MICROBIAL ANTI-CANCER THERAPY AND PREVENTION (PJF RIDER, L SWEENY, AND KG KOUSOULAS, SECTION EDITORS)



Salmonella Typhimurium as an Anticancer Therapy: Recent Advances and Perspectives

Katherine M. Broadway¹ · Birgit E. Scharf²

Published online: 20 November 2019 © Springer Nature Switzerland AG 2019

Abstract

Purpose of Review Bacteria were first conceived as potential cancer therapeutics in the nineteenth century. Since then, a wide range of advancements has been made especially in the advent of microbial engineering, particularly in the *Salmonella* Typhimurium serovar. Recent developments include attenuated profiles of *Salmonella* for safe delivery, as well as genetic engineering for targeting to cancerous tissue and improved efficacy for antitumor effects. This review provides a summary of recent advances in the field of *Salmonella*-mediated cancer therapy and implications for further clinical testing.

Recent Findings A focus of recent *Salmonella*-mediated cancer therapies is genetic engineering of the bacteria for optimized tumor targeting and anticancer effects. Careful design has led to the use of attenuated *Salmonella* as drug delivery vehicles and tumor-targeting therapeutics with excellent safety and therapeutic efficacy in countless murine tumor models. Moreover, *Salmonella* has the potential for use as imaging and diagnostic tools that would improve patient prognosis through early awareness.

Summary Here, we have detailed recent advances in the use of *Salmonella* as a therapy to combat cancer. Continued innovative and novel discovery in this field of study will yield a promising future for the use of *Salmonella*-mediated cancer therapies in cancer care.

Keywords Antitumor agents · Bacterial engineering · Bacterial-mediated cancer therapy · Cancer therapy

Introduction

Advances in cancer research such as detection and effective treatments are unquestionable. Between November 2016 and October 2017, there had been 18 new cancer therapy developments, which more than doubles the previous year timeframes in 2015 and 2016 [1]. Despite this, cancer incidence is predicted to continue on a steady increase due to the growing world population and elongated average lifespan, causing an even greater need for cancer research innovation.

This article is part of the Topical Collection on *Microbial Anti-cancer Therapy and Prevention*

Birgit E. Scharf bscharf@vt.edu

¹ U.S. Army Combat Capabilities Development Command Chemical Biological Center, Aberdeen Proving Ground, MD 21010, USA

² Department of Biological Sciences, Life Sciences I, Virginia Polytechnic Institute and State University, Blacksburg, VA, USA Now more than ever, novel therapeutics and treatment strategies to combat cancer are necessary. Bacterial-mediated cancer therapies have the potential to meet this need by complementing or, in some cases, overcoming negative side effects of current cancer treatment regimens including surgery, radiation, chemotherapy, and immunotherapy [2].

A Brief History of Bacterial-Based Cancer Therapy

The phenomenon of bacterial-mediated cancer therapy was first observed in 1868 by the German surgeon Dr. Wilhelm Busch but was later best described by Dr. William Coley, an American bone sarcoma surgeon [3]. In 1891, Dr. Coley attributed the clearance of a neck sarcoma and long-term survival of the patient to an erysipelas infection, the causative agent being *Streptococcus pyogenes* [4]. Due to toxicity, Coley heat-inactivated a bacterial mix of the *S. pyogenes* and *Serratia marcescens*, which became known as "Coley's toxins." A retrospective analysis on 1000 of Coley's cases found that nearly half were complete regression [5]. Today, with resistance and reduced susceptibility to common therapeutic options on the rise, bacterial-mediated cancer therapies have experienced a re-emergence in the field. The advantages of using microbes to combat cancer include the selfpropagation of live bacterial agents, specificity to cancerous tissue over healthy tissue, and redirecting the host defenses to contest cancer via immunostimulation. Here, we present a summary of recent research strides that have taken place towards the use of *Salmonella* Typhimurium as an anticancer therapy. This review serves to summarize updates in the field and provide insight to future work and areas of focus.

Key Features of Salmonella Typhimurium as an Anticancer Agent

Our Ally Against Cancer

As one article cleverly coined "From spinach scare to cancer care" [6], Salmonella Typhimurium has not always been viewed as our friend. S. Typhimurium is a classic gastrointestinal pathogen found in undercooked food products such as chicken and eggs. Largely due to microbial genetic engineering, Salmonella can also be employed to battle cancer. Safe delivery with minimal toxic effects can be accomplished due to attenuation of S. Typhimurium. Moreover, S. Typhimurium can colonize the tumor microenvironment and elicit anticancer effects. The ways in which S. Typhimurium intrinsically attacks tumors selectively over normal host tissue include the following: stimulating non-specific immune responses through accumulation at the tumor site, preventing cancer cell growth through nutrient uptake, and penetrating necrotic tumor regions that are least drug-accessible [7]. Additionally, because S. Typhimurium is a facultative anaerobe, there is a wide variety of cancer types the bacterial species is able to infect, for example, colonization of aerobic microenvironments, such as highly vascularized tumors, and the anaerobic microenvironment of poorly vascularized tumors [3]. S. Typhimurium is able to survive and grow in a diverse range of pH conditions, like areas found in the tumor microenvironment [8]. Low-pH areas in the tumor microenvironment impair cytotoxic immune cell activity and cytokine secretion, consequently inhibiting host defenses [8]. The bacterial cells therefore have the capacity to exploit acidic pH areas and redirect host immune cells to the tumor site.

Engineered S. Typhimurium Strains for Anticancer Effects

VNP20009

VNP20009 was engineered by Low et al. at Yale University to target cancer. The strain was developed from the pathogenic *S*.

Typhimurium 14028s [9] through chemical and UV mutagenesis. Two targeted deletions resulting in attenuation by modification of lipid A ($msbB^-$) and a dependence on purine supplementation ($purM^-$) are defining genetic characteristics of the strain. Positive preclinical results indicating antitumor activity of VNP20009 culminated in a 2001 phase 1 clinical trial towards patients with non-responsive metastatic melanoma or renal cell carcinoma. Although anticancer effects were not observed, safe delivery of VNP20009 to human patients was achieved [10]. The focus of research has since been to retain the safety profile of attenuated *Salmonella*, while eliciting anticancer effects within the tumor and/or metastatic foci.

Recently, it was discovered that VNP20009 harbors several other genetic features including 50 non-synonymous SNPs [11] and a 108-kb Suwwan deletion [11, 12], the implications of which mostly remain unknown with respect to tumortargeting efficiency of the strain, except for the gene cheY, which contains a SNP rendering the strain non-chemotactic [13]. We evaluated VNP20009 $cheY^+$ in vitro and discovered a 69% restoration of chemotaxis compared to the parent strain, which we discovered at least in part to be due to the msbB deletion. We then compared tumor colonization and anticancer effects of VNP20009 and VNP20009 cheY⁺ in a 4T1 mouse mammary carcinoma model and found no significant differences between tumor colonization or anticancer efficacy [14]. VNP20009 has been assessed in several murine tumor models, including melanoma, breast cancer, colon cancer, and canine spontaneous neoplasia [15, 16].

A1/A1-R

The A1-R strain was developed at the University of California at San Diego by first mutagenizing *S*. Typhimurium 14028s with nitrosoguanidine. Then, the leucine and arginine auxotroph A1 was chosen due to selective growth in neoplastic tissues over normal tissue [17]. The strain was then further improved for tumor targeting and reduced toxicity through passaging in nude mice bearing transplanted HT-29 colon tumors resulting in the isolation of A1-R [18]. The efficacy of strain A1-R has been evaluated in several orthotopic nude mouse models of prostate [19], breast [18, 20], pancreatic [21, 22], and ovarian cancer [23], as well as sarcomas [24] and gliomas [25, 26]. Moreover, A1-R has been effective in metastatic models of cancer [27, 28]. Finally, patient-derived orthotopic xenograft (PDOX) models have been developed, for which A1-R was tested as effective [29].

∆ppGpp

An avirulent derivative of 14028s was established that is defective in synthesis of the global regulator of gene expression, ppGpp, due to deletions of *relA* and *spoT* [30]. The resulting strain, Δ ppGpp, is avirulent, presenting LD₅₀ values approximately 10^5 higher than wild-type *Salmonella* after oral or intraperitoneal inoculation [30]. In addition to tumor suppression in a CT26 mouse colon cancer model [31], Δ ppGpp has been used as a vector for tumor-specific delivery of therapeutics. The engineered *Salmonella* have been successfully implemented as a theranostic agent, expressing an imaging reporter gene, *Renilla* luciferase [32, 33]. Additionally, tumoricidal agents such as cytolysin [32, 34] and Noxa [35] have been delivered by Δ ppGpp.

Other Strains

Several other strains of *S*. Typhimurium (Table 1) were constructed for the purposes of tumor targeting and eradication, including BRD509/BRD509E [36, 37], χ4550 [38], CRC2631 [7], LH340 [39–41], LVR01 [42], MvP728 [43–45], RE88 [46–48], S634/S636 [49], SA186 [50], SB824 [51], SL3261 [52, 53], SL7207 [54–57], and YB1 [58, 59].

Intrinsic Immunostimulatory Components

The immunosuppressive environment of a growing tumor protects the tissue from immune attack [60, 61]. Some bacterial components are intrinsically immunostimulative, termed pathogen-associated molecular patterns (PAMPs). *S.* Typhimurium PAMPs include flagellin, lipopolysaccharide (LPS), and CpG-rich DNA, which can be recognized by membrane-bound toll-like receptors (TLRs) expressed by innate immune cells. In short, PAMPs are involved in the activation of innate and adaptive immune responses to differentiate foreign pathogen components from self. For example, TLR5 activation by *S.* Typhimurium flagellin has been shown to elicit potent antitumor activity in a mouse xenograft model of human breast cancer [62].

