The Wisdom of Narrative Inquiry: An Unfolding Story

Liora Bresler

We are narrative beings. Narratives are part of the human psyche, manifested in cave paintings and on canvases, in ancient and contemporary (even academic) rituals, in myths, testaments and tv shows. Recently, social scientists have begun to acknowledge the narrative nature of our understanding of reality. Optimally, listening to stories enables a sense of connection, reducing "otherness." However, it's useful to remember that narratives can empower or suppress, expand perception or solidify stereotypes of "the other." The ultimate task of education is discernment about which narratives are conducive to wisdom and skillful action. One important individual and communal task is to seek and include voices that have been alienated. In this bridge-chapter I consider some of the rhizomatic roots and intellectual traditions of narrative inquiry. I reflect on emerging directions exemplified in this volume, including the juxtaposition of musical, visual, dramatic and written narratives, aiming to lead to deepened knowledge and educational practice.

1 Tracing Roots and Nested Communities

Acknowledging intellectual roots is an integral aspect of scholarship, recognizing the "shoulders of giants we stand upon." A more intricate metaphor that captures the interconnected experience of the academic endeavor is offered by Buddhist scholar and practitioner Stephen Batchelor: "The human world is like a vast musical instrument on which we simultaneously play our part while listening to the compositions

L. Bresler (✉)
College of Education, University of Illinois, Urbana-Champaign, Champaign, IL, USA
e-mail: liora@illinois.edu

of others." (Batchelor 1997, p. 106). Resonant with my own personal experience of academe, this is relevant for the community of narrative inquirers, clearly reflected in the broad range of references for each chapter. Beyond bibliography, the "simultaneous play" extends to an elaborate network of relationships and influences, many of them implicit but powerful. My discussion of intellectual communities and recent confluences aims to glimpse broad ideas and representative voices rather than attempting to be comprehensive.

The origins of narrative and inquiry reach back long before formal academic knowledge, we trace narrative and inquiry to the age-old human longing to express and comprehend life experiences through the creation of narratives via dance, visual arts, music, drama and language. The Enlightenment, itself a narrative of progress and rationality coinciding with the "grand narratives" of national states, brought with it an attempt to break free, through scientific methodology, from a history confined by dogma, myth and magic. This methodology reflected not only what it was seeking but also what it was reacting against (Stinson 2016, 144). Cognition and emotion, inner and outer realities, were firmly separated to distinguish the world of truth, supported by objective proofs, from contamination by the world of mysticism, tradition, feelings and intuition. Scientific methodology was designed to keep the inner world as removed as possible from the "real world" (Stinson 2016, 144).

During the last century, formal inquiry in the social sciences has gradually (though not always sequentially) connected the inner and the outer, discipline by discipline. Narrative has functioned as an important aspect of this process. Systematic inquiry, essential to scholarship, addresses the criteria that were missing in pre-positivist eras (Lincoln and Guba 1985). Arts-based research (ABR) is a recent part of that reconnection, aiming to reposition academic knowledge with a broader understanding of perception, exploration and communication, strengthening the link between the oral and the written.

More immediately, this volume was generated by the 2018 conference of the *Narrative Inquiry in Music Education* (NIME6), a well-orchestrated feast of ideas and music. This event, as noted by the editors, is an outgrowth of the community of narrative inquiry in music education, established in 2006 by Margaret Barrett and Sandy Stauffer in Arizona. Traveling across the globe, each conference has been shaped by the visions of its respective creators: global perspectives by Heidi Westerlund (NIME4), alternative forms of communication by Jeananne Nichols and Wesley Brewer (NIME5), and "seldom heard voices" by Tawnya Smith and Karin Hendricks (NIME6).

The focus on seldom heard voices has been the mission of cultural anthropology from its start in late nineteenth century, focusing on faraway locations. An accessible narrative style used by some early pivotal anthropologists (e.g., Malinowski 1922; Mead 1928) made their work a harbinger. In folklore, stories have been the material of many researchers as part of the European nationalistic movements in the nineteenth century (Toelken 1996). Historical research in the nineteenth century,

part of the humanities, took narrative forms,[1] halted by the introduction of "quasi scientific" history in the late nineteenth century that eroded the close association of historical with literary writing (Bridges 2003, 105–107), thus moving towards the social sciences (themselves a hybrid between the physical sciences and the humanities.) The "porous citizenries" of history, folklore, psychology, sociology, and education, among other disciplines included in social sciences and humanities, revolve around the meaning and practice of narrative inquiry.[2]

In the field of literary criticism, one academic concept of narrative theory was initially outlined in Northrop Frye's discussion of narrative structure (Frye 1957), designating an outer, objective reality, and anticipating the "Grande Idée of narrative" in academe (Bresler 2006). The rise of French literary theorists, including Roland Barthes, and anthropologist Claude Levi-Strauss (1955) generated influential, widely read studies of narrative structure during the 1960s (Carr 1986). Migrating from folklore, literary criticism, and mythology studies into the discipline of history, narrative—initially co-existing with modernist, structuralist, and formalist ideologies—branched out to become a key force driving postmodernism. In the mid 1960s, the work of philosophers of history Arthur Danto, W. B. Gallie, and Morton White argued for the role of narrative in history, generating lively arguments among philosophers and historians who criticized overly literary views of a discipline that had aspired to be scientific and objective (Carr 1986, 9). Hayden White's 1973 publication *Metahistory* maintained that "narrativism" had become the dominant perspective in discussing the nature of historical discourse (Bridges 2003, 105–107), and anthropologist (and former journalist) Clifford Geertz made the startling claim that all anthropological writing is fiction—"something made" (Geertz 1973, p. 15). These were landmarks for narrative, sensitizing the scholarly world to its writing conventions and opening the field to alternative possibilities.

