INVITED REVIEW

The efect of blood fow occlusion during acute low-intensity isometric elbow fexion exercise

David B. Copithorne¹ · Charles L. Rice^{1,2}

Received: 2 August 2018 / Accepted: 30 January 2019 © Springer-Verlag GmbH Germany, part of Springer Nature 2019

Abstract

Purpose Blood flow restriction (BFR) with low-intensity (<30% of 1 repetition maximum strength) muscle contraction has been used chronically (>4 weeks) to enhance resistance training. However, mechanisms underlying muscle adaptations following BFR are not well understood. To explore changes related to chronic BFR adaptations, the current study used blood fow occlusion (BFO) during an acute bout of low-intensity isometric fatiguing contractions to assess peripheral (muscle) factors afected.

Methods Ten males completed separate fatiguing elbow fexor protocols to failure; one with BFO and one with un-restricted blood fow (FF). Baseline, post-task failure, and 30 min of recovery measures of voluntary and involuntary contractile properties were compared.

Results BFO had greater impairment of intrinsic measures compared with FF, despite FF lasting 80% longer. Following task failure, maximal voluntary contraction and 50 Hz torque decreased in both protocols (~ 60% from baseline). Voluntary activation decreased~11% from baseline at failure following both protocols, but recovered at a faster rate following BFO, whereas MVC recovered to \sim 90% of baseline in both protocols. The 10/50 Hz torque ratio was decreased by \sim 68% and \sim 21% from baseline, for BFO and FF, respectively ($P < 0.01$). 50 Hz half-relaxation-time (HRT) was significantly longer immediately following BFO $(-107\%$ greater than baseline), with no change following FF.

Conclusions Thus, greater peripheral fatigue that recovers at a similar rate compared to conventional exercise is likely driving muscle adaptations observed with chronic BFR exercise. Likely BFO alters energy demand and supply of working muscle similar to chronic BFR, but is exaggerated in this paradigm.

Keywords Blood fow restriction · Elbow fexion · Fatigue · Intrinsic muscle properties · Low-frequency fatigue · Peripheral fatigue

Communicated by Philip D. Chilibeck.

 \boxtimes David B. Copithorne dcopitho@uwo.ca Charles L. Rice crice@uwo.ca

¹ Canadian Centre for Activity and Aging, School of Kinesiology, Faculty of Health Sciences, The University of Western Ontario, London, ON, Canada

² Department of Anatomy and Cell Biology, Schulich School of Medicine and Dentistry, The University of Western Ontario, London, ON N6A 3K7, Canada