The expression of proinflammatory cytokines such as IL- 1β [31] and TNF- α by immune cells has been triggered by systemic S. Typhimurium. TNF- α , in addition to other proinflammatory cytokines [63], has been found to play an important role in the initial phase of tumor colonization, due to increased tumor vascular disruption and hemorrhage [64]. Induction of TNF- α is a careful balancing act between immune stimulation and septicemia in Salmonella strain construction. Strongly attenuated bacteria such as VNP20009 have an efficacious safety profile in animals and humans, critical for use as a therapy for cancer patients [10], but may strongly reduce the favorable immunostimulatory, and therefore tumor clearance, effects. To address this, Frahm et al. constructed conditionally attenuated Salmonella strains by deleting genes involved in LPS synthesis, such as *rfaD* and *rfaG*, and then complementing the resulting mutants by chromosomally integrated copies of these genes under control of an arabinose-inducible promoter. This resulted in an effective balance of attenuation and therapeutic benefit, in which the conditionally attenuated *rfaD* strain delayed growth of CT26 and RenCa tumors in vivo [65].

In addition to eliciting a proinflammatory response, *S*. Typhimurium also influences the downregulation of immunosuppressive factors. Kaimala et al. found that administration of attenuated *Salmonella* led to increased accumulation and functional maturation of intratumoral myeloid cells, with decreased expression of immunosuppressive genes including arginase-1, IL-4, TGF- β , and VEGF [66]. High expression of the 2,3-dioxygenase 1 (IDO) has been found in many tumors and is associated with immune tolerance by indirectly causing T cell apoptosis via an increase in kynurenine concentration [67]. *S*. Typhimurium inhibits IDO expression in B16F10 and 4T1 tumor cells, leading to higher T cell viability and survival [67]. Overall, *S*. Typhimurium-mediated inhibition of immune evasion is a promising strategy for antitumor therapy (Fig. 1).

The Role of Motility and Chemotaxis in Tumor Targeting of *S*. Typhimurium

Harnessing bacterial motility and chemotaxis is an appealing approach to actively direct S. Typhimurium towards cancerous tissue in the body and achieve distribution within the tumor. Motility has been reported as critical for in vitro tumor colonization [68]. Moreover, the importance of individual chemoreceptors for effective tumor localization in vitro has been described for SL1344 [69], where both chemotaxis and proliferation were found to be essential for bacterial accumulation of tumor spheroids [70]. VNP20009 lacking the Trg receptor localizes in vivo within regions of the tumor that are quiescent, which is a cellular, reversibly non-replicating state [71]. Using high-throughput screening of a S. Typhimurium gene deletion mutant library, it was presented that motility, chemotaxis, and the ethanolamine metabolic pathway confer an advantage in tumor colonization [72]. In contrast, using SL1344 mutants $\Delta fliGHI$ and $\Delta cheY$ in comparison to wild type, motility, and chemotaxis was found to be immaterial for tumor colonization in mice 24 h after administration [73]. Our group has previously shown that in the 4T1 aggressive model of mouse mammary carcinoma, VNP20009 and VNP20009 cheY⁺ do not significantly differ in influencing primary tumor size and moreover have no effect on the number of pulmonary metastases or bacterial colonization of the primary tumor [14].

Overall, there is a discrepancy in the contribution of chemotaxis and motility on tumor colonization and eradication, likely due to several differences in experimental parameters including *S*. Typhimurium strain (VNP20009, VNP20009 *cheY*⁺, SL1344), cancerous cell line (mouse mammary carcinoma 4T1, human colorectal adenocarcinoma LS174T, mouse colon carcinoma CT26), in vitro and in vivo modeling (cylindroids, microfluidic tumor in chip devices, orthotopic

 Table 1
 Salmonella Typhimurium strains used as anticancer agents

Name	Genotype	Description	References
VNP20009	msbB ⁻ , purM ⁻	Chemical/UV mutagenesis; targeted deletions of <i>msbB</i> , resulting in a lipid A modification, and <i>purM</i> , resulting in purine auxotrophy. Selected for hyperinvasive trait towards B16F10 cells in vitro.	[9, 10, 14, 15, 103, 127–130]
A1/A1-R	leu ⁻ /arg ⁻	Chemical mutagenesis; selected for leucine and arginine auxotroph (A1). Passaged and isolated from HT-29 colon tumors in vivo (A1-R).	[17–19, 21, 24, 25, 131–139]
$\Delta ppGpp/SHJ2037$	relA ⁻ , spoT ⁻	Deletions of <i>relA</i> and <i>spoT</i> resulting in a lack of ppGpp production, a global regulator.	[31, 32, 34, 35, 81, 90, 140–143]
BRD509/BRD509E	$aroA^{-}, aroD^{-}$	Dependent on aromatic compounds for growth.	[36, 37, 144–148]
χ4550	$cya^{-}, crp^{-}, asd^{-}$	Tn mutagenesis to remove adenylate cyclase (<i>cya</i>), cyclin adenosine monophosphate receptor protein (<i>crp</i>), and aspartate semi-aldehyde dehydrogenase (<i>asd</i>).	[149, 150]
CRC2631	aroA ⁻ , thyA ⁻ , rfaH ⁻	LPS-deficient (<i>rfaH</i>) and auxotrophic for amino acids (<i>aroA</i>) and thymine (<i>thyA</i>).	[7, 151, 152]
LH340	$phoP^{-}, phoQ^{-}$	Lacking regulation of acid phosphatase synthesis, resulting in reduced survival in macrophages.	[39–41]
LVR01	<i>aroC</i>	Dependent on aromatic compounds for growth.	[42, 153]
MvP728	$purD^{-}, htrA^{-}$	Dependent on purine supplementation (<i>purD</i>) and lacking heat-shock protein induction (<i>htrA</i>).	[43, 45]
RE88	aroA ⁻ , dam ⁻	Lacking DNA adenine methylase (<i>dam</i>) and dependent on aromatic compounds for growth.	48[46-48]
SA186	znuABC	Deletion of the zinc transporter operon, conferring reduced virulence but maintaining stimulation of protective immunity.	[50, 154]
SL3261	aroA ⁻	Dependent on aromatic compounds for growth.	[53, 79, 80, 100, 155–160]
SL7207	aroA ⁻	Dependent on aromatic compounds for growth.	[57, 104, 161–164]
YB1	asd ⁻ , aroA ⁻	Essential gene, <i>asd</i> , under control of a hypoxia-inducible promoter and dependent on aromatic compounds for growth.	[58, 59, 118, 165]
S634/S636	pagL ⁻ , pagP ⁻ , lpxR ⁻ , arnT ⁻ , eptA ⁻ , lpxT ⁻ , aroA ⁻	Aromatic compounds auxotroph and several lipid A modifications.	[49]

syngeneic model, subcutaneous cancer cell injection), timelines ranging from hours to weeks, and mode of *Salmonella* delivery to the host (intravenous, intraperitoneal, intratumoral injection).

Engineered *S*. Typhimurium for Cancer Therapy

Anticancer Therapeutic Delivery

S. Typhimurium strains are being utilized as live delivery vehicles, made to express various anticancer therapeutics including cytokines, cytotoxic agents, regulatory molecules, tumorassociated antigens or antibodies, prodrug enzymes, and genetic material used as DNA vaccines or for RNA interference (Fig. 2). Controlled release of therapeutic agents is imperative for continued safety and efficacy. For example, *S.* Typhimurium promoters and their respective inducing molecules used for the expression of various therapeutics include the following: pBAD, inducer L-arabinose; pTet, inducer tetracycline; RecA, inducer radiation; quorum sensing, inducer bacterial density; and hypoxia-inducible promoters induced

by low-oxygen concentrations [74]. Other strategies utilize the *Salmonella* type three secretion system (T3SS) allowing for efficient delivery of drugs via a molecular needle directly into the cytosol of cancerous cells. Finally, the facultative intracellular lifestyle of *Salmonella* has allowed for its use as a delivery system of a variety of cancer therapeutics, including short hairpin RNAs (shRNAs) for RNA interference that, upon entry of the eukaryotic cell, can dramatically alter cellular functions via gene silencing [16]. While examples of engineered *Salmonella* for cancer therapy are below, a detailed list is provided in Table 2.

Cytokines

S. Typhimurium has been engineered to deliver immunocompetent cytokines that can induce activation of immune cells and killing of tumor cells. Specifically, S. Typhimurium production of IL-2 under the control of the *nirB* promoter promoted an antitumor and pro-apoptotic intratumoral response [36]. IL-18, which stimulates NK cells and T cells to release IFN- γ , was secreted by VNP20009 under the control of the *ompC* promoter, inhibiting the growth of primary subcutaneous CT26 colon carcinoma as well as D2F2 breast carcinoma Fig. 1 Intrinsic immunogenic components of Salmonella Typhimurium. Upon introduction of attenuated Salmonella in vivo. pathogen-associated molecular patterns (PAMPs) including flagellin, CpG-rich DNA, and lipopolysaccharide (LPS) are recognized by TLRs and elicit an immune response. Proinflammatory cytokines, such as IL-1 β and TNF- α , are increasingly produced by the host, while immunosuppressive factors such as IL-4 and TGF-B exhibit reduced production



pulmonary metastases [75]. In a similar manner, Loeffler et al. have demonstrated the use of *S*. Typhimurium expressing chemokine CCL21 [76] and the cytokine LIGHT [77], resulting in antitumor activity dependent on CD4- and CD8-expressing cells. *S*. Typhimurium has also been used as a vector for cytokine gene therapy. Delivery of a eukaryotic expression plasmid producing the IL-2 cytokine prolonged survival of mice transplanted with hepatoma cell tumors [78]. Moreover, *Salmonella* has delivered IL-4 and IL-18 via eukaryotic expression vectors, mediating an IFN- γ response and increasing survival of melanoma bearing mice [79].

