RESEARCH ARTICLE

Methanogenic community structure in simultaneous methanogenesis and denitrification granular sludge

Yujiao Sun¹, Juanjuan Zhao ($\boxtimes)^{1,3}$, Lili Chen², Yueqiao Liu¹, Jiane Zuo ($\boxtimes)^2$

1 College of Water Science, Beijing Normal University, Beijing 100875, China

2 School of Environment, Tsinghua University, Beijing 100084, China

3 Environmental Engineering Department, North China Institute of Science and Technology, Beijing 101601, China*

HIGHLIGHTS

- UASB with SMD granules was operated with high removal efficiency of COD and NO_3 ⁻ N .
- Methanosaetaceae was absolute predominant methanogen in SMD granules.
- The methanogen quantity and activity decreased as C/N decreased from 20:1 to 5:1.
- Bacterial community succession happened with C/N decreasing.

ARTICLE INFO

Article history: Received 17 March 2018 Revised 4 July 2018 Accepted 4 July 2018 Available online 4 August 2018

Keywords: Simultaneous methanogenesis and denitrification (SMD) Methanogens Community structure Diversity index Granular sludge

GRAPHIC ABSTRACT

ABSTRACT

A laboratory scale up-flow anaerobic sludge bed (UASB) bioreactor fed with synthetic wastewater was operated with simultaneous methanogenesis and denitrification (SMD) granules for 235 days with a gradient decrease of C/N. Molecular cloning, qRT-PCR and T-RFLP were applied to study the methanogenic community structures in SMD granules and their changes in response to changing influent C/N. The results indicate that when C/N was 20:1, the methane production rate was fastest, and Methanosaetaceae and Methanobacteriaceae were the primary methanogens within the Archaea. The richness and evenness of methanogenic bacteria was best with the highest T-RFLP diversity index of 1.627 in the six granular sludge samples. When C/N was reduced from 20:1 to 5:1, the methanogenic activity of SMD granules decreased gradually, and the relative quantities of methanogens decreased from 36.5% to 10.9%. The abundance of Methanosaetaceae in Archaea increased from 64.5% to 84.2%, while that of Methanobacteriaceae decreased from 18.6% to 11.8%, and the richness and evenness of methanogens decreased along with the T-RFLP diversity index to 1.155, suggesting that the community structure reflected the succession to an unstable condition represented by high nitrate concentrations.

© Higher Education Press and Springer-Verlag GmbH Germany, part of Springer Nature 2018

1 Introduction

A great amount of wastewater containing high-strength

✉ Corresponding author s

organics and high-strength nitrates is generated in various industries, such as the pharmaceutical factory, dairy, fertilizer, and brewery. If the simultaneous methanogenesis and denitrification (SMD) could be achieved, then organic matter and nitrate could be removed simultaneously, which simplifies the sewage treatment process and reduces overall construction and operational costs. Recently, researchers studying the SMD process [\(An et al., 2008;](#page-7-0) [Chen et al., 2009; He et al., 2014](#page-7-0); [Kodera et al., 2017](#page-7-0))

E-mail: zhjj@ncist.edu.cn (J. Zhao); jiane.zuo@tsinghua.edu.cn (J. Zuo)

^{*} Special Issue—Bio-based Technologies for Resource Recovery (Responsible Editors: Aijie Wang & David Stuckey)

indicated that SMD could be fulfilled by granular sludge in an anaerobic bioreactor. The C/N was thought to be the critical factor affecting the system function and microbial communities [\(Xie et al., 2012;](#page-8-0) [Akizuki et al., 2013](#page-7-0)). However, there were two completely different types of microbes involved in the SMD process: methanogenic archaea and denitrifying bacteria, which typically do not coexist. There has been little research reported on how these two different microbes might coexist and exert their function in a bioreactor. It has been presumed that this coexistence can be achieved with the biomembrane or granular sludge, both of which can form clear layers within the bioreactor ([Lin and Chen, 1995\)](#page-7-0). More researches are required to further the understanding of the fundamental relationships between Archaea and Eubacteria in the methanogenic community structure in a SMD granular sludge.

