern blot analysis suggests that it consists of two separate circular molecules (Kazama and Toriyama 2016).

#### **4.1.2 Gene Contents and Genes Associated with Cytoplasmic Male Sterility**

The Nipponbare mitochondrial genome is reported to contain 35 genes for known proteins, 3 ribosomal RNAs, 2 pseudo-ribosomal protein genes, 17 tRNAs, and 5 pseudo-tRNAs (Notsu et al. 2002). Some genes consist of multiple exons that are dispersed throughout the mitochondrial genome and that are trans-spliced to form functional mRNAs (Table 4.2). Although 19 open reading frames (ORFs), which encode over 150 amino acids, have also been predicted, transcriptional products were detected in only 10 of those ORFs (Notsu et al. 2002). The existence of all genes except the predicted ORFs was confirmed in reported rice mitochondrial genome sequences (Tian et al. 2006; Fujii et al. 2010; Bentolila and Stefanov 2012; Zhang et al. 2012; Igarashi et al. 2013; Okazaki et al. 2013; Asaf et al. 2016;

**Table 4.1** A summary of reported rice mitochondrial genome sequence

Accession no.	Strain	Organism	Length (bp)	% GC	References
BA000029	Nipponbare	<i>Oryza sativa japonica</i> group	490,520	43.9	Notsu et al. (2002)
DQ167399	93-11	<i>Oryza sativa indica</i> group	491,515	43.8	Tian et al. (2006)
DQ167400	Nipponbare S	<i>Oryza sativa japonica</i> group	490,669	43.8	Tian et al. (2006)
DQ167807	PA64S	<i>Oryza sativa japonica</i> group	490,673	43.8	Tian et al. (2006)
AP011076	CW-CMS	<i>Oryza rufipogon</i>	559,045	44.0	Fujii et al. (2010)
AP011077	LD-CMS	<i>Oryza sativa indica</i> group	434,735	43.9	Fujii et al. (2010)
JF281153	IR 6888B	<i>Oryza sativa indica</i> group	637,692	43.9	Bentolila and Stefanov (2012)
JF281154	WA-CMS	<i>Oryza sativa indica</i> group	401,567	43.9	Bentolila and Stefanov (2012)
JN861111	Hassawi	<i>Oryza sativa indica</i> group	454,820	43.8	Zhang et al. (2012)
JN861112	IR 1112	<i>Oryza sativa indica</i> group	454,894	43.8	Zhang et al. (2012)
AP012527	RT98-CMS	<i>Oryza rufipogon</i>	525,913	44.2	Igarashi et al. (2013)
AP012528	RT102-CMS	<i>Oryza rufipogon</i>	502,250	44.0	Okazaki et al. (2013)
KU176938	W1340	<i>Oryza minuta</i>	515,022	44.0	Asaf et al. (2016)
AP017385	BT-CMS	<i>Oryza sativa indica</i> group	95,643 <sup>a</sup>	44.0	Kazama and Toriyama (2016)
AP017386	BT-CMS	<i>Oryza sativa indica</i> group	440,134 <sup>b</sup>	43.9	Kazama and Toriyama (2016)

<sup>a</sup>Subgenome 1<sup>b</sup>Subgenome 2

Kazama and Toriyama 2016). The sequence complexity of plant mitochondrial genomes sometimes makes new sequences and ORFs via illegitimate homologous recombination. Expression of such new ORFs sometimes leads to male sterility, called cytoplasmic male sterility (CMS). Several studies have identified CMS-associated genes (or CMS-causative genes) (Iwabuchi et al. 1993; Akagi et al. 1994; Fujii et al. 2010; Bentolila and Stefanov 2012; Okazaki et al. 2013; Igarashi et al. 2013). Previously, CMS-associated genes have been identified by comparisons of gene structures and their expression profiles between CMS-causing and normal mitochondria. In rice, CMS lines are bred by cytoplasmic substitution via repeated backcrossing. In this case, the cytoplasmic donor cultivar carries *restorer of fertility (Rf)* genes in its nuclear genome. This indicates that the

**Table 4.2** Location of homologous fragments of the mitochondrial genes in the nuclear genome

Gene	Function	Location in the nuclear genome				
		Exon1	Exon2	Exon3	Exon4	Exon5
<i>nad1</i>	Complex I	N.D.	chr. 1	chr. 8	chr. 9	chr. 12
<i>nad2</i>	Complex I	chr. 9	chr. 9	chr. 1	chr. 1	chr. 1
<i>nad3</i>	Complex I	chr. 12	–			
<i>nad4</i>	Complex I	chr. 12	chr. 12	chr. 12	chr. 12	–
<i>nad4L</i>	Complex I	N.D.	–			
<i>nad5</i>	Complex I	chr. 12	chr. 12	chr. 12	N.D.	N.D.
<i>nad6</i>	Complex I	chr. 12	–			
<i>nad7</i>	Complex I	chr. 12	chr. 12	chr. 12	chr. 12	chr. 12
<i>nad9</i>	Complex I	chr. 1	–			
<i>cob</i>	Complex III	N.D.	–			
<i>cox 1</i>	Complex IV	chr. 12	–			
<i>cox 2</i>	Complex IV	N.D.	chr. 12	–		
<i>cox 3</i>	Complex IV	N.D.	–			
<i>atp1</i>	Complex V	chr. 9	–			
<i>atp4</i>	Complex V	chr. 12	–			
<i>atp6</i>	Complex V	chr. 1	–			
<i>atp8</i>	Complex V	chr. 12	–			
<i>atp9</i>	Complex V	chr. 12	–			
<i>ccmB</i>	Cytochrome c	chr. 12	–			
<i>ccmC</i>	Cytochrome c	chr. 12	–			
<i>ccmFc</i>	Cytochrome c	chr. 12	N.D.	–		
<i>ccmFn</i>	Cytochrome c	N.D.	–			
<i>mat-r</i>	Transcription	N.D.	–			
<i>rps1</i>	Translation	N.D.	–			
<i>rps2</i>	Translation	chr. 12	–			
<i>rps3</i>	Translation	chr. 12	chr. 12	–		
<i>rps4</i>	Translation	N.D.	–			
<i>rps7</i>	Translation	chr. 12	–			
<i>rps11</i>	Translation	N.D.	–			
<i>rps12</i>	Translation	chr. 12	–			
<i>rps13</i>	Translation	chr. 12	–			
<i>rps14</i>	Translation	chr. 9	–			
<i>rps19</i>	Translation	N.D.	–			
<i>rpl2</i>	Translation	N.D.	N.D.	–		
<i>rpl5</i>	Translation	chr. 9	–			
<i>rpl16</i>	Translation	chr. 12	–			
<i>orfX</i>	Transporter	chr. 12	–			