Introduction

It is generally accepted that resistance training with contractile intensities of \sim 70% of maximal voluntary contraction (MVC), are required to stimulate muscle hypertrophy and strength gains (ACSM [2009;](#page-8-0) Ratamess et al. [2009\)](#page-8-1). However, evidence supports the use of blood flow-restricted (BFR) exercise, sometimes referred to as occlusion exercise, as a training technique that elicits hypertrophy and strength gains by incorporating low-intensity muscular contraction (~ 20–30% of MVC) in combination with BFR (Yasuda et al. [2008,](#page-8-2) [2011\)](#page-8-3). Although it is commonly reported that strength and hypertrophy gains are maximized at relatively high-intensity, other studies report low levels of intensity \langle <50% of MVC) performed to failure that will elicit similar gains in strength and hypertrophy (Kumar et al. [2009](#page-8-4); Burd et al. 2010). These results would indicate that sufficient protein synthesis, and therefore, muscle hypertrophy can occur at lower exercise intensities than previously suggested (Ratamess et al. [2009\)](#page-8-1). BFR is most often achieved through the application of external pressure around the limb segment over the working muscle. External pressure can be applied using a sphygmomanometer that applies a quantifable pressure (mmHg), or by using elastic bands that cannot provide an exact measure of restriction. Whereas the physiological mechanisms are not fully understood, BFR training has been observed to facilitate positive muscular adaptations in both rehabilitation (Ohta et al. [2003\)](#page-8-6) settings and athletes (Cook et al. [2014](#page-8-7)). Specifcally, blood fow-restricted exercise has been explored from a chronic adaptation perspective over 4 or more weeks of exercise training in both young and elderly populations, as well as in healthy and rehabilitation settings (Ozaki et al. [2011](#page-8-8); Abe et al. [2010](#page-7-0)). These studies observed increases in hypertrophy, strength (Manimmanakorn et al. [2013a;](#page-8-9) Abe et al. [2010;](#page-7-0) Ozaki et al. [2011](#page-8-8)), and muscle endurance (Manimmanakorn et al. [2013a](#page-8-9)). Hypertrophy has been assessed by changes in muscle girth, and through magnetic resonance imaging to evaluate CSA (cross-sectional area) (Manimmanakorn et al. [2013a](#page-8-9); Ozaki et al. [2011](#page-8-8); Abe et al. [2010](#page-7-0)). Restricting or occluding blood fow essentially attenuates oxygenated blood and blood-borne substrates (glucose and free fatty acids) from reaching the working muscle (Moritani et al. [1992](#page-8-10)), with greater levels of restriction causing greater attenuation. This localized hypoxic stimulus may be an important mechanism that in combination with low-load exercise contributes to positive strength adaptations (Scott et al. [2015](#page-8-11)). In addition, the efect of BFR distal to the restriction, likely causes a larger accumulation of metabolic by-products due to the greater hypoxic state (Scott et al. [2015](#page-8-11)). This presumably causes aerobic fibers (type I slow motor units), to metabolize ATP in a low-oxygen anaerobic environment rather than a preferred oxygenrich environment, and therefore recruitment of anaerobic fibers (type II fast motor units) is enhanced to offset and maintain a given contraction intensity. Type II fbers produce more force per fber than type I, but are far less fatigue resistant (Greising et al. [2012\)](#page-8-12). Although this concept has not been directly assessed, indirect measures would manifest as shorter time to fatigue, and relatively greater neural activation of muscle refected in the electromyographic (EMG) signal (Manimmanakorn et al. [2013b;](#page-8-13) Yasuda et al. [2008\)](#page-8-2). A study by Karabulut et al. (2010) (2010) (2010) reported in the thigh muscle (vastus lateralis) an increase in EMG amplitude across isotonic submaximal repetitions with blood restriction set at 44% greater than systolic blood pressure. Towards the end of the intervention contractions EMG declined indicating some neural drive failure at the muscle level, although it must be recognized there are surface EMG limitations during dynamic contractions (see Farina et al. [2004](#page-8-15)). Also, they did not go to failure, or explore the recovery profle. In another study, a continuous increase in EMG indicated contractile output during complete blood fow occlusion was maintained by greater neural output (Moritini et al. [1992](#page-8-10)), Furthermore, Yasuda et al. [\(2009](#page-8-16)) noted that under complete blood flow occlusion (BFO) with low-level fatiguing contractions there was an extreme mismatch in energy demand (increasing muscle activation, or neural compression) and energy supply (no blood flow) that resulted in feelings of maximal exertion and complete mechanical failure.

Neuromuscular fatigue has both voluntary and involuntary components. The involuntary (peripheral) component can be assessed from electrically evoked contractions of the muscle, which bypasses the central nervous system. During prolonged contraction of a moderate to high intensity, the muscle fbers become weaker and contract slower, often due to muscle damage (Alway et al. [1990\)](#page-8-17) or excitation–contraction (E–C) failure (Edwards et al. [1977](#page-8-18)). Excitation–contraction coupling failure is one of a number possible causes of fatigue (Jones [1996\)](#page-8-19), and can be evaluated indirectly following fatiguing contractions by comparing the response of the muscle at lower frequencies of tetanic stimulation $(i.e., < 20 Hz)$ to the response from maximal frequencies of excitation (i.e., 50 Hz), (Jones [1996\)](#page-8-19). An increase in this ratio (10–50 Hz) after fatiguing contractions is an indication of peripheral fatigue and is referred to as low-frequency fatigue (LFF). Central components of fatigue are more diffcult to evaluate because they include assessing the degree of voluntary drive generated from spinal and supraspinal factors. Voluntary activation (VA) of the system can be indirectly assessed using the interpolated twitch technique (ITT) (Behm et al. [1996\)](#page-8-20). Following fatiguing low-intensity blood fow-restricted exercise VA was decreased (Karabulut et al. [2010\)](#page-8-14) and EMG, as a measure of voluntary neural activation, was increased. These changes were interpreted as an increase in central fatigue following low-intensity blood flow-restricted exercise (Karabulut et al. [2010\)](#page-8-14).

Thus, assessing changes in neural activation and muscle properties using an acute bout of fatiguing exercise with a high level of occlusion should provide further understanding of relevant peripheral factors afected during chronic BFR training paradigms. Therefore, the purpose of this experiment was to quantify the degree of fatigability in response to prolonged steady-state contraction of the elbow fexors at low-intensity (20% MVC) with a high level of external pressure (250 mmHg) to failure, compared with the responses to the same exercise at 20% MVC during unrestricted blood flow to failure (FF). We hypothesized, H1: that BFO exercise will cause exercise induced voluntary failure in a shorter absolute time, and H2: that BFO will cause greater peripheral fatigue compared to the unrestricted exercise. H3: that the recovery following a greater amount of peripheral fatigue caused by BFO, will be attenuated compared to the FF protocol. Electrically evoked tetanic responses were used to specifcally target intrinsic (peripheral) changes in the muscle and voluntary activation in combination with time to fatigue and EMG were used as measures to assess overall fatigability of the system.