The objective of this study was to investigate the removal efficiency of COD and $NO₃⁻-N$ in the up-flow anaerobic sludge bed (UASB) bioreactor running a SMD process at the different influences of C/N. Moreover, the methanogenic community structure and the changes it undergoes in SMD granules and how it is affected by the C/N were investigated. In this research, the UASB bioreactor was incubated with common anaerobic granular sludge and fed with artificial wastewater containing glucose and $NaNO₃$ to domesticate the SMD granular sludge. During the whole process, molecular cloning, qRT-PCR and T-RFLP were used to investigate the methanogenic community structure and the succession process that occurs in response to the changing C/N in the influent from 20:1 to 15:1, 10:1 and 5:1. The relationship between the methanogenic community structure and the C/N were analyzed in-depth, there might be a great potential for applying SMD technology to high strength organics and nitrates in order to accomplish high removal efficiency of COD and $NO₃⁻-N$ at low cost.

2 Materials and methods

2.1 UASB operation and sludge samples

The UASB bioreactor was made of poly (methyl

Table 1 Performances of UASB bioreactor under different C/N ratios

methacrylate) with a total height of 1.08 m and a total volume of approximately 3.0 L; the upper settle section of the reactor was 1.1 L, and the lower reactor section was approximately 1.9 L. Artificial influent with suitable proportions of glucose and $NaNO₃$ were provided as input into the reactor from its bottom by a squirm pump and flowed through the reactor section, a three-part separator, and a sedimentation section before flowing out. The gas production was captured and calculated before being emitted. The reflux was adjusted according to influent flux in order to retain the waterpower ascent flow between 0.80 m/h and 1.57 m/h. The temperature in the bioreactor was maintained at 35°C by a bath interlayer, and the pH was adjusted to $7.2-7.8$ by adding NaHCO₃ into the influent flux. The UASB bioreactor was run for 235 days, and six sludge samples were collected in different phases and labeled as A, B, C, D, E and F. Sample A was incubated sludge, sample B was methanogenic sludge from the start-up phase of the reactor without nitrate in the influent, samples C, D, E and F were SMD sludge when the C/N was 20:1, 15:1, 10:1 and 5:1, respectively. The detailed operational conditions of the UASB bioreactor are provided in Table 1. The six sludge samples were pretreated, then the morphology of the sludge particles and microbial communities were investigated by Scanning Electron Microscope Quanta 200 (FEI Company, USA).

2.2 Defining the biomethane potential of SMD granular sludge

The methane production rate was measured using a biomethane potential test on granular sludge as described in previous reports [\(Angelidaki et al., 2009\)](#page-7-0).

2.3 DNA extraction and PCR amplification

The cell wall of the anaerobes in the sludge samples was broken by a cell disruptor instrument Fastprep-24 (MP Biomedicals, USA). DNA extraction and purification were completed by a DP301 kit (Tiangen Biological Company, China) and an A140-2 kit (Dingguo Biological Company, China), respectively. Next, the 16S rDNA segments of Archaea and Eubacteria were separately amplified by primers 109F-915R (5'ACKGCTCAGTAACACGT3'-

Notes: The data in the table were all average value during each operation phase

5′GTGCTCCCCCGCCAATTCCTT3′) and 8F-1492R (5′ AGAGTTTGATCCTGGCTCAG3′-5′GGTTACCTTGT-TACGACTT3′), respectively.

2.4 Clone library construction

A clone library was constructed for sample D (C/N was 15:1). The purified 16S rDNA segments were first ligated into the pGEM-T vector system, transformed into competent cells of E. coli DH5 α and spread on Luria-Bertani plate with 0.5 mmol/L IPTG, 0.080 mg/mL X-GAL and 0.100 mg/mL amperil. The Rsal and Mspl restriction endonuclease (Toyota Biological Company, Japan) were applied to cut the amplified fragments of Eubacteria. The PCR products were subjected to electrophoresis and then sequenced by an ABI sequencer according to the manufacturer's instructions.