The shift from modern to postmodern, from objective to constructed realities, meant that cultural and personal perspectives were regarded as constituting multiple social realities. This multiplicity was recognized to exist not only across, but also *within,* cultural communities. The turn to a constructivist worldview meant that we can no longer assume we know what reality is for others. In anthropology, attention to seldom heard voices increasingly focused on "home" settings: for example, the stories of the old and marginalized (Myerhoff 1978) and of the homeless (Duneier 1999) in the USA. Whether in remote places or at home, research studies involved in-depth, open-ended interviews along with extensive observations to learn about insiders' perspectives. Still, the communication of this work was typically formal and "authorial" (Barone 2001). The old conventions of impersonal, "objectivist" writing took time to erode. In her chapter "The anthropologist as a story teller" cultural anthropologist Alma Gottlieb (2016) discusses the formal writing style traditionally expected in her field, where personal narratives were regarded as obstacles

---

[1] Going back to the Greeks and the works of Herodotus, "The father of history," and Thucydides' participant-observation narratives.

[2] The social-science-versus-humanities debate is still going strong in qualitative research and in the Artistic Research genre.

to credibility (and promotion): until recently, anthropologists might have used narratives as an anecdotal part of lectures and informal conversations but typically not in scholarly books and papers.

The social upheavals that shook the social science disciplines in the 1960s—the civil rights and feminist movements, political challenges to the Vietnam War, and awareness of minority perspectives and values—affected educational research too. The recognition that we know too little about the educational experiences of children "not making it" prompted many researchers to turn to anthropology with its frequent focus on marginalized communities and long-term, qualitative research methods. The emergent attention to cultures of schooling highlighted schools as systems of discipline (cf. Dreeben 1968; Foucault 1977; Henry 1966). Classroom observations and interviews with research participants brought attention to the hidden (Jackson 1968), the implicit (Eisner 1979), and the experienced (Goodlad et al. 1979) curricula. In general education (but *not* music education, not yet!), the qualitative emphasis on understanding a perspective of multiple voices challenged the idea that the views of those in mainstream power were the only ones worth listening to.

2   Narrative Inquiry in Music Education

Music education, characterized by largely quantitative methods for most of the twentieth century, opened up (cautiously) to qualitative and narrative research in the early 1990s. During the first Qualitative Research in Music Education Conference in May 1994, we discovered a sense of community and shared interest that we did not know existed, since qualitatively oriented papers were rarely published in the field. The *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education* (CRME), the first North-American journal in the field to dedicate a special issue to qualitative research (Bresler 1994), included a body of qualitative papers. Following methodologies and procedures of narrative inquiry (though not yet *labeled* as such) was a vital component of many of these papers. In that CRME issue, for example, conference keynoter Norman Denzin discussed interpretation as storytelling: "The story telling self that is presented is always one attached to an interpretive perspective… that gives the writer a public persona." Denzin identified four paradigms (positivist, postpositivist, constructivist and critical) and three major perspectives (feminist, ethnic, and cultural) that structure qualitative writing, shaping the stories that qualitative researchers tell one another. These paradigmatic perspectives, Denzin suggested, "are masks that are hidden behind, put on, and taken off as writers write their particular storied and self-versions of a feminist, gay-lesbian, Afro-American, Hispanic, grounded theory or interactionist text. They give the writer a public identity" (Denzin 1994, pp. 22–23).

Another keynoter, Alan Peshkin, focused on researchers' subjectivities as shaping their narratives. He alluded to anthropologist Robert Redfield, who compared his own study of Tepotzlan, a village in Mexico, to a narrative about the very same

village by Oscar Lewis, tracing these different narratives to the personal interests and implicit questions of the researchers (Peshkin 1994). Peshkin's autoethnographic reflections (practiced long before autoethnography received its name and became a legitimate form of scholarship) on his subjectivities in diverse research projects is itself a compelling narrative that invites readers to experience and identify their own positionalities.

In that volume, keynoter Robert Stake referred to "narratives of music classrooms" (Stake 1994, p. 33) discussing constructed knowledge, interpretation, and vicarious experiential knowing. Creating rich, complex narratives in both his conference talk and paper, Stake included visual images by Rene Magritte, who used unexpected juxtapositions of recognizable images, drawing our attention to artists' narratives, and their role as interpreters.

Studies of narrative inquiry by music educators in the conference illuminated voices that were not attended to before, including Margaret Schmidt's "Defining good music teaching: Four student teachers' beliefs and practices" (Schmidt 1994); Joyce Gromko's "In a child's voice: An interpretive interaction with young composers" (Gromko 1994); and Jackie Wiggins's "Teacher research in a general music classroom" (Wiggins 1994). Wiggins, for example, shares her own narrative as a teacher-researcher in one of her fifth-grade general music classes, focusing on the musical experiences of two children and their peers. She reflects on the profound effect of her study on her conceptions of teaching and learning, noting common skills required of her as both researcher and teacher, as well as the need to separate herself from the situation in data analysis and interpretation (Wiggins 1994).