Methods

Subjects

Ten healthy male subjects (see Table [1](#page-2-0) for characteristics) participated in two testing trials administered in a random order and each was separated by at least 48 h, with both completed within 7 days. All procedures were approved by the local institutional ethics committee (REB# 107212, WREM at The University of Western Ontario) and conformed to the declaration of Helsinki. Written and verbal consent were obtained from each participant. All subjects were right-hand dominant and therefore to minimize limb dominance efects, the non-dominant left arm was tested in each participant.

Experimental set‑up

Participants were supine on an examination plinth with their legs supported by a large wooden box (to minimize extraneous movement of the lower limbs) placing their hip and knee joints at $\sim 90^\circ$. To record elbow flexion, the left arm was in the dependent position and the elbow joint was fexed to $\sim 90^\circ$ with the supinated wrist secured to a linear force transducer (SST-700-100A; AS Technology, Haliburton, ON, Canada) using a velcro strap. The force transducer was adjusted so that force was measured at the wrist in a standardized fashion for all participants. A brace was adjusted to press down frmly on the left shoulder to minimize any extraneous shoulder or torso movements, as well as in inelastic

Table 1 Values are means \pm SD

| Parameters | Participants $(n=10 \text{ males})$ |
|-------------------------|--|
| Age (years) | $27 + 4$ |
| Height (cm) | $178 + 7$ |
| Mass (kg) | $84.9 + 10.2$ |
| BFO time to failure (s) | $234 + 44^a$ |
| FF time to failure (s) | $1026 + 752$ |
| BFO MVC (Nm) | $337.1 + 76.2$ |
| FFfail MVC (Nm) | $322.6 + 66.2$ |

BFO, blood flow occlusion at 20% intensity. FF, no blood flow occlusion at 20% intensity. MVC, maximal voluntary isometric contraction

a Denotes signifcant diference between BFO and FF time to failure in seconds

strap was fastened securely across the chest. EMG of the fexors was recorded, via adhesive Ag–AgCl electrodes (Kendall, H59P cloth electrodes) arranged in a monopolar fashion. Recording electrodes were placed on the skin over the mid-belly of the muscle and reference electrodes were secured over the ulna on the posterior forearm. For elbow fexor muscle stimulation custom made aluminum foil electrode pads (\approx 2 \times 5 cm) covered in damp paper towel were placed over the distal and proximal 1/3 of the arm fexors.

In all sessions, torque and EMG data were recorded using an A/D converter (CED 1401; Cambridge Electronic Design Ltd, Cambridge, UK) in conjunction with Spike2 software (v. 7.02; Cambridge Electronic Design). The torque and EMG data were sampled at 500 and 5000 Hz, respectively. EMG data were amplified $(\times 1000)$ and bandpass filtered (10 Hz—20 KHz, with a 60 Hz notch flter) using Neurolog; NL844, Digitimer, Welwyn Garden City, UK.

Experimental protocol

Participants were randomly assigned to complete either frst the low-intensity BFO to failure protocol or the low-intensity unrestricted blood fow (FF) to failure protocol. Except for the addition of the blood pressure cuff to restrict blood flow all procedures were identical in both trials. The blood pressure cuff (adult sized sphygmomanometer, 10 cm in width), was applied over the most proximal portion of the biceps muscle belly and pressure was maintained at 250 mmHg during the BFO protocol for all participants. This pressure was sufficient to abolish the radial pulse during the resting state for all participants, To determine MVC strength and voluntary activation of the elbow fexors maximal electrical stimulation doublets (200 µs pulse width; 400 V; 100 Hz doublet; range 90–168 mA) were applied using a constant current stimulator (DS7AH; Digitimer, Hertfordshire, UK) by increasing current intensity until the torque response no longer increased with an increase in current intensity, or coactivation of other muscles impeded the elbow fexor torque. For the interpolated twitch technique (ITT) (Behm et al. [1996\)](#page-8-20) doublets were used to assess voluntary activation in the elbow fexors. Participants were instructed to perform 2–3 brief $(-3-5 s)$ elbow flexion MVCs, which included a superimposed doublet at the peak torque, and a potentiated doublet was applied at rest immediately following the MVC. If variability in maximal torque was 5% or more between MVCs then a third MVC was performed. It has been reported that inexperienced participants may produce less than maximal MVCs when expecting electrical stimuli (Button and Behm [2008\)](#page-8-21), thus multiple MVCs were conducted for familiarization. Two to three minutes of rest was given between each MVC. Strong verbal encouragement and visual feedback were provided during all voluntary contractions. The greatest elbow fexion MVC was selected as the

