

# Strong Edge Coloring of Subquartic Graphs

Junlei Zhu<sup>1( $\boxtimes$ )</sup> and Hongguo Zhu<sup>2</sup>

 <sup>1</sup> College of Data Science, Jiaxing University, Jiaxing 314001, China zhujl-001@163.com
<sup>2</sup> Department of Mathematics, Zhejiang Normal University, Jinhua 321004, China

zhuhongguo@zjnu.edu.cn

**Abstract.** A strong k-edge coloring of a graph G is a mapping  $c : E(G) \to \{1, 2, 3, ..., k\}$  such that for any two edges e and e' with distance at most two,  $c(e) \neq c(e')$ . The strong chromatic index of G, written  $\chi'_s(G)$ , is the smallest integer k such that G has a strong k-edge coloring. In this paper, using color exchange method and discharging method, we prove that for a subquartic graph G,  $\chi'_s(G) \leq 11$  if  $mad(G) < \frac{8}{3}$ , where  $mad(G) = \max\{\frac{2|E(G)|}{|V(G)|}, H \subseteq G\}$ .

**Keywords:** subquartic graph  $\cdot$  strong edge coloring  $\cdot$  maximum average degree

# 1 Introduction

To solve the Channel Assignment Problem in wireless communication networks, Fouquet and Jolivet [8] first introduced the notion of strong edge coloring in 1983. A strong k-edge coloring of a graph G is a mapping  $c: E(G) \to \{1, 2, 3, \dots, k\}$ such that  $c(e) \neq c(e')$  for any two edges e and e' with distance at most two. The smallest integer k such that G has a strong k-edge coloring of G is called the strong chromatic index of G, written  $\chi'_s(G)$ . By greedy algorithm, it is easy to see that  $2\Delta^2 - 2\Delta + 1$  is a trivial upper bound on  $\chi'_s(G)$ , where  $\Delta$  is the maximum degree of G. However, it is NP-complete to decide wether  $\chi'_s(G) = k$  holds for a general graph G [14]. In 1989, Erdős and Nešetřil [7] proposed the following important conjecture while studying the strong edge coloring of graphs.

Conjecture 1. [7] For any graph G with maximum degree  $\Delta$ ,  $\chi'_s(G) \leq \frac{5}{4}\Delta^2$  if  $\Delta$  is even,  $\chi'_s(G) \leq \frac{5}{4}\Delta^2 - \frac{1}{2}\Delta + \frac{1}{4}$  if  $\Delta$  is odd.

In [7], Erdős and Nešetřil constructed two classes of graphs satisfying  $\chi'_s(G) = \chi'(G) = |E(G)|$  while |E(G)| attains the upper bound in Conjecture 1. This illustrate that the upper bound is sharp if Conjecture 1 is true. Also, they asked a question: For a general graph G, is there any positive number  $\varepsilon$  such that  $\chi'_s(G) \leq (2-\epsilon)\Delta^2$ , where  $\Delta$  is the maximum degree of G. As yet, there are many research results on strong edge coloring. For a graph G with sufficient large  $\Delta$ , Molloy

and Reed [15] proved that  $\chi'_s(G) \leq 1.998\Delta^2$  using probabilistic methods. In the next decides, this result was improved to  $1.93\Delta^2$  by Bruhn and Joos [4],  $1.835\Delta^2$ by Bonamy, Perrett and Postle [3]. For graphs with small  $\Delta$ , scholars also made a lot of research works. It is an obvious result that  $\chi'_s(G) \leq 5 = \frac{5}{4}\Delta^2$  while  $\Delta = 2$ . For subcubic graphs, the above conjecture was verified by Andersen [1], and independently by Horák, Qing, Trotter [10]. For subquartic graphs,  $\chi'_{s}(G) \leq$ 22 was proven by Cranston [6] using algorithms. Huang, Santana and Yu [11] reduced 22 to 21. For graphs with  $\Delta = 5$ , Zang [18] confirmed that  $\chi'_s(G) \leq 37$ .

For graphs with maximum average degree restriction, there are also a mount of results. The maximum average degree of a graph G, written mad(G), is the largest average degree of its subgraph. In other words,  $mad(G) = \max\{\frac{2|E(H)|}{|V(H)|}:$  $H \subseteq G$ . In 2013, Hocquard [9] studied the strong chromatic index of subcubic graphs with maximum average degree and obtained the following theorem.