Sequences existed in nuclear genome entirely are listed

N.D. means full-length sequences are not detected in the nuclear genome

cytoplasmic donor cultivar has both CMS-associated and *Rf* genes; RF suppresses the expression of the CMS-associated gene, and male sterility does not occur. The most common approach to identify CMS-associated genes has mostly relied on Northern blot screening between CMS and fertility restored lines (Hanson and Bentolila 2004).

Recently, it has become more common to use next-generation sequencing to identify CMS-associated genes. Whole mitochondrial genomic sequences of CMS rice were obtained and compared between those of standard cultivars, such as Nipponbare, to screen for new ORFs that are absent from the reference genome (Bentolila and Stefanov 2012; Kazama and Toriyama 2016). Then, CMS-associated gene candidates were selected based on the criteria that they are chimeric in structure with known mitochondrial genes or encode peptide containing a transmembrane domain, because all reported CMS-associated genes have such characteristics. Subsequently, the expressions of candidate genes were checked to determine whether they exhibit different patterns in the presence or absence of *Rf* genes. Expression pattern differences that depend on the presence or absence of *Rf* genes indicate that the expression of CMS-associated genes is the cause of CMS. However, it is presently impossible to modify a plant mitochondrial genome by DNA fragment knock-in and specific ORF knock-out. Thus, there is not yet an absolute proof that a CMS-associated gene is a CMS-causative gene that has not been obtained.

### 4.1.3 Mitochondrial DNA Fragments in the Nuclear Genome

Many DNA fragments identical to mitochondrial DNA have been found in the nuclear genome (Notsu et al. 2002; Bentolila and Stefanov 2012). This kind of nuclear fragment is called “promiscuous” DNA and thought to be translocated from mitochondria through evolutionary processes and/or organelle establishment. In *Arabidopsis*, a 620-kb insertion of a mitochondrial genome sequence was reported on chromosome 2 (Stupar et al. 2001). In rice, fragments representing 60% of the mitochondrial genome were found in the nuclear genome (Bentolila and Stefanov 2012). Interestingly, such promiscuous DNA fragments are unequally distributed among the chromosomes.

To identify which mitochondrial genes exist in the nuclear genome, BLAST search was performed (Table 4.2). In this analysis, genes except tRNAs and the predicted ORFs in the Nipponbare mitochondrial genome were used as queries. Homologous sequences were found for all but 14 mitochondrial genes (Table 4.2) (International Rice Genome Sequencing Project 2005). The similarity between the mitochondrial and nuclear gene sequences was more than 88%. This indicates that almost all of the mitochondrial genes in rice have been translocated into the nuclear genome and that the translocation events of mitochondrial genome could have occurred in relatively recent times.

## 4.2 Chloroplast Genomics in Rice

### 4.2.1 Use of Rice Chloroplast Genomes for Comparative Genomics

Chloroplasts are organelles that are representative of plants; they are the most prominent plastid present in green tissues, and play a crucial role in plants as a metabolic center involving various biochemical processes, including photosynthesis. Chloroplasts possess their own genome, which is generally circular and consists of a large single copy (LSC) region and a small single copy (SSC) region, respectively, that separate two inverted repeat regions (IRs). The chloroplast genome contains three major groups of genes that encode (i) subunits of the photosynthetic complex, (ii) components of the gene expression machinery, and (iii) a few proteins that may function in metabolic pathways and unknown proteins (Shimada and Sugiura 1991). Compared with the mitochondrial genome, the chloroplast genome of land plants has a well-conserved structure, although the gene content, gene order, and fine structural details depend on the species (Jansen et al. 2007; Xu et al. 2015). In the grass family (Poaceae), the chloroplast genome shares some structural arrangements that are different from those of other plant families (Doyle et al. 1992; Katayama and Ogihara 1996; Saski et al. 2007). These include three inversions in the LSC; deletions of *accD*, *ycf1*, and *ycf2*; and loss of introns in *clpP* and *rpoC1* (Katayama and Ogihara 1996; Saski et al. 2007; Daniell et al. 2016).

The rice chloroplast genome was first sequenced in the *Oryza sativa* L. cv. Nipponbare (Hiratsuka et al. 1989); its length was 134,525 bp with 38.99% GC content. The present annotation data ([https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/nuccore/NC\\_001320.1](https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/nuccore/NC_001320.1)) show that the Nipponbare chloroplast genome contains 159 genes, including 108 protein-coding genes, 8 ribosomal RNA genes, 38 transfer RNA genes, and 5 pseudogenes. To date, more than 100 rice chloroplast (plastid) genome sequences, including that of wild rice, are available in the National Center for Biotechnology Information (NCBI) database (<https://www.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/nucleotide/>) because of advances in sequencing technologies.