Cytotoxins

Cytotoxic proteins are highly effective at mammalian cell killing and must be kept under tight control so as to not elicit adverse effects on healthy tissue [32, 34, 80]. Pore-forming cytolysins such as ClyA and HlyE delivered by *S*. Typhimurium have been shown to result in cancer cell killing and tumor clearance. Bacterial-borne HlyE under the control of a hypoxia-inducible promoter (FF+20*) was expressed only in hypoxic regions of murine mammary tumors [80]. Similarly, *S*. Typhimurium has been engineered by Min and colleagues to produce the cytotoxin ClyA under the control of the P_{BAD} promoter [81]. Once the tumors have been colonized, L-arabinose can be intraperitoneally administered to activate expression of the cytotoxin and enhance tumor suppression [81]. Strain $\Delta ppGpp$ expressing ClyA under the control of a tetR-regulated promoter was evaluated in rat advanced glioma, where the strain induced cancer cell apoptosis and lead to prolonged survival of the rats [82]. Cytotoxin delivery by S. Typhimurium includes secreted tumor necrosis factor-related apoptosis-inducing ligand (TRAIL) under control of the radiation-inducible RecA promoter [83] and the hypoxia-induced *nirB* promoter, the latter causing melanoma apoptosis and reduction of tumor growth in melanomabearing mice [84]. Attenuated strains were engineered to express the diphtheria toxin A (DTA) chain protein in the 4T1 tumor microenvironment, resulting in significantly lower tumor volumes and 100% survival of animals through the course of the study [85]. S. Typhimurium has been designed to secrete chimeric Pseudomonas exotoxin A (ToxA) that selectively kills epidermal growth factor receptor (EGFR)-expressing tumor cells in vitro. EGFR is known to be overexpressed in neoplasias such as breast, colon, and lung prostate cancers, among others [86]. Other examples of successful tumor therapy by Salmonella cytotoxin delivery includes the expression of apoptin, an apoptosisinducing small protein [87], and of FasL, the proapoptotic cytokine Fas ligand [88].

Fig. 2 Strategies for increased therapeutic efficiency of *Salmonella* Typhimurium. After administration, *Salmonella* can directly deliver cytokines and cytotoxins to elicit anticancer effects, act as a vaccine vector prompting eukaryotic gene expression, and perform RNA interference for tumor gene silencing



Regulatory Molecules

S. Typhimurium can be modified to regulate and inhibit angiogenesis as well as promote cancer cell apoptosis. Using the plasmid-bacteria balanced-lethal system [89], strain S634 delivered endostatin, an antiangiogenic agent [49]. In another study, the T3SS protein SopA was fused with endostatin for efficient tumor suppression and induction of severed necrosis in CT26 colon cancer [56]. Through controlled expression, the anticancer protein L-asparaginase demonstrated antitumor efficacy towards mice-bearing MC38, 4T1, and AsPC-1 tumors [90]. Under the hypoxia-induced *nirB* promoter, VNP20009 has been engineered to express Fas-associated protein with death domain (FADD), an adaptor protein transmitting apoptotic signals [91]. FADD-expressing VNP20009 suppressed B16F10 tumor growth and induced apoptosis of tumor cells by activating the caspase-dependent apoptotic pathway [91]. Attenuated S. Typhimurium has been used to deliver therapeutic cargo in the form of the mitochondrial-targeting domain (MTD) belonging to Noxa, a mediator of apoptosis induction, in the presence of mitochondrial damage. MTD fused to a novel cell-penetrating peptide (CPP) for facilitated entry was delivered to tumor cells resulting in antitumor effects towards mice-bearing CT26 tumors [35]. The entire system, including timed cell lysis and control of MTD-CPP expression, was under the control of the P_{BAD} promoter activated by Larabinose [35]. VNP20009 recently has been engineered to deliver DNase I, a nuclease that cleaves single- and double-stranded DNA, via an eukaryotic expression vector [92]. VNP20009-DNase I subcutaneously administered with the anti-inflammatory agent triptolide led to enhanced apoptosis of B16F10 cells in vitro and suppressed tumor volume in vivo [92].

Vaccine Vectors

Bacterial-mediated vaccination is a process by which bacteria deliver tumor antigens to the host, either directly or via therapeutic plasmids, helping to prime a T cell response against the cancer-expressed targets [93]. This leads to the induction of an immune response against the tumor and effective clearance. For example, the gene MTDH/AEG-1 encoding a cell surface protein with a lung-homing domain is overexpressed in more than 40% of breast cancer patients and promotes lung metastasis [48]. Upon delivery of MTDH/AEG-1 by attenuated *S*. Typhimurium, chemosensitivity to doxorubicin was increased and breast cancer lung metastasis inhibited in vivo [48]. Using the T3SS of strain MvP728, Xu et al.

Table 2 Antican	cer therapeutic strateg	ties using Salmonella Typhimurium			
Category	Strategy	Description	In vivo cancer models (s)	Salmonella strain	References
Cytotoxic agents	ClyA/HlyE	Pore-forming cytolysin	4T1 mouse mammary carcinoma, CT26 colon carcinoma, rat C6 olioma	SL3261, ΔppGpp	[80–82, 166]
	DTA	Diphtheria toxin A	MDA-MB-231 (human) and 4 T1 (mouse) breast cancer	SL7207	[56]
	TRAIL	Tumor necrosis factor-related apoptosis-inducing	B16F10 melanoma, RM-1 prostate, 4T1 mammary	VNP20009, SL7207	[83, 84, 162]
		ligand	carcinoma, human gastric cancer SGC-7901 in nude mice	001111	[20]
	Apopun	Apoptosis-inducing small protein	Human laryngeal Hep-2 in nude mice	LH430	[8/]
	FasL	Fas ligand	Murine D2F2 breast carcinoma, CT26 colon carcinoma	VNP20009	[88]
Cytokines	IL-2	Lymphocyte regulatory cytokine	B16F10 mouse melanoma	BRD509E	[36]
	IL-18	IFN-y-inducing factor, enhancing cytokine	Mouse CT26 colon carcinoma	VNP20009	[75]
	CCL21	production by 1 and NN, cells Chemokine, controls migration of lymphocytes	Mouse D2F2 breast carcinoma, CT-26 colon carcinoma	VNP20009	[76]
	LIGHT	TNF-family cytokine (also TNFSF14 or HVEM-L)	Mouse D2F2 breast carcinoma, CT-26 colon carcinoma	VNP20009	[77]
Regulators	Endostatin	Antiangiogenic agent	Mouse CT26 colon carcinoma, B16F10 melanoma	SL7207, S634	[49, 56]
	L-Asparaginase	Antitumor protein promoting apoptosis	Mouse 4T1 mammary carcinoma, mouse MC38 colon	$\Delta ppGpp$	[06]
			cancer, human AsPC1 pancreatic cancer		
	Fas-associated protein with death domain (FADD)	Adaptor protein transmitting apoptotic signals	Mouse B16F10 melanoma	VNP20009	[16]
	DNase I	Nuclease cleaving DNA	Mouse B16F10 melanoma	VNP20009	[92]
Vaccine vectors	Survivin	Oncoprotein overexpressed in human cancers	CT26 colon carcinoma, A20 B cell lymphoma, murine	MvP728, SL7207, RE88	[44, 46, 57]
	Endoglin (CD 105)	Co-receptor in the TGF-ß receptor complex	D2F2 breast cancer, B16F10 mouse melanoma, and Renca renal carcinoma	RE88, SL2707	[47, 54]
	MTDH/AEG-1	Metadherin/astrocyte elevated gene-1, cell surface protein with a lung-homing domain	4T1 mouse mammary carcinoma	RE88	[48]
	4-1-BBL	Ligand-enhancing T cell immunity	DMH-induced colorectal tumors in rats	SL3261	[53]
	Flk1	VEGF receptor 2, antivasculature effect	G1261 glioma, B16F10 mouse melanoma	SL7027, SB824	[94–96]
RNA interference	Stat3-specific	Signal transducer and activator of transcription 3	Mouse RM-1 prostate cancer, B16F10 melanoma, H22	LH430, VNP20009,	[39, 43, 99, 167]
	IDO-specific	Immunosuppressive molecule	hepatocarcinoma B16F10 mouse melanoma, advanced pancreatic cancer	MVP728 VNP20009	[168, 169]
	INHA-specific	Alpha subunit of inhibition	CT26, B16F10	BRD509	[101]
	Bcl-2-specific	B cell lymphoma 2	B16F10	SL3261	[100]
	PD-1-specific	Checkpoint molecule	B16	LH430	[102]
	Sox2-specific	Sex-determining region Y-box 2	Mouse xenograft A549 lung cancer	VNP20009	[85, 170]
	PLK-1-specific	Polo-like kinase 1	MDA-MB-231 (human) and 4T1 (mouse) breast cancer	SL7207	[85]
	MDR-1-specific	Multidrug resistance gene	Ovarian carcinoma SKOV-3	SL7207	[164]

demonstrated that survivin, an oncoprotein overexpressed in most cancers, could be delivered orally by a *Salmonella*-based vector into the cytosol of antigen-presenting cells [44]. This delivery led to therapeutic vaccination and potent antitumor activity in a CT26 mouse model [44]. Survivin has also been successfully employed for DNA-based vaccination by SL7207 and RE88 towards murine neuroblastoma [57] and murine D121 lung cancer in conjunction with chemokine CCL21 expression [46]. Other targets of *Salmonella*-based DNA vaccination include 4-1BBL, a ligand enhancing T cell immunity [53], and Flk-1, a vascular endothelial growth factor (VEGF) receptor 2 [94–96].

