# **Prediction of Hidden Oscillations Existence in Nonlinear Dynamical Systems: Analytics and Simulation**

Gennady A. Leonov and Nikolay V. Kuznetsov

**Abstract.** From a computational point of view, in nonlinear dynamical systems, attractors can be regarded as self-excited and hidden attractors. Self-excited attractors can be localized numerically by a standard computational procedure, in which after a transient process a trajectory, starting from a point of unstable manifold in a neighborhood of equilibrium, reaches a state of oscillation, therefore one can easily identify it. In contrast, for a hidden attractor, a basin of attraction does not intersect neighborhoods of equilibria. While classical attractors are self-excited, attractors can therefore be obtained numerically by the standard computational procedure, for localization of hidden attractors it is necessary to develop special procedures, since there are no similar transient processes leading to such attractors. This keynote lecture is devoted to affective analytical-numerical methods for localization of hidden oscillations in nonlinear dynamical systems and their application to well known fundamental problems and [ap](#page-8-0)[plied](#page-7-0) models.

## **1 Introduction**

An oscillation in dynamical system can be easily localized numerically if initial conditions from its open neighborhood lead to long-time behavior that approaches the oscillation. Such oscillation (or a set of oscillations) is called an attractor, and its attracting set is called the basin of attraction [49, 27]. Thus, from a computational

Nikolay V. Kuznetsov

I. Zelinka et al. (Eds.): *Nostradamus 2013: Prediction, Model.* & *Analysis*, AISC 210, pp. 5–13. DOI: 10.1007/978-3-319-00542-3\_3 c Springer International Publishing Switzerland 2013

Gennady A. Leonov

Faculty of Mathematics and Mechanics, Saint Petersburg Sta[te U](#page-8-1)niversity, Universitetski pr. 28, Saint-Petersburg, 198504, Russia e-mail: leonov@math.spbu.ru

Dept. of Mathematical Information Technology, University of Jyväskylä, P.O. Box 35 (Agora), FIN-40014, Finland e-mail: nkuznetsov239@gmail.com

point of view in applied problems of nonlinear analysis of dynamical models, it is essential to regard attractors [44, 45, 40, 32] as *self-excited* and *hidden attractors* depending on simplicity of finding its basin of attraction in the phase space.

For a self-excited attractors its basin of attraction is connected with an unstable equilibrium: self-excited attractors can be localized numerically by *standard computational procedure*, in which after a transient process a trajectory, started from a point of unstable manifold in a neighborhood of equilibrium, reaches a state of oscillation therefore one can easily identify it. In contrast, for a *hidden attractor, its basin of attraction does not intersect with small neighborhoods of equilibria*.

For numerical localization of hidden attractors it is necessary to develop special analytical-numerical procedures, since there are no similar transient processes leading to such attractors from neighborhoods of equilibria. Remark, that one cannot guarantee finding [of](#page-8-2) [an](#page-6-0) [attr](#page-5-0)[acto](#page-8-3)r (especially for multidimensional systems) by the integration of trajectories with random initial conditions since basin of attraction can be very small.

### **2 Self-excited Attractor Locali[zat](#page-6-1)ion**

In the first half o[f](#page-5-1) [th](#page-5-1)e last century during the initial period of the development of the theory of nonlinear oscillations [55, 19, 3, 53], a main attention was given to analysis and synthesis of oscillating sy[stem](#page-8-4)s, for which the problem of the existence of oscillations can be solved with relative ease.

These investigations were encouraged by the applied research of periodic os[cilla](#page-8-5)[tion](#page-8-6)s in mechanics, electronics, chemistry, biology and so on (see, e.g., [54]) The structure of many applied systems (see, e.g., Duffing [13], van der Pol [51], Tricomi [56], Beluosov-Zhabotinsky [4] systems) was such that the existence of oscillations was "almos[t ob](#page-8-7)[vio](#page-6-2)[us](#page-6-3)" since the oscillations were excited from unstable equilibria (*self-excited oscillation*). This allowed one, following Poincare's advice "*[to](#page-8-8) construct the curves defined by differential equations*" [50], to visualize periodic oscillations by sta[ndar](#page-6-4)d computational procedure.

