

# A Tverberg Type Theorem for Matroids

Imre Bárány, Gil Kalai, and Roy Meshulam

*In memory of Jirka Matousek*

**Abstract** Let  $b(M)$  denote the maximal number of disjoint bases in a matroid  $M$ . It is shown that if  $M$  is a matroid of rank  $d + 1$ , then for any continuous map  $f$  from the matroidal complex  $M$  into  $\mathbb{R}^d$  there exist  $t \geq \sqrt{b(M)}/4$  disjoint independent sets  $\sigma_1, \dots, \sigma_t \in M$  such that  $\bigcap_{i=1}^t f(\sigma_i) \neq \emptyset$ .

## 1 Introduction

Tverberg's theorem [15] asserts that if  $V \subset \mathbb{R}^d$  satisfies  $|V| \geq (k - 1)(d + 1) + 1$ , then there exists a partition  $V = V_1 \cup \dots \cup V_k$  such that  $\bigcap_{i=1}^k \text{conv}(V_i) \neq \emptyset$ . Tverberg's theorem and some of its extensions may be viewed in the following general context. For a simplicial complex  $X$  and  $d \geq 1$ , let the *affine Tverberg number*  $T(X, d)$  be the maximal  $t$  such that for any affine map  $f : X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^d$ , there exist disjoint simplices  $\sigma_1, \dots, \sigma_t \in X$  such that  $\bigcap_{i=1}^t f(\sigma_i) \neq \emptyset$ . The *topological Tverberg number*  $TT(X, d)$  is defined similarly where now  $f : X \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^d$  can be an arbitrary continuous map.

Let  $\Delta_n$  denote the  $n$ -simplex and let  $\Delta_n^{(d)}$  be its  $d$ -skeleton. Using the above terminology, Tverberg's theorem is equivalent to  $T(\Delta_{(k-1)(d+1)}, d) = k$  which

---

I. Bárány (✉)

Rényi Institute, Hungarian Academy of Sciences, POB 127, 1364 Budapest, Hungary

Department of Mathematics, University College London, Gower Street, London, UK

e-mail: [barany@renyi.hu](mailto:barany@renyi.hu)

G. Kalai

Einstein Institute of Mathematics, Hebrew University, 9190 Jerusalem, Israel

e-mail: [kalai@math.huji.ac.il](mailto:kalai@math.huji.ac.il)

R. Meshulam

Department of Mathematics, Technion, 32000 Haifa, Israel

e-mail: [meshulam@math.technion.ac.il](mailto:meshulam@math.technion.ac.il)

is clearly the same as  $T(\Delta_{(k-1)(d+1)}^{(d)}, d) = k$ . Similarly, the topological Tverberg theorem of Bárány, Shlosman and Szűcs [2] states that if  $p$  is prime then  $TT(\Delta_{(p-1)(d+1)}, d) = p$ . Schöneborn and Ziegler [14] proved that this implies the stronger statement  $TT(\Delta_{(p-1)(d+1)}^{(d)}, d) = p$ . This result was extended by Özaydin [13] for the case when  $p$  is a prime power. The question whether the topological Tverberg theorem holds for every  $p$  that is not a prime power had been open for long. Very recently, and quite surprisingly, Frick [7] has constructed a counterexample for every non-prime power  $p$ . His construction is built on work by Mabillard and Wagner [10]. See also [4] and [1] for further counterexamples.

There is a colourful version of Tverberg theorem. To state it let  $n = r(d + 1) - 1$  and assume that the vertex set  $V$  of  $\Delta_n$  is partitioned into  $d + 1$  classes (called colours) and that each colour class contains exactly  $r$  vertices. We define  $Y_{r,d}$  as the subcomplex of  $\Delta_n$  (or  $\Delta_n^{(d)}$ ) consisting of those  $\sigma \subset V$  that contain at most one vertex from each colour class. The colourful Tverberg theorem of Živaljević and Vrećica [16] asserts that  $TT(Y_{2p-1,d}, d) \geq p$  for prime  $p$  which implies that  $TT(Y_{4k-1,d}, d) \geq k$  for arbitrary  $k$ . A neat and more recent theorem of Blagojević, Matschke, and Ziegler [5] says that  $TT(Y_{r,d}, d) = r$  if  $r + 1$  is a prime, which is clearly best possible. Further information on Tverberg's theorem can be found in Matoušek's excellent book [11].