The investigation of narratives centering on musical experiences and the role of music in people's lives was informed by research in neighboring disciplines. Adopting sociological perspectives, Susan Crafts, Daniel Cavicchi, and Charles Keil conducted "open-ended, nondirected, ethnographic interviews" (Crafts et al. 1993, p. 212) with 41 people with diverse tastes and backgrounds, from 4-year old Heather to 83-year old Samuel, centering on how they used and enjoyed music in their own lives. This study assumed that "each person is unique. Like your fingerprints, your signature, and your voice, your choices of music and the ways you relate to music are plural and interconnected in a pattern that is all yours, an 'idioculture' in sound" (Crafts et al. 1993, p. 2). Indeed, the authors found that as creators and receivers, performers and listeners, people's musical tastes and interests reveal far more complexity and more self-directed searching, testing, and experimenting than either music schools or commercial market categories can account for. The narratives "reveal the importance of time, place, and circumstance in shaping the social meaning of musical practices" (Crafts et al. 1993, xiii).

Similarly, Swedish psychologist Alf Gabrielsson (2011) focused throughout a period of 20 years (starting from the 1980s) on narratives of almost 1000 men and women, musicians and non-musicians, mostly Swedish, ranging in age from their teens to their 80s, with distinct musical tastes and preferences, presenting their narratives about their strong musical experience.

Clearly, the search for disregarded voices is not something that is finished once and for all but is, like the horizon, ever expanding. In this process, blind spots

(Wagner 1993) become blank spots that need refinement and nuanced investigation. One of the important contributions of this book and the 2018 conference on which it is based is the broad array of musical genres, ranging from jazz (Goodrich & Kelly), classical piano (Fretheim), band (Mota), and ukulele (Giotta), to popular (Lewis) and school music (Cronenberg, Sieger), involving different cultural backgrounds and periods (including Graça Mota's study of dictatorship-era Portugal), venues, sets of etiquettes and listening styles.

2.1 Listening for Narratives: Lessons from Music

The focus of narrative inquiry on *participants'* voices implies a particular kind of listening, one that is attuned and attentive. There are plenty of books with thoughtful guidelines on how to interview. *Listening in interviews,* however, is not the type of knowledge that can be transmitted through books. An experiential activity, listening to narrative is embodied, cultivated and improvised. The notion of listening in diverse art forms (visual, kinesthetic) as I discuss below, implies a way of "being with" beyond the auditory.

Early in my career, I grappled with ways in which being a musician informed my research. Listening came up as a key lesson. Listening to "musical" qualities of classrooms, including dynamic form, rhythm and counter-point created a narrative organized around musical dimensions (Bresler and Stake 1992). Listening as key to understanding marginalized voices was manifested when I "shadowed" two high-schoolers in urban San Francisco: one of Vietnamese origin, the other, African-American. The expressivity conveyed in the music of their spoken language, as well as the soundscape of their homes, gave me a glimpse into their experiences as adolescents navigating schooling. Just as in music, intonation, texture, pace, dynamics and silence were crucial for meaning-making. Later, my awareness of the centrality of non-verbal aspects of inquiry prompted me, in my role as research-educator, to design classroom experiences that involved music and sound[3] (Bresler 2014) as well as other artistic experiences grounded in resonance, including both consonance and dissonance (Bresler 2013, 2018a, b).

Listening in narrative inquiry is a process that is attuned and open-ended rather than directive and category-driven: it is reminiscent of chamber musicians tuning in to each other and to the music. In this present volume, authors reflect on what we mean when we talk about listening: How do children listen? How do we listen to our participants, *with* them and *to* them? What challenges does listening present? (Hubbard, Huber, Powell, Lewis, this volume) While the closeness of listening has been addressed wisely as an important anti-dote to an aloof, objectivist stance, I suggest that qualitative research is well served by an *interplay* of distances,

---

[3] Including my own playing on the piano to illustrate musical qualities in research.

alternating close *and* far (Bresler 2013), responding to the interpretive, issue-oriented nature of scholarship.

3   Narrative Inquiry and the Arts

A critical contribution of this book is its expansion of the scope of narrative inquiry to include musical, visual and dramatic forms of representation, connecting narrative with arts-based research, as exemplified in the work of Dearden & Dearden, Eidsaa, Fretheim, Goodrich & Kelly, Huber, Kent, Schei, and Smith & Doherty (this volume), with some overlap with the "differently traditioned" mediated qualitative scholarship, discussed by Jorgensen (this volume).

"Narrative" is an open term. A widespread interpretation equates narrative with articulated personal meaning, not limited to language. Cultural psychologist Jerome Bruner described narrative as a mode of thinking and a structure for organizing knowledge (Bruner 1996, p. 90). Identifying two basic forms of human cognition—the logico-scientific and the narrative—Bruner argued that "the great works of fiction that transform narrative into an art form come closest to revealing 'purely' the deep structure of the narrative mode of expression" (Bruner 1986, p. 15). Following Bruner, educational researcher Tom Barone suggests that narrative texts are designed to do what good art does so well, which is (quoting novelist James Baldwin) the "laying bare of questions which have been hidden by the answers" (Barone 2001, p. 154).

Barone alludes to philosopher Ludwig Wittgenstein, who argued that "language devices are tools for constructing views of reality. When we employ alternative languages, we are moving to alter that reality" (Barone 2001, p. 160). The inclusion of visual, kinesthetic and musical languages along with verbal languages expands our ability to understand complex realities. Below, I discuss two routes connecting narrative inquiry to the arts, both closely related to the mission and vision of this book: 1. Inquiry into children's narratives through visual art, dance and music combined with language, and 2. Narrative and arts-based inquiry (ABR.)