**Theorem 1.** [9] Let G be a graph with  $\Delta(G) = 3$ .

(1) If  $mad(G) < \frac{7}{3}$ , then  $\chi'_s(G) \le 6$ ; (2) If  $mad(G) < \frac{5}{2}$ , then  $\chi'_s(G) \le 7$ ; (3) If  $mad(G) < \frac{8}{3}$ , then  $\chi'_s(G) \le 8$ ; (4) If  $mad(G) < \frac{20}{7}$ , then  $\chi'_s(G) \le 9$ .

The given upper bound on mad(G) in Theorem 1(1)(2)(4) is optimal since there exist subcubic graphs with  $mad(G) = \frac{7}{3}$  (or  $mad(G) = \frac{5}{2}, \frac{20}{7}$ ) and  $\chi'_s(G) > 1$ 6 (or  $\chi'_s(G) > 7, 9$ ), see Fig. 1.



**Fig. 1.**  $mad(G) = \frac{7}{3}$  (or  $\frac{5}{2}, \frac{20}{7}$ ) and  $\chi'_s(G) = 7$  (or  $\chi'_s(G) = 8, 10$ )

For subquartic graphs with bounded maximum average degree, Lv et al. [13] gave out the following theorem, which improved the corresponding upper bound on mad(G) due to Bensmail et al. [2].

**Theorem 2.** [13] Let G be a graph with  $\Delta(G) = 4$ .

- $\begin{array}{ll} (1) \ \ If\ mad(G) < \frac{61}{18},\ then\ \chi_s'(G) \leq 16;\\ (2) \ \ If\ mad(G) < \frac{7}{2},\ then\ \chi_s'(G) \leq 17;\\ (3) \ \ If\ mad(G) < \frac{18}{5},\ then\ \chi_s'(G) \leq 18;\\ (4) \ \ If\ mad(G) < \frac{26}{7},\ then\ \chi_s'(G) \leq 19;\\ (5) \ \ If\ mad(G) < \frac{51}{13},\ then\ \chi_s'(G) \leq 20. \end{array}$

Ruksasakchai and Wang [17] studied the strong edge coloring of graphs with  $\Delta(G) \leq 4$  and mad(G) < 3 and obtained the following theorem.

**Theorem 3.** [17] If G is a graphs G with maximum degree  $\Delta \leq 4$  and mad(G) < 3, then  $\chi'_s(G) \leq 3\Delta + 1$ .

For graphs with maximum degree 5 and bounded maximum average degree, Qin et al. [16] obtained the following theorem.

**Theorem 4.** [16] Let G be a graph with  $\Delta(G) = 5$ .

(1) If  $mad(G) < \frac{8}{3}$ , then  $\chi'_s(G) \le 13$ ; (2) If  $mad(G) < \frac{14}{5}$ , then  $\chi'_s(G) \le 14$ .

Additionally, Choi et al. [5] studied the strong edge coloring of graphs with maximum degree  $\Delta \geq 7$  and bounded maximum average degree. They obtained a theorem as follows.

**Theorem 5.** [5] Let G be a graph with maximum degree  $\Delta$ .

(1) If  $\Delta \geq 9$  and  $mad(G) < \frac{8}{3}$ , then  $\chi'_s(G) \leq 3\Delta - 3$ ; (2) If  $\Delta \geq 7$  and mad(G) < 3, then  $\chi'_s(G) \leq 3\Delta$ .

Recently, Li et al. [12] studied the strong edge coloring of graphs with maximum degree  $\Delta \geq 6$  and bounded maximum average degree. The following theorem is given in [12].

**Theorem 6.** [12] Let G be a graph with maximum degree  $\Delta$ .

(1) If  $\Delta \geq 6$  and  $mad(G) < \frac{23}{8}$ , then  $\chi'_s(G) \leq 3\Delta - 1$ ; (2) If  $\Delta \geq 7$  and  $mad(G) < \frac{26}{9}$ , then  $\chi'_s(G) \leq 3\Delta - 1$ .

In this paper, we further consider the strong edge coloring of subquartic graphs by using color exchange method and discharging method. We obtained the following theorem.