2.5 QRT-PCR and establishment of standard curve

The primers Arc109f–Arc344r [\(Grosskopf et al., 1998](#page-7-0)), P338f–P518r ([Ovreås et al., 1997\)](#page-8-0), 331f–518r and 518f– MX825r (Stahl and Amann, 1998) were applied to quantify Archaea, Eubacteria, Mehanobacteria and Methanosaeta with Sybr Green florescent dye, respectively. The qRT-PCR optimum parameters were initial denaturation for 3 min at 94°C followed by 32 cycles (for 10 s at 94°C, for 20 s at 57°C and for 30 s at 72°C). The Archaea standard sample was made of T plasmids from Methanobacteriaceae Archaeon, Methanosaeta concilli at a proportion of 1:2 (according to the molecular cloning results). Eubacteria was from Sulfurospirillum sp., uncultured Bacteroidetes, Streptococcus suis with a proportion of 1:1:4, and Methanobacteria was from Methanobacteriaceae Archaeon. The correlation coefficients of all the standard curves were more than 0.98.

2.6 T-RFLP analysis of community structure

The target fragment of template DNA was amplified by PCR using fluorescence-marked primers (109f–915r-FAM) and purified and processed by restriction endonuclease TaqІ (Toyota Biological Company, Japan). The products were further purified to remove salt ions, and a standard sample and formamide were added before denaturation at 95°C for 5 min. T-RFLP analysis was done by a gene analysis instrument (ABI 3730 DNA Analyzer, USA).

3 Results and discussion

3.1 Performance of the UASB bioreactor and SMD granular sludge

The UASB bioreactor was operated for 235 days, which was divided into 5 phases I–V in this paper, and the performance was illustrated in Fig. 1. After the starting period (phase I), the sludge COD loading rate increased quickly to approximately 10 $\text{kg/m}^3/\text{d}$, and the COD removal efficiency was stable above 95% in the whole process. Nitrate was introduced into the bioreactor on the 46th day with the loading rate of 0.5 kg/m³/d, and nitrate concentration in the influent water was increased stepwise in the succeeding days at 0.7, 1.1, to the final concentration of 2.0 kg/m³/d (as shown in Table 1). The COD removal

Fig. 1 Changing of loading rate and removal efficiency of COD and $NO₃⁻N$ in the UASB bioreactor for 235 days

efficiency was not affected by nitrate and it was maintained above 97% when C/N was gradually decreased from 20:1 to 15:1 and 10:1 (phases II, III and IV). When the C/N was 5:1 (phase V), the COD removal efficiency declined slightly, but it was mostly above 96%. The NO_3 ⁻-N removal efficiency was excellent, remaining above 99% in phases III–V after nitrate had been added in the influent water.

Upon visual inspection, the incubated sludge was deepblack in color, mostly irregularly spherical. The SEM images of six sludge samples are shown in Fig. 2. Compared with the incubated sludge (sample A), the microbial quantities in granular sludge (sample B) increased greatly although the morphological types consisting mainly of filamentous bacteria, which were predominant outside the granules (Wang et al., 2016), cocci and bacilli did not change considerably. After nitrate was added to bioreactor (samples C, D, E and F), both microorganism quantities and types increased markedly. This significant increase was also reported by other researches ([Yi et al., 2017; Yin et al., 2017\)](#page-8-0). In addition to filamentous bacteria, cocci and bacilli, a large number of streptococci were detected on the sludge particle surfaces. Additionally, aside from the large number of cocci and bacilli, a small number of spirilla was found inside the sludge particles. As the ratios of C/N decreased from 20:1 to 15:1, 10:1 and 5:1, the sludge surfaces became rougher, the quantities of streptococci and filamentous bacteria decreased, and the quantities of cocci and bacilli increased. In addition, streptococci and filamentous bacteria were primarily on the surfaces of sludge particles and they were seldom found inside the particles.