Fig. 1 Maximal voluntary contraction normalized to time displayed as 25%—failure point (FP) for both BFO and FF trials. Recovery time points from R0–R30. Values represented as percent change from baseline and displayed as means \pm SE

baseline value. Tetanic 50 Hz (200 µs pulse width; 400V; 1 s duration; range 35–90 mA) stimulation was applied for 1 s to elicit 30% of elbow fexor MVC torque which from pilot testing was tolerable and did not activate antagonist muscles of the arm. Stimulations at 1 Hz (twitch) and 10 Hz (same stimulation parameters as 50 Hz) were applied using this same intensity. After baseline measures were acquired (at the beginning of each testing day), participants completed one of the two intervention protocols. Participants were instructed to maintain 20% of MVC constant isometric contraction, while elbow flexor MVCs $(-3-5 s)$ with ITT were assessed every minute during the fatiguing intervention until failure. Failure was defned as the point at which participants were unable to maintain the 20% testing contraction after two consecutive attempts. During a 30-min recovery period at each time point a 1 Hz, 10 Hz and 50 Hz response was elicited followed by an MVC with ITT. Parameters were assessed immediately following the fatiguing task (at failure point, FP; and \sim 2–3 s following failure (R0), which accounted for the time needed to remove the blood pressure cuff) and at 2, 5, 10, 20, and 30 min of recovery.

Data and statistical analyses

Off-line quantification of measures consisted of time-to-peak torque (TPT), peak torque (PT), and half-relaxation time (HRT) for the 1-Hz stimulation, and PT and HRT for the 50- and 10-Hz stimulations. Peak torque (Nm) was measured in the MVCs. Voluntary activation was calculated using the interpolated twitch equation: 1−(superimposed/potentiated twitch) \times 100 (Belanger and McComas [1981;](#page-8-22) Gandevia [2001](#page-8-23)). The superimposed twitch refers to the doublet stimulation applied at the MVC peak, and the potentiated twitch refers to the doublet stimulation applied following the MVC at rest. Data are described as mean \pm SD, while displayed as means \pm SE in all figures. A two-way repeated measures ANOVA with a modified Bonferroni was performed to determine between-group diferences of time and protocol. Cohen's d effect sizes (ES) were also calculated for main fndings. A post hoc power analysis was completed for the 10-Hz tetanic stimulation and found that the sample size of 10 was sufficient. When only a main effect of time was observed, paired sample *t* tests were used in conjunction with a Dunnett's table test for multiple comparisons. Paired *t* tests were used to compare group diferences in time-tofailure as well as MVC strength. All statistical analyses were performed using SPSS version 25. Statistical signifcance accepted at α < 0.05.

Results

Voluntary characteristics

Time to failure point (FP) was 80% longer for FF compared with BFO (see Table [1\)](#page-2-0). There was a main effect of time for MVC $(P<0.01)$ which decreased similarly in both protocols by $\sim 60\%$ at FP (see Fig. [1](#page-3-0)). Following 30 min of recovery MVC rebounded at similar rates to $\sim 87\%$ of baseline following both protocols, but was signifcantly lower than baseline. During both protocols voluntary activation decreased to ~89% of baseline at FP. There was a main efect of time ($P < 0.01$) and protocol ($P = 0.012$) and FF was $\sim 5\%$ less than BFO at the mid-point of task failure $(P=0.018,$ $ES = 0.41$) (see Fig. [2](#page-4-0)). The FF protocol remained signifcantly lower compared to BFO at recovery time points R–R10. At the completion of recovery (30 min) voluntary activation for both protocols was not diferent from baseline at \sim 94% and \sim 91%, respectively (see Fig. [2](#page-4-0)).

Twitch properties

For the twitch there was a signifcant decrease in peak torque following BFO compared to FF at R0 of \sim 75% and \sim 31%

BFO MVC \blacksquare - FF MVC

from baseline, respectively $(P < 0.01$, ES 0.88), as well as a main effect of time $(P < 0.01)$. However, no statistical difference was observed between trials at R2 or for the remainder of the 30-min recovery period (see Fig. [3\)](#page-4-1). The twitch (1 Hz) following the 30-min recovery period, remained depressed for both protocols at $\sim 55\%$ and $\sim 64\%$, respectively, of baseline. TPT and HRT of the twitch (1 Hz) response were unchanged following the task and throughout recovery (data not displayed).