Then, in the middle of 20th century, it was found numerically the existence of chaotic osci[llat](#page-8-6)ions [57, 47], whi[ch w](#page-8-7)ere also excited from an unstable equilibrium and could be computed by the standard computational procedure. Nowadays there is enormous number of publications devoted to the computation and analysis of self-exited chaotic oscillations (see, e.g., [52, 11, 9] and others).

In Fig. 1 numerical localization of classical self-exited oscillation are shown: van der Pol oscillator [51], one of the modification of Belousov-Zhabotinsky reaction [4], two prey and one predator model [14].

In Fig. 2 examples of visualization of classical self-excited chaotic attractors are presented: Lorenz system [47], Rössler system [52], "double-scroll" attractor in Chua's circuit [5].



**Fig. 1** Standard computation of classical self-excited periodic oscillations



**Fig. 2** Standard computation of classical self-excited chaotic attractors

## **3 Hidden [Attr](#page-7-1)[ac](#page-6-5)[tor](#page-7-2) [Lo](#page-7-3)[cal](#page-8-9)[iza](#page-6-6)[tion](#page-7-4)**

While classical attractors are self-exited attractors therefore can be obtained numerically by the standard computational procedure, for local[izat](#page-6-7)ion of hidden attractors it is necessary to develop special procedures, since there are no similar transient processes leading to such attractors. At first, the problem of investigating hidden oscillations arose in the second part of Hilbert's 16th problem (1900) on the number and possible dispositions of limit cycles in two-dimensional polynomial systems (see, e.g., [\[46](#page-7-4)] and authors' works [34, 23, 42, 36, 43, 21, 32]). The the problem is still far from being resolved even for a simple class of quadratic systems.

Later, the problem of analyzing hidden oscillations arose from engineering problems in automatic control. In 50s of the last century in M.Kapranov's works [17] on stability of phase locked-loops (PLL) systems, widely used nowadays in telecommunications and computer architectures, the qualitative behavior of systems was studied and the estimate of stability domain was obtained. In these investigations Kapranov assumed that in PLL systems there were self-excited oscillations only. However, in 1961, N.Gubar' [32] revealed a gap in Kapranov's work and showed analytically the possibility of the existence of hidden oscillations in two-dimensional system of phase locked-loop: thus from the computational point of view the system considered was globally stable (all the trajectories tend to equilibria), but, in fact, there was a bounded domain of attraction only.



**Fig. 3** Nonlinear control system.  $G(s)$  is a linear transfer function,  $f(e)$  is a single-valued, continuous, and differentiable function [16].

In 1957 year R.E. Kalman stated the following [16]: "*If f*(*e*) *in Fig. 1* [see Fig. 3] is replaced by constants K corresponding to all possible values of  $f'(e)$ , and it is *found that the closed-loop system is stable [for](#page-7-5) [all](#page-7-6) [su](#page-5-2)[ch](#page-7-7) [K,](#page-5-3) [then](#page-6-8) it intuitively clear that the system must be monostable; i.e., all transient solutions will converge to a unique, stable critical point.*" Kalman's conjecture is a strengthening of Aizerman's conjecture [2], in [whic](#page-8-10)h in place of condition on the der[ivat](#page-6-9)ive of nonlinearity it is required that the nonlinearity itself belongs to linear sector.

In the last century the investigations of widely known Aizerman's, and Kalman's conjectures on absolute stabilit[y ha](#page-6-10)[ve l](#page-7-8)[ed](#page-6-11) [to](#page-6-12) [the](#page-7-9) [find](#page-7-4)ing of hidden oscillations in automatic control systems with a unique stable stationary point and with a nonlinearity, which belongs to the sector of linear stability (see, e.g., [31, 30, 6, 37, 7, 24, 38, 41, 32]).