3.1   Children's Narrative in Various Forms of Representation

The recognition that young children's artistic creations express richness of meaning was understood early on, exemplified, for example, in the remarkable pedagogical work of art educator Freidl Dicker-Brandeis, who taught in the Theresienstadt concentration camp, or in the writing of Victor Lowenfeld (1947), whose compelling advocacy for children's expressive art shaped the field of art education for decades. With important exceptions, however, children's voices have seldom been listened to in academe. John Goodlad's previously mentioned notion of the *experienced curriculum* referring to students' voices (Goodlad et al. 1979) was a notable alert to this

missing perspective in educational research. Children's perspectives were clearly manifested in NIME6, from Janice Huber's thoughtful keynote address about a First-Nation 4-year-old Suzy, to Judy Lewis' descriptions of the musical experiences of inner- city USA school children and Tiri Schei's depiction of kindergarten immigrant children in Norway designing imaginary travels with Mitwa the bear.

Starting in the 1970s, we witnessed a growing interest in children's visual and verbal narratives, paralleling the shift discussed above in folklore and history from "text to context," and branching from psychologically derived taxonomies of developmental stages of children's art to an enhanced attention to *individual* narrative– for example, in the pioneering work of Brent Wilson (1974) and Christine Thompson (Thompson and Bales 1991; Thompson 1999). Thompson's observation that "Every day, in every corner of the globe, in matters large and small, young children are misunderstood" (Thompson 2002, 87) led to a body of scholarship exploring children's voices through their art making and conversations around it. Reflecting on methodological issues involved in this type of inquiry, Chris Schulte (2013) re-encountered his own participatory movements while engaged in the drawing performances of a young boy, rethinking the relational and ethical complexities of being with children through research.

In dance education, Sue Stinson grappled with methodological issues in a field that had no tradition of embodied narrative inquiry: "I decided that my only "methodology" would consist of listening to each of the children – their words and their movement – and trying to be aware of both my own actions and the children's response to them" (Stinson 1985, pp. 222–223). Stinson's work for the next three decades focused on the voices of dancing children and dance students from early childhood through adolescence to college (Stinson 2016), through interviews and close observations. The work of Eeva Anttila has attended to children's voices in both language and movement since the 1990s (Anttila 2007). In her recent work with immigrants in Finland, Anttila (2019) aims to understand how movement and dance can support social interaction and communication in groups coming from diverse cultural and ethnic backgrounds, with no common spoken language. Learning through movement and dance, Anttila draws on autoethnographic, performative writing, revealing her experiences and vulnerable moments in aiming to illuminate others' vulnerabilities and generate discussion about embodied sensibilities that may help us understand the challenges of "migrating" pedagogies.

I noted above the early work of Wiggins and Gromko in attending to children's musical narratives. The growing field of children's compositions that originated with taxonomies of child development now attends to children's musical and verbal narratives, including Margaret Barrett and Sandy Stauffer's leading work (Barrett 1998; Stauffer 2001; Wiggins 2007), where children's compositions are acknowledged to reflect their unique perspectives. Increasingly, the inclusion of children's narratives in diverse artistic languages enables an understanding of their meaning-making and lived experience.

3.2   Narrative and Arts-Based Inquiry

Music education, previously characterized by hard disciplinary boundaries (Detels 1999), has softened considerably in the past 20 years. The two most immediate influences on narrative inquiry in music education comes from educational research and from ethnomusicology with its roots in cultural anthropology.

The influence of education on narrative inquiry in music education highlighted language (Barone 2001; Clandinin and Conneley 2000). Scholar of folklore and children's literature (and former musician), Betsy Hearne (2017) illuminates the important aspect of author's narrative in attending to the *musical qualities* of research texts: "The most affective and effective language, whether poetry or prose, wields power by dint of rhythm, cadence, structure, tonal range, texture, pattern, dynamics of tradition and innovation–all musical as well as verbal elements. Suspense charges both art forms by virtue of these common elements. Most of us have experienced a change of attention, adrenalin, breath, and heartbeat at the climax of a powerful story as well as a piece of music. Out of numerous synonyms, a writer will select for nuance of sound as well as sense, for resonant overtones as well as lexical connotations. (I personally am allergic to a writing style with too much vibrato!) In language, there is the micromusic of a word, a sentence, a line; there is also the macromusic of a narrative or poetic arc" (160–161).

In the social sciences, the incorporation of music and sound as integral to the spoken or written text is part of the new arts-based research (ABR) movement. The term ABR, coined in the 90s, is an umbrella-term for diverse approaches and communities, challenging traditional orthodoxies of what counted as academic knowledge. The complex, typically antagonistic relationships between the constructs of "arts" and "research" goes back at least two and a half millennia. The dichotomous view of the senses and perception versus knowledge/truth, a legacy of Plato, was maintained and developed by key philosophers of the Western world. According to this dichotomy, arts-based research is an oxymoron (Bresler 2011).

The postmodern crossing of humanistic and social science boundaries, recently extending to the arts, is further eroding this dichotomy. An early pioneer in the deconstruction of the science/art dichotomy was philosopher, psychologist and educator John Dewey, who argued that art and science share the same features with respect to the process of inquiry (Dewey 1934). From a very different direction, the science/art connection and the attention to *personal* narratives was instigated in psychotherapy and phenomenological psychology in the late nineteenth/early twentieth centuries, centering around individual lived experience. This has not been a smooth coupling. The dissonance in using narrative-based processes and writing in psychotherapy was acknowledged in Freud's reflections on his own writing in 1893: "…It still strikes myself as strange that the case histories I write should read like short stories and that, as one might say, they lack the serious stamp of science… The fact is that local diagnosis and electrical reactions lead nowhere in the study of hysteria, whereas a detailed description of mental processes such as we are accustomed to find in the works of imaginative writers enables me, with the use of a few

psychological formulas, to obtain at least some kind of insight into the course of that affection." (Freud, 1893–1895/1955, pp. 160–161, in Freeman 2018, p. 133). Psychotherapy's deviation from the scientific method and writing style was heavily criticized at the time, and later—for example by philosopher of science Karl Popper (1963), who clumped psychotherapy with alchemy and astrology as cases of pseudo-science.

