# **Conservation Genetics and Phylogeography of the Threatened Corsican and Barbary Red Deer** *(Cervus elaphus corsicanus*  **and** *C. e. barbarus)*

#### **Frank E. Zachos, Ghaiet M. Hajji, and San S. Hmwe**

**Abstract** The two red deer subspecies *C. e. corsicanus* (Corsican red deer, endemic to the Tyrrhenian islands of Sardinia and Corsica) and *C. e. barbarus* (Barbary red deer, presently confined to a small area along the Tunisian-Algerian border) are classified by the IUCN as "Endangered" and "Lower risk (near threatened)", respectively (until recently, the Barbary red deer's status was "Vulnerable"). Both subspecies underwent severe bottlenecks in the twentieth century. We review our results on genetic variability and differentiation in these two subspecies at polymorphic microsatellite loci and sequences of the mitochondrial control region and discuss their bearing on conservation and phylogeography. Our analyses yielded very low genetic variability for *C. e. corsicanus*. The Barbary red deer also showed low variability values in a European comparison, but diversity was not as low as might have been feared in the light of the population's history. Analyses of molecular variance, assignment tests and factorial correspondence analysis did not yield any signs of differentiation among the Tunisian subgroups studied, whereas there was clear evidence of a differentiation between the Sardinian and the Corsican red deer population. The phylogeographic analysis showed close relationships between *C. e. corsicanus* and autochthonous Italian deer at two unlinked sets of nuclear loci, suggesting as the most likely scenario an introduction of Italian mainland red deer to the Tyrrhenian islands, from where animals were probably translocated to North-Africa.

F.E. Zachos $(\boxtimes)$ 

G.M. Hajji

U. R. de Biologie Animale et Systématique Évolutive, Département de Biologie, El Manar, Tunisia e-mail: gayahajji@hotmail.com

S.S. Hmwe

Three Quarter Kamayut Township Yangon University, (92) Khyne Shwe War Street (Baho Road), Post Office Yangon, Myanmar e-mail: sansan.hmwe@gmail.com

Zoological Institute, Christian-Albrechts-University, Olshausenstrasse 40, D-24118 Kiel, Germany e-mail: fzachos@zoologie.uni-kiel.de

## **1 Introduction**

The red deer (*Cervus elaphus*) is not an endangered species as a whole. Two genetically and morphologically distinct Western-Palearctic populations, however, are listed by the World Conservation Union as "Endangered" (*C. e. corsicanus*, the Tyrrhenian or Corsican red deer) and "Lower Risk" (near threatened) (*C. e. barbarus*, the North-African Barbary red deer). In the present review, we shall give a summary on our work on these two subspecies with regard to (1) genetic variability and differentiation of subpopulations and (2) the phylogeographic origin of the Tyrrhenian red deer and its relationship to the Barbary red deer.

## **2 Conservation Genetics**

#### *2.1 Barbary Red Deer*

Apart from recent introductions, the Barbary red deer (*C. e. barbarus* Bennett, 1833) is the only African deer taxon. The historical range of this deer covered large parts of Algeria, Tunisia and possibly Morocco, but at present the Barbary deer is restricted to a small area of cork oak and pine forest on the Tunisian-Algerian border (Fig. [1\)](#page-2-0) – a concentration which makes it particularly susceptible to diseases and forest fires, which are not uncommon in the region (Kock and Schomber [1961;](#page-11-0) Cowan and Holloway [1973;](#page-10-0) Dolan [1988](#page-11-1); Oumani [2006\).](#page-12-0) The Barbary red deer is listed in Appendix III by CITES (a recent proposal to list it in Appendix I was rejected in June 2007), and its IUCN status has recently been changed from "Vulnerable" to "Lower Risk (near threatened)" (Wemmer [1998](#page-12-1); IUCN Red List 2007). Barbary red deer are characterised by a simplified antler structure (frequent lack of the bez tine) and by white spots running in longitudinal lines (Dolan [1988;](#page-11-1) Geist [1998\).](#page-11-2) They suffered a severe bottleneck with only seven specimens left in Tunisia in 1962, two of them in Ain Baccouch and five in Ain Seraouia (Van Dijk [1972\)](#page-12-2), which, however, were augmented by animals from Algeria crossing the border (Dolan [1988;](#page-11-1) Wemmer [1998\).](#page-12-1) Consequently, hunting was banned, and in 1966, a reserve of 417 hectares with 17 individuals was established at El Feidja, about 190 km Southwest of Tunis, from where the deer can emigrate freely (Direction Générale des Forêts – hereafter abbreviated as DGF – 1994). This reserve is located within the El Feidja National Park, which also includes an additional enclosure for the Barbary deer. Subsequently, an area of ca. 200 km along the Mediterranean in Northern Tunisia was colonised (Meyer [1972;](#page-12-3) Dolan [1988\).](#page-11-1)

Apart from Algerian immigrants, the El Feidja population is the origin of all Barbary deer present in Tunisia. Between 1978 and 1996, several reintroductions of this species into different reserves, mainly Ain Baccouch (Tabarka) and Mhebès (Séjnane), were carried out (DGF [1994\).](#page-10-1) Population size at El Feidja seems to have been about 100 individuals since 1972 (Van Dijk [1972;](#page-12-2) Dhouib [1998](#page-10-2); Oumani [2006\)](#page-12-0).