The generalization of Kalman's conjecture to multidimensional nonlinearity is known as Markus-Yamabe conjecture [48] (which is also proved to be false [12]).

At the end of the last century the difficulties the difficulties of numerical analysis of hidden oscillations arose in simulations of aircraft's control systems (anti-windup) and drilling systems which caused crashes [26, [29,](#page-8-11) [8, 1](#page-8-12)8, 33, 32].

Further investigations on [hid](#page-4-0)den os[cil](#page-4-1)lations were greatly encouraged by the [pres](#page-6-13)[ent](#page-7-10) authors' discovery, in 2009-2010 (for the first time), of *chaotic hidden attractor* in Chua's circuits (simple electronic circuit with nonlinear feedback) [25, 44, 7].

Until recently, only self excited attractors have been found in Chua circuits. Note that L. Chua himself, in analyzing various cases of attract[ors](#page-7-10) [e](#page-7-10)xistence in Chua's circuit [10], does not admit the existence of hidden attractor (discovered later) in his circuits. Now, it is shown that Chua's circuit and its various modifications [44, 45, 20] can exhibit hidden chaotic attractors (see, Fig.4, b), Fig.5) with positive largest Lyapunov exponent $[22, 35]$ <sup>1</sup>.

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> While there are known effects of the largest Lyapunov exponent (LE) sign inversion ([35, 22]) for nonregular time-varying linearizations, computation of Lyapunov exponents for linearization of nonlinear autonomous system along non stationary trajectories is widely used for investigation of chaos, where positiveness of the largest Lyapunov exponent is often considered as indication of chaotic behavior in considered nonlinear system.



**Fig. 4** a) Self-excited and b) Hidden Chua attractor with similar shapes

<span id="page-4-0"></span>

<span id="page-4-1"></span>**Fig. 5** Hidden chaotic attractor (green domain) in classical Chua circuit: locally stable zero equilibrium  $F_0$  attracts trajectories (black) from stable manifolds  $M_{1,2}^{st}$  of two saddle points *S*1*,*2; trajectories (red) from unstable manifolds *Munst* <sup>1</sup>*,*<sup>2</sup> tend to infinity

#### **4 Conclusion**

Since one cannot guarantee revealing complex oscillations regime by linear analysis and standard simulation, rigorous nonlinear analysis and special numerical methods should be used for investigation of nonlinear dynamical systems.

It was found [28, 38, 24, 39, 41, 32] that the [eff](#page-8-13)[ecti](#page-8-14)[ve m](#page-8-15)[eth](#page-8-16)ods for the numerical localization of hidden attractors in multidimensional dynamical systems are the methods based on special modifications of *describing function method*<sup>2</sup> and *numerical continuation*: it is constructed a sequence of similar systems such that for the first (starting) system the initial data for numerical computation of possible oscillating solution (starting oscillation) can be obtained analytically and then the transformation of this starting oscillation when passing from one system to another is followed numerically.

<span id="page-5-1"></span><span id="page-5-0"></span>Also some recent examples of hidden attractors can be found in [63, 60, 59, 58, 61, 62, 1, 15].

<span id="page-5-2"></span>**Acknowledgements.** This work was supported by the Academy of Finland, Russian Ministry of Education and Science (Federal target programm), Russian Foundation for Basic Research and Saint-Petersburg State University.