*Oryza*, which includes 23 species, is divided into 10 nuclear genome types, which include 6 diploids (AA, BB, CC, EE, EF, and GG) and 4 allotetraploids (BBCC, CCDD, HHJJ, and HHKK) (Ge et al. 1999). The AA genome type includes three cultivated rice species (*Oryza sativa* ssp. *japonica* and *O. sativa* ssp. *indica* in Asia and *O. glaberrima* in Africa) and six wild relatives: *O. barthii*, *O. glumaepatula*, *O. longistaminata*, *O. meridionalis*, *O. nivara*, and *O. rufipogon*. The Asian cultivated rice, *O. sativa*, is generally thought to have originated from *O. rufipogon* (Khush 1997; Vaughan et al. 2008; Huang et al. 2012). However, despite numerous studies (Ma and Bennetzen 2004; Vitte et al. 2004; Zhu and Ge 2005; Londo et al. 2006; Molina et al. 2011; Huang et al. 2012; Yang et al. 2012; Civián et al. 2015; Huang and Han 2015), the domestication history remains under debate.

Recent studies of the evolutionary and phylogenetic relationships among the AA genome species based on whole chloroplast genome sequences showed that two subspecies of *O. sativa*, *japonica* and *indica*, had distinct maternal origins (Wambugu et al. 2015; Kim et al. 2015; Tong et al. 2016). It is indicated that the maternal genome of *japonica* has been derived from *O. rufipogon*, whereas the *indica* maternal genome has been originated from *O. nivara*, although the nuclear genomes seem to be of complex origin (Kim et al. 2015). Nuclear genome analyses suggest that the African cultivated rice *O. glaberrima* was domesticated from *O. barthii* (Li et al. 2011b; Wang et al. 2014). Phylogenetic relationships of several chloroplast genomes also indicated that the maternal origin of *O. glaberrima* was *O. barthii* (Wambugu et al. 2015; Kim et al. 2015; Tong et al. 2016). Moreover, chloroplast genome analyses of worldwide rice accessions revealed that South American wild rice, *O. glumaepatula*, has a distinct chloroplast genome (Kim et al. 2015), and *O. rufipogon* contains cytoplasm derived from different geographic regions (Kim et al. 2015; Wambugu et al. 2015). Chloroplast-based phylogenies usually reflect geographic distributions better than nuclear genomes and should be useful for resolving the evolutionary and domestication history of rice. Wild species have disease-resistance and stress-tolerance genes, which make them valuable genetic resources for rice improvement and breeding (Brar and Khush 1997). In recent years, wild species with the EE genome (*O. australiensis*) and BBCC genome (*O. minuta*) chloroplast sequences were also reported (Nock et al. 2011; Waters et al. 2012; Asaf et al. 2017). These chloroplast genome studies will elucidate the detailed genetic relationships among rice species and will be helpful in developing future breeding strategies using new genetic resources. In addition, the accumulated rice chloroplast sequences also provide insight for chloroplast genome engineering to improve chloroplast function such as photosynthetic capacity.

#### 4.2.2 Perspectives on Rice Chloroplast Genome Engineering

In higher plants, the first successful chloroplast transformation was achieved in tobacco by particle bombardment about 30 years ago (Svab et al. 1990). Chloroplast transformation has many advantages over nuclear transformation, including a high level of transgene expression, multigene transformation, site-directed gene integration, absence of gene silencing, and maternal inheritance that prevents transgene flow into the environment. Each plant cell has dozens of chloroplasts, each of which contains multiple genome copies. Thus, gene expression can be ten to a hundred times greater in chloroplast genomes than in nuclear genomes. With this property, plants can be used to make large amounts of foreign proteins, such as pharmaceutical proteins (e.g., vaccine antigens and antibiotics) and industrial enzymes (e.g., hydrolases, redox enzymes, and transferases). Many functional proteins have been expressed in tobacco and lettuce chloroplasts (reviewed in Jin and Daniell 2015;

Daniell et al. 2016), and expression can be as high as 70% of total leaf protein (Ruhlman et al. 2010). Chloroplasts have great potential as bioreactors for commercial production. Now, many therapeutic proteins are in clinical development (Zhang et al. 2017).

Chloroplast transformation has also been used to control agronomic traits, including resistance to insects, diseases, and herbicides, and abiotic stress tolerance of plants (reviewed in Jin and Daniell 2015; Daniell et al. 2016). For example, double-stranded (ds) RNA expressed in chloroplasts was shown to induce RNA interference (RNAi) of target genes in insect hosts (Jin et al. 2015; Zhang et al. 2015), demonstrating a new approach to protecting crops without chemicals.

Chloroplast engineering of metabolic pathways or photosynthetic ability could be used for crop improvement (Maliga and Bock 2011; Hanson et al. 2013; Wani et al. 2015). To manipulate the isoprenoid pathway, seven genes were simultaneously inserted into the chloroplast genome, resulting in the accumulation of high levels of target metabolites (Kumar et al. 2012). Photosynthetic efficiency was also enhanced by replacing the tobacco chloroplast *rbcL* gene with three genes from the cyanobacterium *Synechococcus* (*rbcL*, *rbcS*, and an assembly gene) (Lin et al. 2014).

Despite the remarkable progress in chloroplast transformation technologies, there are still substantial limitations to their use. Successful examples of chloroplast genome engineering have been restricted to only tobacco and a few dicots (Jin and Daniell 2015). Development of fully chloroplast-engineered monocots has not yet been achieved because of the lack of transformation protocols (Bock 2007; Clarke and Daniell 2011; Khan 2012; Rigano et al. 2012). Major obstacles to chloroplast transformation in monocots are thought to be (i) difficulty of tissue culture and regeneration from green tissue and (ii) no effective selection systems for retaining the transformed chloroplasts (plastids) and facilitating the transition from heteroplasmic to homoplasmic state (that is, all chloroplast genomes are replaced with identical transformed chloroplast genomes). Indeed, efficient protocols for tobacco chloroplast transformation were established based on tissue culture systems of green leaf materials using spectinomycin selection with the aminoglycoside 3'-adenyltransferase gene, *aadA*, as a selection maker (Lutz et al. 2007; Verma and Daniell 2007; Scotti and Cardi 2012). Unfortunately, most monocotyledonous plants are endogenously resistant to spectinomycin, because of the point mutations in their targeted *16S rRNA* gene (Fromm et al. 1987). Additionally, regenerable tissue culture materials in monocots are generally nongreen tissues, such as dark-grown embryogenic calli or suspension cells. In nongreen tissues, a small number of plastids exist as undifferentiated plastids called proplastids. Proplastids are about fivefold smaller in size than chloroplasts, and the gene expression levels are lower than those of chloroplasts (Vera and Sugiura 1995; Sakai et al. 1998; Silhavy and Maliga 1998; Daniell et al. 2002; Pyke 2007; Liebers et al. 2017).