Let  $M$  be a matroid (possibly with loops) with rank function  $\rho$  on the set  $V$ . We identify  $M$  with the simplicial complex on  $V$  whose simplices are the independent sets of  $M$ . It is well known (see e.g. Theorem 7.8.1 in [3]) that  $M$  is  $(\rho(V) - 2)$ -connected. Note that both  $\Delta_n^{(d)}$  and  $Y_{r,d}$  are matroids of rank  $d + 1$ . In this note we are interested in bounding  $TT(M, d)$  for a general matroidal complex  $M$ . Let  $b(M)$  denote the maximal number of pairwise disjoint bases in  $M$ . Our main result is the following

**Theorem 1** *Let  $M$  be a matroid of rank  $d + 1$ . Then*

$$TT(M, d) \geq \sqrt{b(M)}/4 .$$

In Sect. 2 we give a lower bound on the topological connectivity of the deleted join of matroids. In Sect. 3 we use this bound and the approach of [2, 16] to prove Theorem 1.

## 2 Connectivity of Deleted Joins of Matroids

We recall some definitions. For a simplicial complex  $Y$  on a set  $V$  and an element  $v \in V$  such that  $\{v\} \in Y$ , denote the *star* and *link* of  $v$  in  $Y$  by

$$\begin{aligned} \text{st}(Y, v) &= \{\sigma \subset V : \{v\} \cup \sigma \in Y\} \\ \text{lk}(Y, v) &= \{\sigma \in \text{st}(Y, v) : v \notin \sigma\}. \end{aligned}$$

For a subset  $V' \subset V$  let  $Y[V'] = \{\sigma \subset V' : \sigma \in Y\}$  be the induced complex on  $V'$ . We regard  $\text{st}(Y, v)$ ,  $\text{lk}(Y, v)$  and  $Y[V']$  as complexes on the original set  $V$  (keeping in mind that not all elements of  $V$  have to be vertices of these complexes). Let  $f_i(Y)$  denote the number of  $i$ -simplices in  $Y$ . Let  $X_1, \dots, X_k$  be simplicial complexes on the same set  $V$  and let  $V_1, \dots, V_k$  be  $k$  disjoint copies of  $V$  with bijections  $\pi_i : V \rightarrow V_i$ . The *join*  $X_1 * \dots * X_k$  is the simplicial complex on  $\bigcup_{i=1}^k V_i$  with simplices  $\bigcup_{i=1}^k \pi_i(\sigma_i)$  where  $\sigma_i \in X_i$ . The *deleted join*  $(X_1 * \dots * X_k)_\Delta$  is the subcomplex of the join consisting of all simplices  $\bigcup_{i=1}^k \pi_i(\sigma_i)$  such that  $\sigma_i \cap \sigma_j = \emptyset$  for  $1 \leq i \neq j \leq k$ . When all  $X_i$  are equal to  $X$ , we denote their deleted join by  $X_\Delta^{*k}$ . Note that  $\mathbb{Z}_k$  acts freely on  $X_\Delta^{*k}$  by cyclic shifts.

**Claim 2** *Let  $M_1, \dots, M_k$  be matroids on the same set  $V$ , with rank functions  $\rho_1, \dots, \rho_k$ . Suppose  $A_1, \dots, A_k$  are disjoint subsets of  $V$  such that  $A_i$  is a union of at most  $m$  independent sets in  $M_i$ . Then  $Y = (M_1 * \dots * M_k)_\Delta$  is  $(\lceil \frac{1}{m+1} \sum_{i=1}^k |A_i| \rceil - 2)$ -connected.*

*Proof* Let  $c = \lceil \frac{1}{m+1} \sum_{i=1}^k |A_i| \rceil - 2$ . If  $k = 1$  then  $\rho_1(V) \geq \lceil \frac{|A_1|}{m} \rceil$  and hence  $Y = M_1$  is  $(\lceil \frac{|A_1|}{m} \rceil - 2)$ -connected. For  $k \geq 2$  we establish the Claim by induction on  $f_0(Y) = \sum_{i=1}^k f_0(M_i)$ . If  $f_0(Y) = 0$  then all  $A_i$ 's are empty and the Claim holds. We henceforth assume that  $f_0(Y) > 0$  and consider two cases:

(a) If  $M_i = M_i[A_i]$  for all  $1 \leq i \leq k$  then  $Y = M_1 * \dots * M_k$  is a matroid of rank

$$\sum_{i=1}^k \rho_i(V) \geq \sum_{i=1}^k \left\lceil \frac{|A_i|}{m} \right\rceil \geq \left\lceil \frac{\sum_{i=1}^k |A_i|}{m} \right\rceil.$$

Hence  $Y$  is  $(\lceil \frac{\sum_{i=1}^k |A_i|}{m} \rceil - 2)$ -connected.

(b) Otherwise there exists an  $1 \leq i_0 \leq k$  such that  $M_{i_0} \neq M_{i_0}[A_{i_0}]$ . Choose an element  $v \in V - A_{i_0}$  such that  $\{v\} \in M_{i_0}$ . Without loss of generality we may assume that  $i_0 = 1$  and that  $v \notin \bigcup_{i=1}^{k-1} A_i$ . Let  $S = \bigcup_{i=1}^k V_i$  and let  $Y_1 = Y[S - \{\pi_1(v)\}]$ ,  $Y_2 = \text{st}(Y, \pi_1(v))$ . Then

$$Y_1 = (M_1[V - \{v\}] * M_2 * \dots * M_k)_\Delta.$$

Noting that  $f_0(Y_1) = f_0(Y) - 1$  and applying the induction hypothesis to the matroids  $M_1[V - \{v\}]$ ,  $M_2, \dots, M_k$  and the sets  $A_1, \dots, A_k$ , it follows that  $Y_1$  is  $c$ -connected. We next consider the connectivity of  $Y_1 \cap Y_2$ . Write  $A_1 = \bigcup_{j=1}^t C_j$  where  $t \leq m$ ,  $C_j \in M_1$  for all  $1 \leq j \leq t$ , and the  $C_j$ 's are pairwise disjoint. Since  $\{v\} \in M_1$ , it follows that there exist  $\{C'_j\}_{j=1}^t$  such that  $C'_j \subset C_j$ ,  $|C'_j| \geq |C_j| - 1$ , and  $C'_j \in \text{lk}(M_1, v)$  for all  $1 \leq j \leq t$ . Let

$$M'_i = \begin{cases} \text{lk}(M_1, v) & i = 1, \\ M_i[V - \{v\}] & 2 \leq i \leq k, \end{cases}$$

and

$$A'_i = \begin{cases} \bigcup_{j=1}^t C'_j & i = 1, \\ A_i & 2 \leq i \leq k-1, \\ A_k - \{v\} & i = k. \end{cases}$$

Observe that

$$Y_1 \cap Y_2 = \text{lk}(Y, \pi_1(v)) = (M'_1 * \dots * M'_k)_\Delta$$

and that  $A'_i$  is a union of at most  $m$  independent sets in  $M'_i$  for all  $1 \leq i \leq k$ . Noting that  $f_0(Y_1 \cap Y_2) \leq f_0(Y) - 1$  and applying the induction hypothesis to the matroids  $M'_1, \dots, M'_k$  and the sets  $A'_1, \dots, A'_k$ , it follows that  $Y_1 \cap Y_2$  is  $c'$ -connected where

$$\begin{aligned} c' &= \left\lceil \frac{1}{m+1} \sum_{i=1}^k |A'_i| \right\rceil - 2 \\ &= \left\lceil \frac{1}{m+1} \left( \sum_{j=1}^t |C'_j| + \sum_{i=2}^{k-1} |A_i| + |A_k - \{v\}| \right) \right\rceil - 2 \\ &\geq \left\lceil \frac{1}{m+1} \left( |A_1| - m + \sum_{i=2}^{k-1} |A_i| + |A_k| - 1 \right) \right\rceil - 2 = c - 1. \end{aligned}$$

As  $Y_1$  is  $c$ -connected,  $Y_2$  is contractible and  $Y_1 \cap Y_2$  is  $(c - 1)$ -connected, it follows that  $Y = Y_1 \cup Y_2$  is  $c$ -connected.  $\square$