#### <span id="page-5-3"></span>**References**

- 1. Abooee, A., Yaghini-Bonabi, H., Jahed-Motlagh, M.: Analysis and circuitry realization of a novel three-dimensional chaotic system. Commun Nonlinear Sci. Numer. Simulat. 18, 1235–1245 (2013)
- 2. Aizerman, M.A.: On a problem concerning the stability in the large of dynamical systems. Uspekhi Mat. Nauk 4, 187–188 (1949) (in Russian)
- 3. Andronov, A.A., Vitt, A.A., Khaikin, S.E.: Theory of Oscillators. Pergamon, Oxford (1966)
- 4. Belousov, B.P.: A periodic reaction and its mechanism. In: Collection of short papers on radiation medicine for 1958,.Med. Publ., Moscow (1959) (in Russian)
- 5. Bilotta, E., Pantano, P.: A gallery of Chua attractors, vol. Series A. 61. World Scientific (2008)
- 6. Bragin, V.O., Kuznetsov, N.V., Leonov, G.A.: Algorithm for counterexamples construction for Aizerman's and Kalman's conjectures. IFAC Proceedings Volumes (IFAC-PapersOnline) 4(1), 24–28 (2010), doi:10.3182/20100826-3-TR-4016.00008
- 7. Bragin, V.O., Vagaitsev, V.I., Kuznetsov, N.V., Leonov, G.A.: Algorithms for finding hidden oscillations in nonlinear systems. The Aizerman and Kalman conjectures and Chua's circuits. Journal of Computer and Systems Sciences International 50(4), 511–543 (2011), doi:10.1134/S106423071104006X

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> In engineering practice for the analysis of the existence of periodic solutions it is widely used classical harmonic linearization and describing function method (DFM). However these classical method is not strictly mathematical reasonable and can lead to untrue results (e.g., DFM proves validity of Aizerman's and Kalman's conjectures on absolute system if control system, while counterexample with hidden oscillation are well known).