In contrast to philosophy of science, existentialism had a different response to narrative, where the literary genre of the novel was recognized to combine deep knowledge with artistry. French philosopher and writer Jean-Paul Sartre, for example, acknowledged the power of literature to elucidate truth with a universal import. In his book on the groundbreaking realist novelist Gustave Flaubert, Sartre writes: "What, at this point in time, can we know about a man? It seemed to me that this question could only be answered by studying a specific case… For a man is never an individual; it would be more fitting to call him a *universal singular*" (1971/1981, ix–x). Freud[4] and Sartre, both using individual narratives invoking "universality," claimed different kinds of generalization of knowledge, with Sartre's operating within a postmodern worldview in what Lincoln and Guba (1985) would refer to as *transferability*.

In education, the science/art nexus was advocated by Elliot Eisner (1979) who, underscoring the knowledge embodied in artworks, expanded the notion of legitimate forms of representation in educational research to include the visual and the poetic as expressive forms. Arts-based inquiry espouses the idea that the processes and products of arts can contribute meaningfully and powerfully to research (Barone and Eisner 1997). Grounded in perceptual awareness, ABR can be conceptualized as a way of knowing. While ABR initially focused on the literary and visual arts and the possibilities of transporting word-based art criticism into the field of education (Barone 2006), it soon expanded to drama, dance, and music (Knight and Cutcher 2018; Leavy 2018), linked to "an expanding orientation to qualitative social science that draws inspiration, concepts, processes, and representation from the arts, broadly defined" (Knowles and Cole 2008, p. xii).

Rita Irwin and her colleagues highlighted the seamless connections among art-making, research, and teaching (Irwin and de Cosson 2004). Their concept of *a/r/tography* is a form of practice-based research, referring to the arts as a way of re-searching the world to enhance understanding, recognizing the educational potential of teaching and learning as dual acts of inquiry. Working within an a/r/tographic framework, music educator Peter Gouzouasis and his colleagues (Gouzouasis et al. 2014) offer a multi-voiced performance autoethnography in which contemporary music education practices are informed by and imbued with the voices of teachers and learners.

In the field of arts therapy, Shaun McNiff defines arts-based research as a method of inquiry that uses elements of the creative arts therapy experience, including the making of art, as a way of understanding the significance of what we do within arts

---

[4] and Jung (1934/1966).

therapy practice (McNiff 1998, p. 13). Combining the traditions of music education with expressive arts therapy, Tawnya Smith (2014) draws on musical and visual forms of representation to capture significant, non-verbal expressive qualities. Visual responses created by the participants as they listened to their own improvised music were used to focus participants on listening holistically rather than with self-conscious perfectionism, and to help convey the artistic or expressive elements of music making that occurred. Curated recordings of the improvisations conveyed the sonic landscape of the research sessions, which added important context for the participants' journals and focus-group comments.

A more radical approach shifts from ABR toward *research-based art*. Graeme Sullivan (2005) conceptualized ABR as the imaginative, critical, and intellectual work undertaken by visual artists as a form of research, taking place in community spaces, Internet studios, museums and galleries. Sullivan's interpretation of art as research fits well with artistic practices conducted in Colleges of Fine Arts and disrupts a basic expectation in the field of Education.

The role of the senses in *producing* knowledge, addressed by the field of sensory anthropology since the late twentieth century (e.g., Classen 1997; Howes 2003; Stoller 1989) expanded to the *communication* of research studies (Gottlieb 2020). An important ally for ABR in narrative inquiry is the performance movement in the social sciences. Although the performative movement falls within the family of ABR, performative social science is primarily comprised of research whose work is not so much *arts*-based as it is scientifically based (Gergen and Gergen 2018, p. 54). Scholars who are attracted to performative work draw from various artistic traditions in order to carry out social science research, attending to the ways in which research is presented and performed for others. Performatively oriented scholars often emphasize the aesthetic qualities involved in their research projects and call on the artistic skills of the performer in order to stimulate interest, excitement and potential for change (Saldana 2011). Considering the specific audience and the aims of the performance, this research frequently aspires to social activism.

While theater has provided one type of performance model emphasizing dramatization and communication, ethnomusicologists incorporated music in their scholarly presentations early on to illustrate musical cultures and expression. Ethnomusicologists (and some historical musicologists, music theorists, and sociologists of music) have used music to illustrate their key ideas, sometimes performing music themselves (for example, Bruno Nettl and Tom Turino.)

Increasingly, music includes non-human soundscapes, expanding the meaning and possibilities of musical narratives. The work of ethnomusicologist Steven Feld, for example, explored Bosavi song, rainforest ecology, and cultural poetics in the 1980s and 1990s (Feld 1982), evolving to include film. *Voices of the Rainforest*, originally a 1991 CD, is a documentary sound art composition of a day in the life of the Bosavi rainforest and its inhabitants, with a film around the soundtrack, drawing both from Feld's 1976–1999 photographs, and an immersive eco-rockumentary, a cinematic concert for listeners.[5] The use of film and other technologies

---

[5] http://www.stevenfeld.net/voices-of-the-rainforest

overlaps with mediated qualitative scholarship, the focus of Estelle Jorgensen's chapter (this volume).