Even with these disadvantages, several advancements have been reported in monocotyledonous cereal crops, particularly in rice. Khan and Maliga (1999) were the first to transform rice plastids. They used a fluorescent antibiotic resistance gene, *aadA11gfp*, a fusion gene of the *Aequorea victoria* green fluorescence protein



gene (*gfp*) and *aadA*. They introduced the fusion gene to rice suspension culture cells and selected the transplastomic lines with streptomycin: *aadA* confers resistance to both spectinomycin and streptomycin, and rice cells are sensitive to streptomycin. Twelve shoots regenerated from surviving cells on streptomycin-containing medium from 25 bombarded plates. The plastid transformation was proven by PCR detection of the transgene, but the GFP fluorescence was only observed in a few populations of highly heteroplasmic cells, including wild-type and transgenic chloroplasts. Despite this success, the authors did not indicate inheritance of the transgene or the fertility of the transplastomic plants. Subsequently, Lee et al. (2006) again attempted to introduce *gfp* and *aadA* by using streptomycin selection with the conventional rice cell culture with mature seed-derived calli. They successfully produced fertile transplastomic rice plants and demonstrated transmission of both transgenes to the progeny. However, the transformation efficiency was quite low, with two transgenic lines out of approximately 4000 calli on 100–120 bombarded plates; and all transplastomic lines still have been in heteroplasmic state.

A different selection approach using PPT (L-phosphinotricin), the active ingredient of the herbicide Basta, and the resistance gene *bar* was also attempted for rice plastid transformation (Li et al. 2009). Although the transformation efficiency was not clear, six transplastomic plants were obtained with various heteroplasmic levels, and maternal transmission of *bar* was suggested based on crossing experiments (Li et al. 2009). More recently, Li et al. (2016a, b) tried other selection strategy using a rice-specific chloroplast transformation vector with hygromycin-resistance cassette that contains the hygromycin phosphotransferase gene *hpt*. The antibiotic hygromycin B blocks protein biosynthesis in both prokaryotic and eukaryotic cells (Gonzalez et al. 1978), and hygromycin selection was widely used for nuclear transformation in rice (Hiei and Komari 2008). Fertile transplastomic plants were obtained, and transgene inheritance in progeny was demonstrated. However, only a few transformation events occurred in these experiments (24 surviving plants with approximately 20,000 total calli), and the number of transformed plastids was very small, probably because of weak selection pressure (Li et al. 2016b).

A possible reason for the lower transformation efficiencies observed in nontobacco species is reduced activity of plastid homologous recombination (Sikdar et al. 1998). Assuming this was the case, the application of transcription activator-like effector nucleases (TALENs) was tested in rice plastid transformation (Li et al. 2016a). TALENs are a powerful tool for targeted genome modification (Bogdanove and Voytas 2011). They induce genomic double-strand breaks (DSBs) for gene insertion and thus greatly stimulate the homologous recombination DNA-repair pathway (Wyman and Kanaar 2006). To improve the insertion efficiency of exogenous DNA fragments into the rice plastid genome by homologous recombination, Li et al. (2016a) conducted co-transformation of the TALEN vector and plastid transformation vector into rice calli by particle bombardment. As a result of preliminarily PCR analyses of  $T_0$  plants, the transformation efficiency

(detection frequency of transgene fragments) of co-transformation (0.35%) was much higher than that of transformation with a single vector (0.11%).

In summary, despite the interest in chloroplast transformation of rice, it has not yet been successful. Issues to be solved include (i) choice of target tissues for gene introduction, (ii) activation of homologous recombination, and (iii) development of efficient selection methods. The candidate target tissues (plastids) include nongreen tissue (proplastids) and green tissue (chloroplasts). As mentioned above, calli, a nongreen tissue used in conventional tissue culture systems, contain small proplastids with low introduction efficiency and low levels of gene expression. In contrast, green tissue contains large chloroplasts that are thought to have high efficiency and high levels of gene expression. However, no culture system capable of regenerating green tissues has yet been established in rice. In maize, a leaf-based culture system has been constructed (Ahmadabadi et al. 2007). We attempted a similar culture method using rice seedlings, and confirmed that it can be used to culture (unpublished data). We are now testing this green tissue to see if it can be used for chloroplast transformation of rice.

The selection methods, for transplastomic rice plastids, streptomycin-*aadA*, PPT-*bar*, and hygromycin-*hpt*, all failed to achieve homoplasmy, which indicates that these selection methods are not suitable for rice plastid transformation. In dicots, a few alternative selection systems have recently been developed for plastid transformation (Barone et al. 2009; Li et al. 2011a; Bellucci et al. 2015; Dunne et al. 2014; Yu et al. 2017). The selection methods for dicots and other novel selection methods need to be tested for transforming rice plastids.

Furthermore, because of their low plastid transformation efficiency, monocots, including rice, seem refractory to integration of foreign genes into the plastid genome. Perhaps monocots have specific biological mechanisms to prevent it. At present, many aspects of monocot plastid biology remain unclear. Elucidation of the molecular mechanisms of plastid genome maintenance will be indispensable for establishing methods for plastid transformation in rice.