<span id="page-2-0"></span>

**Fig. 1** Distribution of the Barbary red deer in Tunisia (*shaded area*) and location of sample sites. Figure taken from Hajji et al. [\(2007\)](#page-11-3)

For Mhebès, Oumani recorded 80 individuals in 2002 and a similar number (70) in 2006 (Oumani [2006\).](#page-12-0) The present number of deer at Mhebès is rather low compared with the number of founders (39 individuals) in 1979 (DGF [1994\).](#page-10-1) The fact that neither of the two reserve populations (El Feidja and Mhebès) has increased is explained by Oumani [\(2006\)](#page-12-0) with the dispersal of the deer from the reserve areas into adjacent habitats. Sadly, poaching is still also an important factor in limiting the population growth of the Barbary deer in Tunisia.

The total population size of *C. e. barbarus* in Tunisia was estimated by Oumani (pers. comm. 2006) to be about 800 individuals. This is in clear contrast to the census results obtained by the DGF according to which there are 2,000 deer in Tunisia (DGF [1994](#page-10-1); see also Dolan [1988](#page-11-1) who gives the same number). In addition to protection through government programmes, the WWF, in the context of the Regional Euro-Mediterranean Programme for the Environment (SMAP), is coordinating a project at El Feidja and Mhebès including studies on the population size and ecology of the deer in Northwestern Tunisia and the establishment of a deer enclosure at Mhebès. These conservation measures, however, are still sometimes thwarted by the government as was shown by the sale of 10 red deer from an enclosure in El Feidja in 2007 to a prince who wanted them for his private zoo in Morocco. In addition to these 10 animals, many more panicked during the capturing, jumped over the enclosure's fence and have not returned since.

Apart from the inclusion of some African samples in phylogenetic or phylogeographic studies (Polziehn and Strobeck [2002;](#page-12-4) Ludt et al. [2004;](#page-11-4) Hajji et al. [2008\)](#page-11-5) there has only been one genetic study of Barbary red deer. Hajji et al. [\(2007\)](#page-11-3) analysed 30 Tunisian Barbary red deer from El Feidja (*n*=12), Ain Baccouch (*n*=8) and Mhebès  $(n=10)$ . Samples were collected in the field (faeces) or came from skin and hair of captured or accidentally killed or injured deer.

A stretch of 680 bp of the mitochondrial control region was successfully amplified and sequenced in 20 individuals. Amplification of 13 polymorphic microsatellites was successful in 19 red deer, a subset of 8 loci was amplified in all 30 individuals. Two distinct haplotypes were found differing by 16 transitions and being distributed evenly among the 20 specimens, occurring 11 and 9 times, respectively. This resulted in a low or intermediate haplotype diversity but in a rather high nucleotide diversity (Table [1\)](#page-4-0), which is typical of populations having undergone a transient bottleneck where many haplotypes from the polymorphic original gene pool are lost through drift and those remaining are usually not closely related to one another (Nei et al. [1975\)](#page-12-5).

The microsatellite loci analysed did not show any significant signs of linkage disequilibrium. Neither did tests for distortion of our results through stutter bands, large allele dropout or null alleles. Observed and expected heterozygosity values were 0.46 and 0.78, respectively, allelic diversity was 5.60 (Table [1\)](#page-4-0).

A statistical test for a signature of the bottleneck in the microsatellite data (based on heterozygosity values relative to those expected under mutation-drift equilibrium and implemented in the Bottleneck software by Cornuet and Luikart [1996\)](#page-10-3) was highly significant  $(p=0.00018)$ .

We particularly tested our three sample sites El Feidja, Ain Baccouch and Mhebès for signs of (incipient) differentiation by calculating overall and pairwise  $F_{ST}$  and  $R_{ST}$  values (the latter being a microsatellite-specific analogue of  $F_{ST}$ ) and by carrying out assignment tests in which individuals are assigned to the population of which their genotype is most typical. Additionally, a factorial correspondence analysis (FCA) was also conducted to see if this approach would yield any clusters of individuals related to their geographical origin. Positive signs of differentiation were not found in any of these calculations in that none of the  $F_{ST}$  or  $R_{ST}$  values were significantly different from zero; the assignment tests showed very high error rates (about 60%, which is not much lower than expected under random assignment to three populations); and there were no clusters of individuals in the FCA (not shown).

In Ain Baccouch, only one of the two haplotypes was found, but this is probably an artefact of the small sample size (control region amplification was successful in seven animals from Ain Baccouch) and may not be interpreted as evidence of differentiation. Consequently, the Tunisian red deer can still be considered a single, genetically homogeneous population.