RNA Interference

RNA interference (RNAi) is a mechanism of transcriptional regulation in the eukaryotic cell used for gene silencing. This mechanism can be exploited for cancer therapy, specifically to knock down mutated genes or in cancers where protein overexpression is driving tumorigenesis [97]. A current limitation in the clinical application of RNAi-based drugs is the lack of an effective delivery system [98]. *S*. Typhimurium is an intriguing delivery vehicle for RNAi therapy due to its tumor targeting and facultative intracellular nature. There are two mechanisms of bacterial-mediated RNAi delivery targeting an oncogene or tumor-expressed factor, namely delivery of plasmid-encoding shRNAs and expression of shRNAs to induce RNAi [93].

With S. Typhimurium expressing signal transducer and activator of transcription 3 (Stat3)-specific siRNAs against prostate tumor-bearing C57BL6 mice, tumor growth was significantly inhibited and the metastatic sites reduced [39]. Tian et al. applied S. Typhimurium as a vector to deliver short hairpin RNA (shRNA) targeting Stat3 in hepatocellular carcinoma, markedly delaying and reducing tumors in mice [99]. S. Typhimurium has delivered shRNA expressed from a plasmid to target Bcl-2 (B cell lymphoma-2). The gene was significantly silenced, delaying melanoma cell tumor growth and prolonging animal survival [100]. S. Typhimurium harboring an shRNA expression plasmid, that targeted the alpha subunit of inhibition (sh-INHA), was evaluated in vivo towards CT26 colon and B16F10 melanoma tumor models, where INHA expression is known to be high [101]. Results showed tumoricidal effects of Salmonella with and without the INHA knockdown; however, more significant and prolonged tumor growth inhibition was observed in the presence of sh-INHA activity. Salmonella harboring RNAi plasmid vectors are therefore an encouraging therapy strategy.

A combinational therapy was developed by Zhao et al. B16 melanoma-bearing mice received *Salmonella* delivered RNAi targeting PD-1, a checkpoint molecule involved in tumor immune escape through suppression of T cell function, as well as pimozide, a drug which has shown efficacy in some studies as a therapeutic against melanoma [102]. Results showed that combined shRNA-PD-1 and pimozide delivery significantly inhibited tumor growth and prolonged animal survival, with an increase in T cell response. The combination of a chemotherapeutic with bacterial-based immunotherapy is a promising clinical strategy in the treatment of melanoma.

Improving Targeting Efficiency and Specificity

Limited tumor targeting in vivo has been a drawback in the use of some Salmonella strains for anticancer efficacy. To improve targeting, VNP20009 was engineered for inducible expression of carcinoembryonic antigen (CEA)-specific single-chain antibody fragments (scFv) on the cell surface, using the major outer membrane lipoprotein and the outer membrane protein OmpA (Lpp-OmpA) expression system [103]. The engineered strain resulted in increased accumulation of bacteria in CEA-expressing tumors vs. CEA-negative tumors [103]. Additionally, S. Typhimurium can be engineered to overexpress recombinant, surface expressed, single-domain antibodies to facilitate their targeting to tumor tissue [104]. Specifically, S. Typhimurium was constructed to express a camelid single-domain (VHH) antibody against human CD20, a well-studied tumor-associated antigen used in antibody immunotherapy as a target of non-Hodgkin and chronic lymphocytic leukemia (CLL) [105]. This engineered strain exhibited strongly reduced accumulation within spleen and liver in vivo, significantly increasing the safety profile of tumor-targeting bacteria [104]. S. Typhimurium $\Delta ppGpp$ was constructed to display a peptide sequence termed arginineglycine-aspartate (RGD) on the external loop of OmpA [106]. The RGD peptide is well understood as a tumorhoming peptide that binds alpha v beta 3 integrin ($\alpha \nu \beta 3$), which is overexpressed on cancer cells and blood vessels during cancer angiogenesis [107]. In vivo evaluation of RGDdisplaying $\Delta ppGpp$ introduced to nude mice bearing human breast cancer (MDA-MB-231) or human melanoma (MDA-MB-435) exhibited a 1000-fold higher targeting efficiency than control bacteria and prolonged survival of the animals [106]. This novel approach to use tumor-associated antigens for targeted delivery of S. Typhimurium demonstrates much promise as a future therapy.

We recently performed RNA-seq on B16-F10 melanoma tumors following *S*. Typhimurium VNP20009 intravenous administration, first confirming expression of melanomaassociated genes prior to analyzing the effect of VNP20009 on changes within the tumor transcriptional landscape. We confirmed expression of *TYRP1*, a gene encoding tyrosinase-related protein 1, within melanoma tumors where there was 1000-fold higher expression compared to spleen tissue (data unpublished). TYRP1 is located in melanocytes that produce melanin, a characteristic of B16 melanoma cells

[108]. Interestingly, the TYRP1 gene, as well as others that fall in the category of melanocyte differentiation antigens (MDA), is a subject for vaccination therapy. The goal in these studies is the activation of cytotoxic T lymphocytes [109]. It has been described by Hara et al. that immunization against B16 melanoma can be accomplished by introduction of an antibody, mAb TA99, that recognizes gp75 (TYRP1). The stimulated immune response not only protected the animal from melanoma tumors, but also resulted in rejection of subcutaneously implanted tumors and metastases [110]. As described above, S. Typhimurium can be engineered to express recombinant, surface expressed, single-domain antibodies that facilitate their targeting to tumor tissue [104]. Therefore, it is possible to use this approach to more efficiently and perhaps expediently target Salmonella to melanoma tumors via their expression of TYRP1, resulting in increased and reduced colonization of the tumor and spleen, respectively.

Using Salmonella for Imaging and Diagnostics

Another application of tumor-colonizing *S*. Typhimurium is the potential use in magnetic resonance and positron emission tomography (PET) for diagnostic imaging. VNP20009 expressing the reporter herpes simplex virus *thymidine kinase* (HSV1-*tk*) when delivered to mice in vivo localized within tumors and sequestered the radiolabeled nucleoside analogue 2'-fluoro-1- β -D-arabino-furanosyl-5-iodouracil (FIAU) [111, 112]. A log-log relationship was found between PET imaging and bacterial accumulation, indicating non-invasive localization of the tumor site can be achieved based on pinpointing *S*. Typhimurium. These techniques could be used to aid in tracking *S*. Typhimurium and understanding anticancer drug efficiency and requirements for duration of targeting.

In an effort to address current limitations in tomographic sensitivity, S. Typhimurium has been modified to release a recombinant biomarker. Specifically, VNP20009 was engineered to express and release a fluorescent reporter protein, ZsGreen, in a microfluidic-based in vitro experimental setup. The produced ZsGreen was detected using single-layer antibody dots and found to accumulate in tissue with a 2600-fold higher resolution compared to the current limit of tomographic techniques [113]. The authors recently went a step further and evaluated the fluoromarker-releasing bacterial system in tumor-bearing mice. Based on measurements gathered from viable tissue, necrotic tissue, and plasma, the system has the capability to detect tumors as small as 0.12 g [114]. The Salmonella-based, fluoromarker-release system has potential to identify currently undetectable microscopic tumors and facilitate early diagnostics in the future.

Alternative Strategies Towards S. Typhimurium-Mediated Cancer Therapy

Exploiting tumor targeting innate to *S*. Typhimurium and the safety profile of attenuated strains, an engineering perspective has been applied to therapy options by using bacteria to deliver nano-, photo-, and thermal-therapeutics. Employing *S*. Typhimurium as a biological "mailman," to carry drug payloads via membrane attachment to intended sites in an accurate and precise way is a growing field of focus [115]. Nanoscale bacteria-enabled autonomous drug delivery system (NanoBEADS) enhanced nanoparticle retention and distribution within 3D tumor spheroids in vitro and 4T1 mouse mammary carcinoma in vivo [116]. The drug delivery system would improve therapeutic effects in cancer treatment and

Fig. 3 Photothermal therapy with *Salmonella*. Tumor-targeting *S*. Typhimurium are coated with polydopamine, a biocompatible photothermal agent. Following tumor colonization, near-infrared irradiation is used to activate the polydopamine, causing a light-toheat conversion and therapeutic effects

Photothermal therapy



has the potential to minimize side effects brought on by chemotherapeutics.