**Acknowledgments** This work is supported by grants, PRESTO-Sakigake from the Japanese Science and Technology Agency (JPMJPR12B2 to SA) and Kakenhi from the Japanese society for the promotion of Science (16H06182 to TK and 16K14827 to SA).

## References

- Ahmadabadi M, Ruf S, Bock R (2007) A leaf-based regeneration and transformation system for maize (*Zea mays* L.) *Transgenic Res* 16:437–448. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11248-006-9046-y>
- Akagi H, Sakamoto M, Shinjyo C, Shimada H, Fujimura T (1994) A unique sequence located downstream from the rice mitochondrial *atp6* may cause male sterility. *Curr Genet* 25 (1):52–58
- Asaf S, Khan AL, Khan AR, Waqas M, Kang SM, Khan MA, Shahzad R, Seo CW, Shin JH, Lee JJ (2016) Mitochondrial genome analysis of wild rice (*Oryza minuta*) and its comparison with other related species. *Plos One* 11(4):e0152937. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0152937>

- Asaf S, Waqas M, Khan AL, Khan MA, Kang S-M, Imran QM, Shahzad R, Bilal S, Yun B-W, Lee I-J (2017) The complete chloroplast genome of wild Rice (*Oryza minuta*) and its comparison to related species. *Front Plant Sci* 8:1–15. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpls.2017.00304>
- Barone P, Zhang XH, Widholm JM (2009) Tobacco plastid transformation using the feedback-insensitive anthranilate synthase [??]-subunit of tobacco (ASA2) as a new selectable marker. *J Exp Bot* 60:3195–3202. <https://doi.org/10.1093/jxb/erp160>
- Bellucci M, De Marchis F, Ferradini N, Pompa A, Veronesi F, Rosellini D (2015) A mutant *Synechococcus* gene encoding glutamate 1-semialdehyde aminotransferase confers gabaculine resistance when expressed in tobacco plastids. *Plant Cell Rep* 34:2127–2136. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00299-015-1856-z>
- Bentolila S, Stefanov S (2012) A reevaluation of rice mitochondrial evolution based on the complete sequence of male-fertile and male-sterile mitochondrial genomes. *Plant Physiol* 158(2):996–1017. <https://doi.org/10.1104/pp.111.190231>
- Bock R (2007) Towards plastid transformation in maize. *News Rep* 6:2–5
- Bogdanove AJ, Voytas DF (2011) TAL effectors: customizable proteins for DNA targeting. *Science* 333:1843–1846. <https://doi.org/10.1126/science.1204094>
- Brar DS, Khush GS (1997) Alien introgression in rice. *Plant Mol Biol* 35:35–47. <https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1005825519998>
- Civián P, Craig H, Cox CJ, Brown TA (2015) Three geographically separate domestications of Asian rice. *Nat Plants* 1:15164. <https://doi.org/10.1038/nplants.2015.164>
- Clarke JL, Daniell H (2011) Plastid biotechnology for crop production: present status and future perspectives. *Plant Mol Biol* 76:211–220. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11103-011-9767-z>
- Daniell H, Khan MS, Allison L (2002) Milestones in chloroplast genetic engineering: an environmentally friendly era in biotechnology. *Trends Plant Sci* 7:84–91. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S1360-1385\(01\)02193-8](https://doi.org/10.1016/S1360-1385(01)02193-8)
- Daniell H, Lin C-S, Yu M, Chang W-J (2016) Chloroplast genomes: diversity, evolution, and applications in genetic engineering. *Genome Biol* 17:134. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s13059-016-1004-2>
- Doyle JJ, Davis JI, Soreng RJ, Garvin D, Anderson MJ (1992) Chloroplast DNA inversions and the origin of the grass family (Poaceae). *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 89:7722–7726. <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.89.16.7722>
- Dunne A, Maple-Grødem J, Gargano D, Haslam RP, Napier JA, Chua NH, Russell R, Møller SG (2014) Modifying fatty acid profiles through a new cytokinin-based plastid transformation system. *Plant J* 80:1131–1138. <https://doi.org/10.1111/tpj.12684>
- Fromm H, Edelman M, Aviv D, Galun E (1987) The molecular basis for rRNA-dependent spectinomycin resistance in *Nicotiana* chloroplasts. *EMBO J* 6:3233–3237
- Fujii S, Kazama T, Yamada M, Toriyama K (2010) Discovery of global genomic re-organization based on comparison of two newly sequenced rice mitochondrial genomes with cytoplasmic male sterility-related genes. *BMC Genomics* 11:209. <https://doi.org/10.1186/1471-2164-11-209>
- Ge S, Sang T, Lu BR, Hong DY (1999) Phylogeny of rice genomes with emphasis on origins of allotetraploid species. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 96:14400–14405. <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.96.25.14400>
- Gonzalez A, Jimenez A, Vazquez D, Davies JE, Schindler D (1978) Studies on the mode of action of hygromycin B, an inhibitor of translocation in eukaryotes. *Biochim Biophys Acta* 521:459–469
- Hanson MR, Bentolila S (2004) Interactions of mitochondrial and nuclear genes that affect male gametophyte development. *Plant Cell* 16(Suppl):S154–S169. <https://doi.org/10.1105/tpc.015966>
- Hanson MR, Gray BN, Ahner BA (2013) Chloroplast transformation for engineering of photosynthesis. *J Exp Bot* 64:731–742