The genetic data clearly reflect the population's bottleneck and show low genetic diversity for both mitochondrial control region sequences and nuclear microsatellite loci. However, compared to other populations known to be bottlenecked and/or inbred (e.g., Hasselbusch, Mesola or Corsica/Sardinia), variability values were not

Population	$H_{o}$	$H_E^-$	AD	HD	$\pi$ [%]
Tunisia	0.46	0.78	5.6	0.529	1.266
Sardinia	0.48	0.66		0.872	0.473
Corsica	0.54	0.64			
Mesola	0.51	0.62		$\theta$	$\Omega$
Hasselbusch	0.58	0.66	4.9	0.493	0.337
Val di Susa	0.75	0.85	8.0	0.591	0.733
Tarvis	0.76	0.81		0.750	0.650
Southern Spain	0.65	0.80		0.652	1.318
Bulgaria	0.74	0.85		0.667	0.986
Romania	0.54	0.88		0.500	0.644
Spain	0.66	0.78	7.5		
Scotland	0.44	0.81		0.478	0.536

<span id="page-4-0"></span>**Table 1** Genetic variability at microsatellite loci and the mitochondrial control region in the Tunisian and European red deer populations

 $H<sub>o</sub>$  and  $H<sub>n</sub>$ : observed and expected heterozygosity, AD allelic diversity (only given when sample size was comparable, i.e. between 16 and 22), HD haplotype diversity,  $\pi$ : nucleotide diversity. Mesola, Val di Susa and Tarvis are on the Italian mainland. The values for Corsica are from Hajji et al. [2008.](#page-11-5) Hasselbusch is a strongly inbred and isolated population in Northern Germany (see Zachos et al. [2007](#page-12-6) for details). The data for Sardinia and Mesola are from Hmwe et al. [\(2006a\)](#page-11-6), those for Val di Susa, Tarvis, Southern Spain and Bulgaria from Zachos et al. [\(2003\)](#page-12-7), and the Spanish, Romanian and Scottish values are taken from Martinez et al. [\(2002\),](#page-11-7) Feulner et al. [\(2004\)](#page-11-8) and Hmwe et al. [\(2006b\)](#page-11-9). For details of calculations see Hajji et al. [\(2007\)](#page-11-3)

as low as might have been expected in the light of the population's demographic history (Table [1,](#page-4-0) Hmwe et al. [2006a\).](#page-11-6) This may be due partly to immigration of Algerian animals. The Algerian population is estimated to have been about 300– 400 head in the early 1950s before the Algerian war for independence and 400–600 in the mid-1970s (Salez [1959;](#page-12-8) Kock and Schomber [1961;](#page-11-0) Wemmer [1998;](#page-12-1) for an estimate on population density in Algeria cf. Burthey et al. [1992\).](#page-10-4) The total Algerian population was estimated to be approximately 2,000 in the late 1980s (Dolan [1988\)](#page-11-1) but since the official number for Tunisia is dubious, the same might also hold for Algeria.

Conservation measures should concentrate on the reduction of poaching, which still plays a major role in the mortality rates of Barbary red deer. At the moment, efforts are being made by the WWF to strengthen anti-poaching legislation. In addition, the distribution range of the Barbary red deer should be further extended to reduce its susceptibility to environmental stochasticity such as forest fires and diseases.

The analysis of Hajji et al. [\(2007\)](#page-11-3) and ongoing field studies in Tunisia have yielded valuable data on *C. e. barbarus* but information about these deer outside Tunisia is much needed. There are still rumours of Barbary red deer having survived in Morocco. This sounds unlikely but should be investigated nonetheless. The most important future steps, however, must concentrate on Algeria. The population size in Algeria and the number of migrants between Algeria and Tunisia need to be known. An assessment of the genetic variability in Algerian red deer and whether they are differentiated from the Tunisian population or not are pre-requisites of an effective bilateral management which must be the ultimate goal in the conservation of these last African red deer. Fortunately, plans for such bilateral protection measures are under way at present.

### *2.2 Tyrrhenian or Corsican Red Deer*

The Corsican red deer (*C. e. corsicanus* Erxleben, 1777) is the smallest of the existing red deer (Dolan [1988\)](#page-11-1). It is confined to the Tyrrhenian islands Corsica and Sardinia and classified as "Endangered" by the IUCN (Wemmer [1998](#page-12-1); IUCN Red List 2007). In the second half of the twentieth century, it underwent a severe bottleneck with only 100–200 animals remaining (Krumbiegel [1982;](#page-11-10) Dolan [1988](#page-11-1); Kidjo et al. [2007](#page-11-11) and references therein), but has recovered well since so that recently it has been suggested that the Tyrrhenian red deer be downgraded to "near threatened" in the IUCN Red List (Kidjo et al. [2007\)](#page-11-11). Present numbers are given as at least 2,700 head by Lovari et al. [\(2007\),](#page-11-12) but in line with Banwell [\(1998\)](#page-10-5), who gives an estimate of only 1,500 specimens, another recent figure is "slightly >1,000" (Kidjo et al. [2007\)](#page-11-11). After its extinction around 1970, the Corsican population was re-founded with altogether 14 Sardinian animals (of which one male died shortly after its introduction) between 1985 and 1994 (Dolan [1988](#page-11-1); Gonzalez and Kidjo [2002](#page-11-13); Kidjo et al. [2007\).](#page-11-11) The introduced deer were at first kept in enclosures, but since 1998 there have been repeated releases into the wild so that in 2004, there were about 200 free-ranging animals on Corsica and another 50 in enclosures (see Kidjo et al. [2007](#page-11-11) who give a detailed report on the extirpation and reintroduction history of the red deer on Corsica).