**Theorem 7.** If G is a graph with  $\Delta(G) = 4$  and  $mad(G) < \frac{8}{3}$ , then  $\chi'_s(G) \le 11$ .



Fig. 2. Subquartic graphs.

 $G_1, G_2, G_3$  in Fig. 2 are subquartic graphs, where  $mad(G_1) = \frac{8}{3}$ ,  $\chi'_s(G_1) = 10$ ;  $mad(G_2) = \frac{20}{7}$ ,  $\chi'_s(G_2) = 11$  and  $mad(G_3) = 3$ ,  $\chi'_s(G_3) = 12$  (we can take the graph obtained from  $G_1$  by deleting two 1-vertices,  $G_2$  by deleting the 1-vertex

and  $G_3$  as subgraphs, respectively). We do not know whether the upper bound  $mad(G) < \frac{8}{3}$  in Theorem 7 is optimal. However, due to the graph  $G_3$  in Fig. 2, we know that there exists a graph G with  $\Delta(G) = 4$ , mad(G) = 3 and  $\chi'_s(G) = 12$ .

For the strong edge coloring of subquartic graphs, Theorem 2 gives out some sufficient conditions for  $\chi'_s(G) \leq 16$  (respectively 17,18,19,20). Theorem 3 indicates that any graph G with  $\Delta(G) = 4$  and mad(G) < 3 satisfies  $\chi'_s(G) \leq 13$ . Therefore, Theorem 7 enriches the results of strong edge coloring for subquartic graphs.

# 2 Notations

All graphs considered here are finite undirected simple graphs. For a graph G, V(G), E(G),  $\Delta(G)$  and  $\delta(G)$  denote its vertex set, edge set, maximum degree and minimum degree respectively. For  $v \in V(G)$ ,  $d_G(v)$  (abbreviated by d(v)) denotes the degree of v in G. v is a i (or  $i^+$ ,  $i^-$ )-vertex if d(v) = i (or  $d(v) \ge i$ ,  $d(v) \le i$ ). For a vertex v, a i-neighbor of v is a i-vertex in N(v). A  $i_j$ -vertex is a i-vertex adjacent to exactly j 2-vertices. A 2-vertex is bad if it is adjacent to a 2-vertex, semi-bad if it is adjacent to a 32-vertex. A 2-vertex is good if it is neither bad nor semi-bad. For an edge e, F(e) denotes the set of forbidden colors for it.

### 3 Proof of Theorem 7

Suppose G is a counterexample with minimum  $2^+$ -vertices and then with minimum edges. Let H be the graph obtained from G by deleting all 1-vertices. Obviously,  $H \subseteq G$  and then  $mad(H) \leq mad(G) < \frac{8}{3}$ . In the following, we first illustrate some properties of H.

Lemma 1. *H* does not have vertices of degree 1.

Proof. Suppose v is a 1-vertex in H and  $uv \in E(H)$ . Since H is the graph obtained from obtained from G by deleting all 1-vertices,  $d_G(v) > 1$  and v has at least one 1-neighbor  $v_1$  in G. Compared with G,  $G - v_1$  has the same 2<sup>+</sup>-vertices but fewer edges. By the minimality of G,  $\chi'_s(G - v_1) \leq 11$ . Note that in G,  $|F(vv_1)| \leq 6$ . Thus,  $vv_1$  can be colored, which leads to a contradiction.

**Lemma 2.** If  $d_H(v) = 2$ , then  $d_G(v) = 2$ .

*Proof.* Suppose  $d_G(v) > 2$ . Then, v has at least one 1-neighbor  $v_1$  in G. Compared with G,  $G - v_1$  has fewer edges while the same 2<sup>+</sup>-vertices. By the minimality of G,  $\chi'_s(G - v_1) \leq 11$ . Note that in G,  $|F(vv_1)| \leq 9$ . Thus,  $vv_1$  can be colored, which leads to a contradiction.

**Lemma 3.** If v is a  $3_i$ -vertex in H, where  $i \ge 1$ , then  $d_G(v) = 3$ .

Proof. Suppose  $d_G(v) > 3$ . Then, v has at least one 1-neighbor v' in G. Let  $v_1$  be a 2-neighbor of v in H, By Lemma 2,  $d_G(v_1) = 2$ . Let G' = G - v'. Compared with G, G' has the same 2<sup>+</sup>-vertices but fewer edges. By the minimality of G,  $\chi'_s(G-v_1) \leq 11$ . Note that in G,  $|F(vv')| \leq 10$ . Thus, vv' can be colored, which leads to a contradiction.