- Hiei Y, Komari T (2008) *Agrobacterium*-mediated transformation of rice using immature embryos or calli induced from mature seed. *Nat Protoc* 3:824–834. <https://doi.org/10.1038/nprot.2008.46>
- Hiratsuka J, Shimada H, Whittier R, Ishibashi T, Sakamoto M, Mori M, Kondo C, Honji Y, Sun CR, Meng BY, Li YQ, Kanno A, Nishizawa Y, Hirai A, Shinozaki K, Sugiura M (1989) The complete sequence of the rice (*Oryza sativa*) chloroplast genome: intermolecular recombination between distinct tRNA genes accounts for a major plastid DNA inversion during the evolution of the cereals. *MGG Mol Gen Genet* 217:185–194. <https://doi.org/10.1007/BF02464880>
- Huang X, Han B (2015) Rice domestication occurred through single origin and multiple introgressions. *Nat Plants* 2:15207. <https://doi.org/10.1038/nplants.2015.207>
- Huang X, Kurata N, Wei X, Wang Z-X, Wang A, Zhao Q, Zhao Y, Liu K, Lu H, Li W, Guo Y, Lu Y, Zhou C, Fan D, Weng Q, Zhu C, Huang T, Zhang L, Wang Y, Feng L, Furuumi H, Kubo T, Miyabayashi T, Yuan X, Xu Q, Dong G, Zhan Q, Li C, Fujiyama A, Toyoda A, Lu T, Feng Q, Qian Q, Li J, Han B (2012) A map of rice genome variation reveals the origin of cultivated rice. *Nature* 490:497–501. <https://doi.org/10.1038/nature11532>
- Igarashi K, Kazama T, Motomura K, Toriyama K (2013) Whole genomic sequencing of RT98 mitochondria derived from *Oryza rufipogon* and northern blot analysis to uncover a cytoplasmic male sterility-associated gene. *Plant Cell Physiol* 54(2):237–243. <https://doi.org/10.1093/pcp/pcs177>
- International Rice Genome Sequencing P (2005) The map-based sequence of the rice genome. *Nature* 436(7052):793–800. <https://doi.org/10.1038/nature03895>
- Iwabuchi M, Kyoizuka J, Shimamoto K (1993) Processing followed by complete editing of an altered mitochondrial atp6 RNA restores fertility of cytoplasmic male sterile rice. *EMBO J* 12(4):1437–1446
- Iwahashi M, Nakazono M, Kanno A, Sugino K, Ishibashi T, Hirai A (1992) Genetic and physical maps and a clone bank of mitochondrial DNA from rice. *Theor Appl Genet* 84(3-4):275–279. <https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00229482>
- Jansen RK, Cai Z, Raubeson LA, Daniell H, Depamphilis CW, Leebens-Mack J, Müller KF, Guisinger-Bellian M, Haberle RC, Hansen AK, Chumley TW, Lee S-B, Peery R, McNeal JR, Kuehl JV, Boore JL (2007) Analysis of 81 genes from 64 plastid genomes resolves relationships in angiosperms and identifies genome-scale evolutionary patterns. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 104:19369–19374. <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0709121104>
- Jin S, Daniell H (2015) The engineered chloroplast genome just got smarter. *Trends Plant Sci* 20:622–640. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.tplants.2015.07.004>
- Jin S, Singh ND, Li L, Zhang X, Daniell H (2015) Engineered chloroplast dsRNA silences cytochrome p450 monooxygenase, V-ATPase and chitin synthase genes in the insect gut and disrupts *Helicoverpa armigera* larval development and pupation. *Plant Biotechnol J* 13:435–446. <https://doi.org/10.1111/pbi.12355>
- Katayama H, Ogihara Y (1996) Phylogenetic affinities of the grasses to other monocots as revealed by molecular analysis of chloroplast DNA. *Curr Genet* 29:572–581. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s002940050087>
- Kazama T, Toriyama K (2016) Whole mitochondrial genome sequencing and re-examination of a cytoplasmic male sterility-associated gene in Boro-Taichung-type cytoplasmic male sterile Rice. *PLoS One* 11(7):e0159379. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0159379>
- Khan MS (2012) Plastid genome engineering in plants: present status and future trends. *Mol Plant Breed* 3:91–102. <https://doi.org/10.5376/mpb.2012.03.0009>
- Khan MS, Maliga P (1999) Fluorescent antibiotic resistance marker for tracking plastid transformation in higher plants. *Nat Biotechnol* 17:910–915. <https://doi.org/10.1038/12907>
- Khush GS (1997) Origin, dispersal, cultivation and variation of rice. *Plant Mol Biol* 35:25–34. <https://doi.org/10.1023/A:1005810616885>
- Kim K, Lee S-C, Lee J, Yu Y, Yang K, Choi B-S, Koh H-J, Waminal NE, Choi H-I, Kim N-H, Jang W, Park H-S, Lee J, Lee HO, Joh HJ, Lee HJ, Park JY, Perumal S, Jayakodi M, Lee YS,