Michael Silvers' *Voices of Drought: The Politics of Music and Environment in Northeastern Brazil* (Silvers 2018), explores themes of environmental justice, natural resources, protest songs, and cultural policy in the production and experience of popular music. Silvers assembled playlists on Spotify with recordings relevant to each of the book's chapters https://voicesofdrought.web.illinois.edu/ Incorporating music, sound and creative videos as integral to his papers and communications, Silvers proposes an ecomusicological perspective that focuses on environmental justice to understand key questions in the study of music and the environment. Unearthing links between music and the environmental and social costs of drought, his synthesis explores ecological exile, poverty, and unequal access to water resources alongside issues like corruption, prejudice, unbridled capitalism, and expanding neoliberalism.

In education, Walter Gershon understands knowledge in, as, and through sound, aiming to open new doors for conceptualizing and interpreting curriculum. "Listening," he argues, "brings to the fore not only the importance of hearing and the senses in schooling, but also the central nature of *all* sounds in educational contexts" (Gershon 2018, p. 1). Gershon's incorporation of sounds and sonic works in presentations testifies to what might be gained through sonic inquiries and representations of educational contexts.

4   Disregarded Musical Voices: Our Own

Disregarded voices can be inner ones, as the autoethnographic genre clearly makes manifest (e.g., Bartleet and Ellis 2009; Bochner 2014; in this volume, Beauregard & Bucara; Fretheim; Kent; Mcbride & Minette). The work of Eve Harwood (2017) and Betsy Hearne (2017), initially presented in NIME5, illuminates important aspects of musical selves that have not been attended to before. Weaving autoethnography, narrative research, and commentary by poets and memoirists, Hearne explores her life journey in music and in narrative, observing that her own "life pace of narrative development unfolded naturally as allegro, forzando, andante, adagio" (Hearne 2017, p. 153). With the life pace of Hearne's musical development stopping midway, Hearne comments that "Such disparity bears investigation because ultimately music and narrative, if not inextricable, are the worse for being separated, which happens too often in the course of childhood and adolescence" (ibid).

The writer's voice, of course, is always there, behind the mind/fingers that create the text, but in formal presentations, it is often "disembodied," disconnected from one's lived experiences. Earlier on, I learned about the importance of connecting to myself as part of what I identified as a "three-pronged connection" (Bresler 2005).

Still, I didn't allow myself the space that I gladly gave to my participants, even as I have been inspired by anthropologists who have provided early models for an authentically narrated and situated self (e.g., Myerhoff 1978).

In NIME6 I embarked for the first time on autoethnographic explorations of my musical self through five stages (Bresler 2018b), with each stage differently manifesting the interplay between knowing/unknowing (Bresler 2019). Only recently—when I posed to myself the question I have regularly posed to my doctoral research students in the past 30 years—"Who am I *not* listening to?" (and gave myself time to listen)—did I discern my inner voice, shy yet eager to be listened to. Listening to others, but also to oneself, I now realize first-hand, is an on-going process, continuously evolving.

Recognizing the ability of music to convey qualities that cannot be captured in language, I requested and received for my NIME6 presentation a piano so that I could accompany my talk with playing music from each of these stages. The choices I made—from a children's Israeli song, through "Dies Irae" from Mozart's Requiem, to a Schubert sonata and György Ligeti piano piece—evoked embodied qualities of experience and visceral memories, powerfully expressive of mood and ambiance. These sonar qualities, creating a resonance that is immediate, invited me to "read myself in music" in ways that were unmediated and intuitive, allowing me then to articulate meanings in words. However, the power of academic habits proved to be so entrenched that I finished my allotted 20 min without ever getting to the piano. This was a humbling (and deeply educational!) experience in negotiating my habit-driven presentation style as part of internalized academic expectations.

5 Coda: The Wisdom of Narrative

Ultimately, I find narrative to provide an inspiration for wise living, acknowledging the constant shift of both life circumstances and our evolving selves. In the words of Stephen Batchelor: "Instead of thinking of ourself [sic] as a fixed nugget in a shifting current of mental and physical processes, we might consider ourself [sic] as a narrative that transforms these processes into an unfolding story. Life becomes less of a defensive stance to preserve an immutable self and more of an ongoing task to complete an unfinished tale." (Batchelor 1997, p. 104).

This edited volume is a compelling collection of voices, combining scholarship with performative narratives, expanding both. As we read in a "listening mode", we note areas of resonance reminiscent of Sartre's words on the universal singular (1971/1981). In the process of connecting to others' voices and narratives, we often connect with our inner selves, a connection that allows us to recognize our interdependence and shared humanity, wherein knowledge is at the service of wisdom. I applaud the editors and authors, and you, the reader, as you join this journey.

References

Anttila, E. (2007). Children as agents in dance. In L. Bresler (Ed.), *International handbook in research for art education* (pp. 865–879). Dordrecht: Springer.

Anttila, E. (2019). Migrating pedagogies: Encountering immigrant pupils through movement and dance. *The International Journal of Critical Pedagogy, 10*(1), 75–96. Retrieved from http://libjournal.uncg.edu/ijcp/article/view/1531.

Barone, T. (2001). *Touching eternity*. New York: Teachers College Press.

Barone, T. (2006). Arts-based educational research then, now, and later. *Studies in Art Education, 48*(1), 4–8.