#### **Lemma 4.** Every bad vertex in H is adjacent to a 4-vertex.

Proof. Suppose v is a bad vertex in H and it is adjacent to a 2-vertex u and a 3<sup>-</sup>-vertex w. By Lemma 2,  $d_G(u) = d_G(v) = 2$ . Denote  $N_G(u) = \{u_1, v\}$ . Note that  $2 \leq d_H(w) \leq 3$ . If  $d_H(w) = 2$ , then  $d_G(w) = 2$  by Lemma 2. If  $d_H(w) = 3$ , then by Lemma 3,  $d_G(w) = 3$  since  $d_H(v) = 2$ . Let  $G' = G - uv + ww_1$ , where  $ww_1$  is a pendent edge incident with w. Note that  $3 \leq d_{G'}(w) \leq 4$  and G' has fewer 2<sup>+</sup>-vertices than G. By the definition of maximum average degree, mad(G') < 2 if mad(G) < 2 and  $mad(G') \leq mad(G) < \frac{8}{3}$  if  $2 \leq mad(G) < \frac{8}{3}$ . By the minimality of G,  $\chi'_s(G') \leq 11$ . Let c be a strong 11-edge coloring of G'. Note that in G,  $|F(uv)| \leq 8$ . If  $c(uu_1) \neq c(vw)$ , then uv can be colored, which is a contradiction. If  $c(uu_1) = c(vw)$ , then we first exchange the colors on pendant edges wv and  $ww_1$  in G'. After that, uv can be colored, which leads to a contradiction.

#### **Lemma 5.** H does not have $3_3$ -vertices.

*Proof.* Suppose v is a 3<sub>3</sub>-vertex in H and  $N_H(v) = \{v_1, v_2, v_3\}$ . By Lemma 2,  $d_G(v_i) = 2, i = 1, 2, 3$ . By Lemma 3,  $d_G(v) = 3$ . Let G' = G - v. Note that G' has fewer 2<sup>+</sup>-vertices than G. By the minimality of G,  $\chi'_s(G') \leq 11$ . Note that in G,  $|F(vv_i)| \leq 6, i = 1, 2, 3, vv_i$  can be colored, which is a contradiction.

#### **Lemma 6.** Every semi-bad vertex in H is adjacent to a 4-vertex.

*Proof.* Suppose v is a semi-bad vertex in H and it is adjacent to a 3<sub>2</sub>-vertex u and a 3<sup>-</sup>-vertex w. Let  $N_H(u) = \{u_1, u_2, v\}$ , where  $d_H(u_1) = 2$  (see Fig. 3). By Lemma 2,  $d_G(u_1) = d_G(v) = 2$ . By Lemma 3,  $d_G(u) = 3$ . Note that  $2 \leq d_H(w) \leq 3$  and  $d_H(v) = 2$ , we have  $d_G(w) = d_H(w)$  by Lemma 2 and Lemma 3. Let  $G' = G - uv + ww_1$ , where  $ww_1$  is a pendant edge incident with w. Note that G' has fewer 2<sup>+</sup>-vertices than G, by the definition of maximum average degree, mad(G') < 2 if mad(G) < 2 and  $mad(G') \leq mad(G) < \frac{8}{3}$  if  $2 \leq mad(G) < \frac{8}{3}$ . By



the minimality of G,  $\chi'_s(G') \leq 11$ . Let c be a strong 11-edge coloring of G'. Erase on color on  $uu_1$ . Note that in G,  $|F(uu_1)| \leq 9$ ,  $|F(uv)| \leq 9$ . If  $c(uu_2) \neq c(vw)$ , then  $uu_1, uv$  can be colored, which is a contradiction. If  $c(uu_2) = c(vw)$ , then we first exchange the colors on pendant edges wv and  $ww_1$  in G'. After that,  $uu_1$  and uv can be colored, which leads to a contradiction.

**Lemma 7.** Let v be a  $4_i$ -vertex in H, where  $i \ge 3$ . Then its 2-neighbors are all good vertices.

*Proof.* Suppose that  $v_1, v_2, v_3$  are 2-neighbors of v and at least one of them is not good. Without loss of generality, we assume that  $v_1$  is not a good vertex. This implies that  $v_1$  is adjacent to a 2-vertex or a 3<sub>2</sub>-vertex.