- Kim B, Copetti D, Kim S, Kim S, Lim K-B, Kim Y-D, Lee J, Cho K-S, Park B-S, Wing RA, Yang T-J (2015) Complete chloroplast and ribosomal sequences for 30 accessions elucidate evolution of *Oryza* AA genome species. *Sci Rep* 5:15655. <https://doi.org/10.1038/srep15655>
- Kumar S, Hahn FM, Baidoo E, Kahlon TS, Wood DF, McMahan CM, Cornish K, Keasling JD, Daniell H, Whalen MC (2012) Remodeling the isoprenoid pathway in tobacco by expressing the cytoplasmic mevalonate pathway in chloroplasts. *Metab Eng* 14:19–28. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ymben.2011.11.005>
- Lee SM, Kang K, Chung H, Yoo SH, Xu XM, Lee S-B, Cheong J-J, Daniell H, Kim M (2006) Plastid transformation in the monocotyledonous cereal crop, rice (*Oryza sativa*) and transmission of transgenes to their progeny. *Mol Cell* 21:401–410. doi: 987 [pii]
- Li Y, Sun B, Su N, Meng X, Zhang Z, Shen G (2009) Establishment of a gene expression system in rice chloroplast and obtainment of PPT-resistant rice plants. *Agric Sci China* 8:643–651. [https://doi.org/10.1016/S1671-2927\(08\)60259-X](https://doi.org/10.1016/S1671-2927(08)60259-X)
- Li W, Ruf S, Bock R (2011a) Chloramphenicol acetyltransferase as selectable marker for plastid transformation. *Plant Mol Biol* 76:443–451. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s11103-010-9678-4>
- Li ZM, Zheng XM, Ge S (2011b) Genetic diversity and domestication history of African rice (*Oryza glaberrima*) as inferred from multiple gene sequences. *Theor Appl Genet* 123:21–31. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00122-011-1563-2>
- Li D, Tang N, Fang Z, Xia Y, Cao M (2016a) Co-transfer of TALENs construct targeted for chloroplast genome and chloroplast transformation vector into rice using particle bombardment. *J Nanosci Nanotechnol* 16:12194–12201. <https://doi.org/10.1166/jnn.2016.12949>
- Li D, Tang N, Liu M, Shen C, Hu Y, Xia Y, Cao M (2016b) Using hygromycin phosphotransferase and enhanced green fluorescent protein genes for tracking plastid transformation in Rice (*Oryza sativa* L.) via gold particle bombardment. *Nanosci Nanotechnol Lett* 8:409–417. <https://doi.org/10.1166/nml.2016.2153>
- Liebers M, Grübler B, Chevalier F, Lerbs-Mache S, Merendino L, Blanvillain R, Pfannschmidt T (2017) Regulatory shifts in plastid transcription play a key role in morphological conversions of plastids during plant development. *Front Plant Sci* 8:23. <https://doi.org/10.3389/fpls.2017.00023>
- Lin MT, Occhialini A, Andralojc PJ, Parry MAJ, Hanson MR (2014) A faster Rubisco with potential to increase photosynthesis in crops. *Nature* 513:547–550. <https://doi.org/10.1038/nature13776>
- Londo JP, Chiang Y-C, Hung K, Chiang T, Schaal BA (2006) Phylogeography of Asian wild rice, *Oryza rufipogon*, reveals multiple independent domestications of cultivated rice, *Oryza sativa*. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 103:9578–9583. <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0603152103>
- Lutz KA, Azhagiri AK, Tungsuchat-Huang T, Maliga P (2007) A guide to choosing vectors for transformation of the plastid genome of higher plants. *Plant Physiol* 145:1201–1210. <https://doi.org/10.1104/pp.107.106963>
- Ma J, Bennetzen JL (2004) Rapid recent growth and divergence of rice nuclear genomes. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 101:12404–12410. <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.0403715101>
- Maliga P, Bock R (2011) Plastid biotechnology: food, fuel, and medicine for the 21st century. *Plant Physiol* 155:1501–1510. <https://doi.org/10.1104/pp.110.170969>
- Molina J, Sikora M, Garud N, Flowers JM, Rubinstein S, Reynolds A, Huang P, Jackson S, Schaal BA, Bustamante CD, Boyko AR, Purugganan MD (2011) Molecular evidence for a single evolutionary origin of domesticated rice. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 108:8351–8356. <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.1104686108>
- Nock CJ, Waters DLE, Edwards MA, Bowen SG, Rice N, Cordeiro GM, Henry RJ (2011) Chloroplast genome sequences from total DNA for plant identification. *Plant Biotechnol J* 9:328–333. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1467-7652.2010.00558.x>
- Notsu Y, Masood S, Nishikawa T, Kubo N, Akiduki G, Nakazono M, Hirai A, Kadowaki K (2002) The complete sequence of the rice (*Oryza sativa* L.) mitochondrial genome: frequent DNA sequence acquisition and loss during the evolution of flowering plants. *Mol Gen Genomics* 268 (4):434–445. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00438-002-0767-1>