Barone, T., & Eisner, E. (1997). Arts-based educational research. In R. M. Jaeger (Ed.), *Complementary methods for research in education* (2nd ed., pp. 73–98). Washington, DC: AERA.

Barrett, M. (1998). Researching children's compositional processes and products. In B. Sundin, G. McPherson, & G. Folkestad (Eds.), *Children composing* (pp. 10–34). Malmö: Lund University.

Bartleet, B., & Ellis, C. (Eds.). (2009). *Music autoethnographies: Making autoethnography sing/making music personal*. Bowen Hills: Australian Academic Press.

Batchelor, S. (1997). *Buddhism without beliefs*. New York: Riverhead books.

Bochner, A. (2014). *Coming to narrative*. London: Routledge.

Bresler, L. (1994). Guest editorial: Qualitative methodologies in music education. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education, 122*, 9–14.

Bresler, L. (2005). What musicianship can teach educational research. *Music Education Research, 7*(2), 169–183.

Bresler, L. (2006). Embodied narrative inquiry: A methodology of connection. *Research Studies in Music Education, 27*, 21–43.

Bresler, L. (2011). Arts-based research and drama education. In S. Schonmann (Ed.), *Key concepts in theatre drama education* (pp. 321–326). Amsterdam: Sense.

Bresler, L. (2013). The spectrum of distance: Cultivating empathic understanding in research and teaching. In B. White & T. Costantino (Eds.), *Aesthetics, empathy and education* (pp. 9–28). New York: Peter Lang.

Bresler, L. (2014). Research education in qualitative methodology: Concerts as tools for experiential, conceptual and improvisatory pedagogies. In C. Conway (Ed.), *Oxford handbook of qualitative research in American music education* (pp. 608–636). New York: Oxford University Press.

Bresler, L. (2018a). Aesthetic-based research as pedagogy: The interplay of knowing and unknowing towards expanded seeing. In P. Leavy (Ed.), *The handbook of arts-based research* (pp. 649–672). New York: Guilford.

Bresler, L. (2018b). *Aesthetic intonation: Narrative of research and music journeys*. Presented in the Narrative in Music Inquiry Conference. Boston.

Bresler, L. (2019). Wondering in the dark: The generative power of unknowing in the arts and in qualitative inquiry. In N. Denzin & M. Giardina (Eds.), *Qualitative inquiry at a cross-road* (pp. 80–95). London: Routledge.

Bresler, L., & Stake, R. (1992). Qualitative research methodology in music education. In R. Colwell (Ed.), *The handbook on research in music teaching and learning* (pp. 75–90). New York: Macmillan.

Bridges, D. (2003). *Fiction written under oath? Essays in philosophy and educational research*. Dordrecht: Kluwer.

Bruner, J. (1986). *Actual minds, possible worlds*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Bruner, J. (1996). *The culture of education*. Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press.

Carr, D. (1986). *Time, narrative, and history*. Indianapolis: Indiana University Press.

Clandinin, D. J., & Conneley, M. (2000). *Narrative inquiry: Experience and story in qualitative research*. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass.

Classen, C. (1997). Foundations for an anthropology of the senses. *International Social Science Journal, 153*, 401–412.

Crafts, S., Cavicchi, D., & Keil, C. (1993). *My music*. London: Wesleyan University Press.

Denzin, N. (1994). Romancing the text: The qualitative researcher-writer-as-bricoleur. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education, 122*, 15–30.

Detels, C. (1999). *Soft boundaries: Re-visioning the arts and aesthetics in American education*. Westport: Bergin & Garvey.

Dewey, J. (1934). *Art as experience*. New York: Perigee Books.

Dreeben, R. (1968). *On what is learned in school*. Reading: Addison-Wesley.

Duneier, M. (1999). *Sidewalk*. New York: Farrar, Straus and Giroux.

Eisner, E. (1979). *The educational imagination*. New York: Macmillan.

Feld, S. (1982). *Sound and sentiment: Birds, weeping, poetics, and song in Kaluli expression*. Philadelphia: University of Pennsylvania Press.

Foucault, M. (1977). *Discipline and punish: The birth of the Prison* (Sheridan, A, Trans.). New York: Pantheon Books.

Freeman, M. (2018). Narrative inquiry. In P. Leavy (Ed.), *The handbook of arts-based research* (pp. 123–140). New York: Guilford.

Frye, N. (1957). *The anatomy of criticism*. Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Gabrielsson, A. (2011). *Strong experiences with music: Music is much more than just music*. New York: Oxford University Press.

Geertz, C. (1973). *The interpretation of cultures*. New York: Basic Books.

Gergen, M., & Gergen, K. (2018). The performative movement in social science. In P. Leavy (Ed.), *The handbook of arts-based research* (pp. 54–67). New York: Guilford.

Gershon, W. (2018). *Sound curriculum: Sonic studies in educational theory, methods, & practice*. London: Routledge.

Goodlad, J. I., Klein, M. F., & Tye, K. A. (1979). The domains of curriculum and their study. In J. I. Goodlad (Ed.), *Curriculum inquiry: The study of curriculum practice* (pp. 43–77). New York: McGraw-Hill.

Gottlieb, A. (2016). Ways of writing anthropology. In H. Wulff (Ed.), *The anthropologist as writer: Training, practice, genres* (pp. 93–117). New York: Berghahn.

Gottlieb, A. (in press/2020, February). Writing about children for a broad forum. *Public Anthropologist, 1*(2).