3.2 Biomethane potential of SMD granular sludge

The methanogenic activity among sample A–F (shown in

Fig. 3) shows that after nitrate was added to the bioreactor, the methanogenic activity of the samples (sample C) was higher than that of the incubated sludge (samples A and B). When C/N was reduced from 20:1 to 15:1, 10:1 and 5:1, the methanogenic activity of the samples also decreased gradually. When the C/N was 10:1 (sample E) and 5:1 (sample F), the methanogenic activity was lower than the activity of the incubated sludge (sample A). These results indicate that nitrate at ambient concentration was effective for the methanogenic activity, while higher nitrate concentrations may inhibit the methanogenic activity of samples. It has been widely reported that nitrate strongly inhibits the methanogenic activity and denitrification occurs before methanogenesis, and the methanogenic process could only occur after denitrification has been completed [\(Mosquera-Corral et al., 2001](#page-7-0); [Tugtas and](#page-8-0) [Pavlostathis, 2007;2008](#page-8-0)). However, the inhibition mechanism of nitrate or denitrification on methanogenesis process has not been thoroughly elucidated to date. It has generally been considered that 1) because the methanogens are strict anaerobe, the presence of $NO₃⁻$ and its reduced intermediate products NO_2^- , NO and N_2O leads to higher redox potentials that are not conducive to the growth of methanogens and methanogenic activity [\(Tugtas and](#page-8-0) [Pavlostathis, 2007;](#page-8-0) [Banihani et al., 2009](#page-7-0)); 2) denitrifiers would compete against methanogens for hydrogen and acetate ([Klüber and Conrad, 1998](#page-7-0)); 3) NO_2^- and $NO_3^$ would generate toxic effects on the enzymes involved in the methanogenic process, with $NO₂⁻$ being more poisonous than $NO₃⁻$ [\(Chen and Lin, 1993](#page-7-0)). However, when the carbon source is easily metabolized and the C/N is suitable, these conditions would not inhibit either the methanogenic or denitrification activity ([Hendriksen and](#page-7-0) [Ahring, 1996](#page-7-0)). In the UASB bioreactor system the reduction of NO_3^- -N was very complete; therefore, it could be speculated that $NO₃⁻-N$ would not inhibit and

Fig. 2 SEM images of sludge particles and microbial communities

Fig. 3 Methane production rate in biomethane potential test of SMD granular sludge samples

poison methanogens, and the main interaction between denitrifying bacteria and methanogens is the competition for hydrogen and acetate in the system.

3.3 Construction of 16S rDNA clone library

A clone library was constructed for sample D (C/N was 15:1) as the representative sample in order to more accurately assess the microbial community structure in SMD granular sludge and to quantify the proportion of Methanobacteriaceae Archaeon and Methanosaeta concilli in Archaea standard sample for qRT-PCR. After the DNA extraction, the molecular cloning yielded 88 clones that represented 32 OTUs of Archaea based on the PCR and ARDRA tests. The 32 OTUs were compared to describe bacterial 16S rDNA in GenBank by the BLAST procedure, and the results are shown in Table 2. In sample D, all the *Archaea* clones were from methanogens and could be classified into 4 main groups, namely, Methanosaetaceae, Methanobacteriaceae, Methanospirillaceae and Methanomicrobiaceae, and most of the matches were to uncultured sequences. There were 19 OTUs from 63 clones belonged to Methanosaetaceae that accounted for 71.59% of the *Archaea* clones, making *Methanosae*taceae the most predominant methanogen in the sample; the most abundant clone, A3 (16/88), was most similar to Methanosaeta concilli. The abundance of Methanosaetaceae could be beneficial for granule formation and maintenance ([Song et al., 2010\)](#page-8-0). The second most abundant kind of Archaea was represented by 20 clones (22.73%) and 9 OTUs belonging to Methanobacteriaceae.

There were several clones belonging to *Methanospirilla*ceae and Methanomicrobiaceae.