If  $v_1$  is adjacent to a 2-vertex u (see Fig. 4), then by Lemma 2,  $d_G(v_i) = d_G(u) = 2$ , i = 1, 2, 3. Let  $G' = G - v_1$ . Note that G' has fewer 2<sup>+</sup>-vertices than G. By the minimality of G,  $\chi'_s(G') \leq 11$ . Note that in G,  $|F(uv_1)| \leq 7$ ,  $|F(vv_1)| \leq 9$ ,  $uv_1, vv_1$  can be colored, which is a contradiction.

If  $v_1$  is adjacent to a 3<sub>2</sub>-vertex  $v'_1$  and  $u \neq v_1$  is the other 2-neighbor of  $v'_1$  (see Fig. 5). By Lemma 2,  $d_G(v_i) = d_G(u) = 2$ , i = 1, 2, 3. By Lemma 3,  $d_G(v'_1) = 3$ . Let  $G' = G - v_1$ . Note that  $G - v_1$  has fewer 2<sup>+</sup>-vertices than G. By the minimality of G,  $\chi'_s(G') \leq 11$ . Note that in G,  $|F(v_1v'_1)| \leq 9$ ,  $|F(vv_1)| \leq 10$ . Thus,  $vv_1, v_1v'_1$  can be colored in order, which is a contradiction.

**Proof of Theorem 7**: We define weight function w(v) = d(v) for each  $v \in V(H)$  and we define five discharging rules R1-R5 as follows. Let w'(v) be the final weight function while discharging finished. As we know, the sum weigh is fixed. However, we shall prove that  $w'(v) \geq \frac{8}{3}$  for each  $v \in V(H)$ . This will lead to a contradiction as follow.

$$\frac{8}{3}|V(H)| \le \sum_{v \in V(H)} w'(v) = \sum_{v \in V(H)} w(v) \le mad(H)|V(H)| < \frac{8}{3}|V(H)|.$$

### **Discharging Rules:**

**R1** Each 4-vertex gives  $\frac{2}{3}$  to each adjacent bad vertex. **R2** Each 4-vertex gives  $\frac{1}{2}$  to each adjacent semi-bad vertex. **R3** Each 4-vertex gives  $\frac{1}{3}$  to each adjacent good vertex. **R4** Each 3<sub>2</sub>-vertex gives  $\frac{1}{6}$  to each adjacent semi-bad vertex. **R5** Each 3<sub>1</sub>-vertex gives  $\frac{1}{3}$  to each adjacent good vertex.

In the following, we shall verify that  $w'(v) \ge \frac{8}{3}$  for each  $v \in V(H)$ . By Lemma 1,  $\delta(H) \ge 2$ .

• 
$$d(v) = 2$$

If v is bad, then by Lemma 4, v is adjacent to a 4-vertex. By R1,  $w'(v) = 2 + \frac{2}{3} = \frac{8}{3}$ .

If v is semi-bad, then by Lemma 6, v is adjacent to a 4-vertex. By R2 and R4,  $w'(v) = 2 + \frac{1}{2} + \frac{1}{6} = \frac{8}{3}$ .

If v is good, then by the definition of good vertex and Lemma 5, each neighbor of v is either  $3_1$ -vertex or 4-vertex. By R3 and R5,  $w'(v) = 2 + \frac{1}{3} \times 2 = \frac{8}{3}$ .

• d(v) = 3

By Lemma 5, v is  $3_i$ -vertex, where  $0 \le i \le 2$ . If v is a  $3_2$ -vertex, then by R4,  $w'(v) \ge 3 - \frac{1}{6} \times 2 = \frac{8}{3}$ . If v is a  $3_1$ -vertex, then by R5,  $w'(v) \ge 3 - \frac{1}{3} = \frac{8}{3}$ . If v is a  $3_0$ -vertex, then w'(v) = w(v) = 3.

• d(v) = 4

If v is a 4<sub>i</sub>-vertex, where  $i \ge 3$ , then by Lemma 7, the 2-neighbors of v are good. Thus,  $w'(v) \ge 4 - \frac{1}{3} \times 4 = \frac{8}{3}$  by R3.