The first assessment of genetic variability based on five microsatellite loci and 332 bp of the mitochondrial control region yielded very low variability values for 17 Sardinian red deer in a European comparison (Zachos et al. [2003\)](#page-12-7). A more recent study, based on a larger sample size of 29 Sardinian red deer and an extended panel of 12 microsatellite loci as well as a larger fraction of the mitochondrial control region (531 bp) confirmed these results (Hmwe et al. [2006a](#page-11-6), see values in Table [1](#page-4-0)). Microsatellite variability was nearly as low as for Mesola, a relict population of truly autochthonous Italian mainland red deer which mark the lower end of genetic diversity in European-type red deer. The comparatively high number of eight haplotypes found (defined by seven polymorphic sites) may be a consequence of more than one colonisation of or introduction to the island. Only a few females would be enough to have caused this mitochondrial pattern without significantly increasing nuclear genetic variability. We have recently analysed a panel of eight further microsatellite loci, which show the same picture with respect to variability (Hajji et al. [2008\),](#page-11-5) but also included 10 red deer from Corsica in our analysis. Genetic variability of the Corsican animals was still a little lower than that for Sardinia (observed and expected heterozygosity and allelic richness were 0.54, 0.64 and 3.50 for Corsica and 0.53, 0.71 and 4.40 for Sardinia), but the differences were

<span id="page-6-0"></span>

**Fig. 2** Bayesian structure analysis of Corsican (1) and Sardinian (2) red deer with the STRUCTURE software (Pritchard et al. [2000\)](#page-12-12). All Corsican animals were assigned to one cluster (*dark grey*) with high probabilities, whereas all but six Sardinian deer were assigned to a second cluster (*light grey*) with similarly high probabilities. When the data were tested for  $K=3$  clusters (which yielded a higher overall probability but is not shown), only two of these six Sardinian specimens were grouped with the Corsican red deer, while the other 21 Sardinian red deer were assigned to two "non-Corsican" clusters

not significant. Interestingly, however, signs of considerable differentiation were found between the Corsican red deer and their population of origin on Sardinia. Pairwise  $F_{ST}$  for these two populations was about 15% and significantly different from zero, and the number of loci not in Hardy-Weinberg-Equilibrium due to an excess of homozygotes increased considerably (from two and zero in the single populations to five in the pooled data set), which is indicative of a Wahlund effect, i.e. a reduction in homozygosity relative to Hardy-Weinberg expectations due to substructuring of the total population. Further, assignment tests assigned more than 90% of the Corsican and Sardinian animals to their correct population of origin, and a Bayesian structure analysis without a priori assumptions of geographical origin also yielded distinct clusters roughly equivalent to the two islands (Fig. [2\)](#page-6-0). Finally, a tree based on genetic distances among all individual red deer from Corsica and Sardinia also showed a non-random pattern in that one of the two main branches comprised exclusively Sardinian animals while the other comprised pre-dominantly Corsican deer (not shown).

## **3 Phylogeography of the Corsican Red Deer**

The origin of the Corsican red deer has been a matter of considerable debate (reviewed in Vigne [1988](#page-12-9) and Zachos and Hartl [2006\)](#page-12-10). The two main questions are: (1) where did it come from and (2) how did it reach the Tyrrhenian islands – naturally during a glacial regression of the sea-level or through human introduction? The latter hypothesis was already put forward at the end of the nineteenth century (Lydekker [1898\),](#page-11-14) and Groves (pers. comm. to Geist [1998\)](#page-11-2) thought that the Tyrrhenian red deer were introduced from North-Africa by the Phoenicians. It has recently been shown that hares (*Lepus* sp.) were introduced to Sardinia from Africa (Scandura et al. [2007\),](#page-12-11) so this might also hold for red deer. In line with this,

Ludt et al. [\(2004\)](#page-11-4) and Skog et al. [\(2009\)](#page-12-13) found close relationships between Sardinian and Barbary red deer based on sequences of mitochondrial DNA (cytochrome b and control region; see also Sommer et al. [2008](#page-12-14) for a review on red deer phylogeography). Flerov (1952) regarded the Corsican red deer to be closely related to the Barbary red deer and the Spanish subspecies *C. e. hispanicus*, and Zachos et al. [\(2003\)](#page-12-7) and Hmwe et al. [\(2006a\)](#page-11-6) found close similarities at the mitochondrial control region between Sardinian and Spanish red deer. This was, however, not corroborated in more comprehensive studies (Ludt et al. [2004;](#page-11-4) Skog et al. [\(2009\).](#page-12-13) An early genetic hypothesis based on mitochondrial RFLP markers linked *C. e. corsicanus* with Bulgaria and the Near East (Hartl et al. [1995\)](#page-11-15) but none of the subsequent analyses yielded further evidence in favour of this assumption.