Methanosaetaceae is one of the most predominant methanogens in most anaerobic methanogenic granular sludge, and it accounts for 35%–75% of *Archaea* generally ([Liu et al., 2002\)](#page-7-0). In the SMD granular sludge, a high concentration of NO_3 ⁻-N would have influenced the growth of methanogens and only four types of methanogens survived (as shown in Table 2). Methanosarcinaceae, which often appears in anaerobic acetic-trophic methanogenic granular sludge, was not detected in SMD granular sludge. Both Methanosarcinaceae and Methanosaetaceae are representatives of acetic-trophic methanogens. Methanosarcinaceae have a low affinity for acetate and therefore grow in high acetate concentrations, while the specific surface area of *Methanosaetaceae* is high and its affinity for the matrix is strong, thus, Methanosaetaceae grows well in low-acetate conditions. In the UASB bioreactor, more than 95% COD removal efficiency was attained, indicating that the acetate which was produced by fermentative and acetogenic microorganism was utilized by methanogens rapidly and accumulated only slightly. Therefore, the growth of Methanosarcinaceae was inhibited and the growth of Methanosaetaceae was promoted.

3.4 Analysis of Archaea 16S rDNA by qRT-PCR

The relative quantity of Archaea and Bacteria in SMD granules and Methanosaetaceae and Methanobacteriaceae within the *Archaea* of samples A–F were analyzed by qRT-PCR. As shown in Fig. 4, *Archaea* was significantly less than Bacteria in samples A–F indicating that the content of methanogens was much less than Bacteria in SMD granular sludge because all of the Archaea clones belonged to methanogens according to the clone library results. In addition, when C/N was reduced from 20:1 to 5:1 (samples C–F), the relative abundance of Archaea in SMD granules decreased from 36.5% to 10.9%. As the content of nitrate increased gradually, the quantity of organic matter used for denitrification also increased, leading to a corresponding reduction of organic matter used by methanogens. Although several researchers [\(Liang and Zuo, 2008](#page-7-0)) believe that certain *Archaea* have a denitrification function, it is generally considered that denitrifiers are either Fungi or Bacteria. Therefore, with the increase of nitrate, the methanogens decreased, the denitrifying bacteria increased, and the Archaea declined rapidly in samples D, E and F.

Table 2 Clone results of *Archaea* in granules of sample D

| Flora classification (Archaea) | OTU _s quantity | Clone quantity | Content $(\%)$ | Representative strain |
|--------------------------------|---------------------------|----------------|-----------------|---|
| Methanosaetaceae | 19 | 63 | 71.59 | Methanosaeta concilli (X51423) |
| Methanobacteriaceae | | 20 | 22.73 | Unculture Methanobacteriaceae Archaeon (AB236056) |
| Methanospirillaceae | | | 4.55 | Unculture Methanoaspirillum sp. (AY692060) |
| Methanomicrobiaceae | | | 1.14 | Unculture Methanomicrobiaceae Archaeon (AB236985) |

Fig. 4 Relative content of Archaea and Bacteria in SMD granular sludge samples

In the six sludge samples, the relative contents of Methanosaetaceae and Methanobacteriaceae are shown in Fig. 5. The content of Methanosaetaceae was almost the same in samples A and B (approximately 40%), and the content of Methanobacteriaceae in sample A was lower than in sample B, which increased from 13.1% to 21.9%. After adding nitrate into the bioreactor, the abundance levels of Methanosaetaceae and Methanobacteriaceae changed markedly. With the decline of C/N from 20:1 to 5:1 (samples C–F), Methanosaetaceae increased from 64.5% to 84.2%, whereas Methanobacteriaceae decreased from 18.6% to 11.8%. According to the previous researches ([Song et al., 2010](#page-8-0); [Tabatabaei et al., 2010](#page-8-0)), the Methanosaetaceae uses acetate as substrate to produce methane, while *Methanobacteriaceae* uses $H₂/CO₂$ as substrate. The glucose substrate was first degraded by fermentative and acetogenic bacteria into hydrogen and acetate, which were utilized by methanogens to produce methane. In general, 70% of methane is produced from acetate, while the other 30% from H_2/CO_2 . Therefore, it is reasonable for the relative content of Methanosaetaceae to