- <span id="page-6-11"></span><span id="page-6-3"></span><span id="page-6-2"></span>8. de Bruin, J., Doris, A., van de Wouw, N., Heemels, W., Nijmeijer, H.: Control of mechanical motion systems with non-collocation of actuation and friction: A Popov criterion approach for input-to-state stability and set-valued nonlinearities. Automatica 45(2), 405–415 (2009)
- <span id="page-6-9"></span><span id="page-6-1"></span>9. Chen, G., Ueta, T.: Yet another chaotic attractor. International Journal of Bifurcation and Chaos 9(7), 1465–1466 (1999)
- <span id="page-6-4"></span>10. Chua, L.: A zoo of strange attractors from the canonical Chua's circuits. In: Proceedings of the IEEE 35th Midwest Symposium on Circuits and Systems (Cat. No.92CH3099-9), vol. 2, pp. 916–926 (1992)
- 11. Chua, L.O., Komuro, M., Matsumoto, T.: The double scroll family. IEEE Transactions on Circuits and Systems CAS-33(11), 1072–1118 (1986)
- 12. Cima, A., van den Essen, A., Gasull, A., Hubbers, E., Mañosas, F.: A polynomial counterexample to the Markus-Yamabe conjecture. Advances in Mathematics 131(2), 453–457 (1997)
- <span id="page-6-7"></span>13. Duffing, G.: Erzwungene Schwingungen bei Veranderlicher Eigenfrequenz. F. Vieweg u. Sohn, Braunschweig (1918)
- <span id="page-6-12"></span>14. Fujii, K.: Complexity-stability relationship of two-prey-one-predator species system model; local and global stability. Journal of Theoretical Biology 69(4), 613–623 (1977)
- 15. Jafari, S., Sprott, J., Golpayegani, S.: Elementary quadratic chaotic flows with no equilibria. Physics Letters A 377, 699–702 (2013)
- <span id="page-6-0"></span>16. Kalman, R.E.: Physical and mathematical mechanisms of instability in nonlinear automatic control systems. Transactions of ASME 79(3), 553–566 (1957)
- 17. Kapranov, M.: Locking band for phase-locked loop. Radiofizika 2(12), 37–52 (1956) (in Russian)
- <span id="page-6-6"></span>18. Kiseleva, M.A., Kuznetsov, N.V., Leonov, G.A., Neittaanmäki, P.: Drilling systems failures and hidden oscillations. In: Proceedings of IEEE 4th International Conference on Nonlinear Science and Complexity, NSC 2012, pp. 109–112 (2012), doi:10.1109/NSC.2012.6304736
- <span id="page-6-13"></span>19. Krylov, A.N.: The Vibration of Ships. GRSL, Moscow (1936) (in Russian)
- <span id="page-6-5"></span>20. Kuznetsov, N., Kuznetsova, O., Leonov, G., Vagaitsev, V.: Analytical-numerical localization of hidden attractor in electrical Chua's circuit. In: Ferrier, J.-L., Bernard, A., Gusikhin, O., Madani, K. (eds.) Informatics in Control, Automation and Robotics. LNEE, vol. 174, pp. 149–158. Springer, Heidelberg (2013)
- <span id="page-6-8"></span>21. Kuznetsov, N.V., Kuznetsova, O.A., Leonov, G.A.: Visualization of four normal size limit cycles in two-dimensional polynomial quadratic system. Differential Equations and Dynamical Systems 21(1-2), 29–34 (2013), doi:10.1007/s12591-012-0118-6
- 22. Kuznetsov, N.V., Leonov, G.A.: On stability by the first approximation for discrete systems. In: Proceedings of International Conference on Physics and Control, PhysCon 2005, vol. 2005, pp. 596–599 (2005), doi:10.1109/PHYCON.2005.1514053
- <span id="page-6-10"></span>23. Kuznetsov, N.V., Leonov, G.A.: Lyapunov quantities, limit cycles and strange behavior of trajectories in two-dimensional quadratic systems. Journal of Vibroengineering 10(4), 460–467 (2008)
- 24. Kuznetsov, N.V., Leonov, G.A., Seledzhi, S.M.: Hidden oscillations in nonlinear control systems. IFAC Proceedings Volumes (IFAC-PapersOnline) 18(1), 2506–2510 (2011), doi:10.3182/20110828-6-IT-1002.03316
- 25. Kuznetsov, N.V., Leonov, G.A., Vagaitsev, V.I.: Analytical-numerical method for attractor localization of generalized Chua's system. IFAC Proceedings Volumes (IFAC-PapersOnline) 4(1), 29–33 (2010), doi:10.3182/20100826-3-TR-4016.00009