Tetanic properties

The 10-Hz tetanic stimulation had a greater decrease during BFO (~ 80% decrease from baseline) compared to FF (~ 45% from baseline) at R0 (*P*<0.01, ES 0.56). Both the BFO and FF protocols had a main effect of time $(P=0.01)$ and 10 Hz remained depressed by \sim 40% from baseline following 30 min of recovery (see Fig. [4\)](#page-5-0). The 10 Hz HRT was unchanged throughout both protocols and recovery with no diference between protocols (data not displayed). The 50-Hz peak torque was not signifcantly diferent between groups, but was signifcantly reduced from baseline following both protocols and throughout the duration of recovery (see Fig. [5](#page-5-1)a). The changes in 50-Hz torques were similar to changes observed for MVC torques. However, the 50-Hz HRT had a main effect of time $(P < 0.01)$ and was significantly longer following the BFO at R0 and R2, by $\sim 107\%$ (*P*<0.01, ES 0.95) and ~ 18% (*P*<0.01, ES 0.74), respectively, compared to baseline. In contrast, 50-Hz HRT during FF remained unchanged from baseline at R0 $(-96%)$ and R2 (~91%). Following 5 min of recovery 50-Hz HRT was similar to baseline for both protocols (see Fig. [5](#page-5-1)b). The 10 Hz to 50 Hz peak torque ratio between protocols was signifcantly different $(P < 0.01$, ES 0.51) immediately following both protocols (at R0), but was reduced more following BFO (to \sim 32% of baseline) compared to the FF (\sim 79% of baseline) (see Fig. 6).

EMG

With BFO maximal EMG at the 25% normalized timeto-fatigue value was statistically greater than baseline,

Fig. 3 Represents values of 1 Hz torque percent changes during R0–R30 minutes of recovery compared to baseline. Dagger denotes signifcant difference between BFO and FF conditions. Values displayed as $mean \pm SE$

Fig. 4 Represents values of 10-Hz torque percent changes during R0–R30 minutes of recovery compared to baseline. *Dagger* denotes signifcant diference between BFO and FF conditions. Values displayed as $mean \pm SE$

Fig. 5 a Represents values of 50-Hz torque percent changes during R0–R30 minutes of recovery compared to baseline. **b** Represents values of 50-Hz half-relaxation-time percent change during R0–R30 minutes of recovery compared to baseline. Dagger denotes signifcant diference between BFO and FF conditions. Values displayed as $mean \pm SE$

exhibiting an increase in muscle activation before declining, while the FF protocol did not increase before declining. Maximal elbow fexor EMG following both protocols showed similar declines between protocols that were not signifcant at FP but were at R0 (11–30%). However, by R5 maximal EMG had recovered to baseline values in both protocols. Submaximal fexor EMG following each protocol showed a strong trend $(P=0.06)$ with BFO increasing from ~ 27% at 25% of normalized time to 65% at task failure, and FF increasing from ~ 25–40% at task failure (data not displayed). Submaximal EMG was only recorded **Fig. 6** Represents values of the 10/50 Hz torque ratio as percent changes during R0–R30 minutes of recovery compared to baseline. Dagger denotes signifcant diference between BFO and FF conditions. Values displayed as mean \pm SE

during the fatiguing task and was not assessed during the recovery period.

Discussion

The current study assessed the effects of a single bout of blood flow occlusion during low-intensity elbow flexor contraction compared with the same protocol performed with an unrestricted blood fow. This BFO paradigm was used to explore relevant factors responsible for results found from established chronic training BFR protocols known to cause hypertrophy and strength improvements (Kumar et al. [2009;](#page-8-4) Burd et al. [2010\)](#page-8-5). The main fndings of the current study were: (1) time to task failure (FP) was shorter during blood flow occlusion compared with the unrestricted bout $(234 \pm 44 \text{ vs. } 1026 \pm 752 \text{ s, respectively})$; (2) MVC strength (voluntary fatigue) was reduced to a similar degree in both protocols with no diferences between protocols in voluntary activation; (3) although the 50-Hz torque responses were similar to the changes in MVC, in contrast the intrinsic contractile torque measures at 1 Hz and 10 Hz were depressed to a greater amount following BFO than those during the FF protocol (see Figs. [3,](#page-4-1) [4](#page-5-0)), and 50-Hz HRT was longer following BFO. During the 30-min recovery period, MVC and VA recovered at a similar rate between protocols, but MVC remained signifcantly depressed. The more attenuated 1-Hz and 10-Hz torques following BFO compared to FF were no longer diferent between protocols by R2, but remained lower than baseline values. The 50-Hz torque responses were however recovered in both protocols by 30 min. These changes are indicative of a greater amount of peripheral fatigue induced during BFO than FF.