□ Methanosaetaceae ■ Methanobacteriaceae ■ Other Archaea

Fig. 5 Relative content of Methanosaetaceae and Methanobacteriaceae in Archaea in SMD granular sludge samples

be approximately 40% of the whole *Archaea*, while Methanobacteriaceae was approximately 20%. After the addition of nitrate, the denitrifying bacteria grew quickly, which required abundant electron donors to reduce nitrate into nitrogen gas. Hydrogen and acetate are suitable electron donors, and the denitrifying bacteria are the first to use them because the energy yield in denitrification is higher than that in methanogenesis (as shown in Table 3). This property could affect the growth of methanogens, which is the reason that the content of *Archaea* declined with the decrease of C/N. Compared with acetate, the hydrogen will be prioritized for use by denitrifying bacteria (as shown in Table 3), which mainly resulted in the decrease of hydrogenotrophic Methanobacteriaceae. In addition, when the supply of hydrogen had run out, the nitrate ran out mostly because the lowest C/N was 5:1 in this experiment. The remaining acetate would be utilized by methanogenesis, leading to a gradual increase of the relative content of acetic-trophic Methanosaetaceae within the Archaea with the reduction of the C/N (Fig. 5).

3.5 Analysis of the Archaea community with T-RFLP

T-RFLP has been considered a promising way to analyze the microbial community [\(Osborn et al., 2000;](#page-8-0) [Lueders et](#page-7-0) [al., 2001](#page-7-0)). The analysis of cloned Archaea T-RFLP peak values (as shown in Fig. 6) combined with the molecular cloning results was yielded the followings observations: 1) The peak at 284 bps, which represented Methanosaetaceae (compared with the restriction enzyme map of single clones analyzed by T-RFLP), was prominent; 2) The peak at 393–395 bps represented both part Methanosaetaceae and Methanospirillaceae in the cloned Archaea; 3) The peaks at 92 bps and 728–735 bps represented Methanobacteriaceae in the cloned Archaea; 4) The peak at 82 bps represented Methanosaetaceae and Methanomicrobiaceae; 5) The peak at 260–265 bps was not observed. In the six sludge samples, it was obvious that the Archaea diversity was not high, and Methanosaetaceae was the dominant methanogen, while the quantity of Methanobacteriaceae was influenced by the C/N, which is consistent with the previous qRT-PCR result.

In addition, peak at 333 in sample A was more abundant than in sample B, while the peak at 284 bps in sample B was much higher than in sample A. After the addition of nitrate, the peak at 393–395 bps which represents both Methanosaetaceae and Methanospirillaceae in samples C, D, E and F was observed more prominently compared with samples A and B. With the increase of C/N, Archaea diversity decreased gradually.

Based on the number of characteristic terminal fragments and the size of the peak area in T-RFLP profiles, Shannon–Wiener index (H') was worked out according to Eq. (1), and the values for the Archaea community in six sludge samples are shown in Table 4.

Notes: $\Delta_f H_m^{\Theta}$, $\Delta_f S_m^{\Theta}$, $\Delta_f G_m^{\Theta}$ were calculated according to the NBS tables of chemical thermodynamic properties [\(Wagman et al., 1982\)](#page-8-0)

Fig. 6 T-RFLP profiles of Archaea 16S rDNA PCR products amplified from SMD sludges at different C/N ratio

$$
H' = -\sum_{i=1}^{s} p_i \ln p_i, \qquad (1)
$$

in this equation, p_i represents the proportion of a certain peak value out of the total peak value.

According to Table 4, the T-RFLP diversity index of Archaea in samples A and B without added nitrate were quite low. When the C/N was 20:1 (sample C), the richness and evenness of methanogens provided the highest T-RFLP diversity index value of 1.627, while the removal efficiency was favorable, i.e., the removal efficiency of

Table 4 Diversity index T-RFLP of Archaea in six sludge samples

| Sample No. | T-RFLP diversity index | |
|---------------|------------------------|--|
| A | 0.966 | |
| B | 0.924 | |
| \mathcal{C} | 1.627 | |
| D | 1.338 | |
| E | 1.219 | |
| F | 1.155 | |

COD was above 98% and the removal efficiency of $NO₃$ ⁻ N was above 99%. However, adding more nitrate (sample D, E and F) led to the decrease of Archaea diversity. When the C/N was 5:1, the T-RFLP diversity index decreased to 1.155, which was still higher than that of sample A and B, and the removal efficiency of COD decreased to 96%. Thus, the community structure reflected the succession to an unstable condition represented by high nitrate concentrations.