The only other genetically substantiated hypothesis as to the origin of the Tyrrhenian red deer is based on nuclear microsatellite loci. Zachos et al. [\(2003\)](#page-12-7) and Hmwe et al. [\(2006a\)](#page-11-6) found close relationships between Sardinian and European mainland red deer, in particular those from the Mesola wood in the Po delta (the relationship of mitochondrial control region sequences derived from Sardinian and Mesola red deer was ambiguous). The Mesola population is important from a phylogeographic point of view as it is the only surviving, truly autochthonous red deer population in the Italian peninsula, thus very probably at least partially representing the original Italian gene pool (Mattioli [1990\).](#page-11-16) This hypothesis matches with morphological analyses which showed close similarities between Holocene red deer from Southern Italy and samples from the extinct original Corsican red deer population (Vigne [1988\)](#page-12-9). According to this hypothesis red deer either naturally colonised the Tyrrhenian islands from the Italian mainland during a glacial period in the Pleistocene when the sea-level was considerably lower (for details see Hmwe et al. [2006a\)](#page-11-6) or were introduced to Sardinia and Corsica by man. Putative Pleistocene red deer fossils are known from Corsica (*C. e. rossii*, Pereira [2001\)](#page-12-15), but the extant Tyrrhenian red deer can hardly be considered a descendant of these early deer because, in spite of a very well-analysed fossil record, no red deer were found between the early Holocene (ca. 11500 cal. BP) and the mid-Holocene ( 5000 cal. BP or later) (Vigne et al. [1997](#page-12-16); Vigne [1999](#page-12-17); Costa et al. [2003\).](#page-10-6) Sites from the Late Neolithic ( 4500 cal. BP) in Sardinia and from Classical Antiquity in Corsica, however, have frequently yielded red deer bones (Fonzo [1987;](#page-11-17) Vigne [1988\)](#page-12-9). This is clearly indicative of human introduction after the indigenous deer populations had become extinct (Vigne [1992,](#page-12-18) [1999;](#page-12-17) Schüle [1993](#page-12-19); Masseti [1998,](#page-11-18) [2002a\)](#page-11-19). The Corsican population, possibly much younger than the Sardinian one, could have been founded with introduced animals from Sardinia or directly from the Italian mainland. Such introduction events were not uncommon at the time, and deer are known to have been introduced to many islands as early as the eleventh millennium BP (Vigne [1993;](#page-12-20) Masseti [1996,](#page-11-20) [2002a,](#page-11-19)[b\).](#page-11-21)

To shed further light on this issue, red deer from Corsica and Sardinia together with a selective sample of numerous European-type red deer were analysed for the first time, among them both Mesola and North-Africa (Hajji et al. [2008;](#page-11-5) see Fig. [3](#page-8-0)).

The study, based on eight nuclear microsatellite loci, yielded close relationships of *C. e. corsicanus* to red deer from both Mesola and North-Africa, as reflected, for

<span id="page-8-0"></span>

**Fig. 3** Geographical location of sample sites studied in a phylogeographic analysis by Hajji et al. [\(2008\).](#page-11-5) 1: Scotland (*C. e. scoticus*, *n* = 9), 2: France (*C. e. hippelaphus*, *n* = 14), 3: Southern Spain (*C. e. hispanicus*, *n* = 21), 4: Tunisia (*C. e. barbarus*, *n* = 30), 5: Sardinia (*C. e. corsicanus*, *n* = 23), 6: Corsica (*C. e. corsicanus*, *n* = 10), 7: Mesola (*C. e. hippelaphus*, *n* = 25), 8: Romanian Carpathians (*C. e. montanus*, *n* = 17). The arrow denotes the most probable direction of introductions

example, by the fact that more than 50% of all alleles found in Mesola and Tunisia, respectively, were alleles also recorded in the Tyrrhenian red deer. However, the analyses favoured Mesola as the closest relative of the Tyrrhenian red deer. This was evident from allele frequencies and distributions at single loci, from different parameters of genetic distance and from the resulting trees (see Fig. [4\)](#page-9-0). Nei's standard distances (Nei [1972\)](#page-12-21), chord distances (Cavalli-Sforza and Edwards [1967\)](#page-10-7) and proportion-of-shared-alleles distances (Bowcock et al. [1994](#page-10-8), calculated as 1-Dps) between *C. e. corsicanus* and Mesola were 0.745, 0.117 and 0.585, while the respective values between *C. e. corsicanus* and Tunisia were 1.015, 0.126 and 0.640. Assignment tests did not yield misassignments of *C. e. corsicanus* specimens except for the individuals incorrectly assigned between Sardinia and Corsica (see above).

Rather unexpectedly, the study also yielded a quite close genetic proximity between *C. e. corsicanus* and the French red deer population. This may be due to introductions from France to the Tyrrhenian islands (which cannot be totally ruled out, although there are no records confirming this) or, more probably, due to the limited number of loci (eight) used in the analyses and/or length homoplasy.

<span id="page-9-0"></span>

**Fig. 4** Neighbour-joining tree based on pairwise chord distances derived from allele frequencies at eight nuclear microsatellite loci. Numbers at nodes refer to support from 1,000 bootstrap replicates. Figure modified from Hajji et al. [\(2008\)](#page-11-5)

Perhaps the emerging picture would have been clearer had the animals been genotyped for more loci. This would also explain the rather low bootstrap support for nodes in our trees. Null alleles, stutter bands and allelic dropout, potential error sources known to be able to distort analyses based on microsatellites, were tested for with the MICRO-CHECKER software (van Oosterhout et al. [2004\)](#page-12-22) and could be shown not to have influenced the data (see Hajji et al. [2008](#page-11-5) for details).

In general, however, the results are in accordance with a priori expectations. They confirm those of Hmwe et al. [\(2006a\)](#page-11-6) in that Mesola turned out to be the probably closest extant relative of the Tyrrhenian red deer. The recent study (Hajji et al. [2008\)](#page-11-5) was based on eight completely different and unlinked nuclear loci, which further adds to the credibility of the main conclusion.