- 26. Lauvdal, T., Murray, R., Fossen, T.: Stabilization of integrator chains in the presence of magnitude and rate saturations: a gain scheduling approach. In: Proc. IEEE Control and Decision Conference, vol. 4, pp. 4404–4005 (1997)
- <span id="page-7-11"></span><span id="page-7-8"></span><span id="page-7-6"></span><span id="page-7-0"></span>27. Leonov, G.A.: Strange attractors and classical stability theory. St.Petersburg University Press, St.Petersburg (2008)
- <span id="page-7-5"></span>28. Leonov, G.A.: Effective methods for periodic oscillations search in dynamical systems. App. Math. & Mech. 74(1), 24–50 (2010)
- <span id="page-7-4"></span>29. Leonov, G.A., Andrievskii, B.R., Kuznetsov, N.V., Pogromskii, A.Y.: Aircraft control with anti-windup compensation. Differential equations 48(13), 1700–1720 (2012), doi:10.1134/S001226611213
- <span id="page-7-9"></span>30. Leonov, G.A., Bragin, V.O., Kuznetsov, N.V.: Algorithm for constructing counterexamples to the Kalman problem. Doklady Mathematics 82(1), 540–542 (2010), doi:10.1134/S1064562410040101
- 31. Leonov, G.A., Bragin, V.O., Kuznetsov, N.V.: On problems of Aizerman and Kalman. Vestnik St. Petersburg University. Mathematics 43(3), 148–162 (2010), doi:10.3103/S1063454110030052
- <span id="page-7-10"></span><span id="page-7-1"></span>32. Leonov, G.A., Kuznetsov, G.V.: Hidden attractors in dynamical systems. From hidden oscillations in Hilbert-Kolmogorov, Aizerman, and Kalman problems to hidden chaotic attractors in Chua circuits. International Journal of Bifurcation and Chaos 23(1), Art. no. 1330002 (2013), doi:10.1142/S0218127413300024
- <span id="page-7-3"></span>33. Leonov, G.A., Kuznetsov, G.V.: Hidden oscillations in drilling systems: torsional vibrations. Journal of Applied Nonlinear Dynamics 2(1), 83–94 (2013), doi:10.5890/JAND.2012.09.006
- <span id="page-7-7"></span>34. Leonov, G.A., Kuznetsov, N.V.: Computation of the first lyapunov quantity for the second-order dynamical system. IFAC Proceedings Volumes (IFAC-PapersOnline) 3, 87–89 (2007), doi:10.3182/20070829-3-RU-4912.00014
- <span id="page-7-12"></span>35. Leonov, G.A., Kuznetsov, N.V.: Time-varying linearization and the Perron effects. International Journal of Bifurcation and Chaos 17(4), 1079–1107 (2007), doi:10.1142/S0218127407017732
- <span id="page-7-13"></span>36. Leonov, G.A., Kuznetsov, N.V.: Limit cycles of quadratic systems with a perturbed weak focus of order 3 and a saddle equilibrium at infinity. Doklady Mathematics 82(2), 693–696 (2010), doi:10.1134/S1064562410050042
- 37. Leonov, G.A., Kuznetsov, N.V.: Algorithms for searching for hidden oscillations in the Aizerman and Kalman problems. Doklady Mathematics 84(1), 475–481 (2011), doi:10.1134/S1064562411040120
- 38. Leonov, G.A., Kuznetsov, N.V.: Analytical-numerical methods for investigation of hidden oscillations in nonlinear control systems. IFAC Proceedings Volumes (IFAC-PapersOnline) 18(1), 2494–2505 (2011), doi:10.3182/20110828-6-IT-1002.03315
- <span id="page-7-14"></span>39. Leonov, G.A., Kuznetsov, N.V.: Hidden oscillations in dynamical systems: 16 Hilbert's problem, Aizerman's and Kalman's conjectures, hidden attractors in Chua's circuits. Journal of Mathematical Sciences (in print, 2013)
- <span id="page-7-2"></span>40. Leonov, G.A., Kuznetsov, N.V.: Hidden oscillations in dynamical systems. from hidden oscillation in 16th hilbert, aizerman and kalman problems to hidden chaotic attractor in chua circuits. In: 2012 Fifth International Workshop on Chaos-Fractals Theories and Applications, IWCFTA, pp. XV–XVII (2013), doi:10.1109/IWCFTA.2012.8
- 41. Leonov, G.A., Kuznetsov, N.V.: Analytical-numerical methods for hidden attractors localization: the 16th Hilbert problem, Aizerman and Kalman conjectures, and Chua circuits. In: Numerical Methods for Differential Equations, Optimization, and Technological Problems, Computational Methods in Applied Sciences, vol. 27, part I, pp. 41–64. Springer (2013), doi:10.1007/978-94-007-5288-7 3