Let  $M$  be a matroid on  $V$  with  $b(M) = b$  disjoint bases  $B_1, \dots, B_b$ . Let  $I_1 \cup \dots \cup I_k$  be a partition of  $[b]$  into almost equal parts  $\lfloor \frac{b}{k} \rfloor \leq |I_i| \leq \lceil \frac{b}{k} \rceil$ . Applying Claim 2 with  $M_1 = \dots = M_k = M$  and  $A_i = \cup_{j \in I_i} B_j$ , we obtain:

**Corollary 3** *The connectivity of  $M_\Delta^{*k}$  is at least*

$$\frac{b\rho(V)}{\lceil \frac{b}{k} \rceil + 1} - 2 .$$

We suggest the following:

**Conjecture 4** *For any  $k \geq 1$  there exists an  $f(k)$  such that if  $b(M) \geq f(k)$  then  $M_\Delta^{*k}$  is  $(k\rho(V) - 2)$ -connected.*

*Remark* Let  $M$  be the rank 1 matroid on  $m$  points  $M = \Delta_{m-1}^{(0)}$ . The chessboard complex  $C(k, m)$  is the  $k$ -fold deleted join  $M_\Delta^{*k}$ . Chessboard complexes play a key role in the works of Živaljević and Vrećica [16] and Blagojević, Matschke, and Ziegler [5] on the colourful Tverberg theorem. Let  $k \geq 2$ . Garst [9] and Živaljević and Vrećica [16] proved that  $C(k, 2k - 1)$  is  $(k - 2)$ -connected. On the other hand,

Friedman and Hanlon [8] showed that  $\tilde{H}_{k-2}(C(k, 2k - 2); \mathbb{Q}) \neq 0$ , so  $C(k, 2k - 2)$  is not  $(k - 2)$ -connected. This implies that the function  $f(k)$  in Conjecture 4 must satisfy  $f(k) \geq 2k - 1$ .

### 3 A Tverberg Type Theorem for Matroids

We recall some well-known topological facts (see [2]). For  $m \geq 1, k \geq 2$  we identify the sphere  $S^{m(k-1)-1}$  with the space

$$\left\{ (y_1, \dots, y_k) \in (\mathbb{R}^m)^k : \sum_{i=1}^k |y_i|^2 = 1, \sum_{i=1}^k y_i = 0 \in \mathbb{R}^m \right\} .$$

The cyclic shift on this space defines a  $\mathbb{Z}_k$  action on  $S^{m(k-1)-1}$ . The action is free for prime  $k$ .

The  $k$ -fold deleted product of a space  $X$  is the  $\mathbb{Z}_k$ -space given by

$$X_D^k = X^k - \{(x, \dots, x) \in X^k : x \in X\} .$$

For  $m \geq 1$  define a  $\mathbb{Z}_k$ -map

$$\phi_{m,k} : (\mathbb{R}^m)_D^k \rightarrow S^{m(k-1)-1}$$

by

$$\phi_{m,k}(x_1, \dots, x_k) = \frac{(x_1 - \frac{1}{k} \sum_{i=1}^k x_i, \dots, x_k - \frac{1}{k} \sum_{i=1}^k x_i)}{(\sum_{j=1}^k |x_j - \frac{1}{k} \sum_{i=1}^k x_i|^2)^{1/2}} .$$

We'll also need the following result of Dold [6] (see also Theorem 6.2.6 in [12]):

**Theorem 5 (Dold)** *Let  $p$  be a prime and suppose  $X$  and  $Y$  are free  $\mathbb{Z}_p$ -spaces such that  $\dim Y = k$  and  $X$  is  $k$ -connected. Then there does not exist a  $\mathbb{Z}_p$ -map from  $X$  to  $Y$ .*