When normalized for time, the rates of decline and recovery in the MVC were similar between the two protocols as previously observed when comparing low-intensity bouts of contraction with and without BFR (Cook et al. [2013](#page-8-24)), however, voluntary activation was impaired more in the FF protocol in the current study. This was presumably due to the greater time in the FF protocol and therefore more contractile work required to reach task failure of $\sim 60\%$ of MVC. The response from the 50-Hz stimulation likely paralleled the MVC decline in both protocols during the fatiguing task, but was not assessed until R0 at which time the loss was signifcant and similar to the MVC loss. Recovery of voluntary activation was more impaired following the longer task (FF) for the frst 10 min of recovery, which is likely due to greater time under tension (80% longer) during FF. These results are in agreement with Behm and St. Pierre ([1997](#page-8-25)) who found similar results in VA following a long-term fatiguing task when compared with a short task. The accumulation of metabolic by-products would be countered upon release of the restriction (Cady et al. [1989\)](#page-8-26), and a return to "normal" blood fow shown by the rapid recovery of half-relaxation-time observed within 5 min of rest following the fatiguing task. Therefore, the similar decrease in MVC between protocols indicates that blood flow occlusion caused the same amount of voluntary fatigue but in a signifcantly shorter amount of time than with FF (see Fig. [1\)](#page-3-0). However, the MVC recovered at similar rates between the two protocols, but neither returned to baseline (~ 90% of baseline) following 30 min (see Fig. [1\)](#page-3-0). The similar change in MVC and the 50-Hz responses have been observed previously in other fatiguing protocols (Edwards et al. [1977](#page-8-18)) and supports that voluntary activation was maximal and that these recover rapidly (within 30 min) as compared with force responses induced by lower frequencies of activation.

The depression of torques at lower frequencies of stimulation compared with high frequencies is refected in the 10/50 Hz ratio (see Fig. [6\)](#page-6-0). For the BFO protocol this ratio was depressed by \sim 79% from baseline compared with \sim 20% for FF at R0, and did not recover by the end of 30 min in either protocol. The inability of the muscle to produce force at low-frequencies (10 Hz), compared to the relative small reduction in forces elicited from high-frequencies (50 Hz) is indicative of fatigue-induced muscle impairment referred to

as low-frequency fatigue (Edwards et al. [1977](#page-8-18); Jones et al. [1979](#page-8-27)). In this experiment immediately following the BFO protocol we observed greater reductions in both 1-Hz and 10-Hz torques compared with the FF protocol (see Figs. [3,](#page-4-1) [4](#page-5-0)). The reduction of the 10/50 Hz ratio is indicative of failure to produce force due to mechanisms beyond the point of the neuromuscular junction (Jones [1996](#page-8-19)). This low-frequency fatigue has been observed extensively and used as an indicator of peripheral fatigue following bouts of exercise or fatiguing contractions (Edwards et al. [1977](#page-8-18); Hill et al. [2001](#page-8-28); Verges et al. [2009\)](#page-8-29). Low-frequency fatigue features a more severely afected loss of force that may take days to recover fully (Jones [1996](#page-8-19)). In our study, 2 min after the task, BFO had recovered to the same amount as FF $(-60\% \text{ of}$ baseline), however, both protocols remained depressed from baseline for the remainder of recovery. This low-frequency fatigue may be indicative of structural damage to the muscle fber or impairments in excitation–contraction coupling mechanisms caused by Ca^{2+} disruption following prolonged exercise (Jones [1981;](#page-8-30) Booth et al. [1997](#page-8-31)). Perhaps the greater amount of peripheral fatigue induced by BFO is indicative of an alteration in the preferred metabolic energy production of the type I oxidative fbers, caused by the ischemic environment. The early (0–2 mins) rapid recovery may be due to reperfusion and a hyperemic response following restriction providing a renewed supply of oxygen for type I fber metabolism.

It has been reported that contractile output during lowintensity contractions (20% MVC) with complete occlusion of blood fow results in greater neural activation (EMG) to maintain task force (Moritani et al. [1992](#page-8-10)). Yasuda et al. [\(2009\)](#page-8-16) also noted greater increases in EMG following BFO compared to moderate blood fow restriction, and attributed this to increased neural compression and blood fow impairment resulting in greater muscle activation and greater energetic demand at the same external load. Although the current study does not have a direct measure of arterial perfusion, we believe that the pressure applied (250 mmHg) likely created near complete occlusion, and therefore the observed increase in submaximal RMS EMG during each protocol indicates greater neural drive was required to maintain force during the fatiguing task. However, the BFO and FF protocols did not difer in the increased amount of submaximal RMS EMG at task failure likely because both protocols ended with each participants volitional failure point (FP), when task force (20% MVC) was no longer able to be maintained. However, importantly the BFO protocol was $\sim 80\%$ shorter in absolute time than the FF protocol. Therefore, the change in submaximal RMS EMG indicates a relatively greater modulation in muscle activation pattern and supports what has been shown in other similar studies (Moritani et al. [1992;](#page-8-10) Scott et al. [2015;](#page-8-11) Yasuda et al. [2008](#page-8-2)). Compared to the Karabulut et al. [\(2010\)](#page-8-14) study that observed a greater reduction in maximal EMG amplitude (at pre- and post-MVCs) following blood fow restriction, the current study observed no diference in maximal RMS EMG values between protocols at task termination. The diference is likely due to the current study terminating the intervention at failure, compared with completion of a set number of repetitions in the former study.