- 42. Leonov, G.A., Kuznetsov, N.V., Kudryashova, E.V.: Cycles of two-dimensional systems: Computer calculations, proofs, and experiments. Vestnik St.Petersburg University. Mathematics 41(3), 216–250 (2008), doi:10.3103/S1063454108030047
- <span id="page-8-12"></span><span id="page-8-11"></span><span id="page-8-9"></span><span id="page-8-1"></span>43. Leonov, G.A., Kuznetsov, N.V., Kudryashova, E.V.: A direct method for calculating Lyapunov quantities of two-dimensional dynamical systems. Proceedings of the Steklov Institute of Mathematics 272(suppl. 1), S119–S127 (2011), doi:10.1134/S008154381102009X
- <span id="page-8-10"></span><span id="page-8-6"></span>44. Leonov, G.A., Kuznetsov, N.V., Vagaitsev, V.I.: Localization of hidden Chua's attractors. Physics Letters A 375(23), 2230–2233 (2011), doi:10.1016/j.physleta.2011.04.037
- <span id="page-8-0"></span>45. Leonov, G.A., Kuznetsov, N.V., Vagaitsev, V.I.: Hidden attractor in smooth Chua systems. Physica D: Nonlinear Phenomena 241(18), 1482–1486 (2012), doi:10.1016/j.physd.2012.05.016
- <span id="page-8-8"></span><span id="page-8-4"></span>46. Li, J.: Hilberts 16-th problem and bifurcations of planar polynomial vector fields. International Journal of Bifurcation and Chaos 13(1), 47–106 (2003)
- <span id="page-8-7"></span>47. Lorenz, E.N.: Deterministic nonperiodic flow. J. Atmos. Sci. 20(2), 130–141 (1963)
- 48. Markus, L., Yamabe, H.: Global stability criteria for differential systems. Osaka Math. J. 12, 305–317 (1960)
- <span id="page-8-3"></span>49. Ott, E.: Application of the differential transformation method for the solution of the hyperchaotic Rossler system. Scholarpedia 1(8), 1701 (2006)
- 50. Poincaré, H.: Mémoire sur les courbes définies par les équations différentielles. Journal de Mathématiques 37, 375–422 (1881)
- <span id="page-8-2"></span>51. van der Pol, B.: On relaxation-oscillations. Philosophical Magazine and Journal of Science 7(2), 978–992 (1926)
- <span id="page-8-5"></span>52. Rossler, O.E.: An equation for continuous chaos. Physics Letters A 57(5), 397–398 (1976)
- <span id="page-8-16"></span>53. Stoker, J.J.: Nonlinear Vibrations in Mechanical and Electrical Systems. Interscience, N.Y (1950)
- <span id="page-8-15"></span>54. Strogatz, H.: Nonlinear Dynamics and Chaos. With Applications to Physics, Biology, Chemistry, and Engineering. Westview Press (1994)
- 55. Timoshenko, S.: Vibration Problems in Engineering. Van Nostrand, N.Y (1928)
- <span id="page-8-14"></span>56. Tricomi, F.: Integrazione di unequazione differenziale presentatasi in elettrotechnica. Annali della R. Shcuola Normale Superiore di Pisa 2(2), 1–20 (1933)
- 57. Ueda, Y., Akamatsu, N., Hayashi, C.: Computer simulations and non-periodic oscillations. Trans. IEICE Japan 56A(4), 218–255 (1973)
- 58. Wang, X., Chen, G.: A chaotic system with only one stable equilibrium. Commun Nonlinear Sci. Numer. Simulat. 17, 1264–1272 (2012)
- <span id="page-8-13"></span>59. Wang, X., Chen, G.: Constructing a chaotic system with any number of equilibria. Nonlinear Dyn. (2012), doi:10.1007/s11071-012-0669-7
- 60. Wei, Z.: Dynamical behaviors of a chaotic system with no equilibria. Physics Letters A 376, 102–108 (2011)
- 61. Wei, Z.: Complex dynamics of a new chaotic system without equilibria. In: 2012 Fifth International Workshop on Chaos-fractals Theories and Applications, pp. 79–82 (2012)
- 62. Wei, Z., Pehlivan, I.: Chaos, coexisting attractors, and circuit design of the generalized sprott c system with only two stable equilibria. Optoelectronics And Advanced Materials. Rapid Communications 6(7-8), 742–745 (2012)
- 63. Yang, Q., Wei, Z., Chen, G.: An unusual 3d autonomous quadratic chaotic system with two stable node-foci. International Journal of Bifurcation and Chaos 20(4), 1061–1083 (2010)