*Proof of Theorem 1* Let  $M$  be a matroid on the vertex set  $V$ , and let  $f : M \rightarrow \mathbb{R}^d$  be a continuous map. Let  $b = b(M)$  and choose a prime  $\sqrt{b}/4 \leq p \leq \sqrt{b}/2$ . We'll show that there exist disjoint simplices (i.e. independent sets)  $\sigma_1, \dots, \sigma_p \in M$  such that  $\bigcap_{i=1}^p f(\sigma_i) \neq \emptyset$ . Suppose for contradiction that  $\bigcap_{i=1}^p f(\sigma_i) = \emptyset$  for all such choices of  $\sigma_i$ 's. Then  $f$  induces a continuous  $\mathbb{Z}_p$ -map

$$f_* : M_\Delta^{*p} \rightarrow (\mathbb{R}^{d+1})_D^p$$

as follows. If  $x_1, \dots, x_p$  have pairwise disjoint supports in  $M$  and  $(t_1, \dots, t_p) \in \mathbb{R}_+^p$  satisfies  $\sum_{i=1}^p t_i = 1$  then

$$f_*(t_1\pi_1(x_1) + \dots + t_p\pi_p(x_p)) = (t_1, t_1f(x_1), \dots, t_p, t_pf(x_p)) \in (\mathbb{R}^{d+1})_D^p.$$

Hence  $\phi_{d+1,p}f_*$  is a  $\mathbb{Z}_p$ -map between the free  $\mathbb{Z}_p$ -spaces  $M_\Delta^{*p}$  and  $S^{(d+1)(p-1)-1}$ . This however contradicts Dold's Theorem since by Corollary 3 the connectivity of  $M_\Delta^{*p}$  is at least

$$\frac{b(d+1)}{\lfloor \frac{b}{p} \rfloor + 1} - 2 \geq (d+1)(p-1) - 1$$

by the choice of  $p$ .

□

**Acknowledgements** Research of Imre Bárány was partially supported by ERC advanced grant 267165, and by Hungarian National grant K 83767. Research of Gil Kalai was supported by ERC advanced grant 320924. Research of Roy Meshulam is supported by ISF and GIF grants.

## References

1. S. Avvakumov, I. Mabillard, A. Skopenkov, U. Wagner, Eliminating higher-multiplicity intersections, III. Codimension 2 (2015), 16 pp., arXiv:1511.03501
2. I. Bárány, S. Shlosman, A. Szűcs, On a topological generalization of a theorem of Tverberg. *J. Lond. Math. Soc.* **23**, 158–164 (1981)
3. A. Björner, Topological methods, in *Handbook of Combinatorics, 1819–1872*, ed. by R. Graham, M. Grötschel, L. Lovász (North-Holland, Amsterdam, 1995)
4. P.V.M. Blagojević, F. Frick, G.M. Ziegler, Barycenters of polytope Skeleta and counterexamples to the topological Tverberg conjecture, via constraints (2015), 6 pp., arXiv:1508.02349
5. P.V.M. Blagojević, B. Matschke, G.M. Ziegler, Optimal bounds for the colored Tverberg problem. *J. European Math. Soc.* **17**, 739–754 (2015)
6. A. Dold, Simple proofs of some Borsuk-Ulam results. *Contemp. Math.* **19**, 65–69 (1983)
7. F. Frick, Counterexamples to the topological Tverberg conjecture (2015), 3 pp., arXiv:1502.00947
8. J. Friedman, P. Hanlon, On the Betti numbers of chessboard complexes, *J. Algebraic Combin.* **8**, 193–203 (1998)
9. P. Garst, Cohen-Macaulay complexes and group actions, Ph.D.Thesis, The University of Wisconsin – Madison, 1979
10. I. Mabillard, U. Wagner, Eliminating higher-multiplicity intersections, I. A Whitney trick for Tverberg-type problems (2015), 46 pp., arXiv:1508.02349
11. J. Matoušek, *Lectures on Discrete Geometry* (Springer, New York, 2002)
12. J. Matoušek, *Using the Borsuk-Ulam Theorem* (Springer, Berlin, 2003)
13. M. Özaydin, Equivariant maps for the symmetric group, 1987. Available at <http://minds.wisconsin.edu/handle/1793/63829>

14. T. Schöneborn, G.M. Ziegler, The topological Tverberg theorem and winding numbers. *J. Combin. Theory Ser. A* **112**, 82–104 (2005)
15. H. Tverberg, A generalization of Radon's theorem. *J. Lond. Math. Soc.* **41**, 123–128 (1966)
16. R. Živaljević, S. Vrećica, The colored Tverberg's problem and complexes of injective functions. *J. Combin. Theory Ser. A* **61**, 309–318 (1992)