If v is a  $4_i$ -vertex, where  $0 \le i \le 2$ , then by R1-R3,  $w'(v) \ge 4 - \frac{2}{3} \times 2 = \frac{8}{3}$ . Therefore, for each  $v \in V(H)$ ,  $w'(v) \ge \frac{8}{3}$  and the proof of Theorem 7 is finished.

### 4 Further Considered Problems

Theorem 7 illustrates that  $\chi'_s(G) \leq 11$  holds for any graph G with  $\Delta(G) = 4$ and  $mad(G) < \frac{8}{3}$ . For the graph  $G_3$  in Fig. 2, it satisfies that  $\Delta(G_3) = 4$ ,  $mad(G_3) = 3$  and  $\chi'_s(G_3) = 12$ . Then a question follows out naturally. What is the supremum M such that any graph G with  $\Delta(G) = 4$  and mad(G) < Msatisfying  $\chi'_s(G) \leq 11$ ?

Acknowledgement. This research was supported by National Natural Science Foundation of China under Grant Nos. 11901243, 12201569 and Qin Shen Program of Jiaxing University.

**Declaration of Competing Interest.** We declare that we have no conflicts of interest to this work. We also declare that we do not have any commercial or associative interest that represents a conflict of interest in connection with the work submitted.

### References

- 1. Andersen, L.D.: The strong chromatic index of a cubic graph is at most 10. Discrete Math. **108**(1–3), 231–252 (1992)
- Bensmail, J., Bonamy, M., Hocquard, H.: Strong edge coloring sparse graphs. Electron. Note Discrete Math. 49, 773–778 (2015)
- Bonamy, M., Perrett, T., Postle, L.: Colouring graphs with sparse neighbourhoods: bounds and applications. J. Combin. Theory Ser. B 155, 278–317 (2022)
- Bruhn, H., Joos, F.: A strong bound for the strong chromatic index. Combin. Probab. Comput. 27(1), 21–43 (2018)
- Choi, I., Kim, J., Kostochka, A.V., Raspaud, A.: Strong edge-colorings of sparse graphs with large maximum degree. European J. Combin. 67, 21–39 (2018)
- 6. Cranston, D.W.: A strong bound edge-colouring of graphs with maximum degree 4 using 22 colours. Discrete Math. **306**, 2772–2778 (2006)
- Erdős, P., Nešetřil, J., Halász, G.: Irregularities of Partitions, pp. 161–349. Springer, Berlin (1989). https://doi.org/10.1007/978-3-642-61324-1

- Fouquet, J.L., Jolivet, J.L.: Strong edge-colorings of graphs and applications to multi-k-gons. Ars Combin. 16, 141–150 (1983)
- Hocquard, H., Montassier, M., Raspaud, A., Valicov, P.: On strong edge-colouring of subcubic graphs. Discrete Appl. Math. 161(16–17), 2467–2479 (2013)
- Horák, P., Qing, H., Trotter, W.T.: Induced matching in cubic graphs. J. Graph Theory 17(2), 151–160 (1993)
- Huang, M.F., Santana, M., Yu, G.X.: Strong chromatic index of graphs with maximum degree four. Electron. J. Combin. 25(3), 3–31 (2018)
- 12. Li, X.W., Li, Y.F., Lv, J.B., Wang, T.: Strong edge-colorings of sparse graphs with  $3\Delta 1$  colors. Inform. Process. Lett. **179**, 106313 (2023)
- Lv, J.B., Li, X.W., Yu, G.X.: On strong edge-coloring of graphs with maximum degree 4. Discrete Appl. Math. 235, 142–153 (2018)
- 14. Mahdian, M.: On the computational complexity of strong edge-coloring. Discrete Appl. Math. **118**(3), 239–248 (2002)
- Molloy, M., Reed, B.: A bound on the strong chromatic index of a graph. J. Combin. Theory Ser. B 69(2), 103–109 (1997)
- Qin, L.Z., Lv, J.B., Li, J.X.: Strong edge-coloring of some sparse graphs. Adv. Math. (China) 51(1), 41–52 (2022)
- Ruksasakchai, W., Wang, T.: List strong edge coloring of some classes of graphs. Australas. J. Combin. 68, 106–117 (2017)
- 18. Zang C.Y.: The strong chromatic index of graphs with maximum degree  $\Delta$ . arXiV1510.00785vl (2015)