- Okazaki M, Kazama T, Murata H, Motomura K, Toriyama K (2013) Whole mitochondrial genome sequencing and transcriptional analysis to uncover an RT102-type cytoplasmic male sterility-associated candidate gene derived from *Oryza rufipogon*. *Plant Cell Physiol* 54(9):1560–1568. <https://doi.org/10.1093/pcp/pct102>
- Pyke K (2007) Plastid biogenesis and differentiation. In: Bock R (ed) *Cell and molecular biology of plastids*. Springer, Berlin, pp 1–28
- Rigano MM, Scotti N, Cardi T (2012) Unsolved problems in plastid transformation © 2012 Landes Bioscience. © 2012 Landes Bioscience. Do not distribute. 1–5
- Ruhlman T, Verma D, Samson N, Daniell H (2010) The role of heterologous chloroplast sequence elements in transgene integration and expression. *Plant Physiol* 152:2088–2104. <https://doi.org/10.1104/pp.109.152017>
- Sakai A, Suzuki T, Miyazawa Y, Kawano S, Nagata T, Kuroiwa T (1998) Comparative analysis of plastid gene expression in tobacco chloroplasts and proplastids: relationship between transcription and transcript accumulation. *Plant Cell Physiol* 39:581–589. <https://doi.org/10.1093/oxfordjournals.pcp.a029408>
- Saski C, Lee SB, Fjellheim S, Guda C, Jansen RK, Luo H, Tomkins J, Rognli OA, Daniell H, Clarke JL (2007) Complete chloroplast genome sequences of *Hordeum vulgare*, *Sorghum bicolor* and *Agrostis stolonifera*, and comparative analyses with other grass genomes. *Theor Appl Genet* 115:571–590. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00122-007-0567-4>
- Scotti N, Cardi T (2012) Plastid transformation as an expression tool for plant-derived biopharmaceuticals. In: Dunwell JM, Wetten AC (eds) *Transgenic plants: methods and protocols, methods in molecular biology*. Humana Press, Totowa, pp 451–466
- Shimada H, Sugiura M (1991) Fine-structural features of the chloroplast genome – comparison of the sequenced chloroplast genomes. *Nucleic Acids Res* 19:983–995. <https://doi.org/10.1093/nar/19.5.983>
- Sikdar SR, Serino G, Chaudhuri S, Maliga P (1998) Plastid transformation in *Arabidopsis thaliana*. *Plant Cell Rep* 18:20–24. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s002990050525>
- Silhavy D, Maliga P (1998) Plastid promoter utilization in a rice embryogenic cell culture. *Curr Genet* 34:67–70. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s002940050367>
- Stupar RM, Lilly JW, Town CD, Cheng Z, Kaul S, Buell CR, Jiang J (2001) Complex mtDNA constitutes an approximate 620-kb insertion on *Arabidopsis thaliana* chromosome 2: implication of potential sequencing errors caused by large-unit repeats. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 98(9):5099–5103. <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.091110398>
- Svab Z, Hajdukiewicz P, Maliga P (1990) Stable transformation of plastids in higher plants. *Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A* 87:8526–8530. <https://doi.org/10.1073/pnas.87.21.8526>
- Tian X, Zheng J, Hu S, Yu J (2006) The rice mitochondrial genomes and their variations. *Plant Physiol* 140(2):401–410. <https://doi.org/10.1104/pp.105.070060>
- Tong W, Kim T-S, Park Y-J (2016) Rice chloroplast genome variation architecture and phylogenetic dissection in diverse *Oryza* species assessed by whole-genome resequencing. *Rice (N Y)* 9:57. <https://doi.org/10.1186/s12284-016-0129-y>
- Unsel M, Marienfeld JR, Brandt P, Brennicke A (1997) The mitochondrial genome of *Arabidopsis thaliana* contains 57 genes in 366,924 nucleotides. *Nat Genet* 15(1):57–61. <https://doi.org/10.1038/ng0197-57>
- Vaughan DA, Lu BR, Tomooka N (2008) The evolving story of rice evolution. *Plant Sci* 174:394–408. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.plantsci.2008.01.016>
- Vera A, Sugiura M (1995) Chloroplast rRNA transcription from structurally different tandem promoters: an additional novel-type promoter. *Curr Genet* 27:280–284. <https://doi.org/10.1007/BF00326161>
- Verma D, Daniell H (2007) Chloroplast vector systems for biotechnology applications. *Plant Physiol* 145:1129–1143. <https://doi.org/10.1104/pp.107.106690>
- Vitte C, Ishii T, Lamy F, Brar D, Panaud O (2004) Genomic paleontology provides evidence for two distinct origins of Asian rice (*Oryza sativa* L.) *Mol Gen Genomics* 272:504–511. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s00438-004-1069-6>

- Wambugu PW, Brozynska M, Furtado A, Waters DL, Henry RJ (2015) Relationships of wild and domesticated rices (*Oryza* AA genome species) based upon whole chloroplast genome sequences. *Sci Rep* 5:13957. <https://doi.org/10.1038/srep13957>
- Wang M, Yu Y, Haberer G, Marri PR, Fan C, Goicoechea JL, Zuccolo A, Song X, Kudrna D, Ammiraju JSS, Cossu RM, Maldonado C, Chen J, Lee S, Sisneros N, de Baynast K, Golser W, Wissotski M, Kim W, Sanchez P, Ndjioudjop M-N, Sanni K, Long M, Carney J, Panaud O, Wicker T, Machado CA, Chen M, Mayer KFX, Rounsley S, Wing RA (2014) The genome sequence of African rice (*Oryza glaberrima*) and evidence for independent domestication. *Nat Genet* 46:982–988. <https://doi.org/10.1038/ng.3044>
- Wani SH, Sah SK, Sági L, Solymosi K (2015) Transplastomic plants for innovations in agriculture. A review. *Agron Sustain Dev* 35:1391–1430. <https://doi.org/10.1007/s13593-015-0310-5>
- Waters DLE, Nock CJ, Ishikawa R, Rice N, Henry RJ (2012) Chloroplast genome sequence confirms distinctness of Australian and Asian wild rice. *Ecol Evol* 2:211–217. <https://doi.org/10.1002/ece3.66>
- Wyman C, Kanaar R (2006) DNA double-strand break repair: all's well that ends well. *Annu Rev Genet* 40:363–383. <https://doi.org/10.1146/annurev.genet.40.110405.090451>
- Xu JH, Liu Q, Hu W, Wang T, Xue Q, Messing J (2015) Dynamics of chloroplast genomes in green plants. *Genomics* 106:221–231. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.ygeno.2015.07.004>
- Yang CC, Kawahara Y, Mizuno H, Wu J, Matsumoto T, Itoh T (2012) Independent domestication of Asian rice followed by gene flow from japonica to indica. *Mol Biol Evol* 29:1471–1479. <https://doi.org/10.1093/molbev/msr315>
- Yu Q, Lutz KA, Maliga P (2017) Efficient plastid transformation in arabidopsis. *Plant Physiol* 175(1):186–193
- Zhang TW, Hu SN, Zhang GY, Pan LL, Zhang XW, Al-Mssallem IS, Yu J (2012) The organelle genomes of hassawi rice (*Oryza sativa* L.) and its hybrid in Saudi Arabia: genome variation, rearrangement, and origins. *Plos One* 7(7):e42041. <https://doi.org/10.1371/journal.pone.0042041>
- Zhang J, Khan SA, Hasse C, Ruf S, Heckel DG, Bock R (2015) Full crop protection from an insect pest by expression of long double-stranded RNAs in plastids. *Science* 347:991. LP-994
- Zhang B, Shanmugaraj B, Daniell H (2017) Expression and functional evaluation of biopharmaceuticals made in plant chloroplasts. *Curr Opin Chem Biol* 38:17–23. <https://doi.org/10.1016/j.cbpa.2017.02.007>
- Zhu Q, Ge S (2005) Phylogenetic relationships among A-genome species of the genus *Oryza* revealed by intron sequences of four nuclear genes. *New Phytol* 167:249–265. <https://doi.org/10.1111/j.1469-8137.2005.01406.x>