Nevertheless, although not as unequivocal as with mitochondrial sequence data, nuclear genetic analyses also confirmed a close relationship of Tyrrhenian and Barbary red deer. It is still unclear if there are true *Cervus* fossils in the Late Pleistocene of North-Africa (Cheylan [1991\),](#page-10-9) and it is considered more probable that the modern Barbary red deer go back to introductions by humans in Holocene times (Kowalski and Rzebik-Kowalska [1991\)](#page-11-22), although Hamilton [\(1978\)](#page-11-23) thought that the Barbary red deer reached Africa via Sicily. Putting together both the palaeontological and the genetic results, it seems very likely that the Tyrrhenian red deer were introduced to Corsica and Sardinia from mainland Italy and that these deer were subsequently translocated to North-Africa (Fig. [3,](#page-8-0) see also Dobson [1998\).](#page-10-10) This

would neatly explain the seeming contradiction between nuclear and mitochondrial genetic data. The fact that the Mesola red deer do not show a mitochondrial haplotype unequivocally linked with those of the Tyrrhenian and the Barbary red deer is probably the result of drift in the small, long-time isolated and bottlenecked Mesola population. Effective population size is four times smaller for the mitochondrial than for the nuclear gene pool, which is why drift has a fourfold smaller effect on (nuclear) microsatellite allele frequencies than on control region sequences.

Apart from presenting a very probable solution to the debate about the origin of the Tyrrhenian red deer and its relative relationships with mainland Italian and African Barbary red deer, the study of Hajji et al. [\(2008\)](#page-11-5) also highlights the need for taking into consideration all available sources – palaeontological, archaeozoological and genetic, and it is also a corroboration of previous studies, which warned against the exclusive use of mitochondrial DNA in phylogeographic analyses (e.g., Taberlet et al. [1998\).](#page-12-23)