4 Conclusions

The UASB bioreactor with simultaneous methanogenesis and denitrification (SMD) was operated for 235 days, in which the COD removal efficiency was mostly above 96% and the NO_3 ⁻-N removal efficiency was excellent, remaining above 99%. During the whole process, the methanogenic community structure and the succession process were affected by the changing ratios of C/N in the influent from 20:1 to 15:1, 10:1 and 5:1. When the C/N was 20:1 (sample C), the methane production rate was fastest in the six granular sludge, with Methanosaetaceae and Methanobacteriaceae being the main methanogens within the *Archaea*; the richness and evenness of the methanogens were best with the highest T-RFLP diversity index of 1.627. With the C/N decrease from 20:1 to 5:1 (sample C to F), the methanogenic activity in the samples decreased gradually, and Archaea relative abundance in SMD granules decreased from 36.5% to 10.9%, during which Methanosaetaceae increased from 64.5% to 84.2%, while Methanobacteriaceae decreased from 18.6% to 11.8%; the T-RFLP diversity index decreased to 1.155. Thus, the community structure reflected the succession to an unstable condition represented by high nitrate concentrations.

Acknowledgements This work was supported by the National Natural Science Foundation of China (Grant Nos. 51678054 and 51378064).

References

Akizuki S, Izumi K, Nagao N, Shiotani T, Niwa C, Toda T (2013). Effect of $\text{COD/NO}_3\text{-}N$ ratio and seed sludge on simultaneous methanogenesis and denitrification in intermittent organic solid waste treatment. International Biodeterioration & Biodegradation, 84(6): 8–13

- An Y, Yang F, Wong F S, Chua H C (2008). Simultaneous bioenergy (CH4) production and nitrogen removal in a combined upflow anaerobic sludge blanket and aerobic membrane bioreactor. Energy & Fuels, 22(1): 103–107
- Angelidaki I, Alves M, Bolzonella D, Borzacconi L, Campos J L, Guwy A J, Kalyuzhnyi S, Jenicek P, van Lier J B (2009). Defining the biomethane potential (BMP) of solid organic wastes and energy crops: a proposed protocol for batch assays. Water Science and Technology, 59(5): 927–934
- Banihani Q, Sierra-Alvarez R, Field J A (2009). Nitrate and nitrite inhibition of methanogenesis during denitrification in granular biofilms and digested domestic sludges. Biodegradation, 20(6): 801–812
- Chen K C, Lin Y F (1993). The relationship between denitrifying bacteria and methanogenic bacteria in a mixed culture system of acclimated sludges. Water Research, 27(12): 1749–1759
- Chen S, Sun D, Chung J S (2009). Simultaneous methanogenesis and denitrification of aniline wastewater by using anaerobic-aerobic biofilm system with recirculation. Journal of Hazardous Materials, 169(1–3): 575–580
- Grosskopf R, Janssen P H, Liesack W (1998). Diversity and structure of the methanogenic community in anoxic rice paddy soil microcosms as examined by cultivation and direct 16S rRNA gene sequence retrieval. Applied and Environmental Microbiology, 64(3): 960–969
- He Q M, Peng X Y, Li Z Y (2014). The treatment of animal manure wastewater by coupled simultaneous methanogenesis and denitrification (SMD) and shortcut nitrification-denitrification (SND). Journal of Chemical Technology and Biotechnology (Oxford, Oxfordshire), 89(11): 1697–1704
- Hendriksen H V, Ahring B K (1996). Integrated removal of nitrate and carbon in an upflow anaerobic sludge blanket (UASB) reactor: operating performance. Water Research, 30(6): 1451–1458
- Klüber H D, Conrad R (1998). Inhibitory effects of nitrate, nitrite, NO and N₂O on methanogenesis by Methanosarcina barkeri and Methanobacterium bryantii. FEMS Microbiology Ecology, 25(4): 331–339
- Kodera T, Akizuki S, Toda T (2017). Formation of simultaneous denitrification and methanogenesis granules in biological wastewater treatment. Process Biochemistry, 58: 252–257
- Liang L H, Zuo J E (2008). Review of modern culture-independent methods used to study community structure and function of denitrifying microorganisms. Acta Scientiae Circumstantiae, 28(4): 599–605 (in Chinese)
- Lin Y F, Chen K C (1995). Denitrification and methanogenesis in a coimmobilized mixed culture system. Water Research, 29(1): 35–43
- Liu W T, Chan O C, Fang H H P (2002). Characterization of microbial community in granular sludge treating brewery wastewater. Water Research, 36(7): 1767–1775
- Lueders T, Chin K J, Conrad R, Friedrich M (2001). Molecular analyses of methyl-coenzyme M reductase α-subunit (mcrA) genes in rice field soil and enrichment cultures reveal the methanogenic phenotype of a novel archaeal lineage. Environmental Microbiology, 3(3): 194–204
- Mosquera-Corral A, Sánchez M, Campos J L, Méndez R, Lema J M (2001). Simultaneous methanogenesis and denitrification of pre-