Attenuated strains have been developed as "thermobots" to transport membrane-attached, low-temperature sensitive liposome (LTSL), which undergo structural and chemical phase change to achieve timed doxorubicin delivery in response to high-intensity focused ultrasound (HIFU) heating [117]. The thermobots successfully triggered doxorubicin release with high nuclear localization and induced proinflammatory cytokine expression in vitro, as well as therapeutic efficacy in vivo towards CT26 colon cancer [117]. Finally, photothermal therapy, which results in the conversion of laser light to heat through absorption, has been integrated with YB1, engineered to survive only in anaerobic conditions by placing the essential gene *asd* under control of a hypoxia promoter pepT[118]. Nanophotosensitizers (indocyanine green-loaded nanoparticles (INPs)) activated by near-infrared laser irradiation were linked to the surface of YB1 for tumor precision therapy [119]. The YB1-INP photothermal therapy resulted in a 14fold higher bioaccumulation within solid tumors compared to treatment with YB1 alone and eradicated solid MB49 mouse bladder carcinoma tumors in vivo [119]. Furthermore, VNP20009 has been coated with polydopamine, a biocompatible photothermal agent and heated using nearinfrared irradiation (Fig. 3). In just a single dose, this therapeutic approach eliminated B16F10 tumors without relapse or metastasis [120].

S. Typhimurium decreases the expression of mammalian Pglycoprotein (P-gp), a multidrug resistance (MDR) transporter, in a manner dependent on the bacterial protein, SipA. Mercado-Lubo et al. constructed a gold nanoparticle system packaged with SipA for enriched delivery, followed by chemotherapeutic agents such as doxorubicin [121]. The group found suppressed tumor growth in vivo towards CT26 colon cancer with their semi-synthetic *Salmonella* nanoparticle mimic, thereby enhancing efficacy and cytotoxicity of a non-targeted chemotherapeutic [121]. Overall, the engineered biomimic was efficient in circumventing tumor MDR and exhibiting a high degree of safety [122].

Conclusions

We have provided a review to update readers to the best of our ability on the state of *S*. Typhimurium in the bacterialmediated cancer therapy field of study. This bacterial marvel has been tested in various stages of clinical trials [123]. VNP20009 has been evaluated in preclinical trials against canine spontaneous neoplasia, where overall survival was best in the complete responders [15]. A pilot trial (identifier: NCT00006254) was then conducted on VNP20009 towards patients with squamous cell carcinoma, where tumor colonization was observed but no tumor shrinkage [124]. Finally,

VNP20009 was evaluated in a phase 1 clinical trials (identifiers: NCT00004216, NCT00004988) towards patients with metastatic melanoma, which accomplished safe delivery to the patients with minimal toxicity; however, no tumor shrinkage was observed [10, 125]. Another phase 1 clinical trial was completed in 2014, where χ 4550 expressing IL-2 was orally administered to patients with unresectable hepatic metastases from a solid tumor, with results yet to be reported (identifier: NCT01099631). Despite tumor specificity and tumorsuppressive effects being well documented in preclinical testing, the translation to human oncology has fallen short. Thus, the exact mechanisms underlying Salmonella-mediated cancer therapy are not fully understood, highlighting the complexity of not only cancer but the interspecies relationship between Salmonella and residents of the tumor microenvironment.

To this end, the National Cancer Institute organized the first Microbial-Based Cancer Therapy Conference in July 2017, with the objective to share insights and stimulate conversation in the field [126]. The first NIH call specifically geared to-wards bacterial-mediated cancer research, named "Bugs as Drugs" was posted February 2019 (https://grants.nih.gov/grants/guide/pa-files/PAR-19-193.html). The use of *Salmonella* as a novel antitumor agent has experimentally shown much promise as a cancer therapeutic, at a time when innovation is in the greatest need.

Acknowledgments The images in this article were created using BioRender.

Funding Information This work was supported by College of Science Dean's Discovery Fund from Virginia Tech to B.E.S.K.M.B. was supported by a Oak Ridge Institute for Science and Education (ORISE) post-doctoral fellowship in microbiology.

Compliance with Ethical Standards

Conflict of Interest The authors declare that they have no conflicts of interest.

Human and Animal Rights and Informed Consent This article does not contain any studies with human or animal subjects performed by any of the authors.

References

Papers of particular interest, published recently, have been highlighted as:

- · Of importance
- •• Of major importance
 - Heymach J, et al. Clinical cancer advances 2018: annual report on progress against cancer from the American Society of Clinical Oncology. J Clin Oncol. 2018;36(10):1020–44.

- 2.•• Forbes, N.S., et al., White paper on microbial anti-cancer therapy and prevention. J Immunother Cancer, 2018. 6(1): p. 78. This work highlights the importance and application of microbial-based cancer therapies and details a path forward for clinical applications.
- Pawelek JM, Low KB, Bermudes D. Bacteria as tumour-targeting vectors. Lancet Oncol. 2003;4(9):548–56.
- Coley WB II. Contribution to the knowledge of sarcoma. Ann Surg. 1891;14(3):199–220.
- McCarthy EF. The toxins of William B. Coley and the treatment of bone and soft-tissue sarcomas. Iowa Orthop J. 2006;26:154–8.
- Dolgin E. From spinach scare to cancer care. Nat Med. 2011;17: 273.
- Eisenstark A, et al. Development of Salmonella strains as cancer therapy agents and testing in tumor cell lines. Methods Mol Biol. 2007;394:323–54.
- Flentie K, et al. A bioluminescent transposon reporter-trap identifies tumor-specific microenvironment-induced promoters in Salmonella for conditional bacterial-based tumor therapy. Cancer Discov. 2012;2(7):624–37.
- Low KB, et al. Construction of VNP20009: a novel, genetically stable antibiotic-sensitive strain of tumor-targeting Salmonella for parenteral administration in humans. Methods Mol Med. 2004;90: 47–60.
- Toso JF, et al. Phase I study of the intravenous administration of attenuated Salmonella typhimurium to patients with metastatic melanoma. J Clin Oncol. 2002;20(1):142–52.
- Broadway KM, et al. Complete genome sequence of *Salmonella* enterica serovar Typhimurium VNP20009, a strain engineered for tumor targeting. J Biotechnol. 2014.
- Murray SR, et al. Hot spot for a large deletion in the 18- to 19centisome region confers a multiple phenotype in *Salmonella enterica* serovar Typhimurium strain ATCC 14028. J Bacteriol. 2004;186(24):8516–23.
- Broadway KM, et al. Rescuing chemotaxis of the anticancer agent Salmonella enterica serovar Typhimurium VNP20009. J Biotechnol. 2015;211:117–20.
- Coutermarsh-Ott SL, et al. Effect of Salmonella enterica serovar Typhimurium VNP20009 and VNP20009 with restored chemotaxis on 4T1 mouse mammary carcinoma progression. Oncotarget. 2017;8(20):33601–33,613.
- Thamm DH, et al. Systemic administration of an attenuated, tumor-targeting Salmonella typhimurium to dogs with spontaneous neoplasia: phase I evaluation. Clin Cancer Res. 2005;11(13): 4827–34.
- Zheng JH, Min J-J. Targeted cancer therapy using engineered Salmonella typhimurium. Chonnam Med J. 2016;52(3):173–84.
- Zhao M, et al. Tumor-targeting bacterial therapy with amino acid auxotrophs of GFP-expressing Salmonella typhimurium. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. 2005;102(3):755–60.
- 18. Zhao M, et al. Targeted therapy with a Salmonella typhimurium leucine-arginine auxotroph cures orthotopic human breast tumors in nude mice. Cancer Res. 2006;66(15):7647–52.
- Zhao M, et al. Monotherapy with a tumor-targeting mutant of Salmonella typhimurium cures orthotopic metastatic mouse models of human prostate cancer. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. 2007;104(24):10170–4.
- Zhang Y, et al. Determination of the optimal route of administration of Salmonella typhimurium A1-R to target breast cancer in nude mice. Anticancer Res. 2012;32(7):2501–8.
- Nagakura C, et al. Efficacy of a genetically-modified Salmonella typhimurium in an orthotopic human pancreatic cancer in nude mice. Anticancer Res. 2009;29(6):1873–8.
- 22. Hiroshima Y, et al. Comparison of efficacy of Salmonella typhimurium A1-R and chemotherapy on stem-like and non-