Gouzouasis, P., Bakan, D., Ryu, J. Y., Ballam, H., Murphy, D., Ihnatovych, D., Virag, Z., & Yanko, M. (2014). Where do teachers and learners stand in music education research? A multi- voiced call for a new ethos of music education research. *International Journal of Education & the Arts, 15*(15). Available at http://www.ijea.org/v15n15/.

Gromko, J. (1994, May). In a child's voice: An interpretive interaction with young composers. Presented at the 1st *Qualitative Methodologies in Music Education Research* conference.

Harwood, E. (2017). A life in classroom music: Memoir and meaning. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, (210–211), 15–23.

Hearne, E. (2017). "Your one wild and precious life": A tale of divergent patterns in narrative and musical development. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education*, (210–211), 153–165.

Henry, J. (1966). *On education*. New York: Random House.

Howes, D. (2003). *Sensual relations: Engaging the senses in culture and social theory*. Ann Arbor: University of Michigan Press.

Irwin, R., & de Cosson, A. (2004). *A/r/tography: Rendering self through arts-based living inquiry*. Vancouver: Pacific Educational Press.

Jackson, P. (1968). *Life in classrooms*. New York: Holt, Rinehart and Winston.

Jung, C. (1934/1966). *The spirit in man, art, and literature.* (R. Hull, Trans.). Princeton: Princeton University Press.

Knight, L., & Cutcher, A. (2018). *Arts-research-education: Connections and directions*. Dordrecht: Springer.

Knowles, G., & Cole, A. (2008). *Handbook of art based inquiry*. Thousand Oaks: Sage.

Leavy, P. (Ed.). (2018). *The handbook of arts-based research*. New York: Guilford.

Levi-Strauss, C. (1955). The structural study of myth. *Journal of American Folklore, 68*(270), 428–444. https://doi.org/10.2307/536768.

Lincoln, Y., & Guba, E. (1985). *Naturalistic inquiry*. Thousand Oaks: Sage.

Lowenfeld, V. (1947). *Creative and mental growth*. New York: Macmillan.

Malinowski, B. (1922). *Argonauts of the western pacific*. London: Routledge.

McNiff, S. (1998). *Art-based research*. Philadelphia: Jessica Kingsley Publishers.

Mead, M. (1928). *Coming of age in Samoa*. New York: William Morrow and Co.

Myerhoff, B. (1978). *Number our days*. New York: Simon & Schuster.

Peshkin, A. (1994). The presence of self: Subjectivity in the conduct of qualitative research. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education, 122*, 45–56.

Popper, K. (1963). *Conjectures and refutations*. London: Routledge.

Saldana, J. (2011). *Ethnotheater: Research from page to stage*. Walnut Creek: Left Coast Press.

Sartre, J. (1981/1971). The family idiot: Gustave Flaubert, Vol. 1 1821–1857. Chicago: University of Chicago Press.

Schmidt, M. (1994, May). *Defining "Good" music teaching: Four student teachers' beliefs and practices*. Paper presented at the 1st *Qualitative Methodologies in Music Education Research* Conference, Urbana-Champaign, Illinois.

Schulte, C. (2013). Being there and becoming-unfaithful. *International Journal of Education & the Arts, 14*(SI 1.5). Retrieved May 15, 2019, from http://www.ijea.org/v14si1/

Silvers, M. (2018). *Voices of drought: The politics of music and environment in northeastern Brazil*. Urbana: University of Illinois Press.

Smith, T. D. (2014). *Using the expressive arts to facilitate group music improvisation and individual reflection: Expanding consciousness in music learning for self-development* (Doctoral dissertation). Retrieved from ProQuest dissertations and theses. (3645985). http://hdl.handle.net/2142/49453

Stake, R. (1994). Case study: Composition and performance. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education, 122*, 31–44.

Stauffer, S. (2001). Composing with computers: Meg makes music. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education, 150*, 1–20.

Stinson, S. (1985). Research as art: New directions for dance educators. In *Proceedings of the third international conference of dance and the child international* (pp. 217–238). Auckland: Dance and the Child International.

Stinson, S. (2016). *Embodied curriculum theory and research in arts education: A dance scholar's search for meaning*. Dordrecht: Springer.

Stoller, P. (1989). *The taste of ethnographic things: The senses in anthropology*. Philadelphia: University of Philadelphia Press.

Sullivan, G. (2005). *Art practice as research: Inquiry in the visual arts*. Thousand Oaks: Sage.

Thompson, C. (1999). Action, autobiography, and aesthetics in young children's self-initiated drawings. *Journal of Art and Design Education, 18*(2), 155–162.

Thompson, C. (2002). Drawing together: Peer influence in pre-school-kindergarten classes. In L. Bresler & C. Thompson (Eds.), *The arts in children's lives: Context, culture, and curriculum* (pp. 129–138). Dordrecht: Kluwer.

Thompson, C., & Bales, S. (1991). "Michael doesn't like my dinosaurs": Conversations in a pre-school art class. *Studies in Art Education, 33*(1), 43–55.

Toelken, B. (1996). *The dynamics of folklore*. Logan: Utah State University Press.

Wagner, J. (1993). Ignorance in educational research: Or, how can you "not" know that? *Educational Researcher, 22*(5), 15–23.

Wiggins, J. (1994). Teacher-research in a general music classroom. *Bulletin of the Council for Research in Music Education, 123*, 31–35.

Wiggins, J. (2007). Compositional processes in music. In L. Bresler (Ed.), *International handbook in research for art education* (pp. 453–469). Dordrecht: Springer.

Wilson, B. (1974). The superheroes of J. C. Holz: Plus an outline of a theory of child art. *Art Education, 27*(8), 2–9.