## **References**

- <span id="page-10-5"></span>Banwell B (1998) Description of *Cervus elaphus corsicanus*. IUCN Deer Specialist Group Newsletter 14:9
- <span id="page-10-8"></span>Bowcock AM, Ruiz-Linares A, Tomfohrde J, Minch E, Kidd JR, Cavalli-Sforza LL (1994) High resolution human evolutionary trees with polymorphic microsatellites. Nature 368:455–457
- <span id="page-10-4"></span>Burthey F, Burthey A, Sennaoui F, Bensefia N (1992) The *Cervus elaphus barbarus* (Benett, 1833) in Algeria. Status and first elements of eco-ethology. Results and prospects after three years of investigation. In: Spitz F, Janeau G, Gonzalez G, Aulagnier S (eds) Ongulés/Ungulates 91. S. F. E. P. M. – I. R. G. M, Paris Toulouse, pp 271–276
- <span id="page-10-7"></span>Cavalli-Sforza LL, Edwards AWF (1967) Phylogenetic analysis: models and estimation procedures. Am J Hum Genet 19:233–257
- <span id="page-10-9"></span>Cheylan M (1991) Patterns of pleistocene turnover, current distribution and speciation among mediterranean mammals. In: Groves RH, Di Castri F (eds) Biogeography of mediterranean invasions. Cambridge University Press, Cambridge
- <span id="page-10-3"></span>Cornuet JM, Luikart G (1996) Description and power analysis of two tests for detecting recent population bottlenecks from allele frequency data. Genetics 144:2001–2014
- <span id="page-10-6"></span>Costa L, Vigne J-D, Bocherens H, Desse-Berset N, Heintz C, de Lanfranchi F, Magdeleine J, Ruas M-P, Thiébault S, Tozzo C (2003) Early settlement on Tyrrhenian islands (8th millennium cal. BC): mesolithic adaptation to local resources in Corsica and Northern Sardinia. In: Larsson L, Kindgre H, Knutsson K, Loeffler D, Åkerlund A (eds) Mesolithic on the mour. Oxbow Books, Oxford, pp 3–10
- <span id="page-10-0"></span>Cowan I McT, Holloway CW (1973) Threatened deer of the world: conservation status. Biol Conserv 5:243–250
- <span id="page-10-2"></span>Dhouib S (1998) Contribution à l'étude du cerf de Barbarie (*Cervus elaphus barbarus* Bennet, 1833), espèce préservée du parc national d'El Feidja: régime alimentaire et recensement de la population. Mémoire de DEA Fac Sci Bizerte
- <span id="page-10-1"></span>Direction Générale des Forêts (1994). Gestion de la Faune Sauvage et des Parcs Nationaux en Tunisie. Réintroduction, Gestion et Aménagement. Direction Générale des Forêts, Ministère de l'Agriculture, tunis
- <span id="page-10-10"></span>Dobson M (1998) Mammal distributions in the Western Mediterranean: the role of human intervention. Mammal Rev 28:77–88
- <span id="page-11-1"></span>Dolan JM (1988) A deer of many lands – a guide to the subspecies of the red deer *Cervus elaphus* L. Zoonooz LXII(10):4–34
- <span id="page-11-8"></span>Feulner PGD, Bielfeldt W, Zachos FE, Bradvarovic J, Eckert I, Hartl GB (2004) Mitochondrial DNA and microsatellite analyses of the genetic status of the presumed subspecies *Cervus elaphus montanus* (Carpathian red deer). Heredity 93:299–306
- Flerov CC (1952) Musk deer and deer. In: Fauna of the USSR. Mammals, vol. 1,2. Academy of Sciences, Moscow
- <span id="page-11-17"></span>Fonzo O (1987) Reperti faunistici in Marmilla e Campidano nell'Età del Bronzo e nella prima Età del Ferro. La Sardegna nel Mediterraneo tra il secondo et il primo millennio a.C. Amministrazione Provinciale, Cagliari
- <span id="page-11-2"></span>Geist V (1998) Deer of the world. Their evolution, behavior, and ecology. Stackpole Books, Mechanicsburg, PA
- <span id="page-11-13"></span>Gonzalez G, Kidjo N (2002) A research project on conservation biology of Corsican red deer (*Cervus e. corsicanus*). IUCN Deer Specialist Group Newsletter 17:1–3
- <span id="page-11-5"></span>Hajji GM, Charfi-Cheikrouha F, Lorenzini R, Vigne J-D, Hartl GB, Zachos FE (2008) Phylogeography and founder effect of the endangered corsican red deer (*Cervus elaphus corsicanus*). Biodivers Conserv 17:659–673
- <span id="page-11-3"></span>Hajji GM, Zachos FE, Charfi-Cheikrouha F, Hartl GB (2007) Conservation genetics of the imperilled barbary red deer in Tunisia. Anim Conserv 10:229–235
- <span id="page-11-23"></span>Hamilton WR (1978) Cervidae and paleomerycidae. In: Maglio VJ, Cooke HBS (eds) Evolution of African mammals. Harvard University Press, Cambridge, MA
- <span id="page-11-15"></span>Hartl GB, Nadlinger K, Apollonio M, Markov G, Klein F, Lang G, Findo S, Markowski J (1995) Extensive mitochondrial-DNA differentiation among European red deer (*Cervus elaphus*) populations: implications for conservation and management. Z Saeugetierkd 60:41–52
- <span id="page-11-6"></span>Hmwe SS, Zachos FE, Eckert I, Lorenzini R, Fico R, Hartl GB (2006a) Conservation genetics of the endangered red deer from Sardinia and Mesola with further remarks on the phylogeography of *Cervus elaphus corsicanus*. Biol J Linn Soc 88:691–701
- <span id="page-11-9"></span>Hmwe SS, Zachos FE, Sale JB, Rose HR, Hartl GB (2006b) Genetic variability and differentiation in red deer (*Cervus elaphus*) from Scotland and England. J Zool 270:479–487
- <span id="page-11-11"></span>Kidjo N, Feracci G, Bideau E, Gonzalez G, Mattéi C, Marchand B, Aulagnier S (2007) Extirpation and reintroduction of the Corsican red deer *Cervus elaphus corsicanus* in Corsica. Oryx 41:488–494
- <span id="page-11-0"></span>Kock D, Schomber HW (1961) Beitrag zur Kenntnis der Verbreitung und des Bestandes des Atlashirsches (*Cervus elaphus barbarus*) sowie eine Bemerkung zu seiner Geweihausbildung. Saeugetierkundl Mit 9:51–54
- <span id="page-11-22"></span>Kowalski K, Rzebik-Kowalska B (1991) Mammals of Algeria. Polish Academy of Science, Wroklaw Warsaw Krakov
- <span id="page-11-10"></span>Krumbiegel I (1982) Der Korsika-Rothirsch (*Cervus elaphus corsicanus*, Erxleben 1777) und sein Biotop. Saeugetierkdl Mitt 30:281–286
- <span id="page-11-12"></span>Lovari S, Cuccus P, Murgia A, Murgia C, Soi F, Plantamura G (2007) Space use, habitat selection and browsing effects of red deer in Sardinia. Ital J Zool 74:179–189