Therefore we propose, that although both protocols reached a similar level of voluntary fatigue (MVC), lowintensity exercise in combination with blood fow occlusion causes a greater amount of peripheral fatigue than lowintensity exercise alone, and that BFO therefore recovers at an accelerated rate compared to FF despite remaining lower than baseline after 30 min. Based on other studies (Moritani et al. [1992](#page-8-10); Scott et al. [2015;](#page-8-11) Yasuda et al. [2008](#page-8-2)), in an ischemic environment fatigue will be greater and result in an earlier or greater amount of activation of type II muscle fbers compared with an environment without BFO. Fatigue following BFO recovers at a faster rate when unrestricted blood flow is restored, causing a reperfusion of oxygenated blood fow. This is likely due to anaerobically (due to the ischemic environment caused by BFO) fatigued type I muscle fbers reverting to aerobic energy production, which allows voluntary activation of the muscle to be restored despite a greater amount of peripheral impairments.

This study provides important insights about how BFO may alter the neuromuscular system to enhance strength and hypertrophy gains with chronic training as used in previous studies (Ozaki et al. [2011](#page-8-8); Abe et al. [2010;](#page-7-0) Manimmanakorn et al. [2013a\)](#page-8-9). Although training regimes at near complete blood flow occlusion are not likely to be used chronically, the results of this study provide evidence that blood flow occlusion results in a greater level of peripheral fatigue, observed through intrinsic changes of the muscle properties at low-frequency.

Author contributions DB Copithorne: experimental design, data collection and analysis, all manuscript revisions and edits. CL Rice: all manuscript revisions and edits.

Funding This research was supported by the Natural Sciences and Engineering Research Council (NSERC) as well as Ontario Graduate Scholarships (OGS).

Compliance with ethical standards

Conflict of interest DB Copithorne and CL Rice have no conficts of interest that are directly relevant to the content of this article.

References

Abe T, Sakamaki M, Fujita S, Ozaki H, Sugaya M, Sato Y, Nakajima T (2010) Efects of low-intensity walk training with restricted leg blood flow on muscle strength and aerobic capacity in older adults. J Geriatr Phys Ther 33(1):34–40