treated effluents from a fish canning industry. Water Research, 35(2): 411–418

- Osborn A M, Moore E R B, Timmis K N (2000). An evaluation of terminal-restriction fragment length polymorphism (T-RFLP) analysis for the study of microbial community structure and dynamics. Environmental Microbiology, 2(1): 39–50
- Ovreås L, Forney L, Daae F L, Torsvik V (1997). Distribution of bacterioplankton in meromictic Lake Saelenvannet, as determined by denaturing gradient gel electrophoresis of PCR-amplified gene fragments coding for 16S rRNA. Applied and Environmental Microbiology, 63(9): 3367–3373
- Song M, Shin S G, Hwang S (2010). Methanogenic population dynamics assessed by real-time quantitative PCR in sludge granule in upflow anaerobic sludge blanket treating swine wastewater. Bioresource Technology, 101(Suppl 1): S23–S28
- Stahl D A, Amann R (1998). Development and application of nucleic acid probes. In: Nucleic Acid Techniques in Bacterial Systematics. Chichester: John Wiley Sons Ltd., 205–248
- Tabatabaei M, Rahim R A, Abdullah N, Wright A D G, Shirai Y, Sakai K, Sulaiman A, Hassan M A (2010). Importance of the methanogenic archaea populations in anaerobic wastewater treatments. Process Biochemistry, 45(8): 1214–1225

Tugtas A E, Pavlostathis S G (2007). Inhibitory effects of nitrogen

oxides on a mixed methanogenic culture. Biotechnology and Bioengineering, 96(3): 444–455

- Tugtas A E, Pavlostathis S G (2008). Inhibitory effects of nitrate reduction on methanogenesis in the presence of different electron donors. Water Science and Technology, 57(5): 693–698
- Wagman D D, Evans W H, Parker V B, Schumm R H, Halow I, Bailey S M, Churney K L, Nuttall R L (1982). The NBS tables of chemical thermodynamic properties. Journal of Physical and Chemical Reference Data, 11(2): 7–38
- Wang B, Peng D, Zhang X, Wang X (2016). Structure and formation of anoxic granular sludge—A string-bag hypothesis. Frontiers of Environmental Science and Engineering, 10(2): 311–318
- Xie L, Chen J, Wang R, Zhou Q (2012). Effect of carbon source and $\text{COD/NO}_3\text{-}N$ ratio on anaerobic simultaneous denitrification and methanogenesis for high-strength wastewater treatment. Journal of Bioscience and Bioengineering, 113(6): 759–764
- Yi X H, Wan J, Ma Y, Wang Y, Guan Z, Jing D D (2017). Structure and succession of bacterial communities of the granular sludge during the initial stage of the simultaneous denitrification and methanogenesis process. Water, Air, and Soil Pollution, 228(3): 121–132
- Yin Z, Xie L, Zhou Q, Bi X (2018). Simultaneous carbon and nitrogen removal from anaerobic effluent of the cassava ethanol industry. Journal of Bioscience and Bioengineering, 125(3): 346–352