- Matsumoto Y, et al. Intraperitoneal administration of tumortargeting Salmonella typhimurium A1-R inhibits disseminated human ovarian cancer and extends survival in nude mice. Oncotarget. 2015;6(13):11369–77.
- Hayashi K, et al. Systemic targeting of primary bone tumor and lung metastasis of high-grade osteosarcoma in nude mice with a tumor-selective strain of Salmonella typhimurium. Cell Cycle. 2009;8(6):870–5.
- Kimura H, et al. Targeted therapy of spinal cord glioma with a genetically modified Salmonella typhimurium. Cell Prolif. 2010;43(1):41–8.
- Momiyama M, et al. Inhibition and eradication of human glioma with tumor-targeting Salmonella typhimurium in an orthotopic nude-mouse model. Cell Cycle. 2012;11(3):628–32.
- Miyazaki M, et al. Clinical practice guidelines for the management of biliary tract cancers 2015: the 2nd English edition. J Hepatobiliary Pancreat Sci. 2015;22(4):249–73.
- Yam C, et al. Monotherapy with a tumor-targeting mutant of S. typhimurium inhibits liver metastasis in a mouse model of pancreatic cancer. J Surg Res. 2010;164(2):248–55.
- Murakami T, et al. Efficacy of tumor-targeting Salmonella typhimurium A1-R against malignancies in patient-derived orthotopic xenograft (PDOX) murine models. Cells. 2019;8(6): 599.
- Na HS, et al. Immune response induced by Salmonella typhimurium defective in ppGpp synthesis. Vaccine. 2006;24(12):2027–34.
- Kim JE, et al. Salmonella typhimurium suppresses tumor growth via the pro-inflammatory cytokine interleukin-1beta. Theranostics. 2015;5(12):1328–42.
- Jiang SN, et al. Engineering of bacteria for the visualization of targeted delivery of a cytolytic anticancer agent. Mol Ther. 2013;21(11):1985–95.
- Le UN, et al. Engineering and visualization of bacteria for targeting infarcted myocardium. Mol Ther. 2011;19(5):951–9.
- Nguyen VH, et al. Genetically engineered Salmonella typhimurium as an imageable therapeutic probe for cancer. Cancer Res. 2010;70(1):18–23.
- Jeong J-H, et al. Anti-tumoral effect of the mitochondrial target domain of Noxa delivered by an engineered Salmonella typhimurium. PLOS One. 2014;9(1):e80050.
- al-Ramadi BK, et al. Potent anti-tumor activity of systemicallyadministered IL2-expressing Salmonella correlates with decreased angiogenesis and enhanced tumor apoptosis. Clin Immunol. 2009;130(1):89–97.
- Yoon W, et al. Engineered Salmonella typhimurium expressing E7 fusion protein, derived from human papillomavirus, inhibits tumor growth in cervical tumor-bearing mice. Biotechnol Lett. 2014;36(2):349–56.
- Saltzman DA, et al. Attenuated Salmonella typhimurium containing interleukin-2 decreases MC-38 hepatic metastases: a novel anti-tumor agent. Cancer Biother Radiopharm. 1996;11(2):145– 53.
- Zhang L, et al. Intratumoral delivery and suppression of prostate tumor growth by attenuated Salmonella enterica serovar typhimurium carrying plasmid-based small interfering RNAs. Cancer Res. 2007;67(12):5859–64.
- VanCott JL, et al. Regulation of host immune responses by modification of Salmonella virulence genes. Nat Med. 1998;4(11): 1247–52.
- 41. Jia H, et al. Antitumor effects of Stat3-siRNA and endostatin combined therapies, delivered by attenuated Salmonella, on orthotopically implanted hepatocarcinoma. Cancer Immunol Immunother. 2012;61(11):1977–87.

235

- 42. Grille S, et al. Salmonella enterica serovar Typhimurium immunotherapy for B cell lymphoma induces broad anti-tumour immunity with therapeutic effect. Immunology. 2014;143(3):428–37.
- 43. Manuel ER, et al. Enhancement of cancer vaccine therapy by systemic delivery of a tumor-targeting Salmonella-based STAT3 shRNA suppresses the growth of established melanoma tumors. Cancer Res. 2011;71(12):4183–91.
- 44. Xu X, et al. Effective cancer vaccine platform based on attenuated Salmonella and a type III secretion system. Cancer Res. 2014;74(21):6260.
- Xiong G, et al. Novel cancer vaccine based on genes of Salmonella pathogenicity island 2. Int J Cancer. 2010;126(11): 2622–34.
- Xiang R, et al. A DNA vaccine targeting survivin combines apoptosis with suppression of angiogenesis in lung tumor eradication. Cancer Res. 2005;65(2):553–61.
- Lee SH, et al. Endoglin (CD105) is a target for an oral DNA vaccine against breast cancer. Cancer Immunol Immunother. 2006;55(12):1565–74.
- Qian BJ, et al. MTDH/AEG-1-based DNA vaccine suppresses lung metastasis and enhances chemosensitivity to doxorubicin in breast cancer. Cancer Immunol Immunother. 2011;60(6):883–93.
- Liang K, et al. Endostatin gene therapy delivered by attenuated Salmonella typhimurium in murine tumor models. Cancer Gene Ther. 2018;25(7):167–83.
- Chirullo B, et al. Attenuated mutant strain of Salmonella Typhimurium lacking the ZnuABC transporter contrasts tumor growth promoting anti-cancer immune response. Oncotarget. 2015;6(19):17648–60.
- Roider E, et al. Invasion and destruction of a murine fibrosarcoma by Salmonella-induced effector CD8 T cells as a therapeutic intervention against cancer. Cancer Immunol Immunother. 2011;60(3): 371–80.
- 52. Lin CS, et al. Enhancement of anti-murine colon cancer immunity by fusion of a SARS fragment to a low-immunogenic carcinoembryonic antigen. Biol Proced Online. 2012;14:2.
- Ye J, et al. Recombinant Salmonella-based 4-1BBL vaccine enhances T cell immunity and inhibits the development of colorectal cancer in rats: in vivo effects of vaccine containing 4-1BBL. J Biomed Sci. 2013;20:8.
- Jarosz M, et al. Therapeutic antitumor potential of endoglin-based DNA vaccine combined with immunomodulatory agents. Gene Ther. 2013;20(3):262–73.
- 55. Li Z, et al. Recombinant attenuated Salmonella typhimurium carrying a plasmid co-expressing ENDO-VEGI151 and survivin siRNA inhibits the growth of breast cancer in vivo. Mol Med Rep. 2013;7(4):1215–22.
- Shi L, et al. Angiogenic inhibitors delivered by the type III secretion system of tumor-targeting Salmonella typhimurium safely shrink tumors in mice. AMB Express. 2016;6(1):56.
- Berger E, et al. Salmonella SL7207 application is the most effective DNA vaccine delivery method for successful tumor eradication in a murine model for neuroblastoma. Cancer Lett. 2013;331(2):167–73.
- Li C-X, et al. 'Obligate' anaerobic Salmonella strain YB1 suppresses liver tumor growth and metastasis in nude mice. Oncol Lett. 2017;13(1):177–83.
- Yu B, et al. Obligate anaerobic Salmonella typhimurium strain YB1 treatment on xenograft tumor in immunocompetent mouse model. Oncol Lett. 2015;10(2):1069–74.
- Joyce JA, Fearon DT. T cell exclusion, immune privilege, and the tumor microenvironment. Science. 2015;348(6230):74–80.
- 61. Sznol M, et al. Use of preferentially replicating bacteria for the treatment of cancer. J Clin Invest. 2000;105(8):1027–30.

- Cai Z, et al. Activation of Toll-like receptor 5 on breast cancer cells by flagellin suppresses cell proliferation and tumor growth. Cancer Res. 2011;71(7):2466–75.
- Liu F, et al. Vessel destruction by tumor-targeting Salmonella typhimurium A1-R is enhanced by high tumor vascularity. Cell Cycle. 2010;9(22):4518–24.
- Leschner S, et al. Tumor invasion of Salmonella enterica serovar Typhimurium is accompanied by strong hemorrhage promoted by TNF-alpha. PLoS One. 2009;4(8):e6692.
- Frahm M, et al. Efficiency of conditionally attenuated Salmonella enterica serovar Typhimurium in bacterium-mediated tumor therapy. MBio. 2015;6(2).
- 66. Kaimala S, et al. Salmonella-mediated tumor regression involves targeting of tumor myeloid suppressor cells causing a shift to M1like phenotype and reduction in suppressive capacity. Cancer Immunol Immunother. 2014;63(6):587–99.
- Kuan YD, Lee CH. Salmonella overcomes tumor immune tolerance by inhibition of tumor indoleamine 2, 3-dioxygenase 1 expression. Oncotarget. 2016;7(1):374–85.
- Toley BJ, Forbes NS. Motility is critical for effective distribution and accumulation of bacteria in tumor tissue. Integr Biol (Camb). 2012;4(2):165–76.
- Kasinskas RW, Forbes NS. Salmonella typhimurium lacking ribose chemoreceptors localize in tumor quiescence and induce apoptosis. Cancer Res. 2007;67(7):3201–9.
- Kasinskas RW, Forbes NS. Salmonella typhimurium specifically chemotax and proliferate in heterogeneous tumor tissue in vitro. Biotechnol Bioeng. 2006;94(4):710–21.
- Zhang M, Forbes NS. Trg-deficient Salmonella colonize quiescent tumor regions by exclusively penetrating or proliferating. J Control Release. 2015;199:180–9.
- 72. Silva-Valenzuela CA, et al. Solid tumors provide niche-specific conditions that lead to preferential growth of Salmonella. Oncotarget. 2016.
- Crull K, Bumann D, Weiss S. Influence of infection route and virulence factors on colonization of solid tumors by Salmonella enterica serovar Typhimurium. FEMS Immunol Med Microbiol. 2011;62(1):75–83.
- Nguyen VH, Min JJ. Salmonella-mediated cancer therapy: roles and potential. Nucl Med Mol Imaging. 2017;51(2):118–26.
- Loeffler M, et al. IL-18-producing Salmonella inhibit tumor growth. Cancer Gene Ther. 2008;15(12):787–94.
- Loeffler M, et al. Salmonella typhimurium engineered to produce CCL21 inhibit tumor growth. Cancer Immunol Immunother. 2009;58(5):769–75.
- Loeffler M, et al. Attenuated Salmonella engineered to produce human cytokine LIGHT inhibit tumor growth. Proc Natl Acad Sci U S A. 2007;104(31):12879–12,883.
- Ha XQ, et al. Inhibitory effects of the attenuated Salmonella typhimurium containing the IL-2 gene on hepatic tumors in mice. J Biomed Biotechnol. 2012;2012:946139.
- Agorio C, et al. Live attenuated Salmonella as a vector for oral cytokine gene therapy in melanoma. J Gene Med. 2007;9(5):416– 23.
- 80. Ryan RM, et al. Bacterial delivery of a novel cytolysin to hypoxic areas of solid tumors. Gene Ther. 2009;16(3):329–39.
- Hong H, et al. Targeted deletion of the ara operon of Salmonella typhimurium enhances L-arabinose accumulation and drives P(BAD)-promoted expression of anti-cancer toxins and imaging agents. Cell Cycle. 2014;13(19):3112–20.
- Chen JQ, et al. The engineered Salmonella typhimurium inhibits tumorigenesis in advanced glioma. Onco Targets Ther. 2015;8: 2555–63.
- Ganai S, Arenas RB, Forbes NS. Tumour-targeted delivery of TRAIL using Salmonella typhimurium enhances breast cancer survival in mice. Br J Cancer. 2009;101(10):1683–91.