- <span id="page-11-4"></span>Ludt CJ, Schroeder W, Rottmann O, Kuehn R (2004) Mitochondrial DNA phylogeography of red deer (*Cervus elaphus*). Mol Phylogenet Evol 31:1064–1083
- <span id="page-11-14"></span>Lydekker R (1898) The deer of all lands. A history of the family Cervidae living and extinct. Rowland Ward, London
- <span id="page-11-7"></span>Martinez JG, Carranza J, Fernandez-Garcia JL, Sanchez-Prieto CB (2002) Genetic variation of red deer populations under hunting exploitation in Southwestern Spain. J Wildlife Manage 66:1273–1282
- <span id="page-11-20"></span>Masseti M (1996) The postglacial diffusion of the genus Dama Frisch, 1775, in the Mediterranean region. Suppl Ric Biol Selvag 25:7–29
- <span id="page-11-18"></span>Masseti M (1998) Holocene and anthropochorous wild mammals of the Mediterranean islands. Anthropozoologica 28:3–20
- <span id="page-11-19"></span>Masseti M (2002a) Uomini e (non solo) topi. Firenze University Press, Florence
- <span id="page-11-21"></span>Masseti M (2002b) The red deer of Lampedusa (Pelagian islands, Italy): literary references and osteological evidence. Arch Nat Hist 29:51–66
- <span id="page-11-16"></span>Mattioli S (1990) Red deer in the Italian peninsula with particular reference to the Po delta population. Deer 8:95–98
- <span id="page-12-3"></span>Meyer P (1972) Zur Biologie und Ökologie des Atlashirsches *Cervus elaphus barbarus*, 1833. Z Saeugetierkunde 37:101–116
- <span id="page-12-21"></span>Nei M (1972) Genetic distance between populations. Am Nat 106:283–292
- <span id="page-12-5"></span>Nei M, Maruyama T, Chakraborty R (1975) The bottleneck effect and genetic variability in populations. Evolution 29:1–10
- <span id="page-12-0"></span>Oumani A (2006) Ecobiologie du cerf de Barbarie (*Cervus elaphus barbarus*) en Kroumirie-Mogods (Tunisie). PhD thesis, Université du 7 Novembre à Carthage
- <span id="page-12-15"></span>Pereira E (2001) *Cervus elaphus rossii* (Mammalia, Artiodactyla), a new endemic sub-species from the middle Pleistocene in Corsica. Palaeovertebrata 30:189–213
- <span id="page-12-4"></span>Polziehn RO, Strobeck C (2002) A phylogenetic comparison of red deer and wapiti using mitochondrial DNA. Mol Phylogenet Evol 22:342–356
- <span id="page-12-12"></span>Pritchard JK, Stephens M, Donnelly P (2000) Inference of population structure using multilocus genotype data. Genetics 155:945–959
- <span id="page-12-8"></span>Salez M (1959) Notes sur la distribution et la biologie du cerf de Barbarie (*Cervus elaphus barbarus*). Mammalia 23:132–138
- <span id="page-12-11"></span>Scandura M, Iacolina L, Ben Slimen H, Suchentrunk F, Apollonio M (2007) Mitochondrial CR-1 variation in Sardinian hares and its relationships with other old world hares (Genus *Lepus*). Biochem Genet 45:305–323
- <span id="page-12-19"></span>Schüle W (1993) Mammals, vegetation and the initial human settlement of the Mediterranean islands: a palaeoecological approach. J Biogeogr 20:399–412
- <span id="page-12-13"></span>Skog A, Zachos FE, Rueness EK, Feulner PGD, Mysterud A, Langvatn R, Lorenzini R, Hmwe SS, Lehoczky I, Hartl GB, Stenseth NC, Jakobsen KS (2009) Phylogeography of red deer (*Cervus elaphus*) in Europe. J Biogeogr 36:66–77
- <span id="page-12-14"></span>Sommer RS, Zachos FE, Street M, Jöris O, Skog A, Benecke N (2008) Late Quaternary distribution dynamics and phylogeography of the red deer (*Cervus elaphus*) in Europe. Quaternary Sci Rev 27:714–733
- <span id="page-12-23"></span>Taberlet P, Fumagalli L, Wust-Saucy A-G, Cosson J-F (1998) Comparative phylogeography and postglacial colonization routes in Europe. Mol Ecol 7:453–464
- <span id="page-12-2"></span>Van Dijk G (1972) Le cerf de Barbarie (*Cervus elaphus barbarus* Bennet, 1833) dans la forêt d'El Feidja en Tunisie. Rapport de Stage. Direction Générale des Forêts, Tunisie
- <span id="page-12-22"></span>van Oosterhout C, Hutchinson WF, Wills DPM, Shipley P (2004) MICRO-CHECKER (Version 2.2.3): software for identifying and correcting genotyping errors in microsatellite data. Mol Ecol Notes 4:535–538
- <span id="page-12-9"></span>Vigne J-D (1988) Les Mammifères post-glaciaires de Corse, étude Archéozoologique (XXVIe suppl. Gallia Préhistoire). CNRS, Paris
- <span id="page-12-18"></span>Vigne J-D (1992) Zooarchaeology and the biogeographical history of the mammals of Corsica and Sardinia since the last ice age. Mammal Rev 22:87–96
- <span id="page-12-20"></span>Vigne J-D (1993) Domestication ou appropriation pour la chasse: histoire d'un choix socio-culturel depuis le Néolithique. L'exemple des cerfs (*Cervus*). In: Desse J, Audoin-Rouzeau F (eds) Exploitation des animaux sauvages à travers le temps. APDCA éd, Antibes, France, pp 201–220
- <span id="page-12-17"></span>Vigne J-D (1999) The large "true" Mediterranean islands as a model for the Holocene human impact on the European vertebrate fauna? Recent data and new reflections. In: Benecke N (ed) The holocene history of the European vertebrate fauna. Modern aspects of research. Verlag Marie Leihdorf, Rahden, pp 295–321
- <span id="page-12-16"></span>Vigne J-D, Bailon S, Cuisin J (1997) Biostratigraphy of amphibians, reptiles, birds and mammals in Corsica and the role of man in the holocene turnover. Anthropozoologica 25–26:587–604
- <span id="page-12-1"></span>Wemmer C (1998) Deer. Status survey and conservation action plan. IUCN/SSC Deer Specialist Group, Gland, Switzerland
- <span id="page-12-10"></span>Zachos FE, Hartl GB (2006) Island populations, human introductions and the limitations of genetic analyses: the case of the Sardinian red deer (*Cervus elaphus corsicanus*). Hum Evol 21:177–183
- <span id="page-12-6"></span>Zachos FE, Althoff C, Steynitz VY, Eckert I, Hartl GB (2007) Genetic analysis of an isolated red deer (*Cervus elaphus*) population showing signs of inbreeding depression. Eur J Wildlife Res 53:61–67
- <span id="page-12-7"></span>Zachos F, Hartl GB, Apollonio M, Reutershan T (2003) On the phylogeographic origin of the corsican red deer (*Cervus elaphus corsicanus*): evidence from microsatellites and mitochondrial DNA. Mamm biol 68:284–298