- Alway SE, Sale DG, MacDougall JD (1990) Twitch contractile adaptations are not dependent on the intensity of isometric exercise in the human triceps surae. Eur J Appl Physiol Occup Physiol 60(5):346–352
- American College of Sports Medicine (2009) American College of Sports Medicine position stand. Progression models in resistance training for healthy adults. Med Sci Sports Exerc 41(3):687
- Behm DG, St-Pierre DMM (1997) Effects of fatigue duration and muscle type on voluntary and evoked contractile properties. J Appl Physiol 82(5):1654–1661
- Behm DG, St-Pierre DMM, Perez D (1996) Muscle inactivation: assessment of interpolated twitch technique. J Appl Physiol 81(5):2267–2273
- Belanger AY, McComas AJ (1981) Extent of motor unit activation during efort. J Appl Physiol 51(5):1131–1135
- Booth J, McKenna MJ, Ruell PA, Gwinn TH, Davis GM, Thompson MW, Harmer AR, Hunter SK, Sutton JR (1997) Impaired calcium pump function does not slow relaxation in human skeletal muscle after prolonged exercise. J Appl Physiol 83(2):511–521
- Burd NA, West DW, Staples AW, Atherton PJ, Baker JM, Moore DR, Holwerda AM, Parise G, Rennie MJ, Baker SK, Phillips SM (2010) Low-load high volume resistance exercise stimulates muscle protein synthesis more than high-load low volume resistance exercise in young men. PLoS One 5(8):e12033
- Button DC, Behm DG (2008) The efect of stimulus anticipation on the interpolated twitch technique. J Sports Sci Med 7(4):520
- Cady EB, Elshove H, Jones DA, Moll A (1989) The metabolic causes of slow relaxation in fatigued human skeletal muscle. J Physiol 418(1):327–337
- Cook SB, Murphy BG, Labarbera KE (2013) Neuromuscular function after a bout of low-load blood fow-restricted exercise. Med Sci Sports Exerc 45(1):67–74
- Cook CJ, Kilduff LP, Beaven CM (2014) Improving strength and power in trained athletes with 3 weeks of occlusion training. Int J Sports Physiol Perform 9(1):166–172
- Edwards RH, Hill DK, Jones DA, Merton PA (1977) Fatigue of long duration in human skeletal muscle after exercise. J Physiol 272(3):769–778
- Farina D, Merletti R, Enoka RM (2004) The extraction of neural strategies from the surface EMG. J Appl Physiol 96(4):1486–1495
- Gandevia SC (2001) Spinal and supraspinal factors in human muscle fatigue. Physiol Rev 81(4):1725–1789
- Greising SM, Gransee HM, Mantilla CB, Sieck GC (2012) Systems biology of skeletal muscle: fiber type as an organizing principle. Wiley Interdiscip Rev Syst Biol Med 4(5):457–473
- Hill CA, Thompson MW, Ruell PA, Thom JM, White MJ (2001) Sarcoplasmic reticulum function and muscle contractile character following fatiguing exercise in humans. J Physiol 531(3):871–878
- Jones DA (1981) Muscle fatigue due to changes beyond the neuromuscular junction. Hum Muscle Fatigue Physiol Mech 1981(178–196)
- Jones DA (1996) High-and low-frequency fatigue revisited. Acta Physiol 156(3):265–270
- Jones DA, Bigland-Ritchie B, Edwards RHT (1979) Excitation frequency and muscle fatigue: mechanical responses during voluntary and stimulated contractions. Exp Neurol 64(2):401–413
- Karabulut M, Cramer JT, Abe T, Sato Y, Bemben MG (2010) Neuromuscular fatigue following low-intensity dynamic exercise with externally applied vascular restriction. J Electromyogr Kinesiol 20(3):440–447
- Kumar V, Selby A, Rankin D, Patel R, Atherton P, Hildebrandt W, Williams J, Smith K, Seynnes O, Hiscock N, Rennie MJ (2009) Age-related diferences in the dose–response relationship of muscle protein synthesis to resistance exercise in young and old men. J Physiol 587(1):211–217
- Manimmanakorn A, Hamlin MJ, Ross JJ, Taylor R, Manimmanakorn N (2013a) Efects of low-load resistance training combined with blood flow restriction or hypoxia on muscle function and performance in netball athletes. J Sci Med Sport 16(4):337–342
- Manimmanakorn A, Manimmanakorn N, Taylor R, Draper N, Billaut F, Shearman JP, Hamlin MJ (2013b) Efects of resistance training combined with vascular occlusion or hypoxia on neuromuscular function in athletes. Eur J Appl Physiol 113(7):1767–1774
- Moritani T, Sherman WM, Shibata M, Matsumoto T, Shinohara M (1992) Oxygen availability and motor unit activity in humans. Eur J Appl Physiol Occup Physiol 64(6):552–556
- Ohta H, Kurosawa H, Ikeda H, Iwase Y, Satou N, Nakamura S (2003) Low-load resistance muscular training with moderate restriction of blood fow after anterior cruciate ligament reconstruction. Acta Orthop Scand 74(1):62–68
- Ozaki H, Miyachi M, Nakajima T, Abe T (2011) Efects of 10 weeks walk training with leg blood fow reduction on carotid arterial compliance and muscle size in the elderly adults. Angiology 62(1):81–86
- Ratamess NA, Alvar BA, Evetoch TK (2009) Progression models in resistance training for healthy adults. American college of sports medicine. Med Sci Sports Exerc 41(3):687–708
- Scott BR, Loenneke JP, Slattery KM, Dascombe BJ (2015) Exercise with blood fow restriction: an updated evidence-based approach for enhanced muscular development. Sports Med 45(3):313–325
- Verges S, Mafuletti NA, Kerherve H, Decorte N, Wuyam B, Millet GY (2009) Comparison of electrical and magnetic stimulations to assess quadriceps muscle function. J Appl Physiol 106(2):701–710
- Yasuda T, Brechue WF, Fujita T, Sato Y, Abe T (2008) Muscle activation during low-intensity muscle contractions with varying levels of external limb compression. J Sports Sci Med 7(4):467
- Yasuda T, Brechue WF, Fujita T, Shirakawa J, Sato Y, Abe T (2009) Muscle activation during low-intensity muscle contractions with restricted blood flow. J Sports Sci 27(5):479-489
- Yasuda T, Ogasawara R, Sakamaki M, Bemben MG, Abe T (2011) Relationship between limb and trunk muscle hypertrophy following high-intensity resistance training and blood fow–restricted low-intensity resistance training. Clin Physiol Funct Imaging 31(5):347–351

Publisher's Note Springer Nature remains neutral with regard to jurisdictional claims in published maps and institutional afliations.