- Chen J, et al. Salmonella-mediated tumor-targeting TRAIL gene therapy significantly suppresses melanoma growth in mouse model. Cancer Sci. 2012;103(2):325–33.
- Shi L, et al. Combined prokaryotic-eukaryotic delivery and expression of therapeutic factors through a primed autocatalytic positive-feedback loop. J Control Release. 2016;222:130–40.
- Quintero D, et al. EGFR-targeted Chimeras of Pseudomonas ToxA released into the extracellular milieu by attenuated Salmonella selectively kill tumor cells. Biotechnol Bioeng. 2016;113(12):2698–711.
- Guan GF, et al. Salmonella typhimurium mediated delivery of Apoptin in human laryngeal cancer. Int J Med Sci. 2013;10(12): 1639–48.
- Loeffler M, et al. Inhibition of tumor growth using salmonella expressing Fas ligand. J Nat Cancer Inst. 2008;100(15):1113–6.
- Wang S, Kong Q, Curtiss R 3rd. New technologies in developing recombinant attenuated Salmonella vaccine vectors. Microb Pathog. 2013;58:17–28.
- Kim K, et al. L-Asparaginase delivered by Salmonella typhimurium suppresses solid tumors. Mol Ther Oncolytics. 2015;2:15007.
- Yang Y-W, et al. Tumor-targeted delivery of a C-terminally truncated FADD (N-FADD) significantly suppresses the B16F10 melanoma via enhancing apoptosis. Sci Rep. 2016;6:34178.
- Chen T, et al. Triptolide modulates tumour-colonisation and antitumour effect of attenuated Salmonella encoding DNase I. Appl Microbiol Biotechnol. 2019;103(2):929–39.
- Gardlik R, Fruehauf JH. Bacterial vectors and delivery systems in cancer therapy. IDrugs. 2010;13(10):701–6.
- Feng KK, et al. Combined therapy with flk1-based DNA vaccine and interleukin-12 results in enhanced antiangiogenic and antitumor effects. Cancer Lett. 2005;221(1):41–7.
- Lu XL, et al. The enhanced anti-angiogenic and antitumor effects of combining flk1-based DNA vaccine and IP-10. Vaccine. 2008;26(42):5352–7.
- Jellbauer S, et al. CD8 T cell induction against vascular endothelial growth factor receptor 2 by Salmonella for vaccination purposes against a murine melanoma. PloS One. 2012;7(4):e34214.
- Mansoori B, Sandoghchian Shotorbani S, Baradaran B. RNA interference and its role in cancer therapy. Adv Pharm Bull. 2014;4(4):313–21.
- Chen X, et al. RNA interference-based therapy and its delivery systems. Cancer Metastasis Rev. 2018;37(1):107–24.
- 99. Tian Y, et al. Targeted therapy via oral administration of attenuated Salmonella expression plasmid-vectored Stat3-shRNA cures orthotopically transplanted mouse HCC. Cancer Gene Ther. 2012;19(6):393–401.
- Yang N, et al. Oral administration of attenuated S. typhimurium carrying shRNA-expressing vectors as a cancer therapeutic. Cancer Biol Ther. 2008;7(1):145–51.
- Yoon W, et al. Therapeutic advantage of genetically engineered Salmonella typhimurium carrying short hairpin RNA against inhibin alpha subunit in cancer treatment. Ann Oncol. 2018;29(9): 2010–7.
- 102.• Zhao T, et al. PD-1-siRNA delivered by attenuated Salmonella enhances the antimelanoma effect of pimozide. Cell Death Dis. 2019;10(3):164. This work shows an effective combination of chemotherapy and bacterial-based immunotherapy via RNA interference resulting in prolonged animal survival and increased T cell response.
- Bereta M, et al. Improving tumor targeting and therapeutic potential of Salmonella VNP20009 by displaying cell surface CEAspecific antibodies. Vaccine. 2007;25(21):4183–92.
- 104.• Massa PE, et al. Salmonella engineered to express CD20-targeting antibodies and a drug-converting enzyme can eradicate human lymphomas. Blood. 2013;122(5):705. This paper applies a

Salmonella surface-expressed antibody to effective tumor targeting and increased efficacy in vivo, significantly increasing the safety profile of the bacterial strain.

- Du FH, Mills EA, Mao-Draayer Y. Next-generation anti-CD20 monoclonal antibodies in autoimmune disease treatment. Auto Immun Highlights. 2017;8(1):12.
- 106.• Park SH, et al. RGD peptide cell-surface display enhances the targeting and therapeutic efficacy of attenuated Salmonella-mediated cancer therapy. Theranostics. 2016;6(10):1672–82. This paper details a novel approach using tumor-associated antigens for targeted delivery of Salmonella Typhimurium.
- Danhier F, Le Breton A, Preat V. RGD-based strategies to target alpha(v) beta(3) integrin in cancer therapy and diagnosis. Mol Pharm. 2012;9(11):2961–73.
- Alvarez E. B16 murine melanoma: historical perspective on the development of a solid tumor model, in Tumor models in cancer research. In: Teicher BA, editor. . Totowa: Humana Press; 2011. p. 79–95.
- Saenger YM, et al. Improved tumor immunity using antityrosinase related protein-1 monoclonal antibody combined with DNA vaccines in murine melanoma. Cancer Res. 2008;68(23): 9884.
- Hara I, Takechi Y, Houghton AN. Implicating a role for immune recognition of self in tumor rejection: passive immunization against the brown locus protein. J Exp Med. 1995;182(5):1609– 14.
- Soghomonyan SA, et al. Positron emission tomography (PET) imaging of tumor-localized Salmonella expressing HSV1-TK. Cancer Gene Ther. 2004;12:101.
- Tjuvajev J, et al. Salmonella-based tumor-targeted cancer therapy: tumor amplified protein expression therapy (TAPET) for diagnostic imaging. J Control Release. 2001;74(1–3):313–5.
- Panteli JT, et al. Genetically modified bacteria as a tool to detect microscopic solid tumor masses with triggered release of a recombinant biomarker. Integr Biol (Camb). 2015;7(4):423–34.
- 114.•• Panteli JT, Van Dessel N, Forbes NS. Detection of tumors with fluoromarker-releasing bacteria. Int J Cancer. 2019. An alternative application is described where Salmonella Typhimurium is used as a fluoromarker-release system for detection of microscopic tumors and early diagnostics.
- 115. Kazmierczak R, et al. Direct attachment of nanoparticle cargo to Salmonella typhimurium membranes designed for combination bacteriotherapy against tumors. Methods Mol Biol. 2015;1225: 151–63.
- Suh S, et al. Nanoscale Bacteria-Enabled Autonomous Drug Delivery System (NanoBEADS) enhances intratumoral transport of nanomedicine. Adv Sci (Weinh). 2019;6(3):1801309.
- Ektate K, et al. Chemo-immunotherapy of colon cancer with focused ultrasound and Salmonella-laden temperature sensitive liposomes (thermobots). Sci Rep. 2018;8(1):13062.
- Yu B, et al. Explicit hypoxia targeting with tumor suppression by creating an "obligate" anaerobic Salmonella Typhimurium strain. Sci Rep. 2012;2:436.
- Chen F, et al. Nanophotosensitizer-engineered Salmonella bacteria with hypoxia targeting and photothermal-assisted mutual bioaccumulation for solid tumor therapy. Biomaterials. 2019;214:119226.
- Chen W, et al. Bacteria-driven hypoxia targeting for combined biotherapy and photothermal therapy. ACS Nano. 2018;12(6): 5995–6005.
- Mercado-Lubo R, et al. A Salmonella nanoparticle mimic overcomes multidrug resistance in tumours. Nat Commun. 2016;7: 12225.
- 122. Felgner S, et al. Biomimetic Salmonella: a next-generation therapeutic vector? Trends Microbiol. 2016;24(11):850–2.
- 123. Torres W, et al. Bacteria in cancer therapy: beyond immunostimulation. J Cancer Metastasis Treat. 2018;4(2018):1.

- 124. Nemunaitis J, et al. Pilot trial of genetically modified, attenuated Salmonella expressing the E. coli cytosine deaminase gene in re-fractory cancer patients. Cancer Gene Ther. 2003;10(10):737–44.
- Heimann DM, Rosenberg SA. Continuous intravenous administration of live genetically modified salmonella typhimurium in patients with metastatic melanoma. J Immunother. 2003;26(2): 179–80.
- Curran CS, et al. Report on the NCI Microbial-Based Cancer Therapy Conference. Cancer Immunol Res. 2018;6(2):122.
- 127. Luo X, et al. Antitumor effect of VNP20009, an attenuated Salmonella, in murine tumor models. Oncol Res. 2001;12(11– 12):501–8.
- Clairmont C, et al. Biodistribution and genetic stability of the novel antitumor agent VNP20009, a genetically modified strain of Salmonella typhimurium. J Infect Dis. 2000;181(6):1996– 2002.
- Lee KC, et al. Comparative evaluation of the acute toxic effects in monkeys, pigs and mice of a genetically engineered Salmonella strain (VNP20009) being developed as an antitumor agent. Int J Toxicol. 2000;19(1):19–25.
- 130. Cunningham C, Nemunaitis J. A phase I trial of genetically modified Salmonella typhimurium expressing cytosine deaminase (TAPET-CD, VNP20029) administered by intratumoral injection in combination with 5-fluorocytosine for patients with advanced or metastatic cancer. Protocol no: CL-017. Version: April 9, 2001. Hum Gene Ther. 2001;12(12):1594–6.
- 131. Hoffman RM. Tumor-targeting Salmonella typhimurium A1-R: an overview. Methods Mol Biol. 2016;1409:1–8.
- Hayashi K, et al. Cancer metastasis directly eradicated by targeted therapy with a modified Salmonella typhimurium. J Cell Biochem. 2009;106(6):992–8.
- 133. Hiroshima Y, et al. Efficacy of tumor-targeting Salmonella typhimurium A1-R in combination with anti-angiogenesis therapy on a pancreatic cancer patient-derived orthotopic xenograft (PDOX) and cell line mouse models. Oncotarget. 2014;5(23): 12346–57.
- 134. Kawaguchi K, et al. Tumor-targeting Salmonella typhimurium A1-R combined with temozolomide regresses malignant melanoma with a BRAF-V600E mutation in a patient-derived orthotopic xenograft (PDOX) model. Oncotarget. 2016;7(52):85929–85,936.
- 135. Murakami T, et al. Tumor-targeting Salmonella typhimurium A1-R in combination with doxorubicin eradicate soft tissue sarcoma in a patient-derived orthotopic xenograft (PDOX) model. Oncotarget. 2016;7(11):12783–90.
- 136. Igarashi K, et al. Tumor-targeting Salmonella typhimurium A1-R combined with recombinant methioninase and cisplatinum eradicates an osteosarcoma cisplatinum-resistant lung metastasis in a patient-derived orthotopic xenograft (PDOX) mouse model: decoy, trap and kill chemotherapy moves toward the clinic. Cell Cycle. 2018;17(6):801–9.
- 137. Yano S, et al. Tumor-specific cell-cycle decoy by Salmonella typhimurium A1-R combined with tumor-selective cell-cycle trap by methioninase overcome tumor intrinsic chemoresistance as visualized by FUCCI imaging. Cell Cycle. 2016;15(13):1715–23.
- 138. Zhang Y, et al. Tumor-targeting Salmonella typhimurium A1-R arrests growth of breast-cancer brain metastasis. Oncotarget. 2015;6(5):2615–22.
- 139. Murakami T, et al. Adjuvant treatment with tumor-targeting Salmonella typhimurium A1-R reduces recurrence and increases survival after liver metastasis resection in an orthotopic nude mouse model. Oncotarget. 2015;6(39):41856–41,862.
- Yang CJ, et al. Salmonella overcomes drug resistance in tumor through P-glycoprotein downregulation. Int J Med Sci. 2018;15(6):574–9.

- 141. Phan TX, et al. Activation of inflammasome by attenuated Salmonella typhimurium in bacteria-mediated cancer therapy. Microbiol Immunol. 2015;59(11):664–75.
- Kim K, et al. Cell mass-dependent expression of an anticancer protein drug by tumor-targeted Salmonella. Oncotarget. 2018;9(9):8548–59.
- 143. Lim D, et al. Anti-tumor activity of an immunotoxin (TGFalpha-PE38) delivered by attenuated Salmonella typhimurium. Oncotarget. 2017;8(23):37550–37,560.
- al-Ramadi BK, et al. Influence of vector-encoded cytokines on anti-Salmonella immunity: divergent effects of interleukin-2 and tumor necrosis factor alpha. Infect Immun. 2001;69(6):3980–8.
- 145. Strugnell R, et al. Characterization of a Salmonella typhimurium aro vaccine strain expressing the P.69 antigen of Bordetella pertussis. Infect Immun. 1992;60(10):3994.
- Yoon W, et al. Application of genetically engineered Salmonella typhimurium for interferon-gamma-induced therapy against melanoma. Eur J Cancer. 2017;70:48–61.
- 147. Yoon WS, et al. Antitumor therapeutic effects of a genetically engineered Salmonella typhimurium harboring TNF-alpha in mice. Appl Microbiol Biotechnol. 2011;89(6):1807–19.
- Yoon WS, et al. Salmonella typhimurium with gamma-radiation induced H2AX phosphorylation and apoptosis in melanoma. Biosci Biotechnol Biochem. 2014;78(6):1082–5.
- Sorenson BS, et al. Attenuated Salmonella typhimurium with IL-2 gene reduces pulmonary metastases in murine osteosarcoma. Clin Orthop Relat Res. 2008;466(6):1285–91.
- Nakayama K, Kelly SM, Curtiss R. Construction of an ASD+ expression-cloning vector: stable maintenance and high level expression of cloned genes in a Salmonella vaccine strain. Bio/ Technology. 1988;6(6):693–7.
- 151. Kazmierczak RA, et al. Salmonella bacterial monotherapy reduces autochthonous prostate tumor burden in the TRAMP mouse model. PloS One. 2016;11(8):e0160926.
- Sutton A, Buencamino R, Eisenstark A. rpoS mutants in archival cultures of Salmonella enterica serovar typhimurium. J Bacteriol. 2000;182(16):4375–9.
- Chabalgoity JA, et al. Salmonella typhimurium as a basis for a live oral Echinococcus granulosus vaccine. Vaccine. 2000;19(4):460– 9.
- 154. Pasquali P, et al. Attenuated Salmonella enterica serovar Typhimurium lacking the ZnuABC transporter confers immunebased protection against challenge infections in mice. Vaccine. 2008;26(27–28):3421–6.
- 155. Meng JZ, et al. Oral vaccination with attenuated Salmonella enterica strains encoding T cell epitopes from tumor antigen NY-ESO-1 induces specific cytotoxic T-lymphocyte responses. Clin Vaccine Immunol. 2010;17(6):889–94.
- 156. Yang N, et al. Attenuated Salmonella typhimurium carrying shRNA-expressing vectors elicit RNA interference in murine bladder tumors. Acta Pharmacol Sinica. 2011;32(3):368–74.
- Yuhua L, et al. Oral cytokine gene therapy against murine tumor using attenuated Salmonella typhimurium. Int J Cancer. 2001;94(3):438–43.
- 158. Zuo SG, et al. Orally administered DNA vaccine delivery by attenuated Salmonella typhimurium targeting fetal liver kinase 1 inhibits murine Lewis lung carcinoma growth and metastasis. Biol Pharm Bull. 2010;33(2):174–82.
- 159. Yuhua L, et al. Prophylaxis of tumor through oral administration of IL-12 GM-CSF gene carried by live attenuated salmonella. Chin Sci Bull. 2001;46(13):1107–11.
- 160. Saltzman D, et al. Low dose chemotherapy combined with attenuated Salmonella decreases tumor burden and is less toxic than high dose chemotherapy in an autochthonous murine model of breast cancer. Surgery. 2018;163(3):509–14.

- Ahmad S, et al. Induction of effective antitumor response after mucosal bacterial vector mediated DNA vaccination with endogenous prostate cancer specific antigen. J Urol. 2011;186(2):687– 93.
- Cao HD, et al. Attenuated Salmonella typhimurium carrying TRAIL and VP3 genes inhibits the growth of gastric cancer cells in vitro and in vivo. Tumori. 2010;96(2):296–303.
- 163. Mei Y, et al. Combining DNA vaccine and AIDA-1 in attenuated Salmonella activates tumor-specific CD4(+) and CD8(+) T-cell responses. Cancer Immunol Res. 2017;5(6):503–14.
- 164. Deng J, et al. Enhancement of ovarian cancer chemotherapy by delivery of multidrug-resistance gene small interfering RNA using tumor targeting Salmonella. J Obstet Gynaecol Res. 2015;41(4): 615–22.
- 165. Ning BT, et al. Treatment of neuroblastoma with an engineered "obligate" anaerobic Salmonella typhimurium strain YB1. J Cancer. 2017;8(9):1609–18.
- 166. Liu X, et al. Radiotherapy combined with an engineered Salmonella typhimurium inhibits tumor growth in a mouse model of colon cancer. Exp Anim. 2016;65(4):413–8.

- 167. Li X, et al. Delivery of the co-expression plasmid pEndo-Si-Stat3 by attenuated Salmonella serovar typhimurium for prostate cancer treatment. J Cancer Res Clin Oncol. 2013;139(6):971–80.
- 168. Manuel ER, et al. Salmonella-based therapy targeting indoleamine 2,3-dioxygenase coupled with enzymatic depletion of tumor hyaluronan induces complete regression of aggressive pancreatic tumors. Cancer Immunol Res. 2015;3(9):1096–107.
- Blache CA, et al. Systemic delivery of Salmonella typhimurium transformed with IDO shRNA enhances intratumoral vector colonization and suppresses tumor growth. Cancer Res. 2012;72(24): 6447–56.
- 170. Zhao C, et al. Enhanced therapeutic effect of an antiangiogenesis peptide on lung cancer in vivo combined with salmonella VNP20009 carrying a Sox2 shRNA construct. J Exp Clin Cancer Res. 2016;35(1):107.

Publisher's Note Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional affiliations.